Intercultural composition and the realisation of ancient and medieval music

Kim Elliott Cunio,
Master of Creative Arts

Presented in fulfilment of the Requirements for the degree Doctor of Creative Arts
College of Arts
University of Western Sydney
February 2008.
Abstract

This thesis argues that there is a methodology, or series of methodologies that make it possible to realise music from a number of cultures, and that realisation is itself part of the process of intercultural exploration and composition. This proposition relates specifically to a portfolio of work undertaken at the same time as this dissertation that ranges from realisation of ancient and medieval music to new composition. It will be argued that such music is intercultural in its essence, and that this music is ‘new music’.

The thesis comprises a body of creative work and an exegesis that contain five major parts. The first is a definition of intercultural activity and realisation where prominent examples of intercultural composition, music realisation and commentary are examined.

The second part is an examination of The Temple Project, certainly the most ambitious work presented in the accompanying portfolio. The thesis argues that The Temple Project has a place both in the genre of an artistic realisation of ancient music, as well as being part my own body of work as a composer.

The third section responds to The Sacred Fire, a realisation of the music of Hildegard of Bingen. The thesis argues that there is merit in undertaking a radical intercultural creative process with Hildegard’s music, which can include new composition. New composition and the realisation process will be examined.

The fourth is an investigation of two smaller works in the accompanying portfolio. Mandala for Dawn and Namu Amida Batsu are new compositions that respond to the teachings and music of particular traditions. The thesis proposes that new intercultural composition is not very different to the realisations presented earlier, and that they benefit greatly from detailed intercultural experience and understanding.
The final section of the exegesis examines my own life, my own larger body of work, my own accompanying process of cultural investigation and understanding, and the potential of such explorations. This section also defines the multiple roles that the realiser often undertakes, ranging from historian / musicologist, composer, producer, performer, and even audio engineer. The thesis concludes by identifying areas for further investigation.
Dedication

I dedicate this thesis and the music contained within to all the beings in this world, who nourish me simply by their presence. I hope that this thesis plays a part in our evolution towards an unlimited way of seeing ourselves, and being with this remarkable planet we live in. Om Shalom Salaam Amen Aman – Kim Cunio
Acknowledgements

This thesis has benefited from the help and generosity of many people. The are a number of people and organisations I wish to specially thank. Firstly all the partners who enabled the creative projects to flourish.

For the *Temple Project* they include The Melbourne International Arts Festival, The Jewish Museum of Australia and the Gandel Foundation for commissioning, and performance. The Australia Council for a grant towards the writing and recording the project, and Moshe Frumin for lending his collection of replica instruments originally commissioned by the Haifa Museum. ABC Television Sunday Arts, ABC Classic FM and ABC Radio National for recording and broadcasting live performances of *The Temple Project*. All the members of the Australian Baghdadi Jewish community for supporting this research, as well Margaret Kartomi, and the Archive of Jewish Music at Monash University, for sharing current research. The University of Western Sydney (UWS), for a grant towards the recording, and Michael Macken for recording the studio version. Finally and most importantly all the players, Heather Lee, Lew Kiek, Tunji Beier, Andy Rigby, and Anne Hildyard.

For the *Sacred Fire*, Heather Lee for such intense and meaningful collaboration. The Australia Council for a grant towards the research and recording of the project. Robert Patterson at ABC Classics for Executive Production and release of the disc. Stephen Grant, Dr Constant Mews and Dr Helen De Zubicaray for timely discussions and loans of facsimile editions and recent scores. All the players including Heather Lee, Cantillation, Paul Jarman, Llew Kiek, Tim Constable, Jamal Rekabi, Bronwyn Kirkpatrick, Tunji Beier and spoken artists Rebecca Frith, James Coates and Stephanie Dowrick.

For *Mandala for Dawn*, Dawn Griggs for being such an inspirational figure both in life and death, Roger Davidson and Ullamaija Kivimäka from the Foundation of Universal Sacred Music for commissioning and performing the work; Heather Lee, the Sangeet ensemble and choir, and Ash Dargan for the performance. For *Namu Amida Butsu* thanks to Bronwyn
Kirkpatrick for suggesting the piece, using it in her Masters of Shakuhachi recital, and for recording it.

Beyond the projects I wish to thank Professor Michael Atherton, my principal supervisor, for working with me over the last four years in such a compassionate and skilled manner. His work and nature speak for themselves. I also wish to thank staff at the UWS Music Department, Dr Bruce Crossman for his work with the Aurora Festival, and general support, Dr Diana Blom for making me so welcome, and all the other staff I have met over the past four years in both teaching and administrative positions. I thank my wife Heather Lee for having the courage to undertake her Doctorate at the same time as mine, and for being such an observer of life. My parents Hyacinth and Nissim have provided great encouragement and the One Spirit Seminary, the Brahma Kumaris and Stephanie Dowrick have helped provide a spiritual journey to mirror the journey of my intellect. Finally, I offer blessings and a tide of change to all those in the world who are denied the opportunity to learn and investigate their place in the world.
Declaration

The work presented in this thesis, in the musical scores and in the recordings is to the best of my knowledge and belief original. Though it contains music from existing cultures and composers this is a new collection of music. I hereby declare that I have not submitted this material in whole or part, for a degree at this or any other institution.

-------------------------
Kim Cunio
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents – Exegesis</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents – Appendix 1: CD recordings</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents – Appendix 2: Scores</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of abbreviations</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 1  Introduction  17

1.1 The exegesis  17

1.2 The research question  18

1.3 Selection of the Projects  19

1.4 Why intercultural realisation?  21

1.5 The participant – observer  21

1.6 Additional roles in the projects  23

## Chapter 2  Literature  25

2.1 Intercultural composition  25

2.2 Intercultural theory and composition  26

2.3 Intercultural realisation  30

2.4 Oral tradition and intercultural composition  33

2.5 A brief intercultural history  34

2.6 Case Study: Islamic Europe – an intercultural experiment  36

2.7 A survey of modern intercultural music  38

2.7.1 Pre World War 2  38

2.7.2 Post World War 2  41
Chapter 3  *The Temple Project – Music of the Second Jewish Temple*  
3.1 Introduction - The largest project of this thesis  
   3.1.1 Background  
3.2 Similar research and music  
   3.2.1 Literature  
   3.2.2 Recordings  
3.3 Suzanne Haïk –Vantoura  
   3.3.1 Chironomy  
   3.3.2 The Tiberian system of notation  
   3.3.3 Haïk -Vantoura’s realisation  
   3.3.4 Example 1: Exodus 15: 3-4  *The Song of the Red Sea*  
3.4 Jewish oral tradition  
   3.4.1 Sephardi, Mizrachi and Ashkenazi traditions  
3.5 The Babylonian tradition  
3.6 Babylonian / Baghdadian music  
3.7 Example 2: Baghdadian transcription. Exodus 6:26 – 7:113  

Chapter 4  *Analysis of The Temple Project*  
4.1 Comparative archaeology / iconography and oral transcription as the basis for a new realisation  
4.2 The intercultural composition process  
   4.2.1 Identification of texts for treatment  
   4.2.2 Transcription of oral tunes for selected texts  
   4.2.3 Embellishment Ornament, and counter-melody  
   4.2.4 The use of drone-based harmony  
4.3 Case Study 1  *Sh’má Yisrael*, Deuteronomy 6: 4-9  
   4.3.1 Sh’má Yisrael Score  
4.4 Instruments used in the realisation  
   4.4.1 Ancient Jewish instruments  
   4.4.2 Instruments of Moshe Frumin
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Example 3: Temple Harp realisation, Moshe Frumin 2004</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.4 Example 4: King David’s Harp realisation, Moshe Frumin 2004</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.5 Instruments of Harry Vatiliotis</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.46 Additional Near Eastern instruments</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Case Study 2 Ashir Shirim</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1 Ashir Shirim Score</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Performance / recordings of the project</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Evaluation of the realisation</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5 The Sacred Fire - Music of Hildegard Of Bingen</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction – a collaboration with soprano Heather Lee</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Similar projects</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Intercultural research as the basis for a new realisation</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 The intercultural composition process</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1 Artistic speculation in the preparation of modern scores</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2 Instruments and players in this realisation</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 New composition in the realisation</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1 The writing of new composition within pieces</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2 Example 5: Types of organum used in <em>O Ierusalem</em></td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3 Types of organum used in <em>O Ierusalem</em> Score</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3 The writing of new compositions</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Case Study 3: Dance of Ecstasy</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1 Dance of Ecstasy Score</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.2 The use of Near Eastern melisma</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.3 Rhythm and accompaniment</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 Case Study 4 Ordo Virtutum Prologue</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.1 Multiple realisations of a single text</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.2 Free and metrical time</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.7.3 Differing uses of harmony 101
5.8 Performance / recordings of the project 102
5.9 Evaluation of the realisation 102

Chapter 6  Mandala for Dawn – New composition and traditional texts 104
6.1 Introduction 104
6.2 The Foundation for Universal Sacred Music 104
6.3 The intercultural music festival 105
6.4 Featured texts / traditions 106
   6.4.1 Tibetan Buddhist Mantra for Green Tara 107
   6.4.2 Example 7: Choir setting of Green Tara Mantra in Mandala for Dawn.
   6.4.3 Benedictine antiphon: De Spritus Sancto 110
   6.4.4 Example 8: Opening of Hildegard Von Bingen’s De Spritus Sancto and its setting in Mandala for Dawn 111
   6.4.5 Hindu yogic mantra 111
   6.4.6 Example 9: Original tune and setting of Om asatoma sat gamaya 112

6.5 Composition language 113
   6.5.1 Moving from a small to a larger ensemble 113
   6.5.2 The use of drone-based harmony 114
   6.5.3 The composition of new material in this realisation 115
   6.5.4 The composition of new material: Score 116

6.6 The interaction between score-based and improvised playing 117
   6.6.1 Example 10: Interaction between Dideridu, sticks, horns and bass clarinet in Mandala for Dawn 117

6.7 Performance / recordings of the project 118
6.8 Evaluation of the composition 118

Chapter 7  Namu Amida Butsu - A solo piece for shakuhachi 120
7.1 Introduction 120
7.2 Honkyoku and new composition 121
7.3 New shakuhachi composition in Australia 123
    7.3.1 Example 11. Shakuhachi entry in Anne Boyd’s 125
        *Goldfish Through Summer Rain.*
    7.3.2 Example 12 Excerpts of Ross Edwards 126
        *Raft Song at Sunrise, shakuhachi solo*
7.4 Overview of *Namu Amida Butsu* 127
7.5 Example 13, Musical excerpts of *Namu Amida Butsu* 129
7.6 Scoring methods used 132
7.7 Performance / recordings of the project 132
7.8 Evaluation of the composition 132

Chapter 8  Conclusions 134
8.1 Introduction 134
8.2 What did I set out to do? 134
8.3 What did I achieve, and what did I learn from the process? 136
    8.3.1 Recording 138
    8.3.2 Performance 140
    8.3.3 Scoring 142
8.4 The development of my own work during this thesis 144
8.5 Further research 144
8.6 Intercultural music projects and ensembles 146
8.7 Conclusions 146

References 149

Appendices 163

Appendix 1: CD recordings 163
    1.1 *The Temple Project* studio recording, April 2006 163
1.2 *The Temple Project* live recording, The Melbourne Festival, October 2004
1.3 *The Temple Project* live recording, Eastside Arts, August 2006
1.4 *The Sacred Fire* studio recording, double CD, February 2006
1.5 *The Sacred Fire* live recording, The Art Gallery of New South Wales, December 2007
1.6 *Mandala for Dawn* live recording, The Kaufmann Centre, October 2006
1.7 *Namu Amida Butsu* live recording, Leura, May 2006
1.8 List of tracks referred to in the thesis

**Appendix 2: Scores**

2.1 *The Temple Project*, October 2004

Transliteration and translation of texts
‘T’kiah T’ruah Sh’varim’
‘Masada’
‘Halelulu Betziltzelay’
‘El Norah Alilah’
‘Z’imru Y’didim’
‘Sh’ma Yisrael’
‘The Priestly Blessing’
‘The Ten Commandments’
‘Ashir Shirim’
‘Halachma Anya’
‘B’fi Sh’arim’
2.2 The Sacred Fire, February 2006

Disc 1

’O Fragile One’
’The Sacred Fire’
’O Pastor Animarum’
’O Quam Mirabilis’
’O Vis Aeternitatis’
’Ordo Virtutum Medley’
’And it Came to Pass’
’O Ignis Spiritus’
’O Beatissime Ruperte’
’Caritas Abundat’

Disc 2

’Dance of Ecstasy’
’O Ierusalem aurea civitas’
’Who are These?’
’Partriachs, Prophets and Virtues’
’De Spiritu Sancto’
’Ordo Virtutum - Instrumental Prologue’
’The Soul’
’O Virridissima Virga’

Transliteration and translation of texts

2.3 Mandala for Dawn, April 2006

2.4 Namu Amida Butsu, July 2004
List of abbreviations

ABC    Australian Broadcasting Commission

BBC    British Broadcasting Corporation

AD     Anno Domini

CE     Common Era

BCE    Before Common Era

TPL    *The Temple Project* Live Recording

TPS    *The Temple Project* Studio Recording

TSF1   *The Sacred Fire* Disc 1

TSF2   *The Sacred Fire* Disc 2

MFD    *Mandala for Dawn*

NAB    *Namu Amida Butsu*

FUSM   Foundation for Universal Sacred Music

DCA    Doctor of Creative Arts

UWS    University of Western Sydney

LP     Long Playing record.
CD  Compact Disc

DHM  Deutsche Harmonia Mundi

US  United States

UK  United Kingdom

#  Sharp

b  Flat

1/4  Quarter tone

.5  Quarter tone closest to a lower note

1.5  Quarter tone closest to an upper note
Chapter 1. Introduction

1.1 The exegesis

This exegesis presents my work as a composer and music researcher in a holistic context that examines composition from an intercultural perspective. The term ‘intercultural’ is used, as it provides a framework for someone like myself, who works and writes in the music of a number of cultures. Intercultural music is a theoretical frame for the production and analysis of a number of creative works contained in this thesis. Intercultural and cross-cultural are terms that are sometimes used to define the same creative process.

Intercultural methodologies were initially developed in the US in the 1970s in response to an increasing movement of people and ideas in the world, and the impact of this on the peace movement, trade and culture. They were initially focussed on reducing cultural misunderstandings, something which modern writers express clearly.

The challenge is that even with all the good will in the world, miscommunication is likely to happen, especially when there are significant cultural differences between communicators. Miscommunication may lead to conflict, or aggravate conflict that already exists. We make --whether it is clear to us or not -- quite different meanings of the world, our places in it, and our relationships with others (LeBaron, 2003:1).

Writers such as Lonner and Berry, Field Methods in Cross Cultural research, Cushner and Brislin, Intercultural Interactions, and Richard Lewis, When Cultures Collide, drew on concepts from traditional disciplines such as anthropology, cultural studies, psychology and communication. By the 1990s intercultural methodologies had grown and were incorporated into international corporate culture.

It was inevitable that intercultural methodologies be used in the arts. A landmark work was Peter Brook’s 1989 production of The Mahabharata, the great Indian epic, which utilised an international cast and intercultural perspective to great effect. Heavily criticized in some Indian circles because of its international focus the production was seen as a landmark in
international art. (Marranca, 1991:13). It featured a cast from all parts of the world, and a new translation, that Marranca ranked alongside Salman Rushdie’s *The Satanic Verses* as a defining point in intercultural writing.

The music presented in the thesis is largely a series of realisations of early music, the first project being music of the ancient Jewish Second Temple period (to 70 CE)\(^1\) and the second that of the visionary medieval composer Hildegard Of Bingen\(^2\) (1098-1179). It is argued that these realisations are not arrangements (as they are commonly understood) but new compositions within the parameters of each project’s style. The parameters are defined through intercultural investigation, a process which links intercultural practice to the act of music realisation.

The third collection is new music that is written within an intercultural process: distilling the experiences of realising early music, and seeing what results arise in new composition.

The exegesis is both a companion to the presented music, and a critical reflection that is at the heart of the composition process.

### 1.2 The research question

This thesis relates to the treatment of music. What is best practice for the investigation of intercultural and early music? What tools are available to a composer undertaking projects in these fields? What multi-disciplinary approaches are necessary to employ a sophisticated and relevant methodology? If these are the tools of intercultural investigation and composition, then how can they be employed, and further, how have they been employed by myself and composer / practitioners in Australia and overseas? The thesis argues that the answer to this problem is in a process of intercultural realisation.

---

\(^1\) CE is an abbreviation for Common Era, a system of measuring time that replaced AD (*Anno Domini*) in non Christian and academic circles. Both time lines start from the conception of the historical Jesus.

\(^2\) Hildegard is referred to as Hildegard Von Bingen, Hildegard Of Bingen, and Hildegard of Bingen. In this thesis she is referred to as Hildegard of Bingen.
In order to respond to these questions it is necessary to set a context for the investigation. The nature of intercultural composition will be discussed, what it means in a musical sense, and its evolution to date. The realisation process will be defined and investigated, and the distinction between realisation and composition will be elaborated.

With a context established, each project of the dissertation will be explored in some detail, both in its relationship to other works, and within broader intercultural arts practice. This will include an analysis of texts and scores, instruments, temperament, scale and intonation - all features of the realisation process. Finally, conclusions will be drawn both for the growing field of intercultural music, and my own work. The thesis concludes by mirroring my own journey as a composer and person to this process.

1.3 Selection of the Projects

The projects in this exegesis are a snapshot of my working life, and offer a view of realisation/composition in intercultural music practice. During the process of candidature I had a number of projects to choose from and settled on works from three main areas of intercultural practice.

The first area is in the treatment of music for which there is no firm record. The Temple Project (2004-6) is typical of this genre. This work speculates on the sounds of the second Jewish Temple around the time of the historical Jesus, as the Temple was destroyed in 70 CE. This project involved historical investigation, direct cultural experience, textual and musical research, collaboration with luthiers, composition, recording and performance.

A second area of intercultural practice is in dealing with existing music, and reinvestigating it from an intercultural perspective. The project that represents this is The Sacred Fire (2005-7), music of Hildegard of Bingen, which combines scholarship as well as medieval and Near Eastern composition practices. New compositions were also written to respond to the music of Hildegard.
The final area is one that often receives the greatest exposure - new composition from an intercultural perspective, where the composer investigates a number of cultures in the writing of a new work. Two pieces have been selected for this exegesis. *Mandala for Dawn* \(^3\) (2006), is scored for chamber orchestra and soloists from a range of cultural backgrounds. While *Mandala for Dawn* has a direct textual link to a number of traditions, the second work selected, *Namu Amida Butsu* \(^4\) (2004), is a new piece written for the Japanese shakuhachi in response to the tradition of *honkyoku*.

The choice of projects to feature in this dissertation was not easy, as other works also competed for inclusion. These included *Tomorrow’s Islam* (2004)\(^5\), a commission for the ABC on progressive Islam, *Ishq*, \(^6\) (2007), a commission for the Art Gallery of New South Wales to accompany the Arts of Islam exhibition from the Khalili collection, and *The Thread of Life* \(^7\) (2006), an intercultural project undertaken in New York, which involved the formation of an international intercultural ensemble for performance and recording.

---

\(^3\) *Mandala for Dawn*, commissioned by the Foundation for Universal Sacred Music, draws on Australian Aboriginal culture with didjeridu and sticks scored, Tibetan Buddhist culture with the setting of the *Green Tara* Mantra, South Indian culture with the setting of the *Om Asatoma* mantra, and European culture with a small realisation excerpt from *De Spiritus Sancto* by Hildegard Of Bingen. In addition to this it explores the use of extended drone based harmonic structure, common in intercultural practice.

\(^4\) *Honkyoku* is at the heart of shakuhachi repertoire, and is both a technical and spiritual practice, as Japanese Zen points out. Originally played by monks from the Fuke sect of Zen, it is now a valid and traceable lineage of both composition and instrumental technique in Japan and around the world. www.shakuhachi.org/honkyoku.html Accessed on retrieval 18 November, 2007.

\(^5\) *Tomorrow’s Islam* was commissioned by the ABC as music for a two part documentary series, recording, and broadcast on ABC Classic FM. It was also performed at the Melbourne International Arts Festival in 2004.

\(^6\) *Ishq* has two forms. Initially it was a series of compositions that responded to selections from Khalili collection of Islamic art, the second is as a stand alone CD that explores a pan Islamic lineage.

\(^7\) *The Thread of Life*, was also commissioned by the Foundation for Universal Sacred Music, and involved collaboration with the Sultana Ensemble, an Arabic Jewish ensemble, as well as Nicholas Ng, a composer and Erhu player from Australia. The material was selected from Jewish, Christian, Islamic Hindu and Buddhist cultures.
While all of these works are intercultural they did not demonstrate a progression from realisation to new composition that was important to the preparation of this thesis.

1.4 Why intercultural realisation?

Intercultural is a way to describe music that contains attributes of more than one culture, or when the composer is from more than one culture, or when the players are from different cultures (Kimberlin and Euba, 1995: 2-5). All of these processes are engaged in this thesis.

Realisation is a process that can be undertaken to an existing composition for either in performance or recording. Realisation is also a way to describe a process of recomposing around traditional texts and melodies with a historical and ethnomusicological perspective embedded in the music. A realisation starts with the premise that it is not possible to directly reconstruct the music of a particular period or time, and instead employs an artistic process of recreation. Such processes have been increasingly common in early Western music. The combination of intercultural immersion and realisation is a valid and permeable framework to investigate music from folk and traditional cultures, Non Western classical traditions and early Western music. It is applicable to much new music of the 21st Century.

(The Realisation) is the final result of the composing process and takes the form of a performable score, a live performance, a recording to be presented in public, a recording for private audition, or a new not yet experienced music activity (Englert, 1993: 1).

1.5 The participant – observer

The research methodology of participant observation, often credited to Bronislaw Malinowski (1884-1942) is regularly applied in intercultural realisation. Malinowski was a British social anthropologist studying peoples of the Trobriand Island in the Indian Ocean early in 1914, when the First World War stopped him returning to Europe for 3 years. He described the change this extended stay brought about:
I ceased to be a disturbing element in the tribal life I was to study, altering it by my very approach, as always happens with a newcomer to every savage community. In fact, as they knew that I would thrust my nose into everything, even where a well mannered native would not dream of intruding, they finished by regarding me as a part and parcel of their life (Bernard, 1994: 320).

In 1962 Morris Zelditch outlined an empirical approach that could provide in depth systematic study, usually over a longer period of time with a process of cultural identification. This set a series of benchmarks that are still followed today in qualitative and action research by anthropologists, psychologists and other disciplines (Zleditch, 1962: 566-576).

Objectivity is always a key consideration in this method, and writers in this field are careful not to appropriate an objective position. Gregory Barz writes in *Shadows in the Field* that the participant observer should define their own reflexive self image or shadow when joining an external musical culture. Field work is a key part of this process as it is an experience that can be drawn upon in a later period of reflection (Barz, 1997:3-4).

Participant observation directly relates to the process of intercultural research. The thesis argues that it is desirable to be directly involved in the making of music to be explored. This may be through a process of field work, cultural exchange or research partnership. In other words there is best practice for an intercultural composer, which is to combine direct experience with critical reflection. This exegesis argues that it is not as responsible to use a transcription and ‘arrange’ it in an ‘intercultural manner’, or to hastily make a transcription without a cultural connection to the music.  

If there is to be such a connection it must be as a participant, though the participant must also display the skills necessary to record the event. These skills are fairly standard in both anthropology and musicology, the difference is that the intercultural practitioner is an

---

8 This role was discovered from being brought up with the Baghdadi and Sephardic Jews. As soon as I made a decision to take this music into the concert hall, arrangement and the changing of traditional structures was required, the role of ‘observer’ had to be followed. Figures such as Dr Florian Messner have explored this in Australia. Messner is a trained anthropologist working as a musician who has been involved in many intercultural projects.
active participant at all times, and that the result of the process is both an artistic creation and a research document.

The advantage of being a participant - observer is the ability to embody complex contradictions that may be unexplainable without direct experience. It helps the intercultural practitioner not to judge the music or culture of others, and can be an important tool in dealing with concepts of otherness that can arise during intercultural practice. It also helps to explain music culture from the perspective of the primary participants. (Pt Vyas, Vale 2004: 1).

The observer will always have a process of discriminating thought, and the participant will always have an internal process to describe.

1.6 Additional roles in the projects

Roles utilised in the projects were musicologist, arranger, artistic director, producer, recording engineer, and production manager. It is important to acknowledge that the intercultural composer or musician will take on some or all of these during project-based research, and Chapter 8 addresses the pressures that these additional roles place on the intercultural composer.

The nature of intercultural work is that the composer must learn new skills. The first skill is the ability to play with the members of another culture as an equal. This requires finding an instrumental or vocal technique that can be suitable, as well as a thorough knowledge of the musical tradition being investigated.

---

9 PT abbreviation for Pandit originally described a man who had mastery over the Vedas and Hindu scripture, and is now taken as a form of great respect to the older generation of Indian music masters, as well as masters in many other fields.
The role of musicologist is perhaps most obvious apart from the role of composer. It requires the ability to process and contextualise individual experiences. Further it involves transcription, analysis, documentation and the interpretation of current scholarship.

The work of academics such as Joachim Braun, Alfred Edersheim, Magaret Kartomi, Sarah Menasseh, Tang Yating, and Regina Randhofer is relevant to *The Temple Project*. They have researched instrumental and oral traditions in Jewish diaspora music, increasingly utilising comparative analysis.

The investigative work of the Sequentia ensemble, Christopher Page, Constant Mews, Pozzi Escott and Helen de Zubicaray have contributed to the realisation of *The Sacred Fire*, both regarding the interpretation of scores and the recording of new realisations of the music.

Taking on the roles of producer and recording engineer have been more recent developments. They relate initially to intercultural documentation facilitated by organisations such as UNESCO, The Smithsonian Institute, and record labels such as Celestial Harmonies. Working with traditional musicians requires a flexible production philosophy, doing the best to achieve a studio quality recording with Western Classical production values in remote locations. Recent technological advances have helped this process (Rahn, 2004).

Finally, the intercultural composer has to exist in a world, which is increasingly a marketplace of ideas. Intercultural music needs to be advocated for and to find its place in the stage of music.

---

10 Eckhart Rahn Executive Producer at Celestial Harmonies addressed the 2004 SIMS (Symposium of the International Musicological Society) conference in Melbourne on this subject and the role of the Celestial Harmonies record label in the preservation of music.
Chapter 2. Literature

2.1 Intercultural composition

Intercultural composition contains the idiom of which this exegesis is concerned. It is a deliberate usage that relates not only to what it defines, but also to certain practices that take place in the creation of music.

Interculturalism, within which intercultural compositions can be located, is multi-disciplinary, including criticism, artistic practice and social politics. A definition is therefore broad, for intercultural as a term refers to a series of artistic phenomena, as well as a way of understanding these phenomena. Bonnie Marranca writes in *Interculturalism and Performance*:

> What is “interculturalism”? The writings that cluster around the world of this word alternately address theory, technique, politics, aesthetics, theatrical production, critical writing. Interculturalism is linked to world view practice, and theory/criticism that is, the mental attitude that precedes performance, the performance process, and the theoretical writing that accompanies performance. A fairly recent addition to theatrical vocabulary, interculturalism, then, is a state of mind, as much as a way of working. (Marranca, 1991: 9).

Intercultural composition has both intercultural and artistic processes that lead to new music. During the last fifteen years (the period of recent intercultural investigation) daily life has changed significantly. In the economically prosperous world it is common to talk to someone in a call centre in Asia who works in a room where the clocks are set to the host country, creating an intercultural enclave wholly designed to facilitate an illusion of oneness (Moses, 2004: 3). The internet makes it possible for people in any part of the world with access to a computer and phone connection to communicate by text, phone, and even video in real time.

Music is routinely made across the world by utilizing modern communications. The commercial arm of the music industry is always looking for that ‘new sound’, and often
that new sound is old or traditional music dressed up in an exotic garb. The change is staggering, and it is naive to think that music practice has not changed with it.

Intercultural composition is a longstanding phenomenon, as musicians have always travelled. Ancient music has strong intercultural connections, which are investigated, in *The Temple Project* (Chapters 3 and 4). The same is true for some Christian music forms of the medieval period, particularly the Mozarabic music of medieval Spain which combined European and Near Eastern music and textual practices (2.6). Chapter 5, which investigates *The Sacred Fire* introduces the possibility of infusing culturally specific medieval music (that of Hildegard of Bingen), with instruments and scales of medieval Iran, Turkey and India.

### 2.2 Intercultural theory and composition

Intercultural music has an inbuilt potential for transcendence. It is this search for meaning that is at the heart of intercultural composition. In Australia intercultural music started in the 1970s in classical, jazz and folk idioms, and it signaled a major change in performance practice. Australian composers and players had been interested in the music of their region and the larger world for some time, but they did not generally experience it firsthand.

During the 1960s and 1970s composers tended to derive their knowledge of other musical systems sounds and instruments from recordings and books. Some took tertiary ethnomusicology courses. Few traveled to experience the origins of their cultural borrowings. In the last two decades interest in playing music of Asia, Africa, and Eastern Europe has increased. Some musicians have studied overseas, and there has tended to be deeper understanding and respect for other musical cultures, especially those of Australia’s neighbours (Atherton, 2003: 56).

While there are a number of ways to define intercultural composition a starting point is the work of Tse Kimberlin and Aiken Euba.

Intercultural music is that in which elements from two or more cultures are integrated. The composer of this music usually belongs to one of the cultures from which the elements are derived, but this does not necessarily have to be the case.
Indeed, this type of intercultural activity is thematic, being inherent in the music itself and, therefore, the origin of the composer is irrelevant to the definition (Kimberlin and Euba, 1995: 2-5).

