Chapter 1: Nature of the Inquiry

1.1 Introduction
This chapter will discuss the key issues that emerge in the conduct of research in the social sciences and highlight the critical method as the nature of the inquiry for the present research. It is argued that a method of critique is needed to bridge the gap between 'absolute' behaviourist type empirical methods and interpretive approaches that are 'relative' to a particular cultural and historical context. This chapter therefore, explains why the critical method has been chosen to examine the evolution of current education policies in South Africa.

1.2 Methodological Issues in Social Science Research
1.2.1 Quantitative versus Qualitative Approaches
Researchers in the social sciences are usually faced in their respective inquiries with crucial questions that require substantive answers even before they proceed with the research task. The questions are usually related to epistemological and methodological concerns and the use of social theory to explain the behaviour of researchers is largely undeveloped (Walker, 1984). Research analysis today does not necessarily locate the research studies in their social and historical context.

Epistemology, however, should not be treated as though it were a self-contained discipline without roots in the thought of a period (history). No knowledge can be firm for all times since conceptions of the world have changed historically (Hughes, 1980). Even within a single discipline, there may be several schools of thought putting forward several epistemological principles. It is these principles that set the context for the debate within which the different schools select their versions of the world.
These claims to knowledge are related philosophically to the historically and socially based conceptions human beings hold about their world and their lives within it. Knowledge therefore has social dimensions. This particular claim is relevant to the debate about whether the social sciences are akin to the natural sciences or whether as human sciences they are different. Similarly, when it comes to research, the debate about the social sciences continues and has tended to be a choice between ‘quantitative’ and ‘qualitative’ which more often than not are presented as an ‘either – or’.

Quantitative methods are consistent with the philosophy of Positivism, the latter according a pre-eminent place to empirical research in the production of knowledge. Positivists argue that ‘the basis of science is in a theoretically neutral observation language...where statements made are...directly verifiable as true or false by simply looking at the facts of the world’ (Held, 1980, p. 36). It also claims that: (a) reality is that which is available to the senses, (b) philosophy is dependent on the sciences, (c) there is a common methodological and logical foundation shared by the natural and social sciences, (d) there is a distinction between fact and value.

Quantitative methods refer to data that yield information at a level of measurement and which lend themselves to statistical operations. It is assumed that certain variables can be isolated as aspects of social interaction to reveal ‘logical’ connections and suggest causal patterns. This approach to educational research is based on the scientific or empirical model of research which assumes that social phenomena can be tested and measured by means of scales. Such an approach, consistent with a positivist, empiricist orientation, emphasises an instrumental view of reason, overlooks other forms of rationality and denies the existence of hermeneutic (practical) reason and emancipatory (critical) reason.

Qualitative approaches, on the other hand, are consistent with the humanist alternative which, while generally accepting the positivist view of natural science, claimed that it was
inappropriate for the study of social life. Qualitative methods stress instead the role of interpretation, understanding and construction of meaning. In qualitative research, the research is a social agent to a more explicit degree than with quantitative approaches where the real agenda is hidden behind a mask of value neutrality.

Dilthey (cited in Held, 1980, p. 66), asserts that "knowledge of persons could only be gained through an interpretive procedure grounded in the imaginative recreation of the experience of others. History, society indeed all human products were seen as the objectifications of the human mind and...accordingly understanding such phenomena required that the lived experiences of others be grasped through the apprehension of their inner meaning". While positivists focused on the objective, non-human world, humanists and therefore qualitative research stressed human social behaviour which was imbued with values. Such a conception presupposed a knowledge of culture that could only be gained by isolating the feelings, ideas and goals of a particular historical period.

Quantitative methodology while stressing the idea of a neutral observation language was less inclined to concern itself with the origin and source of theories. Of greater importance was the verification of such theories, once formulated. To this extent, theories had to be tested against the facts of the world. Scientific theories, however, are inventions that are actively engaged in creating a reality and, hence, not relying on substantiation by the facts of the external world. This suggests that the actor in society is an active constituent of the construction of knowledge. Similarly, much of what passes for social scientific theory is under-determined by the facts of the world. Such theories are, therefore, better seen as conceptual schemes which implies that other criteria have to be satisfied before a theory can be regarded as being scientific. When applied to social life, this does raise concerns since one is studying human beings who can also theorise about their own lives in society. This means that the positivist conception of science
though advocating the natural scientific approach to the study of society, does not imply that the social sciences cannot be scientific within another interpretation of science.

Having briefly sketched some of the main features of the quantitative and qualitative approaches to research particularly in relation to epistemology and methodology, critical theory, discussed in the next chapter, is proposed as the alternative approach for the present research.

1.2.2 Critique of Positivistic Nature of Inquiry

The nature of inquiry in the positivist tradition has had three major challenges, namely, analytic philosophy, the interpretive tradition and critical theory. The analytic tradition in philosophy might be said to have begun with the work of Wittgenstein who recognised the importance of 'language' rather than 'thought' as a starting point for an examination of the foundations of truth and knowledge. Austin (1962) and Searle (1971) further articulated speech-act theories which criticised the positivistic forms of the description rather than the explanation of language. Austin's theory sees language as a rule-governed activity that depends on social as well as linguistic conventions. Such an approach offers, in principle, "a unified theory of the meaning of utterances within the framework of a general theory of social activity" (Lyons, 1977, p. 735). This idea was further explored by Habermas (1979; 1984) when he specified the conditions for ideal speech, as a foundation of social theory. However, despite the valid contributions of the analytic tradition, it presented a one-sided notion of social practice, since it left the social dimension of language unanalysed beyond appeals to rather vague concepts like 'forming life' and 'social practices' (Roderick, 1986, p. 6). Hughes (1980, p. 66) believes that Vico was perhaps the earliest theorist to suggest that human history was a process reflecting the maturation of the human mind and the study of humanity and society in history was different from the study of natural phenomena because the former involved subjective understanding in terms of 'meaning'.
Dilthey (1961) argued that knowledge of persons can be gained only through an 'interpretive' approach. Since all human products were seen as objectifications of the human mind, understanding such phenomena required that the 'lived experiences' of others be grasped through the apprehension of their inner meaning. Thus, Dilthey saw interpretation as essential to exploration. Gadamer (1976), writing in the hermeneutic tradition, argued that meanings can be 'reconstituted' in acts of interpretation. Historical tradition cannot be seen as an object existing apart from us—the community which binds us to tradition and which is in the constant process of being reconstituted by our own interpretive activity. This points to the socially and historically rooted condition of human knowledge. The latter views, particularly those of Dilthey and Gadamer, emerged as a reaction to the 'scientised' or empiricist conception of social actions as embodied in positivist views of social science.

According to the early critical theory critique of positivism, that is the critique of instrumental reason, positivism overlooked the fact that cognition as a process is primarily a social act. This critique reflected on the condition for knowledge of the social as well as the natural world and in so doing highlighted the role of the subject in the act of perception. In positivism, society is seen to be dependent on applied science and in turn 'scientific' criteria are applied in order to establish whether the social world is rationally ordered. Furthermore, critical theorists believe that positivist approaches in social science research do not adequately deal with value issues. The existence of values in any stage of research and/or theory development is inescapable. It is possible to interpret human (social) experiences in different ways.

Critical theory provides some basis for distinguishing the nature of different social theories in respect of the identification of existential values/interests in the forms of knowledge in the social theory and the identification of the political-economic grounding
of the social theory—the constraints exercised by the social structure on the formation of social theory. Critical theory then adopts an historical and social understanding of knowledge rather than attempting to set up any 'mechanical' inquiry for verifying or falsifying proposition as in a critical rationalist approach such as Popper's (1966; 1972). Examining the political-economic aspect of the theory formation, critical theory enables the researcher, such as myself, to explore the relationship between policy and political-historical-economic development such as that of South Africa. Such an analysis points historically to the broad social milieu which both constrains and ideologically shapes the perceptions of researchers at a practical level, or philosophers at a more obviously theoretical level.

1.2.3 Critique of Interpretive Nature of Inquiry

Critical theory has criticised the interpretivist approach for its failure to theorise the larger social system and to recognise the way in which specific events are shaped by features of the larger system. Furthermore, interpretivists falsely assumed that social actors could define and construct their own reality. While interpretive approaches provide an opportunity to validate meanings of social phenomena as socially constructed by participants, they fail to take into account the possibility that participants can act as rational as well as social agents. Critical theory espouses that the important feature of any research process is the ability to incorporate a vision of what 'ought to be' and some notion of 'how' to get there through emancipatory practice. Interpretive approaches do not express a theory of human potential.

Habermas (1977), in his dialogue with Gadamer (1976) about the role of the interpretive approaches, argued that 'historicism' is 'interest bound'. The latter is defined as knowledge grounded in historical situations which critical theorists believe blocks critical reflection. The 'truth' content of meanings is taken at face value as well as the possibility of distortion entering into the expression of meaning by subjects. Critical theory then is
an alternative orientation to positivism and interpretivism offering an "emancipatory interest in securing freedom from self-imposed constraints, hypothesised forces and conditions of distorted communication" (Roderick, 1986, p. 56). This emancipatory interest assumes that humans are capable of acting 'rationally', are able to be 'self-determining' and 'self-reflective'. According to Habermas (1973, pp. 22-3) "self-reflection brings to consciousness those determinants of a self-formative process of cultivation and self-formation (building) which ideologically determine a contemporary practice and conception of the work...(leading) to insight due to the fact that what has previously been unconscious is made conscious in a manner rich in consequences: analytic insights intervene in life".

In support of both transformative as well as interpretive concerns, critical theory makes reference to 'critical ethnography' which is defined according to Simon and Dippo (1986, p. 195) as "data and analytic procedures in a way consistent with one's pedagogical/political project; allows the public sphere to become the starting point for the critique and transformation of the conditions of oppressive and inequitable moral and social regulation and lastly addresses the limits of its own claims by a consideration of how, as a form of social practice, it too is constituted and regulated through historical relations of power and existing material conditions". This is in contrast to the particularistic ethnographic accounts of the interpretive approach where 'ethnography' referred to a particular method, the accomplishment of a product, in this case, the product being a kind of knowledge that centres on the actual practices and points of view of people within an organised set of social relations. In trying to be emancipatory and transformatory, critical ethnography attempts to make the points of view of conventional ethnography more topical.

The research process adopting a critical theory perspective implies the capacity for self-reflection and suggests an alternative approach to resolving issues in research such as the
validity of knowledge or the ethical and moral dimensions of obtaining data. Critical theory in research implies that an approach is required that transcends both the objectivism of positivism and the relativism of interpretivism. A meta-level of critique is required. A critical theory of society asserts that a codified scientific method is not an adequate foundation for the validity of truth claims. Only in a reconstruction of the self-formation of developmental processes is there objectivity about the relation between these processes and our cultural understanding of them. Only by an explicit awareness of the dialectical reciprocity of history and culture can we attain an adequate grasp of the immediacy of the present. We approach social facts from a cultural perspective which is not neutralised by research techniques since these may themselves conceal our prejudgments of the data. Our social inquiry begins from and returns to the immediate and we must become aware of the influence of the cultural situation.

Beginning from the immediacy of a given consciousness and by reconstructing the self-formation of this consciousness, we observe how at every stage standards of the preceding one disintegrate and new ones arise. The method of critical theory therefore revolves around a critique of the successive stages in the self-formation of the subject. Each critical reconstruction is a self-understanding that breaks down the constraints of past forms of consciousness. An adequate comprehension of the present requires both a critique and retention of the past stages within a theory of the totality. With Hegel (1956), the reflective critique of the limits of knowledge (German Idealism) became a critique of false consciousness. Marx (1972) conceived of this phenomenological critique of consciousness as an immanent method for the critique of ideology.

For Hegel (1956), critical philosophy is a reconciliation of the objective conflicts inherent in the institutions of society (objective spirit) and the forms of consciousness (absolute spirit) basic to the historical activity of man. Schroyer (1973, p. 30) asserts that ultimately the role of philosophy is the critical comprehension of the historical genesis of
these conflicts, and the resulting mediation will be the basis for a reunification which effectively ‘respiritualises’ that which has become comprehensible.

For Marx (1947; 1972; 1974), the reconstruction of the genesis of capitalism illuminates the historical origins of the development of universal commodity exchange. Having shown how it has become immanently possible to conceive of human labour as equivalent to the value of its product, Marx demonstrates that the actual dynamics of capitalism makes equal exchange between wage labour and capital impossible. The critique at the same time defines an immanent potential that the bourgeois ideology conceals—the objective possibilities that are inherent in the socialisation of the means of production. Critique thus anticipates the emancipation of man from both the constraints of nature and of repressive social power. The intent of critique is to promote conscious emancipatory activity.

Construction of a critical theory follows the principle of an immanent critique. In this thesis the critique is attempted in Chapter Five. By first expressing what a social totality holds itself to be and then confronting it with what it is in fact becoming, a critical theory is able to restore the actuality to a false appearance. In Marx, for example, the ideology of "equivalence exchange" as the self-image of capitalist society is contradicted by the formulation of the "developmental laws of capitalism". The appearance of capitalism is negated by its own structural tendencies, which Marx shows intensify human exploitation and alienation. In view of this, critical theory can be seen as an attempt to restore missing parts of the historical self-formation process to man and in this way to release a self-positing comprehension which enables him to see through socially unnecessary authority and control systems. Schroyer (1973, p. 31) says that "by uniting lost experiential dimensions of both individual and collective pasts, critical theory anticipates a release of emancipatory reflection and a transformed social praxis. In this self-reflective recognition of "pseudo-necessity", the conditions needed to perpetuate unnecessary social roles and
institutions are removed and man can actualise new possibilities for human development”.

Horkheimer (1937), showed that positivistic theory tries to construct frameworks of increasing generality, being based on the assumption that there is no basic difference between the object of the natural sciences and of the humanities. Critical theory, on the other hand, starts from the premise that every period or epoch has one or several constitutive principles for the reproduction of society and that these general concepts must be analysed in a state of constant flux between the general and the particular. "Society will never become apparent in a blend accumulation of fragmented facts, hypotheses, short and medium range theories" (Schroyer, 1973, p. 134). Furthermore, critical theory does not exclude from scientific activity the question of the context in which knowledge is produced and used. It therefore reflects on science in analysing the relationship between theory and practice. Wellmer (1971, p. 14) states that the traditional approach "leads to a misrepresentation of the object under scrutiny and to an accommodating conformism on the part of the scientists. Because they no longer see exactly how in every act of perception...they remain imprisoned in and take their bearings from a process of social life, they misrepresent human history as a natural process and willingly act out the role assigned to them by the ...system as useful and irresponsible experts whose knowledge can be smoothly integrated in the system's utility structures”.

Critical theory's rejection of the objectivism of the traditional approach was seen more as a matter of necessity since the positivist image of neutrality in an industrial system became difficult to conceive since this knowledge was used to mediate objective conflict and create new coercive controls. Critical theory attempts to combat the objectivistic perception of history as a natural process, concentrating more on relating the object of knowledge to the constitutive activity of the subject within a historical context.
Marx (1974) showed that consciousness of the relationship between human activity and social wealth was a critique of feudal absolutism and represented the rationality of a market society. Implicit in the concepts of value and exchange between wage labour and capital were the ideas of justice, equality and freedom. Marx's critique of political economy reconstructs the historical genesis of bourgeois consciousness and shows the gap between its Utopian ideals and its ideological distortion of alienation and exploitation. Using Marx's critique of the political economy, critical theory can enlighten the existing consciousness about its ideological content. Wellmer (1971, pp. 83-84) asserts that "the medium of this enlightenment is theory, whose destruction of ideology through the analysis of the context of social coercion must also be the disclosure of a concept of personal social freedom, which, as 'real' Utopian content of false social consciousness, it can obtain only in the course of this criticism". This concept of ideology implies the dissolution of false consciousness as an emancipatory process mediated by communication and reflection.

Habermas (1973; 1977), in contrast, instead of criticising the exploitative character of capitalist production as Marx did, seeks to extend critical theory in order to analyse the systematically distorted communication of all industrial organisations. More importantly however, Habermas tends to justify critical theory in his communication theory which he sees as being legitimated by the twentieth century revolution in linguistic philosophy. Habermas (1971, p. 176) sees the importance of linguistic philosophy for critical theory in its capacity to express the idealisations of symbolic action and rational discourse. Thus, the notion of an ideal speech situation or non-repressive communication is the necessary condition for the simultaneous maintenance of communication and meta-communication. Shroyer (1973, p. 162), asserts that "it is just this anticipated situation of ideal speech which can be used as a normative standard for the critique of distorted communication. The fundamental idealisation made in every act of human speech assumes an ideal of reason which does not exist empirically but which every human
assertion anticipates in practice. In every communicative situation in which a consensus is established under coercion or under distorted conditions, we are confronting instances of illusory discourse. This is the contemporary form of the critique of ideology”.

Hoy and McCarthy (1994, p. 84), refer to the following as sorts of critical inquiry suited to a critique of impure reason:

- Socio-cultural approaches to critique are of ethical-political import since the conceptions of reason they interrogate are embodied in the practices and institutions that are analysed and assessed with this in mind.

- Such approaches rely, implicitly or explicitly on interpretive schemes that guide the selection, description, organisation and explication of 'data'.

- These schemes appear as the empirically and theoretically informed, historically oriented and practically interested, general interpretive frameworks associated with Marx, Weber, Habermas and Foucault.

- The appropriation of philosophically derived concepts of reason for socio-theoretical purposes enabled the above-mentioned theorists to build a tension between the real and the ideal into their interpretive frameworks and thus to combine—in very different ways—normative and empirical perspectives in systematic narratives.

- These narratives were constructed as histories of the present, with the practical-political aim of helping us to understand better some of the central practices and institutions of our form of life—how they arose and became established, what possibilities they open up and/or closed off, how they functioned in the larger society, what were they good and/or bad for and of which general trends their developments were symptomatic—in ways that entailed challenges to received understandings and thus to the orders the latter supported.

- The construction of these grand narratives combined in different ways, many of the methods mentioned above—interpretive, descriptive, genealogical, reconstructive, structuralist, functionalist. Those methods have also been used in more limited combinations and for less ambitious purposes. The critique of impure reason requires that rational practices be studied from both the 'inside' and from the 'outside' synchronically and diachronically, locally and globally, structurally and functionally, normatively and empirically. None of these separate approaches, taken by itself, gives us the whole story.
1.2.4 Critical Nature of Inquiry

There are many difficulties inherent in any attempt to describe the 'critical methodology' since none of the critical theorists studied discuss, in any specific detail, what could constitute the 'method' of critical theory. Many of the writings of the critical theorists from Horkheimer and Adorno to Habermas represent an application of critical methodology to various philosophical positions and problems. Horkheimer and Adorno, for example, present their critique of instrumental reason and Marx critiques the political economy. Habermas makes his contribution by a critique of the theory of language and communication and his analysis of the crisis tendencies of late capitalist societies.

In Marx's view, truth was to be found not in a conceptual transcending of contradiction but in a practical transcending of a contradictory way of life including the ideological components of it. Roderick (1986, pp. 172-173) suggests that 'radical theory', as espoused by Marx, should be used as a basis for a radical democracy in which all political decisions are subjected to the discussion of a reasoning public. Horkheimer (1937; cited in Held, 1980) sees the purpose of critical theory being to investigate aspects of the social world 'in the movement of its development'. The starting point of the critique would be the 'conceptual principles' and (internal) standards of an object. This is followed by a discussion of the implications and consequences of these standards with a re-assessment of the object against these implications and consequences. Critique proceeds then from within. So Horkheimer's criticism has the following themes; the process of changing concepts into opposites, the principle of negation, the role of values in critique and the possibility of transcendence.

McCarthy (1978, p. 271) argues that Habermas, by introducing the notion of 'rational reconstruction', has changed the orientation of critical theory so that "the theory of social evolution grounds a teleological reading of past history and provides the normative-theoretical basis for a historically oriented analysis of the present with an interest in the
future". The point is that the early critical theorists in their critiques, did not write about 'critical method' as if it were a unified set of rules or procedures.

Such an explanation avoids the narrow empiricism of integrative meta-analysis and transcends particularistic ethnographic accounts, leaving open the possibility for penetration of ideological influences constraining or distorting researchers in the process of their inquiries.

Adorno (1973, p. 167) believed that most philosophies failed to provide an adequate account of the relationship between subject and object. As he expressed it (Adorno, 1973, p. 183) "an object can be conceived only by a subject but always remains something other than the subject, whereas a subject by its very nature is from the outset an object as well".

Held (1980, p. 173) summarises what critical theory must do in order to explain human activity without distortion. It must proceed:

1. through the explication of the constitution of ideas in consciousness and interaction, in the dialectics of experience;

2. through the analysis of the creation, maintenance and change of people's inter-subjective, historical concepts;

3. by refusing to ignore and smooth over contradictions and contradictory claims at the phenomenal level, in other words, it must observe and explain 'determinant and historical acts of negation' and grasp the dynamic movement of the subject;

4. by leaving open the possibility of a critically reflective understanding of history and tradition. It must not only accept the importance of an understanding of the meaning structure of tradition, but also recognise that tradition must not be idealised. For it might also embody interaction based on deception and distortion (ideology).

The task of enquiry, therefore, would be to illuminate the assumptions and premises of social life that are subject to transformation and those propositions which are not (Wright,
Hamilton (1978, p. 19) argues that positivistic philosophy weakened the power of systematic inquiry by separating logic (explanation) and cognition (understanding). Critical inquiry, in abandoning the cognitive-logical polarity, produces an educational theory that...acknowledges the dynamic quality of human history; accepts the open-ended nature of research and action; and aims to reduce the apparent complexity of human experience and finally operates through the translation of private knowledge into public discourse. To generalise is to render a public account of the past, present or future in a form that can be 'tested' through further action and inquiry.

This stance implies, for example, that the school system would be studied in totality, not in isolation so that an understanding of its contradictions and issues would be viewed as necessary to enable people to develop a more adequate sense of how to penetrate institutional structures and to inform practical actions. Giroux (1979, p. 10) asserts that "as a mode of reasoning, the category of totality in the dialectic allows educators not only to become more critically interpretative, it also suggests new ways of acting in the world; it helps teachers and students alike to link knowledge with specific normative interests, with specific frames of reference".

Knowledge that emerges from such a paradigm would instruct "the oppressed" about their situation as a group situated within specific relations of domination and subordination. It would be knowledge that would illuminate how the oppressed could develop a discourse free from the distortions of their own cultural inheritance...it would be a form of knowledge that instructed the oppressed in how to appropriate the most progressive dimensions of their own cultural histories as well as how to restructure and appropriate the most radical aspects of bourgeois culture. Finally, such knowledge would have to provide a motivational connection to action itself; it would have to link a radical decoding of history to a vision of the future that not only exploded the reifications
of the existing society, but also reached into those...longing for a new society and new forms of social relations (Aronowitz and Giroux, 1985, p. 35).

Smith (1993), in commenting on the potentials for empowerment in critical education research, identified three interrelated spheres of empowerment: one sphere emerging from the discourses of social psychology, another sphere emerging from the discourse of critical social theory, being concerned with a political reading of the world and the unmasking of false consciousness. The third sphere emerges from the closely related discourse of social activism (Smith, 1993, p. 77).

For Black South Africans who need to affirm their own histories through the use of a language and a set of social relations, the body of knowledge that emerges from a critical social science will help them reconstruct and dignify the cultural experiences that make up the history of their daily lives. It would be possible then, for those who were traditionally voiceless, to learn skills and knowledge that will allow them to critically examine the role society has played in their own self-formation.

Smith (1993, p. 75) asserts that just being informed by critical theory is no guarantee that a critical research approach will be empowering or be empowering in a way we recognise as being significant. As such he has prepared a conceptual scheme of three identifiable and interrelated spheres of empowerment to be used as a template in ascertaining the empowerment potentials in critical educational research methodologies. The three spheres of empowerment are (Smith, 1993, p. 79):

A. Empowerment as self-growth which indicate:
   - change in self-knowledge
   - increase in self-esteem
   - strengthening of personal confidence
- growing sense of determination and assertiveness
- acquisition of specific/social skills.

Possible procedures would encourage individuals to:
- tell their story
- reflect on their perceptions and understandings in terms of their validity
- uncover, explore and resolve repressed feelings
- identify specific skills or competencies.

B. Empowerment as political consciousness-raising which indicate:
- developing scepticism about appearances
- questioning assumptions of neutrality and equality in educational provisions
- recognising the 'raced', classed and gendered
- recognising historical and political antecedents to contemporary practices.

Possible processes that embody the concept of empowerment as political consciousness-raising are:
- those that are responsive to the view that participants' interpretations often encompass meanings which sustain their powerlessness
- those that reinterpret participants' perceptions and practices in relation to a general theory of society which recognises the structured and historical roots of social and cultural reproduction and resistance
- those that re-situate the particular into the wider social and cultural arena
- those that employ analytic concepts which highlight how culturally constructed and value-laden our understandings and practices can be.

C. Empowerment as collective action/struggle which indicate:
- authentic participation of the researched in the research, i.e. the dissolution of the conventional distinction between the researcher and the researched and the incorporation of genuine sharing of perceptions and
self-reflections of all participants who have an interest in the outcomes of the research

- the development of a shared ideology critique which is integral to subjecting individual and shared understandings to critical review
- a reconstructed and shared theory which forms the basis of a critique of the interests served by contemporary understandings, practice and institutional arrangements
- planning of activities or programs designed to challenge, resist or transform those conditions which are creating the false consciousness or the alienation, or the oppression of particular groups
- collective strategic action.

Possible research designs which foster such outcomes are:

- those where reciprocity and reflexivity are incorporated in the research process, not just as a method to verify data, but in order to help participants understand and change their situation
- the use of the language of critique and the language of possibility, the former uniting with the latter when it points to the conditions for new forms of culture, alternative social practices, new modes of communication and a practical vision for the future
- premised on and responsible to the inherent capacity of people to construct their worlds, i.e. those which embrace the potentials of human agency
- those which engender solidarity through change
- those which engage communities of interested participants in critical dialogue, decision-making and strategic action.

Smith (1993, p. 84) suggests that the critical, non-participatory and non-interventionist characteristics shared by critical ethnography, critical policy analysis and critical text analysis contain their empowerment potentials. Such a premise is diagrammatically represented by Smith (1993, p. 85) to show a 'gap' between the production of a critical report (ie the critical re-interpretation in the form of a narrative) and the possibility that stakeholders will read that report, reflect on its cogency and consequences and proceed to initiate change (or transformative action).
Table 1.2.4.1: Diagram showing empowerment potentials

With regards to critical policy analysis (in the form of analysis as evaluation of a policy document) which is also of particular interest to the researcher, Smith (1993, p. 86) asserts that this form of inquiry is usually constrained to the critical re-interpretation of policy as text in the name of "equity, justice and a caring community". Prominent proponents of such a view include Prunty (1985) who views policy as the authoritative allocation and legitimation of values; Grimley (1986) who sees policy as commonly expressed by a politically dominant group and Anderson (1979) who sees policy as serving procedural, distributive or re-distributive or regulatory ends. Despite this, Robinson (1992) and Popkewitz (1984) assert that no matter how elegant the design or social significance of these critical inquiries their empowering potentials are limited. Smith (1993, p. 89) argues, however, that in the self-critical and reflexive spirit characteristic of critical researchers, applying the empowering potentials of non-participatory and non-interventionist research, does not unproblematically endorse current practices and sanctions of participatory and interventionist designs. Miller and Martens (1990) believe that experience is penetrating that participation and intervention in order to transform the relations of domination.
1.3 Critique as Nature of the Inquiry of Present Thesis

The purpose of this section of the chapter is to detail the way in which a critical method of analysis will be applied to examine the African National Congress (ANC) educational policy in South Africa. The critical method of inquiry is selected because it is the only form of critique, from those discussed earlier, which is consistent with the theoretical orientations and goal of the inquiry constituted by this thesis. The thesis is a theoretical endeavour with critical intent at the level of practice. As a goal it seeks to examine the current education policy in South Africa under the African National Congress and assess the impact of the critical tradition on such policy formulation. It is hoped that the inquiry reported in this thesis, though operating within the constraints of a monologic, academic endeavour, would be able to shed light on present African National Congress policy and assess its value as an avenue for educational change in South Africa.

The critical interest of the inquiry is in knowing 'what is to be done' to change the practices of researchers, policy-makers and practitioners in an emancipatory and educative direction. An important step in this direction, is gaining an understanding of the current state of affairs in the policy field in South Africa. To understand this, it is necessary to know (1) the conceptual and logical character of the theory field and the conceptual frameworks influencing practice; and (2) the location of the current theory and practice in the historical, economic and social circumstances. In other words, the critique of South African Education Policy is an analytic tool that looks below the surface features to the underlying conceptual and logical character and externally beyond the boundaries of the immediate object to the formative processes and structures of history, the economy and society. Such an analysis facilitates the exercise of rational judgement to examine the internal and external character of a research and policy field and a set of practices. The use of the critical method does not, however, preclude the incorporation of other more conventional research methods in the overall approach to supplement and strengthen the critique.
The critique of South African Education Policy takes as its object the ANC draft *Policy Document for Education* (1994) in South Africa as well as the ANC *Reconstruction and Development Programme* (1994). The critical method is applied as two moments of criticism: internal and holistic or external. The concluding remarks that sum up the findings of the internal and holistic criticism include a brief discussion of transcendent possibilities. The internal criticism of the intellectual field begins by describing the typical theoretical orientations evident in the research studies (Chapter Two). This involves highlighting the problems of logic and concept and problems of design and interpretation.

The holistic criticism begins by highlighting the historical, economic and social context for the emergence of and conduct of this study (Chapter Three). Since the object of this critique is the policy documents of the ANC, discourse analysis is employed as part of the moment of internal criticism as the language of the policy text signals problems of logic and concept and reveals the nature of the values embedded implicitly within it (Chapters Four and Five). The holistic criticism of the policy field locates ANC education policy in 1994 within a historical, economic and social context. This external moment of criticism also considers ideological aspects of the policy as promulgated and the structural character of the processes implied for policy-making.

In this thesis, the internal criticism becomes a ground-clearing exercise where the existent states of affairs are looked at. The state of affairs in South Africa prior to ANC victory in 1994 is assessed through the examination of the problems of logic and concept inherent in the other two research methods: positivist and interpretive and the holistic moment of critique emerges when the gaps are revealed. This is a dialectical process that emerges in Chapter Five after examining the boundaries, scope or outer limits of the state of affairs from Chapter Two through to Chapter Five. The object of critique here is not the internal
standard of rules but the connections between the socially structured systems of thought and action. In tracing the broad social, economic and historical context of the existent state of affairs in Chapter Three, ideological issues emerge. The use of Habermas's critical method is valuable in revealing contradictions and/or distortions WITHIN the system of thought, policy or practice under scrutiny; in locating such contradictions and/or distortions in a wider historical, social and economic, EXTERNAL, framework and in suggesting alternative possibilities for FUTURE reconstruction that can transcend existing levels of theory and practice.

This summary of the nature of the inquiry of the research has now been completed. Before proceeding to the specific details of the three main paradigms in social theory, discussed in Chapter Two, the History of South Africa in Chapter Three, and Present Educational Policy in South Africa in Chapter Four and a Critique of the present policy in Chapter Five, it must be stressed that the present endeavour besides being more theoretical than practical is also more illustrative than definitive. There is nonetheless a theoretical and a practical side to the total research program constituted by the present doctoral thesis.

The theoretical side is encapsulated in the present and three later chapters which define the critical orientation and the method of analysis employed in the thesis. The practical side is illustrated in the application of the method of critique, as a method of meta-analysis to a particular policy field: Present Educational Policy in South Africa to be discussed in Chapter Five. The third and final moment of critique according to Habermas, transcendental critique is partially attempted in the summary and conclusion when alternative possibilities are given and appropriate forms of a process of concrete transcendence by discourse institutionalised among participants is suggested. In this sense is represents a synthesis of the thesis and the anti-thesis.
Chapter 2  Critical Theory as Orientation of Thesis

2.1  Introduction

This chapter deals with the theoretical foundations of the present research. The purpose is to make explicit the theoretical framework adopted in this thesis in an attempt to examine the impact of the critical tradition on South African policy formation. Pursuit of these theoretical concerns also anticipates the examination of policy theory. According to Fay (1975), Bernstein (1976), Bredo and Feinberg (1982) and other contemporary theorists including Habermas (1971), there are at least three modes of inquiry or paradigmatic orientations in social theory, namely, 'positivism', 'interpretivism' and 'critical theory'. The chapter includes a general discussion of the features of each paradigm as well as an outline of their differing accounts of the nature, grounding and scope of knowledge.

Before attempting any insight into critical theory it is important to engage in a little ground clearing. We need to remember that critical theory is not a unified body of thought, in respect of its breath and its many versions and manifestations. As such the theoretical development of the thesis is limited because it is incomplete. It is a tentative and preliminary excursion into relatively unknown territory rather than a fully worked theoretical account of a territory that has been only recently claimed; we do not have as yet a fully articulated critical theory of policy analysis nor much systematic discussion of critical theory as a method of procedure. As such critical theory is complex. It is more a tradition of thinking than a coherent body of theory and the content of critical theory is indeterminate. It is a procedural rather than a substantive form of inquiry: a method of approach rather than a specific set of propositions. The only unchanging thesis common to all 'critical' theoretical writings is that critical theory is itself changeable. Namely, through an analysis of the historical conditions which inform its own categories, 'critical theory' seeks to adapt those categories anew to historical reality.
In respect of content, the only properties of critical theory are a practical position and a place in the history of philosophy seen as a reflection of social development. The practical position is an interest in understanding forms of domination as a first step to freeing people from such repression. In view of the complexity of critical theory it is impossible for the researcher to discuss all modes of thought claiming to contain roots of critical theory. Instead the researcher has been selective in the choice of content related to critical theory and which are justified below and later in the thesis. A discussion of post-colonialism and theories of state is included in the thesis to mark the scramble now taking place within critical theory over the valency of the 'post-colonial' market, a debate whose specific provenance is an emerging critical and pedagogical field within the apparatus of the Western 'humanities'. With regards to theories of State, the critical version of post-colonialism submits the operations of the law to forms of scrutiny which aim to expose inconsistencies or concealed interests. This suggests that the State is the expression and enactment of the domanitive class and economic relations at work in any particular historical period. Submitting the State to critical analysis has the aim of revealing the constructedness and sometimes sheer arbitrariness of rules and structures which assumes to be natural, permanent and essential.

As such an important aspect in pursuit of the critical interest of the present inquiry is not only gaining an understanding of the nature of the current state of affairs in the theory field but involves also an examination and understanding of the meaning of policy and the models of policy-making. The features of the competing paradigms—positivism, interpretivism and critical theory have to be reiterated in order to understand the relationship between research and policy and for identifying the emancipatory possibilities for policy-making in education.

It is argued that positivism is poorly adapted to social analysis because of its failure to locate the knowing subject, reflexively, in a psychological and structural/historical
framework. A form of reason which fails to provide such a location is a form of reason whose self-image is subjective but not objective. It is one-sided because it 'looks outward' from the knowing subject to the world in a naïve and ingenuous way, without at the same time looking inward to the subject and the location of the subject in a wider objective framework. The failure of positivism's attempt to provide a clear account of theory testing means that it is no longer possible to see this "context of verification" as a sieve by means of which values, which come into the "process of discovery", can be removed from knowledge. Instead, it is necessary to view theory-formation and theory testing in a broader way.

It is also argued that the interpretive approach, however powerful its critique of earlier forms of positivism, must itself be transcended. Interpretivism rejects positivism's narrow behavioural view of evidence in the human studies, but it also rejects the objectivism and decisiveness of positivism's account of the logic of theory testing, leaving a descriptive empiricism which can multiply accounts of systems of meaning and value but can neither translate one into another or choose between their competing accounts of reality.

It is shown that critical theory, an alternative paradigm that transcends both the implicit absolutism of positivism and the implicit relativism of interpretivism should be given serious attention because it promises to remember the lessons of the interpretive critique of positivism without giving way to complete relativism. As a procedural rather than a substantive inquiry which in a fundamental sense is concerned with education, it sets out a procedure for rational-valuing—the method of critique—internal, holistic and quasi-transcendental.

When applied to the policy field, such a method of critique improves our understanding of the school/industry interface and is able to penetrate the 'transition from apartheid to
democracy and equal rights for all citizens' to reveal ideological distortions in communicative patterns and structural connections. In Apartheid South Africa particularly, the intellectual and policy fields were dominated by positivist orientations which were inadequate because of their one-sidedness and failure to address value issues and omission of structural factions like class, race, gender and culture. The new African National Congress policy document (1994), despite its difficulties, does have emancipatory potential. At a theoretical level, the attempt to reformulate the notion of education, to recognise the importance of consensual, discursive forms of communication makes the education policy document of South Africa emancipatory rather than repressive. For policy to be emancipatory it means at the simplest level dialogue with and direct input from those whose experiences and attitudes will be shaped by such policy.

2.2 Paradigmatic Orientations
The discussion of the three paradigmatic orientations of competing modes of inquiry, namely 'positivism', 'interpretivism' and 'critical theory' is intended to demonstrate that which is available to the would-be researcher or policy analyst. This alerts the would-be researcher policy analyst to the fundamental concerns that arise with any attempt to examine social phenomena as well as making explicit the theoretical framework adopted in the present research to examine South African policy.

An important reason for the inclusion of the three paradigms for discussion in this thesis is that social science researchers, faced with the need to choose between apparently competing alternatives, have tended to opt for either the dominant mode of positivism, or to assume, somewhat naively, that it makes no difference which paradigm is adopted or which method is applied—only that a choice is declared.

However, to go below the surface of the three paradigms available to social science researchers requires a more sophisticated assessment of the competing claims—an
assessment that considers features such as the account given to the nature of knowledge, the grounds used to establish valid and reliable knowledge and the scope assumed for knowledge. Such an assessment, assumes a fuller description of the key characteristics of each paradigm and the significant points of departure between them. This is undertaken in this chapter.

2.2.1 Positivism and the Nature of Knowledge

Although it was Auguste Comte (1798-1857) who invented the term 'positivism', the main themes underlying his discussion of such a paradigmatic orientation has roots in seventeenth century empiricism and ideas of progress central to eighteenth century Enlightenment thinkers. These intellectual traditions provided the basis for Comte's positivism but his ideas, that progress of society can be achieved by the application of scientific theories of social reform, were also shared by nineteenth century European thinkers. Moreover, since Comte's time, different conceptions of positivism have appeared. The discussion of positivism in this chapter will thus focus on the classical formulation by Comte through to the form of logical positivism that emerged in the 1920s and 1930s by the Vienna Circle.

The existence of the many diverse understandings of 'positivism' as a term, reveals that the issue of what positivism is, and was, remains controversial. Halfpenny (1982) identifies at least twelve positivisms. He argues that, deriving from Comte, there are four definitions: (1) a theory of history where improvements in knowledge contribute to progress and social stability; (2) as scientific knowledge grounded in observation; (3) as 'scientism' (the co-extension of knowledge and science) and; (4) as a secular religion of society. In addition, a further definition can be derived from Spencer (1900), when he argues that positivism (5) is an evolutionary progress based on competition between individuals. Durkheim (1964), offered the seventh definition when he argued that positivism (6) consisted of the quantification of data through statistical analysis.
Halfpenny suggests a further two meanings from the associated academic field of logical positivism where positivism (7) is seen as a theory of meaning, where the meaning of a proposition depends upon its method of verification, and, (8) where positivism is conceived of as a program for the syntactual and semantic unification of the sciences. The ninth comes from Hempel’s (1965) identification of positivism (9) with the Deductive-Nomological (D-N) Schema. In the tenth, positivism is seen as a (10) theory of knowledge according to which science consists of a corpus of causal laws on the basis of which phenomena are explained and predicted. According to Bacon, positivism (11) is a theory of scientific method where progress can be made from observation and experimentation. Finally, Popper (1966) sees positivism (12) as a scientific method where progress in science is made through a process of falsifying hypotheses.