There is an inherent assumption of modernity, even post modernity in this statement. It implies that we live in a world where it is possible for cultures that were once separated to have a meeting point not only in music practice but across all the arts, and even into broader cultural exchanges. Much critical writing has also come from this phenomenon, which defines it as globalisation, part of an economic and social system that marginalises many people in the developing world. This has been well documented in the social sciences.

Writers from the East and Near East point out that globalisation is systemic and not isolated to any one dominant culture. Muqtedar Khan describes this as glocalization: A war between modernity and post modernity; sovereignty and anarchy; reason and destruction in which art has a vital role to play.

We live in a strange world. We are at the peak of scientific achievements; the Genome project has been completed, we are on the verge of cloning human beings, simulations and artificial intelligence are paying dividends and yet the Taliban's and Hindutvavadis in the East and Jerry Springers and Jerry Falwells in the West enjoy supporters in millions (Khan 2004: 3).

Interculturality will always have a political dimension, at least partly because of the nature of power in the world. Edward Said’s landmark work Orientalism changed the nature of East/West discourse, and his definition of the ‘oriental’ and its implicit notion of the ‘other’ must be understood by the modern intercultural composer.

Said argued that the West defines itself by the other, its mythological opposite, which is often the ‘oriental’, a people, a place and a music that is invented to fit a model of who the West would like to be. This premise also fits with theories of binary opposition 11 in

11 ‘A binary opposition is a pair of opposites, thought by the Structuralists (such as Roland Barthes) to powerfully form and organize human thought and culture…Many such oppositions imply or are used in such a way that privileges one of the terms of the
Western post-enlightenment thinking. Said argued that this takes place in all forms of culture, and indeed it is apparent in music. Examples of otherness abound in operas that are still routinely performed today. Notable works include Handel’s *Rinaldo*, almost shocking for its portrayal of Islamic culture, and Mozart’s *Idomeneo*, which defines Islamic protagonists as either wicked or exotic. These phenomena continue into the 20th Century with the fictitious oriental soundworld of Hollywood movies, the portrayal of the East in popular culture, and in the marketing of conceptual world music brands.  

Said wrote:

Orientalism is a style of thought based upon ontological and epistemological distinction made between "the Orient" and (most of the time) "the Occident"…

The Orient is not only adjacent to Europe; it is also the place of Europe's greatest and richest and oldest colonies, the source of its civilizations and languages, its cultural contestant, and one of its deepest and most recurring images of the Other. In addition, the Orient has helped to define Europe (or the West) as its contrasting image, idea, personality, experience (Said, 1979: 1-5).

In music there are two possible ways to deal with this notion of otherness. One is a non-political, universal response where great themes are played out for all of humanity. This notion is synonymous with high art, and the canon of great work in all cultures is testament to this aspiration. We hold certain works above their initial cultural significance due to their broadly perceived artistic merit. The *Moonlight Sonata* No. 14 for piano, by Beethoven, is known well beyond its initial cultural significance as a single solo piano sonata in a large body of work for solo instruments, chamber ensembles and orchestra. The popular name of ‘Moonlight’ was not used until 31 years after the composition of the work, which is now held as a pinnacle of achievement in Western Classical music.

opposition, creating a hierarchy. This can be seen in English with white and black, where black is used as a sign of darkness, danger, evil, etc., and white as purity, goodness, and so on.  


12 This can be seen in many soundtracks and recordings of world music. An Armenian *duduk* is played to represent the exotic suffering of combatants in the film *Gladiator*, The *Ullian* pipe is used to portray folk based innocence in soundtracks from *The Lord of The Rings* to *Titanic*, and concept based world music albums include compilation series that combine disparate genres into one collection or motif, such as the best selling *Buddha Bar* series that combines dance, groove, world music themes with Buddhist inspired music.
The second way to deal with otherness is to embed the socio-politics in the music, insisting that the artistic process flourish freely. Notions of belonging are crucial to this type of music making. Music is linked both to the culture of origin and the culture of investigation, and it is judged on artistic not political grounds.

The West-Eastern Divan Workshop and Orchestra of Daniel Barenboim and Edward Said (discussed later in this chapter), is a prominent example of this response to otherness. Though music is the purpose and outcome of the collaboration, politics are never ignored.

These two responses can even be combined. Le Nozze di Figaro is considered a great opera not merely because of its social comment regarding the breakdown in class relations in 18th Century Europe, the situation from which its plot is derived, and from which Mozart derived a great deal of inspiration. It is seen as such also because of the quality of its music. Le Nozze di Figaro takes us beyond time and place, while also offering the opportunity for us to reconnect with its original historical role as a witty and sophisticated act of social commentary.

It has been argued by Martin Baumann that it is possible to work creatively and artistically with a knowledge of the underlying contradictions that are apparent in intercultural exchange:

A dialogue that takes place within the dynamic of intercultural encounter and that principally recognises the Other in his/her Otherness, without overemphasising or suppressing the Own (Baumann, 2000: 1).

One example is the cultural immersion of a Western artist such as Adrian McNeil into the playing of the Hindustani sarod. He is widely respected both in India and Australia, playing with leading players in both countries. His commitment to Indian culture goes far beyond the music he plays, yet he is judged on the quality of his playing and his scholarship, not on his integration within Indian culture.

Another example is the scored compositions of Dr L Subramaniam, the Carnatic violinist. Brought up in Carnatic - music he encountered Jascha Heifietz at a young age, which led to
his fascination with, and eventual mastery of Western composition processes (Subramaniam, 2004: 5).

Interculturality allows us to navigate and make sense of the great cultural pilgrimages that now take place. Kimberlin and Euba argue that there are two broad types of intercultural music: one that arises from place, belonging and culture, and another that is a process of artistic meeting between people from different cultures.

There is another type of intercultural creative activity in which the origin of the composer is the determining factor. A composer writing in an idiom acquired from a culture other than his or her own is involved in an intercultural activity, even though the music that he or she produces is not necessarily intercultural. For example, when an African composer writes a fugue in the style of Bach, in which he or she makes no use of African resources, intercultural activity takes place but the music itself is not intercultural (Kimberlin and Euba, 1995: 2-5).

2.3 Intercultural realisation

Intercultural realisation is intercultural composition. Though a realisation traditionally refers to the methods in which a composition is rendered, it is also a legitimate process in itself; that is a realisation follows a stage of conceptual framing. After this framing is completed it is the role of the realisation to bring the artistic vision into practice (Englert, 1993:1). The projects undertaken and described here follow a concept of intercultural exploration, and it is therefore not surprising that the realisations are also inherently intercultural.

Paradoxically it is possible to define a realisation by that which it is not. A realisation makes no claim to be an authentic single edition of a work. It has an inherent assumption of multiplicity - that it is possible to make music in many different ways, for if the musical concept changes, the realisation will also change.
This thesis contains realisations of oral traditional music (project 1), and early Western music, (project 2), which constitute two of the four projects of this exegesis. Realisation is a conceptual framework that radically shifts the authenticity debate. A realisation is clearly not authentic, in the manner of being a single absolute edition of a piece of music, no matter how impressive the scholarship. Indeed it is argued that the same level of scholastic integrity is required for a realisation as an ‘authentic’ version of a piece, for every artistic decision is potentially a research decision. Realisations are pieces of art and should be judged on artistic, intercultural and production values.

There is an essential difference between a realisation and an arrangement. An arrangement is generally an intellectual and artistic process of working within an established piece of music, where a realisation is a process of recreating that work. The realisation therefore has far greater scope for new composition than the arrangement, and offers the protagonist a process of cultural immersion in the conceptual phase (the participant observer) before the process of composition. 13

This methodology is well suited for early Western music. Early music requires an imaginative process due to the limited nature of its scoring. Until the 13th Century most neumatic scores had no indication of duration and the neumes were open to a number of interpretations (Nagley, 1985: 96). There is little mention of tempo and emphasis until the pre-Baroque, and no mention of instrumental or vocal tone, technical style or ornamentation until the Baroque. A realisation recreates all of these missing parameters within a framework of informed knowledge, or to be candid, informed speculation.

One of the most exciting parts of the realisation process is the writing of new music. It is common for the realising composer to become immersed in the syntax of the music they are working with. The realisation can contain all the aspects of arrangement within its process, but an arrangement is no longer an arrangement when it contains a substantive amount of new material. The arrangement is usually written for new instruments or voices, or includes a transcription of a work, where the realisation has a new conceptual understanding of the work. For example a process of finishing the score to Schubert’s Unfinished Symphony is more than an arrangement it requires composition within a recreated sound, the sound-world of Schubert.

---

13 A realisation can contain all the aspects of arrangement within its process, but an arrangement is no longer an arrangement when it contains a substantive amount of new material. The arrangement is usually written for new instruments or voices, or includes a transcription of a work, where the realisation has a new conceptual understanding of the work. For example a process of finishing the score to Schubert’s Unfinished Symphony is more than an arrangement it requires composition within a recreated sound, the sound-world of Schubert.
working with. Immersion does not parody, rather it explores aspects of the music for which there is no record. What is important is that a conceptual investigation takes place. An example of this process can be shown with the music of Hildegard of Bingen. Though Hildegard wrote over 70 compositions, there are no instrumental scores in any of her collections, and no instrumental parts in her vocal works (Hildegard, Dendermonde, Riesenkodex). 14 A quick conceptual investigation is revealing.

A purely ‘authentic’ project would have to perform without instruments or certainly have no purely instrumental pieces, as there is no direct evidence of instruments. However, the lack of instrumental parts does not necessarily mean that instrumental pieces were not played, or that instruments never played with the voice. They may have been played but may not have been deemed worthy of scoring by Hildegard’s scribes or by herself. They may have been played and omitted from the final score for fear of the political ramifications of taking too many liberties with a music descended from the Cantus Firmus (fixed part of Gregorian chant). They may have been rejected from the scores because instruments were not seen as capable of mirroring the manifestation of God through mode and melisma, and they may have been left out simply because of convention (Nagley, 1985: 90). Instruments may not have been played simply because the composer had no access to them.

Alternately, instrumental pieces may have been adapted in real time from existing compositions, or they may have played drone tones, or vocal lines with embellishment and improvisation. The point is that we do not know, and as such a realisation becomes worthy of consideration. Any of these parameters offer a possible instrumental realisation, and this route has been chosen by a number of medieval ensembles such as Sequentia. 15

14 Hildegard Of Bingen, Symphonia armoniae celestium revelationum, Dendermonde, Riesenkodex manuscripts.


15 Sequentia is widely seen as the leading specialist Hildegard of Bingen ensemble. Founded in 1977 by Benjamin Bagby and Barbara Thornton, the ensemble provides a
2.4 **Oral tradition and intercultural composition**

Oral tradition is crucial to any investigation of intercultural music. Music is not static, nor has it ever been. The definition of writing music has changed so dramatically in the last 100 years that it is now possible for music to be both oral and written. The recording of music offers a potentially perfect copy of a performance that can then be transcribed or learnt orally, making it a meeting place between oral and written forms. It can be argued that notation as we historically understand it, is now only one of a number of processes to preserve and record music (Reid, 2007: 2).

The computer has revolutionised oral music. Innovations such as the Music Instrument Digital Interface (MIDI), and wave file composition (whereby the composition takes place after the recording of the individual parts), have replaced traditional scoring for many composers. In addition to this we now extend the term composition and composer well beyond the historical Western definition of a composer. The composer of a work does not necessarily have to know the craft of notation, nor be able to perform a work the same way twice. Reid states that a written score can range from a chord chart to a Pro Tools file. (Reid, 2007:1-2).

It is a given that most of the traditional music of the world is oral. In many cases oral music has survived far longer than its written counterpart. Earlier assumptions of the vagaries of oral tradition are being increasingly questioned. This applies to the music of this thesis, particularly in relation to the Baghdadi Jewish migratory chant that *The Temple Project* is concerned with (Kartomi, McCredie, 2004: 4). Baghdadi Jewish orality has survived largely unchanged for the last two thousand years but there is no one authentic way in which to realise music in *The Temple Project*, due to the multiplicity of cultures involved (Cunio, 2004: 1-15).

mixture of scholasticism and innovation, writing a number of new realisations as well as adding instrumental textures.
Technology is changing how we perceive music tradition. It is no longer necessary to write a definitive score when working in intercultural music. Indeed when notating and working with traditional music full scoring can be a burden, making future renditions unnecessarily complex or rigid in nature. The journal *Recent Researches in the Oral Traditions of Music* defines this point of change:

> Recent Researches in the Oral Traditions of Music encourages scholars to rethink the critical edition as a crucial component in the current rapprochement between ethnomusicology, historical musicology, and cultural studies. As new media make it possible to experience musics from throughout the world, as oral traditions have become essential to the globalization of local musical practices, and as popular musics give postmodern meaning to historical diasporas, so too does Recent Researches in the Oral Traditions of Music invite music scholars to conceive of editions that will contribute fundamentally to some of the most critical debates of our day (Bohlman, 2005:1).

### 2.5 A brief intercultural history

It is telling to note that intercultural music thrives when cultural tolerance thrives. It is difficult to share music when there is war, which is not to presume that music stops during crisis, but rather that its role changes. Instead of providing a detailed history of intercultural practice (something for further research), a few historical snapshots are provided which relate directly to the projects of this exegesis. A case study of medieval Islamic Spain is explored in more depth, as it is an intercultural period of immense interest.

The first intercultural collaborations were directly related to the balance of power in the world, and the migration and travelling of people for either war or commerce. Comparative archaeology has found great similarities between the instruments of many cultures of the ancient Near East suggesting that there was a sophisticated exchange of musical ideas and knowledge between a number of musically advanced cultures.

The work of Joachim Braun has helped a generation of researchers to discover an epistemology that is far greater than primary source material alone. He argues that it is possible to combine the study of primary texts, archaeological findings of musical
instruments, or depictions of them in actual objects or iconography, with other sources drawn from anthropology, sociology and linguistic study. In *Music in Ancient Israel / Palestine* he writes:

> The emergence of local musical culture involved a far broader spectrum of peoples than previously assumed, including the Cannanite, Judaic, Israelite, Phonecian, Phillistine, Samaritan, Nabatean, Idumic, and other groups who have never been mentioned in the history of the region’s music (Braun, 2002: xiii).

Braun writes specifically about the Bible as one of the greatest examples of misrepresentation in musical scholarship’s history, something that is pertinent to *The Temple Project*.

> Although this source was clearly of a mythological nature its theological significance elevated it to the status of a historical document this one sided focus prompted an attitude of fetishism with regard to what the Bible actually recounts about instruments, musical events, and music in the larger sense (Braun, 2002: 1).

Abraham Idelsohn, one of the fathers of modern musicology wrote at great length 100 years ago about the intercultural processes behind Jewish, Christian and Islamic music. He believed that all came from Near Eastern practice and had only diverged in the medieval period with the rise of European syntax, scale and temperament. Idelsohn argued that cross fertilisation has taken place particularly within the monotheistic religions until the present day, and his transcriptions of scale similarities are still valid (Idelsohn, 1967: 12-25).

There are written sources describing the adaptation of secular melodies from a number of cultures for the recitation of sacred texts. This has occurred in Spain, many Arabic countries and the Far East, and was prevalent well into the 20th Century. Scales and modes from these cultures have also been adapted including Turkish and Arabic *maqams*, which readers and cantors have certainly used since the 16th Century. This also includes Arabic Andalusian modes from Morrocco, and the *makam* and *maqams* from Syria to Egypt. (Seroussi 2003: 1-2).
While it is possible to look at many different cultural snapshots one has been chosen as it is symbolic of historical intercultural practice. It is medieval Al Andalus, and the great city of Cordoba.

2.6 Case Study: Islamic Europe – an intercultural experiment.

Perhaps the greatest single intercultural music experiment was in Al Andalus in what is now described as medieval Spain. The three monotheistic traditions coexisted from 750 until 1492 CE, the year that the New World was discovered. This period of tolerance and cultural exploration lasted nearly 500 years more than current modernism has existed in the West. This period and the music that it encompassed is a backdrop to the intercultural treatment of Hildegard Of Bingen in *The Sacred Fire*, the second project of this thesis.

In Cordoba and Iberia medieval culture had its most liberal flowering. While most of the Islamic and Christian world barely tolerated religious minorities, in Cordoba and Al-Andalus, something remarkable happened. The *dhimmi* (Jews and Christians), were seen by the Andalusian Muslims as protected peoples who came from the same great book. Jews especially gained self-determination and political power not seen since the destruction of the Second Temple a thousand years before. Jewish life was on a par with other Islamic strongholds such as Babylon and Alexandria, and the liveliest of cultural dialogues took place. Christians led a far richer life than they did in many Christian states (Cunio, 2007: 3-13).

A quick comparison can be telling. The historian Edward Gibbon used the numbers of library manuscripts as a way of defining 10th Century polity and culture. This was, and still is still one of the best measures for defining the success and openness of a culture. The literacy of a population is a benchmark of many other pursuits, including poetry and therefore music making and sharing. Gibbon described the largest Christian libraries in Europe as having some 400 volumes, whereas the Caliph’s Library in Cordoba, (by no means the principal seat of Islam, which was officially held in Baghdad), had an estimated 400,000 – 600,000 volumes, with forty-four volumes just for the catalogue. Furthermore there were 70 libraries in Cordoba, a capital that had room for 70 freelance copyists in its market. In a marvellous twist it was these libraries that would bring the treasured translations of the Greeks back to Europe (Menocal 2002: 33-34).
Much of this openness took place through Arabisation – an intercultural process that involved cultural study and representation. Christians Arabised themselves alongside the other minorities; the Mozarabs as they were called spoke and worshipped in Arabic, as well as writing many fine works of poetry in the Islamic style of the time. They even composed in Arabic. Poets composed in Arabic, Hebrew and Romance (pre Spanish) in the one poem. The songs of the troubadours were sung by Christians inspired by the huge body of Arabic song and poetry, ring songs and cycles, songs of unrequited love that transformed the worship of a beautiful woman into worship of the divine. This happened in Islamic, Christian and Jewish (Sephardic) culture (Gerber, 1992: 60-65).

Traders were accompanied by instruments borrowed and adapted from Islam, while they played music forms that were essentially Arabic. The people who travelled these routes were mostly Jewish. The 9th Century Book of Roads and Kingdoms describes the Jewish trade routes from Western Europe to Alexandria that moved from Christianity to Islam and back. These Jewish traders travelled and stayed with the local Jewish communities sharing their life in another culture and planting the seeds of cultural change (Gerber, 1992: 34-35).

Dialogue with Baghdad, the principal seat of Islam brought treasured Greek documents such as Dioscorides’ On Medicine to the libraries of Cordoba. In an act of religious cooperation a Christian Greek scholar was brought out from Constantinople by a Jewish negotiator who presided over the translation with him for the Muslim Caliph of Cordoba. (Menocal 2002: 89).

At the height of its influence, Cordoba lasted for little over a Century. Civil war broke it apart and a series of taifa, small city like states, arose in its place. Harsher Islamic thinkers started to come into prominence as a result of hired mercenaries who were brought in by rulers to increase their power. The mercenaries stayed and the political culture of tolerance slowly began to fade. At the same time Christianity began to unify in Spain. A new wave of intermingling took place. Christians lived in Islamic states and Islamic people settled in Christian kingdoms. Despite the sometimes ambivalent and autocratic notions of their
rulers the people voted by their actions and continued to expand religious and cultural
dialogue.

Western Europe received the rewards of interculturality but became increasingly intolerant
of it. Pope Innocent III (1198-1216) attacked and spoke viciously against those Christians
who Arabised themselves and in 1212 northern Europeans offered to defeat the Islamic city
states. By 1248 all the great Islamic cities were taken save Granada, which survived 250
years of warfare as a last monument to Islamic splendour in Europe.

2.7 A survey of modern intercultural music

There have been many intercultural projects, far too many to mention in this exegesis. The
view taken is that modern intercultural practice is approximately 100 years old. While it did
occur before the 20th Century, a sense of global possibility in intercultural music dates to
the rise of modernity in communications, transport and many other mediums. We find an
explosion of ideas and forms of expression during the 20th Century continuing into the 21st.
Projects are discussed pre and post World War 2. This section is not intended as an
authoritative survey of modern intercultural music, it instead highlights projects or events
that have influenced our culture of music making and the music of this thesis.

2.7.1 Pre World War 2

In 1889 the Exposition Universelle presented Asian music to Europe for the first time. It
catching the attention of Claude Debussy who was particularly intrigued by a Gamelan
ensemble from Java (Hugh, 2005:1). Debussy worked for years to find a way to represent
this aesthetic in his music, and his use of pentatonic scales, sustained pedalling and drone-
based harmony allowed a Western instrument to join with the East (Goodall,
2001:Broadcast).

The great Sufi master Hazrat Inayat Khan was acutely ware of intercultural practice. A
gifted composer Khan was able to combine methods of scoring and traditional music,
brining the Sufi zikr into a Western idiom, making concert music a spiritual practice. His work cannot be overestimated, and is being increasingly understood in the west. Inayat Khan offered a transcendent, intercultural view of music, inspired by Sufism, that is vital to this dissertation and my own work as a composer:

The mystics of all ages have loved music most. In almost all the circles of the inner cult, in whatever part of the world, music seems to be the center of the cult or the ceremony. And those who attain to that perfect peace which is called Nirvana, or in the language of the Hindus Samadhi, do this more easily through music. Therefore Sufis, especially those of the Chishtiyya School of ancient times, have taken music as a source of their meditation; and by meditating thus they derive much more benefit from it than those who meditate without the help of music. The effect that they experience is the unfoldment of the soul, the opening of the intuitive faculties; and their heart, so to speak, opens to all the beauty which is within and without, uplifting them, and at the same time bringing them that perfection for which every soul yearns (Khan, 1979:1-3).

The Indian poet, novelist and writer Rabindranath Tagore was one of the first modern intercultural writers and musicians. He studied music while in London, undergoing a mirror process to those Westerners who were fascinated by the East. Though best known for winning the Nobel Prize for Literature in 1914 Tagore was much more than a poet. He had a mastery of Bengali folk music traditions, and added Western notions of scoring and harmony to Indian scales, writing many pieces of music including the Indian and Bangladeshi national anthems. He was also involved in intercultural dialogue throughout his life. Tagore house in Kolcutta is testament to this, excerpts of his correspondence with leading Western figures such as Bernard Shaw, Romain Rolland and Einstein show this clearly (Dutta, Robinson, 1997: 69, 222).

Well known and documented is the work of Western composers in the first half of the 20th Century, when a number of composers started to engage with folk music in a new way. It is not that intercultural music did not exist before the modern folk song movements in Europe (composers were fond of quoting exotic pieces in their work, and Puccini’s Turandot is a fine example of this). However transcription and identification with national and regional folk influences suddenly included more than merely borrowing a tune, and the music of this
time started to include intercultural practice, the studying and transcription of music along national lines and class divides that had stood for many years.

The English folk song collectors such as Vaughan Williams, Finzi, Holst and even Britten were not content just to add existing melodies to their concert music. They documented, transcribed and preserved music, even allowing for the expression of multiple versions of texts or music. Their ‘composed’ music is consequently still fresh today.

In Eastern Europe the music of Bartók, Kodály and Janáček offers an even deeper process. They investigated the modal nature of Eastern European folk musics, the range of temperament available, and the potential of folk music to sound fiercely ‘modern’. The work of Bartók in particular has been investigated in great detail.

In America jazz became the quintessential intercultural form. Jazz is originally an Afro-American music that fuses tradition with a new land and religion, and religious music with the spirit of defiance and improvisation. Jazz was, and is unlike anything old Europe had ever known, and the innovations of Jazz are certainly on par with the innovations of Western concert music. Scott Joplin’s *Maple Leaf Rag*, was much more than the first best selling record, it was a work of jazz that entered the popular domain. Many such works changed the musical landscape by allowing a movement to formalise in both the developed and later the developing world. This process is still continuing today with Rhythm and Blues, Hip Hop and other Black American hybrid art forms (Reid, 2006: 3).

Shanghai became a great intercultural centre in the 1930s and 1940s, similar to Paris in the same period. Chinese, Russian, German and Middle Eastern communities all mixed in Shanghai, decades before the multiculturalism of the countries like Canada and Australia. Refugees from Stalin and Hitler’s atrocities formed the Shanghai conservatory, which became one of the great music institutions of the world (Cunio, 2001: 2).  

---

17 My father Nissim Cunio experienced life in Shanghai between 1920 and 1948. He was a musician in Shanghai and saw first hand much of this great cultural experiment.
In addition, improvements in transportation changed music. Western concert artists started to tour the world in the 20th Century. Artists such as Dame Nellie Melba and Jascha Heifietz travelled to Asia inspiring locals to learn and adapt the violin and other Western instruments (Isaacs, 1994: 1). Western concert instruments entered South America, Asia and the Middle East, invigorating ‘classical’ composition in these countries.

### 2.7.2 Post World War 2

During this period intercultural music exploded and Australia found its place in the world of music primarily through intercultural practice and experience. Despite the White Australia Policy many European and even some Asian migrants brought a richness of culture and a desire to share that transformed art and life. Music became intercultural in the provincial halls of Melbourne and Sydney, a legacy that is still seen in organisations such as the Boite in Melbourne, and the Folklines programme at the Woodford Folk Festival. An awareness of Aboriginal culture grew and composers both black and white started to enter into intercultural practice. Possibly the greatest change in Australia was an engagement with Asia. Australian composers such as Peter Sculthorpe, Anne Boyd, Martin Wesley-Smith and many others combined intercultural investigation and a response to the Australian land, a hybrid that is by no means stale today, and a sound that is still studied by the current generation of composers.

The work of John Cage (both prior to and after World War 2) is very well documented. Cage’s fascination with Eastern philosophy, in particular Zen Buddhism, permeated his music, regarding score, changes to instruments, and performance notes. The Prepared Piano is a truly intercultural invention, which Cage describes:

> I made the prepared piano. I needed percussion instruments for music for a dance that had an African character by Syvilla Fort. But the theater in which she was to dance had no wings and there was no pit. There was only a small grand piano built in to the front and left of the audience. At the time I either wrote twelve-tone music for piano or I wrote percussion music. There was no room for the instruments. I couldn't find an African twelve tone row. I finally realized I had to change the piano. I did so by placing objects between the strings. The piano was transformed
into a percussion orchestra having the loudness, say, of a harpsichord. (Cage, 1991: 2).

The music of John Cage is surely one of the greatest of intercultural experiments, it is geared towards notions of Eastern mysticism, heavily influenced by the syntax of transformative ritual, yet it is also outward looking and innately American. Minimalism, or process music also has a strong intercultural aesthetic and comes from a language that is extremely well suited to intercultural exploration; Terry Riley’s *In C* is a prominent example. *In C* works within one scale in the manner of an Indian Raga, allowing players to explore their own relationship with the thematic material in the manner of classical Hindustani music.

The 1960s saw a radical shift. The East began to embrace interculturalism, and popular Western culture embraced the East. The most striking example is with Indian music. Hindustani music became extremely popular in the West, Ravi Shankar became a world wide phenomenon, and popular musicians found a ‘new sound’. When Shankar performed at the Woodstock Festival in 1969 the shift was permanent. A series of magnetic collaborations between Western jazz and Indian traditional players ensued which even moved into classical music. Yehudi Menuin returned to his roots recording with Ravi Shankar while Paul Horn played the silver flute in the legendary acoustic of the Taj Mahal, making an audacious night time recording. Electrifying groups such as the Mahavishnu Orchestra and Shakti dazzled audiences with a technical and precise fusion well into the 1970s that remains impressive three decades on. These early fusion groups opened up interculturality to a great part of the population.

Landmark meetings between Western and Indian players were also orchestrated by the WaterLily Acoustics Label which include *Meeting by the River*, Ry Cooder and Vishwa Mohan Bhatt, (1993).

The death of Umm Kulthum in 1975 saw the largest funeral in the modern world, exposing a whole generation to Arabic music and the west to the latent power of Arabic music, starting a dialogue between Arabic and Western musicians, that is growing today. A robust
movement now exists between Jewish and Arabic musicians, which is of particular interest to the methodology of *The Temple Project*.

Western early music invigorated itself by exploring the Near East. In Australia the Renaissance Players used Near Eastern instruments and techniques with Western music. In Europe Jordi Savall combined exemplary scholastic work with intercultural investigation. His ensembles *La Capella Reial De Catalunya* and *Hespèrion XX* and *Hespèrion XXI*, resonate with my own projects.

More recently festivals around the world have looked to intercultural music as a drawcard, and a new generation of composers from the countries of Said’s ‘other’ have mastered Western composition and scoring. In Japan the music of Takemitsu and Someh Satoh is clearly in two worlds, that of the Western concert hall, and inside the spiritual dimensions of zen and Shinto.

The West-Eastern Divan Workshop and Orchestra of Daniel Barenboim and Edward Said is born from Said’s desire to heal the oriental divide, and Barenboim’s radical belief in the healing power of music. Indeed Barenboim warmed up to this by breaking the ban on performing Wagner in Israel. The orchestra contains both Palestinian and Israeli players. It took years to form into a cohesive body and despite the Intifada it has performed, toured and recorded. While Said died in 2003 at the age of 67, the orchestra survives, a testament to the transcendental and political power of intercultural music.

Barenboim wants to show Germans that you needn't be German to play German, and Israelis that Arab kids too can play violins and violas. Said recalls Israelis looking on with awe as Barenboim coaxes an A major scale from an Egyptian oboist. He then notes that the same Arab, who turned away an interested Israeli from Albania on grounds that Arab music was only for Arabs, was spotted a day or two later showing Yo-Yo Ma how to tune his cello to an Arabic scale (Schoenbaum, 2002: 1).
In Eastern Europe a generation of composers have turned within and studied medievalism. Pärt, Górecki and Gubaidulina combine mysticism, renewal and medievalism into a form that is striking in its modal sonority.

Peter Gabriel launched Real World, and ‘world music’ arrived in both the developed and developing world. Traditional music has arrived on the world stage through high quality recording and promotion. Non Western artists are now given international billing in the west, and the Tibetan Institute for the Performing Arts sends its graduates into the west to reignite Tibetan culture.

In Australia Liza Lim, Julian Yu and others are bringing an Asian perspective. Composers such as Michael Atherton have worked both in a band (Sirocco), the concert Hall and installation. Performing artists such as shakuhachi master Riley Lee have a voracious capacity for intercultural projects. The ABC has undertaken a radical shift, starting with the Classic FM Breakfast presenter Christopher Lawrence, who played a broad range of music in the early 1990s. The Daily Planet on Radio National has launched a combination of popular world and ethnic music into thousands of homes, and the ABC Classic FM Drive presenter Julia Lester pushes the boundaries of classical programming openly embracing jazz, and intercultural music.

This phenomenon has social ramifications. It can be argued that intercultural music commodifies traditional music and takes it away from its host culture while offering little in return. Intercultural music is regularly played in elite arts festivals, but its playing does not necessarily mean its original exponents are receiving any financial royalty or exposure for their craft. It is much easier for a white literate and employed musician of the developed world to make intercultural music than any musician of the developing world. Intercultural music is also subsidised by Western governments and institutions, which may not be able to facilitate or safeguard intercultural projects in the developing world.

In popular music everyone who is from Said’s ‘other’ can be positioned as part of the ‘world music’ genre while a hundred genres exist to describe micro movements in popular
American music. In art music the majority of successful composers come from a background of relative wealth. Few are from a displaced or vanishing culture, and the very act of art music composition implies a high level of education that is itself a privilege.

George Lipsitz writes in Dangerous Crossroads:

This dynamic dialogue, however does not necessarily reflect relations of recipriocity and mutuality. Inter-cultural communication does not automatically lead to intercultural cooperation, especially when participants in the dialogue speak from positions of highly unequal access to power, opportunity, and life chances (Lipsitz, 1994: 3).

The intercultural composer must be acutely aware not only of the aesthetics of the music they work with, but also its social politics, and the politics of the larger music industry. The methodology of participant observation can help a composer to become aware of some of the underlying contradictions in intercultural music practice. This should be accompanied by a composition process that credits and rewards all participating individuals and cultures.
3.1 Introduction - The largest project of this thesis

*The Temple Project* recreates music of the late Second Jewish Temple, which ended in 70 CE. It also presents music of the time of Jesus. It is an artistic speculation built upon the foundations of oral chant, archaeological record, and informed speculation from a variety of sources. It is a work of historical, intercultural art, and as discussed in the previous chapter it is a realisation project. The discussion of this process will focus on two major components, music and instruments.

This project follows on from a project undertaken in 2000 to set parts of the Dead Sea Scrolls to the tunes of Baghdadian Jewish émigré communities for the Art Gallery of New South Wales and Olympic Arts Festival exhibition of the Dead Sea Scrolls. In 2004-5 The Melbourne International Festival, Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC), and the Australian Jewish Museum, commissioned and broadcast a realisation of this music.

New instruments were made by two luthiers: Moshe Frumin in Israel was commissioned by the Haifa museum to make 21 instruments, of which 18 were brought to Australia; Harry Vatiliotis in Australia, (who had previously made ancient Egyptian and Greek instruments) loaned 2 instruments. 18

Music was transcribed from the body of Baghdadi Jewish émigré liturgy in China, Burma, and Australia, and written for a chamber ensemble of five players. Additional music was also sourced through the somewhat controversial research of French academic Suzanne Haïk -Vantoura. New music was also composed for the project.

---

18 These instruments are owned by Professor Michael Atherton of UWS. See 3.2.2 Similar Projects. Michael Atherton, *Melismos* and *Ankh* for information on the projects they were made for.
3.1.1 Background

In 70 CE the Second Jewish Temple was destroyed. The appalling casualties of the Roman invasion did not just include the innocent loss of life and those killed in resistance, but the destruction of hundreds of years of living culture based at the site of the Temple Mount. A vibrant musical culture perished which included one of the great orchestras and choirs of the ancient world. It took very little time for the art of Jewish musical instrument making and performance to be lost – indeed the Rabbis out of respect actively discouraged all forms of instrumental music. Within a few generations the Temple music was completely lost, surviving only in descriptions in historical works such as The Talmud.

A number of historical periods contributed to the formation of this music. They can be referred to in *The Temple Project*, published by UWS in 2006, and a forthcoming essay for the released CD. Additional information regarding the Baghdadian (Babylonian) oral tradition, and musical instruments is provided later in this chapter.\(^{19}\)

3.2 Similar research and music

There have been a number of similar projects both regarding ancient Jewish music and ancient music. There is a growing body of literature on the subject of ancient Jewish music, and a number of music projects have been recorded.

3.2.1 Literature

Primary source material is limited. A quick overview concludes that The Jewish Bible (Tanach, Torah or Old Testament) is the foremost and richest source for knowledge of the musical life of ancient Israel until some time after the return from the Babylonian exile. It is complemented by several external sources: archaeological relics of musical instruments and of depictions of musical scenes; comparative material from the neighbouring cultures; and

\(^{19}\) It is argued in this paper that historical intercultural realisation is the best method for recreating this music.
post-biblical sources, such as the writings of Philo and Josephus, the Apocrypha, and the Mishnah.  

The Bible has many references to music. These include vocal and instrumental music and associated music with dance and wine, rites in which men and women participated. The *Song of Songs* is one of the greatest examples of this (Bloch, 1995: 5-15).

Of the primary writers Josephus is crucial, as he wrote at the time of the destruction of the Second Temple. Josephus was a Jew who initially led part of the Jewish revolt against Rome, who then sided with the Romans after being captured. He wrote that the Jewish cause in the war was doomed. He described the military defeat of 70 CE that ended ancient Jewish music and the Second Temple.

> From the very first, when we were bent on claiming our freedom but suffered such constant misery at each other’s hands, and worse at the enemy’s, we ought perhaps to have read the mind of God and realized that HIS once beloved Jewish race had been sentenced to extinction (Josephus, V11: 340).

In the last century scholars have produced influential/important works on the subject of Jewish music, and Eastern Jewish music in particular. Two classic works on this subject are by Abraham Idelsohn (1882-1938). They are the *Thesaurus of Hebrew Oriental Melodie*, a ten volume work compiled between 1914 and 1932, and *Jewish Music in its Historical Development*, written in 1929.

Idelsohn, a composer musicologist, wrote about the time the Second Temple was destroyed. He describes the transition to Rabbinical Judaism from extant primary sources as a fundamental change in culture, from animal sacrifice to liturgy. He saw this as forming the basis of surviving chant. The following excerpt is typical.

---

20 The article *The Temple Project* (Cunio, 2004) provides a survey of Biblical and non-Biblical references to music, as well as the cultural influences on Jewish music and instruments.
Rabbi Yohana Ben Zaccai, the spiritual head of his time, saw Rabbi Joshua’s lament (for the destruction of the Temple) as follows. My son, be not worried, we have a way of atonement which is as important as these (sacrifices), and this is charity to the poor and prayer three times a day… (Idelsohn, 1967: 26).

Another writer of this period was Curt Sachs (1881-1959), who had a keen interest in the history of instruments and music of the ancient world, and established a platform of investigation for future researchers.

It was not until the 1970s when a new generation of scholars arrived, that the oral music of the Jews, and the Baghdadi Jews began to be examined by the wider musicological community.

Joachim Braun, Alfred Edersheim, Magaret Kartomi, Sarah Menasseh, Tang Yating, and Regina Randhofer have all contributed significantly to an understanding of Jewish orality. Braun’s work *Music in Ancient Israel / Palestine* has already been mentioned in the previous chapter because it is relevant both to the nature of intercultural music and this project. It argues that it is impossible to study the music of the ancient world without a multidisciplinary and comparative methodology. The work focuses especially on comparative archaeology.

The most reliable primary source information about the musical culture of ancient Israel/Palestine is doubtless the archeological /iconographic evidence…Indeed, thanks to archaeology, occasionally even the timbre of certain instruments has been preserved although the actual form of the music itself has disappeared forever (Braun, 2002:5-6).

Braun also covers many of the great historical periods of the Near East, making a strong case for the interrelation of ancient musical cultures, as well as contextualising writers such as Anne Caubet’s (1994) work into comparative methodologies (Braun, 2002: 8). This research is important to the realisation of *The Temple Project*, as it contributed to the decision to use the reproductions of non-Judaic Near Eastern instruments made by Harry Vatiliotis.
There is also a current research project aimed at collecting music of the Baghdadi Jews in this crucial generation (the last generation of living Baghdadi Jews). A number of articles were published in the Journal of Australian Jewish Studies Vol XVI, 2002: *Continuity and Change in Baghdadi Jewish Music Culture*, (Kartomi 2002:90-110); *Herod the Great’s Jewishness*, (Leihy, 2002:111-120), and *Music of the Dead Sea Scrolls* (Cunio, 2002:16-25). (Abramovich, Shavitsky, 2002: 13-270). The archive of Australian Jewish Music at Monash University, run by Bronia Kornhauser since 1995, plays a central role in supporting this new research.

2004 saw the release of a significant body of new writing in *Ethnomusicology Forum Vol 13/1*, 2004, which featured articles on Jewish orality. This is largely due to the work of staff at Monash University in Australia, including Magaret Kartomi, and Kay Dreyfus. Regina Randhofer, who spent a significant period in Israel, wrote on the use of Babylonian past musics in contemporary Baghdadi Jewish expression (Randhofer, 2004:21-47). Sarah Menasseh wrote on music of the Jews of Bombay, part of her speciality of the Jews from India, (Menasseh, 2004:47-74); while Kartomi and McCredie described the musical outcomes of the 18th Century migration of Baghdadi Jews (Kartomi, McCredie, 2004:3-21). 2007 also saw the release of *Music of the Baghdadi Jews* on Celestial Harmonies, a CD of Margaret Kartomi’s fieldwork in Asia and Australasia, produced by herself and Kornhauser.

### 3.2.2 Recordings

The following survey looks at a number of influential works that have contributed significantly to scholarship and / or performance practice of ancient or ancient Jewish repertoire. Many of these recordings feature essay length programme notes.  

1. *La Musique de la BIBLE révélée – Suzanne Haïk-Vantoura*

The first modern recording of this type was in 1976, facilitated by the French composer and musicologist Suzanne Haïk-Vantoura who recorded excerpts of her ‘deciphered’ ancient

---

21 See Bibliography for Publication details of all recordings.
Jewish music, which is based on medieval Jewish cantillation signs. The music is arranged from single monophonic deciphered scores, and no notes or explanations appear regarding the manner of this work. Vantoura’s published book *The Music of the Bible Revealed* should be consulted when listening to the music.

There are a number of areas in which the recording falls short. The instruments themselves are from the Western concert hall. The singers declaim with a European operatic technique, and there is no microtonality or temperament that equates to research on Near Eastern oral music. There is little logical relationship to the original culture in this recording of the realisation, however the music remains strangely alluring. The scores of Haïk-Vantoura can be performed with intercultural practice today, something attempted on *The Priestly Blessing*, part of *The Temple Project*.

2. **Ancient Echoes San Antonio Vocal Arts Ensemble**

This recording takes advantage of a significant shift in music practice. The instrumentation contains a combination of modern reproductions of first Century CE instruments as well as traditional Middle Eastern instruments, a similar rationale to that of *The Temple Project*. New composition took place around modal fragments of the Jewish musicologist Abraham Idelsohn, and the bulk of the recording contains his transcriptions. The sound of the disc is firmly in the Western early music genre. One of the highlights of this project is the inclusion of two pieces from the time but not the specific culture. They are *The Lord’s Prayer* in Aramaic, and the *Song of Sekilos*, both from the first century CE.

3. **Yoel Ben Simhon and The Sultana Ensemble**

This 2003 disc is from Ben Simhon, a Moroccan Israeli musician, and it displays a much greater understanding of the cultural practices of Near Eastern music. Simhon’s ensemble plays traditional Near Eastern instruments with a degree of freedom that is most engaging. This is one of the first projects to present material wholly by Arabic speaking musicians,

---

22 An analysis of Haïk-Vantoura’s research was presented at the SIMS 2004 conference by the author of this exegesis.
throughout the disc. It contains a mixture of traditional Moroccan / Jewish and newly composed music played with Arabic and Western instruments.

4. Yair Dalal selected recordings
Dalal is the leading Baghdadian Jewish musician of our time, and also a fine player and advocate for Judeo-Arabic music. Dalal has played Sephardi music with the ensembles of Jordi Savall, spent years documenting the work of the last generation of Baghdadi Jewish composers and players, and recorded consistently. Recordings that conceptualise The Temple Project include Sal Ol, which features Judeo-Arabic tunes sung in a similar manner to some of The Temple Project texts. Azazme contains an Arabic ensemble playing in a fine cross collaboration, and Samar alternates between solo taqasim and instrumental textures. Coincidentally, Dalal has also written musical scores for the Dead Sea Scrolls.

5. Michael Atherton, Melismos and Ankh
Atherton is of interest because he is an active intercultural participant and advocate for this mode of making music. Moreover he utilises aspects of the realisation process in both these recordings. The strength of these lie in their recreation of instruments, a collaboration with Australian luthier Harry Vatiliotis, and the balance between classicism and non-classicism in the recordings.

Melismos, an exploration of the music of ancient Greece, has the advantage of a great deal more evidence than Ankh, the Egyptian music project. Both projects have more firm pictorial evidence than The Temple Project. However it is not clear where the lines of new composition are drawn in some of Atherton’s work, and the recordings could do with a more detailed description of the realisation process.

6. Rafael Pérez Arroyo, Music in the Age of the Pyramids
Arroyo’s work is commendable. The disc is a culmination of extensive research and disclosure of the realisation process. In addition to this the recording is released on the Natural Acoustic Recordings (NAR) Label, keeping artificialities in the sound processing to a minimum. Sonically it is a beautiful work with a combination of traditional research and
research that speculates on the chironomy or possible chironomy of ancient Egypt. This is something applicable to the next section of this thesis that looks at the work of Suzanne Haïk -Vantoura. This work is broadly similar in conceptual terms to *The Temple Project*.

**Summary**

These written and recorded works offer an interesting point of departure for this thesis. In keeping with the broad themes of these works two main sources were chosen for research and realisation, the work of Suzanne Haïk -Vantoura, and part of the body of Jewish oral chant, that of the Baghdadi tradition. This combination of modalities gives the realisation an informed yet creative premise.

**3.3 Suzanne Haïk -Vantoura**

Suzanne Haïk -Vantoura’s research into providing a decoding method for the Tiberian (Masoretic) school of notation has been the most radical and hotly debated work in this field. Haïk -Vantoura’s work must be considered in some detail as it offers an alternative methodology to oral transcription.

Haïk -Vantoura makes an emphatic though not wholly convincing case for a new scoring method in realising ancient Jewish music, based on the *Te’amim* – (small signs written below and above the text). She sees this as a true reconstruction of the music of the time. Vantoura writes that a group called the Masoretes were the custodians of a written and chironic music tradition, who preserved its writing, fearing that it would be lost for ever in the changing medieval world. The first example of the *Te'amim* is in the *Codex of the Prophets* written in 895 CE by Moses Ben Asher; the point from which she dates her research. She cites early sources who believed the notation was descended from Moses’ revelations at Mount Sinai (Haïk -Vantoura, 1991: 46). It is therefore necessary to understand gestural notation and the later Tiberian system.
3.3.1 Chironomy

Chironomy is the art of communicating music through gesture, a process that was widespread in the ancient world. Haïk -Vantoura speculates that chironic gestures were the means by which the ancient musical system was transmitted, and ultimately integrated into the notational form of the Te’amim (also called the Tiberian system of notation). This does not only apply to ancient Jewish music, for chironomy is also discussed in the history of Egyptian and other musics, and instrumentalists in Egypt may have had their own chironomer, or non - playing orchestra member (Arroyo, 2001:1-6).

Haïk -Vantoura writes that the chironomer is akin to a modern conductor who communicates a score through gesture, even though there is no direct evidence of this practice in ancient Jewish music making. (Haïk -Vantoura, 1991:70-76).

3.3.2 The Tiberian system of notation

The Tiberian system is the system that is commonly called the Te’amim (sometimes written as T’amim in Roman characters) which most Rabbis, Cantors and scholars describe as cantillation and accentuation symbols. The common use of these symbols is to give the reader a sense of the textual rhythm of the work, as well as providing a non-text based reference for punctuation and inflection. In some cases they illuminate punctuation points, in others they offer an initiated way of reading the texts.

This notation is not mentioned in Jewish treatises of the seventh and eighth Centuries, lending weight to the argument that it originated in the ninth or tenth Century. However the words ‘pisquet te ‘amim’, the likely precursor to the term Te’amim, is present in The Talmud, which was written and edited by the 6th Century (Haïk -Vantoura, 1991: 46-47). Works written about the Te’amim are quite clear about its perceived role, in which no mention of music is made, yet these texts were definitely sung in antiquity.
The first treatise on the te’amim that we possess dates only from 930 CE. It is the work of the last teacher of the Masorah, Aaron Ben Asher, whose father had edited the Codex of the Prophets (found in the Cairo Geniza) and whose grandfather himself was one of the founders of the celebrated Tiberian school. Basically, the object of the treatise was to aid the student in the correct pronunciation of the Holy Scriptures. (Haïk -Vantoura, 1991: 47).

In divergence from accepted views Haïk -Vantoura views the notation as a graphic representation of actual music - not only in its accepted role of a punctuation and cantillation aid. The notation is used on the two common types of ancient Jewish texts, prosodic (prose texts), and psalmodic (poetic texts). In both cases the notation occurs above and below the written words, mostly with the same signs used in both texts.

Some medieval writings relate these cantillation signs to the revelations of Moses on Mount Sinai. The *Mahzor Vitry*, a largely anonymous work compiled by Rabbi Simha de Vitry in 1100 CE, states the following:

“It was the meaning of the neumes which was revealed to Moses on Sinai, but the form of the symbols is the work of the scribes” (Weil: 332, CF: 65).

It is not known whether the Tiberians, the preservers and recorders of this syntax had any knowledge of a musical use for it. There were two preceding notational forms in Jewish literature, an extremely old Palestinian mode, which used a small number of dots for syntax, and a Babylonian mode that used simple letters as the code, with each letter symbolising a particular syntax.

The Tiberian notation has no rhythmic accentuation or time based marking, and does not have any markings that attest to the mode or scale.

**3.3.3 Haïk –Vantoura’s realisation**

Haïk-Vantoura describes the signs below the words as giving a scale degree. She uses comparative analysis to deduce the nature of the scale and points to the example of
Babylonian cuneiform tablets found in 1968. Written in Lydian modes, they show a similarity with the modern major scale, that Vantoura believes this music also shares. It is a fascinating hypothesis that cannot be tested fully, as any music written from the scheme offers no proof of an ancient providence.

Haïk-Vantoura describes the signs above the words as added notes or subordinate degrees, similar to the modern writing of ornamental symbols, seeing these markings as derivative of the lower markings.

Some cantillation signs are common, while others are occasional. The | sign ends many verses and is described by Haïk-Vantoura as being the primary note of the series of scale degrees (analogous to the modern tonic). She deduced scales from a process of analysing music / textual expression via the signs and has described this as a ‘deciphering key’.

The rhythmic and poetic nature of the Psalm texts renders them different from the Prosodic texts both in synagogue cantillation and the Haïk-Vantoura realisation. She suggests that a constant, underlying rhythmic pulse should be set up, providing a set time period and allowing the upper markings to be precise rhythmic occurrences within the scale degrees of the lower markings (Haïk-Vantoura, 1991:36). She describes the results of realisations made with the decoding key:

The beauty which adorns these realisations reinforces the unquestionable musical logic of these interpretations. It attests to a method of procedure without contradictions, and it bears witness to a cadre of trained specialists as the source of the notation... This music indisputably demonstrates a syntax. And it is this syntax which best confirms the reality of the deciphering key, removing any idea of pure and simple chance (Haïk-Vantoura, 1991: 37).

Israel Adler, Director of the Centre for the Study of Jewish Music, Hebrew University Jerusalem wrote to her in 1973:
You have succeed in taking as a base the role of the interpunctuation of the Biblical accents (te’amim), in creating melodic lines which adapt themselves to the texts in the most perfect manner (Haïk -Vantoura, 1991: 548).

### 3.3.4 Example 1: Exodus 15: 3-4 The Song of the Red Sea

Realised with the deciphering key (Haïk -Vantoura, 1991:116).

The realisation provides a smoothly contoured melody that fits within some of the likely characteristics of ancient music. They include a limited melodic range (in this case only a sixth), the use of an unaltered scale, and word painting where the higher notes occur in the important words of the text. In this case “ve loya rah bayam” (he has cast into the sea) is centred around the three highest scale degrees, with the phrase ending on the fourth for dramatic effect. When compared to the Baghdadian tune for a similar Exodus text, it is melodically expressive.

This methodology is far from foolproof in the process of reconstituting Biblical ancient music. As stated it is not a reconstruction and the author’s insistence of it as such does her fine work a disservice. It gives no clue to the possibilities of instrumental accompaniment, nor does it give an idea of any of the concepts that a modern score takes for granted. These include tempo, metre, dynamic markings, the use of accelerando, ritardando, and vocal / instrumental style to name a few. It also makes expressive assumptions about the nature of orality in Jewish music, suggesting that oral tradition is much less rigorous than many modern scholars now believe.

However, despite these drawbacks it is a compelling method that is available for use alongside the transcription and realisation of oral chant, a methodology that has both transcription and comparative analysis available in its favour.
3.4 Jewish oral tradition

Jewish music is largely oral. This is a given to all researchers even though there are sporadic written traditions dating 300 years. Questions as to the nature of this music can easily be asked when evaluating the divergent nature of Jewish oral tradition. However the thesis argues that these traditions are vigorous and well cared for by custodians, and have survived despite the pressures of modernity. This is certainly an area for future research, and an area now receiving due consideration by academics.

3.4.1 Sephardi, Mizrachi and Ashkenazi traditions

There are three main traditions extant: the Ashkenazi, broadly based in Europe; the Sephardi, descendants of Jews who had contact with the Sefarad (medieval Spain); and the Mizrachi, Jews who stayed largely in the Middle East. Other communities include the Felashim (Ethiopian), and tribal communities from parts of India and Burma, which date back to antiquity.
Each of these traditions (besides the tribal communities) dates its custom from the onset of the Rabbinic tradition, a tradition that predates the destruction of the second Jewish Temple in 70 CE. The Ashkenazi tradition has taken many of the characteristics of European music particularly over the last 500 years (Jacobs, 2000: 5) and as such is not considered at all in this realisation. The Sephardi tradition has largely intermingled with the Mizrachi due to the expulsion of the Jews of Spain in 1492. This happened in a most remarkable manner, fusing the Mizrachi ideal for piety and saintliness with the Sephardi ideal of learning and intellectual mastery (Gerber, 1992: 162). In addition rituals were adapted and a general compromise was reached which allowed different communities to mix (Idelsohn, 1967: 59-60). Some parts of the Mizrachi tradition have retained their innate character more than others and survived this melding with Sephardic culture. The Babylonian tradition is a distinct part of the Mizrachi tradition alongside other micro traditions such as Yemeni, Persian, and Turkish Jewish music, which has survived with a strong sense of orality (Cunio, 2002: 28).

3.5 The Babylonian tradition

As this was the tradition chosen in The Temple Project a brief investigation is called for. This tradition is approximately 2,600 years old, and offers a rare continuity in time and place compared to much ancient music. Recent scholarship is enriching our understanding of this tradition and enabling comparative study between it and other traditions such as Yemenite Jewish, Syrian orthodox, and Sephardic Jewish.

The terms Baghdadian and Babylonian are often interchangeable in this instance. Both refer to Jews who stayed in Babylon after King Cyrus allowed the Jews to return to Judea and Jerusalem in 538 BCE, or Jews who migrated to join this unique and long-running Jewish diaspora.

Psalm 137, Al Naharot Bavel, provides an insight to the Babylonian community. This Psalm is now sung during the festival of Tish B’Av, a festival on the 9th day of the lunar month of Av, a day of great mourning and fasting for the destroyed Temple.
By the rivers if Babylon, there we sat down; yea, we wept, when we remembered Zion. We hanged our harps upon the willows in the midst thereof. For there they that carried us away captive required of us a song; and they that wasted us required of us mirth, saying, Sing us one of the songs of Zion (The Tanach, year not given:1336 ).

Aram - Naharayim, as Iraq was called in the Bible had strong connections from the beginning of Jewish recorded history. Some saw Abraham the patriarch as a Babylonian Jew. Leading women figures in Biblical history came from Paddan-Aram (Northern Iraq) and the prophets Jeremiah and Isaiah relate events connected with Babylon (Cunio, 2000: 1). The strongest episode is the defeat of Jews by Nebuchadnezzar in 586 BCE, where the Jews were humbled, and many taken as captive to the victor’s city. It is a remarkable feat that within a few generations the Jews had a fulfilling life in this land, with many seeing it as a second Jerusalem (Dior, 2001: 1-3).

It was the Babylonian exile that led to the practice of ‘Houses of worship’ the precursor to the synagogue and this mode became, by the end of the ancient world, the pre-eminent way for Jews to worship: It reached the point that even in Judea, the home of the Temple, many of these houses existed. As such many Babylonian Jews still see the synagogue as their link to ancient Judaism, though it is unlikely that the music of the Temple was directly performed in the Babylonian communities before or after its destruction (Randhofer, 2004: 27).

This Jewish diaspora was important during the wars with the Greeks and the occupation and eventual loss of the Second Temple in 70 CE. When Hellenistic and Roman influence spread pervasively the Babylonians were able to provide cultural and financial support. The great Babylonian Talmud is testimony to the religious rigour of the community.

Babylonian Jews also played an important role in medieval history. The Abasid dynasty moved the headquarters of the Caliphate to Baghdad from Syria in 750 CE, giving this community a seat at the heart of the Islamic world. Jews were granted the special rights of
the *dhimmi*, people of the book, whose belief had come before The Prophet, Muhammad. Consequently they rose to exceptional ranks in society (Menocal 2002: 89).

Baghdadian Jews also provided refuge after the Christian reconquest of Spain, and the expulsion of the Jews by Ferdinand and Isabella in 1492. This led to a curious mixing of cultures whereby Baghdadis that had never been to Spain intermingled and learnt the language and customs of the Sephardic Spanish tradition (Randhofer, 2004: 24).

In the 18th Century Iraqi Jewish trading colonies were established in Bombay, Calcutta, Rangoon, Penang, Singapore, Surabaya, Shanghai, Hong Kong and much of South East Asia. Baghdadian Jews thrived in both the Ottoman Empire and the British Raj. They were highly educated, multi-lingual, were able to travel freely, and often took positions of commerce and trade with government and private enterprise.

The founding of the State of Israel and a changing view towards the Baghdadian Jews in the Arabic world has hastened the demise of these communities in Iraq and many émigré countries. The future of this musical tradition lies in Israel, where a great deal of music and cultural research has already taken place. Unfortunately, so has a great deal of musical assimilation, with many tunes and vocal styles being incorporated and adapted into the mainstream Sephardic cantillation. Coincidentally and ironically a handful of countries, including Australia, also host émigré communities who have migrated both from Iraq and Iraqi émigré communities in the Far East. This micro-tradition (due to its small number of practitioners), is still alive in a number of countries though significant cultural and musical pressures will see the tradition change in the next 20-30 years (Kartomi, McCredie, 2004: 4-5).

This long neglected music and cantillation is now being recognised and there is a concerted effort to preserve the music of this tradition while the current generation of Iraqi émigrés still live.
3.6 Babylonian / Baghdadian music

The cultural environment of Iraq has undoubtedly influenced the music of this tradition. Hebrew was essentially a dead language in this culture until the migration of many Babylonian Jews to Israel, which reached its zenith between 1948-50. Though Hebrew was used to declaim the sacred texts the vernacular of Arabic was the most common language followed by a growing knowledge of English. In addition many Baghdadis spoke and worshipped in Aramaic and Baghdadian texts sometimes have Aramaic repeated next to them.

Randhofer identifies three main ways in which this musical culture has survived: written sources (which need to be examined carefully); notation (though this does not contain any musical notation); and oral transmission. With oral tradition Randhofer argues that there has been too much divergence for there to be a primal tradition from which all else springs (Randhofer, 2004: 25-26).

Tunes were, and are still, taught as the way of interpreting The Tanach and later writings, with each tune learnt by rote from an elder or community leader until a mastery is achieved. It is uncommon for there to be a solo cantor or chazzan in this tradition, for the majority of singing is communal. Most tunes are relatively simple, and while they have ample room for ornamentation they do not rely on it (Jacobs, 2000: 3).

Melodies are rarely over an octave in span and are often limited to four or five notes in the naturally occurring part of the voice. There is no concept of the key-based system in this music, and the key of a text can change with every declamation. The vocal line dominates and no written records exist of Baghdadian instrumental accompaniments, although pictures have shown Baghdadian Jews playing Arabic instruments in secular events.

The declamation of these texts is inherently musical. Melodies and expressive ornaments are used to great effect without the large amount of melodic jumping that takes place within other Eastern Jewish traditions, such as in Yemen and Egypt. Baghdadian tunes differ in
relation to prosody and psalmody. In prosodic passages the rhythm is additive in nature, following the stresses of the text. While it can be scored metrically, as with the example below, it is inherently non-metrical, as the reader will not sing a prosodic text with an underlying pulse. Many Baghdadis call this style of singing *Gimell* (the 3rd letter of the Hebrew alphabet, meaning mostly spoken and a little sung). The notation of such singing in an additive manner (whereby the rhythm of each bar is different) can also be at odds with the spirit of the music as it is not intended to be complicated. Such an action is comparable to fully scoring the ornaments of Baroque music, and can rigidify a text (Cunio, 2000: 11).