Such diversity, with regards to the definition of ‘positivism’, reflects the ambiguity inherent in the meaning of the term. Despite this, the most systematically developed definitions were presented by the philosopher Kolakowski (1972) and extended by the sociologist Giddens (1974). In his overall view, Kolakowski sees positivism as a "collection of rules and evaluative criteria for referring to human knowledge", and as a "normative attitude, regulating how we use such terms as 'knowledge', 'science', 'cognition', and 'information' " (Kolakowski, 1972, p. 11). Kolakowski presents four main rules as to what counts as knowledge. (1) The rule of phenomenalism states that "we are entitled to record only that which is actually manifested in experience" (Kolakowski, 1972, p. 11). Kolakowski stresses that "positivists do not object to inquiry into the immediately invisible causes of any observed phenomenon, they object only to any accounting for it in terms of occult entities that are by definition inaccessible to human knowledge" (Kolakowski, 1972, p. 12). This rule is repeated by Giddens and also by Hindess who believe that "positivism asserts the claims of experience as the ultimate foundation of human knowledge and denies the possibility of meaningful discourse concerning supersensible objects" (Hindess, 1977, p. 16).
Second, Kolakowski's rule of nominalism follows from the first and states: "that we may not assume that any insight formulated in general terms can have any real referents other than individual facts" (Kolakowski, 1972, p. 15). Alternative lines on this issue were a major factor in the differentiation of the French and British traditions of positivism in the nineteenth century. There are also parallels in Germany and Austria in economics and economic history and in Weber's opposition to the Hegelian legacy in social thought. This issue also recurs in arguments about methodological individualism in Popper (1966), Watkins (1952; 1956) and Lukes (1968).

Kolakowski's third rule is one that refuses to call value judgements and normative statements knowledge. Kolakowski believes that, in addition, the rule of nominalism "renders untenable the assumption that beyond the visible world there exists a domain of values 'in themselves', with which our evaluations are correlated in some mysterious way" (Kolakowski, 1972, p. 16). Giddens' definition of a rule, is perhaps an appropriate response to this in that he asserts that "judgements of value have no empirical content of a sort which renders them accessible to any tests of their 'validity' in the light of experience" (Giddens, 1974, p. 3). The French tradition from Saint-Simon (1952) to Durkheim (1966) tried to find some law of history which governed the variations in values and norms to be found in societies of different social types, in the belief that such a law would allow moral and political choice and decision-making to proceed on a scientific basis (Bryant, 1985, p. 6).

Kolakowski's fourth tenet is the belief in the essential unity of the scientific method. Saint-Simon (1952) believed that the unity of science stemmed from the law of gravity. Giddens (1974, p. 80) discussion of the applicability of the methods of the natural sciences to the social sciences is the closest approximation to Kolakowski's rule four. Giddens (1974, p. 81), in his discussion of Dilthey says that "Dilthey opposed the views to authors such as Comte and J.S. Mill, who emphasised the continuity of the scientific
study of nature and society, stressing instead the subjective”. While the articulation of Kolakowski’s views do not help to clarify the contentions inherent in the concept of ‘positivism’, they nevertheless, do provide general orientations and highlight certain central issues. An attempt will be made to look at at least three different intellectual periods that attempted to analyse these different characterisations presented by Kolakowski and others.

Non-positivists or anti-positivists have today taken up strong positions particularly with regards to Kolakowski’s four main tenets. On the question of phenomenalism, structural Marxists (Glucksmann, 1974; Hindess and Hirst, 1975, 1977) argue that the observable aspects of social formations—that is, their phenomenal aspects—are not to be confused with their essential or underlying features which constitute their deeper structures. What is more, they even consider that the analyses and explanation of the readily observable phenomena of social life provide false models of the social formations which are under investigation” (Lane, 1970, pp. 341-342). Essentially then, the structural Marxists criticise positivists for emphasising that what is directly observable constitutes science. In contrast, neo-Marxists, opposed to positivism, believe in phenomenalism by asserting to be scientific in their study of society and dismissing alternative options, namely positivism and interpretivism, of studying society as being ideological. Anti-positivists criticise this assertion of neo-Marxists as being positivistic.

The positivist conception of the unity of science, that the methods employed to study society, are the same as those studied by natural sciences, has been challenged by ethnomethodologists who say that apart from there being more to social reality than appearances might suggest, these appearances might also be misleading. Cohen (1980), in commenting on the ethnomethodologists, suggests that “their own solution seems to be one that starts with a tabula rasa or at least with a state of mind as near to it as possible—allowing the careful observation of phenomena, as they readily occur, to suggest
connections which can then be upgraded to low-level hypotheses, which stick close to the facts and which emerge from them with little nudging”.

These sort of debates about the definition of positivism are frequent (Giddens, 1974; Adey and Frisby, 1976), even though the term is used in different senses. Essentially, there are two positivisms, that of the nineteenth century and that of the twentieth century. Both are influenced by the philosophy of the Enlightenment. In the nineteenth century positivism, metaphysics and theology are emphasised as opposed to reason. Undisciplined speculation is disregarded in favour of tested and systematised experience (Mills, 1959, p. 389). Comte (1844), believed that all knowledge in the history of science, passed through three stages, the religious, metaphysical, and the scientific. The last stage epitomised his positivism. The twentieth century logical positivists (Carnap, 1958; Neurath, 1944; Feigl, 1969a; Reichenbach, 1949) were concerned to demarcate science from opinion by the logical analysis of language “and the application of a radical form of empiricism embodied in the verifiability criterion of meaning” (Halfpenny and McMyler, 1994, p. xiv). The positivist view of science together with the unity of scientific method, as explained by Kolakowski, constitutes positivist social science (Lessnoff, 1974; Keat and Urry, 1975; Benton, 1977). For the purposes of this chapter, the focus will be specifically on the positivist conception of science, the kind of knowledge it generates and the ways in which claims to this knowledge are justified.

Within a positivist approach, explanations have to conform to scientific laws. Statements expressing these laws are descriptions of regular relationships that are taken to hold at all times and places, past, present and future; they are strictly universal (Evans, 1979, p. 76). Homans (1964), uses the basic laws of behavioural psychology to explain social and historical phenomenas. "When a response is followed by a reward, the frequency or probability of its recurrence increases." Fay (1975) asserts that such an account of explanation illustrates that scientific knowledge is used for prediction and control.
Hempel (1965) argues that explanation and prediction are the same in their structure and content, differing only in whether they are performed retrospectively or prospectively.

The positivist explanation of science also constitutes the notion of that which is observable. The only things that can properly be said to 'exist' are those that are accessible to the senses. By focusing on that which is observable, it means that the values held by the scientist are seen as irrelevant to the truth or falsity of their assertion.

"Science can discover what is the case and explain it; but it cannot show what should, or ought to, happen" (Weber, 1949; Lessnoff, 1974).

Positivism is thus opposed to the epistemology of the subjectivist paradigm and the significance of that opposition can be seen in the introduction to Kant's 'Critique of Pure Reason' where Kant (1950) asserts that

"though all our knowledge begins with experience, it does not follow that it arises out of experience. For it may well be that even our empirical knowledge is made up of what we receive through impressions and of what our own faculty of knowledge supplies from itself. If our faculty of knowledge makes any such addition, it may be that we are not in a position to distinguish it from the raw material until, with long practice of attention, we have become skilled in separating it. This, then, is a question which at least calls for closer examination, and does not allow of any off-hand answer: whether there is any knowledge that is thus independent of experience and even of all impressions of the senses. Such knowledge is called a priori, and distinguished from the empirical, which has its sources a posteriori, that is, in experience".

The theoretical position adopted by Kant, the existence of a priori knowledge is excluded from positivist epistemology.

In contrast to this tradition, realism, while rejecting the primacy of the observable, retains the view that some form of empirical testing is essential in the assessment of scientific theories. This latter view which the realists share with the positivists, has been the basis for objection from the anti-positivists who believe that the study of society consists of
social meanings that cannot be reduced to the discovery and validation of observable data. The idea of interpreting meanings has been central to much of the opposition to positivist social science (Outhwaite, 1975). Essentially, critics of positivism (e.g. Nagel, 1961) present the social sciences as subjective, lacking in objective criteria of validity. What should be stressed instead is that while the criteria of validity for interpretive knowledge may be different from empirical knowledge, this does not mean that they are inferior. Apel (1972) and Giddens (1976) have asserted that knowledge generated in the natural sciences are social since they involve communicative interactions between scientists.

The value-free notion of positivism has also come under attack from anti-positivists since it is a belief that any theoretical framework expresses evaluative attitudes towards society and its members. Taylor (1967) and Israel (1972) re-affirm the assertion that "to adopt one such framework rather than another is, amongst other things, to accept that evaluative position, to commit oneself to the political and moral values it reflects".

The view of the natural sciences adopted by the positivists "pre-supposes a view of the physical world as a possible object of prediction and human technological control" (Irvine, Miles and Evans, 1979). Such a view is further emphasised by the focus on prediction, explanation and laws. Marcuse (1964) and Fay (1975) believe that such a conception of science will treat human beings as objects to be manipulated and the design and organisation of societies to be solved by scientific expertise and, of course, political power.

In contrast to this, there developed in the twentieth century, a school of thought that felt there was a difference in the structure of the social world and the world of nature and that while the methods of the former consisted of explanation, that of the latter in understanding. This was the interpretive turn (Bloland, 1989) or what Bernstein (1983,
p. 30) called "a recovery of the hermeneutical dimension with its thematic emphasis on understanding and interpretation".

Bernstein (1983, p. 31) states that

"there is however, a much stronger and much more consequential sense than Kuhn's notion of a 'sensitive reading' in which the hermeneutical dimension of science has been recovered. In the critique of naïve and even of sophisticated forms of logical positivism and empiricism; in the questioning of the claims of the primacy of the hypothetical-deductive model of explanation; in the questioning of the sharp dichotomy that has been made between observation and theory; in the insistence on the under-determination of theory by fact; and in the exploration of the ways in which all description and observation are theory impregnated, we find claims and arguments that are consonant with those that have been at the very heart hermeneutics".

Hence, the twentieth century saw the replacement of notions of science as empiricist to notions concerned with judgement, understanding and interpretation.

2.2.2 Interpretivism and the Nature of Knowledge

"The persistent claim that it is science and science alone that is the measure of reality, knowledge and truth" (Bernstein, 1983, p. 46) has been replaced by the claim that reality is socially constructed (Berger and Luckmann, 1966; Harding and Hintikka, 1983), that knowledge is problematic and contested (Lather, 1988a) and that truth is locally and politically situated (Popkewitz, 1984). The significance of this shift is "that it presupposes a reliance on tacit knowledge as well as propositional knowledge and acknowledges, with feminist critics of science and philosophers that the teaching of method is nothing other than the teaching of a certain kind of history" (Lincoln, cited in Guba, 1990, p. 80).

The concept of interpretative understanding or 'verstehen' was at the centre of the debates carried on by the German-speaking historians, philosophers and sociologists in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The idea of 'understanding' could be set against
that of causal explanation, which was also characteristic of the German hostility to positivistic social thought of France and England represented respectively by Comte and J.S. Mill. According to Droysen, "there are three possible scientific methods: the speculative, the physical or mathematical and the historical. Their respective essences are to know, to explain and to understand" (Apel, 1984, p. 1). This was perhaps the first attempt made, in 1858, to distinguish explanation and understanding from the natural science as well as see the start of the hermeneutic-dialect.

The theory of understanding as a distinct cognitive process which results in the acquisition of knowledge had been pioneered by Wilhelm Dilthey (Apel, 1984; Rickman, 1962). "We explain through intellectual process, but we understand through the co-operation of all dispositional and spiritual forces (Gerütskrafte) in understanding and their submergence in the object" (Dilthey, cited in Apel, 1984, p. 3). Dilthey in Table 2.2.2.1 distinguishes three classes of "expressions of mental life".

**Table 2.2.2.1: Three Classes of Expressions of Mental Life**

| 1. | **Propositions** – which correspond to logical norms. They are context-independent and transported from one person to another without any change in their context. |
| 2. | **Actions** – which are related to the mental content which it expresses and permits inferences. |
| 3. | **Expression of experience** – there exists a relationship between the life form from which it springs and the understanding which it generates. |

Source: Outhwaite, 1975, p. 31.

These forms of understanding by Dilthey guarantee the possibility of inter-subjective communication and is clearly illustrated in the case of language where a sentence is understood because of the agreement in a speech community about the meaning of words, inflection and syntax.
For Gadamer (1976), seeing hermeneutics as a method for

"the objective understanding of meaning apart from significance makes a number of fundamental mistakes. First, this objectivism perpetuates an unacceptable subject-object dualism that is an illusion because finite, historical man always sees and understands from his standpoint in time and place; he cannot stand above the relativity of history and procure objectively valid knowledge" (Gadamer, cited in Palmer, 1969, p. 178).

The phenomenological movement, initially started from the work of Husserl (1962), was later developed by Alfred Schutz (1969) who promulgated a phenomenological approach (the philosophical study of meanings) to research in the social sciences in order to emphasise and explain the role of symbols. This interest in meaning and the cultural context was taken up by Garfinkel (1967) who argued that constitution of meaning occurred through the use of symbols and the meaning creating methods of participants (ethno-methodology). The latter schools represent the modern form of 'verstehende' and is characterised by an emphasis on the 'subjective meanings' of social agents and the way in which 'social structure' is built up out of a plurality of 'definitions of the situation'. Modern analytic philosophy, in its critique of logical positivism, has also provided another position on 'verstehen'.

The concept of understanding or 'verstehen' has, however, been a storm centre of current debates. Aron (1957), writing about German sociology, spoke of the ambiguity of the concept. Parsons (1949) calls it "this somewhat difficult concept". Hughes (1959, p. 24) refers to it as "the most difficult intellectual problem...the murkiest of the dark corners in the labyrinth of German social science methods". Lundberg (1964, p. 25), in commenting on the concept of understanding, asserts that "the error lies in overlooking that insight and understanding are the ends at which all methods aim, rather than methods in themselves" and von Mises (1956, pp. 25, 32) believes that "understanding, then, is nothing but the subsumption of an event in a primitive 'theory' which covers a limited range of experience...it is not possible to state a special act of
understanding in the humanities which would consist of anything else but reducing to earlier experiences and subsumption under the known, habitual and repeatedly observed”.

These assertions clearly deny that a distinctive procedure is involved in the social sciences. Hayek (1964, pp. 31; 41) has convincingly argued:

"the shout, the bandished fist, the distorted face have no physically ascertainable feature in common. They can only be classed together because they are all expressions of anger. If it were objected that all the above forms of behaviour could be classed together because they lead to the same kind of action (i.e. behaviour designed to damage or destroy the object of the anger) the same argument would apply. Ignoring a person, striking him, insulting him, or depriving him of something he needs are quite different from the point of view of behaviour; but they are all motivated by anger. The behaviourist cannot classify and explain social occurrences if he refuses to take into account the mental occurrences which activate behaviour and can be understood because they do so."

Essentially, interpretative approaches claim that there should be "an openness to the conceptions and understandings of those people or groups whom one studies and much more tentativeness in the way the researcher holds or applies his or her concepts, particularly because their correct usage depends upon the conceptions of those being studied" (Bredo and Feinberg, 1982, p. 4).

Interpretivist knowledge, therefore, comprises the reconstruction of inter-subjective meanings, the interpretive understanding of the meanings humans construct in a given context and how these meanings interrelate to form a whole. Interpretivist knowledge will hence be more context-specific and less generalised. According to Glaser and Strauss (1967), interpretivist knowledge is grounded knowledge, not developed from armchair speculations or elegant deductive reasoning but both discovered and justified from the field-based inductive methodology of interpretivist inquiry. Such knowledge also represents inside understanding of the perspectives and meanings of those in the
setting being studied and comprises both propositional and tacit information. The understanding communicated in interpretivist knowledge then comes not only from its words but from the broadly shared contexts of natural experience within which it is embedded.

According to Lincoln, "interpretivist knowledge constitutes not nomothetic models but holistic pattern theories or webs of mutual and plausible influence, webs that reflect a hermeneutic intertwinement of part and whole and a view of knowledge that is more circular or 'amoebalike' then hierarchic and pyramid like" (Guba, 1990, p. 84). Interpretivist understanding also aims for internal consistency and coherence. "Correspondence theories identify truth with a relationship between language and reality, coherence theories identify truth with internal consistency among claims within a language" (Howe, 1988, p.15).

The knowledge generated from interpretivism is value bound and hence "conflictual, problematic and contested...locally and politically situated" (Guba, 1990, p. 80). Moreover, social inquiry is meaningful only because it does involve values (Smith, 1983, p. 47).

If all knowledge is socially constructed, value bound and indeterminate, "only true and context bound working hypotheses are possible" (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p. 37). Such hypotheses are not connected to a prior theory but to a context-specific, often emergent inquiry problem, which may or may not be informed by existing knowledge. "The evidence generated by interpretive research is much more likely to be of an evocative rather than a comprehensive kind, to be sustained, rejected or refined through future studies. The conclusions from one study merely provide a starting point in a continuing cycle of inquiry, which may or [may not] over time serve to generate
persuasive patterns of data from which further conclusions can be drawn" (Morgan, 1983c, p. 398).

Being value-laden, interpretivist knowledge is not neutral but is permeated by the values and interests of the inquirer. In the case of an inquiry, what is represented are the meanings and values of respondents making the inquirer's role one of "translating or intermediary among differing communities" (Bredo and Feinberg, 1982, pp. 430-431). Interpretivist inquiry then is not directly [or necessarily] concerned with judging, evaluating or condemning existing forms of social and political reality, or with changing the world (Bernstein, 1976, p. 169). Emphasis is rather on describing and understanding its meaning and to enrich human discourse. Interpretivist knowledge, implies ways in which human beings categorise, code, process and impute meaning to their experiences. It is not an accumulation of facts but ways of construing the world. In this context, the world is viewed as a 'life-world' which is lived in and largely taken for granted (Schutz, 1969 and Luckmann, 1977). It is actor rather than observer defined. Everyday life is inter-subjective, that is, shared with others. According to Schutz (1969), knowledge of everyday life is organised in zones around a person's "here and now". The zones are both spatial and temporal, of different degrees of relevance: first, face-to-face encounters and, then, more distant zone where encounters are more typified.

Knowledge of everyday life is, hence, oriented to solving practical problems. 'Recipe knowledge', an example of practical knowledge is limited to pragmatic competence in routine tasks. The 'stock of knowledge' an explorative type of knowledge allows us to make decisions involving choices between alternatives based on existing stocks of knowledge. To analyse the life worlds of individuals and the way information reaches them, is to analyse their cognitive maps, which categorise the world of experience into phenomena. Bruner et al (1956), maintain that the learning and utilisation of categories
represents the most elementary and general form of cognition by which humanity adjusts to its environment.

As is evident by this portrayal of interpretivist knowledge, knowledge is grounded (Glaser and Strauss, 1967) and embedded in practice. As such, it is not developed from speculation or deductive reasoning but justified by the field-based inductive methodology of interpretivist inquiry (Guba and Lincoln, 1988a, pp. 89-115). Such knowledge also represents inside understanding of the perspectives and meanings of those in the setting being studied and comprises both propositional and tacit information. The understanding communicated in interpretivist knowledge comes not only from words but from the broadly shared contexts of natural experience within which it is embedded (Stake, 1983, pp. 279-286).

It has also been argued that being value-laden, interpretivist knowledge is "conflictual, problematic and contested...locally and politically situated" (Guba, 1990, p. 80). This also implies that interpretivist knowledge is permeated by the values of the inquirer even as it seeks to reconstruct others' sense of meaning and beliefs. Bernstein (1976, p. 169) says interpretivist inquiry even though embedded in the world of practice "is not directly concerned with judging, evaluating, or condemning existing forms of social and political reality or with changing the world but with describing and understanding its constitutive meaning". Emphasis is on enriching human discourse, "to enlarge the conversation" (Smith, 1984, p. 390).

The production of interpretivist knowledge then, resides in the processes by which social actors interact, negotiate and accommodate each others' life worlds. Such an approach, by focusing on different, possibly conflicting, forms of knowledge, how they intersect and interact is of value for analysing the production, utilisation and transformation of knowledge. By focusing on the different constructions of social reality by actors in a
social situation, the social implications of such actions and constructions may be traced out, enabling one to more adequately understand the significance of human agency in social situations.

2.2.3 Critical Theory and the Nature of Knowledge

It has been shown through a discussion of positivism that it is concerned with a form of reason with a doctrine about the logic and grounding of knowledge. The arguments of Positivism are unconvincing in their discussion of the process of science and the role of values in scientific thought is not explored. Despite its criticism of positivism's behavioural view of evidence in the human studies, interpretivism itself also rejects the objectivism of positivism, leaving a descriptive empiricism which can multiply accounts of systems of meaning and value but can neither translate one into another or choose between their competing accounts of reality. An alternative approach is needed that allows for the judgement of the adequacy or otherwise of competing belief systems. Critical theory offers the capacity for such judgement.

Critical theory owes its origins to Hegel and Marx, its systematisation to Horkheimer and his associates at the Institute of Social Research in Frankfurt and its development to successors, particularly Jürgen Habermas (Jay, 1973; Wellmer, 1971; O'Neill, 1977; Held, 1980; Geuss, 1981; Roderick, 1986; Kellner, 1989; McCarthy, 1978, 1991). Hegel, in his "Phenomenology of Spirit" (1977), developed the concept of the moving subject which, through the process of self-reflection, comes to know itself at even higher levels of consciousness. In this book, Hegel tried to show the relationship between thought and action when he discussed the master/slave dialectic and the struggle between virtue and the way of the world. With regards to the first relationship, according to Hegel, "self-consciousness exists in and for itself when, and by the fact that, it so exists for another: that is, it exists only in being acknowledged" (Hegel, 1977, p. 111).
The slave transforms his or her identity by shaping the world and thus becomes something other than a slave. In the struggle between ancient classical virtue and the way of the modern world, the latter triumphs as a higher form of human self-knowledge oriented towards freedom. Historical development, as the institutionalisation of human action, became an element in human rationality. Critical theory derives its basic insight through a process of self-reflection in history. According to Hegel (1956), critique as criticism refers to a system of constraints which are humanly produced. For Hegel, critique makes transparent what has been hidden, through initiation of the process of self-reflection as outlined above. In respect of the theoretical work of the Frankfurt School, "the critical significance of Hegel's phenomenology lay not merely in its materialist component; the idealist conception of history as ultimately the work of Spirit was a critical reflection of the real alienation of productive powers" (Slater, 1977, p. 33).

Marx, in contrast, came to the conclusion that the course of human freedom culminating in the modern state, (which Hegel documented as leading from slavery to emancipation - the so-called course of human reason) was no emancipation at all. The task of emancipation which could be carried on by critical theory would be radical social transformation. Marx attempted to ground his claims of transformative action in species being. According to Marx, the modern productive process does not allow the worker to constitute himself or herself as a species being, that is, a person who can function for another human being. The point of revolution would be to bring the human being to his or her full and proper capacities as a being for whom the species would be the end, object and aim. Marx is criticised since he "tends to view the self-formative process of the species uni-dimensionally in terms of progress through productive activity. The institutional framework is regarded as an aspect of the productive process" (McCarthy, 1978, p. 83).
Roderick has summed up the context of the Frankfurt School views about Marxism thus, "...the deterioration of orthodox Marxism into a 'legitimation of science'; the inability of the modern proletariat to fill the role originally assigned to it by Marx and the world-wide advance of technological and bureaucratic modes of domination" (Roderick, 1986, p. 20). Habermas' critical theory of society is best understood by the Hegelian-Marxist attempt to articulate a concept of critical reason. For Habermas, "Marx's work contains the principle elements required for an adequate conception of reason and the interest of reason in emancipation" (McCarthy, 1978, p. 82).

Critical theory, as a model of reflection, owes its systematisation to the twentieth century, in particular to the work of Horkheimer and the Frankfurt School. "The separation between the individual and society in virtue of which the individual accepts as natural the limits prescribed for his activity is relativised in Critical Theory. The latter considers the overall framework which is conditioned by the blind interaction of individual activities (that is, the existent division of labour and class distinctions) to be a function which originates in human action and, therefore, is a possible object of painful decision and rational determination of goals" (Horkheimer, 1972, p. 207).

Horkheimer's reliance on Marxian doctrine as the epistemological foundation for critical theory is apparent when he says that a critical theory of society will show "how an exchange economy, given the conditions of men, must necessarily lead to a heightening of those social tensions which in the present historical era lead in turn to wars and revolution" (Horkheimer, 1972, p. 266). As Marx used political economy, Horkheimer used his model of economic determinism to predict the development of social contradictions in the modern world. Connerton (1976) claims that Horkheimer's theory is flawed because "its search for a secure ground now appears to swing between the unstable poles of an absence and an affirmation: the absence of substantive work on political economy has its counterpart in the affirmation of historicity as a formal
principal" (Connerton, 1976, p. 40). In contrast, Held (1980) claims that "Horkheimer's thought on ideology...recast the terms of reference of critique and reinforce the emancipatory intent of Marx's enterprise" (Held, 1980, p. 353).

In the post 1930's, critical theory could be characterised by its critique of modes of rationality and by an analysis of culture and civilisation under 'dialectic of Enlightenment'. The principle representatives of this period were Horkheimer and Adorno who, after the Second World War, had a deep pessimism about the future course of rationality and who changed their focus from Hegel and Marx to Weber. Weber speculated that in the course of western history, reason frees itself from its more mythic and religious sources and becomes ever more purposive, more oriented to means to the exclusion of ends. Reason, devoid of its redemptive and reconciliatory possibilities, could only be purposive, useful and calculating (Horkheimer, 1974). Horkheimer took this a step further in his designation of the term 'instrumental reason' where reason was used for social control. Instrumental reason was the ability of those in power to dominate and control society for their own purposes (Horkheimer, 1974). Both Horkheimer and Adorno saw the Enlightenment as being dialectical, associated with rationality itself. While the Enlightenment unMASKS the acts of those who govern, it is also a tool that is used in the name of progress to dope the masses (Horkheimer, 1974).

Adorno used this insight into the nature of art and historical development. He addressed the issue of the relation of art to capitalist society. "The modernity of art has not in its mimetic relation to a petrified and alienated reality. This, and not the denial of the mute reality, is what makes art speak" (Adorno, 1984, p. 31). Hence, in Adorno's view, in a time when reason has degenerated to the level of instrumentality, one can turn to art as the expression of the rehabilitation of a form of rationality which can overcome the limitation of reason by expressing its non-identity with itself. Art then has a role to play
in critical theory since it leads to transformed understanding which would eventually anticipate emancipation by expressing the condition of the human world.

2.2.4 Habermas and Critical Theory

With Habermas, Adorno's student, the discourse of critical theory was taken to another level. As Roderick (1986) has pointed out, Habermas in "Communication and the Evolution of Society" (1979) and "The Theory of Communicative Action" (1984), has attempted a paradigm shift by focussing on 'communication' rather than 'production'. "Habermas has been engaged in a crucial attempt to salvage the potential for human liberation remaining in the Marxist tradition in the face of the widely recognised 'crises of Marxism'" (Roderick, 1986, p. 139). In explicating a paradigm of communication as a supplement to Marx's paradigm of production, "labour and communicative action are treated as complementary, but irreducible, models of human social action" (Roderick, 1986, p. 154).

Habermas argues that Horkheimer and Adorno who conceived of the process of rationalisation in terms of the subject-object relations, cannot conceive of these phenomena in other than instrumental terms. To construct a theory of rationalisation in non-instrumental terms, Habermas relates to his theory of communicative action which is based on a philosophy of language. "A communicatively achieved agreement has a rational basis; it cannot be imposed by either party, whether instrumentally through intervention in the situation directly or strategically through influencing the decisions of the opponents" (Habermas, 1992, p. 287). Bubner (1982) has argued that Habermas succumbs to the "most intricate self-deception by attempting to ground his practical critique through a quasi-Kantian reflection on language". Bubner (1982) makes the point that although "rationality may be a constitutive feature of knowledge" as Kant tried to show, it is not "necessarily a defining characteristic of social praxis". Habermas himself has argued that "he is less concerned with particular theoretical and value positions which
are relative to social and historical contexts, and more with the conditions for the possibility of argument as such" (Held, 1980, p. 397). Roderick (1986) challenges the assumption of Habermas that 'understanding' pre-supposes agreement, since, for example, "one might have a genuine understanding of racism without being a racist" (Roderick, 1986, p. 159).

With regards to his later work on 'communicative action', and 'communicative rationality', McCarthy states that "Habermas is not seeking to demonstrate conceptually that what is rational is (or will be) real and what is real is (or will be) rational, but to identify empirically the actually existing possibility for embodying rationality structures in concrete forms of life" (McCarthy, 1978, p. 405-6). Roderick believes that "Habermas' concept of communicative rationality is embodied in society and history, but only partially so that it can serve as a goal for action" (Roderick, 1986, p. 164). "A communicative action has within it a claim to validity, which is in principle criticisable, meaning that the person to whom such a claim is addressed can respond with either a yes or a no based, in turn, on reasons...if communicative actions were reducible to instrumental or strategic actions, one would be back in the philosophy of consciousness where...all action was reducible to strategic or instrumental action" (Rasmussen, 1990). Clearly though Habermas's concept of communicative rationality has implications for 'progress' and the 'good life'. This thought is related to the discussion in the next section on post-colonialism when the latter argues that studies of the silenced and marginalised post-colonial voice anticipated the interest in cultural relativity and the subversive power of the marginal.

2.2.5 Critical Theory, Post-Structuralism and Post-Colonialism

Any discussion of Critical Theory must also necessarily include a discussion of post-structuralism, a movement characterising the twentieth century. Thinkers like Michel Foucault (1977), Jacques Derrida (1981) and Lacan (1981), subjected many of the
assumptions about humanity, knowledge, rationality and progress to interrogation. What has been distinctive about their work is that instead of using science and reason to get closer to the truth, these writers viewed the very idea of truth as something to be dismantled, deconstructed. They have waged a war of deconstruction against all the 'grand recits'—scientific rationality, the unification of knowledge and the emancipation of humanity, discussed earlier in the chapter.

In the broadest possible sense of critical theory, the post-structuralists (Lacan, Derrida, Foucault) see the text as that area of the discourse of the human sciences in which the 'problem' of the discourse of the human sciences is made available. Whereas in the discourses discussed earlier, there is a move towards the final truth of a situation, the post-structuralists show that in literature, the truth of a human situation is the itinerary of not being able to find it.

The problem of human discourse is generally seen as articulating itself in the play of three shifting concepts: language, world and consciousness. "We know no world that is not organised as a language, we operate with no other consciousness but one structured as a language-languages that we cannot possess, for we are operated by those languages as well. The category of language then embraces the categories of world and consciousness even as it is determined by them" (Spivak, 1987, p. 78).

This implies that since we are questioning the human being's control over the production of language, the figure that will serve us best is writing, for there the absence of the producer and receiver is taken for granted. A safe figure, outside of the language (speech) writing opposition is the text—a weave of knowing and not knowing which is what knowing is.
Post-structuralism has also had a tremendous impact on the post-colonial movement, a discussion of which is relevant to this research, particularly as South Africa moves into the post-colonial phase. The term refers to the process of decolonisation which like colonisation itself has marked the colonising societies as powerfully as it has the colonised. The term directs our attention to the fact that colonisation was never simply external to the societies of the imperial metropolis. It was always inscribed deeply within them. "This was a process whose negative effects provided the foundation of anti-colonial political mobilisation and provoked the attempt to recover an alternative set of cultural origins not contaminated by the colonising experience" (Hall cited in Chambers and Curti, 1996, p. 246.)

Fanon (1959; 1963; 1967; 1986) has been crucial to our understanding of the internal traumas of identity which are associated with colonisation and enslavement. For colonisation is never only about the external processes and pressures of exploitation. It is always also about the ways in which colonised subjects internally collude with the objectification of the self, produced by the coloniser (Fanon, 1986). The search for independence and the struggle for decolonisation, therefore had to be premised on new identities. In his discussion on the Algerian War of Independence 1954, Fanon shows how the Algerian people had undergone a radical transformation with a deeper awareness of self in relation to the revolution. The revolution had a therapeutic effect on the down trodden masses who through colonisation had lost confidence in themselves. The colonised were dominated by foreigners (French), reduced to outsider status in their own country and they became powerless victims of a policy of divide and rule. The colonised's commitment to the revolution however gave them the strength to overcome their fear of the oppressor.

Like the South Africans, the Algerians took their destiny into their own hands no matter how formidable the situation was. The masses in South Africa like those of Algeria
realised that they could not rely on the force of argument to convince the colonial powers of their right to self-determination and when faced with a politically conscious, organised and determined mass resistance the colonial powers were destined to be defeated. Once again Fanon shows that in Algeria, as was the case in South Africa, the youths and students led the protests against what they regarded as injustices perpetrated by their government. They all, in varying degrees, either directly or through their forebears, had inherited what Fanon describes as a political consciousness which does not surrender to intimidation or oppression and which instructs that revolutions are fought so that people shall control government, and not government control people.

Throughout his work Fanon questions the legitimacy of settler colonial rule, where a gang of White settler minority give themselves the right to rule the indigenous majority often with the collusion of the metropolitan power. He counterposes this with the right of the indigenous majority to resort to armed struggle. In South Africa however the mass rallies and demonstrations can be seen as safety valves that prevented a violent revolution taking place. However while Fanon supports an armed struggle as being justified and legitimate, there is always moral questioning on the issue of violence and armed struggle, particularly when it comes to defining South African Freedom Fighters or rationalising the ANC attack on 'soft targets' which often involved innocent victims.

Equally important amongst post-colonial writers whose work has contributed significantly to critical theory is Spivak (1987; 1990). To grasp the core of Spivak's work implies going beyond the binary opposition between First World intellectual production and Third World physical exploitation. Intertwined with both in further contradiction/production is the part played by Spivak in feminist theory. Spivak (1987) emphasises the crucial importance of examining and reappropriating the experience of the female body. According to Spivak (1987), 'woman' like any other term can only find its meaning in a complex series of differentiations, of which the most important or at least
the most immediate, is man. It follows for a woman that heterogeneity must importantly include the experience of her body, an experience which has been subject to the most rigorous male censorship. Spivak relies on the classic Marxist analysis of exploitation which has been expanded in her writings to account for imperialism. Allowing the Third World a voice which will then inflect and produce the forms of political liberation provides a context for Spivak’s work.

To avoid this dominating disablement, historians must face the contemporary critique of subjectivity both in relation to the Third World and in relation to themselves. It is only when the full force of contemporary anti-humanism has met the radical interrogation of method that a politically consequent historical method can be envisaged. Spivak argues that to understand the process the analyst of culture must be able to sketch the real effects of the imaginary in her object of study while never forgetting the imaginary effect of the real in her own investigations. The force of the female body in the text which Spivak explores, resides in its grounding in the gendered Third World body, in that female body that is never questioned and only exploited. Spivak believes that through the texts, these women of the Third World articulate, even construct truths which speak of our as well as their situation.

In a similar vein Said cited in Spivak (1987, p. 131) calls for a criticism of society that would account for quotidian politics and the struggle for power. As a Palestinian, Said was critical of the West particularly in its association with Third World countries. Said, for example, believes that in reading Jane Austen’s “Mansfield Park” one could also detect elements that had to do with slavery and British-owned sugar plantations in Antigua, the point being that just as Austen talks of Britain and British overseas possessions, so too must her twentieth century reader and critics who have far too often focused on the former to the exclusion of the latter. Similarly, in his work on Orientalism (1978), Said shows how “the Oriental was linked thus to elements in Western society
(delinquents, the insane, women, the poor) having in common an identity best described as lamentably alien" (Said, 1978, p. 270). It is, however, Said's views on the intellectual that were particularly relevant to the resistance movement in South Africa. The attempt to hold to a universal and single standard as a theme plays an important role in his account of the intellectual, rather the interaction between universality, and the local, the subjective, the here and how.

For Said (1994) the intellectual appeals to as wide a public as is possible, who is his/her natural constituency. The problem for the intellectuals is not the mass of society but the insiders, the experts who mould public opinion, make it conformist, "encourage a reliance on a superior little band of all-knowing men in power" (Said, 1994, p. xii). Intellectuals, according to Said should be the ones to question patriotic nationalism, corporate thinking and a sense of class, racial or gender privilege. It involves what Foucault terms 'a relentless erudition' (Said, 1978, p. XV) of scouring alternative sources, exhuming buried documents, reviving forgotten histories. The intelligensia in South Africa played an important part in trying to uphold a single standard of behaviour for South African society. Just as they would condemn an act of aggression by an enemy, the intellectuals in South Africa during the times of crisis condemned the government's attempt to invade the weaker people. From the academy, the church and professional guilds in South Africa, intellectuals were co-opted as part of the liberation process and as the authors of a language that tried to speak the truth to power.

In conclusion therefore what the above writers have shown is that post-colonialism like the post-structuralist discourse which provides its philosophical and theoretical grounding, has something to say about a crisis in the modes of comprehending the world associated with such concepts as 'Third World' and 'Nation State'. The concepts of 'subject' and 'identity' that were radically undermined in previously discussed discourses in their unitary and essentialist form, have now proliferated under post-colonial
discourses into new discursive positionalities. Chapter Five will critically discuss in
greater detail the impact of the post-colonial debate on South African society.

2.2.6 Some Assumptions and Features of Critical Theory

Critical theory assumes that all scientific knowledge about social reality carries with it
either implicitly or explicitly certain ideological, political and evaluative convictions
(Faganis, 1975, p. 483). There is also the related assumption that knowledge of the
social and cultural world is not so much a 'science' in the positivistic sense as a form of
consciousness about the shifting boundaries of reality and the on-going distillation of
meaning from social existence (Watson, 1982, p. 236).

Critical theory rejects the Kantian duality between 'noumena' and 'phenomena'. The
phenomenal is the world known to our faculties of perception and the noumenal, the
world of things themselves. According to Kant, reason through mathematics could
discover scientific truths about phenomena but reason was incapable of obtaining similar
truths about the realm of human belief and values—the noumenal realm. This duality,
according to Halle (1965), is the kernel of the 'fact' and 'value' dichotomy of
contemporary social science. A key assumption of critical theory is that even when the
most neutral methodology, that of the natural sciences is applied to the social world, it
becomes political in its findings and implications. An important assumption of critical
theory is also that the interest in reason can develop through critique and the critical
power of reason helps to reconstruct the built-in distortions that originate in social
institutions and which permeate social relationships. Hence, the earlier discussion of
Horkheimer showed his thesis of instrumental reason. This argument is further taken up
by Faganis (1975, p. 483).

An important distinguishing feature of critical theory, however, is the recognition of the
inter-connection between social theory and social practice. The self-conscious integration
of theory and practice is its core tenet (Habermas, 1974 and Fay, 1975, p. 109). However, this does not imply that the unity of theory and practice would lead to emancipation. Marx was aware that intellectual criticism would not automatically lead to material changes. Hence, the emphasis by critical theorists on a critique of ideology. Fay (1975) says that critical theory attempts to explain the ignorance people have not only about their social order, but their needs and wants as well. Such a theory is necessarily rooted in the felt needs and suffering of humanity. It names the people to whom its insights are addressed, and openly admits that its understanding is to be utilised on behalf of the great mass of people whose uncritical compliance-by-routine serves to challenge or transform, but to preserve contemporary 'society' (Fay, 1975, p. 109; Held, 1980, p. 245; Marcuse, 1964, p. 120). Critical theorists find it difficult to accept the universe of facts as the final context of validation (Marcuse, 1968, pp. 134 ffg; Habermas, 1968b and Adorno, 1969).

With Hegel and the French Revolution, reason became a means of challenging the status quo. Together reason and praxis became the pillars of critical theory (Jay, 1973, p. 61-64). Horkheimer's work on instrumental reason, demonstrates that the latter, on which the modern industrialised society is premised, cannot penetrate beyond mere appearance to detect what history reveals about the nature of humankind. In contrast, critical reason of Marxism attempts to reflect on the human meaning of the historical struggle. Jay (1973) points out "that positivism has always denied the validity of the traditional idea of reason, which it dismissed as empty metaphysics...the Frankfurt School address the problem of 'negative dialects' to imply the negative possibility of a rational society, as opposed to the positivistic irrationality and denial of modern society" (Jay, 1973 and Mills, 1959, pp. 170, 174, 208). Linked with praxis and reason is the idea of rational reorganisation of society based on the Marxism premise of a historical conception of human beings. O'Neil (1977) calls this 'historical remembrance' which lays emphasis on the concept of historical totality and the need to resist 'social amnesia'.
According to Mills (1959), critical theory stresses that only by speculating about and attempting to create post-capitalist alternatives can people successfully begin to overcome relations of subservience and authoritarianism in the context of their own lives. This relates to the concept of historical possibility which in the present day would focus on possibilities for increased barbarism and the negation of humanity itself (Leiss, 1974a). Such a view of critical theory can, however, be limiting in that it could be utopian. If critical theory can reveal the actual nature of an existing situation then only can it meaningfully formulate the conditions for transcending it.