The range of this work, a major 6th, is larger than the Exodus example of Haïk -Vantoura. It also contains substantially more realised ornamentation and turning within the melody. Another difference is the use of an accidental in the tune. In this version both an A natural and A flat are interchanged, often in very close proximity. There are a number of occasions where melodic leaps of a 3rd occur which provide forward potential, and a type of arpeggiation that does not exist in the deciphering key’s realisation. It is also clear that the tune is not strophic in each verse. There are a number of small motive-like figures within the piece, such as bar 7 beats one and two: Bb - A -natural C natural Bb, which is repeated in double time in bar 17 beat 2.

There are points in this declamation where the singing is not compatible with the notional 4/4 that has been chosen to score it. In bar 17 there are too many syllables present for this rhythm, which is stretched by a beat in order to fit the text into the existing melodic shape. This is consequently scored as a 5/4 bar. Bars 28 and 40 are written as in 3/4, to make sense of a similar process where there are less text based syllables than the mode would ordinarily allow. These are not changes in metre as in a modern piece but an attempt to marry the demands of the text (which is paramount) with the mode. It would also have been preferable to transcribe this piece without any time signatures or barlines.
Hu acahron V’moshe Exodus V126 - V113

Declamation: Ellis Jacobs
Numbers under text
designate Verse structure

(Cunio, 2000: 1-2).
Chapter 4  Analysis of The Temple Project

4.1  Comparative archaeology / iconography and oral transcription as the basis for a new realisation

The overwhelming consensus from researchers is that the primary Jewish tradition perished in 70 CE. What remains is to see how the music of this thesis relates to the instruments and music of the time. Comparative archaeology and iconography are both important in any selection of musical instruments. Comparative archaeology looks at the finds of the Near East in the broad period to make assumptions on the nature of instruments, while iconography is able to approximate size and style.

It was unrealistic to commission all new replicas and a collaborator was sourced and found. That collaborator was Moshe Frumin, who has worked for the last 20 years to reconstitute ancient Jewish instruments. These instruments have been exhibited at a number of galleries and museums around the world, principally the Haifa Museum. Mr Frumin responded to archaeology and iconography, working in Israel and having access to the holdings of the major institutions (Frumin, 2004: 3). He made the decision to concentrate on responding to visual research, as opposed to concentrate on manufacturing a ‘playing’ set of instruments. This did not mean that the instruments were unable to be played, rather that playing was a secondary consideration for a body of work designed for display.

The work of Braun and a generation of contemporary scholars has already been referred to in this thesis. Braun’s research into iconography describes a Near Eastern culture that traded music as well as other forms. This is reflected in the sourcing of instruments for The Temple Project. Other instrumental sources include Harry Vatiliotis (harp and kithara), Andy Rigby (harps), as well as traditional instruments from the playing kit of the ensemble (frame drums, flutes, plucked strings and double reeds). 23

23 The players were Heather Lee, Lew Kiek, Tunji Beier, Andy Rigby, and Anne Hildyard. An example of the assembled instruments can be seen at www.moshefrumin.com.
What we can deduce is that while it is important to examine iconography and archaeology, neither discipline can instantly realise this type of project. Instead archaeology and iconography provide a test of approximation for instrumentation. A study of similar projects shows that it is appropriate to combine the use of replicas with living instruments, as described in Chapter 3. This is because there are no detailed schematic plans of ancient Jewish instruments, or major finds of preserved instruments, even the names and meanings of the ancient instruments are not the same in epistemological evaluations (Braun, 2002: 12).

Oral transcription is crucial to this project. Though transcriptions are not a foolproof methodology they offer a potential cohesiveness that is impossible to achieve by any other means. It has already been argued that the Babylonian tradition is most appropriate for this project.

### 4.2 The intercultural composition process

As all of these are part of the larger composition process, it is impossible to separate performance and recording from research and composition. This is because the nature of ensembles and instruments is changeable, there are no predefined conventions regarding ensemble, instrumental realisation or even style. Though the process is not linear it is still possible to describe it in three parts. The first is research; the sourcing of material including instruments, and selection of texts and melodies for treatment. The second is the playing of instruments, and the writing and arranging of melodic and rhythmic parts including new composition. The third is rehearsal, performance and recording - a process of refining the ‘score’ with the ensemble, of integrating early music and Near Eastern performance practice.24

#### 4.2.1 Identification of texts for treatment

24 The research contained in the forthcoming liner notes for *The Temple Project* makes this clear, as it would not have been possible to undertake this project without a systematic survey of the history of ancient Jewish music practice.
This involved looking at primary and secondary historical sources, as well as examining aspects of the Dead Sea Scrolls and Rabbinic Judaic practice. Primary sources include the Tanach, and the Haftorah (The Old Testament and commentaries on it), transcriptions of the Dead Sea Scrolls from the Israeli Department of Antiquities, The Psalms (Psalm 150 was chosen from this collection), Josephus, early and contemporary Baghdadi Jewish texts. Pieces such as The Priestly Blessing and The Ten Commandments exist both in Rabbinic Judaism and accounts of Temple practice.

The texts chosen follow the basic order of a service as described by Idelsohn and the Mishnah. This order contains introductory pieces, a central service, and occasional pieces. Each Temple service would have had a different selection for each service, though in this project only one selection is presented.

**Psalms and Hymns**

This section contains introductory texts, some of which are still read in the modern synagogue. All occur before the opening of the Ark (reading of the Torah), and offer an equivalent to a Temple service opening. El Norah Alilah is the only piece that may have been composed after the period, the others certainly existed during the Second Temple period.

*T’qiah T’ruah Sh’varim* (Shofar pattern, see 4.4.1 for more information).

*Haleluhu Betziltzelay* (Psalm 150).

*El Norah Alilah* (Yom Kippur prayer).

*Zimru Y’didim* (Hymn from the Dead Sea Scrolls).

**From the High Priest**

This central part of the service has been described by a number of writers, including Idelsohn in the early 20th Century, and these prayers were, and are the most important in the surviving traditions. All of these are described as being used in Temple services. These
pieces use the deciphering key of Haik-Vantoura, new composition and spoken word in the realisation process.

*T’qiah T’ruah Sh’varim* (Shofar pattern).
*Sh’ma Yisrael* (The central prayer of Judaism).
*The Priestly Blessing* (The historical blessing of the High Priest).
*The Ten Commandments* (spoken).

**Occasional Songs**

These pieces are still used in services or by communities for significant festivals or celebrations, and represent surviving Jewish oral tradition.

*Ashir Shirim* (Transcribed Baghdadi wedding song, traditionally sung by women).
*Halachma Anya* (Transcribed Baghdadi lament of the Egyptian Exodus).
*B’fi Sharim* (Closing prayer from the Baghdadi Shabbat evening service).

**4.2.2 Transcription of oral melodies for selected texts**

To some extent the process is self evident. This is because the Eastern communities hold a tradition of always singing the text, whereas the act of only reading is subservient (Jacobs, 2000: 3). Baghdadi tunes were recorded between 2000 and 2004, and were transcribed as part of this process. Existing transcriptions by researchers such as Kartomi, Mannasseh, Randhofer and Idelsohn were also referred to in the planning part of the project.

As a general principle new transcriptions were under-written, which means that I did not fully score every vocal nuance and ornament. It became clear when embarking on this project that the greatest variance in declamation appears with ornamentation. Comparative transcription of the same texts sung by different Baghdadi Jews shows a uniform tune with different ornamentation structures. Transcription also found that some singers were better
able to stay within the given key than others, and that a change in key was not a deliberate modulation, but an occasional result of singing unaccompanied. Once completed the transcriptions were available for the realisation process, where they were often significantly changed.

4.2.3 Embellishment Ornament, and counter-melody.

These are aspects that are firmly part of the realisation. They do not occur in original source material and the majority of transcriptions. In keeping with the transcription process, ornaments were not fully scored. Players workshopped ornamental styles during the rehearsal process, and as a general rule instruments followed vocal ornaments. Counter-melody was used in two manners: as a scored example (Ashir Shirim); and as an improvised counter embellishment (Sh’ma Yisrael). On only one occasion is there anything approximating vertical harmony, this is the refrain in Sh’ma Yisrael, which contains a five part vocal composition combined with a drone-based tonality.  

4.2.4 The use of drone-based harmony

There is no record of drone-based harmony in ancient Jewish music, and also in most of its accompanying cultures. This does not mean that the drone did not exist, it is possible that the fundamental was a given and as such did not need to be repeatedly expressed. Elements of the drone do survive in the style of Baghdadi cantillation called Gimmell, which has already been referred to in this thesis. Gimmell is based on one note with little or no deviating tune. Small amounts of ornamentation punctuate the rhythmic nature of the texts, and some ornaments can approach a quarter tone below the minor second (Cunio, 2004: 5).

Most of the pieces in The Temple Project contain a drone. In some cases this is expressed as a 1 -V -VIII plucked arpeggiation, such as in the harp part of the live recording of The Temple Project (Halachma Anya). In other cases it exists in a fundamental wind or reed part such as the reed organ in Sh’ma Yisrael.

See 4.3, Case Study 1, figure B to view the harmony.
4.3 Case Study 1: *Sh’ma Yisrael* Deuteronomy 6: 4-9

Listening: Appendix 1: Recordings: 1.1, 1.2.

An overview of this piece was presented in the original program notes.

Rabbi Akiba and Josephus both attended services at the Temple, and the first section of the Talmud (the Mishnah) describes the performance at the Temple. It mentions performances of the Sh’ma, The Priestly Blessing and the Ten Commandments. Were these the central affirmations of what it meant to be a Jew in the ancient world? We sing a Babylonian version of the Sh’ma that has been arranged to take into account the grander sounds of the Temple as opposed to the synagogue. Choir textures repeat the first 2 lines of the prayer, while solo voices sing the ensuing texts. Was this the piece that the great singer Hugras the Levite so excited the crowds with every week? Or was it the moment when the people moved to a mystical communion with God through the power of the Levitical singers and instrumentalists (Cunio, 2004: 2).

*Sh’ma Yisrael* is the longest piece in the realisation, lasting 8 minutes or more in every recorded version, and over 15 in the primary recording. This is despite only part of the possible text being used (Numbers 15: 37-41 constitutes another verse which was omitted in this realisation). It is so long due to repetition and embellishment, a process which attempts to bring the central message of divine unity to the listener.

The central text at Figure B is:

*Sh’ma Yisrael Adonay Elohuunu Adonay Ehad.*

*(Baruch Shaym K’vod Malchuto L’olam Vaed.)*

‘*Hear O Israel the Lord is God, the Lord is One*’,

*(Blessed shall be his name for ever and ever)* (Cunio 2004: 4).

This is perhaps the best known of all Jewish texts, and has a newly composed theme. It is no coincidence that this is the only part of *The Temple Project* where vertical harmony exists. The idea was to take this text to a different space for the listener, to integrate notions of scholastic realisation with drone-based harmony as all notes bar one, an E flat are within
the scale. The second line (in brackets) is traditionally only sung once a year at the fast of Yom Kippur, as it is deemed too holy for everyday worship (Jacobs, 2000: 6).

There are other devices at work in this piece. The solo woman’s part (figure C) and the solo flute lines (figure A) result from scored embellishments based on a transcription of a Baghdadi tune. These embellishments have metrically scored ornamentation to add a feeling of depth. Though the music is essentially simple the ornaments provide an extended melisma during a number of phrases such as E of ‘Elohaynu’ in bar 21-22, and A of ‘Adonay’ in bar 23-4.

The flute line at figure E is the same melody as the vocal line of figure C, yet the effect is quite different in the recording. Similarly the differing versions of figure D with and without the drone are quite different, and the piece ends with figure D sung a capella.

The solo male part, figure E, is recited in a similar manner to Baghdadi custom, the ornaments are added in performance, and the counter-melodies on the oud are improvised.

It is worth noting that a number of parts are not scored at all. The reed organ drone, the harp, the oud and percussion were dependent on the rehearsal process to find their form. This is in line with the basic tenet of this realisation, that a combination of scoring and improvisation is ideal.

The use of percussion is non-metrical throughout the piece, and is designed to simulate the effect of the bells that are described as being worn and played by the High Priests. Sh’ma Yisrael presents a type of sound where a small number of textural and melodic variants provide a feeling of great change. Though the realisation offers a limited number of variables to experiment with, the piece generates a strong sense of forward momentum.
SH'MA YISRAEL

DURATION EITHER 200 OR 1600

DEUT. 6:4-9

Flute

A

B

S

A

T

B

Sh'mah Yisra el a do nay e lo hay nu a do nay e had.

Sh'mah Yisra el a do nay e lo hay nu a do nay e had.

Sh'mah Yisra el a do nay e lo hay nu a do nay e had.

Sh'mah Yisra el a do nay e lo hay nu a do nay e had.

S

A

T

B

Ba ruch shaym K'vod mal chu to, Lay o lam va rd.

Ba ruch shaym K'vod mal chu to, Lay o lam va rd.

Ba ruch shaym K'vod mal chu to, Lay o lam va rd.

Ba ruch shaym K'vod min hu to, Lay o lam va rd.

S

S

S

Sh'mah nu Yisra el. A do nay. e lo


A do nay e had. A do nui e had. © CUNIO 2004
4.4 Instruments used in the realisation

The instruments for this realisation came from three sources, Israeli sculptor and luthier Moshe Frumin, Australian luthier Harry Vatiliotis, and the collections of the players of the ensemble.

A project of this nature needs a stable and musical set of instruments to rely upon. Mr Frumin’s instruments formed a visually engaging foundation for this process, but were not aurally sufficient for the project. Mr Vatiliotis’ instruments were sonically pleasing and quite stable, yet were only cultural approximations, while the living instruments chosen are contemporary, traditional relatives of ancient instruments, but can make no claim of sonic accuracy.

It is hoped that new instruments will be commissioned to augment these in the next few years. It is argued that there is still room for the use of traditional instruments in a realisation such as *The Temple Project*, though such instruments must be chosen with care as they have a strong cultural resonance.

4.4.1 Ancient Jewish instruments

Though many writers have described the Jewish instruments of the ancient world, two main sources have been used in this thesis. Wellesz and Sendry were the first to define instruments in a comparative manner, and their work has been augmented by Ann Caubet and Joachim Braun in recent years. (Wellesz, 1957: 100-200), (Sendry, 1966: 80-104).

- *Ugay*: Simple flute. Closest relative the modern Ney. Possibly a long and wide instrument. The term *ugay* may have meant all pipes, flutes and early clarinets.
- *Kinnor*: A variation on the early Greek Kithara (lyre). Gut strings – thin, from the small intestine. Possibly plucked with a plectrum. Ten strings are described for the Ten Commandments. It may have been tuned in a pentatonic scale through two octaves, and used as an accompanying instrument.
• **Tof**: An old Semitic frame drum, corresponding to the Arabic daff.

• **Typanon**: Played by women. It was usually small, close to tambourine size, though it could be very large as women are described as sitting on it in the Talmud.

• **Pa’amor**: Small bell or jingle, often on the hem of the high priest. Its use was to protect him from evil spirits when he entered and left the temple.

• **Shofar**: Ram’s horn with a mouthpiece. The only instrument to have survived. It may have been used in rituals as well as for signalling. The following styles of playing exist in the major festivals of Yom Kippur and Rosh Ha Shana.
  - **T’quia**: An appoggiatura on the tonic followed by a long blow on the tonic or fifth.
  - **Sh’varim**: Rapid alternation between the tonic and fifth, or the tonic, usually 12-13 distinct soundings.
  - **Tr’ua**: Quavering on the tonic, usually ending on the fifth.
  - **T’quia G’dola**: A long sostenuto on the tonic or fifth.  

• **Hatzora**: Silver trumpet-like instruments. Used for signalling, warning, before battle, and for peace sacrifices. It is written that 120 were used for the dedication of King Solomon’s Temple (Sendry, 1969: 176.)

• **Nevel**: A stringed harp called the psalterion in Greek. It is vertical and angular with thicker strings than the kinnor.

• **Asor**: Most likely a ten-stringed zither. In Hebrew it is called the Nevel Asor. It is impossible to tell if it had a sounding body.

• **Halil and Abub**: (Double reeds). Two pipers were used in funerals (halilim) after the First Temple period. In the Second Temple period between two and twelve were described as being heard at the Passover Sacrifice (1 & 2), Passover Tabernacles and Shavuot. They were possibly used with one pipe droning, with the other playing the tune. They were seen to induce a state of trance (Sachs, 1940: 110-140.)

• **M’maanim** (or Shistra): A shaken instrument described in Isis worship cults. This rarely mentioned instrument was probably tuned A - Bb (1/4 tone under) - C# (1/4 tone

---

26 It is worth noting that the divergence in playing styles within traditions can be greater than the tradition itself. This is due to the rigours of the instrument which can be very difficult to sound, and the fact that the players only play during two festivals every calendar year.
above) 1.5 - D (slightly under). It is possible this was the first instrument to bring this typically Jewish motive into the official music.

- **Selslim**: Cymbals: *zil* in Turkish, *salasil* in Arabic, *silul* in Tibetan, *kymbala* in Greek.

  Two types are described:


### 4.4.2 Instruments of Moshe Frumin

Work on reconstructions of Temple instruments has been a passion of Israeli luthier and sculptor Moshe Frumin for almost twenty years. He has built instruments based on archaeological remnants, as well as from representations of instruments on the sculpture and coins of the period. Versions of six instruments have been realised solely in this manner. It is important to note that even though a visual representation has been used as a building guide, there is no schematic plan or evidence of material for both the bodies and strings of instruments, nor are there diagrams showing any internal measurements or plans.

Frumin has also built a significant number of instruments through a process of speculative research, responding to the instrumental descriptions in primary Hebraic sources including the Tanach and the Mishnah. Versions of twelve instruments were realised in this manner. This process enabled the project to have eighteen pieces at its disposal, covering most of the instrumental families of ancient music. In these cases Frumin attempted to recreate the described sound and nature of the instruments, with materials from the region and traditional building methods.

The picture in Example 3 is one of the 18 instruments Frumin lent for the project. Each is created with wood and materials from the region of the Temple structure, and uses no modern building techniques. Frumin built instruments that visually represent the Temple’s resources, as sculptural works intended for exhibition not performance. When it came to the point of playing these instruments a number of problems became apparent.
The turning pegs would regularly slip making it difficult to keep the instrument at a constant pitch. Small soundboards, without the hollowing techniques of modern instruments provided a thin and softer sound than modern instruments, and the stress of tuning and playing these instruments led to some warping of their structure. The result of this was the sourcing of additional instruments from Harry Vatiliotis in Sydney, Australia. These instruments were an ancient Greek *kithara*, and a *deccan* harp.

Photo courtesy Moshe Frumin and Australian Jewish Museum.

Frumin designed his instruments based on a combination of research and artistic imagination, a similar process to that of the musical composition. The majority of instruments have some level of description available. When Mr Frumin was unable to obtain a primary description or visual image of an instrument he consulted contemporary Near Eastern archaeological finds to inform his process. In a small number of cases he worked intuitively, imagining what the instrument would have looked and sounded like, by
combining what he felt were its aesthetic and functional requirements. This harp is constructed both from visual image and description (Frumin, 2004: 7).

4.4.4 Example 4: King David’s Harp realisation, Moshe Frumin 2004.
Photo courtesy Moshe Frumin and Australian Jewish Museum.

This harp is built with a wooden detachable base connected to a wooden sound board. Above this two symmetrical deer horns provide the structure of the harp: The horns are not equal in shape or length giving the instrument an ‘imperfect’ appearance. Holes were bored out of the horns with a stone drill and a piece of carved wood was inserted between the holes. Wooden pegs holes were drilled into this piece of wood and cows tendons were twisted and dried to form the strings, which were then attached from the inserted piece of wood to the sound board at the base of the instrument. The instrument contains no modern glues in its construction, and was built without modern tools.
4.4.5 Instruments of Harry Vatiliotis

Two instruments were sourced from Harry Vatiliotis, both were made for Professor Michael Atherton at the University of Western Sydney for the projects *Ankh* and *Melismos* (see Chapter 2). Traditional percussion and wind instruments also supplemented the core of newly-built instruments.

4.46 Additional Near Eastern instruments

During the project the following contemporary instruments were used for the following Second Temple equivalents:

- Wooden and bamboo flutes for the Ugav;
- German zither for the *Asor* (plucked strings);
- Finger cymbals for the *pa’amom*, (bells);
- Medium bossed cymbal for the *selslim* (cymbal);
- Turkish *oud* for the *Kinnor* (plucked strings);
- Turkish *baglama* for the *nevel* (plucked strings);
- Frame drum and a Persian *daff* for the *Tof* (small frame drum);
- Reed organ for the *Magarepha* or *hydraulis* (bellowed);
- Yemenite *shofar* for the *shofar* (ram’s horn);
- Iranian and Turkish *zurnas* for the *Halil* and *Hatzora* (double reeds).

4.5 Case Study 2 Ashir Shirim

Ashir Shirim is a Baghdadi women’s wedding song. While its exact date is unknown, it was first transcribed by Araham Idelsohn a century ago, and has not significantly changed since then. 27 (Idelsohn, 1973, N. 164). In this song a bride, and hence all women are a symbol of the whole nation, able to be fulfilled and redeemed by the prophet Elijah.

---

27 Though the piece has not changed since then this may have been due to the transcribed version being made available to performance artists in the intervening period.
The song shows the simplicity of much Baghdadi Jewish music. The form is strophic and is repeated and ornamented, usually increasing in speed with each repeat. In this version a counter-melody has been scored for the repeat. This counter-melody is an embellishment of a drone displaced up an octave to provide a cut in the woman’s tessitura appropriate for this subject.

Both the tune and counter-melody are played as an instrumental and vocal piece with plucked strings accompanying the voices. It is also apparent, even in a piece such as this, that the rhythm of the text is paramount. Bar 13 inserts a 3/4 bar to keep the textual stress in the correct position.

The scale is also of interest, in this case a variant of Hijaz in D. The piece is centred on the third (F#) seen in bars 1, 7, 12, and 14 in a 16 bar phrase. There is little use of the minor second (Eb) in the lower octave until bar 15, which is the end of a cycle. The scale provides a great deal of interest, leading to the G (bar 8) a tonal centre, that substitutes for the more common A, the secondary tonal centre in most of the piece.

In the recording a significant amount of improvisation takes place. This is in the form of a percussion solo that takes advantage of the fact that this is a celebration. Though scholars have written about the Bible’s seeming disagreement with percussive music this does not mean that percussion was not played in ancient Judea.

The recording of Ashir Shirim concludes with an ululation, where the womens voices rise together in spontaneous joy.
ASHIR SHIRIM

TRAD BAGHDADIAN JEWISH WEDDING MELODY

Voice

Animato

A shir shir rim---la el, be vi wath ha---go---

A yu ma ha te mi ma ba the ne i ma, Hish ge al

na---ge al, E li ya hu ya vo yi ghal A

B shir---- la el wath go--- el, A

shir rim--- la el, be vi wath ha---go--- el A

yu ma ha te mi ma ba the ne i ma, Hish ge al

yu ma ha te mi ma ba the ne i ma, Hish ge al

al, E li ya hu ya vo ghal A

Free intro
Instrumental
Vocal verse X 2
Instrumental
Vocal verse B X 2
Instrumental B
Perc solo
Vocal verse
Vocal verse B
Tutti A and B

© CUNIO 2004
FIRST COLLECTED BY ABRAHAM IDELIOHN

(Cunio, 2004: 26).
4.6 Performance / recordings of the project

A number of performances took place of The Temple Project. They were in October 2004, at the Melbourne International Arts Festival, October 2004 at the Brisbane Multicultural Arts Festival, April 2006 at the Aurora Festival in Sydney, with other performances at the Paddington Uniting Church, Gold Coast Synagogue, Woodford Folk Festival and Australian Jewish Museum. Two versions of The Temple Project were recorded and broadcast on the ABC. The performances at the Melbourne Arts Festival and the Paddington Uniting Church were broadcast on Classic FM and Radio National respectively. ABC Television also featured the rehearsal and performance of The Temple Project in the Sunday Arts Program, November 2004.

A studio recording was made in April / May 2006, with additional editing in October 2007. The disc will be released in 2008.

4.7 Evaluation of the realisation

To some extent The Temple Project should not be evaluated by its chief protagonist. However it is still possible to measure how successfully it responded to its initial brief and premise. Its brief was to investigate and recreate music of this specific period in history, which it did very well. It was received as a work of imagination and substance, partly shown by the support of The Australia Council towards the research and composition of the work. The performance standard was consistent, though the ensemble would have benefited from more time together, always an issue in projects of this kind.

The area that requires the most future work is the instruments themselves. There is scope to commission a series of instruments based on the research of Moshe Frumin. New instruments would be commissioned as playing instruments and would make it possible for a project like this to have an ongoing life. There is also the possibility of realising a great deal more music than is contained in this project.
The research that accompanies this project has been presented at a number of conferences and has been well received; the only contentious note being the questioning of whether this project is suitable for a modern Western concert hall, something that Julia Lester from ABC Classic FM asked Robyn Archer (the Melbourne Festival Director) live on Radio during the broadcast of the work in 2004. I must agree with the answer Ms Archer gave, which is that it must be supported precisely because it is unusual, that such music is an investigation into one of the earliest forms of classical music the world can claim to (ABC, 2004: Broadcast).
Chapter 5  *The Sacred Fire* - Music of Hildegard Of Bingen

5.1  Introduction – a collaboration with soprano Heather Lee

I have worked with soprano Heather Lee for the last 10 years on a large variety or projects from Western classical music to traditional music. Consequently, Lee was an obvious collaborator for part of this project. Lee has had a strong interest in the music of Hildegard of Bingen, and her background in medieval and Baroque music was ideal for this project. Additional collaboration was with Cantillation, a vocal ensemble based at the ABC, and an intercultural ensemble sourced for the project.

The brief for the project from both Lee and the ABC was to create a CD recording of Hildegard of Bingen’s music unlike any other to date. There have been many fine recordings already made in Europe and North America, and while it is possible to broadly match the scholarship, it is difficult to surpass it. However it is possible to take advantage of what Australia offers readily, which is an engaged, highly professional group of intercultural musicians.

It was made clear by Lee, that the vocal line would be performed as written, though there would be some room for ornamentation and harmony (organum), with no strict metre in the vocal lines. Despite this there was enormous room for innovation in instrumentation, texture, and accompaniment. A series of new pieces were also written for the instrumental ensemble.

The music was recorded in February 2006, at the Eugene Goosens Hall, Sydney, and released in May 2007 by the ABC. *The Sacred Fire* has been performed at a number of venues including The Art Galley of New South Wales, December 2007, the Paddington Uniting Church, (Sydney), May 2007, and the Woodford Folk Festival (Queensland), 2004-5.
5.2 Similar projects

This section focuses on recordings of Hildegard’s music made during the last 20 years.28

There are a number of recordings of the music of Hildegard. *A Feather on the Breath of God* (1981) was released in 1984 to popular and critical acclaim. Emma Kirkby was the soloist with an ensemble directed by Christopher Page. This recording created a modern ‘sound’ of Hildegard for a generation of listeners in the English speaking world. The vocal style is trim and very much born out of the English cathedral tradition, where nuance is very light and text sung with very little vibrato. The disc portrays an ethereal otherworldliness that is very appealing.

*Heavenly Revelations, Hymns, sequences, antiphons and responds of Hildegard of Bingen* is sung by the Oxford Camerata directed by Jeremy Summerly. It is an a capella recording, that is also in the English mode of singing. It includes fine choral ensemble and is a very useful reference recording.

The work of Sequentia is probably best known in this field. This is an ensemble entirely devoted to medieval music that has taken a special interest in Hildegard’s output.29 Sequentia has released seven recordings, which cover all of the music of Hildegard.

Even though other ensembles have matched the combination of performance practice and scholarship of Sequentia, none have recorded the entire output of Hildegard. The sound of Sequentia is immediately distinguishable, vocally richer and more open than that of Kirkby and Page and the Oxford Camerata, with an emphasis on small chamber ensembles and solo voices. In addition to this Sequentia were pioneers in the creation of new music in the

---

28 For more detailed information see *The Sacred Fire*, Liner notes, (Lee, 2007: 1-32). The Liner notes also cover aspects of Hildegard’s life and her creative output, which are useful companions in listening to this repertoire.

29 Sequentia was founded by Benjamin Bagby and Barbara Thornton, who died in 1998, of a brain tumour. The ensemble has continued under Bagby and is still working today.
realisation process. New compositions occur in a number of discs, and even in traditional pieces drones are added on a number of instruments.30

Stevie Wishart is another fascinating contributor. Her ensemble, Sinfonie, has made three recordings of Hildegard, which all share innovation and scholarly detail. Wishart worked from original manuscripts, and rehearsed the music extensively with a young choir, taking advantage of the tonality of young voices to make a sonorous and transparent recording. The ensemble rehearsed mostly without scores to achieve a performance style in keeping with that of Hildegard’s order. Wishart has also presented performances through much of Europe with solo singers and instruments including the sinfonye and readers, something that was also undertaken with The Sacred Fire.

A number of recordings and projects deviate from this norm. They include Lux Vivens, a disc made in 1998 by David Lynch and Jocelyn Montgomery, that uses ambient recordings of nature, synthesizers and modern instruments.

Dr Florian Messner has undertaken a fusion project with the music of Hildegard and Indian percussion. While a highly original idea, the premise forces music, which has no written duration into a tight three pulse. Some of the performers in these concerts struggled with the rigidity, while the tabla player Bobby Singh was not instructed to play in any of the medieval rhythmic modes, or in any Hindustani tala.