As a critique of structural conditions and as a critique of knowledge, critical theory is a meta-critique. Fay (1975) argues that critical theory has two tasks: the first is the educative role and the second the emancipatory. The first is achieved by (a) helping actors see themselves in ways which are radically different from their own self-conception, (b) by showing how certain experiences can be overcome and changed if they are conceptualised differently and (c) by enlightening actors to the precise mechanisms which combine to frustrate them, but about which they have been ignorant. The emancipatory task is achieved by exhorting all humans to think critically about domination, about reification and "distorted communication, critical theory hopes to reveal the possibility for liberation and engagement in unorthodox forms of struggle" (Fay, 1975, p. 103-105). Wellmer (1971) concedes that critical theory, like existential philosophy, "conceives itself as a protest, but as a protest somewhat impotent in practice, against an apocalyptically self-obturating system of alienation and reification" (Wellmer, 1971, p. 52).

The nature of knowledge generated by critical social science is well articulated by its concept of critical. Bredo and Feinberg (1982) criticise other inquiry frameworks for not fully acknowledging or justifying their value positions. Critical theory, they say, at least attempts to do so, notably Habermas' efforts to define the 'universal pragmatics' of a
theory of communicative competence (Bredo and Feinberg, 1982, p. 436). Popkewitz (1984) articulates at least two senses of critical. The first (a) is the internal criticism that comes from analytical questioning of argument and method. It stresses the logical consistency in arguments, procedures and language. Continual cross-examinations and rigorous scrutiny of data are its hallmarks and (b) the second sense "gives focus to scepticism toward social institutions and...considers the conditions of social regulation, unequal distribution and power". According to Bernstein (1976) a critical social scientist would ask, for example, whether observed patterns of relationship "reveal invariant regularities of social action" or "express ideologically frozen relations of dependence" (Bernstein, 1976, p. 230-231). It also embodies an action-oriented commitment to the common welfare. It "has a [fundamental] practical interest in the fate and quality of social and political life...in radically improving human existence" (Bernstein, 1976, p. 174-180).

As such, knowledge in critical theory reflects values of a particular cultural, intellectual, social tradition. In critical theory, an emancipatory action-constitutive interest is seen as fundamental (Bredo and Feinberg, 1982, p. 275). By revealing the structural conditions of existence, in particular the injustices and distortions represented by such structures is how critical knowledge enlightens people. Such enlightenment carries within it an enabling, motivating force to stimulate action, a catalyst for self-reflection toward greater autonomy and responsibility and for strategic political action toward emancipation (Bernstein, 1976). Critical theory represents "a genuine unity of theory and revolutionary praxis where the theoretical understanding of the contradictions inherent in existing society, when appropriated by those who are exploited, becomes constitutive of their very activity to transform society" (Bernstein, 1976, p. 182). Knowledge is seen in a "societal and historical - development perspective that highlights its repressive or emancipatory potentials" (Bredo and Feinberg, 1982, p. 272).
2.3 The Limits of Critical Theory

McCarthy (1978) outlined the broad aims of critical theory thus as "the analysis of contemporary society; and this analysis requires both a practical and historical orientation. It requires, that is, a critical historical account of how we came to be what we are, a reflection on the particulars of our self-formative process" (McCarthy, 1978, p. 269-270). Held, in response, saw this as being problematic by asking how critical theory could be part of a movement in history and a means of enlightenment (Held, 1980, p. 398). Held maintains that the Frankfurt School of critical theorists have not adequately demonstrated that critical theory has a special theoretical status.

Therborn (1970) and Slater (1977) criticised early critical theory for (1) reproducing 'idealistic' positions, (2) pursuing 'philosophical' and 'theoretical' problems at the expense of Marxist topics, (3) over emphasising 'superstructural phenomena'—aesthetics and culture and (4) as being too distant from working class politics (Held, 1980, p. 355-6). Held (1980) rejects Therborn's (1970) criticism in that "it relies on a dogmatic assertion"—an assertion stemming from Althusser (1972)—that science can be neatly demarcated from ideology. The assertion is dogmatic because neither Therborn nor Althusser provide any plausible criterion to settle disputes over what constitutes the 'scientific' and 'what does not' (Held, 1980, p. 359).

Leiss (1974a) asserts that it must be argued that a limitation of critical theory is that "the conceptions of the theory, especially in its formative years, did not fully comprehend the possibility that late capitalism could stabilise itself for an extended period of time" (Leiss, 1974a, p. 91-92). Watson (1982), in contrast, believes this criticism with regards to Marx reflects that "his critical theory was conceived during an early and transitional phase of capitalism. That he did not see all the possible premonitions of its future development is not enough to destroy his otherwise critical and accurate analysis of society" (Watson, 1982, p. 253).
Critical theory has also been criticised as being 'unscientific' with regards to the nature of the theory. Hamilton (1974) argues that Hermeneutian reflection or interpretation as a methodology ought not to be termed scientific since such methods lack a systematic means of verifying or testing hypotheses. In the eyes of the empirical-analytic tradition, any subjective interpretation of social life by a theory, effectively disallows it from inclusion in any but the most general notion of 'science' (Hamilton, 1974, p. 61). This view is also shared by Tar (1977) that in particular, both Horkheimer and Adorno were anti-scientific. That this is a myth is clearly demonstrated by Arato and Gerbhardt (1978, p. 371-406). Paul Piccone (1973) says "a Hegelian-Marxist interested in the present as a part of a historical process inextricably constituted by both the past that provides the structure of the present, and a future that determines its dynamic. The temporal structure of this theoretical mediation is such that its meaning cannot be captured in quantitative data whose determinations fix reality in timeless abstractions thereby losing precisely what is most valuable: becoming" (Piccone, 1973, p. 147).

Finally, the contention by critical theorists that modern industrial society is dominative and irrational has been regarded by critics like Quinton (1980) as unacceptable. He argues that "if the change means that society can be improved and that many institutions do not serve the purposes that men want them to, or do so only at extravagant cost, then the change is quite unacceptable. However, if the claim is that modern society is uniquely and hyperbolically dominative, then the change cannot be accepted" (Quinton, 1980, p. 53). In the same vein, Held (1980) recognises that "critical theory fails to grasp adequately the pattern of conflicts and tensions in society and that it maintains an exaggerated notion of the cohesion of capitalism" (Held, 1980, p. 364). He further asserts that "despite the Frankfurt School's continued emphasis on history and the importance of historical inquiry, their work lacks sufficient historical detail on the ways in which social forms are created, sustained and changed" (Held, 1980, p. 374). He does, however, believe that the issues raised by the Frankfurt School are of profound
importance and in contradistinction claims that "Horkheimer's thought on ideology, Adorno's work on reification and fetishism, Marcuse's writings on labour and repressive sublimation and Habermas' reflections on distorted communication recast the terms of reference of critique and reinforce the emancipatory intent of Marx's enterprise" (Held, 1980, p. 353). Giddens (1976) reaffirms Held's last statement above by saying that critical theory, for all its weaknesses, "constitutes one of the major sources for contemporary social and political thought and makes one of the major sources of stimulus in twentieth century social and philosophical thought". In the final analysis Habermas's work should be read as a supplement to the next section since he forges a link between Marxism and a radical democracy in which all political decisions are subjected to the discussion of a reasoning public.

2.4 Theories of State

This section serves to give a brief outline of theories of state since they relate to policy analysis and are necessary to gain both theoretical understanding and political perspectives which cannot be gained either through deductive reasoning or immediate experience. The idea that the supreme authority within a body politic should be identified as the authority of the state was the outcome of a theory that was the product of the earliest major counter-revolutionary movement within modern European history, the movement of reaction against the ideologies of popular sovereignty developed in the course of the French religious wars and subsequently in the English revolution of the seventeenth century (Skinner cited in Goodin and Pettit, 1997, p. 17).

The acceptance of the state as an impersonal form of authority brought with it a displacement of elements of political leadership which had once been important to the theory and practice of government throughout western Europe. One such displacement was the claim "that sovereignty is conceptually connected with display, that majesty serves in itself as an ordering force" (Skinner cited in Goodin and Pettit, 1997, p. 19).
Perhaps the most self-conscious rejection of the old images of power as well as the most unambiguous view of the state as a purely impersonal authority was made by Hobbes (1968, p. 152), when he stated that "to hold dignities is simply to hold offices of command", to be held honorable is nothing more than "an argument and sign of power" (Hobbes, 1968, p. 155). So it is Hobbes who as early as the seventeenth century was speaking in tones of the modern theorist of the state.

This section will deal first with the rise of the modern state on a descriptive level before discussing theories of the state. Barker (1978, p. 118) believes that theories of the modern state cannot exist in isolation from other states. The rise of each individual modern state is conditioned by factors external to it. Furthermore modern states cannot be conceived of as separate from the world system of states. The modern state has to a large degree been shaped by the international system. More specifically, each state has been shaped by the pressures, constraints and opportunities flowing from its geopolitical situation within the system and especially its situation during its most formative period (Anderson, 1986, p. 211).

Therefore in discussing theories of state it is imperative that not only does one understand the rise of the modern states, but also understand that the internal aspects of state formation have to be related to external aspects. The state as the main body regulating internal affairs and external relations as located at the intersection of the two and is shaped by both. External influences involved copying from other states usually as a result of direct compulsion by other states or from more generalised competition between states and between different classes and groups within them. They copied in order to compete. In mid-nineteenth century Japan it was the direct threat of foreign invasion by western imperialism which stimulated the Meiji Restoration and the rise of the modern Japanese state after 1868 (Anderson, 1986, p. 214). Japan was forced to copy and compete with the western imperialism. More generally, and in the case of South Africa, western
imperialism stimulated the growth of non-European nationalisms in a process of reactive copying.

The exercise of coercion also had substantial consequences for states which undertake it. British imperialism and its ability to enforce its will on other countries in the nineteenth century affected the British state. Britain through earlier colonial conquests could take the lead in the Industrial Revolution and in a similar vein James (1938, p. 47) claims that "the slave trade and slavery were the economic basis of the French Revolution".

The notion of an external-internal dialectic is helpful from an analytical point of view as can be seen in the case of absolutism. Absolutist states arose in the sixteenth and seventeenth century Europe under dynastic rulers like the Tudors in England, the Habsburgs in Spain, the Bourbons in France and Romanovs in Russia to name a few. Internally the absolutist state ensured the dominance of the monarchy over other feudal lords and of the feudal landed class as a whole over other classes, particularly over the surplus-producing peasants (Anderson, 1986, p. 215). Through its system of central bureaucracy taxation and economic activity, the absolutist states used these internal innovations to wage external wars against states. A synchronisation of external pressures occurred in the nineteenth century with the Great Depression of the 1870s. The more powerful states like the United Kingdom and the United States of America were affected as were the many subordinate countries which were being incorporated into either the United Kingdom or the United States of America.

Wallenstein (1974; 1979) cites four main historical periods in the development of the world state system (a) 1450-1640; (b) 1650-1730; (c) 1760-1917; and (d) 1917 to the present. In the first period, Wallenstein (1974, 1979) believes the capitalist world economy emerged as a European world economy. The latter suspended previous striving by individual states and monarchs to assemble world empires and thus ensured that
economic rather than political factors tended to dominate in the operation of the system of states. The second period (1650-1730) saw the system's consolidation based on agrarian capitalism and England's struggle for commercial domination, but not political control. The third period (1760-1917) brought a stage of industrial capitalism which encouraged the absorption of other state systems. It also led to the rise of the new urban industrial working class which began "to challenge the capitalist forces in control of them" (Wallenstein, 1979, p. 30). The fourth period (1917 to the present) was the time following the Russian Revolution. Russia rose as a world power while the U.S.A. had to accept a less dominant role.

Wallenstein's theories differ from earlier 'modernisation' theories (for example, Rostow, 1960) which generally take individual nation states as the unit of analysis believing that all states can follow the same path of development from 'tradition' to 'modernity'. Modernisation theory suggests that Third World countries could follow the same path to success as the developed countries had if only their populations were prepared to modernise and give up traditional ways (Rostow, 1960).

Wallenstein's world-system perspective explained not only why Third World countries are poor and subordinate but also how the world economic system operates to ensure that they remain so. The capitalist world economy is held to impose a set of relations on them which guarantees their continued underdevelopment. Underdeveloped countries remain underdeveloped not because of any inherent weakness of their own, but because they are actively underdeveloped by the operations of the system (Frank, 1971). Such a theory may throw light on historical events in South Africa (discussed in greater detail in Chapter Three) prior to the election victory of the African National Congress. Wallenstein's world system perspective which shows systems as more or less determining what happens in individual states, differs from the theory of imperialism which allows more autonomy to states and the forces within them. Thus after 1848 there
was a dominant political and economic power, Britain which stamped its own particular market relations on the world economy. Any economic development taking place during this period was able to copy and build on the experience of Britain but was also forced into particular channels because of Britain's dominance. Since 1880 the capital export and economic dominance of the major capitalist powers "and not the process of primary accumulation of the local ruling classes have determined the economic development of what later came to be called the "Third World" (Mandel, 1978, p. 55). Samir (cited in Held, 1991, p. 308) criticises the world-system perspective for he believes that the dialectical unity of national and international relations is contradictory in the sense that there is a permanent conflict between national interests and global constraints. This conflict he believes is overcome either by the nation-state contriving to shape the global system in conformity with its own interests or by accepting a 'unilateral' adjustment of national life to international constraints.

The attempt to classify the societies of the world capitalist system into 'centres' and 'peripheries' is ultimately that of the nature of the state itself. The societies of capitalism are marked by the crystallisation of a bourgeois national state, whose essential function is to determine the conditions of accumulation through the national control it exercises over the reproduction of the labour force, the market, the centralisation of the surplus, natural resources and technology. The state here fulfils the conditions that make possible the subordination of external relations to the logic of accumulation. Conversely the peripheral state does not control local accumulation. It is then objectively the instrument of the 'adjustment' to the local society to the demands of globalised accumulation and which direction that takes is determined by the directions taken by the central powers.

This makes the central states much stronger than the weaker peripheral state. Samir (cited in Held, 1991, p. 311) asserts that the destruction wreaked on the periphery by the exploitation of the centre is massive and decisive. This destruction goes beyond the
economic to the political and cultural domains as well. The polarisation within the world system between centres and peripheries is a complex social phenomena in which economic laws are conditioned by the social forces (nations, classes, the state, ideologies) that determine the evolution of society. The economic, social, political and ideological aspects are all interlinked. Samir (cited in Held, 1991, p. 316) asserts that this link resonates with what Marx said of primitive accumulation, that plunder precedes the establishment of social and economic structures that subsequently ensures the normal exploitation of labour by capital. It is the non-economic factors—political and military pressures, interventions and cultural alienation, for example, the attraction of the Western mode of consumption, which constitute the real obstacle that make any attempt to 'get out of the system', to 'delink' seem utopian.

It is in the peripheries that revolutions have occurred, many confronted with the problem of developing productive forces and with the hostility of the capitalist world, real advanced democracy has been difficult to achieve. The statist system which is really a "disguised form of capitalist relations in the capitalist Third World" (Samir, cited in Held, 1991, p. 321) is strengthened. In a statist system, the state is the means of national self-protection and self-affirmation. Societies that emerged as a result of revolutions are at a protracted stage in their history whose task consists in eradicating the heritage of unequal development, knowing that this cannot be brought about by reliance on 'adjustment' within the world system but on a commitment to delinking.

Samir (cited in Held, 1991, p. 327) asserts that if the above were true, why then are Third World countries trying to construct bourgeois national states that imitate those of central capitalism? He believes that this situation emanates from those social classes and strata which dominated and still dominate the 'national liberation movement', i.e. the revolts against the unequal development of capitalism. History, he says, "teaches that the bourgeoisies in the periphery have attempted this construction at every stage of world
capitalist expansion...it teaches too that in the last analysis these attempts have always been frustrated by the combination of aggression from without and the internal limits peculiar to those attempts themselves. These limits are themselves largely the objective product of the existing peripheral condition even if they have more remote historical roots" (Samir cited in Held, 1991, p. 327).

What these theories of state and indeed Samir's critique of the world system perspective indicate is that, as in the case of South Africa, it is extremely difficult to construct a "people's state" since historically the bourgeoís still dominate. This manifested in the outbreak of violence on the question of democracy in Kwa-Zulu Natal between ANC and Inkatha supporters. In contrast social inequalities could be further aggravated, instead of being reduced. The present crisis in South Africa has shown the vulnerability of the state and the elusiveness of the freedom they thought they had gained. The difficulty of implementing policies that are acceptable to the people is already in question and the changes taking place in South Africa will therefore continue to be an area of storms.

2.5 Policy Theory

The purpose of this section is to complement the previous sections by firstly indicating the meaning of policy and the dimensions inherent in policy and secondly, to reiterate the features of the competing paradigms–positivism, interpretivism and critical theory–available to the would-be policy analyst as to the would-be researcher. This section then, deals with the clarification of what is involved in policy, particularly as this thesis deals with South African policy development and formulation as well as the outline of positivist, interpretive and critical orientations to policy.

Just as there are many usages of the word 'policy', there are as many definitions (Heclo, 1972). Bachrach and Baratz (1962, p. 947-52), believe that policy includes involuntary failures to act and deliberate decisions not to act. Heclo (1972, p. 83), suggests that "a
policy can consist of what is not being done". Heclo goes on to say that the "term policy needs to be able to embrace both what is intended and what occurs as a result of the intention, any use which excluded unintended results...would surely be impoverished" (Heclo, 1972, p. 85). Anderson (1975, p. 3), defines policy as "a purposive course of action followed by an actor or set of actors in dealing with a problem or matter of concern". The definition of policy as involving a key but not exclusive role for public agencies is discussed by Barker (1982) and Dahl (1970). Jenkins (1978, p. 15), views policy as a "set of interrelated decisions taken by a political actor or group of actors concerning the selection of goals and the means of achieving them within a specified situation where these decisions should, in principle, be within the power of these actors to achieve".

Others like Eulau and Prewitt (1973, p. 465), define policy as a "standing decision characterised by behavioural consistency and receptiveness on the part of both those who make it and those who abide by it". Another definition of policy concerns the role of values in policy. Nisbet and Broadfoot (1980, p. 47), suggest that "policy-making cannot depend on the legitimation of procedures by the policy and their acknowledgment of the right of the majority to rule...at any particular time, however, some values will predominate over others politically".

The definitions of policy offered by Anderson (1975), Jenkins (1978), Eulau and Prewitt (1973) suggest that policies are conscious and that governments deliberately choose courses of action while the definition of Heclo (1972) suggests that public policy is whatever governments do, whether they are aware of it or not. Heclo is most explicit in arguing that policy is what the analyst defines and discerns, not necessarily what the actors perceive themselves as doing. "This is more fundamental than saying that governments sometimes lie about the real reasons behind policy. In that case, while it is difficult to uncover the real reasons, it is assumed that the actors are aware of them, but
prefer to keep them hidden...the analysts must try to get behind the scenes, either through classified documents or interviews, to reconstruct the real reasons" (Pal, 1987, p. 7).

There are a number of points to be borne in mind in any attempt to understand the nature of policy. Although policy may be goal oriented, it involves means as well as ends. The latter two may not necessarily be separate since certain ends may be derived which for reasons of value also preclude the employment of certain means. Values play an important role in all stages of policy since stating goals is stating a preference for some end states rather than others and values involved in the means as much as the ends. Furthermore, given the inevitability of a political context, policy involves questions about power and control. Policies, hence, empower or disable groups through allocation of resources and differential opportunities for participation in discursive forms of life. The above discussion on the definition of policy, sets the background for the development of models of policy-making.

2.5.1 Models of Policy-Making

Allison (1971), suggests that we carry around bundles of related assumptions or basic frames of references in terms of which we ask and answer questions as what happened? Why did it happen? What will happen next? Such descriptive, explanatory and prescriptive models are the 'conceptual lenses' through which we view our world and try to make sense of it.

The simplest definition of a model according to Bullock and Stallybrass (1977) is that it is "a representation of something else, designed for a specific purpose". Such an interpretation of a model can assist in hypothesising and experimentation where variables and their relationships are represented in abstract or symbolic forms. A descriptive model can be derived from complex social phenomena and will assist with description
explanation and understanding. The prescriptive or normative model on the other hand, raises questions about what 'ought' to be rather than 'what is'. Lastly, the 'ideal type' models which involve the exploration of concepts, deal with entities which do not exist in real life but which can help us understand and explain real phenomena. Exponents of such a model include Weber in Shils and Finch, 1949; Simon, 1947.

In policy theory the most prominent writer to use the 'ideal type' model is Herbert Simon (1957a; 1957b; 1960; 1983). The ideal type models of 'rational' policy-making requires the gathering of information prior to taking action; the identification of all options and an assessment of the consequences of such options. Relating the facts collected to a set of criteria or system of values is seen as essential. Lindblom (1959) sets up an ideal type model of rationality which differs slightly from Simon's in that he begins with an identification of the values and specification of objectives and their consequences calculated and related back to the value. An obvious criticism of such a model is that it is unrealistic. The acquisition of 'perfect knowledge' is impracticable. Similarly, when dealing with 'values', it is very difficult to be truly objective and value judgements, if anything are made on a personal intuitive or subjective basis. The descriptive model of policy-making is less of a 'mental construct'. While actors are self-interested, they are not partisan and through bargaining, negotiation and compromise adjust to one another.

Jenkins (1978, p. 16) believed that while the simplest and most often used model is the linear one that gives an ordering of policy activities indicating how an issue progresses through a political system, it was nevertheless unrealistic and suggested that policy is best understood "by considering the operation of a political system in its environment and by examining how such a system maintains itself and changes over time. A simple linear feedback model, Jenkins contends (1978, p. 24) omits the "interactions both across and
within systems" and the "stances and positions adopted by political actors which have no immediate tangible policy output".

Table 2.5.1.1 Systems Model of the Policy Process (from Jenkins, 1978:18)

Environment

- Inputs
  - Demands
  - Supports
  - Resources

- The Political System
  - Conversion/Decision processes etc.

- Policy Output

- Policy Outcome

Environment

Table 2.5.1.2 Amended Systems of the Policy Process (from Jenkins, 1978:22)

Environment

- Inputs
  - Demands/Supports/Resources etc.

- Mediating variables
  - Groups/Parties/Organisations etc.

- The political system
  - The decision system
  - Organisational network

- Policy outputs

- Policy outcomes

Environment

Environmental variables
- Socio-economic
- Physical
- Political
- N.B. Environmental variables vary with time
Este (1986) presents a linear amalgamation of other writer's policy process conceptions (Jenkins, 1978; Lindblom, 1959) which is considered to be a useful step to a policy process model.

Table 2.5.1.3 A Conceptualisation of the Policy Process by Este (1986:10)

![Diagram showing steps in the policy process]

In a linear design the "termination" stage of Este's model would prevent feedback and development of policy. Este, however, recommends twisting the above steps into a spiral so that the termination is the start of the process but on a different level.

Table 2.5.1.4 An Elaboration of the Policy Process—Policy Movement Through Intelligence (Este, 1986:13)

![Diagram showing spiral policy movement]

policy path of first group (no progress along axis of policy movement -- poor organisational intelligence)

policy path of second group (advancing along axis of policy movement -- effective organisational intelligence)
Este (1986, p. 13) illustrates the parts of two groups of decision-makers where the policy-makers in one group through unintelligent use of information move around in a tight circle back to where they started from and the other group through intelligent use of information progresses through the steps of the policy process. Este (1986, p. 15) further warns that the way an organisation analyses and utilises information in the policy process is extremely important to the relative success of that process.

2.5.2 Positivism in Policy Theory

Positivism in policy theory according to Fay (1975), Torgerson (1986a), Hawkesworth (1988), Bobrow and Dyzek (1987) can be characterised in terms of a belief that policy interventions should be based on causal laws of society and verified by neutral empirical observation. Any practical import depends on policy-manipulative variables having a place in this causal scheme. "Assuming such variables can be located, policy-makers can then manipulate policy in pursuit of any ends they see fit to pursue, for ends are treated as arbitrary and beyond the reach of scientific or rational determination" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 218). A true positivist program for policy has been criticised for being elusive (Fay, 1975, pp. 22-29; pp. 49-64; Torgerson, 1986a; Hawkesworth, 1988, pp. 37-40; Bobrow and Dryzek, 1987, pp. 128-34).

Firstly, values in policy have tended to be 'multiple, fluid and controversial" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 218). Secondly, to accept that some uncontroversial goal set does exist will imply accepting that set as given by the political or bureaucratic powers. By ignoring the normative give-and-take of politics, analysts are complicit in what Hawkesworth (1988, pp. 25-27) calls "depoliticising scientism". Thirdly, the intentional actions of human beings, including those involved in the formulation and implementation of policy, can subvert the purported causal generalisations of positivists. People can simply decide to behave differently, and that decision itself may be affected by
knowledge of the purported causal laws in which they figure. Fourthly, causal statements about the effects of policy interventions cannot be empirically verified short of the intervention itself actually occurring. In other words, the idea of waiting for empirical verification before acting is incoherent.

Positivism, as discussed earlier in the chapter, sweeps aside all claims to truth based solely on the authority of beliefs or established practice. "In this its image of the knowing subject is highly individualistic and even heroic" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 136). "If the human intellect could free itself from the fetters of accumulated belief and dogma, if like Descartes in the Meditations it could dig down to some bedrock of certainty and then logically and methodically rebuild a body of knowledge, it could know the truth" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 136). Furthermore, positivism places severe demands on the mental discipline of the knowing subject. Not only do scientists avoid sources of error but they also suppress sources of bias. In other words the scientist has to establish an emotional distance from the subject under review. Objectivity or value neutrality is of utmost importance—subjectivity or judgements of value are prohibited.

Positivism externalised the relationship between the knowing subject and the object of knowledge. The activity of science is ontologically separated from the reality it studies. "It observes that reality but does not participate in it" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 137). What it in effect means is that objects of scientific knowledge were things to be described, manipulated and controlled (Burtt, 1954; Taylor, 1970, pp. 3-50). Policy analysis, as a science, applies these tenets. According to positivism, the policy analyst is essentially reactive and instrumental. The policy analyst's questions are limited to those that can be answered by science alone, that is questions based on empirical fact and practical means. As a scientist, the policy analyst has no special expertise or authoritative knowledge concerning questions of value or ends. The latter can be determined by
politically accountable public officials. In the positivist model, the role of the policy analyst are circumscribed.

Recent work in the philosophy of science (Homans, 1964; Hempel, 1965; Nagel, 1961) have made it increasingly difficult to rely upon the knowledge provided by positivism for policy analysis. Criticisms of social science range from the fact that social science does not provide objective knowledge, particularly the kind close to the epistemological and methodological explanation or predictions of human behaviour, especially at a level that would make them useful to the policy analyst. There is a continued emphasis now on cultural interpretation rather than scientific or causal explanation (Geertz, 1980, pp. 165-179). Social scientists now believe that trying to construct a theory in value neutral observation language "is not only practically unrealistic but philosophically incoherent as well" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 142). Policies formulated within a positivist framework are likely to contain implicit assumptions which are contradictory to, or at the very least unconnected to, the end or goal states constituted in the objectives. There will be far more critical attention to ends than means. The contradiction and conflicts present in society will still be latently present in the too easily accepted problem definition and the structure of goals or ends taken for granted by the positivist policy analyst.

2.5.3 Interpretive Social Science and Policy

Interpretive social science according to earlier discussion construes human behaviours, social relationships and cultural artefacts as texts (dramas or rituals) and then seeks to uncover the meaning those texts have to the agents who constitute them and to others located spatially or temporarily outside them (Rabinow and Sullivan, 1979; Dallmayr and McCarthy, 1977; Bernstein, 1976; Moon, 1975; Fay, 1975). Interpretive social sciences further focuses on "action, intention and convention" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 142). An attempt is made to make sense of the individual's actions in terms of the agent's intentions in the action. These intentions are analysed and explained in terms
of the cultural context of conventions, rules and norms. Sometimes the action may relate to the agent's intentions in the action and at other times the actions may not be what the agent intended. Interpretation then is drawn from the stock of inter-subjective social knowledge.

Sometimes the interpretation may go beyond the agent's own limited comprehension of this situation. Rather than being deductive-nomological, interpretive social science is teleological. Reasoning behind the actions are based on their practical implications (von Wright, 1971). As such, facts and values are treated as rational entities with inter-subjective meanings. Perhaps the greatest contribution made by interpretive social science to policy analysis is in what J.W.N. Watkins described as 'imperfect rationality'. "Policy analysis is often motivated by policy failures and these failures in turn, are usually a function of the fact that some significant actors did not respond as it assumed they would. Ideally, a good policy analysis must identify these anomalous responses, explain them in some coherent way and provide policy-makers with more realistic expectations about the behaviour of those with whom they must deal and to whom the policy will apply" (Fischer and Forester, 1987, p. 145).

The emphasis on purposive agency and transformation of self-identity through practical activity means that the interpretive approach could provide policy analysis with an impetus to investigate the effect that a particular policy has on a particular aspect of community life—the fostering or alienation of a community could be an important policy consideration.

Tribe (1972, pp. 66-110) argues that positivistic policy analysis and highly bureaucratic and rationalistic forms of public administration tend mutually to reinforce one another. The relationship between a mode of scientific explanation that defines human agents as objects whose behaviour is determined by causal forces and a form of governance that relies on the instrumental manipulation of those forces for the achievement of social objectives and the maintenance of social order. With interpretive social science, policy-makers would have to look at different ways to deal with social problems and to make responses that would be more democratic. Since human beings, according to this perspective are seen as self-directing, meaning making agents, it follows that the individual towards whom the policy is directed must be actively brought into the
deliberate process in which the goals and values of the policy are formulated. Policy would have to be re-thought so that policy-makers and citizens could take a more participatory or dialogic form.

Giddens (1976, Chapters 3 and 4) and Fay (1975, pp. 83ff) criticise the interpretive approach's emphasis on subjective meaning and intentional agency which they say make it inadequate in studying social change, the role of structural forces and unintended consequences of action as well as the distorted self-understandings among social actors. While this may be true, one could argue that the interpretive approach's emphasis on inter-subjective meanings, and intentional agency has been a very neglected area in policy analysis. By not focussing on social change, structural forces and unintended consequences of action, the interpretive approach appears almost conservative. The affinity between the interpretive approach and classical conservatism is exemplified by Michael Oakshott (1933, 1975), who believes that in this sense interpretive social science lends an abiding respect for coherent, well-established, ongoing forms of cultural life and a profound suspicion of externally imposed, rationalistically conceived programs of institutional reform. Furthermore, the value-laden character of interpretive analysis does not mean there are no standards for judging the validity of an interpretation or that this perspective is largely irrational and subjective. The emphasis is rather on how standards of judgement operate and are developed.

An important promise offered by interpretive policy analysis is that it might lead to a more realistic set of expectations about the "limitations" of social scientific knowledge and might lead to the development of more appropriate modes of criticism. On the one hand by being value-laden and opposed to the value-neutrality by positivism, the interpretation given to policies by the interpretive perspective could be construed as "personal preferences or private psychological dispositions" (Callahan and Jennings, 1983, p. 27). Another way in which the interpretive perspective could contribute to policy analysis is
that it might lead to an examination of previously neglected areas of government action, namely, sociological, cultural and psychological. This may be so because the interpretive social sciences believe in placing human action in a cultural context. It stands to reason then that the interpretive approach hopes to bring individuals more actively into the deliberation process, thereby encouraging dialogue between the government and its citizens.

In the process of policy development then, interpretive approaches acknowledge the possibility of different meaning systems being held by the various parties likely to be effected by or involved in deciding policy. However, interpretive approaches, like positivist approaches, do not offer a valid means of deciding between such differences. Recognition of the differences could mean structural changes in the relations of power and authority rather than changes in attitudes or behaviours. Such a critical stance may not yet emerge with the interpretive approach to policy as it is still post hoc and ad hoc methodologically being unconnected to ethnographic methods characteristic of the interpretive approach.

2.5.4 Critical Social Science and Policy Formulation

Critical theory as discussed earlier in this chapter, emerged from the work of the Frankfurt School in the period between the wars and has continued thereafter. More recently, the work of the earlier critical theorists has been radically transformed by Jürgen Habermas. As a critical theorist and an exponent of the Frankfurt School of Thought, Habermas attacks positivism for collapsing all knowledge into natural scientific knowledge which it considers to be the only genuine type of knowledge. Habermas believes there are other types of knowledge that are equally legitimate (Habermas, 1971; 1976; 1984), such as knowledge of critical reflection.
The Frankfurt School "stress the need for social theory to develop an overall critical theory which would be sufficiently encompassing to provide an Archimedean point for cultural criticism of whole social orders" (Callahan and Jennings, 1983, p. 125). While Habermas shares such a view, he also differs from the Frankfurt School, Adorno and Marcus in his belief that such a theory should also include a study of speech acts and grammar. He sees his theory of communicative competence as essential for his reconstruction of historical materialism (Habermas, 1979). The latter he believes to provide us with a theory of the dynamics of social change. While this may be true, it is also imperative that we are informed of the historically possible changes that are emancipatory.

Critical theorists argue that human beings are self-reflective and therefore makers of their own history. It is the self-reflective knowledge of human beings that should be one of the principal ends of social inquiry and one which would make it an emancipatory science. "With their distinctive abilities and with this emancipation knowledge, human beings can attain a historically conditioned autonomy" (Callahan and Jennings, 1983, p. 128). The exploration of post-colonialism exemplified in the work of Said, Spivak and Fanon, concerned itself not so much with the raw materiality of power but with the workings of power-in-representation, in colonial images and languages and in the question of the language of the oppressed. The post-structuralist condemnation of universalising meta-narratives provides in this context a riposte to that oppressive story of the unfolding of a unified destiny for Man which ruthlessly expunges particular or local or national histories in its drive towards universal rationalisation, industrial progress and the global expansion of markets.

In terms of the imperialism of representation, this domination of universal narratives may bring about the projection from the 'civilising' imperial centres of fetishised images of Africa, the 'Orient' and Latin America as civilisations representing the 'Other', in ways
that simultaneously bring these regions into being for Europe, fulfil its need for psychological and political centring and silence any attempts at self-representation by these people and their post-colonial descendants.

The response to this in post-structuralist theory has been to assist the exploration of the centrist metropolitan myth of universal history by opening theories of discourse to the voices of those constituted as the Other. The emphasis is on articulating the margins, or what has been projected as marginal. It is a matter of taking hold not only of actual power but also the languages, systems of metaphors and regimes of images that seem designed to silence those whom they embody in representation. Post-structuralist and post-colonialist studies then rest upon one discursive principle; the right of formerly un or misrepresented human groups to speak for and represent themselves in domains defined politically and intellectually as normally excluding them, unsurping their signifying and representing functions and over-riding their historical reality.

The articulation of the margins has taken different forms of which the most direct is a model of simple inversion. In South Africa the struggle was and is to find a form of self-definition for the Black man that is not the obedient reproduction of Western projections. The end result is the desire to be and be able to speak on his own terms and not as an echo of some other. The works of Spivak, Said and Fanon argue the need to bring the margins into the centre by applying a deconstructive critique of the dominant self-histories of the West.

Since critical theorists see the latter as being an emancipatory social science, it will have implications for policy-makers, and in particular, to those persons concerned with human liberation. The question to be asked, however, is whether a theory like the one advocated by Marx and Habermas can be anything more than just a theory? Firstly, Habermas has been criticised for misreading Marx, making him more scientific than he actually is (Sensat, 1979, Chapter 6; Sensat, 1980, pp. 121-4; Gottleib, 1981, pp. 280-95).
Habermas further believes that there is progress not only "in objectifying knowledge" but also "in moral-practical insight" (Habermas, 1979, p. 177). The moral values of freedom and justice are seen as having an objective justification and the binding force of such norms has as its very basis, communication (Habermas, 1979, p. 177). They are built into communicative competence and must be presupposed in any ideal speech situation. Reflection on the presuppositions of human communication will enable us to recognise a commitment to norms of freedom and justice. Habermas further argues that "norms have an immanent relation to truth" (Habermas, 1976, p. 95).

Systematically distorted communication is a situation in which people are kept from understanding the situation and from gaining an understanding of what a rational or valid norm is. Gottlieb (1981, pp. 280-95) believes that one of the clear implications of Habermas' analysis of society is that "capitalist societies, such as our own, have, in holding themselves together as capitalist societies, benefited, more accurately their ruling classes have benefited from systematically distorted communication". Undistorted communication with its "universal validity claims (truth, rightness, truthfulness), which participants at least implicitly raise and reciprocally recognise is dysfunctional for such a society" (Habermas, 1979, p. 118). Similarly Seyla Ben Habib in examining McCarthy's account of Habermas remarks that "nothing would be more erroneous than to assume the ideal-speech situation alone to be the ground norm of critical theory" (Ben Habib, 1979, p. 170).

It may well be that Marx's account of historical materialism could provide us with the foundations of a critical theory of society and an underlying rationale for policy-making. According to Habermas, Marx believed that to overcome exploitation and oppression is simply making social production more efficient. In developing historical materialism, Marx, Habermas claims came to characterise the process of social reproduction, as production, incorrectly reducing practical rationalisation (justifiability of norms governing
human interaction) to technical rationalisation (society's control over natural processes) and therefore came to have an inadequate understanding of the dynamics of capitalism (Habermas, 1975; 1979). Cohen (1978, p. 136) believes that the forces of production, Marx speaks of are fundamental determinates of the historical process. The productive forces determine the general direction in which the production relations will change and the production relations, in turn, explain the non-economic institutions of society and the general direction of their change. So at the level of forces of production, we are talking about human knowledge and human inventiveness. The whole mode of production involves much more than technical control over subjects, it involves an understanding of how humans relate to each other and to the forms that social co-operation takes. If the core notion of human liberty is conscious self-direction and the opening of ever wider possibilities for choice, the development of the productive forces enhances just that (Shaw, 1978; Gurley, 1976; McCarthy, 1978).

2.5.5 Critical Policy Analysis
How then would such an account of historical materialism affect policy-making? For those policy-makers following Marx, they would have to recognise the causal relationship between the economic and political-legal realm. Such recognition would imply the implementation of policies that weaken capitalist-class hegemony over the society, namely, the direction of workers' control over their places of work; democratic rather than business control of the mass media; free and universally accessible higher education, health care, day-care centres, facilities for the elderly, legal aid and the like. Policies will also focus on limiting sexual and racial inequalities. Essentially, an effort would be made to equalise power within the society and to make possible in Habermas' words the existence of a "public sphere" that is essential for a truly human society (Habermas, 1974, pp. 49-55).
The Critical Theory of Jürgen Habermas, assesses the social and political-economic structures as systematic patterns of practical communicative interaction. The critical content of the theory focuses on the systematic distorted nature of communicative interactions that shape the lives of citizens. For example citizens are faced with such influences when politicians or administrators pretend a political problem is a technical one; when private, profit-seeking interests such as say the nuclear construction industry or medical industry misrepresent benefits and dangers to the public; when professionals maybe physicians or social workers create unnecessary dependency and unrealistic expectations in their clients or when established interests in a society evade policies concerning human welfare such as health services (Giddens, 1984).

Bureaucratic pressures usually inhibit participatory processes and for interaction to take place among citizens, it requires a level of mutual understanding to assess the structures and policies of the state. The sort of analysis made by critical theory is one that seeks to expose the ways in which a given structure of state and productive relations functions. For example, how does (1) the state legitimate and perpetuate itself while seeking to extend its power, (2) exclude particular groups systematically from the decision-making processes that affect their lives, (3) promote political and moral illusion that science and technology, through professionals and experts, can solve political problems, (4) restrict public political argument, participation and mobilisation regarding policy alternatives that are inconsistent with existing patterns of ownership, wealth and power. The hegemonic power of such distorted communication could be a reason why in advanced capitalist societies many citizens are ignorant of their own democratic political traditions and rights to corrective action. The basis of all this is communicative action by which policy planners perform both technical and political work. It is the right of citizens to know and understand how the policy planners work gets done. When normal communication is distorted democratic action is crippled (Mueller, 1973).
Essentially, the application of critical theory to policy planning involves the ability on the part of planners to cultivate community networks of liaisons and contracts, rather than depending on the power of documents to procure and disseminate information, to assess concerns of all participants in the planning process and to anticipate political obstacles, struggles and opportunities. It is equally important that citizens be educated about the policy process to enable informed political participation and negotiation. Community organisations should have access to public planning information as well as conditions formal reviews and investigations (Needleman and Needleman, 1974; Hartman, 1984). The above, however, is not without its problems. How do you determine the amount of information to be given to which group and when? and are plans for community participation democratic and efficient?