Possibly the most interesting disc for this project is Mystical orbits Hildegard of Bingen and Birgitta of Sweden with Sufi Poems by Rumi (Dynamo House Melbourne, 2003). This compilation disc contains a number of intercultural performances, including shakuhachi and solo voice, and a wide assortment of beautiful drones. The combining of Hildegard with Rumi sets this disc firmly in the ‘new age’ market, yet the quality of musicianship is beyond the genre and reflects the fact that it is a compilation disc.

30 This body of work was a point of departure for The Sacred Fire, and meetings between myself, Lee and Stephen Grant from Sequentia (May 2004), made it clear that there was still a contribution to be made to this repertoire.
5.3 Intercultural research as the basis for a new realisation

I understand that this CD is loved by reviewers and will not have the audacity to contradict them by saying that "canticles of Ecstasy" is bad. No, it is not bad at all but I recently noticed that it is one of the cds in my collection that I play the least, a fact which led me to reflect on the intrinsic quality of this recording and of this kind of music. The light came when I listened recently to Sacred Treasures II, an album of Russian Orthodox music. I suddenly realized just how "cold" and frighteningly ethereal Hildegard's canticles were compared with those chants from the East. Listening to Rachmaninoff's Vespers was like being nurtured inside the womb of a warm-hearted Russian granny or floating under the golden mosaic figure of the Pantocrator, rejoicing in its strong but tender maleness, while listening to Hildegard's songs was like soaring indefinitely in an icy, mineral space without limits that could either be pitch-dark or totally white. The voices are ethereal but are they still human? (Lights, 2004: 1).

This review on Amazon.com touches on some reasons for a new exploration of the music of Hildegard. We are in an age where the majority of listeners are not interested in a quest for academic perfection, where many instead are after a deep and fulfilling listening experience (see Chapter 2). This reviewer’s experiences are common as there has never been a time when literate listeners have had more access to recorded music.

For these reasons and for the artistic journey itself a project of intercultural research was entered into. The premise was simple. Take the existing music of Hildegard, research what had already been done to it by the finest ensembles (5.2) and extend it culturally in a number of directions.

The specific cultures that mixed in this project were, Benedictine, Germanic medieval culture, (the base culture of this project); Western early music harmony and instrumentation traditions; Persian melisma and instruments, sub-continental Indian instruments and percussion, Burmese percussion, Japanese wind, and new Australian instruments.
5.4 The intercultural composition process

Liner notes for *The Sacred Fire* offer the clearest indication of the intercultural processes in this project.

The culture of melodic embellishment in Near Eastern music informed this realisation process. In much Persian and Arabic music, the melodies can seem quite simple at their first listening. What brings them to life is an exquisite sense of subtlety, where many notes in a phrase have their own departures, or musical ornaments, which contain their own beauty (Lee, 2007: 12).

After identifying this conceptual space for *The Sacred Fire*, the process followed the same basic methodology as *The Temple Project*.

Though the process was not linear it is possible (as with *The Temple Project*) to describe it in three parts. The first is research; the sourcing of material including instruments, and selection of texts and melodies for treatment. The major difference with this project is that this phase had written manuscripts available for consultation. The second part is the playing of instruments, and the writing and arranging of melodic and rhythmic parts including new composition. The third is rehearsal, performance and recording - a process of refining the ‘score’ with the ensemble, of integrating early music and Near Eastern performance practice.

The research involved meeting with academics to ascertain the validity of the process. It also included the sourcing of texts, editions, the comparison of different ‘scores’ of Hildegard’s music, and the preparation of new scores for the project.

The composition of the work involved the selection of music for additional treatment. Harmonic development, through drone-based harmony, suspension and organum was investigated and incorporated into the project. New compositions were written for a specially formed intercultural ensemble, and parts were played with different instruments to choose the appropriate forces.
The performance phase included rehearsal, performance and recording: This was a process of refining the ‘score’ with the ensemble, and integrating early music and Near Eastern performance practice, as with *The Temple Project*. This was a collaborative and experimental recording with ABC Classics, and as such the process was as important as the result. Composition decisions were sometimes made or revised during the recording sessions.\(^{31}\)

### 5.4.1 Artistic speculation in the preparation of modern scores

As defined in Chapter 2, this thesis takes the view that it is impossible and even undesirable to attempt to achieve an ‘authentic’ performance when undertaking an intercultural exploration of this music. Notions of authenticity are themselves misleading when original scores do not contain all the pertinent performance information. The CD liner notes for *The Sacred Fire* state the research case for artistic speculation.

This recording is quite different as it is unashamedly speculative. Most researchers agree that there is no way of knowing whether medieval scores were the end product of the music, or just the beginning. This can be posed as a question: were the neumatic scores of Hildegard’s time an exact replica of what was played, or a clue as to its sound? We can easily ask this question of the Baroque figured bass, the modern song chart, and many other music forms.

Another major question pertains to the vocal sound. Were the women’s voices at Rupertsberg schooled in a modern classical sense? Were they capable of the projection that a modern opera singer is? In both cases the answer is probably no. These were singers who did many other things besides singing. Nevertheless, it can also be argued that the best singers in Europe went to the Church in medieval times, and that the music itself needed a broad technical ability. These women sang a great deal, almost every day, and the performance capabilities of the order must have developed over time (Lee, 2007: 8).

The artistic speculations of this project are addressed throughout this chapter. These speculations include the following:

\(^{31}\) There is an implicit argument in this thesis that the process referred to (research, composition, rehearsal / performance), is worthy of future consideration when realising ancient or medieval music. It employs a consistent and flexible methodology that is suitable for oral and written music.
The exploration of players and instruments from Near and Far Eastern cultures and contemporary Australia (5.4.2); the writing of new composition within pieces to extend the range or texture of existing vocal music (5.4.3); and the writing of new compositions based on melodic fragments and modal scales of Hildegard as well as the setting of a number of Hildegard’s visions (5.5 - 5.7).

5.4.2 Instruments and players in this realisation

An instrumental and vocal ensemble was formed for the project. It played a number of newly composed pieces as well as accompanying the vocal line. The ensemble was featured in TSF1 tracks 1, 8, 9, 13. TSF2 tracks 1, 6, 10, 11, and a number of the vocal pieces.

The vocal ensemble comprised soloists Heather Lee and Mina Kanaridis (intercultural sopranos), Cantillation, actor Rebecca Frith, myself on harmonium, reed organ and voice.

The instrumental ensemble comprised myself playing reed organ, Paul Jarman playing tarogato, a traditional single reed instrument designed and built by Linsey Pollack, that he also describes as a saxillo. Jamal Rekabi played the Iranian kamanche, while Llew

---

32 Lee’s body of work testifies to this label. Her recent recording projects include Buddhist, Jewish, Christian sacred music, Mozart concert arias, and lullabies from around the world. Kanaridis also has a significant body of intercultural work, ranging from performances and recordings with The Renaissance Players, Cantillation and The Song Company.
33 TSF1 tracks 2-7, 9-14. TSF2 tracks, 2-5,7-9. 12.
34 TSF2 tracks 2-5.
35 Male ensemble, TSF2 tracks 7-8. Female ensemble TSF1 tracks 10-12.
36 TSF1, tracks 1,9, TSF2 tracks 6,11.
37 TSF1 track 6,14.
38 Reed organ TSF1 tracks 8,13, TSF2 tracks 1,10. Reed organ / harmonium, TSF1 tracks 4,5-7,9,10-12,14. TSF2 tracks 2-5,6,8,9,11,12.
39 TSF1 tracks 5-7, 8,9,13, 14. TSF2 tracks 1,2-5, 6, 7-8, 10,11.
30 In 1987 Linsey Pollak began designing and making an instrument called the tarogatino, which eventually developed into the saxillo (a single reed conical bore instrument inspired by the Hungarian tarogato). This instrument is like a mellow soprano saxophone made of
Kiek played the Turkish plucked string baglama, and Medieval European plucked string gittern. Bronwyn Kirkpatrick played the Japanese medieval shakuhachi (bamboo flute). Tunji Beier played the daff (Iranian frame drum with metal shakers), frame drum, zarb (Iranian wooden skinned hand drum), tavil (South Indian double sided drum played with covered fingers and sticks), TSF1 track 8, additional bells and cymbals, while Tim Constable played Burmese gongs.

5.5 New composition in the realisation

A significant amount of new composition occurs in The Sacred Fire. This is done in two ways, the writing of new music within existing pieces, and the writing of entirely new pieces. Though this second option seems quite radical it has a great deal of providence. Sequentia are the highest profile ensemble to do this.

Realisations that contain new composition are common in Sequentia recordings. The notes on the Elizabeth Gaver realisation in Voice of the Blood (1995), describe a process of selecting a series of phrases from which to compose.

The following piece in G mode, weaves together both freely and in a stately structure some of the most tender of Hildegard's 8th mode gestures... As this mode in the 12th century was thought to be most indicative of the state of blessedness, wood without the keys. This instrument has developed over Mr Pollak's career as an instrument maker and player. Paul Jarman is one of the foremost players of it. (Pollack, 2007: 1-3).

The kamanche is a four-stringed instrument with a loose horse hair bow played between the knees. Being fretless it is capable of all the subtleties of Persian music, yet it has a range and timbre mid way between early violas and violins. TSF1 tracks 2,5-7, 8, 9, 10-12, 14. TSF2 tracks 1,6,9, 11.

Baglama, TSF2 track 1, gittern, TSF1 tracks 8,13, TSF2 track 10.

TSF1 track 3, TSF2 track 12. Kirkpatrick also played the same instrument in Namu Amida Butsu, the solo shakuhachi piece referred to in Chapter 7.

Daff TSF1 track 13, zarb TSF2, track 1, tavil TSF1 track 8, bells and cymbals TSF1, track 1, 4, 9. TSF2 tracks 6, 11, 12.

TSF1 tracks 2,3,14. TSF2, tracks 7-8, 9.
bestowing upon the listener inner peace and meditative quiet, its effect is to offer comfort (Thornton, 1994: 9).

5.5.1 The writing of new composition within pieces

New composition within pieces includes the writing of organum, the extension of melisma, the adding of rhythmic variance to some pieces, the incorporation of traditional improvisation styles, and the preparing of multiple realisations of texts.

An example of the extension of melisma is in *O Ierusalem aurea civitas*. In this piece after each major phrase 1B 2B etc, the *tarogato* repeats the final phrase of the vocal line. This change of texture has a remarkable effect, firstly of reinforcing the existing word painting within the phrases, and secondly to provide an air of modal progression without having to add any new notes to the score. The majority of phrases either end with a move from the 2\textsuperscript{nd} degree of the scale to the 1\textsuperscript{st}, or the 7\textsuperscript{th} to the 8\textsuperscript{th}.

Examples 5 illustrates the two types of organum used in *O Ierusalem*.

5.5.2 Example 5: Types of organum used in *O Ierusalem*

In *O Ierusalem aurea civitas* organum is explored in two forms, the adding of a harmony down a perfect 4\textsuperscript{th}, such as verse 3a ‘*Nam tu, o nobilis Ruperte*’ and up a Perfect 5\textsuperscript{th} up from the original, verse 5a, ‘*in te symphonizat spiritus sanctus*’. These two devices are achieve very different results, the former reinforces and darkens the melodic line, while the latter is ecstatic, a new melody, suited for emotional or devotional climaxes in the music.

In this example the very first phrase is written at pitch, then repeated with the organum structures used in the realisation, and additionally with an organum triplum.
5.5.3 Types of organum used in *O Ierusalem* Score

(Cunio, 2006: 19).
5.5.3 The writing of new compositions

New compositions used in *The Sacred Fire* are based on melodic fragments and modal scales of Hildegard. They also include the setting of a number of Hildegard’s visions to music with the intercultural ensemble and actor Rebecca Frith. The spoken pieces are simpler than their instrumental equivalents. Each spoken piece has a central theme, which is embellished by the ensemble with some degree of improvisation, recorded while Ms Frith read the text.

The instrumentals are scored pieces that respond to Hildegard’s music directly (the setting of melodies in a new manner), or indirectly (the writing of new music based on modes and motives). The intercultural component is expressed in the liner notes.

The role of text and melody in Near Eastern music is very similar to that of the music of Hildegard. The melody supports the revelation of the text, and is set within a scale that has divine or semi-divine implications. The great difference is the relationship between melody and time. In Near Eastern music both free and rhythmic time co-exist, and rhythm is something to be delighted in. This project experimented with the relationship between tempo, ornament and rhythm. Many of the pieces on this recording are considerably slower than on other recordings. However, the use of Near Eastern ornamental techniques allowed a space in the music to grow, as in the newly-composed *The Sacred Fire*, (TSF1 track 2), which explored ornament itself as the primary mode of melody and accompaniment (Lee, 2007: 12).

One of the features of the new composition is the use of different metre. *O beatissime Ruperte* TSF1, track 13, is a new composition that sets Hildegard’s original music to a metered 3 pulse, to allude to the later European rhythmic modes. The pulse is marked by the Persian *daff*, played in an ecstatic manner by Tunji Beier, which drives the piece and ensemble forward. Ornamentation is scored and the ensemble plays a single melodic line in a manner of a medieval dance.
5.6 Case Study 3: *Dance of Ecstacy*

*Dance of Ecstacy* TSF2, track 1, is one of the most radical pieces in the collection. It is completely new, though it is derived from a number of figures in Hildegard’s music. These include the leap of a 5\textsuperscript{th}, ascending melodic structures from the 5\textsuperscript{th} up to the octave, and melodic fragments that move from the 2\textsuperscript{nd} to the tonic. This melody would sound familiar to listeners of Hildegard’s music except for the following departures.

A strong pulse is written in additive rhythm, giving emphasis to where the words would be in a manner similar to the Near Eastern *maqam*. The additive structure changes the feeling of the music, not allowing the constant pulse of Western music to shape the listening experience.

Further melismatic development occurs, as responsorial melodies are played by an ensemble including *zarb*, *kamanche*, *baglama*, reed organ and *tarogato*.

Temperament has been manipulated in the piece. The 7\textsuperscript{th} is slightly flat (as many of the so called ‘natural’ 7\textsuperscript{ths} of the Near East are), the minor 2\textsuperscript{nd} is smaller, and the 5\textsuperscript{th} is larger. There is room for individual temperaments in the players instruments, shown in the differing tunings between *tarogato* and *kamanche*, *baglama* and reed organ.\textsuperscript{46}

\textsuperscript{46} Rashid Halihal, a Moroccan violinist based in the US commented when seeing the piece that it was like much of the music he grew up with, and that it should be played with great ornament. Halihal was interviewed during a collaboration called *The Thread of Life* where he was part of an intercultural ensemble that played some of *The Sacred Fire* in a concert in New York on November 5, 2006 (Halihal, 2006: 1).
5.6.1 The use of Near Eastern melisma

This piece relies on melisma. For the purpose of this exegesis melisma is defined as a surplus of notes over syllables, (or the innate pulse of a piece - the instrumental equivalent of syllabic pulse). Melisma is something that has innate movement around a melodic centre. Near eastern melisma utilises both microtones and a substantial dynamic range.
Melisma predates both Christian and Islamic music in the Near East, and it has been argued that melisma is more highly developed in Near Eastern musical practice than that of the West, even though parts of the Western canon such as Gregorian chant and motet have well established melisma. In this thesis melisma is a primary composition tool.

The melisma, in its quantity, and in its dynamic range along the time axis, as well as its affinity with other parameters, may contribute both to the musical design of the style of the song and to a certain relationship between music and text (Cohen, Katz, 2005: 189).

In this context Near Eastern melisma means the writing of passages that move around the tonal centre, such as bars 5-8 which present a very simple underlying motif, F - Eb - Db – C, which would take only a bar instead of 4, if not for melisma. In bar 6 at the point where the tune is on an F a melisma of G - Ab – G – F – Eb a Db is inserted before the phrase continues. The end of the phrase is extended to a Bb though it is only functionally intended as a C, and the following phrase also starts on the Bb, creating a melodic link that is both modal and melismatic.

The whole piece is constructed in this manner, and the end provides another clear example. The piece reaches its last functioning moment in bar 32 with a low C, which could easily be the end of the work. However melisma is inserted that starts from the lower Bb – C – Eb – F – Eb – Dd – Eb – Db – C – Bb – Ab – Bb – C, making the end of the piece very languid and deliberate.

5.6.2 Rhythm and accompaniment

Rhythm is provided primarily by the Iranian zarb, which plays with great freedom in the realisation. The zarb has the central role of setting tempo and marking tempi change for the ensemble. An additional rhythmic pulse is provided by the percussive nature of the baglama, which plays drone notes on the 1st and 5th of the scale in addition to the tune itself. This means that rhythm can be both dynamic and responsive, something that is common
with all the new pieces written of the intercultural (instrumental) ensemble. The *zarb* is perfectly suited to this music as it establishes a strong downbeat for each bar, often softening at the later point of the bar with either only one hand playing or by the use of a roll which decrescendos until the end of the bar.

The piece repeats twice in the recording and in both times the *kamanche* only plays from bar 22, which starts almost identically to bar 1, (only one note differs in bars 1 and 22). The repeat allows the *baglama* to move to the foreground, supported by reed organ before a tutti occurs at bar 22.

### 5.7 Case Study 4 *Ordo Virtutum Prologue*

The Prologue to Hildegard’s play *Ordo Virtutum* was selected for an in depth exploration in this realisation. Because *Ordo Virtutum* is such a significant work, it was tempting when planning this project to only record this work, as it is both significant, and long enough to constitute a whole recording. There were three main parameters that were investigated in the realisation of the *Ordo Virtutum Prologue*, the use of multiple realisations of a single text (6.7.1), the use of free and metric time with the same text (6.7.2), and the use of harmony (6.7.3).

#### 5.7.1 Multiple realisations of a single text

The pieces that were written from this realisation process are: *Who are these?* TSF2 track 6, *Patriachs, Prophets and Virtues*, TSF2, tracks 7-8, *Ordo Virtutum – Instrumental Prologue*, TSF2 track 10.

*Who are these?* is a recitation of a translation of the prologue text into English, by Rebecca Frith and the intercultural ensemble. The music is constructed around a very simple descending Dorian fragment G − F − E − D, in which all instruments have the opportunity to improvise as Ms Frith speaks. The *tarogato* is the featured melodic instrument and plays a long phrase with circular breathing at the end of the piece.
"Patriarchs, Prophets and Virtues" is a significant setting of the text and music of Hildegard. A series of Burmese gongs stress the D Dorian scale (with a Bb available to augment it). A massive slightly detuned low E gong thunders the feeling of the piece into newly constructed cadence points before and after the singing, and the Cantillation male ensemble sing the primary text of the prologue very slowly. They then accompany Heather Lee who sings the text of the Virtues over a I–V vocal drone. The men then respond to close the section, before all is repeated with variation (Lee, 2007: 27-28).

"Ordo Virtutum – Instrumental Prologue" is a setting of the same melody for the instrumental ensemble. In this version additive rhythm is used, this time more extensively than in "Dance of Ecstasy." Material that was sombre and austere is now infused with energy. This piece retains the odd lengths of Hildegard’s phrases, as opposed to "O beatissime Ruperti" (TSF1, track 13) which fits the melody into a constant time signature.

In summary all three pieces are completely new pieces of music derived from a piece of source text and score.

5.7.2 Free and metrical time

The "Ordo Virtutum – Instrumental Prologue" is in metric time. The following score shows the first two phrases of original melodic line of Hildegard followed by its instrumental adaptation. This use of metre responds to Hildegard’s music - it is definitely pulsed in a manner similar to the original, yet it is capable of being played ‘in time’. The bars in this example are described as 14/8/ + 14/8/ + 10/8 + 9/8 + 10/8, in the scores of the realisation (Cunio, 2007: 22).
5.7.3 Differing uses of harmony

The *Patriachs, Prophets and Virtues* explores differing uses of harmony. The music itself is repeated and developed in its modified strophic repeat. The first time there is a little harmony, principally a I-V drone from the male choir, the second time this radically changes.

In the repeat (TSF2 track 8) the gongs play through the repeat instead of only at the beginning and end. They provide a type of bass harmony, which has a progression of I- bV1- 1V -11- I (D – Bb – G – E – D). The *tarogato* enters in a melismatic and dissonant manner, pushing towards suspended intervals such as the 2\(^{nd}\), commenting on phrases in the scale, and providing melodic emphasis completely different to the music of Hildegard.
The voices are also different in the repeat. The men sing in organum with the tenors a 5th higher, the reed organ enters with a drone and the texture grows to a tutti culminating with the final refrain of the male choir in organum, with obligato lines for both the female voice and tarogato. The piece ends with the tarogato and gongs, with the tarogato not resolving its final phrase, finishing on the 2nd.

5.8 Performance / recordings of the project


An additional performance of some of the music contained in The Sacred Fire took place in New York in November 2006, for the Foundation of Universal Sacred Music (FUSM, who commissioned Mandala for Dawn, the next piece in this thesis). This took place with an Arabic Israeli ensemble (something not so easily possible in Australia). It offered a most interesting realisation of the music, indicating that the players themselves constitute almost as great a variable as the music itself.

5.9 Evaluation of the realisation

The overwhelming response to this realisation has been positive; during the making of the music, responses from the public, and in the critical domain. What has been most pleasing is that the premise of conjecture (which is argued for in this dissertation) has been largely applauded. The positioning of the realisation by the ABC was also critical. Though it was imagined that The Sacred Fire would be released with a sub-label such as Antipodes, which presents mostly early music, the recording was released on a recently created label called ABC Classics Atmospheres. This positioned the music as an exploration, not a critical edition (Chapter 2.4).
This decision by the ABC was partly made because of an assumption that many people are interested in hearing sacred and religious music outside of its original context. This can be seen in ABC projects such as the *Swoon* series. A realisation such as this offers a listener the opportunity to connect with the spiritual nature of the material without having to engage with the theology behind it. The Sydney Morning Herald Review by John Shand, October 12, 2007 sums this up:

This is multi-functional music of the highest order. The work of the 12th century visionary Bingen has been lovingly reinterpreted by multi instrumentalist Kim Cunio and a cast of expert performers headed by soprano Heather Lee. You can sit and listen and be utterly entranced by the unfolding beauty or use it to create the gentlest of aural ambiences. You can probably even levitate to it, if that’s your thing. If there’s a God, this music is close to the source (Shand, 2007: 27).

Personally I am very happy with the music contained in the recording and live performances. I feel it constitutes a maturing intercultural vision that follows on from *The Temple Project* with a level of assurance. As I produced the recording and undertook all the editing I had a level of control with this project that I do not always have, something that is explored in more depth in Chapter 8.
Chapter 6 *Mandala for Dawn* - New composition and traditional texts

6.1 Introduction

Among the many forms in which the human spirit has tried to express its innermost yearnings and perceptions, music is perhaps the most universal. It symbolizes the yearnings for harmony, with oneself and with others, with nature and with the spiritual and sacred within us and around us. There is something in music that transcends and unites. This is evident in the sacred music of every community - music that expresses the universal yearning that is shared by people all over the globe’ (Dalai Lhama, 2004: 1).

*Mandala for Dawn* plays an important part in this dissertation, as it is the only piece scored for Western concert instruments. Though this thesis is primarily concerned with intercultural music played on intercultural instruments, the instruments of the Western concert hall have an important part to play in such practice, and certainly have done so in Australia. Only two traditional instruments were included in the piece, the *didjeridu*, and sticks, played by Ash Dargan.

Central to this work is the use of traditional texts sung by the choir and soloist. The texts range from a mantra for Green Tara from the Tibetan Buddhist tradition, a quotation of the opening of Hildegard of Bingen’s *De Spiritus Sancto*, and an Indian Yogic mantra.

*Mandala for Dawn* is a piece of programme music, it illustrates a tragic night in which the Australian author and educator Dawn Griggs was brutally murdered on her way to a meditation retreat in India, April 2004. The piece constitutes a mystical narrative of that night - a struggle for acceptance and self realisation that Ms Griggs must have gone through, and a search for transcendence that was at the heart of her journey. 47

---

47 The story itself received considerable publicity in Australia as the murder was brutal, occurring in a vacant stretch of Delhi airport that is well known for petty extortion. The killer, a taxi driver was found within 24 hours, and is currently in prison.
6.2 The Foundation for Universal Sacred Music

At the heart of all religions there are universal core truths and principles which are common to all. While respecting the diversity of religious thought and practice, universal sacred music draws inspiration from our common spiritual ground and encourages the evolution of the various forms of prayer, devotion, meditation, ritual and worship (Davidson, 2004: 1).

*Mandala for Dawn* was commissioned by the Foundation for Universal Sacred Music (FUSM). The FUSM is a not-for-profit organisation that is concerned with music that has a universal message not necessarily tied to a denominational view or belief. This makes it a broad supporter of intercultural music, though it is limited to intercultural sacred music. Pieces commissioned or performed by the by the Foundation include the *Missa Universalis* by American composer Roger Davidson. This work (which removes any mention of the Catholic theology from the mass), has been performed alongside Dave Brubeck’s tribute to the interconnectedness of all life, *Earth Is Our Mother*, as well as works from Europe, the US, Australia, Latin America, and Israel.

The organisation describes its work in the following way:

More is involved, however, in the creation of universal sacred music than our fundamental yearning for the Divine. The repertoire we are creating, preserving and promoting depends on an acceptance of God as the Father and Mother of all humanity. It celebrates the wisdom and truth that the various religions have in common, which can be seen in certain scriptural passages. It also depends on a willingness to reject all beliefs that tend to divide humanity in any way, particularly those that elevate adherents of one religion over another for any reason, or encourage enmity toward people of other faiths. In particular, it acknowledges the eternal and unconditional love of God for us all. This includes the gift that God has given every human spirit - the gift of eternal life, and as many chances as necessary to atone for transgressions and to evolve spiritually to the point at which our will becomes one with God's will (Davidson, 2004: 2).
6.3 The intercultural music festival

It would be possible to describe this festival as a musical interfaith festival. There is one important prescription to this statement, which is that all the music presented was selected and evaluated as art, not religious expression. This is a very important programming consideration that has been expressed lucidly in Australia by Mr Sim Symons, Director of the Queensland Sacred Music Festival on ABC Radio National (Symons, 2001: Broadcast). This is not the type of interfaith where representatives of different religions gather to talk, but instead an attempt to bring together the core essence of teachings, something that Stephanie Dowrick, Australia’s foremost interfaith minister describes as ‘spirituality without borders’ (Dowrick, 2007: 1).

The FUSM has organised two intercultural music festivals, both in New York, in 2005 and 2006. A third is scheduled for April 2008. Each festival has included two concerts of new commissioned music as well as one concert of sacred traditional music, a combination that is relevant to this thesis.

It is uncommon for an intercultural music festival to foster equally contemporary classical and traditional music. The majority of festivals do not mix genres so readily, though similar developments are now taking place in this region.

Organisations such as the Asian Composers League, and the Aurora Festival, have made it possible to include a growing list of traditional or traditionally inspired works in mainstream festivals. There are many tireless advocates for intercultural music in the Asia Pacific region such as Michael Atherton in Australia, Jack Body in New Zealand, and a whole generation of younger composers from ethnically diverse backgrounds who expect festivals to combine traditional practice and performance at the concert hall.48

48 For more information see Chapter 2.
6.4 Featured texts / traditions

The three textual traditions in *Mandala for Dawn* are Tibetan Buddhism, Indian Hinduism and Benedictine Christianity. In addition to this a newly composed text weaves a narrative into the piece.

The following excerpt from the program notes of the concert provides a clear methodology for, and explanation of the texts chosen for the piece.

In 2004 a dear friend Dawn Griggs was brutally murdered on her way to a meditation retreat in India. She had been to India 15 times before. The murder happened in the middle of the night at Delhi airport. Dawn was a very ascended being and many people felt her presence and elevation in the few days after the murder. *Mandala for Dawn* is an attempt to give her soul’s journey a musical and textual narrative through this night, after the physical trauma.

This is through music and mantra to still the mind, especially that of Green Tara, the great feminine transformative force, as well as a yogic mantra to move the mind from the unreal to the real, darkness to light. In the middle section women sing a realisation of the opening of *De Spiritus Sancto*, by Hildegard Von Bingen (1098–1179). There is a triple symbolism in this name for Dawn. It points to the new day, the turning of the eternal world drama and the ascension of Dawn the person (Cunio, 2006: 2).

6.4.1 Tibetan Buddhist Mantra for Green Tara

Tara is widely seen in Tibetan Buddhism as a Bodhishattva of compassion. A Bodhishattva is a being who has taken the Bodhishattva Vow, a decision to postpone their own enlightenment in order to help others achieve enlightenment. In addition to this there is a myth of Tara as descended from the tear of the first Buddha, though she is also part of the pre Buddhist Hindu pantheon of mother Goddesses, alongside Sarasvati, Lakshmi, Parvati, and Shakti. Chinese Buddhists see Quan Ying as the same being as Tara. Tara is paramount to women in modern Buddhism.

There is a true feminist movement in Buddhism that relates to the goddess Tara. Following her cultivation of bodhicitta, the bodhisattva’s motivation, she looked
upon the situation of those striving towards full awakening and she felt that there were too few people who attained Buddhahood as women. So she vowed, 'I have developed bodhicitta as a woman. For all my lifetimes along the path I vow to be born as a woman, and in my final lifetime when I attain Buddhahood, then, too, I will be a woman (Dalai Lama, 1989: 1).

The table below shows the word, the transliteration and the meaning, followed by an excerpt of the score.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>Pronunciation notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Om</td>
<td>om</td>
<td>o with an au combined with the o of ocean.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tare</td>
<td>taaray</td>
<td>a as in father, ray as in ray.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuttare</td>
<td>tootaaray</td>
<td>oo almost as in choose, a as in father, ray as in ray.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soha</td>
<td>sohaa</td>
<td>so almost as so but rounder, aa as in father.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Meaning**

- **Om**: The cosmic sound, body speech mind of TARA
- **Tare**: Invocation of Tara; activation of feminine compassion. The one who ferries us across any suffering.
- **Tuttare**: Activation of this; liberation from vice fear & danger.
- **Soha**: From the Sanskrit svaha, to manifest.

(Cunio, 2006: 2).

### 6.4.2 Example 7: Choir setting of *Green Tara Mantra in Mandala for Dawn*.

The mantra is sung by the choir in a G minor chordal progression of I – V – 1V – I, and is a great crescendo of the piece, with the bass part making a drone based progression. After the repeat a solo voice enters to add a 5th of the G chord, before Figure B, where the lower parts continue to sing the mantra while the higher choir parts and solo soprano start the new text.
The piece repeats later with counter melody, the solo soprano is joined by the first violins in a counter melody, and the choir is offset by horns and strings.

(Cunio, 2006: 2-3).
6.4.3 Benedictine antiphon: *De Spritus Sancto*

*De Spritus Sancto* is one of the pieces contained in *The Sacred Fire* realisation, and it offers a most striking and expansive opening phrase that was perfect for the solo soprano half way through the work. The piece was originally scored only with neumes that offer no rhythmic indication, though in *Mandala for Dawn* the excerpt has been scored metrically.

The words and their translation are below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Words</th>
<th>Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spiritus sanctus</td>
<td>O holy spirit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vivificans vita,</td>
<td>life making liveliness,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movens omnia</td>
<td>influencing all</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The example below shows the original neumatic score in modern notation, as well as the addition of rhythm in the score of *Mandala for Dawn*. It can be seen that even the notes are changed slightly in the setting, such as the end of the phrase where the penultimate G is removed.

The effect of adding rhythm to a text is significant, and this device was not used in the realisation process of *The Sacred Fire*. *Mandala for Dawn* offered the perfect opportunity to use this technique.
6.4.4 Example 8: Opening of Hildegard Von Bingen’s *De Spritus Sancto* and its setting in *Mandala for Dawn*

![Mandala for Dawn notation](image)

(Cunio, 2006: 10).

6.4.5 Hindu yogic mantra

This mantra *Om asatoma sat gamaya*, is both part of traditional Hinduism, and the yogic path. It is a mantra, prayer and kirtan. A kirtan is a devotional call and response music ritual based on the settings of short sacred texts, a use that is appropriate for setting in this work. This mantra is about acceptance, and a consciousness of the soul. Fittingly it is the final work chosen for quotation in *Mandala for Dawn*. While there is a traditional tune for this a newly composed version was written. Below is the original Sanskrit and translation, with the pronunciation below, followed by the scored mantra itself.

**Sanskrit**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sanskrit</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Om asatoma sat gamaya</td>
<td>Lead me from the unreal to the real</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamasoma jyotir gamaya</td>
<td>From darkness to light</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrityorma amratam gamaya</td>
<td>From mortality to immortality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Om shanti shanti shanti</td>
<td>Peace, peace, peace, I am a peaceful soul</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sri gurave namaha         I observe myself, a teacher from within

Pronunciation guide

Gamaya            line 1, is a soft g as in green
Jyotir                line 2, has a liased e on the y
Mrityorma     line 3, has a rolled quick sound
Sri             line 5, is shri

6.4.6 Example 9: Original tune and setting of Om asatoma sat gamaya

There is a stillness in this mantra, seen in its traditional tune which has a small melodic range of only a minor 3rd. Despite this the original tune has a captivating quality, though one that was not suited for this setting, which occurs towards the end of the piece.

There are considerably more forces present than the choir part shown here. The tune is multilayered and lyrical, yet the texture is deliberately dense to provide counterpoint to the lyricism of the soprano line. The excerpt is constructed more as a combination of horizontal lines than as a vertical harmonic setting, such as in the Tara mantra (7.4.2). The theme itself is a reprise of an instrumental motif that occurs a number of times to symbolise moments of transcendent realisation. The setting of it with the voice is to echo that the realisation is actually taking place.

(Cunio, 2007: 1).
6.5 Composition language

The language in *Mandala for Dawn* is not dissonant. Some level of dissonance is reached in the piece through register, which is sometimes scored towards the extremities of range, particularly in the solo soprano part which has many high Cs. There are a few things that do stand out in the work, the uses of drone-based harmony, changeable texture, and an interaction between fully-scored and improvised playing. As already stated, *Mandala for Dawn* is the only piece in the dissertation written for a larger ensemble - an ensemble comprised of modern instruments, different to those of the rest of this thesis.

6.5.1 Moving from a small to a larger ensemble

The ensemble for this work seems at first glance to be slightly odd. It comprises choir, strings, two horns, bass clarinet, solo soprano, Aboriginal sticks and didjeridu. The choir has a substantial amount of divisi, and as such needs a force of at least 24, with 32 or more
recommended. Mandala for Dawn contains thicker textures than the rest of this thesis, which occur in a number of points, such as figure D, which have all available instruments present. Mandala for Dawn is also a departure from some of my recent work, as it is primarily a Western piece. The temperament is equal, there is plenty of vertical harmony in the piece, and it is through composed, something quite different to many of the pieces in The Temple Project and The Sacred Fire, which follow original source or oral material. 49

One feature it shares with the other works of this exegesis is drone based harmony.

6.5.2 The use of drone-based harmony

Drone-based harmony is one way this new work responds to the other pieces in the dissertation. The piece is modal rather than diatonic, and a series of drone points are established on G and D, which are then used in a variety of ways.

One of the ways drone-based harmony is supported is through composition within a mode. This is a device that has been used by many contemporary composers such as Pärt in works such as Fratres and Tabula Rasa. Any note in the scale (no matter how dissonant) can be used at any time when staying in this device. Mandala for Dawn shares an implied, sustained pedal point, described in the program notes to Fratres.

‘In the original version as well as in the cello arrangement the pedal point – the open fifth A-E – was sustained throughout the entire piece’ (Sandner, 1984: 24). There are points in the score where this is obvious, such as the improvised sections played by the didjeridu, and the setting Of Bingen’s De Spiritus Sancto (6.4.3).

Drones or implied drones are shared by many of the forces, at times by the double bass, double bass and cellos, the lower sections of the choir, and even the horns.

49 In 2007 the piece was also rearranged for orchestra and solo voice, with the choral parts given to winds. This combination made the work slightly thicker, and more sonorous than the live recording in which the vocal ensemble struggled with the registers. This is also included in the accompanying recordings.
6.5.3 The composition of new material in this realisation

Unlike the previous two projects nearly all the music in *Mandala For Dawn* is new. As such this work is a response to the earlier research case, not a direct contributor to it. It is intercultural new music, and though it sets texts from a number of cultures it is not a realisation in the manner described in Chapter 2.

A section that is indicative of much of the piece is Figure C. The strings play quavers in small descending phrases that cumulate to create a rhapsodic effect, while the choir sings ethereal ascending scales in a much slower pace. The growth in sound is gradual, the voices periodically jump down part or all of the octave and continue their ascending motion, while the lower parts of the choir sing mildly dissonant intervals to create an unresolved tension. At figure D this resolves in a theme, harmonically similar to the later setting of *Om asatoma sat gamaya* (7.4.4) (Cunio, 2006: 5).
6.5.4 The composition of new material: Score

(Cunio, 2006: 5).
6.6 The interaction between score-based and improvised playing

The instruments that have most freedom in the score are the didjeridu and sticks. Indeed in the November 2006 performance a significant improvisation was added, allowing the didjeridu to play traditional rhythms and interact with the solo soprano at figure E. This is due to a number of reasons. Though it is possible to fully score for these instruments full scoring was rejected in this piece. The following questions were asked when considering the prospect of full scoring: What rhythms should be notated? If it is traditional rhythms, of what Aboriginal nation, and what Aboriginal player? How might permission be sought and received (a process undertaken a number of times in the past)?

The next potential problem was in the reading of a score. Though some Aboriginal musicians, such as Mathew Doyle, are extremely experienced in working with Western scores, the majority prefer not to have to read when playing. Ash Dargan who played the piece in its premiere is a reader, and was able to read the score as written, though he did not want it in any more detail (Dargan, 2006: 1).

Consequently, under-scoring was chosen. In Mandala for Dawn there is interaction between score and improvisation. Though the didjeridu and sticks have complete freedom they must work with the horns and choir who are fully scored. The example below shows the interaction between horns, bass clarinet, didjeridu and sticks.

6.6.1 Example 10: interaction between didjeridu, sticks, horns and bass clarinet in Mandala for Dawn.

The didjeridu enters 5 bars after figure E, which cues a suspension of real time for the next three bars, with the conductor taking a cue from the sticks to signal the resumption of scored time. At this point there is still freedom for improvisation, though the didjeridu and sticks have to play within the notated score, and finish phrases in time with the ensemble.
6.7 Performance / recordings of the project

*Mandala for Dawn* was performed at Merkin Concert Hall, New York City on November 5, 2006, coincidentally the day of the New York Marathon. It is hoped that the piece will be performed again, though it is not uncommon for pieces such as this to only receive a single performance. A live recording was made of the performance and is included in this thesis.

A studio recording of the piece was also made in 2007. In this recording a significant amount of variation was introduced, using some of the production techniques of the earlier projects within this work. These include improvisation, the composition of a new solo line through much of the piece, and the substitution of the choir part for woodwinds. Soprano parts were given to flutes, alto to oboes, tenor to clarinets, and bass to bassoons.

6.8 Evaluation of the composition

It is sometimes difficult to evaluate works such as this in light of a single performance. The rehearsal process was rushed (as with much new music), and the conductor struggled to connect with the score, which was far more transparent than the majority of music in the program. The conductor did not conduct to the written tempos, which also affected the flow of the piece.
The feedback from the performance was generally positive, some sections worked very well, and the players themselves enjoyed the work. The piece was also well received by its publisher, Australian Composers.

The lack of a high quality live recording certainly makes an evaluation more difficult, as I am used to good quality recordings in this digital recording age. Personally I feel that I wrote too many thick textures in the piece, not allowing it to breathe as much as the rest of the music of this thesis. If I revise the work I will certainly look at this in some detail.

In context with the other music of this dissertation *Mandala for Dawn* shows that the intercultural composer can work both with traditional and Western instruments, and that intercultural music can definitely qualify as ‘art music’ - music to be played in a Western concert hall, a key proposition of this thesis.

The process has showed me that I must be careful not to overwrite when working in this manner, and that I must advocate for as much creative control as possible.
Chapter 7  *Namu Amida Butsu* - A solo piece for *shakuhachi*

7.1 Introduction

Traditional honkyoku is a dialogue of sound and silence. The piece begins with silence and then the first breath, which is consciously experienced as it enters the whole body by means of the skin surface coming into the "hara" and then slowly up into the whole of the lungs. There is a slight holding of the breath and then the sound. The sound is entered into, developed, colored and exited, and then with just as much attention the silence is entered into. A seamless connection, unbroken. Silence of breathing leaving the music unbroken sound. The silence then becomes part of the sound as the sound becomes silence. Words only, if not experienced in minute detail in the body; this is the rhythm of the traditional Honkyoku (Brandwein, 1999: 1).

*Namu Amida Butsu* was commissioned by Bronwyn Kirkpatrick. It was premiered in her Masters recital in *shakuhachi*, at the Carrington Ballroom, Katoomba on September 12, 2004. Kirkpatrick had been a student of Grand Master Riley Lee in Australia for the previous six years and was about to embark on a course of study in Japan. Her Masters recital was a milestone in her career, the only available qualification in Australia, as the *shakuhachi* does not currently run as a performance major in the University system.

Ms Kirkpatrick requested a piece of ‘new music’ that would relate to the body of traditional work for the *shakuhachi*, in particular *honkyoku*. It was decided to write a piece for solo *shakuhachi* that would interpret music written for the instrument, and the tradition which it has come from, Zen Buddhism. It is argued in this thesis that contemporary music for the *shakuhachi* is intercultural composition, both in Japan and countries such as Australia.
7.2 Honkyoku and new composition

Honkyoku is a rare music tradition that it is still seen today by many to be a part of a direct spiritual tradition. This affects the way it is played, performed, and received both in traditional and modern settings.

Shakuhachi player and author Christopher Blasdel, writes that the instrument itself comes both from Persian and Chinese influences, and first arrived in China during the T’ang period, a time when mainland China had a great cultural effect on Japan. Confucian court music, Gagaku, was the first style of music for the instrument in Japan, a Celestial Buddhist form, as carvings from the same period show. One of the main features of the art of this period is the flight of Bodhisattvas (see Chapter 7), who move through the clouds that represent a metaphor to true sight, the precursor to enlightenment. By the 12th Century, shakuhachi music was dropped from court life, though it would be thrust into a greater role, part of the ritual of religion itself (Blasdel, 1999: 1).

There is no doubt that the contemporary shakuhachi, the instrument of honkyoku, grew directly from religious practice. The Komuso (wandering priests dated from the Muromachi Dynasty, 1338-1573 CE) used the shakuhachi extensively in their work, and this tradition was vast, reaching many Japanese, and eventually identified it with the Rinzai sect of Zen Buddhism. For hundreds of years honkyoku was informal, regional, and oral.

Sometime during the 18th century, a high ranking Komuso named Kinko Kurosawa was commissioned by the Ichigetsu-Ji Fuke Temple to travel to the various other temples to collect honkyoku pieces. Thus, Kinko spent 3 years on the road and a repertoire of 36 pieces were collected and revised by him (Singer, 2001: 1).

This then is the basis of honkyoku. It is a repertoire of pieces that constitute a deep, mystical music practice that has only travelled to the West in relatively recent times. This music is not intrinsically concerned with the concert idiom or ensemble playing, though the shakuhachi has a proud and long ‘classical’ tradition alongside the shamisen, and koto. Technique is therefore a complex proposition.
It is not enough to practice and master technique or music theory or music sensibility. The inner self must be sought and that arduous and dangerous journey must be embarked upon in a serious, relentless way, sinking into the terror and/or resistance. Then, the possibility of playing true shakuhachi, true honkyoku, presents itself. Honkyoku should be played for an audience that is prepared at least a little to listen, not as one being entertained or amazed, but as one prepared to experience the inner self in a different way. The focus is not on the player and certainly not on showing off the capabilities of the player or of the shakuhachi but on the inner discovery of the listener of the Self as the sound penetrates the skin, the mind, the heart, the inner sanctuary (Brandwein, 1999: 1).

The majority of new composition for the *shakuhachi* is after Word War 2. After Japan’s defeat in the Pacific, contemporary composers looked within to define their own musical output and a form of new music was born that responded to Japanese music traditions. By the 1960s this had matured to a dynamic movement that incorporated the intrinsic nature of instruments such as the *shakuhachi*, and used them with modern instruments whose idioms were often also changed.

After World War II, a new style of music emerged. It was a cross between traditional and Western classical music, and was referred to as "contemporary traditional music." This genre experienced a boom from around 1964. "November Steps," composed by Takemitsu Toru, incorporated the shakuhachi by Yokoyama Katsuya and the biwa by Tsuruta Kinshi with the sounds of a classical orchestra. Shakuhachi master Yamamoto Hozan in Ginkai (Silver World) also tried playing jazz with his shakuhachi. Both of these events created a new form of music that went beyond the framework of East and West, capturing the hearts of the young generation. Many hogaku musicians then in their 40s and 50s decided on their profession after being shocked by this new movement toward contemporary traditional music (Narabe, 2005: 1).

Takemitsu once wrote that his teachers were Duke Ellington and nature, though he later attributed a great debt to Debussy, also as a teacher, who showed him the intrinsic nature of music (Dearden, Sheppard, 2007: 3-4). *November Steps* is surely one of the great intercultural works, and a great work of the 20th Century in any context. Takemitsu shows clearly the great dichotomy that has made contemporary Japanese music so rich - an intercultural perspective within new music practice, a search for identity where the search itself provides the answer.
Although I am self taught, I consider Debussy my teacher - the most important elements are colour, light and shadow" (Dearden, Sheppard, 2007: 3-4).

New music for the shakuhachi is still being written. Composers such as Someh Satoh (born 1947) are also incorporating the instrument and its sounds into Western concert music. Satoh is seen as both a writer of gendai hongaku (new traditional music). He is influenced by Zen and Shinto.

Margaret Leng Tan, a frequent recorder and performer of Someh Satoh’s music has quoted Satoh extensively, asserting that he sees little distinction between sound and silence, something that is influenced by his mystical commitment to Shinto.

Silence and the prolongation of sound is the same thing in terms of space. The idea of living space comes from the Shinto religion, in which natural forces and the physical world are venerated, or worshipped. According to Leng Tan, when Satoh places his music in the context of space and time, he is referring to those categories as understood by Shintoism. The sense of timelessness that some of his music inspires does not correspond to any Western concept, but is closer to the Shinto concept of imanaka… Not just the present moment which lies between the stretch of past eternity and future immortality, but also the manifestation of the moment of all time which is multi-layered and multi-dimensional (unknown author, 2007: 1).

Namu Amida Butsu responds to this concept of Imanaka.

7.3 New shakuhachi composition in Australia

Though composition for the shakuhachi has occurred in many other cultures, a few Australian compositions are pertinent. There are two main types of shakuhachi composition, those from practitioner players, and those of concert composers. In some cases practitioners are both players and concert composers.
The best-known player in Australia, and prolific writer of music for the instrument is Riley Lee. Lee specialises in traditional music, though he has also written a great deal of new music. The majority of his music has been improvisational, responding directly to *honkyoku*. He has recorded over 20 CDs, and a substantial amount of these include new composition, and intercultural collaboration. Lee is a leading figure for the instrument in Australia and internationally, and he has helped to make Australia’s presence in the world of *shakuhachi* relatively large.

Other Australian players include Ann Norman, who has scored works for the instrument, and played in many contexts, from new classical to improvisational, as well as writing and for the *koto*. Another practitioner from Australia is Jim Franklin (who now lives in Germany), a trained composer who studied with Peter Sculthorpe. Franklin plays a leading role in the advocacy for the instrument in Europe, and has investigated the possibilities of the *shakuhachi* in new concert music. A younger Australian practitioner is Bronwyn Kirkpatrick, a former clarinetist, who substitutes for Riley Lee in TaikOz (the Australian intercultural percussion ensemble).

TaikOz have given the instrument a prominent position in the Australian cultural landscape. In 2007 they worked with Meryl Tankard in the Sydney Festival. Riley Lee played extensively in this work, and Synergy percussionist and composer, Tim Constable, wrote new music for this project.

Concert composers such as Liza Lim have written for the *koto* and seriously investigated Japanese notation (*Burning House Part 1*), though two Australian composers are best known for *shakuhachi* concert music, Anne Boyd and Ross Edwards.

Anne Boyd’s *Goldfish Through Summer Rain*, published in 1980, is a poignant work that uses the harp in a manner to suggest the Japanese *koto*, while still taking advantages of its innate timbre. The *shakuhachi* line is fluid, often descending or ascending nearly two octaves in a single phrase. For example the opening moves from a high A to a low C# (the majority of the instrument’s range), before a shaped figure which moves from G# -A again,
then falling to the C#. The scale itself is C# -G -D# -A, evokes stillness. The combination of grace notes in the harp with angular shakuhachi melody is memorable and instils an ‘Australian’ intercultural quality to the instrument, that Boyd’s years of work in South East Asian music helped shape.

The opening shakuhachi line is indicative of the tonality of the piece.

7.3.1 Example 11. Shakuhachi entry in Anne Boyd’s Goldfish Through Summer Rain.

(Boyd, 1980: 1).

Ross Edwards has written a number of times for the instrument. His concerto The Heart of Night, for shakuhachi and orchestra wrote understated lines for the instrument, with light, expressive orchestration. Its 2004 premiere with the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra showed that the instrument is at home in the Australian concert hall. Koto Dreaming, a work for shakuhachi, koto, cor anglais, cello and dancer was written for the Asian Dance and Music Festival in Sydney, 2003. It saw the shakuhachi and koto work together with orchestral instruments - a true intercultural meeting.

An earlier work Raft Song at Sunrise, Shakuhachi solo, written for Riley Lee, is relevant to this thesis. Like Namu Amida Butsu, it is written for the solo instrument. It is idiomatic, adventurous, and focused on Zen.

Raft Song at Sunrise makes its intercultural connotations clear from the beginning. The performance notes start with a quote from Rilke, that suggests Western mysticism and the possibility of the music to transform the player and listener. The notes also advise that this work can be played on any modern wind instrument.
‘Silent friend of many distances, I feel how your breath enlarges all of space. Let your presence ring out like a bell into the night… The Sonnets to Orpheus’ (Rilke, quoted Edwards, 1996: 2).

The first noticeable feature is a lack of barlines. The piece is structured in a non-linear manner, that makes the player examine it phrase by phrase, which opens up the expressive potential of the work. This work explores rhythm in a similar manner to much Honkyoku. The indication of *molto flessibile e espressivo* leaves the player with a great deal of freedom in interpretation. Changing dynamic markings also give the piece a sudden swelling and diminuendo that is akin to traditional *honkyoku*. During the second page of the score repeated semi quaver passages move the music before it changes to slower swelling pianissimo figure from A-F-Eb. Triplet figures introduce rhythmic variety, developed on page 4 with a combination of triplets and sextuplets.

The phrases are always wandering. Deliberate accidentals enter the piece as it develops, stopping the feeling of a fixed scale, a departure from traditional *honkyoku*, which often stays within the scale. There is a combination of flurry and extreme stillness that the following two passages show.

**7.3.2 Example 12 Excerpts of Ross Edwards Raft Song at Sunrise, shakuhachi solo**

(Edwards, 1996: 3, 4).
The opening phrase starts with a crescendo from \( ppp \) to \( f \), with the \( f \) coming in at a rest. This device can be analogised with many of the sutras in Buddhism, such as the Heart Sutra, ‘Form is emptiness, emptiness form’ (Anon, 2007: 1) or the koans of zen, which place seeming opposites together to better understand the non-linear nature of the world.

The opening phrase is in a D Dorian scale, with an emphasis on the 5\( ^{th} \) and 4\( ^{th} \) of the scale. It suggests musical space as dynamics act upon sustained notes and rests. Rests in the middle of phrases also provide a sense of interruption.

The second example moves to a tonality of Eb. A repeated phrase up to the F and then down to the Eb gains momentum through the excerpt, growing in power through dynamic marking, to a crescendo of four Eb semiquavers before another scored rest.

### 7.4 Overview of Namu Amida Butsu

The jailkeeper was ignorance. Clouded by endless waves of deluded thoughts, the mind had falsely divided reality into subject and object. Once the jailkeeper was gone, the jail would disappear and never be rebuilt again (Tich Naht, Hanh, 1991: 121).

*Namu Amida Butsu* (Nembutsu), is a personal response to the search for enlightenment. This is something that has been on my mind as a composer for some time. In the East so much art is not about the relationship between humanity and an external God, like much of the sacred art of the West, but the relationship between our selves and our own minds.

The music of *Namu Amida Butsu* mirrors the calling of the mind to itself, something the Tibetan Lhama Sogyal Rinpoche describes as ‘*bringing the mind home*’, which occurs in the very act of enlightenment itself (Rinpoche, 1992: 56).

*Namu Amida Butsu* is a phenomenon in Zen practice. It is the manifestation of the little things in life, and music is one of those things. The following poem by *In Gassho*, by Kenryu T. Tsuji, gives a clear indication what this practice is concerned with.
In Gassho

The Nembutsu is the sound of the universe.
It is the sound of the wind
as it rustles the leaves;
It is the roar of the waves
as they rush toward the shore;
It is the song of the robin, the whippoorwill
and the chorus of cicadas on a summer evening.

The Nembutsu is naturalness...
The first cry of the baby
as it emerges into the world
from the darkness of the mother's womb;
It is the powerful cry of independence
of individuality, of selfhood;
But it is also the great cry of awakening
to its dependence on something greater than self...
for its sustenance.

The Nembutsu is the proclamation of the Buddha...
Above heaven and below heaven,
I alone am the World Honored One."
It is the ultimate declaration of life;
I alone hold my destiny in my hand
leading to perfect Buddhahood.

When I touch the heart of reality,
It is Namu Amida Butsu...
What else can I say?
When I truly share someone's happiness,
it is Namu Amida Butsu;
And in that moment of deep grief
over a loved one's death,
it is just Namu Amida Butsu.

Namu Amida Butsu...
it is the song of gratitude
not of my finding the Buddha,
but Buddha finding me.’

(Tsuji, 1985: 10).
The beginning of *Namu Amida Butsu* is a proclamation of possibility, which has quite a lot in common with the Edwards *Raft Song at Sunrise*. Though it does not reject metric ties like the Edwards, it asks the player to play freely in regards to time. It has recurring motifs, and angular jumps like the Boyd, and is primarily concerned with melody, not thematic development. Though centred around F it has a secondary tonality of D which is approached from the F above. The 5\(^{\text{th}}\) (C) is only a passing note, a substantial change from much of the previous music of this dissertation which is dominated by the 5\(^{\text{th}}\) and its inversion, the 4\(^{\text{th}}\). The simple performance note, ‘In meditation’, is important, for the music should not be played as an entertainment. It has little tonality, and no immediately apparent virtuosity. The state of meditation is paramount.

### 7.5 Example 13, Musical excerpts of *Namu Amida Butsu*

![Musical notation](image)

(Cunio, 2004: 1).

The piece slowly develops and the intervals become more jagged. The additive nature of the rhythm also expands differently to the Edwards *Raft Song at Sunrise*. This piece is designed to be played relatively ‘in time’, - a response to the strict physical disciplines of Zen which gives the illusion of formlessness through great attention to form itself. The lead up to, and opening of figure B illustrate this change. The piece starts to move, and a melodic flow begins to take shape within the tonality of the opening. At figure B the alternation between 4/4 and 6/4 gives the piece a rhythmic flow that is subtle, yet still regulated.
The piece then moves to the extremes of the instrument with many jumps, using either octave displacement or the intervals of a major and minor 9th. This section represents the yearning desire for enlightenment, and the stage of actively seeking that often comes before surrender. It is introduced towards the end of the first page at the figure D animato. The grace note leaps of a 7th, (bar 46), followed by a 9th, are evocative of much of the piece. This outward focussed section peaks on the high G# (the highest note of Kirkpatrick’s instrument) at bar 53, before retreating at bar 56. The repeated section at bar 56 gives the player the opportunity to internalise.

Figures E and F, represent the transition towards enlightenment and an increasingly introverted state. This peak of this section is bar 70, the end of figure E, where the words ‘Namu Amida Butsu’ are written. They can be whispered, spoken or thought in the
accompanying General Pause. The music is sparse. Long notes are punctuated by recurring grace notes, in the manner of much _honkyoku_. Fermatas are used at the end of every phrase to allow length in the playing.

(Cunio, 2004: 1).

The piece ends with one last flourish at G, the feeling of the Zen Buddhist quote and parable ‘Before enlightenment chop wood carry water, after enlightenment chop wood carry water’ (Anon, 2008: 1). Though everything is outwardly the same after this musical representation of enlightenment, bar 97 is marked ‘with delicacy’. A final point of stillness is achieved at H. The markings are all soft and the note to play ‘breathy’ in bar 102 sets the tone for the final phrase, which is a merging with the cosmos. A _ppp morendo_ at bar 103 makes the final bars as soft as possible.

(Cunio, 2004: 1).
7.6 Scoring methods used

*Honkyoku* can be scored traditionally or with Western notation. This piece was scored entirely with Western notation. A series of meetings with Kirkpatrick were spent listening to *honkyoku* repertoire, and understanding the relationships between the natural world and the music itself. *Honkyoku* effects and techniques derived from them are used in this work.

There is a deliberate decision to under-score one part of the work - its phrasing. Though the basics of the phrasing is dictated by the bars, there are few slur lines for the player. This allows a great deal more freedom in the linking and emphasis of the notes. Time itself is still tightly controlled. A performance note on the bottom of page 1 advises the player to give the duration of a crotchet to a fermata, though there is obviously some leniency in a fermata when compared with a full-scored rest.

7.7 Performance / recordings of the project

*Namu Amida Butsu* was performed at the Carrington Ballroom, Katoomba on September 12, 2004 by Bronwyn Kirkpatrick for her Masters recital in *Shakuhachi*, supervised by Riley Lee. It was recorded on May 2005, at the Brahma Kumaris meditation retreat Centre in Leura, as a meditative performance with no editing. The piece has not been commercially released, though there are plans for it to be incorporated into a disc of new meditation compositions in 2008-9, with the ABC Classics, Atmospheres Label.

7.8 Evaluation of the composition

The response after the performance was very positive, Kirkpatrick spent the time necessary to achieve a good standard, a real achievement as the piece is long and slow, around 15 minutes, a difficult task in a recital. The recording has been heard only by Kirkpatrick, Professor Michael Atherton and myself.
My feeling is that the piece may be too long as a concert piece, and may need to be divided up into 2 separate pieces for performance in a concert setting, or that the theme could be developed with a linking piece written for koto and shakuhachi. I have written for the koto only once, and find it a most satisfying instrument to write for. Satsuki Odamura, an internationally recognised koto player who lives in Australia, is also a great advocate for new music on this instrument.
Chapter 8  Conclusions

8.1 Introduction

This final section of the exegesis reflects on the music of this thesis. It relates this to the notions of belonging and identification that are at the heart of intercultural investigation, the accompanying process of cultural investigation contained in the exegesis, and the potential of such explorations.

This chapter is concerned with whether the individual projects achieved composition and production goals. Did I as a composer do what I set out to do, and what I actually achieved. This chapter also identifies and evaluates the other roles inherent in this music, including those of producer, music director and performer. Music is critically discussed to enable a distillation of the creative experience, which can be expressed in one simple question: what has been learnt in this process? This exegesis and thesis conclude by identifying areas for further research, and music projects to continue this investigation.