The critical theory of policy planning should be able to clarify issues through practical communicative action, by identifying the disabling distortions. The analysis of communicative action allows questions of power and hegemony to be asked concretely and systematically. These could be issues involving political legitimacy, questions of procedural fairness and accountability. Critical communicative account of planning practice seeks not only to integrate analyses of action and structure but also to combine empirical and interpretive research with normative and ethical arguments that help us counteract the obstacles to democratic and legitimate planning processes.

To sum up, the discussion of positivist, interpretive and critical orientations to policy has highlighted that (1) positivist orientations to policy emphasise the strategic or manipulative interest of empirical methods as a source of objective ‘facts’, providing cost effective solutions to policy problems, that is, efficiency and political process guide strategic practice; (2) interpretive orientations have a practical interest in qualitative ethnographic research as a basis for clarifying meanings, meaning systems and the explication of cultural assumptions that need to be taken into account in formulating
policy, that is, symbolic structures and norms guide action; (3) critical orientations have an emancipatory interest in research and policy as self-reflection by policy-makers on historical and cultural circumstances creates the opportunity for transcending their own political agency, that is, participatory, consensual communication guides critical practice.

2.6 Critical Theory, Policy Analysis and the Present Work

Critical theory is the preferred theoretical orientation of this research since it is also a policy theory. It contains within it not only the means of rationally choosing between alternatives but also a vision of the future; a state of affairs where increased learning levels are facilitated for individual knowers as members of society.

The distinguishing feature of critical theory is its interest or commitment to changing and improving the human condition. Guess (1981, p. 76) says "a critical theory is a very complicated conceptual object; it is addressed to a particular group of agents in a particular society and aims at being their 'self-consciousness' in a process of successful emancipation and enlightenment. A process of emancipation and enlightenment is a transition from an initial stage of bondage, delusion and frustration to a final state of freedom, knowledge and satisfaction". In other words while theory guides practice, change comes about more through an increasing self-awareness of the limitations and constraints of human potential as well as the possibilities for emancipation from these. Prunty (1984, p. 33) believes that "from the perspective of critical theory, repression not only emanates from the socio-economic sphere, but also is mediated by human consciousness. Hence, it is necessary to explore the internal and subjective state of human existence alongside of the external and material world".

Post-structuralist and post-colonialist theories legitimate the evacuation of the centre or the idea of the centre, splintering it into 'constellations of voices', 'plurality of meanings, allowing and promotion specificity and regionalism, social minorities and political
projects which are local in scope or surviving traditions and suppressed forms of knowledge. The focus on the local and plural nature of knowledge it is believed will lead to critical transformation. In South Africa at present, post-colonial theories can be seen to be present in that the history of Black South Africans has now come to dominate the public domain. As the history and structures of colonisation continue to be exposed by the narratives of the Black South Africans, strategies of decolonisation and self-determination are set in motion. The narratives of Black South Africans radically problematise concepts of 'discovery'; 'settlement' and 'sovereignty' as well as stereotypic constructions of origin, ethnicity and multi-culturalism.

Deprived of their land and forced to endure the status of people systematically categorised as 'inferior', Black South Africans have had limited access to the cultural capital of their heritage. The memory of the labour exploitation that they experienced thus becomes a living intellectual resource in their expressive political culture. Until the first democratic elections of April 1994, Black South African history did not enter the public domain and there were no means by which it could be heard within the dominant culture. Today, Black South African subjectivity is emerging in ways that are rewriting the history of that country.

Post-colonialism then resonates with critical theory in its liberatory and emancipatory rhetoric and in incorporating the formerly marginalised voices into the centre (public domain). The rejection of an externally imposed order and way of life went hand in hand with attempts to recover the indigenous culture and the native voice. In a large measure then, post-colonialism like critical theory has had an expansive understanding of the potentialities of agency for example gender and sexuality in the West—rethinking gender issues for example accords with and has helped generate very substantial changes in political practice. It is not certain however how opening up space for agency extends to
breaking down the closures of material interest and power politics which characterise the workings of the international system.

Critical theory's exploration of the 'subjective' construction of reality was initially developed by Marcuse (1955) and taken further by Habermas (1979). The latter provides an explanation for the constraint of human consciousness in terms of repressed forms of communication. For Habermas distorted communication occurs when apparent consensus is reached in discourse involving unequal, or asymmetrical power relationships between the parties involved. The distorted communication that Habermas defines was characteristic of the state of affairs that prevailed in South Africa under apartheid and Nationalist rule and which was responsible for igniting the Soweto uprisings of 1976. In contrast, Habermas believes that the ideal speech situation is one in which genuine consensus is achieved on the basis of discursive participation among equals. The ideal of communicative competence, developed by Habermas (1979; 1984) provides a normative basis for critique because it encapsulates the notions of 'justice', 'truth' and 'sincerity'. Such a view re-emphasises the researcher's preference for critical theory as the theoretical orientation of this research since it provides the basis for a critical reformulation of policy and policy analysis which promises to resolve the means-end dichotomy that characterises positivist accounts of policy which were characteristic of education policy in South Africa prior to ANC victory in 1994.

In assessing the impact of the critical tradition on South African Education policy under the ANC, a critical policy-maker in making judgements about what counts as knowledge would need to include and account for forms of false consciousness likely to be held, in particular, by oppressed groups because of their past, disabling and repressive experiences. This implies that each stage of the policy-making process should be as free of coercion as is possible particularly in the forms of communication that occur between interested parties. This would mean no asymmetry in the power relations between the
parties to the decision-making and no forms of undistorted communication during the policy process. The next chapter on a background to South African history shows that the legitimation of a particular group's values through policy, in this case, the Christian National Education Policy of the Nationalist Party, reinforced other structural factors, namely apartheid or separate development concerned with power and wealth. The oppressed Black majority in South Africa made to feel inadequate, conceded power to the 'experts'—White, Afrikaner Nationalists who paid little attention to the notions of justice, truth and sincerity which according to Habermas (1979; 1984) is the basis of the ideal of communicative competence.
Chapter 3: The Social and Historical Background to the Emergence of 'People's Education'

3.1 Introduction
This chapter does not aim to document the whole history of South Africa; its scope is more limited, its focus being one aspect of that history, namely education. However, any discussion of education must be presented against a background of conditions and attitudes which are not immediately educational. South Africa was a unique society prior to 1994 and the extent of such uniqueness must be grasped at the outset if the analysis of this chapter is to be understood. In describing the uniqueness of South Africa, Adam (1971) has used the term 'democratic police state' and van den Berghe (1967) the phrase 'herrenvolk democracy' - a society democratic for the dominant group and tyrannical for the subordinate group. However, though descriptive, Adam and Berghe fail to adequately depict the complexity of the past South African system, a system that emerged essentially from the first Europeans (Dutch) who came to the country during the seventeenth century and who were committed to the maintenance and assertion of White supremacy in all aspects of government.

3.2 The Historical Roots of Apartheid in South Africa
Patterns of migration in South Africa indicate that while African iron age farmers lived in parts of South Africa as long ago as the fourth century AD, by the fifteenth century Bantu-speaking Africans were widely settled over the northern, central and south-eastern regions of modern South Africa. Along the East Coast lived the Nguni people, of the Zulu, Swazi and Xhosa Chiefdoms. The Sotho people lived in the interior. From the fifteenth century onwards, ships from Portugal, Holland, Britain and France sailed around Africa on their way to the East. The Cape of Good Hope became a refreshment station for the Dutch East India Company in 1652. The sixteenth to the
nineteenth centuries were a period of colonial expansion, during which the European powers particularly the British and the Dutch conquered land in order to increase their access to spices, sugar and other products to trade. The Dutch farmers who came to settle at the Cape were called ‘Boers’ or Afrikaners. By 1700 a new social group had come into being at the Cape—the offspring of the White settlers and their African slaves, which in the nineteenth century became known as the Coloured people. With the development of the sugar-growing industry in South Africa under the British, Indians were brought out to South Africa in 1860 as part of an indentured labour scheme. Not only did the British government encourage the introduction of indentured labour but they also offered inducements for the Indian labourers to remain in South Africa.

With regards to settlement patterns, the early English settlers and some Afrikaners (Dutch) lived in or near Cape Town in the Cape Colony. In 1848 English settlers were sent to Natal on the east coast. The rest of the Afrikaners (Trekboers) who left on the Great Trek in 1838 from the Cape Colony were scattered across the interior of South Africa. The Bantu-speaking African inhabited the eastern central plateau (Xhosa and Sotho) and the Nguni (Zulu) the eastern coast of South Africa. The Khoisan people (San and Khoi-Khoi) were the original inhabitants of the Cape when the White settlers first arrived. The Coloureds, a group evolving from the mixture of Khoi-Khoi and Whites, inhabited the Cape Colony. The Indians were located in Natal on the eastern coast and in the Transvaal, an interior region of South Africa.

In agriculture and industry, those settlers (English and Afrikaners) who lived in the Cape Colony were merchants and inn-keepers who did business with the ships that rounded the Cape. The farmers who lived in the nearby countryside raised grapes (for wine) and grain. The Trekboers in the interior of South Africa were semi-nomadic sheep and cattle herders. The San were nomadic hunters who kept no livestock but the Khoi-Khoi were herders with livestock. The Bantu-speaking people were largely subsistence
farmers who cultivated their own vegetables and kept goat and cattle as a source of food. The discovery of gold and diamonds in the nineteenth century in the hinterland of the Cape Colony and the Eastern Transvaal introduced a new element into the hitherto pastoral and agricultural life of South Africa. In the midst of Afrikaner farmers sprang up an industry that brought wealth to an impoverished land.

The emergence of the four (4) population groups in South Africa (White, Bantu, Coloured and Indian) was not officially recognised in South Africa until 1948 when the National Party won the election, campaigning on a platform of racial exclusion. Before introducing any policy on race, the National Party in 1950 introduced the Population Registration Act, designed to decide a person's race. Thus a "Coloured person was one who is not a White person or a native: a native was in fact or is generally accepted as a member of any aboriginal race or tribe of Africa", a White was described as "a person who in appearance obviously is or is generally accepted as a White person, but does not include a person who, although in appearance is obviously a White person, is generally accepted as a Coloured person" (Leach, 1986, p. 70). This Act was further amended in 1959 and again in 1967 where 'descent' rather than 'appearance' was the guideline for racial classification.

The British pattern of governance can be traced back to 1815 when the possession of the Cape Colony fell into the hands of the British after the Dutch were defeated in the Napoleonic Wars. As a result many Dutch farmers trekked into the interior of South Africa in fear of British domination. The Boers (trekkers) founded two (2) independent republics of Orange Free State and the Transvaal while the British expanded into the Cape and took over Natal. It was clear that because of their different religious and cultural backgrounds, the British and Dutch could not live together harmoniously. The creation of the two (2) Boer republics appeared to avert war for a while until Sir George Grey (1854–1861) arrived as Governor of the Cape Colony and High Commissioner to point to
a general federation. What followed was half a century of friction and strife between the Boer and the British.

As a result of the discovery of gold and diamonds in the nineteenth century, relations between Boer and British worsened. With the rush for gold in the 1890s there were more "uitlanders" (White foreigners) in the Boer Republics than Boers. President Kruger of the Transvaal refused to give the foreigners the vote and made the transport of gold as difficult and as expensive as possible for the mainly British mining magnates. Such tensions made war between the Boer and the British inevitable. Prior to the outbreak of the Anglo-Boer War of 1899-1902, the British Government appointed Sir Alfred Milner as High Commissioner to South Africa in 1897. Milner was convinced that if war came, the Transvaal had to be seen as the aggressor so that the British Government could be assured of British support elsewhere. Milner believed that there could be no peace until the Transvaal's franchise had been reformed.

He demanded a five-year retrospective franchise of the fullest kind, a modified oath to be followed by immediate enrolment and a redistribution of seats. Kruger offered a seven-year franchise for five (5) of which the applicant would be denationalised. All attempts at peace had ended in deadlock and the Anglo-Boer War broke out in 1899. With British victory, Milner during his period of reconstruction after the War, attempted to secure British permanence in the Transvaal. To achieve this, Milner focussed on the gold-mining industry. Convinced that African labour was insufficient to meet the needs of the gold mining industry, Milner advocated the importation of Chinese labour as a temporary measure. This so-called "Chinese slavery" led to the defeat of the Conservative Government in Great Britain in 1906. The Afrikaner population of the Transvaal criticised Milner for the importation of Chinese labour as well as for his education policy which required that Dutch should be taught in the public schools where the parents of the
children desired it. The time was limited to a maximum of five (5) hours per week. This was considered to be inadequate.

In essence then the mining industry not only started the migrant labour system, attracting miners from all over Southern Africa but also instituted one of the main pillars of apartheid. Under pressure from the Boer Republics for self-rule, the British in 1910 gave the four (4) South African colonies of Transvaal, the Orange Free State, Natal and The Cape self-government as the Union of South Africa. This move split control of South Africa between the Afrikaners and the British at the expense of the Black population. The new leaders that emerged from the Union of South Africa in 1910 were responsible for instituting many of South Africa's apartheid laws with no intention of handing over power to the Black majority. African response to such segregation dates back to 1912 with the inaugural meeting in Bloemfontein of the South African Native National Congress, the forerunner of the African National Congress which though later banned in South Africa won international support in its struggle for Black freedom.

3.2.1 Liberal/Radical Controversy over the Nature of South African History

Literature on the nature of South African history reveals a controversy between 'liberal' and 'radical' interpretations. In the liberal interpretation of South African history, represented by such writers as Macmillan (1959; 1963; 1975); de Kiewiet (1929; 1937); Thompson (1949; 1960) and Walker (1957; 1965), the attitudes and practices of the twentieth century have been explained on the basis of inheritance. A variety of influences [seventeenth century Calvinist doctrines, early Dutch East India Company policy, early relations with the Khoi-Khoi (Hottentots) and San (Bushmen), the introduction of slavery, and the physical 'isolation' from the liberal currents of eighteenth century Europe] influenced the Afrikaners to develop by 1800 "cultural and social exclusiveness and a core of anti-progressive racial attitudes" (Wright, 1977, p. 8).
In his *History of South Africa*, de Kiewiet (1956) says of the attitude of the Afrikaners to the Africans that "according to their belief, it was more than their arms that made them prevail over the natives and their superiority depended on more than their intelligence or their institutions. Their superiority was born of race and faith, a quality divinely given which could not be transmitted to other races or acquired by them". This concept of superior race and faith remained as the fundamental tenet of 'apartheid' or separate development. Keppel-Jones (1959, p. 31) states that the Afrikaner: "carried his seventeenth century inheritance into the nineteenth which shaped the Afrikaner character of the twentieth century. Thompson (1969, p. 215-16), writing of the Afrikaners, says that "the basic ideas of the majority, including their political leaders, remain those which crystallised in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Bred in isolation from the mainstream of Western thought, they have rejected three of its dynamic modern impulses - liberalism, socialism and democracy...they are the victims of their past. So tyrannical is tradition over them that they are left with no room for effective manoeuvre...they are an anachronism in the second half of the twentieth century."

What is evident from such an analysis is a very illiberal view of Afrikaners whose environment (political, social, economic and geographical) seemed unchanged from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. The concept of change over time was not considered outside very conservative constructs.

Keppel-Jones (1975, p. 160-1) contradicts his earlier statements by claiming that the policies of the Nationalist Government in 1936 "were the product of experiences and prejudices reaching far back into history and were recognised by people then and now to be largely irrelevant to modern conditions". These explanations of the nature of South African history appear simplistic and generalised and the possibility of other explanations existing for the racial attitudes of Afrikaners was excluded. For example, Jordan (1969, p. 3-43), argues that White racial attitudes developed in Europe before the sixteenth
century and, therefore, need no special explanation in South Africa. There is evidence also to show that those who have economic advantages and other forms of privilege will also provide themselves with rationalisations, such as race superiority for the oppression needed to maintain that privilege (Allport, 1954, p. 206-18). The liberal interpretation of South African history also emphasises the liberalising effects of British rule of the Cape from 1806 which led to Afrikaner extremists 'trekking' away from the Cape to perpetuate their own way of life. However, British rule in South Africa, though liberal, was not wholly beneficent.

Macmillan (1959) thought that the British Eastern Cape Frontier Policy in the 1830s by the Governor-General, Sir George Grey, was disastrous and the matter of Xhosa rights on land a blot on the record of his Governorship. Grey believed that African political institutions should be undermined and replaced since "barbarous peoples were doomed unless they became part of ourselves" (Cell, 1982, p. 52). Welsh (1971) traces the roots of segregation to the British administrator in Natal in 1845, Sir Theophilus Shepstone who believed that African identity and integrity should be preserved and that too rapid a process of westernisation would be destructive to them as well as dangerous for the Whites who were such a tiny minority among them (Cell, 1982, p. 52).

Thompson (1960, p. 16-17) wrote that "there can be little doubt that Lord Milner (1897-1905) and the Unionist Government wrought harm in South Africa...they made it immeasurably more difficult for the peoples of South Africa to establish themselves as a stable and humane society". de Kiewiet (1937, p. 10) said that if "Britain had lent the South African communities money instead of pushing federation on them in the 1870s the easing of the financial strain would have disposed all the communities more favourably towards political co-operation". Keppel-Jones (1959) thought that "if the Orange River Sovereignty had been annexed by the British to the Cape in 1854, instead of being given
independence, the Cape and its institutions and tradition would have become and remained dominant in a united South Africa".

The origins of the native pass laws and master-servant relationships which became a characteristic feature of South African society in the twentieth century can be traced back to British legislation of the nineteenth century. While emancipating slaves, the British were also responsible for the subjugation of the Africans on the Cape Eastern Frontier and in Natal and the incorporation of their lands by conquest. Yet, the concession of self-government in the Cape and Natal by the British in the nineteenth century resulted in an increase in White power and discrimination (La Guma, 1972, p. 36). Further entrenchment of White supremacy was witnessed in 1872 when responsible government was granted to the two British colonies of Cape and Natal. The final concession was made by the British by the Act of Union in 1909 which paved the way for the 'apartheid' regime. The granting of this concession, which was to change the course of South African history, was certainly unintentional in terms of promoting apartheid. Britain faced severe budgetary constraints, there was a resurgence of Afrikaner political organisations, sharp class divisions began to appear within the English-speaking community in South Africa and after the Liberal victory in Britain in 1906, Milner, the High Commissioner, was refused support for his policy of post-war reconstruction in South Africa. Such circumstances led to the Act of Union which had enormous repercussions for the concentration and exercise of Afrikaner power.

3.2.2 The Radical Debate

The radical interpretation of South African history with which the researcher is inclined to sympathise, has its roots in nineteenth century Marxism and in contemporary attacks on European exploitation of Coloured areas. Representatives of such an interpretation include Simons and Simons (1969); Frank (1967); Baran (1957); Emanuel (1972); Legassick (1976); Marks (1972); Trapido (1972); and Atmore (1974). While the radical
interpretation does not deny the link between the cultural legacy of the past and the attitudes and practices of the present, they do not see it as a determining factor. The origins of apartheid are attributed not to the Calvinist religion or the frontier tradition of the Afrikaners but rather to the development of capitalism during the nineteenth century. With the discovery of gold and diamonds in South Africa, agriculture was transformed and classes emerged which were antagonistic towards each other. It was during these structural developments, the radicals believe, segregation took shape. The radical interpretation pinpoints the critical turning point to the Milner (the British High Commissioner) era of reconstruction in the Transvaal following the British occupation of Johannesburg in 1901.

The Milner regime, according to the literature, established a close alliance with the mining magnates and made the decision to consolidate and defend a cheap labour policy. The attribution of segregation to Milner, however, is too specific since the British Parliament, conceded to the Union of South Africa Act in 1909, the Mines and Works Act (1911) that consolidated the job-reservation system in industry, the Native Land Act (1913), the most important aspect of the segregationist program, the Native Affairs Act (1920) for the administration of reserves, and the Native (Urban Areas Act) in 1923. In 1922, a confrontation between the capitalist state and the urban Afrikaner working class took place though when Milner left South Africa in 1907, neither of these two forces had existed.

Such a radical interpretation of the Milner regime is indeed plausible and perhaps persuasive since the location of the origins of segregation are attributed to Milner's regime in the Transvaal which, through the discovery of gold, had become a developing economy. As a result, since the 1890s, the nexus of political and economic power had been in the Transvaal. However, Milner himself could not be responsible for the policy
of segregation. By 1907, when Milner left South Africa, the development of capitalism and segregation was far from complete.

After the formation of the Union in 1910, industrialists and farmers alike demanded labour. Under the Native Land Act of 1913, African peasants became proletarianised. Africans were either forced into the reserves or they could remain in White areas as wage labourers. By prescribing reserved areas for Whites and Africans, the Land Act of 1913 set limits on the agricultural productivity of the African peasants. Many left the reserves to work for wages in White areas. The reserves enabled the South African Government to justify average wages at or below the subsistence level, on the grounds that jobs in White areas were merely supplementing the African's basic economic life.

With Africans in the mining industry, there developed an antagonistic relationship between Black and White workers based on the huge gap between average wages. Of the White workers the most structurally insecure were the semi-skilled, "Poor White" Afrikaners, who came under intense pressure from the agrarian revolution of the nineteenth century. By 1922 a new class had been formed, the urban Afrikaner proletariat who were directly opposed to the emerging African proletariat. The political climax was the Rand Revolution of 1922, a violent confrontation between White labour and the capitalist state. It was during this time, and related to such developments, that the ideology of segregation took shape.

Bundy (1972, p. 369-370), writing about the rise and decline of the South African peasantry, argues that African agriculturalists responded positively to market opportunities, many departing from the traditional, subsistence methods and competing effectively with White farmers. The non-market forces that predominated after the post-mineral period was used to disadvantage the African peasantry by wielding economic and political power, making the market favourable to the White sector. As a result, African
agriculture declined, making them more dependent on labour for their income. Despite the plausibility of such an argument, supported by liberals like van der Horst (1965) and Wilson (1975), who attacked the 'doomsday' interpretations of culture contact by liberals such as de Kiewiet (1937), Bundy's interpretation does ignore the benefits derived from Africans who worked on Europeans' farms, particularly with regards to practical and technological education. Such a consideration is supported by van der Horst (1965) and Wilson (1975). There were still other factors, ignored by Bundy, which contributed to the decline of the African peasantry, like drought, pests and diseases, which were not the result of White capitalist influences and exploitation and which ravaged the Cape province in the 1880s and 1890s. Furthermore, the extension of railways meant the opening up of markets for the importation of overseas grain and this disadvantaged all South African farmers, both Black and White.

3.3 The Roots of the South African Educational System

In the context of this history, four systems of education have grown up in South African, those of the Cape, Natal, Transvaal and Orange Free State. That of the Cape dates back to the seventeenth century (1658) while the systems of the other three emerged as a result of the exodus of people towards the north (The Great Trek) in the early part of the nineteenth century (1838). These four systems of education gradually merged into one National System of Education (Malherbe, 1925, p. 1). To understand the early history of South African education, it is necessary to trace developments from the beginnings of the colonial period to the first multi-racial elections of April 1994.

According to UNESCO's International Standard Classification of Education (1975, p. 2), "education comprises organised and sustained communication designed to bring about learning...[and] learning is taken to mean any change in behaviour, knowledge, understanding, skills or capabilities which the learner retains and which cannot be ascribed to physical growth or the development of inherited behaviour patterns". Such a
definition implies that indigenous Africans in South Africa had created effective systems of traditional education before the Dutch arrived in 1652. Thompson (1960, p. 23), argues that "all societies have at all times sought to develop appropriate behaviour patterns to spread the possession of knowledge, understanding and skills among their members...even though the degree of organisation and the extent to which aims were articulated tended to be limited".

Since European association with South Africa in the fifteenth century, following the Portuguese circumnavigation of the Cape, a new written culture was introduced by the Europeans, initially by the Dutch and then by settlers from other parts of Europe, which shaped Africa's more recent perception of the school (Anderson, 1970, p.1 and Malherbe, 1925, p. 35). The first organised school was introduced in 1658 for the children of slaves and in 1663 a school was established for children of White colonists, which also admitted children of free Africans. In 1676, the Dutch Reformed Church expressed concern about the mix of social classes in schools and a separate school was created for slave children in 1685 (Malherbe, 1925, p. 27-28). du Plessis (1911, p. 29-30) alleges that van Riebeeck (sent by the Dutch East India Company to establish a refreshment station at the Cape) was motivated by a concern to have something done for the slaves' intellectual and moral welfare. Molteno, cited in Kallaway (1984, p. 45), believes that the establishment of such a school implied that "the more total the slaves' subjugation, the less they would have resisted the system of forced labour in which they were trapped".

Essentially the education offered by the Dutch was one that, while allowing the slaves to communicate with their masters, enforced the superiority of the Dutch language and culture so that they could become efficient, obedient labourers. The educational policy of the Dutch was vested in the 'Kerkeraad' or Church Council which focused more on religious instruction than on the three R's (Malherbe, 1925, p. 47; Kallaway, 1984, p.
47-48; Behr and Macmillan, 1971, p. 3). Progress in the expansion of schooling was slow in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. A few elementary schools were established for the colonists' children and to a lesser extent for their household slaves (Kallaway, 1984, p. 48). The eighteenth century, however, did see the introduction of mission education directed specifically to the Khoi-Khoi people. An attempt was made by missionaries to convince the Khoi-Khoi to "forego their nomadic way of life" and to "realise the need for discipline and regular habits" (Behr and Macmillan, 1971, p. 314).

When the British took over the Cape in 1806, attempts were made by various British Governors to anglicise the Dutch-speaking colonists. This antagonised and alienated the Dutch colonists particularly over the use of English as a medium of instruction. It also meant that education was no longer controlled by the religious authorities. The education policy of the British created deep-seated resentment, later to be one of the major causes of The Great Trek. The irony of this is that a century and a half later, the descendants of these colonists would try to impose their language on Africans (Nkomo, 1990, p. 30). Hertzog, a one time Prime Minister of South Africa and a descendant of the early Dutch colonists, said "the language of the oppressor on the tongue of the oppressed is the language of a slave" (South African Native Affairs Commission Report, 1905, p. 71). With regards to the Africans and Coloureds the creation of mission schools increased under the British. The Lovedale Mission founded in 1824 was the first institution that trained Black and White teachers before the Cape Colonial government provided facilities to train White teachers (Nkomo, 1990, p. 31).

A result of the Great Trek by Afrikaners was the creation of two republics, the Transvaal and the Orange Free State. Together with the two British colonies of Natal and Cape, educational policy during the middle and late nineteenth centuries was one of local control in each political entity. Eventually education became centralised by 1967 out of economic necessity and this led to the irreversible movement of African people to the towns and
industries especially after the discovery of minerals and the rise of industrialisation. In the Cape Colony, the granting of self-government in 1854 enabled the Dutch to redirect educational policy away from anglicisation by using both English and Dutch as the medium of instruction. By the Education Act of 1865, grants were given to mission schools who really educated more Africans and to rural schools serving White children. Sir George Grey, the then Governor of the Cape, adopted a policy towards the Africans to integrate them into the economic order. They were given elementary education and training in the skills of manual labour. For the Afrikaners, he founded Grey's College in Bloemfontein and later the University of the Orange Free State.

By the Cape Colony's Higher Education Act of 1874, government grants were given for higher education. While designed for Whites particularly, some Africans and Coloureds did attend these colleges. Developments in the other British colony of Natal were similar to those in the Cape except that grants to the mission schools were slower and more limited being based on monies raised by the taxation of Africans (Geber and Newman, 1980, p. 60). The type of education provided for Africans was viewed in terms of their role in their colonial order. The Chairman of the Labour Committee in Natal in 1873 said, "I will not detain this house by making a long clap-trap speech about the mission of the White man in civilising our native population. In this resolution, I propose to use civilisation and morality and Christianity as a means to get labour. If these causes are at the same time advanced, so much the better for them" (Welsh, 1971, p. 20). English was the dominant language in Natal particularly, as it regarded itself as a colony of England. A Central Board of Education was established in 1888.

In the Orange Free State, Dutch became the medium of instruction and, in 1895, the Orange Free State became the first polity to expand compulsory schooling for White children 14-16 years old (Nkomo, 1990, p. 34). Education for Africans was slower to develop in the Orange Free State and Transvaal than the two British colonies because
Afrikaners were farmers who employed Africans on farms as workers. Whatever education there was for Africans was provided by the mission schools which offered, at best, the basics of reading or writing. In the Transvaal, three White classes of schools were created mainly for Afrikaners. The first was the rural school for farmers, the second the town schools and thirdly there was the Gymnasium in Pretoria established to provide secondary and higher education. The latter did not work in practice as most of the students remained in the lower grades (Nkomo, 1990, p. 36). Most English sent their children to private schools. With regards to the Africans, no books were held in the Transvaal until 1867. In 1904, the mission schools began to receive government funds and a special curriculum was set up for Africans (Geber and Newman, 1980, p. 61).

In all four provinces under review, officials tried to balance local control with centralised secular supervision and financial support. Except where local resources were plentiful, central government came to dominate educational policy and for all intents to dictate practice (Nkomo, 1990, p. 39).

3.3.1 Education Since the Union of South Africa in 1910

The Union of South Africa Act (1909) converted the four colonies (Cape, Natal, Orange Free State and Transvaal) into provinces under a central government, the Parliament of the Union of South Africa. The provinces were given some measure of local control and this control was exercised by Provincial Councils. The latter was entrusted with "education, other than higher education, for a period of five years and thereafter until Parliament otherwise provides" (Behr, 1978, p. 21).

The 1905 Cape School Board Act, the Smuts' Education Act of 1907 in the Transvaal, and Hertzog's School Board Act of 1908 in the Orange Free State, were all expanded after the Union of South Africa to grant compulsory education for White children. Such Acts further separated the Whites from the Africans since the latter did not receive free or
compulsory education "since they were regarded as unfit for it" (Nkomo, 1990, p. 48).
In general, African education was still in the hands of the missions who received subsidies from the provinces and each province adopted its own system of taxation, resulting in the uneven development of African education. After 1921, any expansion of African education had to be paid by them through a process of direct taxation. This was later to develop as an important aspect of the apartheid policy. As early as 1903 the Director of Education in the Transvaal had indicated the direction of African education,

"The view...of Teach the Native to Work, although carelessly held by a few, contains, however, the true principle by which the education of the Native is to be regulated and controlled, and no proposal for a plan for Native Education would be likely to commend itself to the sense of the great majority of the people of this country that did not contemplate the ultimate social place of the Natives as that of an efficient worker...the tentative scheme...makes provision, therefore, in the first place for the combination of manual training with elementary instruction and in the second, for the shaping of that elementary instruction so as to equip the Native for a more intelligible comprehension of any industrial work that is set before him." (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 26).

This thinking came to dominate the provision of education for Africans in the years to come.

With regards to Indian and Coloured children, the state paid educational subsidies to the provinces based on the average attendance of pupils in 1925. Prior to that, the first effective forms of schooling were provided by missions as was the case in African education. With the differential financial allocation for education, the African, Indian and Coloured education were seen as being different from Whites and from each other. Table 3.3.1.1 below indicates the per capita expenditure on education of each racial group for the twenty year period 1910-1930.
Table 3.3.1.1: Annual Growth of State Expenditure on education per capita of population during the twenty year period (1910-1930).
(Source: Malherbe, 1977, p. 572.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Whites</th>
<th>Coloureds</th>
<th>Indians</th>
<th>Bantu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>R3,80</td>
<td>R0,04</td>
<td>R0,15</td>
<td>R0,01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>R9,50</td>
<td>R1,13</td>
<td>R0,73</td>
<td>R0,20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A most striking feature of Table 3.3.1.1 is the difference in expenditure between the four racial groups. The figures reflect the quality of education provided during that twenty year period (1910-1930). The growth in expenditure on White education had been much greater than between the other race groups. However, with African education the educational expenditure had been relatively small. This period (1910-1930) was also marked by increasing financial difficulty due largely to an increase in the African population at the rate of 1.95 per cent per annum (Rose, 1970, p. 50). It was also at this time that the urbanisation of the African was taking place accompanied by overcrowding, shortage of housing and the cry for more schools in the urban areas. The needs for education grew far more rapidly than the funds available. It was also evident that an attempt was made to increase per capita expenditure on Coloureds and Indians in spite of the fact that their high birth rates made educational provision difficult.

The increased expenditure on Coloured and Indian education was also indicative of a demand for education from these two groups, while the decrease in value of African education could also be attributed to the fact that African education was mainly dependent on what the African could produce from their own taxable resources. Even the combined figures for the three non-White groups shows a large gap as compared to White expenditure on education. In 1910, in Table 3.3.1.1 for example, the total per capita expenditure on non-White education equalled twenty cents as compared to three rand and eighty cents spent on White education. The latter is at least nineteen times as much in
1910, and for the period 1930, four times as much. Despite the improvement, the disparity between expenditure on White education and African education continued well into this century.

In the years after Union 1910, new tensions emerged with respect to Afrikaner nationalism. Christian national ideology was an important constituent in the Christian National Educational Policy that formed the basis of social and political policy after 1948. This nationalism of the Afrikaner people, as found in Christian National Education, proved to have profound effects on African education in years to come. The effort to preserve the national identity and culture of the Afrikaner people can be seen in Christian National Education (CNE) policy statement upon which total policy was formulated after 1948:

"In this view of life and the world, the Christian and National principles are of fundamental significance, and their object is the propagation, protection and development of the Christian and National nature and character of our nation…we believe that both these principles must be applied to the full in the education of our children, so that these principles may be characteristics of the whole school as regards its spirit, aim, curriculum, method, discipline, staff, organisation and all its activities." (Rose, 1970, p. 54).

3.3.2 African Reaction to Segregation

After the Act of Union in 1910, enlightened Africans believed that union would pool together labour supplied by them, natural resources by Afrikaners (who controlled the gold-bearing reefs) and capital supplied by the British. However, the fact that Union was attained on the terms of the Afrikaner republics implied, to the African, a triumph for the idea of separate destinies for each of the race groups in South Africa.

A deputation was sent by the South African Native Congress to London to seek redress. Though unsuccessful, this latter organisation, formed in 1912, and later known as the African National Congress (ANC), was to have a distinguished career ahead of it. Issues
related to wages, franchise, pass laws, working conditions and above all land featured prominently in the ANC program after Union. The adoption of a policy of conciliation by the ANC to the repressive laws passed by the Union government did, however, collapse and the emancipation movement was then spearheaded by the Industrial and Commercial Workers' Union (ICU) formed in 1919. Due to deportation of its leaders it had disintegrated by the late 1920s. The ANC fear of government retaliation had been justified.

The response of the African to militant leadership and growing contradiction in the Union's economy was fertile ground for a revolutionary party. In 1921, the Communist Party of South Africa (CPSA) was formed. When General Hertzog became Prime Minister of South Africa in 1924, he struck against African political organisations, crushing the ICU and crippling the Communist Party. The ANC was largely paralysed for action. Hertzog's premiership was a further step in barring the doors to citizenship through peaceful means. The Nationalist victory of 1948 together with the banning of African political organisations, demonstrated the final rejection by White South Africans of the ideal of united nationhood.

3.4 National Party Policy After 1948

When the Nationalist Party came to power in 1948, the major policy decisions with regards to education fell within the parameters of the all encompassing policy of apartheid. The education policy after 1948 was one presenting entirely different methods and objectives for the different sections of the population. Africans, Whites, Coloureds and Indians had separate educational facilities not only through schools but through administrative structures, finance, syllabus and different levels of achievement to fit in with different expectations in employment.
The Nationalist Government's policy of CNE (Christian National Education) was steeped in the spirit of Calvinism. The latter is aptly defined as "a creed which sought, not merely to purify the individual but to reconstruct Church and State and to renew society by penetrating every department of life, public as well as private, with the influence of religion" (Tawney, 1938). The principles of Christian National Education pertained mainly to the education of Whites. Native education, they believed, "should be based on the principles of trusteeship, non-equality and segregation; its aim should be to inculcate the White Man's view of life, especially that of the Boer nation, which is the senior trustee" (Blueprint for Blackout, p. 43). Other non-Whites, Coloureds and Indians, had to be educated to similar tenets. "Only when he is Christianised can the Coloured be truly happy, and he will be proof against foreign ideologies which give him an illusion of happiness but leave him in the long run unsatisfied and unhappy" (Blueprint for Blackout, p. 43).

3.4.1 The Education of Whites in South Africa

With the policy of separate development, each racial group in South Africa was controlled separately under a central government Minister of State. The first step towards the segmentation of education came with the Bantu Education Act of 1953 with the creation of a Department of Bantu Education under a Minister. This was followed by the transfer of Coloured education to the Department of Coloured Affairs in 1963 and that of Indian to Indian Affairs in 1965.

In 1967, by the National Education Policy Act, the education of Whites was placed in the hands of the Minister of Education and the administration of education in the hands of the provinces. Education was to be Christian and National and instruction was to be through the medium of the mother tongue, English or Afrikaans. Education was free and syllabuses were to be nationally co-ordinated. Service conditions and salaries for teachers were to be uniform. No legislation, except for the appropriation of funds
relating to school education for Whites, could be introduced in Parliament or any Provincial Council without prior consultation with the Minister and a Minister could enforce compliance if a Provincial Authority failed to give effect to the Minister's policy. Finally, the Minister had the power to ensure that the policy of national education was enforced.

**Table 3.4.1.1: Principles of The National Educational Policy Act of 1967**
(Source: Behr, 1978, p. 42.)

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Education in Schools, maintained and managed by the State or by a Provincial Education Department shall have a Christian character, but the religious conviction of the parents and pupils shall be respected in regard to religious instruction and ceremonies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Education shall have a broad national character.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>The mother tongue, if it is English or Afrikaans, shall be the medium of instruction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Requirements as to compulsory education, and the limits relating to school age shall be uniform.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Education (including books and stationery) shall be free, except in respect of pupils studying part-time and apprentices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Education shall be provided in accordance with the ability and aptitude of and interest shown by the pupil, and the needs of the country and the appropriate guidance shall, with due regard thereto, be furnished to pupils.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Co-ordination on a national basis in respect of syllabuses, courses and examinations standards shall be effected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>The parent community shall be given a say through parent-teachers' associations, school committees, boards of control or school boards or in any other manner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Consideration shall be given to suggestions and recommendations of the officially recognised teachers' associations when planning for purposes of education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Conditions of service and salary scales for teachers shall be uniform.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The principles laid down in this Act (Table 3.4.1.1) are consistent with the policy of the Nationalists in terms of its Christian and National character, but it was ambiguous and
contradictory. In the case of South Africa, which is heterogeneous, one has to ask how effectively could educational policy be formulated and controlled at the national level? In attempting to develop four departments of education, the educational and administrative tasks and problems would surely be immense. It would seem more logical perhaps to have centralised administration and decentralised general education. For example, outside of the Cabinet there was no educational body providing an overall view of the national education pattern particularly in view of the rapid commercial and industrial development in the country.

With regards to the medium of instruction it was imperative that this should have been examined in respect of the needs of the country. There are several areas or regions in South Africa which are homogeneous and dual media could have been considered wherever desirable. Such a policy has led to unnecessary overlapping, duplication and competition. The use of the mother tongue as a medium of instruction was not an unreasonable educational principle though in a country like South Africa, which is bilingual, its importance had been exaggerated.

After the National Education Policy Act of 1967, the provinces took over vocational education. Certain technical colleges (Witwatersrand, Pretoria, Durban, Cape Town) were developed as Advanced Colleges of Technology. In South Africa, technical and commercial high schools were separated from the technical colleges and while being isolated from the range of general secondary education, the type of education given by these technical and vocational institutions was more or less parallel to general secondary education.

Higher education was conducted in the universities and constitutes different, though similar, issues. There are eleven universities, semi-autonomous, degree-granting institutions subsidised by the central government. Four of the universities have English
as the medium of instruction and five Afrikaans. One, the University of Port Elizabeth, opened in 1965, is dual medium. The University of South Africa is today a university that conducts tuition on a correspondence basis to all race groups. Also under this Act, the twelve year period of compulsory schooling, divided into four phases came into effect. (See Table 3.4.1.2).