8.2 What did I set out to do?

My own interactions with the world have certainly influenced this music. Inherent in the research case of this exegesis is the proposition that we cannot separate ourselves from the larger world, that intercultural music is a manifestation of an increasingly intercultural life (Chapter 2). I set out to prove that I could write new intercultural music without engaging in the authenticity debate, instead arguing for a process of cultural immersion and creative reflection.

I set out to explore these notions through music, and to also make sense of my own identity at the same time. My identity is partly defined by my ethnicity, and culture, and Said’s concept of Otherness (Chapter 2), though it is also defined paradoxically by my life in Australia and what I produce as a composer. Writing a major work that responds to an oral culture I was brought up with (The Temple Project), was a central goal of this thesis, and it
enabled me to reconnect with my own sense of culture. It was also important to me that I undertake the process of intercultural composition as both a traditional custodian and a composer. This process is not unlike the music of many composers who have drawn on aspects of their host culture. Host cultures include textual, musical and oral traditions, all of which I responded to in this thesis.

Another goal was to write music that responds to metaphysical concepts. All the projects do this to some extent, relating this process to another proposition of this exegesis: that intercultural music works best when the protagonists are both participant and observer.

Finally I set out to write intercultural music for an international audience, to make music that contains an inherent production and stylistic quality that will last some time; that is capable of existing in the marketplaces of ideas and art. An important consideration throughout this process was to create music that can be primarily evaluated through recording.

When defining the projects for this thesis I initially had proposed a Western Carnatic (South Indian classical) intercultural symphony as the third part of the thesis. I was committed to this project as it would have afforded the opportunity to explore notions of combining oral and literate music cultures in much more detail, as well as the inherent discipline of working within predefined ragas (scales) and talas (beat cycles). After a year of my candidature it became clear that this project would in fact be a whole thesis in itself, and it would be wiser to leave such a project for Post Doctoral research.

The changing of this part of the thesis to Mandala for Dawn and Namu Amida Butsu was the point at which this thesis took a mature form. The inclusion of two smaller works gave me the opportunity to write less prescriptively, and to work more with the discoveries made in the first two projects, explored in chapters 6 and 7.

The difference was paramount. I had initially imagined finishing with a large work to show technical discoveries and processes formed during this period (an outward focus), in short
much more of a composition showcase. However what actually happened is that I was able to allow the process of participant observation to flow through to my new compositions much more naturally with these last two pieces (an inward focus). In both new pieces I was able to move beyond the realisation (valuable as it is) as a composition tool, and allow myself to write with relative freedom.

With *The Temple Project* I set out to write music that would provide an imaginative yet scholastic recreation of the music of the Second Temple Period, to create a mood of realism in a piece of new historical art. I also set out to write music for both performance and recording, and to record it at a high level.

With *The Sacred Fire* I set out to make an intercultural early music recording that could be referenced for live performances. Specifically I wished to investigate the meeting point between Western medievalism and contemporary Near Eastern tonality. The production goal was to make a recording in an acoustic space with as much uninterrupted playing as possible.

With *Mandala for Dawn* I set out to write a concert piece that would integrate some of the research of the previous two projects. I aimed to write a piece of intercultural programme music that would contain settings of newly written and traditional texts.

With *Namu Amida Butsu* I set out to write a new piece of honkyoku with modern notation. I aimed for a piece that feels contemporary and Australian, yet still refers to the body of traditional Japanese shakuhachi music.

**8.3 What did I achieve, and what did I learn from the process?**

I aimed to write a body of music that constituted my principal areas of research; the realisation process, the investigation of early music, and the writing of new intercultural music.
I feel that the main goals of this thesis have been achieved, though they have been done so through a very different process to that I had anticipated. The principal change to my plans was an expanded role for myself. This ended up including the roles of composer, producer, editor, sound engineer, musical director, and performer (Chapter 1). I did not imagine I would be doing all these tasks when I embarked on this process of intercultural composition. I have found that this multiplicity of roles exists in a great deal of intercultural music, for production budgets are often modest, and additional roles emerge during the process of composition and collaboration.

The majority of this exegesis is concerned with the composition process and its results. However it is not enough to examine the compositions of this thesis alone in this exegesis. The process of recording and performance also needs to be addressed. This needs to respond to the projects as well as making available broad findings for intercultural and early music.

Fundamentally I learnt that intercultural music is a process as opposed to a product. Intercultural music is a way in which cultures meet through music (therefore a process) which may or may not lead to a project outcome. I now strongly believe that an intercultural investigation that does not lead to a quantifiable project outcome can still be a success if it is accompanied by a process of critical self reflection.

There is an implicit argument in this thesis that the process I have referred to in projects 1 and 2 (research, composition, rehearsal / performance) is worthy of future consideration when realising ancient or medieval music. It employs a consistent and flexible methodology that is suitable for oral and written music. I have learnt that this process is valid for many types of music, particularly the two main project outcomes of this thesis, recording and performance.
8.3.1 Recording

The main thing that I have learned from these recording projects is that quality recording is a craft, in the same way that the techniques of composition contain craft that must be mastered. It is also difficult to make a good recording without either a lot of time or a lot of money. For sustainable projects both are required. An adequate budget offers more rehearsal time available to the players, and a greater likelihood of a recording being fresh and succinct. Greater time offers more opportunity for revision, editing, mixing and a general technical mastery of the music.

I have also learnt during my candidature that the general population evaluates intercultural music projects from recordings, not scores, or programme notes, and that a recording has the potential to move many listeners if it is made with high artistic and production values. With the intersection of recording and broadcasting providing a previously unimaginable audience base, recording is now an essential medium for intercultural music.

I feel that the recorded music of this thesis is at an acceptable standard, except for the live Recording of *Mandala for Dawn*. The presentation of good quality recordings is very important to me, and it took a considerable amount of personal time to achieve these production goals. I would have been unable to present quality recordings without a large budget if I did not take on the editing and mixing of the projects. The budgeting for recording these works only extended to the players and engineers for the actual recording sessions, with little money allocated for the long processes of audio transferring, clean up, editing, mixing and mastering. Additional funds were sought for all the projects and even with these funds the budgets were extremely tight.

This difficulty in finding enough money to budget for professional production values must be addressed if intercultural music is to sound as polished as commercially released ‘world’

---

50 This live recording suffered due to a shortage of rehearsal time, and the inability of some parts of the choir to sing what were demanding vocal lines. The conductor also took great liberties with tempi in the performance, which made ensemble work more difficult.
and ‘new classical’ music. Both of these genres are often highly subsidised, either by governments, organisations, or recording labels.

There is one other important consideration, creative control. I believe that the composer needs artistic control in the creation of such projects, and that if creative control is surrendered the intercultural process can be placed in jeopardy.

The composer needs to be present at the recording and editing stages of a recording, and must also have a production ethos to refer to, particularly regarding microphone placement and effects processing. The intercultural composer must know how to edit music to an edit plan, which I define as allowing the selection of a final take of the music to sound as if it is the only recording of the music that was made. Intercultural composers who do not have engineering or editing skills can find themselves at the whim of a producer or recording engineer’s taste or ability. The producer and engineer may have no experience with traditional instruments, non equal temperament and traditional music forms. Further they may use effects such as gating or compression that radically change the sonic nature of the music. The intercultural composer must decide if they want a folkloric, popular, or classical styled recording and know how to achieve it.

The actual medium of recording is crucial. I have found during the compilation of this thesis that I have had to be as informed about audio technology as the engineer in order to make production decisions. Most recording takes place with computers, and the computer platform can have a great effect on the music itself. The most successful and pervasive platform is Pro Tools, a platform I do not favour, as I find it imparts a harsh sound both in its conversion, and with its built in effects.\(^5\) I urge intercultural composers to look beyond the mainstream recording ethos. After a process of research I chose to work on the

---

\(^5\) This is a hotly contested topic in the recording community, as many audio engineers are powerful advocates for the platform. The majority of classical recording does not take place with Pro Tools, it uses either smaller boutique systems, such as Apple’s Logic, or classical music products such as the Merging Technologies Pyramix system, currently used by the ABC, the BBC and many European government broadcasters and recording corporations. I myself have chosen Digital Performer, a software only recording solution, popular with American composers.
Macintosh platform, with components that are typically used in concert hall recordings, as opposed to project studio components. I also insisted on producing every studio recording contained in this thesis.

8.3.2 Performance

I achieved a professional performance with every thesis project, except for some aspects of Mandala for Dawn, something I am very proud of. I felt that every performance should take place in the music marketplace, as a public performance that had to pay for itself through the box office. In a number of cases multiple performances took place, which was beneficial to the music contained in this thesis.

I have learnt that performance is vitally important to the presentation of recorded intercultural music. It is greatly beneficial to perform a work prior to recording it, even when the prime outcome of a work is a recording. It became apparent very quickly that I needed to be the musical director for performances. This is not always going to be the case in intercultural music or realisation projects, but in cases where the composer is the only person to navigate a particular intercultural landscape, a great deal of time can be saved if they are the musical director. If they are not, and if there is a conductor for example, care must be taken to adequately brief the conductor on the implicit sound of the work, and of the subtleties that are difficult to communicate in a written score. The musical director needs to make performance practice clear to the performers, to translate an intercultural composition and realisation to performance.

Performance offers the opportunity for music to be played in real time to an audience who will react spontaneously. A good performance offers intercultural music (which is often experimental) the opportunity to take on a defined sound prior to recording. This is particularly true in the relationship between improvisation and scored music. Performance allows improvisation to become set within a composition while still retaining its live nature.
In the projects of this thesis performance was crucial. *The Temple Project* was performed a number of times prior to its recording, which is reflected in the stable nature of the arrangements and instrumentation. Many of the pieces in *The Sacred Fire* were performed prior to recording, and those pieces that were not performed required considerably more editing after the recording sessions. *Mandala for Dawn* was commissioned for performance not recording, and a full studio recording has not been made, though a studio ‘mock up’ is supplied with this thesis. *Namu Amida Butsu* was also commissioned for performance and the recording was made after the performance of the work.

A good performance depends on adequate rehearsal time, and in this consideration the budget is again important. In these projects there was minimal paid rehearsal time, leading to compromises in the number of rehearsals prior to performance and recording. It is strongly recommended that rehearsal budgets be built into the composition budget of new intercultural music, as the works themselves cannot simply be ‘read’ like historical art music.

The interaction between players of different traditions is also very important. It has been my experience prior to and during the projects of this thesis that merely ‘getting down to work’ on the music is not enough; there has to be a process of cultural sharing that occurs within the rehearsal process. Without such a process (that will often include social activities, particularly the eating and drinking) the music can be inflexible because traditional players will often be quite cautious in how they play in mixed cultural ensembles. Time needs to be found to negotiate issues of intonation, temperament and ornament in the rehearsal process or music will not be adequately prepared prior to performance and recording. Intercultural performance works best when there is a genuine friendship between the players.
8.3.3 Scoring

An intercultural composer can work both prescriptively and descriptively. A prescriptive score contains a set of functional instructions that guide ensemble members in performance and recording. A descriptive score is an accurate description of a process either written before, or revised after the realisation process. It is possible for a composer to combine both in the realisation process. A prescriptive score can be written, the process of realisation can be undertaken, and a descriptive score can be transcribed from the finished process.

Only one score is this thesis is descriptive. *Namu Amida Butsu* was played and recorded directly from the score, and no major departures were undertaken. This is because a specific composition aim in this project was the full scoring of a new piece of *honkyoku*.

The other scores contained in this thesis are not synonymous with the recorded material. They are the direct result of a larger realisation process, which viewed the scores as prescriptive guides. These guides were intended to facilitate the performances and recordings of the players chosen for these projects. It is important to note this because a literal performance of these scores will yield a result significantly different to the performed and recorded material of this thesis.

In this thesis the majority of scores are prescriptive, and no process of later revision or description has been undertaken. This is because I always intended the musical works to function primarily as recordings and performances, not published scores. It is therefore necessitous for myself or any other intercultural composer to enter into a descriptive process if written publication is to take place. This is also required if the musical works are to be performed by players with no relationship to the composer, or by players who are not familiar with the style of music presented.
This process or prescriptive scoring refers to many individual pieces in this thesis. *B’fi Sh’arim* (*The Temple Project* studio recording, track 12) was originally transcribed in 4/4. Though I had heard other Baghdadi elders sing the tune in 12/8, the majority sang it in 4/4, and the initial transcription I made in 2000 was in 4/4. In the rehearsal process the ensemble played the tune in both metres, opting for 12/8, which all the members and myself preferred. As such both the live performance and studio recording of *B’fi Sh’arim* are in 12/8. A descriptive scoring process would have adjusted the score, but a prescriptive process, such as the one I worked with did not.

Leaving scores as prescriptive guides offers myself as a composer a greater scope for self evaluation, and it stops the score becoming a critical edition of the work, allowing the musical work the opportunity to change over time. It also values the unique skills of the players without transcribing them into a finished score.

I have learnt through this process that prescriptive scoring can offer the intercultural composer a great deal of artistic freedom in the realisation process, and that this flexibility can involve all the players in a project.

I have also learnt that this process of prescriptive scoring works better with some musicians than others. Musicians who are comfortable with both reading and improvisation are happiest working with prescriptive scoring. Indeed full scoring can slow down the rehearsal process of traditional music. Conversely symphonic or western classical players who do not improvise are much more comfortable with a fully scored part, and it is possible to write a prescriptive score with some full scoring, such as *Mandala for Dawn*.

The use of different scoring techniques is also an area for further research both for myself and other intercultural composers.
8.4 The development of my own work during this thesis

This thesis has provided an opportunity for critical self examination. This is something that I would not ordinarily allow much time for, as the nature of commission deadlines, and stresses of a freelance career do not afford this amount of reflection.

This candidature has also offered me a chance for me to deepen my understanding of intercultural music practice and the possible uses of the realisation process within early music. It has afforded me the opportunity to trial the twin processes of research based composition and cultural immersion; processes that I have argued are both possible and desirable in the creation of new intercultural music.

I have also had to increase my skills during this dissertation, particularly in regards to the recording and editing of music (8.2). It is not possible (on the budgets afforded in such a candidature) to have projects recorded at an appropriate standard unless significant personal time is spent on such processes. The honing of this craft during my candidature will be very important to my future research.

I also feel that this learning process is not completed and that Post Doctoral research is necessary for both for my creative and critical work.

8.5 Further research

There are many areas for further research. Some relate to the broad principles of intercultural music and the realisation process, while others relate to the projects themselves.

One of the central notions of this thesis is that it is not necessary to enter into the authenticity debate when writing an intercultural realisation if the accompanying research and music is rigorous and creative. It is hoped that other writers will develop, and argue the case for such processes. Chapter 2 has demonstrated that this thesis is part of a varied and
rich array of intercultural expression, and there is little doubt that the processes of globalisation and intercultural exploration are here to stay. An ongoing study of intercultural music is recommended. While Chapter 2 investigates the history of musical intercultural activity, an area for separate research is the intercultural activity of the other performing arts.

It is also imperative that scholars continue to assess the results of globalisation on music practice. This must be done in a number of contexts, and include scholars from the developing world, as this is where the most rapid cultural change is taking place.

There are a number of areas for further research that relate to the projects of this thesis. *The Temple Project* plays a part in the burgeoning research into Eastern Jewish oral tradition, which is a relatively new field of study. Recent research into Baghdadi Jewish oral tradition is not completed, and when the documentation process ends there will be new possibilities for intercultural research and music making. I feel that my own contribution will be as a practitioner, to investigate this music in works that follow on from *The Temple Project*.

It is hoped that research will continue into Western early music and its intercultural possibilities, as expressed in *The Sacred Fire*. There is the scope for a wide ranging work into the migration of instruments and musical styles between medieval Christianity and Islam. The work of Maria Rosa Menoccal into language transmission in medieval Spain needs to be matched with a thorough musical investigation. A similar treatment can be made of many medieval European works, and I am planning a follow-on project in the near future.

Finally there is a major area for research into intercultural composition practice itself. It is a new area of generalisation, broadly defined in this thesis, which calls for a new type of practitioner. I may call this the craft of the informed hybrid practitioner, the composer who takes the time to really investigate and respond to music tradition, who is able to facilitate a music project from genesis to performance and production. It is this that this thesis most urges, the formalisation of the informed hybrid composer – a composer who can act as
composer, performer, researcher, producer, musical director, teacher, and preserver of music practice.

8.6 Intercultural music projects and ensembles

As detailed in this exegesis, there is a rapid growth occurring in the creation of intercultural music. This will certainly continue and there is ample scope for new music in intercultural practice. One advantage of intercultural projects is that there is a potential assumption of equality, something that is very important when different cultures meet.

It is hoped that institutions support the creation of intercultural ensembles. This has already started with Monash University in Melbourne launching its own intercultural ensemble, which opened the 2004 Symposium of the International Musicological Society (SIMS) conference. Such ensembles may exist alongside existing ensembles such as string quartets, and combine staff and students. The Renaissance Players at Sydney University is an early music ensemble that follows this model.

It is possible that organisations such as the ABC may form an intercultural ensemble for projects and recordings. Such ensembles do not need to be prescriptive; they can have changing personnel for different projects as long as a consistent performance and research methodology is formed.

8.7 Conclusions

This exegesis reaches a largely positive conclusion. It reaches this because intercultural music has an innate potential to unite cultures and provide narratives for the whole of society. Intercultural activity has the potential to incorporate myths, legends, and notions of the past and the present into a living synthesis.

This thesis argues that intercultural music can be facilitated and accompanied by an intellectual process (through methodologies gleaned from social science practice such as
participant observation). This process can preserve traditional culture as it writes new music; firstly through notation and transcription, and secondly by giving the practitioners of traditional cultures faith that their music is inherently valuable. Crucial to this notion is that traditional players have control over the intercultural process, and are not exploited by composers, producers or the music industry.

The realisation is a way to creatively treat music from any culture. It offers the advantage of not having to justify every musical decision, though it often can. It is an informed artistic process that takes into account available best practice. A realisation is always new music. It is living and vibrant, music of the present that responds to the past.

The intersection between intercultural exploration and the realisation process is important to the development of early music practice, and this will be increasingly reflected in the production and recording of early music in the future.

Intercultural music will be a reflection of the world it is a part of, and musicians will always play music whatever the larger culture. Though recorded music is now paramount, the 20th century has shown that traditions and the spirit of playing music to an audience will always survive. Despite recent technological changes many people still find the concert or performance experience to be the most important event in their musical lives, and this thesis argues that intercultural music will play a prominent part in live performances as well as recording projects.

Intercultural music may even be less of a ‘fringe’ item in the concert hall as the century progresses, and may be where the new classical and art musics of the 21st Century reside, if the listening base of avant-garde music continues to fall.

It is possible that intercultural music will be studied in music institutions in the same manner that forms such as jazz now occupies, as a new art music, formalised by the first few generations of practitioners. Practitioners will look to intercultural music as a way to make sense of the changing nature of society. Music itself is a mirror into human
consciousness and evolution, and as we evolve as a society intercultural music will have the important role of allowing people to express who they are with both complexity and simplicity.
References


Saul, Reuben. *Interview and Shofar recording*, Sydney, Personal communication, 13 June 2000.


**Scores**


**Recordings**


Articles by the composer referred to in this thesis


Scores by the composer referred to in this thesis


Appendix 1: CD recordings

1.1 *The Temple Project* studio recording, April 2006
1.2 *The Temple Project* live recording, The Melbourne Festival, October 2004
1.3 *The Temple Project* live recording, Eastside Arts, August 2006
1.4 *The Sacred Fire* studio recording, double CD, February 2006
1.5 *The Sacred Fire* live recording, The Art Gallery of New South Wales, December 2007
1.6 *Mandala for Dawn* live recording, The Kaufmann Centre, October 2006
1.7 *Namu Amida Batsu* live recording, Leura, May 2006
1.8 List of tracks referred to in the thesis

**The Temple Project:**

‘T’kiah T’ruah Sh’varim’
‘Masada’
‘Haleluhu Betziltzelay’
‘El Norah Alilah’
‘Z’imru Y’didim’
‘Sh’ma Yisrael’
‘The Ten Commandments’
‘The Priestly Blessing’
‘Ashir Shirim’
‘Halachma Anya’
‘B’fi Sh’arim’

**The Sacred Fire:**

‘O Fragile One’
‘The Sacred Fire’
‘O Pastor Animarum’
‘O Quam Mirabilis’
‘O Vis Aeternitatis’
‘Ordo Virtutum Medley’
‘And it Came to Pass’
‘O Ignis Spiritus’
‘O Beatissime Ruperte’
‘Caritas Abundat’
‘Dance of Ecstasy’
‘O Ierusalem aurea civitas’
‘Who are These?’
‘Partriachs, Prophets and Virtues’
‘De Spiritu Sancto’
‘Ordo Virtutum - Instrumental Prologue’
‘The Soul’
‘O Virridissima Virga’

*Mandala for Dawn*

*Namu Amida Butsu*
Appendix 2: Scores

2.1 The Temple Project, October 2004

Performance notes
In 70 CE (Common Era), the Second Jewish Temple was destroyed. The appalling casualties of the Roman invasion did not just include the innocent loss of life and those killed in resistance, but the destruction of hundreds of years of living culture based at the site of the Temple Mount. In particular a vibrant and flourishing musical culture perished which included one of the great orchestras and choirs of the ancient world. (Descriptions of up to 120 players and 500 singers are recorded). It took very little time for the art of Jewish musical instrument making and performance to be lost – indeed the Rabbis out of respect actively discouraged all forms of instrumental music. Within a few generations Temple music was completely lost, surviving only in descriptions in historical works such as The Talmud. This project follows on from a project undertaken in 2000 to set parts of the Dead Sea Scrolls to the tunes of Baghdadian Jewish émigré communities, for the Art Gallery of NSW Dead Sea Scrolls exhibition in 2000.

The Temple Project is an artistic speculation built upon the foundations of oral chant, archaeological record, and informed speculation from a variety of sources. It is a work of historical art written for, and originally performed with replica instruments from two instrument makers. These were Israeli Moshe Frumin and Australian Harry Vatiliotis.

Some traditional instruments were also used in the performance. It was originally performed by Kim Cunio, reed organ, plucked strings, voice, Heather Lee voice, Anne Hildyard, winds and voice, Andy Rigby, harps, and Tunji Beier, percussion.

For future performances traditional instruments should be used. Harp strings should be gut, and reed instruments should not be fully tempered. Flutes should be wooden or bamboo, not silver. Drone based harmony can be added with a harmonium, shruti box or tampurah. A zurna (double reed), can play the shofar (rams horn), parts in the piece, though a shofar is preferable. Traditional plucked stringed instruments may also play a part in future performances.
**Suggested instruments**

Harp, traditional plucked strings, such as oud and baglama, traditional flutes, traditional single and double reeds, harmonium, percussion, *shofar*, voices.

**Underscoring**

*The Temple Project* is underscored leaving significant room for improvisation and embellishment. Chordal harmonisation should be kept to a minimum, horizontal counter melody is suggested, which is in keeping with the style of the music. Improvisations should be kept within the scale of the piece.

**Percussion**

A traditional improvising percussionist is suggested as scored percussion can rigidify such a work and any improvisation that may take place. A suggested kit includes two cymbals, large and small frame drums, the Persian *dombek* (*zarb*), South Indian *tavil*, (or a medium double sided drum), as well as numerous small bells. A small traditional bass drum can be played with light sticks, and cymbals can be played with brushes.

**Pronunciation**

The Hebrew words have been written out as they sound in Australian English, not the phonetic alphabet. This is both in the word guide and the score. The pronunciation style is that of the Baghdadi Jews, which has a guttural quality to it at times, though the vowels are generally pure. The letter V is usually sounded with at least half a W sound. The suggested vocal sound is a slightly guttural sound on the consonants, mixed with clean melodic intonation and pure vowels. Western vibrato and mask resonances should be sparingly used. The word guide has transliteration and translation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRANSLITERATION</th>
<th>TRANSLATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Halleluha Botsitzley.</td>
<td>Praise the Lord, Psalm 150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halleluah</td>
<td>Praise the Lord (Yahweh)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halelelu el B’kad’sho</td>
<td>Praise the Lord in his sanctuary;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halelelu birklyah uzo.</td>
<td>Praise the Lords power.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh binvurotat</td>
<td>Praise the Lords mighty acts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh Krov g’dloh</td>
<td>Praise the Lords excellent greatness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh B’laykah shofar</td>
<td>Praise the Lord with the shofar, kinnor and harp.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh B’navel Y’chiroh</td>
<td>Praise the Lord with timbrel and dance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh B’tof umachol</td>
<td>Praise the Lord with strings and organs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh B’mirim Y’ugav</td>
<td>Praise the Lord with high cymbals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh B’tzitzley Shamah</td>
<td>Let every living being that has breath</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluheh B’tzitzley Tr’ushh</td>
<td>Praise the Lord.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kol Han’shamah Thaialyi ya</td>
<td>Haleluyah.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haleluyah</td>
<td>(Translation Cunic 2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Norah Alliah.</td>
<td>God of Awesome Deeds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>Refrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(El’ Norah Allah, El’ Norah Allah</td>
<td>(God of awesome deeds, God of awesome deeds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamtz’i iamu M’chilah, B’shaat ha Neilah:)</td>
<td>Grant us pardon as the gates begin to close).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>We who are few look up to you</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M’ta mis’far K’tuim, L’cho ayon Nosirim</td>
<td>We praise you as the gates begin to close</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Umsal’dim B’chilah, B’shaat ha Neilah</td>
<td>Refrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>We expose our souls to you, blot our sins,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shor’chim L’cha nut’sha, M’hay pisham V’hasham,</td>
<td>Our dishonest ways, grant us pardon as the gates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamtz’yiym M’chilah, B’shaat ha Neilah</td>
<td>begin to close</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>Refrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hayai lachem L’sitrah, V’hai’tzaim Mirayerah,</td>
<td>Be our refuge, and shield us from danger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V’yeh’dim L’hod Uglash, B’shaat ha Neilah</td>
<td>Grant us joy and honour as the gates begin to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>close</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honor olam V’rahem, V’chol Lohalit Vlochem,</td>
<td>Refrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asem bahevm P’tilah, B’shaat ha Neilah</td>
<td>Be gracious to us, full of compassion. Judge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>tyrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z’chor Tzidkat avhem, V’hades eth Y’mehem,</td>
<td>and those who make war, as the gates begin to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K’kedem Wuthliah, B’shaat ha Neilah</td>
<td>close</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>Refrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K’na nah sh’nat razon, V’nashair Shaerit Hatzon,</td>
<td>Remember the merits of our mothers and fathers,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L’tiferet Wuthliah, B’shaat ha Neilah</td>
<td>renew us with their spirit and faith as the gates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrain</td>
<td>begin to close</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M’chael Tsar Yisrael, Eliyahu V’y Gabriel,</td>
<td>Refrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base runah han Geilah, Bai Hasnat ha Neilah</td>
<td>Make this year a year of favour, return your</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El’ Norah Allah, El’ Norah Allah</td>
<td>flock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamtz’i iamu M’chilah, B’shaat ha Neilah</td>
<td>To honour and glory, as the gates begin to close</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Refrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Come for us Eliajah and Gabriel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grant our wishes as the gates begin to close</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>God of awesome deeds, God of awesome deeds,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grant us pardon as the gates begin to close</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE TEMPLE PROJECT: WORDS

PSALMS AND HYMNS – SECTION 1, FROM THE HIGH PRIEST – SECTION 2 P. 2

TRANSLITERATION

Z’IMRU Y’DIDIM

Z’immu Y’idim, Z’imnu Y’didim.
Z’immu Y’didim, shi nu la me lech.
Ha ca vod shi’m’hu bay a dat, El har ni nu bi o ha lay
Y’shu ech ha’liu be ma on, Zi’m’nu Y’di dim.
Ko deth rom ma mu ya had. Ray tay va o lam ha va
Hi yot.
L’e’lu nu v’sa vod’L’mal cay nu Zi’m’nu Y’dim.
B’yach kol K’lom hash mil yu, Ha gi de na ha bi yu,
Bi sh’ma hot o la mim V’ayn, Zi’m’nu Y’di dim.
Bay Y’d K’zii Hasa mi yu, Ha gidena Ha bi yu
Bishmahol O la mim V’ayn, Z’immu Y’didim.
Ha ska bai li shay ha vu Bay ya had, Ka hal Ba chu
Ha mai la ii
G’wul Y’modi Oz ya do, Z’imru Y’didim.

TRANSLATION

THE THANKSGIVING SCROLL, DEAD SEA SCROLLS

Sing praise O bowed ones, sing to the king of
(glory), rejoice in the congregation of God, ring out
joy in the tents of
salvation, give praise in the (holy) habitation
(exalt) together among the eternal hosts, ascribe to
our God and
glory to our king,
(Sanc)ify his name with strong lips and mighty

tongue, raise up
together your voice
(at all) times, sound aloud joyful music, rejoice with
everlasting joy
(un)ceasingly, worship in the common assembly,
Bless the one
wonderfully does majestic deeds, and makes known
his strong hand.

FROM THE HIGH PRIEST – SECTION 2

Sh’mah Yisrael
Deuteronomy 6: 4-9
Sh’mah Yisrael Eho’enu Adonay Ehad.
(Baruch Shaym K’vod Malchuto L’dam Vaed.)
V’ a havta eth adonay eloh she b’hol Yavoch
U’vchel ne’eshe ut’chol m’odeshe
V’hayu hadvarim ha’al, ashar anochi
M’t’savcha hayom al’kavecha. V’shinantar
L’vanech v’drabah baam, b’shirtecha b’ravecha,
Uvelek’l techa vederech u’v’ człu’cha u’vkurneche
Uk shar’tam l’oth al ladecha
V’hayu l’oto foth Bain e enecha.
Ukth thav tam al m’zuzoth bethecha
Uvish arecha.