**Table 3.4.1.2: Four Phases of Schooling**

*The Structure of the Four-phase System of Differentiated Education in South Africa.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School Year</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Junior Primary Phase</td>
<td>Senior Primary Phase</td>
<td>Junior Secondary Phase</td>
<td>Senior Secondary Phase</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In order to complete the coveted 12 year education, all White students in South Africa had to pass a number of examinations. The four phases of education referred to as differentiated education represented by Table 3.4.1.2, are divided into elementary education, junior primary from grades 1 through to 3, and senior primary from grades 4 through to 7. Secondary education also comprises 2 cycles—junior secondary, grades 8 through to 10, and senior secondary, grades 11 and 12, culminating in the Senior Certificate or The Matriculation. The junior primary phase embraces the first three years of formal schooling, i.e. the 6 to 8 year period of the child's life. The senior primary caters for children in the age range of 9 to 11 years. In the primary phase, all White pupils are given an introductory education geared at developing the basic skills of literacy and numeracy. The teacher in the junior primary phase has to create situations which will enable pupils to acquire modes of thinking through topics of interest drawn from the areas of English, Afrikaans, Mathematics, Environmental Study, Religious Instruction, Art Education, Music and Physical Education (Behr, 1978, p. 46).
The senior primary phase is more subject orientated. Besides the subjects areas mentioned above, pupils have to also study History, Geography, Health and Elementary Science. In this phase, the concentration is on the pupil's intellectual and personal skills as well as attitudes that will lay the foundation and provide tools for further learning. The junior secondary phase is the secondary covering the 12-15 year period of the pupil's life. During these years the pupil establishes his/her life values and self-concept and makes permanent educational decisions that will determine the course of his future personal and occupational life as an adult. During this phase subjects of a technical orientation are introduced so that when pupils choose their electives for the senior secondary phase, they have a wider choice of subjects to choose from.

The senior secondary phase covering the age group 15-18 years is the phase when the pupil is prepared for the senior certificate or matriculation certificate examination. This phase provides for extensive differentiation which is course or field directed. The pupil chooses one of the following eight fields, namely (a) agriculture, (b) arts, (c) commerce, (d) general, (e) home economics, (f) humanities, (g) natural sciences, (h) technical (Behr, 1978, p. 48).

While the requirements of The Matriculation Certificate are uniform for all South Africans, the African population has the greatest difficulty obtaining The Matriculation Certificate. A discussion of African education in the next section will demonstrate the difficulty encountered.

3.4.2 The Education of the African

The Bantu Education Act of 1953 transferred the control of African education from the provincial education departments to the Department of Native Affairs of the Union Government and in 1958, the Bantu Education Department, with its own Minister, took charge of all African education. A fixed grant of thirteen million from general revenue
was paid annually towards African education plus a proportion of the poll tax, a tax paid by Africans only, was introduced to supplement the general revenue allocated. Furthermore, the Act required the medium of instruction to be the mother tongue from first grade through eighth grade instead of through second or fourth grade as it was previously. Also, instead of taking one official language, generally English, the students were required to take both English and Afrikaans.

This Act was severely criticised because while more African students had access to education, the quality of that education declined due to insufficient funds. The teacher-pupil ratio went from one to forty-five to one to sixty. (Rhoodie, 1972, p. 511-12). The salaries of teachers was low, many qualified to teach only primary school. Verwoerd, the Prime Minister, rationalised this by saying that it was not based on qualification but on the standard of living of the Black community (Verwoerd, 1954, p. 19).

Another thorny issue was the emphasis placed on tribalism and the vernacular as a medium of instruction in the formative years of schooling. The late introduction of a European language meant that the knowledge imparted was relevant only to the African way of life. While acknowledging the relevance of one's cultural heritage it is equally imperative that this should not be done in an attempt to stifle one's educational development. The sudden adoption of a European language in eighth grade renders it difficult for the African to attain educational achievement. Table 3.4.2.1 illustrates the process of filtering students so that very few students reached the top of the educational ladder. Their efforts to succeed was further thwarted by examination and the policy of apartheid (Duminy, 1968, p. 56-57).
Table 3.4.2.1: Attrition Rates of African Students, Grades 1-12  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>1955</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>1965</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>1973</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade 1</td>
<td>282,910</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>515,449</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>728,772</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 4</td>
<td>113,499</td>
<td>40.1</td>
<td>228,480</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>383,026</td>
<td>52.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 5</td>
<td>90,948</td>
<td>32.1</td>
<td>176,827</td>
<td>34.3</td>
<td>320,606</td>
<td>44.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 8</td>
<td>34,667</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>86,311</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>181,455</td>
<td>24.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 9</td>
<td>16,122</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>29,565</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>70,711</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 12</td>
<td>1,392</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2,852</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>11,344</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Using the Grade 1 figures in 1955 to represent 100%, it was possible to calculate the percentages of students in other grades in that same year and then to contrast them with figures obtained for 1965 and 1973 respectively. Between 1955 and 1973, 40.1% to 52.6% of the students who started in Grade 1 were able to reach Grade 4. 32.1% to 44% the Fifth Grade, 12.3% to 24.9% the eighth grade, 5.7% to 9.7% the ninth grade and 0.5% to 1.6% the twelfth grade.

This indicates that about half the Africans went as far as fourth grade, less than a quarter an eighth grade education and fewer than two out of one hundred finished high school.

Horrell, in Rhodie’s South African dialogue says (in the early 1970s):

"there has been very large growth in school enrolment, but for every 100 Whites in secondary classes there are still only 73 Indians, 34 Coloured children and 13 Africans. For every R100 spend annually on the education of White pupils roughly R28 is spent on Indians, R26 on Coloured pupils and R6 on Africans". (Rhodie, 1972, p. 496).

A comparison across the columns of these particular groups, however, show very different results, that is, the 1973 Grade 9 cohort of 70,711 is actually more than 13% of the children who started school in 1965. This is significantly greater than the figure of 9.7% obtained by comparing the Grade 9 cohort to the cohort who were beginning school in 1973. It indicates that, while the drop-off is still great, the number of children
staying at school until Grade 9 had increased in relationship to the total numbers of children attending school. While the annual expenditure on every African pupil was R6 according to Rhodie (1972, p. 496) it is not likely that the increase would be due to an increase in school provision but was more likely to have occurred as a result of a higher birth rate.

More recently comparative statistics provided by Christie (1992, p. 39) on government expenditure on education for the different race groups shows that despite the teacher-pupil ratio for African students was poor (41:1) compared to the other race groups: White (16:1); Indian (21:1); and Coloured (25:1), the examination performance of African pupils in the Standard In Matriculation exemption was not much different from that of the Coloured group, namely 56% for the African and 69% for the Coloured. This could indicate the determination on the part of African students to succeed even though state expenditure on African education was disproportionate to the African population figure of (1,000s) 33, 580 (Christie, 1992, p. 39).

In addition, by the Extension of University Education Act of 1959, White students are not admitted to non-White universities and no African can attend a university outside his 'national unit' without the consent of the Minister. "Out of 190 African students applying for permission in 1960, the Minister approved only four" (Horrell, 1964, pp. 136-38; 148-51).

The efforts of the Nationalist Government to impose the policy of apartheid finally came to a head in June 1976 in the form of the Soweto Riots. The catalyst for the riots was essentially the decision of the Nationalists to implement a policy of teaching half the courses in African secondary schools in the Southern Transvaal through the medium of Afrikaans.
"This roused the ire of African students, parents and teachers, both because of the practical difficulties of forcing students to suddenly learn through a language in which they were not fluent and because of the deep hatred among Blacks for the language used by the police, the courts and the apartheid administration." (Harsch, 1980, p. 280).

3.4.3 The Education of Coloureds and Indians

Turner (cited in Rose, 1970, p. 91) asserts that there are several reasons why Coloured and Indian education could be considered together. The origins of both lay in earlier periods of labour shortage. Both groups are concentrated in particular areas: the Coloureds in the Cape and the Indians in Natal. Finally, from the period of the 1960s, the administration of their social and political life, in particular, educational provision had been almost identical. Since most Coloureds are concentrated in the Cape, the education of Coloureds was similar to Whites on the grounds that they were a part of Western civilisation. In the Orange Free State, Coloureds had their education linked to that of Africans and in the Transvaal with Indians. In Natal, after 1942, Coloured education was free and compulsory at the primary level and some money grants were available to poorer children in secondary schools. In the Transvaal, education was not compulsory for either Indians or Coloureds, but education was free for the twelve years of schooling. In the Orange Free State there were no Indians and schooling was not compulsory for the relatively small group of Coloureds.

Education for Indians in Natal started in 1869 and in the Transvaal in the 1890s. The sort of education provided was largely through the missions. More recently, Indians in Natal had state-aided schools, where the land and buildings were financed by the Indian community and the teachers' salaries, books and stationery were paid for by the state. In 1963 and 1965, respectively, the Departments of Coloured Affairs and Indian Affairs were created. The two departments had control of education, including technical and university education. As education became compulsory, parents became more involved in education through school committees and expenditure on education increased.
Despite this, however, and given the similarity in both these groups, one has to question the feasibility of having separate education departments when economically (that is, in the workforce) they would be eventually integrated. If preservation of one's culture was used as an argument to rationalise such separation, then one has to question the extent of such preservation if the education provided was Western and European in content. Education for Whites, Coloureds and Indians was free with buildings, teachers, textbooks and stationery, while African education required parents to pay for books and stationery in addition to fees, taxes and voluntary contributions. Horrell (1969), in a survey done on Soweto by the Institute of Race Relations, said that "the effective minimum level of income of the African compared to the other three population groups is generally estimated at one and a half times the poverty datum line figure, which would mean a family of six at Soweto should have at least R95,63 a month".

With such low incomes and inequalities in state expenditure on education, the quality of African education has been low due to overcrowded classrooms, poor facilities and lowly qualified teachers. The situation became worse due to the poverty of many African children. "Several surveys among African children reveal that sixty to seventy percent suffered malnutrition; fifty percent needed medical and nursing attention and almost ten percent hospitalised for diseases directly or indirectly related to malnutrition" (South African Institute of Race Relations, 1960).

African education was confronted with opposition from the Church, teachers, parents and the youth. Schools were burnt down by youths, principals were placed under police protection and protest was at its height. The Inspector of Education, as the local representative of the department, was the target of dissatisfaction, particularly from parents and (the Church) because they were opposed to the African education policy which provided inadequate schooling facilities. Teachers protested because the Inspector of Education was not tough on policy and gave them very little protection. In 1954, the
ANC recommended the withdrawal of school children from the schools and the boycotting of such institutions. The Roman Catholic and Seventh Day Adventist Churches declared that they would fund their own schools and maintain their commitment to social justice.

The late 1960s saw the emergence of the Black consciousness movement particularly in urban areas.

"The black consciousness movement was rooted in the increasing alienation of black youth from the prevailing political, economic and social structure and the attempts to inculcate conformist modes of behaviour, passivity and psychological and racial inferiority through various agencies of social control, particularly Bantu Education." (Nkomo, 1990, p. 58).

Such consciousness contributed to the explosive rejection of government policy in education by African youth in Soweto in 1976 that continued well into the 1980s.

3.5 The Soweto Uprising

In June 1976, protests were held in Soweto (South Western Townships) of Johannesburg by African pupils. The protests were initially directed against the police but later it developed in response to certain subjects in African secondary schools being taught through the medium of Afrikaans (Coutts, 1992, p. 4). Through confrontation with the police, the protest turned to violence. Within two months of the 16th June, riots occurred amongst at least eighty Black communities. Shortly after the riots, African school children in Soweto expressed the determination of their community to have a single education department in South Africa, with free and compulsory education for all. All students involved in the unrest wanted to be educated in the same schools and universities without distinctions based on colour (Coutts, 1992, p. 5). In the months following the riots, the government extended compulsory education for African students to secondary level and removed Afrikaans as the medium of instruction in secondary
schools, but still this was not enough to quell the concerns of the Africans about the control of education.

In 1980 a country-wide boycott occurred in African schools. African pupils demanded "democratic and free schooling in a liberated South African" (Coutts, 1992. p. 5). Coloured and Indian schools closed too in protest against the separate and parallel education systems. The involvement of the Coloureds in the school boycotts was a source of concern to the government particularly as the boycotts had caused a severe disruption of school attendance in the Eastern Cape. Complaints were made by Coloured pupils against inadequate schooling and protests against the government's policy of separate and parallel education systems. The involvement of Coloured and Indian schools in the boycott did reveal the sensitivity of both these population groups to discrimination that had emanated from past government policy. Indians, particularly, came out in support of the African protests and against a system they both felt to be inferior. However, compared to African education, Indian education had enjoyed steady growth over the years with manageable classes, improved examination results and professional growth. Essentially then, it was African education that was the focus for violence and extended resistance.

3.5.1 The De Lange Commission Report

The Soweto Riots of 1976 brought world-wide condemnation of apartheid with a renewed call for economic sanctions against South Africa. Private businesses and industrial enterprises became concerned about their interests particularly in view of the call for economic sanctions and, therefore, supported a new era in education. The Human Sciences Research Council's investigation of education in South Africa was announced by the Nationalist Government in 1980. Table 3.13.1 reflects a few select principles submitted by the Commission, headed by J.P. De Lange, in 1981 on the future provision of education in South Africa.
Table 3.5.1.1: Recommendations of the De Lange Commission Report on Education

1. Equal opportunities for education, including equal standards in education for every inhabitant, irrespective of race, colour, creed or sex, shall be the purposeful endeavour of the State.

2. Education shall afford positive recognition of what is common as well as what is diverse in the religious and cultural way of life and the languages of the inhabitants.

3. Education shall give positive recognition to the freedom of choice of the individual, parents and organisations in society.

4. The provision of education shall be directed, in an educationally responsible manner, to meet the needs of the individual as well as those of society and economic development and shall, inter alia, take into consideration the manpower needs of the country.

5. Education shall endeavour to achieve a positive relationship between the formal, non-formal and informal aspects of education in the school, society and the family.

6. The provision of formal education shall be a responsibility of the State, provided that the individual, parents and organised society shall have a shared responsibility, choice and voice in this matter.

7. The private sector and the State shall have a shared responsibility for the provision of non-formal education.

8. Provision shall be made for the establishment and state subsidisation of private education within the system of education.

9. In the provision of education the process of centralisation and decentralisation shall be reconciled organisationally and functionally.

10. Effective provision of education shall be based on continuing research.

The Report goes on to recommend management proposals based on three levels:

"at the first level a single ministry responsible for the broad educational policy of the R.S.A.; at the second level; education authorities with specifically devolved functions to fulfil, aimed at providing education within a defined area; at the third level (local) the basic unit of management would be the school in which the most effective response possible would be made to the diversity of culture, religion and language
and the differing needs of children and adults. Localised needs for planning and co-ordination could be served by grouping schools into school districts". (Human Sciences Research Council, 1981, p. 195).

There is no doubt that the De Lange Commission Report, as this became known, was an attempt by the state to deal with the crisis in education. The recommendations of the Committee for Equal Opportunities to all, irrespective of race or culture, displayed a move from the discriminatory practices of apartheid schooling. Given the background of South African educational history, there was little doubt that it was the first attempt to deal with the provision of education for all South Africans.

The key principles of the Report as outlined in Table 3.5.1.1, places emphasis on equal opportunities and standards, freedom of choice, non-formal and formal education as well as the financing of education. While these recommendations were encouraging to all South Africans, it is important that these key principles are viewed in terms of the wider South African context. Apple (1982, pp. 3-4), states that "schools do not exist in a political vacuum. They are structurally limited by the power of the state... Hence the part played by the power of state intervention in legitimating and setting limits on the responses that education can make to the processes of stratification, legitimation and accumulation is essential". The main issue, therefore, is not how the new educational and curriculum changes might change schooling experience but rather how such educational reforms might impact on economic and social relations in the wider South African society.

The De Lange Report (1981) also placed emphasis on basic education. Education was to be provided in three phrases: pre-basic, basic and post-basic. The first phase refers to school readiness, the second directed mainly to literacy and numeracy and the third towards differentiated educational needs (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 167). The emphasis on basic education can be seen in the distinction made between compulsory education and
compulsory school attendance. The former comprised nine years and the latter six years. Schooling would be compulsory for six years and the remaining three years may be complied with either in formal education or in non-formal education. One criticism of this recommendation is that six years of schooling was too short a period for effective transfer to the workplace. It was also criticised as an attempt to further discriminate against those from lower socio-economic backgrounds (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 167).

The recommendations for post-basic education, that is differentiated education (refer to Table 3.4.1.2), were largely technical and vocational or career oriented. The system of education during the time of the investigation was reported to be too academically oriented with little balance between the school and the workplace. The educational changes that followed after the De Lange Commission Report, placed a great deal of emphasis on this aspect of 'career education' with many support services established like guidance and counselling, educational technology, special and remedial education and health services.

In light of the part played by language issues in the 1976 Soweto Riots, the De Lange Report recommended that the mother-tongue be emphasised but the Report also stated that the "importance of the medium at any given level of education being such that it facilitates access to other or higher levels of education" (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 169). There was thus a change in attitude towards the issue of language which had been a source of conflict from the early phases of South African history. As such, it is no longer necessary for an African pupil to write Afrikaans in order to gain a Senior Certificate or even Matriculation exemption. By choice of the users of the then African schooling system, it became an English-medium system. The teaching fraternity received a great deal of importance in the De Lange Report, particularly in their role in educational change. While emphasising the minimum requirements for qualifications of a teacher, the
Report neglected the area of in-service training and education for unqualified and lowly qualified teachers.

Despite these weaknesses, the De Lange Commission Report was certainly a landmark in South African history. The essence of the report was that the approach to education should be controlled by a more open and flexible single ministry, that parents, teachers and communities have much more to say in decision-making which should be moved as near as possible to the situations affected by the decisions, for example admissions to universities and that in relating education to the developmental needs of South Africa, fairness and justice demanded attention to the inequalities suffered by the disadvantaged sectors of society. Attention was also focused on the specific areas of pre-school, career and non-formal, adult education. In response to the De Lange Commission Report, the Nationalist Government in 1983, issued the White Paper on the Provision of Education in the RSA (Republic of South Africa). In principle, the government accepted responsibility for providing equal provision and standards in education for all South Africans but this was still subjected to the principles of Christian National Education, separate schools and separate education departments. The government reacted rather conservatively by centering on the ideology of CNE and rejecting a single education department. The White Paper failed to address the fundamental issue which brought the De Lange Investigation into being—the separation and isolation of the Black education systems and their failure to meet the needs and aspirations of the people they were set up to serve (Miller, Raynham and Schaffer, 1991, p. 49). The attempt to achieve reform through the co-ordination of separate education systems was unlikely to resolve the crisis in education at that time in which the legitimacy of and the authority behind the 'Black education' system was constantly challenged and often rejected.

Education systems are most effective and relevant when they have the acceptance of the user; when the user is involved and participates in the education decisions that are made,
and when the user is in broad agreement with the view of man and society that informs the philosophy on which the education system is based (Miller, Raynham and Schaffer, 1991, p. 49). The positive aspect of the White Paper was that it did acknowledge the shortcomings of the system of education at that time.

During the period 1983/1984, schools in urban areas became centres of unrest as the White Paper dashed all hopes raised by the De Lange Report. This was particularly so with regards to the Africans who also protested against the fact that only one in ten African pupil sitting their Senior Certificate examination gained Matriculation (Year 12) passes in that year (Coutts, 1992, p. 12). This was indeed depressing given that many African pupils aspired to succeed academically, particularly after the 1976 Soweto Riots. Indian schools were relatively quiet but Coloured schools, despite having made progress over the years, became a source of discontent particularly over low per capita expenditure, teacher shortages, unsuitable facilities, making the Coloured Matriculation results sometimes as poor as those in African schools.

During 1985, a movement known as 'People's Education' emerged to establish alternative community administrative structures to those of the state "to eliminate racism, elitism, sexism and massification" (Coutts, 1992, p. 14). The National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC) was responsible for the management of 'People's Education'. The NECC was a national body representing teachers, parents and students mainly from educationally disadvantaged Black communities. It was formed in December 1985 to co-ordinate and lead the struggles being waged within education institutions and in communities around the country against an inferior and racist education system and against a government which was reluctant to change it.

In 1986 the NECC established a bursary scheme, Education Aid Program which channelled funds from international donor agencies to secondary and tertiary students.
This work was placed under threat by the state and between 1986 and 1988 its leaders were detained and legal restrictions were placed on the organisation. It was only with the unbanning of organisations and freeing of political activity on 2 February 1990 that the work of the NECC became recognised. The NECC was supported in its views and policies by the African National Congress (ANC), the oldest organisation for Africans, formed in 1912. It mounted non-violent resistance campaigns, demonstrations and boycotts in its efforts to win rights for Africans and eliminate discrimination. It worked closely with the Congress of Democrats, a White leftist group that sought a radical reorganisation of society, with the South African Indian Congress and the Congress of Coloured People. Leaders of the ANC include the late Albert Luthuli, winner of the Nobel Peace Prize in 1960 and the present President of South Africa, Nelson Mandela who were immobilised by the Nationalist Government and silenced. The ANC was banned in 1960 in South Africa and unbanned on 2 February 1990. The influence of the ANC in South Africa during the period of its banishment was evident largely through cultural clubs which were formed with the aim of providing alternative schooling to Bantu education which actually represented the first sustained effort by ANC members to establish in educational terms an alternative world view. The NECC together with the ANC provided the forum for opening the doors of learning and culture to all by launching 'People's Education' for People's Power Movement.

Ken Hartshorne (cited in Van der Heever, 1987, p. 2) described 'People's Education' as follows:

"In the wider context of the N.E.C.C. movement, 'People's Education' can be regarded as the working out of the educational consequences of their Freedom Charter. It is inextricably bound up with the concept of 'people's power', which is the collective strength of the community and 'an expression of the will of the people' ".

One of the main aims of 'People's Education' is to create people's power. People's power, the proponents believe, can only be created in education if the people are
intimately involved in the planning and implementation of educational policy and curriculum development. The need for relevance and contextualisation of the curriculum and syllabuses is emphasised. Under the Nationalist government, parent communities were allowed a share in the management of schools as well as in the appointment of the teaching staff by means of participation in school committees. However, "the status of school committees were low and few parents were prepared to serve on these committees" (Van der Heever, 1987, p. 12).

The NECC proposed that school committees be replaced by Democratic People’s Committees who would assume control of the affairs of the school. The demand was for the establishment of Parent-Teachers-Student-Associations (PTSAs) by which the parents would be organised around the school community to operate in unison with teachers and students. Furthermore, the history syllabus was identified as one of the main areas of concern in the establishment of a 'People's Education'. The problems with the South African history syllabus was that it was White-centred and depicted South African history as an heroic epoch of the Afrikaner nation. Africans were relegated to a subservient position as "marauding hordes of murderers and cattle thieves" (Van den Heever, 1987, p. 13).

The NECC attempted to increase the power of teachers, pupils and parents. By 1990 a successful effort was made to incorporate the professional teacher societies in the struggle by the formation of the South African Democratic Teachers' Union.

The Nationalist Government responded to such activities by the State of Emergency in 1986, which curtailed the activities of these organisations by banning the NECC. The state did, however, respond to the popular dissatisfaction amongst the dominated classes by "redistributing social resources away from the straightforward monopoly that Whites previously exercised" (Morris and Padayachee, 1988, p. 12). Christie (1992, p. 39)
presents a comparative per capita expenditure ratio for selected years in South Africa. From 1975-1976 the per capita expenditure ratio of African to White was 1:14.07; African to Indian 1:4.52; and African to Coloured 1:3.33. By 1987-1988 these ratios were reduced, particularly in the case of the Whites where the ratio of African to White was 1:5.04; African to Indian 1:3.67 and African to Coloured 1:2.55.

Despite the attempt to redistribute social resources, the South African business community was increasingly critical of President P.W. Botha's government policies which led to an escalation of violence and a severe economic downturn. In 1988, the United Democratic Front (UDF), a coalition of all the leading anti-apartheid groups in South African, was banned and forbidden to take part in any further political activity. School programs had to be approved by the Education Department, to ensure there was no adverse political comment. The Churches were the only organisations who could protest, protected by their international status.

In 1989, President F.W. De Klerk took over as leader of the National Party. He faced an unprecedented economic crisis with high inflation, low economic growth rate, economic sanctions, industrial unrest, political violence and lawlessness. In the same year, the ANC blueprint for change, the Harare Declaration, had been set out as the basis for negotiations. Many preconditions were set out as the first steps towards a new constitution for South Africa. These included the release of all political prisoners, the unbanning of political organisations, the lifting of the state of emergency, an end to political executions and trials and the release of Nelson Mandela. In 1990, President De Klerk announced 'an end to White domination' and the 'beginning of a new era' in South Africa. The first steps of the Harare Declaration were conceded. In 1991, President De Klerk promised that 'The South African statute book will be devoid within months of the remnants of racially discriminatory laws, which have become the cornerstone of Apartheid' (Fenwick and Rosenhain, 1991, p. 147).
In February 1991, Mandela commenting on the reform process, said “we are not called upon to be grateful to the government for repealing laws and removing policies which are a crime against humanity” (Fenwick and Rosenhain, 1991, p. 148). Mandela saw reform as a redress of injustices but believed that true equality in South Africa could only be achieved with the vote.

President De Klerk’s reforms met with resistance from the South African Conservative Party and the neo-Nazi Afrikaner Resistance Movement (AWB) who believed that De Klerk and the Nationalist Party had no mandate from the South African White population to bring about such changes. In addition, there was Black-on-Black violence between Inkatha and the ANC. The former is a predominantly Zulu organisation led by Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi. The latter has been described as a “puppet” of the White government who was even prepared to compromise on the ANC’s demand for one man one vote. Despite this and chiefly through the efforts of The Convention for a Democratic South Africa (CODESA), formed in 1990 to negotiate a new constitution for South Africa, the White electorate on 17 March 1992, showed their support for the process of negotiation when they voted in favour of the government’s policy of political change.

From 26 to 28 April 1994, every South African citizen was given the right to exercise a choice by voting for their government leadership. The African National Congress won an overwhelming majority, with Nelson Mandela elected as President. Shortly thereafter, the ANC, released The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) which Mandela, in the Preface, described as "the end of one process and the beginning of another”. (ANC, 1994). Mandela, again, in the Preface to the book on the RDP Programme, asserts that the RDP:

"is a product of consultation, debate and reflection on what we need and what is possible. For those who have participated in the process it has
been invigorating and reaffirmed the belief that the people of our country are indeed its greatest assets". (ANC, 1994).

South Africa, three years later, is still faced with the complexities of the apartheid era. The environment is still unstable and any immediate change in education is formidable. The form, nature and structure of future education in South Africa will be a process as opposed to a final product, the success of that process depending upon the degree of commitment by the South African nation.

3.6 Conclusion

This chapter has provided a social and historical background to South African education, embracing Whites, Coloureds, Indians and Africans. The unequal pace of advancement of these population groups and the policy of 'apartheid' or separate development with which South Africa has become afflicted, particularly in education, are some of the issues examined here. In order to highlight crucial aspects of the development of South African education, certain events have been discussed to further emphasise the contentious nature of South African education. The next chapter will discuss the main aspects of the African National Congress draft policy framework for education and training as an attempt to construct a new system based on democratic values.
Chapter 4: Policy Framework

4.1 Introduction

Against the historical background presented in the previous chapter, the ANC developed detailed policy and legislative documents necessary to implement the program of reconstruction and development in South Africa. The purpose of this chapter is to examine and critique three of these documents relating to education and training in South Africa under the African National Congress. The three documents that constitute this policy field are; two (2) draft documents "Policy Framework for Education and Training" (January, 1994); "The Education and Training White Paper" (September, 1994) and the book "Reconstruction and Development Policy" (1994).

From an analysis of these documents, a number of themes emerge which indicate the philosophical bases grounded in ANC beliefs, and the practical implications for implementing a new education system for all South Africans. The policy document for South Africa deals with issues that are both general and specific to South Africa. There were several factors that policy-makers had to consider that were crucially important to the process by which South Africa was to be transformed.

During the education crisis in South Africa, the relevance, appropriateness and effectiveness of what the formal school had to offer was questioned by such movements as 'Peoples' Education' and 'alternative education'. An early example was an article by Schollar (1986, pp. 1-2) that listed formal schooling as lacking in opportunities for worthwhile activity, distorting values, providing an inferior learning environment, splitting society into factions and making nonsense of equality of opportunity. The positive influence of this article had been to focus attention on the critical importance of the distinction between schooling and education when issues of relevance, equality and
quality are raised. It also made clear that too much has been expected of formal schooling, particularly in the less developed countries of the New World.

Such a view led to the Western ideal of a liberal education being questioned as tending to elitism and being faulty in meeting the needs of that society. Ashley (1986) believed that education could not remain remote from the two major challenges facing the world today—the need to live together in peace through the conquest of inhumanity, prejudice and self-interest and the need to cope with the economic imperatives of society through the conquest of poverty, hunger and unemployment. Furthermore modern thinking on education, particularly as it related to less developed countries, expressed by such writers as Beeby (1986); Bowles (1980); Coclough (1970); Coombes (1985); and Hawes (1979) together with reviews of literature by the World Bank (1988) tended to coalesce around the concept of quality rather than that of provision. It had become recognised that "quality matters more the poorer the setting...the poorer the country, the greater the effect of school and teacher quality on achievement" (Solomon, 1986, pp. 7-16). It was also recognised that "the secret of a continuing, although not necessarily a regular, advance in qualitative change in education lies in the symbiosis of the centre and the periphery of an educational system, and in the interplay of official programs and local or individual initiatives (Beeby, 1986, pp. 37-44).

All of these, in one way or another had an influence on the policies formulated by the ANC for South African society. Other broad tendencies that grew out of the Nationalist Party regime that have had an impact on the policies and policy-makers of the new South Africa include:

(a) Separate schooling for the different race groups in South Africa.

(b) The strategy of closing and amalgamating White schools aimed at preserving the whiteness of a central core of State schools.
(c) The continuous disintegration of the learning environment in Black schools.

(d) Demoralised and dispirited teachers.

(e) Angry, restless pupils.

(f) The rise of the Trade Union movement with its accompanying awareness of the economic factors involved in societal and educational change.

These were some of the issues that policy-makers had to face and deal with when considering the question of how to get from where they were to a post-apartheid society without losing sight of the vision of creating a truly democratic society for the people of South Africa.

4.2 Historical Trends and Their Aftermath

The denial of equal citizenship and equal rights to all South Africans necessarily involved the denial of equal educational rights with the following consequences (ANC, 1994b).

- The old system was characterised by a complex hierarchy of separate racial and ethnic departments and services, with financial and policy control in White hands throughout. The education for Whites had always been highly privileged and self-contained.

- The funding of education and training had been grossly unequal across the racial and ethnic sub-groups. Huge disparities existed in physical facilities, professional services and teaching quality.

- Access to education was rationalised on a racial and ethnic basis. White children had compulsory education and were therefore literate from childhood to adulthood. By contrast Black children had little or no access to education and training and as a result most Black adults are illiterate.

- State provision for early childhood development and the education and training of children and adults with special needs had generally been inadequate and racially determined.

- Governance had been top-down authoritarian or bureaucratic in all departments, particularly however in systems related to the Blacks. Student representative organisations were discouraged or suppressed and teachers organisations if they existed, operated under severe constraints. Parents and community representatives participated in official advisory and executive structures under paternalistic departmental control.
By contrast, the trend in the White system favoured a high degree of administrative decentralisation, professional and parental ownership and control of schools through governing bodies.

The curriculum textbooks and teacher education were manipulated for ideological purposes and used as instruments of propaganda and indoctrination. The state determined the history, religion, value systems, culture and gender roles that were to be imposed. Policies on examinations and teaching methods discouraged the development of critical thinking and encouraged instead, rote learning.

Management and control of education and training had largely been kept in male hands across racial and ethnic systems. Women suffered discriminatory treatment in service conditions and promotion practices.

Academic learning was given a higher status than vocational learning. Furthermore, there was very little articulation between them, each having a separate curriculum, teacher requirement and qualification.

As a result of the above, huge inequalities existed in skills and competencies in the nation's labour force.

The denial of equal educational rights resulted in schools, colleges and universities becoming an arena of political education and action.

This chapter will focus specifically on the government's Reconstruction and Development Programme, as expressed in the draft policy document on education and training, published by the Ministry of Education in September, 1994 to be later published by the Minister of Education as a statement of government policy, the first policy document on education and training by South Africa's first democratically elected government.

While this document does not cover all aspects of education and training policy, because the new national and provincial education departments and consultative bodies were still in the process of formation at the time of publication, it does however outline government policies in important sectors of education and training.
4.3 Central Goals and Principles of Education and Training Policy

4.3.1 *The Reconstruction and Development Programme* is aimed at mobilising the people and resources of South Africa towards two (2) goals:

(a) eradicating the legacy of apartheid

(b) building a democratic future from which race and gender discrimination have been eliminated.

4.3.2 Through appropriate education and training, it is hoped that the South African people will be empowered to participate effectively "in all the processes of democratic society, economic activity cultural expression and community life". (Ministry of Education, 1994, p. 5).

4.3.3 In order to achieve a permanent learning dividend from their experiences, general education and training components are to be built into specific projects of the *Reconstruction and Development Programme*, such as Youth Programmes and Public Works Programmes, the underlying goal being that all South Africans have access to lifelong learning.

4.3.4 The provision of education and training is seen as being central to the national strategy for human resource development.

4.3.5 While the state has the central responsibility for education and training, learning opportunities may also be provided by other agencies in civil society. Employers in particular, should invest in the education and training of their workers.
4.3.6 An integrated approach to education and training is essential to enable South Africans to extend their range of knowledge, skills and competencies and achieve greater mobility in the education and training system.

4.3.7 The Reconstruction and Development Programme supports the establishment of a National Qualification Framework which will "encourage new and flexible curricula, upgrade learning standards, monitor and regulate the quality of qualifications and permit a high level of articulation between qualifications based on the recognition and accumulation of credits". (Ministry of Education, 1994, p. 6).

4.4 Values and Principles of National Education and Training Policy

4.4.1 Education and Training are recognised as basic human rights so that all citizens can make their full contribution to the society.

4.4.2 Access to lifelong education and training, irrespective of race class, gender, creed or age must be encouraged.

4.4.3 Equal access to basic education is guaranteed.

4.4.4 Democracy, liberty, equality and justice are necessary for the pursuit of lifelong learning.

4.4.5 The curriculum should promote the values underlying the democratic process and the declaration of fundamental rights in the Constitution.

4.4.6 The curriculum and teaching methods should encourage independent, critical thought.
4.4.7 The principle of democratic governance should be reflected in every level of the system.

4.4.8 The state's resources should be deployed according to the principle of equity so that the same quality of learning opportunities is provided to all citizens.

4.4.9 Access and equity is to be coupled with the improvement of the quality of education—quality linked to the capacity and commitment of the teacher, the appropriateness of the curriculum and the way standards are set and assessed.

4.4.10 The rehabilitation of the schools and colleges are to be linked to the restoration of ownership of these institutions to their communities through the establishment and empowerment of legitimate representative governance bodies.

4.3.11 The restoration of the culture of teaching and learning involves the creation of a culture of accountability, of knowing, accepting and acting on one's responsibilities.

4.4.12 The expansion of education and training must meet the test of sustainability.

4.4.13 Improving efficiency and productivity are essential to justify the cost of the system to the public.

It is obvious from the goals and values outlined above that the new ANC government is committed in its desire "to unite the nation in a common mission to reconstruct, develop and protect the education and training system" (Ministry of Education, 1994, p. 9). However, while it is important that the state ensure equal provision of education, it is equally important that individuals in society participate in the decision-making process as expressed by the draft document. What these themes (equal provision of education,
participation in decision-making) imply, as does critical theory, that there is a need to emancipate individual social actors from the repressions inherent in their patterns of learning and socialisation. It also implies at a more collective level, the need to encourage greater numbers of individuals to discursively explore their potential for increased learning levels as a necessary step towards the reconstruction of more emancipatory forms of social interaction and conditions of social life (Habermas, 1984). Habermas’s dialectical model of social evolution aims at the individual level for more persons to have the opportunity to achieve Mündigkeit—mature and autonomous articulateness and at the collective level, for institutions to be structured so that genuine discourse in the public arena is not only possible but also actively encouraged. The other important thread running through the document is the linkage between education, training and the economy. Education and training are seen by the ANC as "fundamental levers" through which the "labour market can be restructured, productivity increased and the legacy of apartheid addressed. The planning of education is focused on the acquisition of skills necessary for participation in the labour market" (ANC, 1994b, pp. 30-33).

Such a commitment to education and training raises many questions. While a sound system of education is a pre-requisite for economic growth, it does not necessarily imply greater economic competitiveness. Unrealistic expectations of education could result in economic failure, since education rarely functions as a panacea for economic ills. Furthermore ascribing an education function to employers (ANC, 1994b, p. 61) has to have economic consequences. What should be attempted is a shared role of business, labour and the state in the provision of training. Once again, the theme of the shared role of business, labour and the state alludes to a major problem in the philosophical base to be examined in the next chapter. The link between education, training and the economy is an international phenomenon of the 1980s/90s which potentially blurs major issues of educating for citizenship in a democratic state and providing a skilled workforce in a capitalist economy. According to critical theory, the emancipatory potential of an
education system for society lies in the possibility for the relevant institutions to be structured to legitimate decision-making models based on dialogic forms of consensus rather than on those achieved by the mechanisms of power and technical control.

4.5 Development Initiatives

4.5.1 National Qualifications Framework

National reconstruction and development demands that the knowledge and skills base of the working and unemployed population are upgraded and that young people at school have better opportunities to continue their education and training. (ANC, 1994b, p. 15). In order for people to prepare for a more effective life in a modern and democratic environment, it is advocated that new curricula be introduced. An integration of education and training would allow learners to progress to higher levels, giving due accreditation to experience and informal training. As such the National Qualifications Framework is seen as a key element of human resource development strategy. The Ministry of Education has based its thinking on the proposed structure of the National Qualifications Framework, comprising eight (8) qualifications level, listed schematically as follows (Ministry of Education, September, 1994, p. 11):

(A) Level 1: General Certificate of Education, to be achieved

- at the end of the compulsory schooling phase: one (1) year reception class (pre-school) plus nine (9) years to Grade 9
- at the end of the Adult Basic Education and Training Phase.

(B) Level 2-4: Further Education Certificate achieved:

- at the end of senior secondary school (Grade 12)
- on completion of Technical College and Community College Programs
on completion of programs offered by accredited private providers of non-government organisations

through industry training and regional training centres.

(C) Level 5-8: Higher Education and Research comprising:

- professional institute programs
- National and Higher National Diplomas
- initial degrees
- higher degrees
- research.
### Table 4.5.1.1: Framework for a Curriculum For Education and Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grades</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>POST-COMPULSORY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>EDUCATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>AND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>TRAINING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>COMPL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>ULS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>SORY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>SCHOOLING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>PRE-SCHOOL EDUCATION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.5.2 Curriculum Development

The Ministry of Education in South Africa, in the advent of democracy, recognises that it is imperative to overhaul learning programs in the nation's schools and colleges. To achieve this a national institute for curriculum Development (NICD) will be established.
with responsibility for the development of curriculum, policy, frameworks, syllabi norms, assessment systems and research (ANC, 1994b, p. 18).

The National Institute for Curriculum Development will be established with responsibility for co-ordinating and developing guidelines for National curriculum policies, assessment practices, curriculum research, development and evaluation. “Curriculum policy and development will be undertaken on a democratic and transparent basis. Stakeholders will participate through the representation of the National Education and Training Co-ordinating Council and its sub-councils and boards on the NICD (ANC, 1994b, p. 72). Curriculum, according to the policy document is defined as “all of the teaching and learning activities that take place in learning institutions” (ANC, 1994b, p. 67).

The above suggests that South Africa is embarking on a major project of modernisation. Apartheid created fragmentation and in a sense, repressed development. What the government identifies as needed is the construction of a curriculum which will serve and even accelerate the modernisation project while simultaneously developing the capacity for a decentralised process of development. Furthermore, a good curriculum both transmits dominant values in this case, those of the ANC, and simultaneously challenges these through critical reflective practice. In the context of South Africa, the National Institute for Curriculum Development should serve as a regulating mechanism which ensures that national norms and standards are maintained through a national policy framework and as a development program which attempts to redress the legacies of apartheid education and empower practitioners to increase their involvement in curriculum processes.

The theme of curriculum development under the ANC discussed in this section, relates to work done by Habermas (1973) when he asserts that education can be part of the emancipatory process through self-reflection and participation in open and symmetrical
patterns of dialogue. The curriculum, if so structured can cultivate opportunities for open and participatory forms of communication. As opposed to a curriculum that is heavily skills based, a curriculum informed by critical theory will negotiate its content and attempt to develop a community of critical thinkers who guard against the domination or repression of certain interests.

4.5.3 The Sectors

The Ministry of Education intends to adopt a holistic and integrated approach to Education Support Services, which they see as encompassing health, social work, specialised education, vocational and general guidance and counselling and psychological services. Targets include those sections of the learning population who have been most neglected or are most vulnerable.

To combat the high illiteracy rate and to enable more active participation in the structures of the economy and society, the Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) proposes the Adult Basic Education Programme as “it is estimated that about 15 million Black adults (over one third of the population) are illiterate and have little or no education. Less than 1% of the education budget under apartheid was spent on Adult Basic Education” (ANC, 1994b, p. 87). While the policies related to Adult Basic Education certainly seek to redress past imbalances, the Policy and Framework document for Education and Training makes no reference to the generation of funds for this program since there will be heavy financial obligations involved in such a provision.

The other sector requiring attention is Early Childhood Educare. It is estimated that “6.5 million infants in South Africa are between the 0-6 years of age. About 5.5 million are African” (ANC, 1994b, p. 91). As families of most of these children are poor and few parents are educated, these children have little preparation for formal schooling. Once again, the financial implications of such a provision are immense. A policy needs to be
developed to ensure that provision of Early Childhood Education is made to those who require it most, extending access beyond the past privileged sectors, but not feasibly to all. Furthermore, since a National Education Policy Initiatives (NEPI) study done in 1993 indicated that teachers currently available in this area are White and comprise only a fraction of the requirement, there is a real danger that this provision could be met with unqualified teachers or lowly qualified teachers who could have little to no effect on improving the educational outcomes during the child’s formative years.

With regards to Higher Education, the past programs indicated a small technikon sector, a relatively large university sector and a fragmented post-secondary college system with poor articulation amongst them. Recognising the influence which higher education exerts on the cultural, social, scientific, technological and professional formation of the country’s leadership, the policy document pays particular attention to curriculum choice, the development of language skills, mathematics and sciences and recognises the basis of autonomous governance in parts of the higher education sector, especially the universities and technikons which fall within the sphere of the national government.

South Africa is a country of many languages. The previous chapter showed how the language issue was an extremely thorny one under the apartheid regime. The official languages of the state were elevated and the other South African languages were suppressed. As a result, many struggles arose in defence of language rights. Afrikaners struggled against British Imperialism and the Africans against Afrikanerdom. The imposition of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction, started the mass protests and riots which culminated in the Soweto Riots of 1976. To develop the previously disadvantaged and neglected indigenous South African languages, different options are to be put forward at the school level, including the use of a language of wider communication whether it is the home language of learners or not; the use of the home language of the majority of learners in the school, without discrimination against those who speak
another language at home; and the use of different languages for different subjects. Recent news reports Afrikaners resenting the ANC policy of reading in English.

While the above provisions relate to the foundations of a sound education, little consideration is given to the time span and resources necessary for the development of indigenous languages. However, this does not preclude the use of different languages in the classroom. A more meaningful use of indigenous languages implies retraining of teachers as knowledge obtained under the apartheid regime had been acquired in a European language. The emphasis on mathematics and science would not only imply retraining of teachers in the use of indigenous languages but also in the use of a technical language. Finally, without a language of learning that has been historically developed and widely used, constituencies that choose to be educated in a non-European language will be unable to compete on an equal basis in the economy.

*The Policy Framework for Education and Training* emphasises that science and mathematics education be linked to a national science and technology policy which maps out their role in the overall development of the country. One aim is that access to science and technology will be increased to cater, in particular, for disadvantaged students and women. The ANC believe that the level of science and mathematics in African schools is mediocre since the majority of African students who remained at school do not study science and mathematics beyond Grade 9. The new science curriculum proposed by the policy framework document is intended to provide students with an understanding of the value of science, how scientifically informed decisions are made and the risks these entail.

With regards to the Sectors in Education, the main themes discussed referred to the provision of Adult Basic Education and Early Childhood Education, the development of indigenous languages and the role of science and technology in the social, economic and
environmental development of South Africa. In respect of science and technology, Habermas examines the relationship between science and politics arguing that this can be understood as both a part of technological planning and at the same time a reaction against it; as an attempt to constitute the system of the science as a political entity. He postulates that "an institution of higher learning which is enlightened with respect to the critique of science, and also politically capable of action, could constitute itself as an advocate to urge that among the alternatives or priority for scientific and technological progress, the decision is not made automatically according to the 'natural laws' imposed by the military-industrial viewpoint, but is decided, on the basis of a general discursive formulation of will, only after weighing politically the practical consequences (Habermas, 1973, p. 6). Mezirow (1971) in relation to Adult Basic Education, has interpreted Habermas (1971) to postulate three (3) generic domains of adult learning distinguished in respect of knowledge claims, methods of inquiry and modes of educational interaction. 'Perspective transformation' is seen as the learning domain most 'critical' to adult learners. One can relate the issue of language to Habermas's concept of communicative rationality which has normative implications for the idea of 'progress' and the 'good life'. Since language reflects cultural development, if the African languages are to develop an understanding of modern, commercial, scientific and technical advances which have developed outside of their cultures and which are not reflected in their languages, might result in 'distorted patterns of communication' as explored by Habermas.

4.5.4 Democratic Governance

*The Policy Framework for Education and Training* is committed to the principle of democratic governance to ensure the active participation of various interest groups, in particular, teachers, parents, workers, students, employers and the broader community. Under apartheid education, "nineteen operating departments, under fourteen different cabinets, implemented their own regulations in terms of at least twelve Education Acts". (ANC, 1994b, p. 20).
The new system of education advocates the creation of a single national system, organised and managed on the basis of the newly created nine provincial sub-systems as opposed to the four systems of the four provinces of the previous regime. The Ministry of Education was sensitive “to the need for the closest possible co-operation between the National Department of Education and each of the provincial education departments on matters relating to the formulation of national education policy and the effective management of the system” (Ministry of Education, 1994, p. 30). A four-tier system is proposed in the Policy Framework for Education and Training. At the national level, there is to be a single Ministry of Education and Training responsible for national policy, standards, planning and finance (ANC, 1994b, p. 9). At the provincial level, authorities will adapt national policies to provincial needs and they will also be responsible for primary and secondary education. Statutory Councils at both national and provincial level will provide channels for the representation of stakeholders and their participation in the formulation of policy (ANC, 1994b, p. 17). Participatory structures such as school boards will operate at lower levels (ANC, 1994b, pp. 26-27).

The emphasis on a single Ministry of Education is certainly a way of overcoming the duplication of functions characteristic of the previous system of education. From a reading of the Policy Framework for Education and Training document (1994), it would appear as though all policy-making is to be done at the national level and the function of the provincial, local and institutional level is merely the implementation of policy. This contrasts with the principles of local participation advocated in other parts of the document. Greater attention needs to be given to the local level as it is the one where transformation is more likely to take place. Changes at national level are important but equally important are problems that occur at local level. Given the diverse cultural and linguistic traditions of each province, an attempt needs to be made to indicate the coordination and coherence of these different levels. Furthermore, very little explanation is
provided as to the nature of the participation of the Statutory Councils and school boards and unless clarified, their contribution to the policy process could be minimal.

4.5.5 The Financing Framework

To finance education and training, the Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) envisages the participation of business and employers, local government, community organisations, non-governmental organisation, donors as well as individual households to contribute financial and human resources for the provision of education (ANC, 1994b, pp. 33-35). Compulsory schooling can be financed through an equal subsidy to all children. At the post-compulsory stage, parents would contribute through fees. "Educational privilege may be reduced as former White schools will reduce per capita subsidisation through open admissions, increased class sizes and greater dependence on other sources of finance" (ANC, 1994b, p. 40).

State-aided schools, which constitute the majority of schools, could continue under the Policy Framework proposed but it is imperative that these schools become part of the system of provision and not centres of privilege. Any level of state funding to them should be linked to their need and performance in terms of equity and quality. The Policy also acknowledges the rights of individuals to run schools but undertakes to review the state funding of private schools.

Private schools in South Africa offer significantly different educational opportunities to different communities, from the very privileged to the relatively poor church schools catering mainly for African pupils. The withdrawal of state funding could mean the closure of the poorer private schools, while the private sector could become an elite entity. A more detailed investigation is needed to look at state subsidisation of private schools than can be offered here.
One problem that emerges at this point relates to the cost of education expansion. The *Policy Framework for Education and Training* (1994) does not provide proposals in relation to the current education budget. The equalisation of per capita subsidisation still leaves open the possibility of privileged parents paying for schooling over and above the basic subsidy. Furthermore, providing the students with compulsory schooling comparable to the standards enjoyed by Whites, would be beyond the state’s budgetary capacity. As Christie (1994, p. 46), argues “inequalities of apartheid education extend beyond distributional issues such as finance into qualitative dimensions such as the curriculum, which are harder to identify and address”.

The financing framework of the Policy document for Education and Training certainly indicates an increase in educational expenditure even after the ANC acknowledged that the past apartheid system was characterised by wastage and high expenditure on education. Furthermore, will the equal subsidisation of all school children imply that the imbalances of the past would be addressed or inequalities annihilated?

The main theme emerging under the financing framework relates to open and equal access to education which would imply a more equal chance of participation in the education process. This once again reinforces the view of critical theorists, particularly Habermas who believes that mass schooling as an institution is the potential site for change. However, depending on how it is structured, it can repress or emancipate learners.

4.5.6 Policy for Teachers

With regard to teacher education, apartheid resulted in inequity and inefficiency. According to the *Policy Framework for Education and Training* (1994), “about 130 institutions undertake teacher education, including most universities and technikons and over 100 teachers’ colleges. More than one quarter of all higher education places are taken by education students” (ANC, 1994b, p. 43). Despite the demand for teacher
education, disparities exist in terms of size, facilities, equipment and staff at the different institutions. The least developed are the African Colleges where "prescribed textbooks remained unchanged for years. Enquiry, critique and engagement with the realities of South African educational condition are stifled" (ANC, 1994b, p. 49).

Under the apartheid administration, teacher management and teacher support were separated. The former referred to control of teachers and was largely inspectorial and bureaucratic. Inspectors of Education were accused of political victimisation, abusing their power and discriminating against women especially as promotion candidates. Under the apartheid regime, the teaching profession, particularly the non-White groups, was plagued by industrial unrest as there was no system of collective bargaining and dispute resolution.

*The Policy Framework for Education and Training* (1994) refers to policies for teacher management and support as well as a framework for collective bargaining and negotiation. The right to strike is promoted alongside a commitment "to protecting and advancing the rights of students to learn in a stable and peaceful environment" (ANC, 1994b, p. 58). Reference is made to an increase in the number of teachers, particularly Adult Basic Education teachers and Early Childhood teachers. Emphasis is also given to teacher in-service and professional development geared to developing "a culture of enquiry, innovation and engagement with the learning needs of society" (ANC, 1994b, p. 51).

The Policy Framework (1994) proposes the creation of an Industrial Council for Education to be concerned with: (1) collective bargaining and (2) the de-linking the upgrading of qualifications from pay increases. Teacher education is to develop under the Department of Education and Training which will operate in partnership with provincial and local government. A National Council of Teacher Education is envisaged
to advise the Minister on policy. This body together with the Qualifications Authority will be concerned with teacher accreditation and trainer qualifications.

To address the past abuses in management and administration of teachers, the Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) favours a policy of peer assessment, whole school review, teacher and school evaluation linked to formative appraisal and developing a system of mentor-teachers and school-based subject advisors (ANC, 1994b, p. 9). Furthermore, "the rights of teachers and other education workers will be advanced while protecting and advancing the rights of students to learn in a stable environment" (Education Policy Unit, 1994, p. 9). What all this implies is that a substantial amount of resources would have to be made available for upgrading and in-service of teachers. The inclusion of Adult Basic Education teachers and Early Childhood Educators in the industrial relations legislation demonstrates that they have been accorded the same status as mainstream teachers. An important factor relating to the upgrading and in-service of teachers is the cost factor which might also be a deciding factor as to whether this provision is achievable.

Furthermore, the concept of whole school review is vague and requires further clarification but the notion of peer assessment may serve to contain past conflicts with the inspectorate. Does the new policy have implications for power relationships since aspects of the policy are still very elusive? The involvement of teachers in the design and implementation of the curriculum demands a high degree of specialisation on the part of educators while on the other hand the concepts of "teachers and trainers" could refer to the generality in teachers' work. In order for the system to function optimally, such tensions need to be teased out and resolved as part of a broader strategy.

Another theme then is the quality of teachers available for the mass expansion and development of educational provision in South Africa. A critical theory perspective will
give teachers the opportunity to develop a 'critical awareness' and an 'historical perspective' thereby not only penetrating 'false consciousness' but diminishing the power of legitimating forces for the status quo. It would imply that teachers foster democratic participation and be aware of the broader social and economic context as well as be aware of structural issues. Administrative structures therefore would have to be developed in dialogue with those affected by them.

4.5.7 Resources for Learning

In order to provide life-long learning to the South African society, the Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) proposes open learning, an approach for flexible education. A vital mechanism of such learning is distance education. For the latter to be effective, it requires that the learning environment be well designed to meet the needs of learners. To achieve this, the ANC plan to foster the development of distance education institutions and to secure and develop the capacity to use radio and television time. A National Open Learning Agency is proposed to facilitate the development of learning opportunities, which do not require 'attendance' at school. (Ministry of Education, September, 1994, p. 16).

Though open learning is a necessity in South Africa, due to the percentage of people in rural areas, the ANC government needs to look at the education budget as such a program involves costs for it to work effectively. The same applies to the policy of educational publishing which requires all learners to have access to the necessary texts to facilitate high quality and effective teaching and learning. While the offer of textbooks with diversity and choice to cater for multilingual classrooms is impressive, would it not involve enormous costs, particularly with regards to resources and could imply a severe drain on the education budget?
The library system under the apartheid regime reflected the policy of differentiation between South Africans through the imbalance in provision of resources. Although South Africa has a sophisticated national library network, few South Africans have access to this service. Furthermore, African students have been even more disadvantaged since there is no law requiring libraries to be provided in schools. As a result, the African students’ access to resource-based learning was practically nil. Giving all citizens free and equal access to library and information services indicates a clear commitment to restructuring of education and a significant move away from apartheid education. Once again, the costs involved in such a provision are tremendous and the government needs to look at strategies for implementation without causing a drain on the education budget.

The theme of open learning, distance education and a well developed library system sets the agenda for the features of a 'socially-critical' education system that responds to the increased emphasis of providing equal access to education and educational resources.

4.6 Conclusion

In summary then, a number of key themes emerge from the major ANC policy statements relating to education. These include:

- Education, Training and the Economy
- Administration and Governance
- A National Learning System
  - Equal access to general education
  - Early Childhood Educare and Adult Basic Education
  - Higher and Further Education
  - Educators
  - Financial Resources
  - Language Policy
Resources for Education and Training.

While these broad themes reflect a commitment to a new era of reconstruction in South Africa, they do not in any way indicate how the ANC proposes to deal with the issues discussed in a coherent way. Just as the ANC policy initiatives signalled the end of apartheid education, a consideration of the list of omissions in the policy document is critical too particularly the gaps between the principles and goals of ANC education policy and the capacity to implement and achieve.

An important concern is that many of the proposals were drawn up by union workers and union education officials with little consultation with parents, teachers and students. The exclusion of educational practitioners in the plan of this proposal could have implications for lack of fidelity for its implementation.

There is also the assumption that the integration and equality of education and training can be achieved by declaring equality through a process of national certification. Yet "education in the schools and education in the workplace are two distinct events" with differing rationales, methods of teaching, learning and assessment, different pedagogical goals and different orientations towards knowledge, curriculum and society. For example, it is quite different to learn a specific skill in the workplace through modular and outcome based curricula compared to developing a broad understanding of art, the humanities and social sciences in the classroom (Jansen, 1994, p. 3). Even if the equivalent link were possible between education and training, it would be difficult to implement because of the large number of under-qualified teachers in South Africa. "Policy intervention seldom defines classroom practice irrespective of the levels of resources available" (McLaughlin, 1991, pp. 185-195). Chapter 3 indicated how past policies of reconstruction, like the De Lange Commission failed to meet the needs of the country.
The election of the African National Congress to government in April 1994 brought hopes of fundamental changes to apartheid education policies in South Africa and expectations of a new educational dispensation. However, the implementation of the new reconstruction and development program in South Africa could be a long and difficult task if the ANC wishes to deliver tangible benefits to the key stakeholders. Questions that need to be raised in regards to the ANC education policy in South Africa are as follows:

- Should a desirable system for South Africa be based on equality of opportunity for the different geographical areas, sexes, social and ethnic groups with supplementary allocation of resources for disadvantaged groups?
- Should resources be redistributed by assessing the standards and needs of educational institutions?
- Should such an assessment be based on the principle of equalising educational policy?
- Should there be a high degree of decentralisation based on geographical rather than ethnic areas to ensure maximum involvement of the local community in education?

It is hoped that the discussion of the definition and models of the policy process in Chapter Three as well as the critique in Chapter Five of the policy initiatives raised in this chapter would help in answering the questions raised above as well as assess the impact of the critical tradition on South African policy development.

This chapter has dealt with the ANC policy documents, through not only a description but also a discussion of some of the assumptions. Though an important landmark in South Africa history, many difficulties, as already discussed, emerged with some of the assumptions. Areas selected for discussion in this chapter were areas prioritised by the ANC policy documents. The next chapter will examine the impact of the critical tradition on the new South African policies relating to education and training.
Chapter 5: Critical Theory and Educational Policy in South Africa

5.1 Introduction

As I have seen in Chapter 2, critical theory seeks to investigate dimensions of the social world and to understand human reality as a 'self-structured, self-unfolding and contradictory whole'. Since critical theory compares our existing endeavours and activities with our inherent possibilities as rational beings it constitutes a critique of existing society.

My interest is in the power of critical theory to contribute to our understanding of human reality through critique which has both a theoretical and a methodological base. As the method of critique, critical methodology has three moments of criticism: internal, holistic or external and quasi-transcendental. These three moments of critique focus analysis on examination of claims at the phenomenal level (internal criticism), analysing the creation, maintenance and change of people's inter-subjective and historical concepts (holistic) and consideration of the possibility of a critically reflexive understanding of history and tradition (quasi-transcendental).

The method of critique of critical theory also has a positive moment as well as a negative moment. The negative moment arises when the engagement in internal and external criticism reveals existential values or underlying criteria and the way that these values or criteria are grounded in an historical sense in a political-economic context which are inherent in the object of critique as an intellectual field of research, an extant policy or institutional practices. The negative aspect arises not only through the identification of the genuine rather than the supposed cases for the existence of values and meanings but also through the exposure of ideological forms of contradiction.
The negative moment is a theoretical and preliminary exercise to answering the practical question, 'How are we to know what is to be done and not to be done?' Knowing what to do requires that we know well what we are already doing.

The positive moment of critique arises when quasi-transcendent possibilities are opened up through identification of suppressed heuristics. Thus, the positive moment looks to the future and considers ways of theorising problems and alternative approaches. It also requires us to add a normative dimension to go beyond knowing what to do to knowing how we might do it better. In respect of this chapter and the African National Congress Education Policy in South Africa, the method of critique provides us with a tool of analysis that reveals both the negative and positive aspects of this body of theoretical writings. The negative aspects are revealed through the internal and external criticism of past and present education policy in South Africa that reveal problems of omission and distortion. The positive aspects are highlighted as latent possibilities for future communicatively competent patterns of discourse within this community of researchers and for future modes of research inquiry that are holistic and emancipatory for researchers and participants. The method of critical methodology, critique, is primarily a theoretical tool so that its application to a particular philosophical problem or social condition does not, of course, exhaust or exclude other critical or otherwise appropriate modes of inquiry, such as critically reflexive empirical research or ethnographic research.

The holistic moment of criticism dealt with in Chapter Three, looked at the historical background to the emergence and victory of the African National Congress in South Africa in April 1994. Such an account overlaps with the external critique of policy and is consistent with the major theoretical findings of the external criticisms of paradigms of research as discussed in Chapter Two. The holistic criticism revealed that past (Christian National) education policy in South Africa was shaped by the control concerns of bureaucracy. Knowledge was selected and channelled into where it was required most
within the government's framework. The intent of such policies was to transform student expectations and behaviours but at the same time their effect was to mask the true nature of the economic and political problem. Young South Africans then were socialised into the dominant values, ethos and morality which pervaded the nation. Such a conclusion is supported by the historical analysis of South African education undertaken in Chapter Three.

A truly critical interest goes beyond the issues discussed above to address structural and historical questions. It seeks a way forward to more open and equitable arrangement through increased participation of excluded groups, such as students and classroom teachers in the policy-making, practice-determining process. To explore their life options in an emancipatory rather than a manipulative way requires that students first have the opportunity to reflect on their own histories and to understand the construction of their identity in class, gender, race and cultural terms.

On the basis of the internal criticism of the policy documents to be undertaken in this chapter and which were introduced in the previous chapter, there is a suggestion that contradictions occur between the perceptions held by the policy-makers and the scope and purpose of such policy documents. As a result contradictions inherent in the policy documents are likely to be reflected in contradictory practices.

Finally, the quasi-transcendental criticism in this chapter is concerned with future possibilities, with what ought to be the case, rather than what is. The ought arises not from any pre-judgement but from analysis of the human possibilities inherent in the existing state of affairs. It is in the internal contradictions and the historical and social tensions of the present that the alternative future possibilities must be discerned. This chapter then uses the 1994 draft policy documents and the 1994 book "Reconstruction and Development Policy" of the African National Congress as the object
of critique. Clearly, the text of the policy documents is an important source of information about the messages conveyed through this communication medium and it is a starting point for the identification of inherent problems and contradictions which is undertaken through the method of internal criticism.

The chapter is organised into five sections. The first section recapitulates key features of the period prior to African National Congress victory in South Africa. The second section details through the positive moment of critique aspects of the critical tradition which are evident in the formulation of the present education policy for South Africa and explores some implications from a post-colonial perspective. The third section explores the assumptions underlying such a research (critical) for practice and the fourth section highlights by way of critique, especially the negative moment, features of present education policy in South Africa. This section also engages in quasi-transcendent critique by pointing the way to the future. Finally, the fifth section serves as a conclusion by highlighting the important points raised in the chapter.

5.2 Soweto to ANC Victory

The Soweto Crisis of 1976 was certainly a watershed in South African history. In a sense it was an important indicator to the apartheid forces that the majority of South African people were united in demanding the end of apartheid education and the establishment of a more democratic South Africa. The National Education Crisis Committee (NECC) which grew out of the Soweto Crisis and which later became the voice of the African National Congress on education promised to ordinary Black South Africans liberation from an inferior and disabling education system (Muller cited in Millar, Raynham & Schaeffer, 1991, p. 319). In the period leading up to ANC victory in the 1994 elections, the NECC assumed a non-directive, responsive, co-ordinating role. Influential in the NECC were parents, students and trade unions. The strongest element of the NECC was its emphasis on the 'process' of education—grassroots participation by
student and community groups involvement of academics and universities in the process of education and regular consultation with the major groups, for example NECC, the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU), ANC, to deepen the sense of process.

In contesting the limits of state restrictions, the period from the Soweto Riots of 1976 to the African National Congress victory of April 1994 was as tumultuous as ever in South Africa. During the period of the 1980s there were further school boycotts, workers' strikes and political arrests made. This prompted the NECC and ANC to shift strategy from 'education later' to 'education for liberation', to a struggle of emancipatory education as an alternative to militant struggle. This argument was put forth by both these organisations in a bid to swing international support and finance behind 'People's Education'. The period of the late 80's then became one of challenge rather than protest. The growth of the various trade unionist movements, particularly the COSATU and the growing power of the Women's Movement challenged almost every sphere of life.

The impact of each and every one of these challenges was increased by their geographical situation. While Johannesburg, the Orange Free State and the Cape Province represented African National Congress strongholds, Natal was a Zulu stronghold represented by Inkatha under the leadership of Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi, the latter proving to be in opposition to many of the African National Congress principles. Such a division has been the cause of the present and continuing tribal clashes in Natal between Inkatha (Zulu) and African National Congress supporters. The African National Congress has had difficulty making headway in Natal.

5.3 Critical Aspects of the African National Congress Education Policy for South Africa

In attempting to establish the critical features of ANC policy for South Africa, it is imperative that the pre and post 1994 election period be examined. The previous section
highlighted the importance of the Soweto Riots of 1976. From this period to ANC victory in April 1994, the National Party Government still had a firm commitment to preserving the segregated education system. The repressions, bannings, restrictions and detentions, even the release of Nelson Mandela from prison in February 1990 could not, however, prevent the then system of education from eroding and crumbling. In 1990, teacher protests, 'stay-aways' and 'chalk-downs' added to the instability of the schooling system. Community response to the crisis was the creation in 1985 of the National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC) which became a powerful negotiating force in education, particularly in developing the form and character of post-apartheid education. This process has involved the ANC, to the extent that the NECC has had broad links with the former. With the election victory of April 1994, the ANC proposed a non-racial, non-sexist democratic policy for South Africa. As discussed in the previous chapter, this included emphasis on the development of human potential, the relationship between education and training, the role of the state and practical issues of setting up a new education system. The present ANC policy also emphasises on a micro-level, creative learning styles, critical thinking, active participation, collective work and democratic practices both in generating and developing knowledge, and in its application.

The other important development of the Soweto Riots of 1976 was the nationalism that it engendered. Something of a division opened up between those for whom an affirmative national tradition could exist, at least in principle, as a radicalised sense of belonging drawing on particular historical ideas and events and those for whom any kind of national belonging was anathema. The events of Soweto in 1976 apart from demonstrating that the Black people of South Africa were united also brought shock-waves rippling through the White school system. While Catholic schools and some from other denominations acted with Christian courage by opening their doors to Black children, a number of White schools, however, invoked technicalities to remain exclusive and elite. Entry of Blacks into White schools was further hampered by the fee structure of White schools,
particularly White private schools, and by the prejudices of White parents. Many White parents made threats of withdrawal if Black children were permitted entry. Furthermore, the school entrance exams to many White schools prevented the entry of many Black children who experienced lower academic standards under Bantu Education. Often, little effort was made to adapt curricula or practices to suit Black pupils.

Linked to the notion of nationalism, which implied the creation of a South African nation based on non-racism, non-sexism, with no regard for class or creed, was work on racism. The notion of 'People's Education' for people's power became a movement that heralded hope for many of the ordinary South Africans. The literature pertaining to the People's Educational Movement dwelt on notions of racialisation especially the construction of racialised notions of national identity. The Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) which grew out of the Soweto Crisis declared that "we must create within the womb of present society, a kind of union, a kind of organisation which is a seed for tomorrow; a seed of the future society. ...Like the principle of democracy and worker control, non-racialism is not something that you can preach for tomorrow and not practise today. You must practise it today in order to ensure that it will live tomorrow" (COSATU, cited in Millar, Raynham & Schaeffer, 1991, p. 310). Similarly, in history "in order to integrate...black historians we found ourselves forced to reinterpret earlier passages in national history; we had to take more seriously what was originally no more than a rhetorical flourish" (Samuel, 1989, p. xiii). In South Africa there was definitely a relationship between nationalism and race.

Even work on gender followed new avenues of approach. In 1978 and 1979, there was an influx of feminists from the Women's Movement at the University of Cape Town to Rape Crisis in Cape Town, a group established by professional women who were also rape survivors. From the outset the organisation was concerned with the development of the potential of the membership who were all women. The development and participation
of women in the RCCT was concerned with the empowering process and it is believed that the democratic discourse encouraged unity across divides, in this case amongst previously oppressed groups of women. It was believed that the membership's potential occurred through participation in the management and administration of the work. As with race and gender, class became another issue. Certainly by the mid eighties the work of theorists like Freire (1972a, 1972b, 1974), Aronowitz and Giroux (1985) and Foucault (1984, 1985) became important literacy texts of political importance. Foucault (1984, 1985) focused on discourse as the condition of communication which he saw as being inseparable from notions of power, control and struggle (Prinsloo cited in Millar, Raynham & Schaeffer, 1991, p. 209). Freire (1972a, 1972b, 1974) proposed a theory of 'conscientisation' which was concerned with the self-realisation of the individual and Aronowitz and Giroux (1985) challenged the assumption that schools functioned as a mechanism for the development of democracy. This body of literature became the basis for educational discussion and understanding and so 'People's Education' emerged in the late 1980s to break the divisions in the education system by their collective action. The conventional notions of teaching were challenged as well as the authoritarian structures of schools.

By 1994, after years of struggling for equality, the African National Congress was anxious to clear the way for a Reconstruction and Development Programme that promised to be non-racist, non-sexist and promised equality, justice and fairness to all. So far as the economy of administration is concerned, the African National Congress has addressed a crucial issue, that of scale and scope. The large is no longer considered to be automatically impressive, indeed in many accounts quite the opposite. Where organisations were often described in their hierarchical terms, the African National Congress with its new flexible approach policy of decentralisation at particular levels has provided valuable heuristics particularly for education.
This decentralisation has translated into practice through the reorganisation of educational administration. The racially and ethnically based system of governance under apartheid education boasted nineteen operating education departments under fourteen different cabinets implementing their own regulations in terms of at least twelve Education Acts. The effect of this was to ensure unequal education and strong political control over education. The high degree of centralisation and non-consultative, top-down bureaucratic style had restricted wider participation of the people. Under the new government, there is a single National Ministry with four levels of governance—national, provincial, local and institutional. "Education is to be a concurrent function of central government and the Provinces, which accordingly will share responsibility for ensuring that education policy formulation and the provision of education is fair, efficient and directed towards the promotion of human development in all its aspects. Local governance and management structures have an important role in planning and co-ordinating education at district or local level, but the form, role and powers of such structures, and their relationship to local government, if any, have still to be clarified" (ANC, 1994b, p. 23).

With the apartheid economy being characterised by low levels of skills development and low wages, there was generally low participation in the economic life of society by the majority. In view of this, a partnership between central and provincial governments, local communities, organised labour, employers, non-governmental organisations, parents and students is considered to be the foundation of the new education financing system. In A Policy Framework for Education and Training (January 1994, p. 39), the terms of the above partnership are outlined:

- Education is to be a concurrent function of central government and the provinces, which accordingly will share responsibility for ensuring that education financing is fair, efficient and directed towards the promotion of human development in all its aspects.
- Central Government will provide overall co-ordination of education financing, including the introduction and maintenance of equitable systems
of budgetary provision, grants, subsidies and intra-governmental transfers for educational purposes.

- Provincial government will have responsibility for management of primary and secondary education, including maintenance of appropriate performance evaluation systems.

- All levels of government and local communities will support early childhood education, ordinary schooling and adult education programs, and other stakeholders like the business sector and organised labour will support Adult Basic Education and Early Childhood Education, if not ordinary schooling.

- Employers and organised labour will have primary responsibility for the organising and financing of education and training of workers.

- Non-government organisations will be encouraged to continue and extend their contributions to educational innovation.

- Support which parents and students can make to education will be encouraged.

As far as state policy for education is concerned, class is not seen as the end product of social life. Social life has become more pluralistic, structured by a wider variety of interests. There is also a realisation that the possibilities for collective action can spring equally from the organisational possibilities provided by race, class or gender (Gilroy, 1988). The system under apartheid was fragmented along racial and ethnic lines, had been saturated with the racial ideology and educational doctrines of apartheid, and prevented access to education and training at all levels with vast disparities existing between Black and White members of the population. The new policy is based on the premise that education and training are basic human rights, where all individuals, irrespective of race, class, gender, creed or age, have access to lifelong learning.

As such The Policy Framework for Education and Training (January 1994, p. 3), refers to the following areas of importance:

- the development of human potential, so that every person is able to contribute freely to society, advance common values and increase socially useful wealth;
• the realisation of democracy, so that independent, responsible and productive citizens will be enabled to participate fully in all facets of the life of their communities and the nation at large;

• the reconciliation of liberty, equality, and justice, so that citizens' freedom of choice is exercised within a social and national context of equality of opportunity and the redress of imbalances;

• the pursuit of national reconstruction and development, transforming the institutions of society in the interest of all, and enabling the social, cultural, economic and political empowerment of all citizens.

Together with the new emphasis on plurality in society, rose the importance of discourse. Foucauldian view focuses on the conditions of production of sanctioned forms of available rational discourse. Foucault (1984, 1986) is concerned with how these conditions articulate with power/knowledge, control and disciplines. He is of the belief that discourse as a condition of communication is inseparable from notions of power, control and struggle. Power he sees as not embodied in the state but diffused throughout society in every practice. Such a view then would hold that policy research is unable to make good its promise to produce and promote freedom, progress and human fulfilment until the question of knowledge production is sorted out. Setting up educational projects and community consultative structures will not guarantee freedom or change. Dynastic knowledge should not be replaced with oppositional knowledge because power inheres in the form of knowledge and not in its ideological proclivities and addressing solely the latter by changing allegiances leaves the power relation in knowledge intact. It will be an error then to assume that replacing one set of leaders with another or one set of ideas with another will escape the structure or bring about social change particularly in regards to autonomy and self-determination (Bové, 1986, p. 255).

In South Africa, educational discourse is developing in all areas. The new discourse through the ANC policy documents is defining the field of practice, professionalising the field of practice by creating experts and expertise and institutionalising the field of practice by creating, co-ordinating and controlling structures for example in Adult Basic Education
and Non-Formal Education. What this policy reflects is immediate educational intervention into adult lives where formal education has failed to deliver. However, according to the Foucauldian view of discourse, this is not enough. Beyond this effective management lies a response to crisis of a more substantial kind and a recognition that in South Africa Black Education has failed in its structural tasks. So the new avenues of educational discourse like Adult Basic Education and Non-Formal Education must be seen as a structuring of new forms of co-operation and consent.

Further insight into this discourse is provided by applying post-colonialist concepts of 'identity' and 'alterity'. The concepts of 'identity' and 'alterity' (the other) as explored by post-colonialist writers do have implications for South African society. Post-colonial discourses have cast light on the deep forces that have driven 'voices' from the periphery or edge of the imperial world to engage in open and dialectic conflict with the voice of the centre. This suggests an important political imperative: that of erasing an entire world and mode of representation dictated by others. In the addition of further cultural identities and differences, we witness a new discursive centre. This implies the corroboration of what was once 'inferior', 'secondary', and 'marginal'.

What is present in the new South Africa which differed from the old is a discourse that questioned the facts, the enclosed and the codified by discursive modes that are fluid and continually renewable. The imposition of a Dutch way of life on a local (African) world resulted in a loss of identity with a different and 'alien' identity being acquired. Resistance was organised in an attempt to repel the invasion of the 'foreigner' and the 'enemy'.

South Africa prior to April 1994 was a place where the struggle between the "identity" and the "alterity" was ignited. In this struggle violent exchanges were made. The voices from the margin (Black majority) grew stronger, even more intelligible. The female from
the margin in the new South Africa manages to find a voice, an outlook, a way of her own to tell her story. In this way, the old Subject (the West, the myth of the cultural supremacy of the White race, the male, power-based relationship between master and slave) is displaced by the Other.

The margin is as Spivak (cited in Harasym, 1990, pp. 156-57) describes "the place of argument, the place for a critical moment, the place of interests for assertions". The margin in South Africa became one of resistance, a space for creativity in which the binary colonised/coloniser is put under erasure and overwritten by a plurality of multiple subjects. It is a territory where the voice can draw out new ways of being.

In the context of spatial distribution, South Africa has become one of 'plural' space by the bodies who dwell in it and mark it with their signs and who describe it with their voices. The present South African society having claimed their territory, inscribe their 'signs', their 'alphabet', and write their meaningful story. Through the winds of change in South Africa, many White South Africans understand that along with their biologically determined identity, another is being constituted. This creates the urge to experience and redefine the symbolic process through which the social imagery—nation, culture, community—becomes the subject of discourse and the object of an identity. It is about indicating the voiceless space of those who until April 1994 in South Africa had been denied speech but who now can "give rein to their language, signs and sounds", alternative modes that go alongside pre-existing ones, perhaps superseding them and perhaps affirming their right to co-exist, without any pre-established hierarchy imposing rank and order.

The space of the margin is the hybrid space which allows present day South Africans an opportunity to destroy barriers of race, sex, gender and language. All South Africans by placing themselves at the cultural edge, create for themselves an open vision, embracing
change and fluidity rather than fixity. To choose the margin then is a political act. This margin which is the site of resistance becomes the critical response to domination. "We come to this space through suffering and pain, through struggle. We know struggle to be that which gives pleasures, delights and fulfills desire. We are transformed, individually, collectively, as we make radical creative space which affirms and sustains our subjectivity, which gives us a new location from which to articulate our sense of the world." (hooks, 1990, p. 153)

An important contribution then of the term 'post-colonial' has been to direct my attention to the many ways in which colonisation has never simply been external to the societies of the imperial metropolis. This was a process whose negative effects provided the foundation of anti-colonial political mobilisation, and provoked the attempt to recover an alternative set of cultural origins not contaminated by the colonising experience. This represents the critical dimension of anti-colonial struggles. However, despite the contribution of post-colonial writings to an understanding of the South African situation, post-colonialism as a field of inquiry has been taken to task for conceptual reasons. Shohat (1992) criticises the post-colonial for its 'theoretical and political ambiguity'—its ahistorical and universalising displacements' and its 'depoliticising implications'. The post-colonial she argues is politically ambivalent because it blurs the clear cut distinctions between colonisers and colonised hitherto associated with the paradigms of 'colonialism' and 'Third Worldism' which it aims to supplant. It dissolves the politics of resistance because it posits no clear domination and calls for no clear opposition. Furthermore, it collapses different histories, temporalities and racial formations into the same universalising category (Shohat, 1992).

In his recent contribution to the debate, a scholar of modern China, Arif Dirlik (1994) believes that the post-colonial is a post-structuralist discourse deployed by displaced Third World intellectuals making good prestige 'Ivy League' American universities.
Secondly, Dirlik (1994, p. 347) believes that post-colonialism grossly underplays capitalism's structuring of the modern world. Its notion of identity is discursive not structural. It repudiates structure and totality. Post-colonial discourse he sees as a culturalism. According to Dirlik (1992, p. 346) this implies a preoccupation with questions of identity and the subject and hence cannot give an account of the world outside the subject. Dirlik (1992, p. 337) goes on to say that the post-colonial presents the coloniser with a problem of identity.

The important point being made by both these critics is the ubiquitous academic marketability of the term 'post-colonial' and the prominent position in its deployment of "academic intellectual of Third World origin...acting as pace-setters in cultural criticism" (Dirlik, 1994, p. 347). The difficulty in applying the term 'post-colonial' to South Africa lies in the fact that not all societies are post-colonial in the same way and the term post-colonial does not operate on its own but is in effect a construct internally differentiated by its intersections with other unfolding relations. So in order for the post-colonial to be more relevant to South Africa, a more careful discrimination is in order between different social and racial formations to avoid spurious 'universalisation'. Hulme (1995) believes that if 'post-colonial' is useful then it refers to a process of disengagement from the whole colonial syndrome which takes many forms and is probably inescapable for all those whose worlds have been marked by that set of phenomena: post-colonial is (or should be) a descriptive not an evaluative term—it is not some kind of badge of merit.

Using the discussion of the post-colonial to obtain an understanding of the South African situation involves to my mind a preoccupation with the colonised/colonising relationship. This revival or re-stage brings to the fore precisely what the post-colonial declares to be 'over'. It is even more ironic that in discussing post-colonial Third World societies, post-colonial critics are so preoccupied with Europe. Main and Frankenberg (1993) observe that the post-colonial critique seems to serve as a critique of western philosophical
discourse, which, as they observe, is like merely taking a detour to return to the position
of the Other as a resource for re-thinking the Western self.

With the growing importance of discourse, came the importance of constitution of self
and identities without losing sight of the fact that "our identities are still constituted
through social hierarchy and cultural differentiation as well as through those processes of
division and fragmentation described in psycho-analytic theory" (Kaplan, 1986, p. 63).
What this illustrates is a concern for the development of the potential of individuals. In
South Africa, such a concern led to the development of leadership abilities amongst
particular groups of the oppressed, for example the creation of the Careers Research and
Information Centre in 1977 and in 1978 the creation of Zakhe, a self-help production
group. Another important feature has been the increasing importance of globalisation
coupled with an increasing attention to the local (Robertson, 1990; Urry, 1990). Society
can no longer be conceived of almost exclusively as the bounded nation state; its bounds
have moved out to encompass the world. Thus, "as spatial barriers diminish so we have
become more sensitised to what the world's spaces contain" (Harvey, 1989, p. 294).
Space is a key referent in modern critical theory since society is constructed through space
as space is constructed through society.

In South Africa at present there appears a much greater awareness among the intelligensia
that critical theory and its practitioners are a part of the historical order and have to be
situated in it (Bourdieu, 1989). The conditions of knowledge are now acknowledged and
texts are seen to be a vital part of the formation of subjectivity and of power relations. As
a consequence, there is more authorial self-doubt: "neither presumption of innocence nor
benefit of doubt is automatically accorded: indeed save for correlation co-efficients and
significance tests, they are not accorded at all" (Goertz, 1988, p. 139). Even Habermas
asserts that "what it is to live well is somehow embedded in that which makes us most
distinctly what we are: language. The good life shadows our every discursive gesture" (Eagleton, 1990a, p. 408).

Despite this however there have also been a series of problems and challenges that the South African policy-makers have not taken sufficiently to heart. Before engaging in a discussion of present educational policy in South Africa, it is necessary to briefly reiterate the different assumptions research and policy contain for practice. Re-examining the positivist, interpretive and critical theory accounts of research and policy illustrates key differences likely to emerge in actual practices that correspond respectively to the influence of 'technical', 'practical', and 'critical' interests.

5.4 Assumptions of Research for Policy Practice

The purpose of this section is to outline the nature of the positivist and interpretive orientations to policy and to indicate the weaknesses of both these orientations from the perspective of critical theory. This section, therefore, serves as a prelude to the application of critique, which examines critically internal and external aspects of African National Congress policy for South Africa.

Positivist approaches to policy have the same limitations as positivist orientations to research because of the one-sideness of the positivist view of knowledge. Positivism tends to separate the values of the knower from the knowledge due to its confidence in a value-free method of research, namely the logical-empirical basis of knowledge. This view on the scope of knowledge is based on the belief that it is only possible to have rational knowledge about factual matters and not values.

Positivist orientations to policy then assume that if policy is developed by 'experts', issues of preference can be turned into an objective process whereby the 'facts speak for themselves'. Separating knowing 'subjects' from knowledge as the 'object' reduces
value issues to statements of fact. A reliance on experts in developing policy also leads to a reliance on strategic rather than practical or critical forms of knowledge and to the rationalisation of ends in purely technical or instrumental terms. Thus, the forms of discourse involved in positivist type policy are more repressive than emancipatory and are more likely to legitimate rather than expose repressive practices. The history of South African education, discussed in Chapter Three, characterises National Party Educational Policy towards the African as one of neglect, negativity and inferiority. The aim of African Education in 1953 was to "regiment the lives of the Black people in every respect" (Molteno, 1980, p. 29). Not only were the education policies towards the Blacks used as an instrument of social control, they were also used to produce workers with particular skills and attitudes towards the workplace, determined by the ruling class.

In the early 1980s, the Nationalist Party responded to the collapse of the South African schooling system by instructing the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) to carry out an extensive and intensive investigation into education. The report, claiming to be a 'scientific research project', was immediately perceived as being value-free. By labelling the report as being scientific it was assumed that the problems of education were essentially technical ones that could be solved by technical solutions. The very positivist nature of the report ruled out the possibility of asking questions which proved to be a challenge to the status quo. Buckland (cited in Millar, Raynham and Schaeffer, 1991, p. 141) asserts that "by treating the problems as essentially technical, it raises methodology to the status of truth and sets aside questions about moral purposes as matters of individual opinion". This view is further supported by Giroux (1979) who believed that "buried beneath this 'end of ideology' thesis is a form of positive pedagogy that tacitly supports deeply conservative views about human nature, society, knowledge and social action... Its elimination of 'ideology' works in the service of social engineers".
The recommendations of the Report saw the 'needs' of pupils being defined in terms of employers' and the states interests. In the interest of economic development, career education was given strong emphasis. What this reinforced was the government policy of maintaining control of a subversive workforce as well as making an effort to train workers. Educational policy-making when viewed from this perspective is consistent with an instrumental view that focuses on extrinsic benefits while ignoring the intrinsic value of education.

Interpretive approaches to policy, while more adequate than positivist accounts, still share with positivism the failings of empiricism. Positivist approaches look for empirical experience as the decisive factor in falsifying/verifying knowledge claims. Interpretive approaches too tend to assess the success or failure of policy on the basis of the allegedly observable features of the problem field.

The strength of the interpretive approaches, particularly in policy development is in acknowledging the possibility of different meaning systems being held by the various parties likely to be affected by or involved in deciding policy. However, interpretive approaches, like those of the positivists do not offer a valid means of deciding between such differences. While the Nationalist Government commissioned the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) to report on schooling and education in South Africa, the commission has somehow missed the point. Despite reference to such values as 'equality', 'recognition of commonality and diversity', 'freedom of choice' all of which supposedly expressed the desire to be innovative, creative and initiating, the real contradiction is in the fact that if innovation and creativity are taken seriously then fundamental structural changes in the relations of power and authority are required rather than just changes in the attitudes or behaviours of those interested in education.
Critical orientations to policy involve not only future goal states but also characterisation of the means to achieve them. This involves moral and ethical issues since policy in critical theory is about social reform of an emancipatory, discursive kind. It is equally crucial in a critical orientation to policy to be aware of whose values are being validated in policy, in other words, who gets to speak in the policy process—the legitimation of a particular group's values through policy generally reinforces other structural factors concerned with power and wealth.

Judgement about what counts as knowledge would need to include and account for forms of false consciousness likely to be held by oppressed groups because of their past disabling and repressive experiences. It is equally necessary to establish participatory structures so that oppressed groups are involved directly in the policy process and that genuine rather than perceived interests are represented. At the level of policy analysis then, a critical orientation would examine internal and external contradictions and systematic connections or omissions that correspond to internal and external moments of criticism as well as pay attention to the criteria of justice, truth and sincerity. So orientations to policy with critical intent recognise the inevitability and complex role played by values in the policy process and stress the need for clear articulation of the goals of policy as well as the means.

Kemmis (et al, 1982b, p. 214) asserts that "if we indeed desire to create improved conditions in our society through improving our education systems and curricula then we must employ evaluation processes which are first of all educational not legalistic (accountability-oriented)". This implies a move away from positivistic orientations to policy which emphasises the strategic or manipulative interest of empirical methods to critical orientations to policy which have an emancipatory interest in research and policy. That is, participatory, consensual communication guides critical practice. It would follow from this that the educational policies in South Africa at present can only be truly
emancipatory if students learn about themselves and their historical life circumstances in a reflexive manner. The culture of learning can be then understood as a social activity with different views held by different groups of people and one where education can be seen as a system of communication between the various participants.

To sum up, the purpose of this section was to demonstrate that practice as well as research and policy can be theorised in at least three different ways: positivist, interpretive and critical. Educational policy in South Africa under the Nationalist Party was control-oriented or 'strategic' rather than 'practical' or 'critical'. The purpose of the next section is to examine the African National Congress Education Policy for South Africa whose orientation is said to be critical in that it seeks to provide or at least approximate through policies, communicative structures that are said to be emancipatory rather than repressive, dialogic rather than monologic and symmetrical rather than asymmetrical with respect to the power relations involved. The interest of the ANC as reflected in the policy documents, the only obvious source of theory about education in South Africa, is in critical, self-reflection rather than technical forms of knowledge, which it believes will provide potentialities for enhanced understanding of historical and cultural circumstances as a first step towards revealing ideological distortions that repress or constrain genuine understanding. As such, the present education policy in South Africa espouses a state of affairs where increased learning levels will be facilitated for individual knowers and for knowers as members of society.

5.5 A Critique of African National Congress Educational Policy in South Africa

From the discussion in Chapter Three it is evident that the emphasis in education under the Nationalist Party and prior to April 1994, was instrumental or technical rather than practical or critical since the focus was on developing specific sets of knowledge and skills with no account being taken of structural influences such as 'class', 'gender' or 'race' which are powerful influences constraining or enabling learners at all stages of
schooling. This technicist view of knowledge would be according to Habermas, 'strategic action' (oriented to success) compared to 'communication action' (orientated to understandings). The 'strategic action' compared to the 'communicative action' largely ignores social and cultural constraints and corresponds to the emphasis on grading and assessment of students, by matching students' interests and expectations with their abilities and skills required to meet the needs of a market economy. The positivist hegemony in research and policy does not create this directly, but indirectly, through the political and bureaucratic location of the exercise of control oriented knowledge and the way research concerns are shaped by the control concerns of bureaucracy.

The problem is not defined in personal or individual terms, but as a problem of efficient use of human resources by selecting and channelling people into the places where 'the economy' needs them. By contrast, the communicative interest in education recognises the importance of the cultural and social context of education. Schools are regarded as sites for learning and investigation as opposed to the acquisition of specific skills. A truly critical view would go beyond this to address historical and structural questions. It would also seek a way forward to a more open and equitable arrangement through increased participation of excluded groups, such as students and teachers, in the policy-making, practice-determining process.

5.6 Participation, Authority and Knowledge

The overall methodology of approach I adopt is a critical one, the purpose being to reveal contradictions in and distorted understandings of practice with the hope of providing insights into how to reform practice in a critical direction. Chapter Three has argued that with regard to policies in the public arena promulgated for education in South Africa, prior to African National Congress victory in April 1994, the emphasis was most certainly a technical one. Such policies emphasised the need for schools to prepare students more adequately for work. This was done with no consideration given to
changing the fundamental structures that shape the cultural meanings learnt in classrooms and which in turn help to perpetuate marked class, sex and race differences. While the intent of such policies, and this includes the philosophy of Christian National Educational (CNE) as a whole, was to transform student expectations and behaviours, their true effect was to mask the nature of the economic and political problem confronting South African society. The education policy of the Nationalist Government was certainly a way of socialising young students into the dominant values, ethos and morality which pervaded the entire South African nation.

As a general rule, students were not involved in any schools in any consultation processes about the manner of operation of schools nor were they involved in any curriculum planning decisions. Parents were involved in a minimal way through education committees which really did not have the power to make decisions. In a very limited way, schools explained their rationale for operating as they did through parent-teacher evenings which were information-giving rather than information-sharing sessions. There was no parental input regarding pedagogical practices. Parents were never encouraged to pass on knowledge to teachers so that such knowledge could be reflected in pedagogical practice.

In contrast to this orthodoxy, the African National Congress' Education Policy represents a significant rethink of education in South Africa. It seeks not to reproduce but to challenge and transform the status quo. The fact that authority and knowledge are problematised whether successfully or not, encourages reflection and participation of the once oppressed persons.

The previous Chapter provided a brief overview of the major policy initiatives of the African National Congress government in South Africa. This section will examine aspects of the present education policy, particularly where critique and agency have been
progressively expanded by the African National Congress in redressing the imbalances of
the past by laying to rest the legacy of apartheid. What follows is a discussion of some of
the themes identified in the previous chapter as areas prioritised by the policy documents
in the task of building a democratic education system for South Africa. The main themes
identified in Chapter Four were:

- Education, Training and the Economy
- Administration and Governance
- A National Learning System
- Resources for Education and Training.

The strategic goal of the African National Congress Education Policy is the integration
of education and training in a national system. The policy documents (ANC, 1994a) envisage a four-tier system which calls for the establishment of a single ministry
at the national level responsible for national policy, norms, standards, planning and
finance. At the provincial level, authorities will implement national policies to provincial
needs and provide and deliver primary and secondary education. Local and institutional
authorities will operate at local levels. This unified system is certainly a step towards
redressing the fragmentation and racial divisions of the Nationalist Party regime which
was responsible for the under-preparedness and under-education of the population
preventing full participation in social, economic and life.

The other central theme of the policy documents is the link between education, training
and the economy. The policy document (ANC, 1994a, p. 32) asserts that the cause of
poor economic performance in South Africa particularly since the 1980s had been that
"employers and the government had failed to invest meaningfully in the development of
broad skills and knowledge and this is the primary cause of the low levels of labour
productivity in the country...labour productivity has been severely impeded by this
educational deficit...thus a strategy which affords education and training a central place is needed if sustained growth is to be secured". What this illustrates is that instead of appropriating a critical impulse, this aspect of the policy proposal is about appropriating a technological impulse. A further assertion is made in the policy document (ANC, 1994a, p. 32) that "countries with well-developed education systems grew faster in the twentieth century than those which delayed educational development. More recently it has been shown that the rapid growth of the Asian newly industrialising countries has been centrally influenced by their large stocks of relatively well educated labour". While this implies more attention to the acquisition of technical skills and vocational training, it does not mean that such an education would necessarily cure economic ills. To fully participate as members of a democracy means not only an emphasis on science and mathematics but an emphasis on humanities as well which, in essence, represents a more general education. The ANC, in contrast to Bourdieu's theory of cultural capital, increased emphasis on science and technology at the expense of the humanities. The policy document (ANC, 1994a, p. 84) asserts that "the development of an indigenous technological capacity requires that we produce more scientists and technologists. To enable this to occur, science and mathematics, education and training, both school-based and work-based, must be transformed from a focus on abstract theories and principles to a focus on concrete application of theory to practice".

That education is a key instrument for transforming labour markets is questionable. Policy-makers have to be guarded that in defining policy there are dangers inherent in arguments that speak for the interests of one group, for example, business and industry, who in any case already wield considerable power. To be truly emancipatory means at the very basic level dialogue with and direct input from the entire community.

The reconstructed, four-tier system of democratic governance, no doubt opens the way for participation of civic society in policy-making. However, the ANC also assumes
that addressing inequalities particularly those of race at the national level will alleviate problems at all the other levels. The past history, however, reflected that the greatest disparities, particularly with regard to quality and quantity of services existed at the local level. Therefore, one cannot rely on change at the top transforming the other three levels of education and training. While change at the national level is essential, it must, however, also pay attention to practical problems at the local levels. The commitment to the development of a national learning system for education and training integrates not only the education and training sectors but also provides for horizontal and vertical articulation so that citizens can have access at any stage of their lives to learning opportunities. The main sub-themes identified in the previous chapter under a national learning system were

- Equal Access and Equal Opportunity to General Education
- Adult Basic Education and Early Childhood Education
- Higher and Further Education
- Educators
- Financial Resources
- Language Policy.

While the African National Congress advocates the expansion of a better quality distance education system, which would give those people out in the rural areas access to education, the historic imbalances in the system cannot be redressed by expansion alone. Immediate mechanisms are needed to reduce the disproportionate high participation rates of one population group, namely the Whites, and increase the intake of the disadvantaged group, namely the Blacks. While the policies regarding governance of higher education, that is democratisation of higher education, protection of academic freedom in the constitution and the recognition of institutional autonomy regarding institutional affairs are enlightening, what is more important, however, is how the balancing will occur,
particularly the relationship between autonomy and financial leverage as a method of steering the system. The relationship between the proposed Higher Education Council and the Ministry is very unclear, giving rise to the perception that while being more democratic, effective governance will be undermined.

Reference is also made in the African National Congress policy document to the open admission policy of former White schools. This is in keeping with the focus in the policy documents with eradication of racial and gender discrimination which occurs throughout the policy document. In view of this, currently in South Africa all schools are 'open', i.e. open to all races, particularly the former White schools in an attempt to foster an integrated society. South Africa was previously segregated on the basis of race. However, an unintended consequence of such integration has, in essence, been the creation of social division on the basis of social class. The 'own' affairs schools i.e. Black homeland schools that still exist due to demographic and geographic factors use the integrated schools as a form of reference in terms of teaching methods and standards of performance. In effect, the integrated schools emerge as being superior to those schools not as yet integrated, and desirable change is seen as being informed by the practice and curriculum of the integrated schools.

The migration of the most able pupils to integrated schools represents a process of middle class formation. In terms of Bourdieu's cultural capital, those African students moving to integrated schools will have an advantage in the job market which is clearly identifiable with integrated schools. While the system of open schooling will at some level satisfy individual aspirations, at a broader social level, 'open' schools seem to be contributing to diversity rather than unity. The majority of African pupils will continue to be schooled in African schools. Career prospects for African students moving to integrated schools will be very bright. It appears as though in the movement from an apartheid state, there is evidence to suggest that consent is replacing coercion as the dominant dimension of
hegemony (Gramsci, 1971). In a sense this means that the bureaucracy of the past regime is only partially displaced making the concept of "open schools cinderella-like".

These points certainly raise questions about the intended effects of policy and generate discussion and concerns about equality and opportunity for all. With the African National Congress policy for education and training in South Africa there is a real danger that education might be steered towards a narrow technicism rather than to critical, self-reflection. If anything, the policies for education may become socially divisive by shifting emphasis from race and gender to social class. To be truly critical in action as opposed to intent, policy-makers in South Africa should focus on the quality of education, particularly on classroom practices rather than on the correction of historical imbalances in resources and syllabuses.

In focusing on education for economic growth, emphasis is placed on Adult Basic Education (ABE). The latter is aimed at adults who never, or hardly, attended school. The education is essentially that of primary level, the equivalent of basic schooling for children. In South Africa, particularly among the Black population, this could mean that the majority of Black adults would have access to Adult Basic Education or non-formal education. Coombes (1968, p. 38) asserts that non-formal education "when well aimed has a high potential for contributing quickly and substantially to individual and national development". In the same sense, the ANC have viewed education, in this case non-formal education, as the key to growth rates in the economy. This view is challenged by Bock and Pappagianis (1983) in that they see non-formal education more effective in limiting cross-segment mobility than formal education because it does not provide the accepted and socially valid certification that is the 'ticket' to primary sector jobs and that it does not socialise its students to the non-cognitive values and styles that are learned in formal school and that are critical to promotability. Dall et al (cited in Bock and Pappagianis, 1983, p. 100) suggest that non-formal education could actually lower individual aspirations and actually transform "potentially discontented school dropouts
into subject citizens, assimilating them into modern society (the lower rungs of the modernising sector) without requiring the state to alter the structure of inequality or deal with the fundamental sources of the crises it faces". So, non-formal education instead of being an equalising force in society can actually have a social function, that of boundary maintenance.

Another important assumption underlying the policy document with particular reference to education and the economy is the great impact that the trade union movement, namely COSATU, have had on policy formulation. The Congress of South African Trade Unions have contributed to the decision-making process by reflecting its interest in flexibility and mobility between the sectors, to be achieved by a national qualifications authority. While this is important, it does appear from this and from the discussion of the preceding paragraph that focus appears to be on structure rather than content of education and training and leads to an underplay of policies and strategies to address racism, sexism and authoritarian control.

While appealing in their intention to be critical and emancipatory, the problem with the policy documents is that they leave obscure the ways in which the new goals and aims are to be achieved. With regards to higher education, the ANC (1994a, p. 113) sees its vision as one where there will be "well planned and integrated, high quality national system of higher education whose students and staff are increasingly representative of South African society. The system will be linked to national and provincial reconstruction, in particular to human resource development and the production of scientific and other knowledge to service the economic, political, cultural and intellectual development of our communities and nation". The document states further that "provision will be made for the creation of Higher Education Councils at provincial levels and particular attention would be paid to the articulation of college provision by Provincial Governments and the Universities and Technikons which is under national governance
structure" (ANC, 1994a, p. 116). It would appear from the above policy statements that the co-ordination of higher education will be a difficulty particularly as the document gives no indication of how this co-ordination is to be achieved. The description of the college sector is sketchy and leaves out the location of community type colleges that will straddle higher and continuing education thereby limiting access of previously oppressed groups to basic education.

It is assumed by the ANC that a redress of such imbalances can be cured by training sufficient teachers who are committed to a lifelong learning for all (ANC, 1994a, p. 50). It is a fallacy to assume that transformation and equity can be achieved by increasing resources. So rather than just focus on the quantity of teachers the focus should shift to the quality of the learning experience for the child in the classroom. A major weakness of the present school system is that many teachers, if not most teachers, have a limited understanding of the broader social and educational issues (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 253). This means that the ANC would have to concentrate on pre-service education and training and on the formal upgrading of teachers already in service.

The challenge will lie not only in developing professional competence but also restoration of confidence (particularly after the past crisis in schooling), changing attitudes and the acceptance of new democratic approaches to the issues of authority and leadership. There needs to be a shift of emphasis from the education and training of the teacher to the all round development of the teacher. In the past, education and training of teachers tended to focus on coping with syllabuses and curricula. With the new education dispensation, teachers need to focus on curriculum change, in the 'what' and 'how' of young people's learning. Teachers will need to question existing content, method and techniques of teaching. This would involve not only an understanding of curriculum issues but also decisions about future curriculum directions. The past neglect of rural schooling and the under-development of Black schooling in particular would place tremendous pressures on
teachers and the function of pre-service and in-service programs should be to prepare teachers to work in such an environment and develop much more effective strategies of distance teaching for example. This implies that teachers would have a crucial part to play in building a society and education system based on respect for human dignity, freedom, equality and justice for all. It also means that what is needed are teachers with the mental resources and confidence to be able to reflect on the dynamics of their classrooms and be able to exercise judgements in their practice. Critical reflection is really about emphasising one's own agency so that one assumes responsibility for one's own action and explores alternatives.

The ANC policy of supplying more teachers with a commitment to lifelong learning is laudable but certain implications have to be looked at. The emphasis on quantity could lead to an under-appreciation of the value of theory or intellectual endeavour in and for itself. The need for modularisation in order to enhance flexibility and accreditation as stated by the policy document that "the national qualifications structure will increase access to higher education by facilitating horizontal and vertical mobility between the different institutional sectors" (ANC, 1994a, p. 114) could further undermine in-depth holistic learning. What emerges then is an internal conflict in the policy that could further undermine learning traditions and cultures which in the new dispensation emphasises critical and creative thinking, active participation, collective work and democratic practices both in the generating and development of knowledge and in its implementation.

In relation to students and classrooms empowerment would mean dialogue with students, parents and teachers, whose experiences and attitudes should shape education policy. Such dialogue would, in effect, challenge current power structures. With regards to the governance of schools, the policy documents emphasise that there will be maximum participation of all stakeholders, but particularly that of parents, teachers and students. Such a policy will also have implications for curriculum review and development. As
opposed to being a syllabus document where facts are emphasised, the curriculum would have to develop critical faculties by empowering students particularly to be self-reflective. To truly empower students, the skills that have to be taught would have to revolve around questions as to how to learn rather than questions concerned with content. Bourdieu (1977), however, in this theory of cultural capital suggests otherwise from Gramsci's (1971) theory that if students are to participate actively in the modern state, the logic and abstraction of the traditional curriculum cannot be overlooked.

The privileged positioning of the intellectual in relation to power and knowledge will always result in a relationship of domination and internalised constraints. Deacon (1996, p. 237) asserts that "these constraints are exercised...by a technique championed...as the surest path to liberation: critical self-reflection. To reflect upon oneself critically involves treating one's self as one's object; to seek to emancipate the self in this way is simultaneously to police the self and bind it with responsibilities".

Realistically, the relationship between students and parents, teachers and eventually employers is asymmetrical with respect to the power involved in each case which, in effect, makes the student dependent on and responsible to others. So unless the question of power that dominates relationships could be dealt with the process of schooling can be disabling rather than emancipatory. This could mean that the discourse of 'People's Education' and critical pedagogy which underlie ANC educational policy while promising empowerment or emancipation can, in themselves, impose new constraints on the people of South Africa. Deacon (1996, p. 235) asserts that critical pedagogy "while emphasising the identification and equal consideration of all viewpoints and the mutual construction of knowledge, sets in motion discursive mechanisms which regulate conflict and the power to speak, constitute participants as equal subjects (in the process concealing real inequalities between learners and between learners and teachers) and obliges them to speak under the disciplinary gaze of reason". Deacon (1996, p. 235)
asserts further that in Freirean pedagogy, "teachers and learners are together but not equal, and it is left up to teachers to determine whether the pedagogical relationship will be democratic or authoritarian". Such a view can work as a potential barrier to empowering the dispossessed.

In transforming the system of education and training in South Africa, the real difficulty lies in achieving the kind of comprehensive change envisioned by the goals outlined in the policy document. Such goals represent a challenge which has a broad and visionary dimension—a political and cultural value system which the present educators must strive to put into place. It would follow that more research is needed on what happens in classrooms. The curriculum under the Nationalist Government was one that was based on prescription. The African National Congress is prone, at times, to believe that social engineering can be achieved through policy edict and efficient planning. For example it is stated that mechanisms will be established to ensure the "articulation and equivalence of the curriculum across different learning contexts" (ANC, 1994a, p. 69). It is difficult to determine how the equivalence of curriculum can be guaranteed across any context. Using the curriculum to promote equality and eradicate poverty may not be very successful. "Bantu Education" discussed in Chapter Three is a good illustration of a failed attempt to use schools as a means of social engineering. Furthermore, new curricula have a part to play in the search for quality and relevance, but new content can still be taught by authoritarian methods rather than learnt by democratic approaches (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 345).

The notion of power arises once again with the issue of language. The African National Congress proposes the following language policy for a democratic system of education (ANC, 1994a, p. 63):

- The right of the individual to choose which language or languages to study and to use as a language of learning (Medium of instruction).
The right of the individual to develop the linguistic skills in the language or languages of his or her choice, which are necessary for full participation in national, provincial and local life.

The necessity to promote and develop South African languages that were previously disadvantaged and neglected.

The intent of such proposals was to give full participation of the previously disadvantaged groups in governance structures. Such a goal may not be realised particularly as languages need to be developed before they can be used effectively particularly in higher domains of learning. Teachers will need to be retrained since the knowledge of many subject disciplines has been acquired in a European language which cannot easily be translated into a less sophisticated local language or dialect. Without the development of an authoritative literature structure, it would be very difficult for both teachers and students alike to be critical and creative in a classroom using different languages if they still need to rely on English or Afrikaans medium texts and print materials because of the poverty of such materials in the local dialect or language.

With the many languages spoken in South Africa, it is necessary that some corpus planning takes place in order to develop or ratify precise terminologies or to sanction and institutionalise loans and coined terms. Without a language of learning that has been historically developed and widely used internationally, in the short-term constituencies that choose to be educated in a non-European language will be unable to compete on an equal basis in the economy.

Furthermore, inherent in the ANC policy document is a dilemma. On the one hand the ANC expresses "the need for building national unity and combating the factors of destructive division, and on the other hand the need for actively respecting diversity among our people for the sake of equality, democracy, an end to exploitation and even of unity itself" (Pastoor, cited in NECC, 1990, pp. 12-13). Such an emphasis implies a
'language of national unity' or a national language. Focusing on the equal rights of the
different language groups could become a potential source of conflict as the past history
of South Africa has indicated, particularly the divisiveness of previous language policies
as applied under apartheid. Without a language of national unity there is a danger that the
language of one cultural group could be elevated over the other thereby arousing ethnic
rivalries and resentments.

As a multi-lingual society there are no easy solutions to the issue of language. Given its
past history and its future needs, South Africa needs a language that will bind the nation
together. Choosing the former colonial language, in this case English, may not be a bad
thing since "the possibilities that the former colonial languages offer in terms of
international communication—and this international communication between African
states" (Cronin, cited in NECC, 1990, p. 10) cannot be over-emphasised. English could
be used for practical, historical and unifying purposes but need not be the only official
language. All South African languages could still have equal status either regionally or
locally together with the common language. Having English as the common language,
however, is not without its problems. Presently more than half of all South Africans are
not able to use English at a level of functional literacy (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 212).
"Those who have not been able to read, speak or write English find it hard to progress
educationally, economically and even politically (NECC, 1990, p. 29).

To be used as a national language then, English would have to become more accessible to
all South Africans by effective teaching programs at literacy and higher levels both inside
and outside the school system. The various other African languages can then develop
"alongside English so that they are not considered as being of lesser importance but can
be used effectively by South Africans as part of their common heritage in all the activities
that make up their lives in society" (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 212). English will have to be
taught in "such a way that learners are made to recognise themselves through the learning
context employed, not as second class learners of a foreign culture, or as units of labour that have to be tuned to work better, but as self-respecting citizens of the world. The idea of teaching English through the exposure of second language learners to English culture should be abandoned. If English belongs to all, then it should naturally assume the cultural colour of its respective users" (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 213).

Therefore, the ANC policy of allowing the different members of South African society "to choose which language to study and to use as a medium of instruction" does present difficulties if the aim is to develop critical thinkers. One would have to be able to deal with conflicting views and learn how to negotiate differences. If all points of view become equally valid, how then does one make critical judgements? In affirming particular experiences one has to ask whether this process of affirmation would empower marginalised groups when they confront the reality of the labour market? Challenging learners with conflicting perspectives and encouraging them to exercise critical judgement, places demands on the teachers' skills in the classroom.

A broad commitment to a non-racial, just and democratic society, the other major item on the policy agenda is multi-cultural education expressed by the statement that "the education process shall aim at the development of national democratic cultures, with respect for the value of our peoples' diverse cultural and linguistic traditions, and shall encourage peace, justice, tolerance and stability in our communities and nation" (ANC, 1994, p. 4).

Moore (1994, p. 239) believed that "while multi-cultural education was seen to be the anti-thesis of apartheid education, it was also perceived by many to be too conceptually close to it for comfort". Such a statement was supported by Michael Cross (cited in Moore, 1994, p. 24) when he argued that "apartheid education needs to be understood as a particular model of multicultural education since in it ethnic difference is elevated to a
fundamental principle of organisation and governance. Similarly, Joe Muller (cited in Moore, 1994, p. 240) asserts that "since apartheid education used cultural difference as its ideological foundation, it is not at all surprising that South Africans are both at home in talking about education and cultural difference and repelled by it". Due to the history of apartheid education, the African National Congress in their policy document ensured that multicultural education had a core place. However, with the difference in opinions discussed above it is obvious that many are uncomfortable about posing 'multicultural education' as a radical alternative to apartheid education.

Moore (1994, p. 244), describes what he believes to be a 'realist' view and a 'constructionist' view of culture. In the former, culture is linked to race and hence 'culture' is viewed as a site of political contestation and certainly one that re-validates segregation and apartheid's divisive politics of difference. The 'constructionist' view of culture argues that culture is a social construct and hence also ideological and political. As a value concept it validates a whole range of forms of oppression. Using the arguments of the critical theorists, the South African policy-makers argue that the approach to multicultural education be deconstructionist in approach arguing that students need to be able to understand the politics embedded in the concept 'culture'. In a sense this would empower students in their specific contestations. Translated into classroom practice it could mean that when dealing with Zulu culture perhaps students could be sent off to interview Zulus and non-Zulus in different social and political locations to find out what, for them, it means to be a Zulu and what, for them, Zulu culture is. Then they come back and share with each other what they found out and recognise that it is a value-laden, political, problematic concept.

If multicultural education is to have a liberatory intent it requires a methodology which enables students to identify their own struggles. However, in the policy document there are no general principles for such an approach, no actually developed models for use in
the classroom and no case studies of actual classroom implementation. If anything what the debate on multiculturalism in South Africa demonstrates is that the South African policy-makers would have to approach this area with caution particularly "as people negotiate with the powerfully destructive forces unleashed by apartheid to construct a new future" (Moore, 1994, p. 261).

This implies that the trap has to be avoided of "searching for a purely educational answer to a problem that has social, economic and political as well as educational dimensions" (Colclough, 1976, p. 60). Issues of power and ideology could dominate education if the "user (learner teacher, parent, community) is not in broad agreement with the view of man and society that informs the philosophy on which the education system is based" (Hartshorne, 1992, p. 346).

Assumptions about educational underdevelopment have promoted the idea in South Africa that what is needed most is more resources. While this assumption is no doubt justified, what is also unfortunately happening is that quantity is being equated with quality. Chapter Three demonstrated that under apartheid the social structure was grossly distorted in terms of per capita expenditure on education for the different population groups, pupils per class, pupil-teacher ratio and so on even when it comes to the use of teaching resources, the latter can be viewed as both an "instrument for constituting particular kinds of learning subjects and instruments of control tending to safeguard orthodoxy against individual heresies (Deacon, 1996, p. 236). An example is given of a remote region of Natal, in South Africa where a mobile library operates to overcome the shortage of school books. It was concluded that while pupils benefited from this system, teachers benefited even more—not because of improved educational materials but due to their greater personal mobility and flexibility given by their access to a motor vehicle! (Deacon, 1996, p. 236).
Similarly, present attempts in South Africa to democratise the way history is taught by history teachers emphasising community involvement and the importance of oral evidence is at variance with the original intention of democratising and empowering the people. In attempting to develop a peoples' history, it was the "researchers who pieced the oral testimonies together, filled in historical gaps and even deviated from the community-approved and refined final version" (Deacon, 1996, p. 235). Even the National Education Policy Investigation, a preamble to the Reconstruction and Development Programme, meant to canvass the educational demands of the 'people' were ratified only by the academics and activists involved (Deacon, 1996, p. 236).

5.7 Conclusion

My internal criticism of past South African educational policies revealed that there were limitations inherent in the empiricist approaches of positivist and interpretive style research. The focus on outcomes narrows the scope of possible knowledge in practice. The contribution of structural factors such as class and gender and the role of culture in the formation and transmission of knowledge is neglected or ignored.

The education policies of the past in South Africa had no critical or emancipatory interest, and while in theory the present government seems committed to such a notion, little has happened in practice. If anything, the status quo remains and the debates about educational issues is essentially an academic endeavour with little grass roots involvement. The present educational policies have not indicated how to assist participants understand their historical and contemporary life situations or to equip them with reflective skills and knowledge to overcome the constraints or to pursue the opportunities presented by such situations. While in theory the African National Congress is committed to the emancipation of the people, the possibility is however yet to be realised. To be critical requires that actual, lived rather than imagined practice be
enforced. In the context of education, 'actual, lived practice' refers to the pedagogical processes between teachers and students constituted as teaching/learning activities.

To be critical requires that practice is understood and improved as a preliminary to creating more emancipatory practices and requires opportunities for reflection on the part of all those involved in the learning process. To be reflective requires adequate knowledge of self and others and skills in communicating on a rational basis as well as a capacity to understand what is involved in accepting the pre-supposed norms of such discourse—sincerity, validity and truth. The purpose of the critical approach is that all interests should be addressed in a collective manner where all parties/groups involved are engaged in open and symmetrical forms of communication.

The holistic moment of criticism revealed, particularly with the old education dispensation, that there was no discourse amongst members of the education community and if any research did emerge, as did from the De Lange Commission in the 1980s (discussed in Chapter Three), there was lack of attention to macro patterns and what emerged was a narrow one-sided report, unreflective of social and historical circumstances. There was little cross-fertilisation of ideas nor were there any meta-theoretical analysis. For the new education dispensation in South Africa, appropriating the critical impulse for a policy-maker means at the very least taking seriously the interests and concerns of all those likely to be affected by policy. While the African National Congress Government most certainly shows a commitment to such a goal, it is difficult to assess the success of such an impulse since at this stage it remains just a possibility.

It is important to remember that no matter how glorified the new education dispensation in South Africa may appear, policy is always about establishing one set of goals rather than another so it is always about declaring and justifying preferences. Inevitably, power
and control are involved. The social and historical structure of policy-making will invariably involve conflict because setting goals and the means to achieve them will usually involve addressing the needs of some people at the expense of others and while the present African National Congress policy as reflected in such documents as the *Reconstruction and Development Programme* is committed to an open and accountable process for policy development, the present policy proposals require a massive sustained national effort for it to succeed. Making this vision a reality will be difficult given that the educational problems, as outlined in Chapter Three, run deep and the present policies do not provide any quick-fix solutions. Since the African National Congress has not successfully indicated how its policies are going to be implemented and under what conditions they can be implemented successfully, they have so far represented no more than hopes and dreams.
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The ANC Reconstruction and Development Programme (1994) has the following policy initiatives.

- Unifying and democratising the bureaucracy, governance and management of education in line with constitutional provision for different powers for national, provincial, local and institutional levels.

- Integration of education and training through a national South African Qualification Authority (SAQA).

- Ten years of free and compulsory schooling including one year of pre-school and a three year post-compulsory stage leading to a Further Education Certificate replacing the Senior Certificate. A multi-lingual language in education policy will be pursued. Special attention will be given to the development of mathematics and science, library and information services.

- The curriculum is to be changed to rid it of its racist legacy through institutes for curriculum development established at national and provincial levels.

- Early Childhood Education is to be enhanced by increased financial support.

- Adult Basic Education is to be supported and prioritised at national and provincial levels of Government.
- Special Education is to be addressed through appropriate divisions at national and provincial level, through an increased financial and a national advocacy campaign to raise awareness around the issues.

- The numbers of teachers will be increased to allow for reduction of class sizes and the development of systems of Adult Basic Education, Early Childhood Education and Special Education. Preparation is to be enhanced through the abandonment of traditional methods of teaching, namely the philosophy underlying Fundamental Pedagogics (Christian National Education) and a greater emphasis placed on distance education. In Industrial Relations, effective mechanisms of collective bargaining and dispute resolution are to be established. Teachers’ relationship with management is also to be changed and framed in terms of development rather than bureaucratic control.

- A higher education commission is to be appointed to investigate and report on currently contentious issues.

- Buildings and physical resources are to be rehabilitated through a national audit, building programs and development of a system of school maintenance undertaken in consultation with communities.
The ANC specifically targets and prioritises women, out-of-school youth and people in rural areas and farm schools.

By such standards, the outlook for South Africa's multi-racial democracy is encouraging. Despite this, however, the ANC Government faces immense problems such as satisfying high Black expectations, curbing violence in the country, and reviving a weak economy from years of recession.

The question to be asked is whether the government of the African National Congress can deliver the policies it proposes for social and economic growth. A weak economy invariably imposes severe constraints on the government. Little reconstruction can take place in the absence of economic growth. Roberts (1995, p. 29) asserts that "the orthodox solutions to South Africa's economic woes are tough industry and fiscal policies, which, in the short-term, will hurt as much as help Blacks. These painful policy choices cut to the heart of the brittle multi-racial alliance supporting the government".

The Government of National Unity comprising the three political parties in South Africa: the African National Congress (N. Mandela); the Nationalist Party (F.W. de Klerk); and the Inkatha Freedom Party (M. Buthelezi) is far from acting in "a consensus-seeking spirit". In theory this power-sharing offers the key minorities—Whites and Zulus—a limited veto in Cabinet in exchange for peace in South Africa. In reality, however, the Government is divided over the Cabinet decision to invalidate the indemnities given by the Nationalist Party regime to members of the security forces for political crimes. The ANC needs the support of the White minority particularly to boost the economy but "frustrated Ministers and regional leaders complain that the ANC is in office but not in power. ANC and NP leaders know that too much compromise can alienate supporters. Africans are wary of the ease with which the ANC leadership has accommodated itself with the White elite. Revelations of corruption feed suspicions that the ANC leadership
has 'sold-out'. "Within the Government, the large, under-employed ANC parliamentary caucus is frustrated and suspicious of the deals made in Cabinet" (Roberts, 1995, p. 30).

The growth of the African National Congress from a small party operating in exile to a mass movement has also created problems. The alignment with COSATU (Congress of South African Trade Unions) and SACP (South African Communist Party) has created internal tensions. The COSATU agenda of 'workers' rights' is in conflict with the government's promotion of business efforts. The government can only offer the prospect of higher social wages, achieved by diverting spending into social services for Blacks to dampen wage demands. What has emerged then is essentially labour discontent with the ANC. "For many in the labour movement, times are changing: COSATU may have to assume the mantle of spokesperson for all those who can never really come within shouting distance of any gravy train, let alone climb aboard" (Roberts, 1995, p. 31).

Many other popular members of the ANC have openly criticised the pace of reform in South Africa, namely, Winnie Mandela (Deputy Minister and President of the ANC's Women's League), Bantu Holomisa (another Deputy Minister) and Peter Mokaba (former head of the ANC Youth League). Similarly the South African Communist Party committed to the idea of a socialist revolution have suffered setbacks with the death of Chris Hani in April 1993 and Joe Slovo in January 1995. The SACP has asserted that "there is nothing in the ANC policy that we want to change but there are worrying tendencies within the ANC against which we wage an open battle" (Roberts, 1995, p. 31).

Roberts (1995, p. 31), also asserts that any conflict between the above-mentioned parties is more likely to be personal than ideological. "With Nelson Mandela seventy-six, a succession battle looms between his anointed successor, Deputy President Thabo Mbeki and ANC Secretary-General Cyril Ramaphosa...such a power struggle could destabilise
the ANC, possibly pushing Mbeki closer to his radical supporters in the Youth League and Women's League.

The ANC's options are further constrained by the weaknesses of the South African economy. There is dependence on a handful of commodity experts, small domestic markets, large foreign debt and a high propensity to import. Economic growth has been modest while population growth has been greater. This has lead to massive unemployment which has been further depressed by the inequitable pattern of income. Despite the policy of affirmative action, the majority of Africans still remain concentrated in semi-skilled and unskilled occupations.

For hundreds of thousands of matriculated pupils (Year 12) sitting their final school examinations, the end of school life also represents for them the beginning of a tough life, one that offers no jobs or any other source of income. Now the question haunting students and parents alike is: what is the value of school education if it does not prepare them for the needs for today's world? Cherie Eilertsein (The Star and S.A. Times International, October 16, 1996, p. 6) claims that education authorities are "turning a blind eye to the changes and needs of today's employment sector. Job security no longer lies in academic results. We are refusing to accept that the world we are in will not reward conformity but will reward uniqueness, flexibility and independence".

Schooling in South Africa is entering a new era with the passing of the South African Schools Bill in November 1996. With this Bill, schools and pupils could find themselves on equal legal and funding footing for the first time. The Bill, however, was passed in the face of vehement opposition from the National Party and Freedom Front. The latter believed that the scrapping of admission tests administered by Government bodies would enforce integration since all race groups would have equal access to education. Education, it believes should be controlled not by the State but by the school themselves.
The Bill, the Freedom Front believed, omitted the right to mother-tongue education and the principle of pro-rata funding for different language groups; which would raise concerns in terms of the impact of the Bill on Afrikaans-medium schools. The ANC and supporters of the Bill, Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP), the Democratic Party (DP) and the Pan-African Congress (PAC) described the Bill as an important step in the transformation of schools which created the opportunity for all schools to become "Centres of Excellence" and largely self-sufficient.

Freedom is never the end of the road, it is the beginning. What South Africa has now in terms of education is no more than a skeleton which would require a mighty effort to put healthy flesh on it. The most difficult task which faces South African society arises from the imbalances which South Africa has inherited from her discriminatory and unfair past. While there are so many sectors of South African society that need repairing, perhaps the most important is education. However, the question of education is a complex one. If South Africa is to move successfully towards democracy, South Africa needs resources. To right the wrongs of her racist past will be costly. To improve the economy South Africa needs to compete in African and international markets. To do this successfully, South Africa needs people with appropriate skills which should be reflected in the workplace and in educational institutions. The latter need to continue the process of consultation which has already begun. The most perfect solutions will not work if the people affected by them have not been consulted and have not been made part of the decision-making process.

To succeed in her endeavours, South Africa has to make speed a priority. Expectations have been raised and if she fails to fulfil them reasonably quickly, South Africa could be diverted from her progress, perhaps fatally. Successful transformation requires a conducive learning and working environment which promotes and encourages diversity and at the same time encourages excellence. South Africa, however, is extremely
fortunate that the route chosen to achieve that balance is founded on democracy, openness and a constitutional state.

This thesis posed a series of questions:

- How does one make sense of current African National Congress Education Policy in the light of post Soweto developments?
- Is it the case that Critical Theory has informed the policy development process?
- Can the ANC, now in government, deliver an educational system that is really empowering to all citizens of South Africa, especially the previously oppressed Black majority?
- Does the "Policy Framework for Education and Training" reflect empowering policy?
- With regards to methodological issues in social science research, does epistemological theory rather than social theory fail to locate the research/policy studies in their social and historical context?

It is the nature of critical inquiry that no simple answers emerge. In attempting to understand and critique, further issues and questions arise. For in dealing with current educational policy we are also dealing with a people's struggle for survival.

Understandably, the policy work on education has taken as a starting point a democratic framework that is driven by the language of redress, access and affirmation. The starkness of the apartheid statistics on exclusion and failure translates readily into a discourse of inclusion and openness that cannot easily accommodate traditional criteria and conventions of selection and excellence.

In this situation there appears to be a fundamental lack of research and policy to teacher, student and parental motivation and to the mechanisms the world over that reinforce, in different ways, student achievement and aspiration. The policy documents also show an attraction to the vision of an integrated education and training system that would recognise and accredit informal knowledge and skill while acting for youth and adults as the regular
allocator of certification. The sheer length of the development program to deliver such a comprehensive reform would suggest that there would be many years of uncertainty at the very point where it would be helpful to have continuity.

While the policy documents have been part of a massive intellectual and organisational effort pursued with good faith, there is almost a sense of disappointment when one reads the various documents. Perhaps the frustration I feel stems from the fact that the policies of the African National Congress may be trying to do what cannot necessarily be done. Maybe what is regarded as its single greatest achievement may also be the cause of its weakness—teaming up academics and activists. What is novel about the policy documents is that academic knowledge was used to produce policy options for government. After all that work, the only assurances the people have that centralised planning and regional curriculum development, participatory pedagogy and critical thinking are what they need are the dual facts that they resonate with political contingencies and principles and that such policies are saleable. When intellectuals use academic knowledge to develop policy they present themselves as prophets, censuring society and mentoring it towards the future.

Intellectual analysis can call attention to social problems but policy advice cannot simply be drawn out of such analysis to alleviate them. The discourse-framing role of the intellectual reflects a Habermansian belief in the power of discourse to produce a form of reason that promotes a progressive development towards a just society. While the central role of the concepts of articulation within the policy documents is the source of its greatest strength, it is also the most severe weakness. What this picture silences, what are not articulated are the voices of those most likely to be excluded from the new system of education: rural people, women and unemployed youth. The danger in the policy document lies in its eurocentric assumption that the new South Africa will be a civil society within which education system change is dominated by a "mechanism of change"
which privileges "the interaction of educationally dominant and assertive groups. To maximise the emancipatory potential of the policy documents and minimise the production of new inequalities and exclusions, it is necessary to locate education system change within the ensemble of power relations that permeate South African society.

Running through the policy documents is a view of people tailor-made to the special requirements of the faith that good will and planning society will advance progressivism. Schooling, if organised along X, Y and Z lines can socialise dispersed people into a South African nation.

There is no understanding in the educational policies of education as always being discursive self-formation within social ambivalence and inner conflict. The policy documents show a simplistic understanding of socialisation as intellectual re-education; it cannot deal with the channelling of desire by social influences which turns the individual into a social subject. Locked into a discourse of human agency, progressive policy cannot imagine that human subjectivity is neither volitional individuality nor manipulable social roles. Lasting social change only comes about through deep personal change. The policy documents cannot deal with emotions and irrationality since it has too great a faith in the liberatory potential of critical rationality.
REFERENCES


Transvaal Education Department. (1903). Report of the Director of Education. Transvaal, South Africa.


The Critical Tradition: Policy and Process in South African Education

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
At the University of Western Sydney, Nepean

PATHMALOSHINI NAIDOO
BA, BA (HONS), BEd., DipEd.,
UNIVERSITY OF DURBAN-WESTVILLE, SOUTH AFRICA

M.Ed.
UNIVERSITY OF NATAL, SOUTH AFRICA

1998
PLEASE NOTE

The greatest amount of care has been taken while scanning this thesis,

and the best possible result has been obtained.
I certify that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being currently submitted for any degrees at this or any other University.

I certify that to the best of my knowledge and ability any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.

I further certify that the authorship resides principally within myself, and I take full responsibility for everything which is said within this thesis. The work is entirely my own except where the words or ideas of other writers are specifically acknowledged.

I give permission for my thesis to be copied, stored and referenced electronically and/or by hard copy by the Library of the University of Western Sydney, Nepean, CLANN and associated electronic data bases in the humanities for purposes of preservation and collection-building and agree that the thesis may be freely available both for research purposes and inspection.

I grant and assign to the University of Western Sydney, Nepean a licence to publish my thesis (in whole or part) should it not otherwise have been published after a period of ten (10) years from the award of the degree.

[Signature]

[Date]
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We are like puny dwarfs perched
on the shoulders of giants......
We see more and farther than our
predecessors, not because we have
keener vision or greater height,
but because we are lifted up and
borne aloft on their gigantic stature.

Bernard of Chartres
(fl. 1114-1124)

I wish to express my sincere thanks to my supervisor, Dr Mavourna Collits, former Head of the Department of Educational Studies, Faculty of Education, University of Western Sydney, for the many hours she so willingly devoted towards the completion of this thesis as well as for the guidance and support she provided.

A personal note of appreciation is devoted to my parents for their unstinting support and encouragement which stimulated my enthusiasm during my years of research.

I would like to express my special thanks to Lorraine Fordham for the professionalism with which she typed this thesis.

Finally, I am particularly indebted to my husband, Manohar, and daughters, Devaksha and Kithavia, without whose love, sacrifice and approval, this task would have been impossible.
CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES AND ILLUSTRATIONS

GLOSSARY

ABBREVIATIONS

ABSTRACT

PREFACE

INTRODUCTION

1. NATURE OF THE INQUIRY

1.1 Introduction

1.2 Methodological Issues in Social Science Research
   1.2.1 Quantitative Versus Qualitative Approaches
   1.2.2 Critique of Positivistic Nature of Inquiry
   1.2.3 Critique of Interpretive Nature of Inquiry
   1.2.4 Critical Nature of Inquiry

1.3 Critique as Nature of the Inquiry of Thesis

2. CRITICAL THEORY AS ORIENTATION OF THESIS

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Paradigmatic Orientations
   2.2.1 Positivism and the Nature of Knowledge
   2.2.2 Interpretivism and the Nature of Knowledge
   2.2.3 Critical Theory and the Nature of Knowledge
   2.2.4 Habermas and Critical Theory
   2.2.5 Critical Theory, Post-Structuralism and Post-Colonialism
   2.2.6 Some Assumptions and Features of Critical Theory

2.3 The Limits of Critical Theory

2.4 Theories of State

2.5 Policy Theory
   2.5.1 Models of Policy-Making
   2.5.2 Positivism in Policy Theory
   2.5.3 Interpretive Social Science and Policy
   2.5.4 Critical Social Science and Policy Formulation
   2.5.5 Critical Policy Analysis
2.6 Critical Theory, Policy Analysis and the Present Work

3. THE SOCIAL AND HISTORICAL BACKGROUND TO THE EMERGENCE OF 'PEOPLE'S EDUCATION'

3.1 Introduction

3.2 The Historical Roots of Apartheid in South Africa
   3.2.1 Liberal/Radical Controversy over the Nature of South African History
   3.2.2 The Radical Debate

3.3 The Roots of the South African Educational System
   3.3.1 Education Since the Union of South Africa in 1910
   3.3.2 African Reaction to Segregation

3.4 National Party Policy after 1948
   3.4.1 The Education of Whites in South Africa
   3.4.2 The Education of the African
   3.4.3 The Education of Coloureds and Indians

3.5 The Soweto Uprising
   3.5.1 The De Lange Commission Report

3.6 Conclusion

4. POLICY FRAMEWORK

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Historical Trends and Their Aftermath

4.3 Central Goals and Principles of Education and Training Policy

4.4 Values and Principles of National Education and Training Policy

4.5 Development Initiatives
   4.5.1 National Qualifications Framework
   4.5.2 Curriculum Development
   4.5.3 The Sectors
   4.5.4 Democratic Governance
   4.5.5 The Financing Framework
   4.5.6 Policy for Teachers
   4.5.7 Resources for Learning

4.6 Conclusion
5. CRITICAL THEORY AND EDUCATIONAL POLICY IN SOUTH AFRICA

5.1 Introduction
5.2 Soweto to ANC Victory
5.3 Critical Aspects of the African National Congress Education Policy for South Africa
5.4 Assumptions of Research for Policy Practice
5.5 A Critique of African National Congress Educational Policy in South Africa
5.6 Participation, Authority and Knowledge
5.7 Conclusion

6. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

7. REFERENCES
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.2.4.1</td>
<td>Diagram showing empowerment potentials</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2.1</td>
<td>Three Classes of Expressions of Mental Life</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.1</td>
<td>Systems Model of the Policy Process</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.2</td>
<td>Amended Systems of the Policy Process</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.3</td>
<td>A Conceptualisation of the Policy Process</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.4</td>
<td>An Elaboration of the Policy Process Movement–Policy Movement Through Intelligence</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.1</td>
<td>Annual Growth of State Expenditure on Education Per Capita of Population During the Twenty Year Period (1910-1930)</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>Principles of The National Education Policy Act of 1967</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.2</td>
<td>Four Phases of Schooling</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.1</td>
<td>Attrition Rates of African Students, Grades 1-12</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1.1</td>
<td>Recommendations of the De Lange Commission Report on Education</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1.1</td>
<td>Framework for a Curriculum for Education and Training</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Glossary

Africans: Original inhabitants of Southern Africa.

Afrikaans: Language of Dutch origin which with English became one of South Africa's two official languages.

Afrikaner: Name applied to South Africans of Dutch descent and also to those of German or French stock. The term replaced that of 'Boer' at the beginning of the twentieth century. It represents an idea of nationhood, 'Afrikanerdom'.

Apartheid: Literally means 'separateness'. The term has been replaced in South Africa with 'separate development'.

Bantu: The term which means 'men'. Originally referred to a group of languages used by certain native tribes of Southern Africa. In 1974, the South African Government decided to abandon 'Bantu' to designate the Black population.

Boer: The word originally meant 'farmer'. It is still used in this sense in Dutch.

CNE: Christian National Education.

Coloured: In South Africa this term is applied to those of mixed breeds. Coloured evolved when the Khoi-Khoi (Hottentots) merged with the Africans, Whites and slaves from East and West Africa.

Dutch: Term used at the end of the nineteenth century to refer to the Afrikaners of the Cape Colony.

Herrenvolk: The People - reference to the Afrikaner people as being a united powerful group.

Indian: From India who came to South Africa during the second half of the nineteenth century to work as indentured labour on the Natal sugar plantations.

Khoi-Khoi: Hottentots who were in occupation of the Cape when van Riebeeck arrived in 1652. Later renamed Khoi-Khoi - meaning 'men of men'. They kept cattle and sheep.

San: Bushmen - scattered over Southern Africa. They are hunter-gatherers.

Trek: Journey by ox-wagon.

Trekkers: Semi-nomad Boers.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviations</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.B.E.</td>
<td>Adult Basic Education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.N.C.</td>
<td>African National Congress.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.W.B.</td>
<td>Afrikaner Weerstands beweging.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.C.U.</td>
<td>Industrial and Commercial Union.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.N.E.</td>
<td>Christian National Education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.O.D.E.S.A.</td>
<td>Convention for a Democratic South Africa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.P.S.A.</td>
<td>Communist Party of South Africa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.P.U.</td>
<td>Education Policy Unit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.E.C.</td>
<td>Further Education Certificate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.E.C.</td>
<td>General Education Certificate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.E.C.C.</td>
<td>National Education Crisis Committee.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.E.P.I.</td>
<td>National Educational Policy Initiatives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.T.S.A.'s</td>
<td>Parent/Teacher/Staff Associations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R.D.P.</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R.S.A.</td>
<td>Republic of South Africa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.A.C.P.</td>
<td>South African Conservative Party.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.A.Q.A.</td>
<td>National South African Qualification Authority.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.D.F.</td>
<td>United Democratic Front.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

For the researcher, education is concerned fundamentally with the notion of human emancipation. In other words, it is only worth the name if it forms people capable of taking part in their own liberation. As such a methodological tool derived from critical theory that is a form of meta-critique with an emancipatory rather than manipulative interest in criticism was used in the examination of current African National Congress Education Policy in South Africa. Education in South Africa prior to ANC victory in 1994 was dominated by the ideology of apartheid which led to a variety of malpractices in defining the role and status of education. The ANC victory in South Africa ushered in a period of awakening from a situation of oppression to the establishment of alternative education structures promising a redress of past imbalances through equality, justice and democracy as fundamental human rights.

Critical theory is a paradigm that transcends the implicit absolutism of positivism and the implicit relativism of interpretivism. The intellectual and policy fields in South Africa under the Nationalist Party were dominated by positivist orientations which were inadequate because of their one-sidedness, failure to address value issues and omission of structural factors like class, gender and culture. As a procedural rather than a substantive inquiry, critical theory sets out a meta-level procedure of rational valuing—the method of critique. As a form of social praxis the ANC policy documents do have emancipatory potential and the potential too at a theoretical level to recognise the importance of consensual, discursive forms of communication.

The importance however lies in its practical application. While the ANC policy documents may serve South African society in an educative way, it is equally important that this also implies at a practical level an increase in collective learning levels. This has to be done in ways that are undistorted and ways that do not devolve all authority to experts. As a preliminary to improving practices, it is vital to penetrate below the surface of the ANC policy documents to understand the true nature of things found to expose internal and external contradictions and distortions. As Durkheim (1964) says why strive for knowledge of reality if this knowledge cannot serve us in life. This implies that pursuit of knowledge is of little value unless it can serve our interests as social and cultural beings.
Preface

I believe that education is concerned fundamentally with the notion of human emancipation. For many, education begins and ends with formal schooling so it is to the schooling system that one must turn for the possibility of human emancipation. The African National Congress, presently in power in South Africa, believe that the possibility of human emancipation could become a reality through their Reconstruction and Development Policy.

As an educator in South Africa, prior to the African National Congress victory in April 1994, I attempted to achieve the goal of human emancipation by defining my role as an educator of persons rather than as an instructor of knowledge. However this approach did little to emancipate my students from the constraints of their historical, social and economic circumstances. It became obvious that one could not attempt to educate persons in any holistic or coherent manner unless one had taken into account the historical, economic and social circumstances of students and related structural issues like culture, class, race, sex and gender.

The attempt to emancipate young learners by facilitating the learning process was more difficult than expected because of many disabling factors, including the prior and enduring influence of race, class, gender and culture.

In South Africa schooling and politics are both being disseminators of cultural content and impetus and both are having a formative and guiding effect on South African society. To understand African National Congress Policy and its implications for education, I
sought theoretical answers and methodological tools to penetrate the distortions and false images I saw being constructed daily in classrooms and administrative offices.

This thesis was born in my struggle to teach for emancipation and in my search for answers as to how the African National Congress hoped to implement teaching for emancipation and the tools they recommended to achieve it. In these respects it is grounded in practice yet it remains essentially a theoretical exercise because it emerged from dialogue with other educators, researchers, policy-makers, and trade unionists who shared similar hopes for the emancipatory potential of schooling. This meant that I became immersed in the social, philosophical and historical literature about schooling as an emancipatory process. After 1990, the literature was extended with a variety of representative primary sources such as policy documents, constitutions, public statements, press releases of the various political parties in South Africa, movements and educational organisations and their policy with regards to policy issues as well as official announcements by members of committees of the various organisations.

A methodological tool derived from critical theory was applied in this thesis since it provided a form of meta-critique with an emancipatory rather than manipulative interest in criticism. Critical theory hence became a method of rational valuing and a powerful tool of internal and external criticism with the potential for use in practical as well as theoretical research. It thus becomes of value not only to a policy-maker but to a researcher or classroom practitioner as well.

With regards to South Africa's present status, critical theory offers us a clear, less distorted picture of how things are and at least suggests through transcendence of the existent, the possibility of how things may be different.
This thesis aims to examine the role played by the Reconstruction and Development Policy in South Africa's education system. It questions the viability of implementing the policies as set out in the policy documents, which the African National Congress claim to be derived from critical theory. It was impossible in the thesis to give a rendition of events during the period under discussion. The focus was on the reconstruction of the central and decisive events that have had implications for present educational policy and development. Although unique events formed part of the historical pattern and progression, continuity was sought throughout in the sense of looking for core themes and events. Such an approach offered an opportunity for a total vision on the progression of education.

I left South Africa at the end of 1993 to pursue my post-graduate studies in Sydney, Australia. This was prior to the first democratic elections held in South Africa in April 1994. I returned to South Africa on a visit at the end of 1997. My four year absence from the country showed that despite some notable successes, the picture that emerged on my visit was of a South Africa making slow progress in light of formidable obstacles. Nelson Mandela's vision of an expanding economy and decent living conditions for all in the new South Africa is blighted by an acute shortage of technical skills. The shortages are a legacy of apartheid education under which Blacks were expected to perform only the lowest tasks in the economy, in order to keep them in a subversive position. While Black recruitment has been stepped up in business and industry, there has been no attempt to accommodate new cultures and attitudes, nor to address the racism inherent in so many workplaces.

On the education front, overcrowded classrooms, under-skilled teachers, lack of teaching material and the poor image of education as a passport to a bright future for Blacks remain huge obstacles. An action plan, stronger than that presented by the policy documents is needed for dramatic change in South Africa.
Introduction

"A crisis occurs, sometimes lasting for decades. This exceptional duration means that incurable structural contradictions have revealed themselves...and that, despite this, the political forces which are struggling to conserve and defend the existing structure itself are making every effort to cure them, within certain limits, and to overcome them." (Gramsci, 1971, p. 178).
How does one make sense of current African National Congress Education policy in the light of post-Soweto developments? Can the ANC, now in government, deliver an educational system that is really empowering to all citizens of South Africa, especially the previously oppressed Black majority? Does the *Policy Framework for Education and Training* reflect empowering policy? Is it the case that Critical Theory has informed the policy development process? With regards to methodological issues in social science research, does epistemological theory rather than social theory fail to locate the research/policy studies in their social and historical context?

Education has long been a political football in South Africa. In the hands of the Nationalists, education was the tool of oppression—the 'White' population group was brainwashed into believing that they were superior and privileged due to their 'heroic' past, while the social and economic inferiority of the Black people was entrenched by minimal instruction. On the other hand, education was the spark which ignited the massive Soweto Riots of 1976, marking the beginning of a violent revolution in South Africa when the Nationalist Government attempted to force Afrikaans as the medium of instruction in Black schools. In adopting the tactics of "liberation before education", education became a victim once again when the Black masses turned to the strategy of trying to make the schools un governable. The crisis in education was not limited to Blacks only but it spread to all population groups—White education was troubled by funding shortages, Indian and Coloured education by teachers' strikes, retrenchment and maladministration.

In this research, the term 'African' is used to cover the original populations of Southern Africa. The official name for it up to 1974 in South Africa was Bantu, and this was derived from the family of languages they spoke. The word 'Coloured' refers to the people of mixed race in South Africa, the descendants of the White settlers and their Indonesian slaves as well as the yellow skinned Hottentots, the latter being displaced by
the Dutch at the Cape. 'Indian' refers to the descendants of the Indians imported during the last century or so to work as indentured labourers in the sugar plantations of Natal. Africans, Coloureds and Indians make up the Black population, sometimes referred to as Non-Whites in South Africa. The term 'Black' is often used interchangeably with 'African' since the latter makes up the mass of the Black population in South Africa.

Background to the Problem

The original White settlers in South Africa were of Dutch origin; today they call themselves 'Afrikaner'. The other main group of settlers in South Africa were of British descent and they sometimes refer to themselves as Europeans. However, long before the arrival of the White man, the land that is now South Africa was peopled by Hottentots and Bushmen, whose ancestors inhabited most of sub-Saharan Africa. With the discovery of the Cape by the Portuguese in the 15th century, South Africa's strategic importance as the guardian of the Cape, the half-way house to the East, was established. By 1600, other countries, notably the English, French and Dutch, became interested in exploring the East Indies. The Dutch East India Company which used the Cape as a half-way house decided to encourage Dutch settlement of the Cape to service the Company's vessels. The first Dutch settler to arrive at the Cape in 1652 was Jan Van Riebeeck.

With the outbreak of the Napoleonic Wars in Europe, however, a British expeditionary force seized the Cape in 1795. By 1806, Britain had acquired the Cape as a piece of her new Empire to secure sea routes to India during the war. For the Dutch, who now called themselves Afrikaners, the arrival of the British meant a dramatic change to their lives. Britain, faced with the problem of coping with a foreign population, enforced a vigorous policy of anglicisation. By 1820, the British government granted funds for large scale emigration to the Cape. The arrival of the 1820 settlers marked the true beginnings of the English-speaking population of South Africa.
The Blacks or Africans who live in South Africa today were traditionally subsistence farmers whose ancestors are believed to be negroid tribes who inhabited the continent south of the Equator. It was with these tribes along the Great Fish River area in the Cape that both Boer (Afrikaner) and British fought in their attempt to secure the region. With the British depriving the Afrikaner of their political independence, the face-to-face contact with these Black tribes brought home to the Afrikaners the fact that they were no longer alone. In the event, during the Great Trek, the Afrikaners, in 1838, decided to migrate further north to escape the British and establish their own independent republics. By 1850, the Afrikaners established two independent republics, the South African Republic in the Transvaal and the Orange Free State.

In 1899, however, the Anglo-Boer War broke out when the Boers saw the presence of the British in neighbouring Natal a threat to their outnumbered forces, and this war, like the Great Trek, was of crucial importance in shaping modern South Africa. The Boers through the war were forced through overwhelming odds to become part of the British Empire and this led to the emergence of a strong Afrikaner nationalism which was a vital element for Boer survival since that survival meant the protection and promotion of the Afrikaans language. Eight years after the war, the South African Act, passed by Britain, established a Union in South Africa embracing the two former Boer Republics and the two British colonies. By this Act, South Africa became a self-governing dominion within the British Empire. For the next five decades, the upsurge of Afrikaner nationalism brought support for the National Party who advocated a policy of separating the races in South Africa to ensure the survival of the Afrikaner. This led to the most controversial period in South Africa's history where Africans were hived off into tribal homelands and deprived of South African citizenship. Blacks were condemned to a separate existence at every level of the political, economic, educational and social life.
Segregated Schooling

South African education up to the first democratic elections of 1994 was organised on a segregated basis. There were separate controlling authorities and separate primary and secondary schools for Whites, Blacks, Coloureds and Indians. One of the results of this segregation was a disparity in the standard of education in South Africa especially as far as Blacks were concerned. School attendance was compulsory for Whites but not for Africans. The schools of the latter were overcrowded and under-resourced. Unequal amounts of money were spent by the South African government on the education of children of the different racial groups. Christie (1992, p. 39) gave the following as the 1987 per capita amount spent on education: White R2508; Indian R1,908; Coloured R1,021; and African R476. The Africans who were in the weakest position had to also absorb educational costs such as textbooks for their children. Even the disparity between the pupil:teacher ratio was unequal. Christie (1992, p. 39), for 1987, shows the following ratio existing for teacher:pupil: White 1:16; Indian 1:21; Coloured 1:25; and African 1:41. Even when it came to the under-qualification of teachers in each race group, the South African Institute of Race Relations (1986, p. 139) gave the following figures for 1982-3: White 3%; Indian 17%; Coloured 59%; and African 77%.

These figures reinforce the views held by the Director of Education in 1903 (Transvaal Education Department, 1903, p. 62) when he asserted that "...the education of the Native is to be regulated and controlled...as that of an efficient worker...The tentative scheme...makes provision...in the first place for the combination of manual training with elementary instruction, and in the second, for the shaping of that elementary instruction so as to equip the Native for a more intelligent comprehension of any industrial work that is set before him".

This the National Party Government was able to achieve until the historic Soweto Riots of 1976 when African school children, subordinated to the priorities of an apartheid
system, protested over the enforced teaching of Afrikaans in African schools. This protest was described as the watershed period in South African history. The introductory extract from Gramsci aptly describes the occurrence of a crisis, in this case the educational crisis in South Africa, sparked by the Soweto Riots. The difference in per capita expenditure among the different population groups, the percentage of students by race of each age cohort at school, teacher-student ratio, teacher qualifications, attrition rates were used by the state to "legitimise certain forms of knowledge, ways of speaking and ways of relating to the world that capitalised on the type of familiarity and skills that only certain students received from their family backgrounds and class relations...Such knowledge functioning to confirm and legitimise their privileged positions in schools" (Aronowitz and Giroux, 1985).

The Crisis in Education

Rejection by the African students of the inferior state education system in South Africa had brought with it, in many instances, "an alienation from learning and education in general and a generation of students with little schooling and poor employment prospects" (Christie, 1992, p. 48).

The critical choice for the present African National Congress Government in South Africa is not so much to resolve the question of educational inequality but rather to create a political order that has legitimacy among the population at large which would make it possible to create democratic structures with the full informed participation of the people in everyday affairs. This view is shared by Gramsci (1971, p. 168) where he states that "force can be employed against enemies, but not against a part of one's own side which one wishes rapidly to assimilate, and whose goodwill and enthusiasm one needs".

In view of the crisis in education, characterised by the burning of schools by African pupils, protests from teachers and parents alike among all non-White groups, the
growing power of the Black Consciousness Movement and riots among the Black communities, "People's Education" emerged from the National Education Crisis Committee (NECC) as the creation of a critically important future for all South Africans. It was bound up with the concept of 'people's power' representing an important shift from political domination by a ruling class to community involvement in transforming the education system. The present Reconstruction and Development Program of the African National Congress, in particular that relating to education, emphasises a change from passive, rote learning styles to creative learning and problem-solving through the active participation and involvement of pupils in the learning process. "People's Education" "consists of a dedication towards bringing about a liberated education system in a democratic society" (Van der Heever, 1987, p. 5).

**Education and Liberation**

At the basis of the development of a culture of liberation in education, lies the philosophy of the pedagogy of liberation, best demonstrated in the works of the South American philosopher, Paulo Freire. The latter believed that "through a process of education, a critical and liberation dialogue must be carried on with the oppressed. Attempting to liberate the oppressed without their reflective participation in the act of liberation is to treat them as objects which must be saved from a burning building, it is to lead them into the populist pitfall and transform them into the masses which can be manipulated" (Van den Heever, 1987, p. 5).

Smangaliso Mkhatshaw summarised the popular appeal of Freire's work in his keynote address at the National Consultative Conference on the Crisis in Education, held at the Witwatersrand University in December 1985, where the movement associated with the slogan "People's Education' for People's Power" was launched. "From the inherent ambivalence of education, namely its capacity to bring about what is least determined in man, as well as to program and determine this, Paulo Freire derives what I think is his
fundamental thesis: that there is no neutral education. Education is either for
domestication or freedom. Although it is customarily conceived of as a conditioning
process, education can equally be an instrument of deconditioning. This is because
people are essentially capable of knowing what conditions them, capable of reflecting on
their own action and behaviour" (Mkatswana, 1985, p. 5).

Underlying Freire's work is a dialectical epistemology for interpreting the development
of human consciousness in its relation to reality. Prinsloo (1987) asserts that according
to the Freirean dialect people as subjects relate to the objective material world by way of a
dialectical process. Praxis, which is action and reflection, enables people to overcome
the duality of their existence and participate meaningfully in the unfolding of history,
which is the inevitable 'humanisation' of people. People 'live' (as opposed to animals
which 'exist') when they relate to their world in a critical way. To exist, is to be aware of
people as subjects, and to be aware of history and time. People participate in history
when they produce culture, that is when they critically reflect on and act upon the main
themes of their times and through the process of dialogue which is characteristic of their
critical consciousness. It is this critical consciousness or capacity for dialogue that
enables people to produce a culture and, thus, become subjects.

According to this view, education for domestication is associated with teaching
approaches that are based on the hierarchical model where teaching is equated to cultural
transmission, assuming a given body of knowledge and one where learners are viewed as
largely 'empty vessels'. In Freire's terms, the content of education is 'whether values or
empirical dimensions of reality' are 'lifeless and petrified', the learners are 'passive
receptacles'. The teacher 'makes deposits' which the students patiently receive. The
learner is 'an empty mind passively open to the reception of deposits of reality from the
world outside'. The effect of banking education is to serve the interests of the 'dominant
minority' by making the 'dominated majority' passive and adapted to the world which the oppressors control (Freire, 1972a, p. 17).

From Freire emerges the notion of 'education for liberation' or 'problem-posing' education (Freire, 1972a; 1972b). "Instead of the bank-clerk teacher, we now have the 'humanist', 'revolutionary educator'. Instead of the 'necrophilic' tendencies which treat people as objects and, thus, reify individual consciousness, 'problem-posing education sees people as conscious beings and consciousness as directed towards the world'. Liberating education consists in acts of cognition, not transfers of information. It is a learning situation in which the cognisable object (the contents of the learning activity), far from being the end of the cognitive act intermediates the cognitive actors-teachers on the one hand and students on the other" (Prinsloo, 1987, p. 363).

Through dialogue the teacher-of-the-students and the students-of-the-teacher cease to exist and a new term emerges: teacher-student with student-teachers. The teacher is no longer merely the one who teaches but one who is himself taught in dialogue with the students who, in turn, while being taught also teach. The students are now critical co-investigators in dialogue with the teacher. "The pedagogy of liberation is, therefore, aimed at creating a deepened consciousness of a particular situation which in turn leads men to apprehend the situation as an historical reality susceptible to transformation" (Van den Heever, 1987, p. 6).

This non-hierarchical approach of Freire which broadly coincides on a descriptive level with deschoolers like Illich (1974), economic reproduction theorists like Bowles and Gintis (1976), and more recently, Giroux (1979) of the USA, seems to have been used as a possible way out of the impasse that had been set up by the previous system of mass education in South Africa which served the interests of those adhering to the doctrine of Christian National or Calvinist Education. Freire's thoughts provide a beacon of sorts in
the attempts to construct alternatives in education. While his educational strategies foster individual growth, particularly amongst the poor, the dispossessed, the peasantry, the working class together with a revolutionary potential, there are limitations to what Paulo Freire's work had to offer people concerned with change in South Africa. As discussed above, the teacher-student dichotomy is dissolved through dialogue. What happens to the authority of the teacher in this context? Freire is ambivalent on this indicating that arguments based on authority are no longer valid so that in order for authority to function it must be on the side of freedom not against it (Freire, 1972a, p. 53). La Belle (1987) asserts that Freirean "consciousness-raising programs have had little visible success". He points to a conceptual split between consciousness-raising and popular education for structural change, showing that the latter is more concerned with constructing alternatives to existing structures, emphasising democracy and political contestation. Freirean programs are constrained, however, by an inability to transcend local issues and by reliance on intellectual leadership from outside the grouping. He believes that there has been a growing disenchantment with Freirean programs and quotes one study in Bolivia of twenty popular education programs that found "evidence of a positive impact on the ability of peasants to articulate opinions on repression, corruption, dependency and the like but no sense of strategies for contestations" (La Belle, 1987, p. 205). Freire on the other hand makes strong associations between the processes of literacy learning and the acquisition of critical consciousness.

This Present Thesis

"Peoples' Education" (for people's power) in South Africa threw up the promise of popular structures that both further undermines the legitimacy of the state structures and contributed to the construction of a new moral authority, a new hegemonic order that legitimated the values and politics of a coalition of groups and classes in opposition to the state. The upsurge of "People's Education" has provided a new opportunity to debate the realities, relevance, quality and style of education in South Africa for all its people.
Put simply, the first aspect of the research problem which this thesis seeks to address is that as South Africa moves towards a post-apartheid society, does the new education dispensation that has evolved under the African National Congress reflect aspects of the critical tradition which it is hoped would bring about emancipation and broader social and educational change? Put simply, the critical tradition interprets social life as created by individuals or groups concerned to reveal contradictions in the rationality or the justice of social action (Carr, 1986, p. 144). Freire in his theory of 'conscientisation' is concerned similarly with the self-realisation of the individual. The thesis is not concerned with how South Africans may improve their lot but with how South Africans empower themselves to play a meaningful role in determining policy and practice as outlined by the Reconstruction and Development Program.

I am concerned that those involved in the development of the new education dispensation in South Africa, construct an account of their work by referring to the iniquities of Bantu education on the one hand, and allude to a radical pedagogy on the other. In South Africa, the 'Paulo Freire' solution is the one being adopted by the African National Congress as a solution to the debilitating effects of a non-functional education system inherited from the Afrikaner National Party. Freire's notion of 'education for liberation' or 'problem-posing' education proposes an interactive and non-hierarchical approach to teaching. Freirean pedagogy does not deal directly with state schooling except in schematising its oppressive features. Its appeal lies largely in non-formal education in South Africa, however the issue of state schooling cannot be avoided. While the credibility of the schooling system in South Africa has been shaken over the last few years, it has by no means been destroyed. In South Africa, state education can be enabling by providing the potential source of skills needed and disabling as an instrument of domination, stratification and legitimisation. It is because of the enabling/disabling that the established schooling system is a site of contestation. If South Africa adopts the radical pedagogy of Paulo Freire with his proposal of 'education for liberation', it could
mean that the site of state education could be vacated and the struggle for equality in education relinquished. While Freire provides a politically meaningful approach to curriculum and pedagogy, no direction is provided at the level of specific educational practice.

This research places current educational policy in its historical context. The approach, while focussing on the critical tradition acclaimed by champions of the ANC and favoured in the curricula of South African Universities of the 1990s, takes a more eclectic view as it traces the origin of the unrest in both socio-political and educational policy and practice that produced the Soweto Uprisings of 1976 and led to the historic government of Nelson Mandela in 1994.

In establishing the impact of the critical tradition on South African policy development and to avoid the research being ahistorical, it is imperative that the contributions of the more traditional approaches to the education debate be studied. While the critical perspective may illuminate aspects of teaching and schooling in terms of political, valuative and ethical dimensions, I do not acclaim the critical tradition. It is hoped that through a study of the more traditional approaches, I am able to explore 'our fundamental options in life'. Such an enterprise does not imply an end to the more traditional approaches but may guard the researcher against trying to explore the issues in education by slavish recourse to the critical tradition.

The final concern in this thesis, arising as part of the problematic, relates to my present role as an educator in South Africa. For many years in the eighties and early nineties, the researcher's work in education was dominated by slogans like "People's Education", 'grassroots education', 'banking education' and 'community colleges' to name but a few. These appeared to be some cure for the problems South Africa was facing in education. The present educational policy in South Africa seems to me to have taken on an
ideological form rather than one of actual policy implementation. Present in the new reconstruction and development program of the African National Congress are underlying tensions between the statements on critical and creative thinking, active participation and democratic practices on the one hand and implied ideological pressures, educational controls and power issues on the other. Nevertheless, it must be acknowledged that South Africa's new policy, particularly with regards to education has provided a new opportunity to debate the realities, the relevance, the quality and style of education in South Africa for all its people. I am hopeful that despite the sloganeering and rejection of apartheid education, in particular that of schooling, there is a common appreciation by all South Africans of the fundamental importance of education and what it can contribute in a regenerated society.

I am no longer involved as an educator in South Africa even though in Australia I am still involved in teaching as a communicative exercise. As such in my current role, I still pursue an emancipatory interest. I have found that it was possible to take a more 'objective' stance, working from outside of South Africa as it offered me a clearer, less distorted picture of how things are and suggested the possibility of how things can be not only different but also better.

Relevance and Significance
The impact of the critical tradition on South African policy development which forms the basis of this thesis is of significance and relevance to research in the social sciences in general and to research in education in particular because of its contribution to theoretical discourse particularly in applying the aspects of the critical tradition to policy development. It also examines critically and holistically the social and educational phenomenon of present South African policy which could be of interest to other social scientists concerned to understand and theorise about South African policy development. Furthermore, the critique of present educational policies in the reconstruction and
development program has application for improving other aspects of schooling by highlighting organisational structures and communicative patterns with emancipatory potential.

Present discussions of inquiry in the social sciences seem to revolve around either quantitative or qualitative approaches. Quantitative orientations to policy emphasise the strategic interest of empirical methods as a source of objective facts while qualitative approaches have a practical interest in ethnographic research as a basis for clarifying meanings that need to be taken into account when formulating policy. Critical approaches to policy formulation are guided by participatory, consensual communication. Applying the characteristics of the critical perspective to an examination of policy also involves the possibility of an emancipatory approach. Such an inquiry could be beyond the implicit 'absolutism' of positivism and the 'relativism' of interpretivism.

Thus in Chapter 1, the Nature of Inquiry in the Social Sciences is explored to establish the complexity of any research involving reflective human subjects, both as individuals and as interactive societies and in Chapter 2 the justification for the selection of a particular methodology for this purpose is examined. Chapter 3 looks at the historical background to South African history and Chapter 4 examines the policy document of the African National Congress. Finally, Chapter 5 critiques the policy documents of the ANC using the framework of critical theory. For me, the reward is an enhanced understanding of the connections between research, policy and practice and of the communicative processes typically involved in each. Such an understanding is of value to a person such as myself who is engaged in work as an educator in philosophy and sociology of education at tertiary level. Furthermore, this kind of understanding tends to contribute to and encourage self-conscious reflection which is perhaps the first step towards improving communication patterns within the academic in a more educative direction.