FROM THE HIGH PRIEST – SECTION 2

Hear O Israel
Deuteronomy 6: 4-9
Here O Israel, the Lord is our God, the Lord is one
(Blessed shall be his name for ever and ever)
And you shall love the Lord with all your heart soul
and might,
And these words which I command you on this day
shall be in your heart.
And you shall teach them to your children,
And talk of them when you sit in your house, when
you walk on the way,
When you lie down and when you rise up.
And you shall bind them as a sign upon your hand,
And they shall be as frontlets between your eyes.
And you shall write them on the doorposts of your
house, and on your gates.

Numbers 15: 37-41
Vayomer Adonay al Moshe layom
Daby ay b’na Yisrael V’amarta a leychem, Yhasu
lachem tlzizhi!
Al car’ay biglohem l’korot em y’ha’anu al tzizith
hacanthaph it l’hayloteh,
V’hayah lachem tlzizith un’t’hem oto u’zchartem eth-
kol mizvot

Numbers 15: 37-41
And the Lord spoke to Moses saying
Speak unto the children of Israel and ask them
To make tzizith (fringes) in the ends of their
garments,
Throughout the generations, and they put on the
fringe the colour blue.

168
THE TEMPLE PROJECT: WORDS
FROM THE HIGH PRIEST – SECTION 2 P. 3

TRANSLITERATION
I'vav'chem
V'aharay einschem asher athen zonim ataraychem.
L'maan tizku'ur v'atshem uth kol mitzvothai,
V'ishem K'doshim lai-lochim.
Ani Adonyay Elohaychem,
Asher bozzathri uth shem ma'areiz Mitzroyim l'v'yoth
Iachem lailochoth.
Ani Adonyay Elohaychem.

TRANSLATION
And when you look on this fringe you will remember
The commandments of the Lord, and do them.
And seek not after your own heart and eyes.
Be mindful of My Mitzvoth (righteous actions) and to them.
So shall you consecrate yourselves to your God.
I, the Lord am your God.
You led you out of Egypt, I the Lord am your God.

(Translation Cunio 2004)
The Priestly Blessing Numbers 6:22-27
And the Lord spoke to Moses saying
"Speak to Aaron and his sons saying:
Thus shall you bless the Children of Israel".
Say to them:
"May the Lord bless you and protect you.
May the Lord shine his face upon you and be gracious unto you.
May the Lord lift up his face upon you and give you peace."
And so call my name to the children of Israel.
And I will bless them.


THE TEN COMMANDMENTS EXODUS 20: 1-17
1-11
Va y'ode b'oreh esh kol ha'd varim ha'el l'mor.
Anochi Adonai elohecha asher hotsehicha m'areiz
Mitzroyim b'met beshem.
Le yitfa'ach elohecha asher neve'el.
Lo ha'ash lecha l'shag al panay.
Le ta'avd l'chach esher beshamayim mima'alei v'asher ba'areiz mitzvot Hashem...
Le hinenov b'aricha lecha v'la taa'iz Ki smocho
Adonai elohecha el kanah poked avon avoh al
brenim al shalashim v'al -- riba'im L'sonay.
V'se'achches la'alpaphim l'halaph u'shmone
mitzvot va'sh.

Le Tishu'ot esh Ahem Adonai elohecha lashe'ev Ki lo
y'make Adonai esh asher yash et sh'mo laschaw.
Zachor esh yom hashabath l'kad'sho.
Shesheth yamim ta'avd v'ashah kol m'aftecha.
V'yom hashav'v she'ashtur elohecha lo ki'asah
kol milacha ataah. L'iv'richa u'va'avich ela
'ma'acha u'v'hemelacha v'garisha asher bisharecha.
Ki shesheth yamim asah Adonai esh hashamayim
v'asah he'areiz ech he'eyam ve'ehi el kol asher ba'am
V'anah bayom hashav'v'at'ki am banach Adonai esh
yom hashabath vay kad'shalcha.

159
THE TEMPLE PROJECT: WORDS
FROM THE HIGH PRIEST – SECTION 2, OCCASIONAL SONGS – SECTION 3 P.4

TRANSLITERATION

12-17
Kaba'ud eth avicha v'eth imecha l'ma-an ya-
arichun yimecha al ha-adamah asher Adonay
e'iocha notain iach.
Loh t'itsch.
Loh tinaph.
Loh ta-aneh b'raycha ad shaker.
Loh tahmod b'eth raiecha loh tahmod esteth
rai-echo v'avo'sec va-amsho v'shoros v'hamoros
v'choi asher l'rai-echo.

TRANSLATION

12-17
Honour your father and mother and your days will be long
upon this land, which the Lord has given you.
You shall not kill.
You shall not commit adultery.
You shall not steal.
You shall not be a false witness against your neighbour.
You shall not covet the house of your neighbour, nor their servants,
their animals, or anything of theirs.
(Translation Cunio 2004).

OCCASIONAL SONGS – SECTION 3

Ashir Shirim
Ashir ahrim laael beviath haqgel
Ayuma t'nima beth 'neimah
Hish geel na geel
Elyianu yafo yighai yighal

OCCASIONAL SONGS – SECTION 3

I will sing songs
(Trad Babylonian)
I sing songs to the Lord, to the coming of the liberator.
This daughter is fearful, simple and sweet
Hurry for she shall be saved now.
Elijah will come, and she will be saved.
(Translation Cunio 2004)

Halacha anya.
Halcha anya
D'elkehu evelarti
Barah d'Mitzrayim
Kol dichfin y'hai Vyecheul,
Kol otz nick y'hai V'yitsach,
Hashta ha'cha
L'shana haat-ha'ah B'arah d'Yisrael
Hashta ha'cha av'lah
L'shana haat-ha'ah B'arah d'Yisrael
Nai chorin

Babylonian Chant Erev Pesach (Seder).
Lo! This is the bread of affliction
Which our ancestors ate in the land of Egypt;
Let all those who are hungry, enter.
And eat of this bread,
And let all who see the need.
Come and celebrate the Pesach.
We celebrate it wherever we are.
Next year may we celebrate in the land of Israel.
This year we are only slaves,
But next year, we may be free, in the land of Israel.
(Translation Cunio 2004)

Bi'ti Sharim
Bi'ti s'anim ithroman,
U'b allhay tzaddikim tibarech.
U'b'shon Hasedim ttikadosh.
U'b'kerov k'oslim ithhala.

Babylonian festival chant
By the mouth of the upright you will be exalted,
You will be blessed by the lips of the righteous,
Sanctified by the tongues of the pious,
And in the midst of the holy ones you shall be praised.
DURATION 130

TKIAH TRUAH SH'VARIM

Optional heavy percussion crescendo to accompany each leap to the 5th.

TRAD SHOFAR PATTERN

Voice and shofar
Read the following B'racha before blowing

Baruch atah adonai elochainu melech haolom shehe'yanu viki-imenu v'hi-ganu laz'man hazeh.

Order:

TKiah Sh'varim Truah Tkiah 3 times
TKiah Sh'varim Tkiah 3 times
TKiah Truah Tkiah 3 times
Truah G'dolah Once

Only for the final blowing of the service.
Masada takes its name from the last stand of Jewish resistance based around the Temple.

2 zurnas, 2 shofars, large cymbal, shaken cymbals
Free time
In F Bayati mode

Cymbal introduction, tavil to join at ’10 – percussion to play throughout piece

Zurna entry at ’25: Bb – C – C

Double zurnas repeat theme at ’40

Double zurnas at ’45: C – C – Eb – Db – C – Bb – C

Percussion solo 1’00 – 1’15

Double zurnas and F shofar at 1’15: C – C – Db – Eb – Db – C – Bb – C

1’45 Double shofar in F and Ab play Truah G’dol until 2’10

© Kim Cunio 2004
HALULUHT BETZILTZELAY P. 3 OF 3

S
Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah.

A
Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah.

T
Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah.

B
le lu ya te ha le yah, Kol han' sha mah.

S
te ha kel yah, Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah.

A
te ha kel yah, Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah.

T
te ha le yah, Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah.

B
te ha le yah, Ha le lu yah, Ha le lu yah.

S
molto rit.

A
Ha le lu yah.

T
Ha le lu yah.

B
Ha le lu yah.
DURATION 700-900

EL NORAH ALILAH

TRAD BAGHDADIAN JEWISH

ALLEGRO  Bright

Voice

Long, free vocal verse with instrumental ghosting

A Chorus

B Verse

Repeat chorus/verse at least twice more

C Instrumental

Verse/Chorus times 2 Instrumental

Free long verse with instrumental ghosting

VERSES CONTAINED IN ACCOMPANYING LYRICS SHEET

BAGHDADIAN JEWISH: YOM KIPPUR TUNE, SUNG AT THE END OF THE NEILAH SERVICE. IT IS ABOUT FINDING FORGIVENESS FOR THE SINS OF THE PAST YEAR, AND OPENING THE GATES OF HEAVEN.

CUNIO © 2004 176
Molto Accel e Crescendo

Hrmo.
SH'MA VISRAEL ORDER

HARP AND HARMONIUM LINES ARE NOT SCORED AS THEY ARE PURELY IMPROVISED.
HARMONIUM TO ALWAYS PLAY A D, A DRONE UNLESS STATED BELOW.
HARP TO IMPROVISE SPACIOUSLY ON THE SCALE AND IN BREAKS.

LONG VERSION (16 MIN)

A FLUTE
B CHOIR, NO DRONE OR HARP
C SOLO SOP
B CHOIR
A FLUTE
D SOLO SOP
E FLUTE
F SOLO BASS
B CHOIR, NO DRONE OR HARP
A FLUTE
C SOLO SOP
B CHOIR
D SOLO SOP NO DRONE OR HARP

SHORT VERSION 8' 30

A FLUTE
B CHOIR, NO DRONE OR HARP
C SOLO SOP
B CHOIR
D SOLO SOP
E FLUTE
F SOLO BASS
B CHOIR, NO DRONE OR HARP
D SOLO SOP NO DRONE OR HARP
BIRKATH COHENIM THE PRIESTLY BLESSING

DURATION 600

\[ \text{Voice} \]

\[ \text{Sim for whole piece} \]

\[ \text{Vaiy y' da ber A do Nai el Mo she le mor. Da} \]

\[ \text{ber el A b'ron v' el ba nah le_mor, koth th' va re hu eth b' nai Yis ra} \]

\[ \text{el_a mor luchem. Y' va re ch' cha A do nai v' yish me re cha, ya} \]

\[ \text{el A do nai pa nav e le cha vi hun e cha, Yi sar A do nai pah nav_e le} \]

\[ \text{cha, V' ya sain l' cha sha lom. V' sa mu eth sh' mi} \]

\[ \text{al' be nai Yis ra el, Va a ni e va re chem.} \]

ORIGINALY REALISED BY SUZANNE HAIR VANTOURA
REARRANGED CUNIO 2004
THE TEN COMMANDMENTS

Spoken word, bowed cymbals, cymbals, bowed bells, oud, harmonium

Free time
F Aeolian mode

Bowed cymbal entry in key of C
Harmonium drone in F throughout piece
Double zurna entry in the following lines:

C – C – Db – Eb – Db – C –Bb – C  
C – C – Db – Eb – Db – C –Bb – C  
C – C – C Db – Eb – F – F – F – (Ab) – (Ab) – (Ab)

Oud to play I - V –VIII throughout piece with occasional scalar phrases up to Db

Voice to read text, after every commandment a pause and instrumental, alternating between zurnas, percussion and oud.

At end of text 1’00 instrumental with all parts playing.

© Kim Cunio 2004
ASHIR SHIRIM

TRAD BAGHDAJAN JEWISH WEDDING MELODY

Voice

A shir shir rim la el, be vi wath ha go

el A yu ma ha te mi ma ba the ne i ma, Hish ge al

na ge al, E li ya hu ya vo yi ghal A

shir la el wath go el A

yu ma ha te mi ma ba the ne i ma, Hish ge al na ge

yu ma ha te mi ma ba the ne i ma, Hish ge al na ge

al, E li ya hu ya vo ghal A

Free intro
Instrumental
Vocal verse X 2
Instrumental
Vocal verse B X 2
Instrumental B
Perc solo
Vocal verse
Vocal verse B
Tutti A and B

© CUNIO 2004

FIRST COLLECTED BY ABRAHAM IDELISJON

192
HA LACHMA ANYA
RECOMPOSED BAGHDADIAN PEACOCK LAMENT

Voice

Zuma Inno Freely

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Duration 1400</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Free verse Plainive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Ha lach ma anya

Ha lach ma anya

Ha lach ma anya

Di Long sustained note

di a hu ha eva tu na ta ma B' a rah

De Mitz ra yun

Kol Kol Kol Kol Kol Kol

fin V thai v ye chul

fin V thai v ye chul

Ha sha ta ha cha

L' sha na L' sha na ha bu ah L' sha na ha bu ah L' sha na ha bu ah

ah ha sha ta ha cha de L' sha na L' sha na ha bu

ah L' sha na ha bu ah L' sha na ha bu ah B' ne' cho ri n
B'FI SH'ARIM

TRAD BAGHDADIAN FESTIVAL PRAYER

DURATION 3'00

Play through 3 times. Actually played in 12/8.

1 MP
2 MF
3 MP

CUNIO © 2004
3.2 *The Sacred Fire*, February 2006

All pieces without formal scores are to be performed from modern manuscripts selected for the project. Suggested scores are written or edited by Audrey Eckdahl Davidson, Stephen Grant, Catherine Jeffries, Christopher Page and Marianne Richer. These editions had ornaments, melisma and performance notes added in pencil for this project by the musical director and performers. New scores were written for a number of pieces, which are included below. The following guides can be used with any reputable edition of the selected works.

**C D 1**

**O F R A G I L E O N E**  
*Duration 1’00*

Spoken word and bell  
Free time  

No mode  
Percussion strikes medieval bell 3 times  
Voice reads freely  
© Kim Cunio 2004

**T H E S A C R E D F I R E**  
*Duration 2’15*

Kamanche soprano, gongs in D -C –Bb- G –A  
Free time  

D Aeolian mode  
Semi improvised vocal line with resting points on A and Bb  
All instruments to follow vocal line within the mode  
© Kim Cunio 2004

**O P A S T O R A N I M A R U M**  
*Duration 3’15*

Soprano and Gongs  
Free time  

G Aeolian mode  
Soprano to sing freely from original manuscript  
Gongs to improvise in G minor chord

---

52 See references
O QUAM MIRABILIS  DURATION 6’45

Soprano, shakuhachi, harmonium, cymbals
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

A Mixolydian mode
Soprano to sing as per original manuscript
Shakuhachi to play highlighted passages from score as a solo and ghost vocal line at other places.
Harmonium to play an A – E drone and improvise suspensions of 2nd and 4th at cadence points

O VIS AETERNITATIS  DURATION 18’00

Soprano, baritone tarogato, kamanche
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

Hidden E mode
Soprano to sing as per manuscript
First verse harmonium drone only
Improvised duet between kamanche and tarogato after each verse
After first verse tarogato plays the 5th of an E drone
Tarogato plays the second response section as a solo
After the second response a modal improvisation between harmonium, kamanche, and tarogato
After the final verse the kamanche ornaments around the last vocal phrase

ORDO VIRTUTUM MEDLEY  DURATION 4’00

Reed organ, gittern, kamanche, tarogato, tavil
Metric time

E Phrygian mode
All parts to play as a tutti and follow score.
Tavil to play all rhythmic accents with the ensemble
**AND IT CAME TO PASS**

Duration 5’00

Spoken word, reed organ, kamanche, tarogato, bells, cymbals
Free time

A Phrygian mode
All players to improvise around phrase: A – Bb – C – Bb – A, D – C – Bb – A
Instrumental, voice cue 1, instrumental, voice cue 2 (repeat), instrumental
© Kim Cunio 2004

**OIGNIS SPIRITUS**

Duration 15’30

Soprano, female chorus, kamanche, harmonium
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

F Aeolian mode
Soprano and chorus to sing as per manuscript
Soprano to sing verses as written.
Female chorus to sing all chorus sections as written with addition of organum at 3B and 6B
Organum should be up a 5\textsuperscript{th} in both cases
Kamanche to play variations on F – G – Ab – Ab – Ab, Ab – Bb – Ab – G – G – F, after 1B, 2B, 5A, 6B
Harmonium to play F – C drone with extra bellowing in B sections

**OBATISSIME RUPERTE**

Duration 2’00

Reed organ, gittern, kamanche, daff
Metric time

D Aeolian mode
All parts to play score as written, with improvised ornamentation

**CARITAS ABUNDAT**

Duration 7’00

Soprano, baritone, tampurah, kamanche, tarogato, gongs
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

D Aeolian and Dorian modes
Soprano to sing as per manuscript
Kamanche to ghost vocal line, improvise and ornament each phrase ending
Baritone and tarogato to add organum part of ‘Qui’, 1\textsuperscript{st} time organum down 4\textsuperscript{th}, 2\textsuperscript{nd} time unison.
Gongs to play with kamanche and improvise a phrase before ‘Qui’
Tampurah to play throughout
O BEATISSIME RUPERTE

ANTIPHON FOR ST RUPERT
DENDERMONDE FOL.164

ARR. CUNIO 2006

Leaning slightly on the beginning of the bar

Repeat 3 times, each slower, softer

REALISATION © CUNIO 2005
C D 2

DANCE OF ECSTACY

Reed organ, baglama, kamanche, tarogato, zarb
Metric time

C Locrian mode
Played twice from the score.
1st time all instruments play except for kamanche which enters at figure B
2nd time baglama kamanche and tarogato enter at B
© Kim Cunio 2004

DANCE OF ECSTASY
REALIZATION OF MELODIC FRAGMENTS OF HILDIGARD VON BINGEN

KIM CUNIO

\[ \text{Music notation} \]
O I E R U S A L E M Α U R E A C I V I T A S  
DURATION 23’00

2 sopranos, tarogato, reed organ  
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

G Mixolydian mode  
Soprano and chorus to sing as per manuscript

Verse 1 alternate solo and unison

Verse 2 solo with organum at  
‘Namn tu, o nobilis Ruperte’ down a 4th  
‘O tener flos campi’ up a 5th

Verse 3 solo and organum at  
‘In te symphonizat’ up a 5th  
‘Quod vas decorum’ down a 4th

Verse 4 alternate soprano solos

Verse 5 organum at  
‘Et ita turres tui’ down a 4th  
Unison at ‘Unde vos’

Tarogato to play the last phrase of each verse  
Reed organ to play G – D throughout with suspensions in Verse 4

W H O R E T H E S E  
DURATION 3’30

Spoken word, reed organ, kamanche, tarogato, bells, cymbals  
Free time

D Aeolian mode  
All instruments to improvise on the following motive:  

Instrumental, voice, instrumental voice, instrumental.  
Final instrumental tarogato to harmonise up to the 5th  
© Kim Cunio 2004
PATRIARCHS PROPHETS AND VIRTUES DURATION 10’00

Soprano, male chorus, kamanche, harmonium, gongs
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

D Aeolian mode
Soprano and chorus to sing as per manuscript
Twice through the score

1st time male chorus, solo soprano with male D – A drone, male chorus, languid pulse
2nd time similar vocal parts with tarogato and gong introduction
Tarogato improvise over solo vocal line for duration of 2nd time
Gong and tarogato improvisation to close the piece with a suspended 2nd to finish
Accelerando throughout 2nd time

DE SPIRITU SANCIO DURATION 5’00

Soprano, kamanche, reed organ, gongs
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

G Aeolian mode
Soprano to sing as per manuscript
Kamanche to ornament in G mixolidian mode
Gongs to play implied 1 B-VI, 1V, V harmony at cadence points
Harmonium to play G – D with suspensions at all cadence points
Vocal solo at ‘Et in saecula’

ORDO VIRTUTUM – INSTRUMENTAL PROLOGUE DURATION 1’30

Reed organ, gittern, kamanche, tarogato, frame drum
Metric time

D Aeolian mode
All parts to play as a tutti and follow score. Frame drum to play all rhythmic accents with ensemble.
Last 2 bars repeated with slight rit
**The Soul**

Spoken word, reed organ, kamanche, tarogato, bells, cymbals
Free time

A Phrygian mode
Kamanche solo on lower scale degrees
Solo voice, joined by kamanche at ‘fulfill its function’
Tutti after ‘on earth’
All players to improvise around phrase: A – Bb – C – Bb – A, D – C – Bb – A
Instrumental, voice cue 1, instrumental, voice cue 2 (repeat), instrumental
© Kim Cunio 2004
Soprano, shakuhachi, harmonium, cymbals
Free time with an implied neumatic pulse

G Ionian mode
Soprano to sing as per original manuscript.
Shakuhachi to play highlighted passages from score as a solo and ghost vocal line at other places
Harmonium to play G – D drone and improvise suspensions of 2nd and 4th at cadence points

*The Sacred Fire: Words and Program Notes* 53

**CD1**

1 **O Fragile One** from Scivias
Hildegard von Bingen
Rebecca Frith *voice*, Tunji Beier *bells*

This is a profound statement of what happened during Hildegard’s life. It placed her as an instrument of God, of service to humanity, despite her frail and weak disposition. A medieval bell begins the intonation.

*O fragile one, ash of ash, and corruption of corruption, say and write what you see and hear.*

2 **The Sacred Fire**
Kim Cunio
In D Aeolian mode
Heather Lee *soprano*, Jamal Alrekabi *kamanche*, Tim Constable *gongs*

This newly written piece brings us into the world of this project, and introduces the incredible sound of the Persian kamanche. The kamanche is a four-stringed bowed instrument, very light and small, played between the knees with a loose bow. Delicate lines are passed from voice to the kamanche, and back, with a deep resonance provided by the gongs.

3 **O pastor animarum**
Hildegard von Bingen
Antiphon for the Creator No. 61. In G Dorian mode
Heather Lee *soprano*, Tim Constable *gongs*

This haunting piece shows the range of Hildegard’s melody. It is a tender plea to the divine for inspiration and intervention in our lives.

*O pastor animarum et o prima vox,*
*per quam omnes creati sumus.*
*Nunc tibi placeat ut digneris nos liberare de miseriis et languoribus nostris.*

---

53 The translations and program notes were edited by Natalie Shea, ABC Classics, 2006.
4 O quam mirabilis
Hildegard von Bingen
Antiphon for the Creator, R. fol. 466. In A Mixolydian mode
Heather Lee soprano, Bronwyn Kirkpatrick shakuhachi, Kim Cunio harmonium, Tunji Beier cymbals

O quam mirabilis
est prescientia divini pectoris
que prescivit omnem creaturam.
Nam cum Deus inspexit faciem hominis
quem formavit omnia opera sua
in eadem forma hominis integra aspexit.
O quam mirabilis est inspiratio
que hominem sic suscitavit.

O vis aeternitatis
Hildegard von Bingen
Antiphon, responsory for the Trinity. R. fol. 466. In Hidden E mode
Heather Lee soprano, Kim Cunio baritone, harmonium, Jamal Alrekabi kamanche, Paul Jarman tarragotto

5 Verse
O vis aeternitatis
que omnia ordinasti in corde tuo,
per Verbum tuum omnia creat sunt
sicqu voluisti,
et ipsum Verbum tuum
induit carnem
in formatione illa
que educta est de Adam.

6 Refrain
Et sic indumenta ipsius
a maxima dolore
abstersa sunt.

Verse
O quam magna est benignitas salvatoris,
qui omnia liberavit
quer incarnationem suam,
quam divinitas expiravit
sine vinculo peccati.

7 Refrain
Et sic indumenta ipsius
a maxima dolore
abstersa sunt.

Gloria Patri et Filio
et Spiritui Sancto. and to the Holy Spirit.

8 **Ordo Virtutum medley**

Kim Cunio

Recomposition of Hildegard fragments first recomposed by Audrey Ekdahl Davidson. In E Phrygian mode

Kim Cunio *reed organ*, Llew Kiek *gittern*, Jamal Alrekabi *kamanche*, Paul Jarman *tarragotto*, Tunji Beier *tavil*

*Ordo Virtutum*, The Play of the Virtues, is probably Hildegard’s most striking work. This piece contains a series of modal fragments derived from Hildegard’s music, rewritten with a number of variations. The rhythm in this piece is additive, freely changing, in the manner of speech, and extensive ornamentation has been added. All instruments play the same tune, though they have different points of emphasis. This piece is a precursor to an indepth exploration of the beginning of *Ordo Virtutum* in the second disc.

9 **And It Came to Pass** from Seivias

Hildegard von Bingen

In A Phrygian mode

Rebecca Frith *voice*, Kim Cunio *reed organ*, Jamal Alrekabi *kamanche*, Paul Jarman *tarragotto*, Tunji Beier *bells, cymbals*

*And it came to pass in the eleven hundred and forty-first year of the incarnation of Jesus Christ, Son of God, when I was forty-two years and seven months old, that the heavens were opened and a blinding light of exceptional brilliance flowed through my entire brain. And so it kindled my whole heart and breast like a flame, not burning but warming.*

**O ignis spiritus**

Hildegard von Bingen

Sequence for the Holy Spirit. R. fol. 471. In F Aeolian mode

Heather Lee *soprano*, Cantillation *chorus*, Jamal Alrekabi *kamanche*, Kim Cunio *harmonium*, Paul Virag *conductor*

This masterful work alternates between the solo voice and responsory, and in this realisation a modal refrain is added on the kamanche. This piece, like a number of Hildegard’s, is concerned with the great metaphorical fire, and as the piece moves towards its conclusion the choir moves into organum to further glorify the great fire of light that cuts through all obscurations.

10 **O ignis Spiritus Paracliti**,

vita vite omnis creature,

sanctus es vivificando formas.

Sanctus es ungendo periculose fractos; sanctus es tergendo fetida vulnera.

*O fire of the Paraclete Spirit, the life in every creature’s life, you are holy in giving life to forms.*

You are holy in anointing the dangerously stricken; you are holy in wiping fetid wounds.

*O spiraculum sanctitatis, O ignis caritatis. O dulcis gustus in pectoribus*

*O vent of holiness, O fire of love. O sweet taste in our breast*
et infusio cordium
in bono odore virtutum.

O fons purissime,
in quo consideratur
quod Deus alienos colligit
et perditos requirit.

11 O lorica vite
et spes compaginis
membrorum omnium
et o cingulum honestatis,
salva beatos.

Custodi eos
qui carcerati sunt ab inimico,
et solve ligatos,
quos divina vis salvare vult.

O iter fortissimum
quod penetravit omnia;
in altissimis et in terrenis,
et in omnibus abyssis
tu omnes componis et colligis.

De te nubes fluunt,
ether volat,
lapides humorem habent,
aque rivulos educunt,
et terra viriditatem sudat.

12 Tu etiam semper educis doctos
per inspirationem Sapientie
letificatos.

Unde laus tibi sit,
qui es sonus laudis,
et gaudium vite,
spes et honor fortissimus
dans premia lucis.

13 O beatissime Ruperte
Hildegard von Bingen
Antiphon for Saint Rupert, R. fol. 471. Recomposed and played as an instrumental piece. In D
Aeolian mode
Kim Cunio reed organ, Llew Kiek gittern, Paul Jarman tarragotto, Tunji Beier daff

This piece is one of the radical departures of the project. The antiphon was set to a rhythmic three-
pulse, something of which there is no record at the time. The ensemble plays the vocal tune with a
sense of acceleration and wonder, to personalise the virtues of this little-known saint who was so inspirational to Hildegard. The Persian daff drives the rhythm forward, and at the end of the piece, the penultimate phrase is heard in two places with a brief canonic burst.

_O great, auspicious Rupert,
you who blossomed in life,
you who were free from the vice of the devil.
You left this pained world,
now help us in the memory of God,
Alleluia.

14 _Caritas abundat_  
Hildegard von Bingen  
Antiphon to the Holy Spirit No. 16. In D Dorian mode  
Heather Lee _soprano_, Kim Cunio _baritone_, tampurah, Jamal Alrekabi _kamanche_, Paul Jarman _tarragotto_, Tim Constable _gongs_

The Holy Spirit is Karitas, a female figure who came to Hildegard in repeated visionary experiences. Karitas is a divine feminine energy that can bring peace and love to all. This is an energy that is divine, fiery, omnipresent, and imbued with virtue, a force that can help the mortal to soar to the heavens, beyond their bodies, into the cosmos. To support this visionary experience the last two lines are sung twice. The first time, the female voice sings down the fourth while the male voice and tarragotto take the original melody in organum. The second time all are in octaves to glorify this great force. The Indian tampurah provides a luscious and providential drone to exemplify the sense of wonder.

_Caritas abundat in omnia,_  
de imis excellentissima super sidera,  
atque amantissima in omnia.  
Quia summo regi osculum pacis dedit.  
_Euouae._  

_Caritas abounds in all beings,_  
_most excellent, from the depths to high above the stars,_  
_most loving in all things._  
_For to the highest king she gives the kiss of piece._  
_[World without end. Amen.]_
CD2

1 Dance of Ecstasy

Kim Cunio
Newly composed piece based on Hildegard’s modal fragments. In C Phrygian mode
Kim Cunio reed organ, Llew Kiek baglama, Jamal Alrekabi kamanche, Paul Jarman tarragotto, Tunji Beier zarb

This newly composed piece is another great adventure. It takes individual fragments of Hildegard’s writing and weaves them with new phrases to make an instrumental realisation that could never have been played in Rupertsberg. It explores the lines of communication between east and west, and the intonation is much more Near Eastern, a sound that may well have reached parts of Europe in the 12th and 13th centuries. The dance features the Turkish baglama, a seven-stringed instrument with moveable frets.

O Ierusalem aurea civitas

Hildegard von Bingen
Sequence to St Rupert, R. 474-475. In G mode
Heather Lee soprano, Mina Kanaridis soprano, Paul Jarman tarragotto, Kim Cunio reed organ

O Ierusalem is one of Hildegard’s master works. It is on a scale otherwise unknown in her work, and has a grand textual and musical narrative. There are two main themes in the work. The first is Jerusalem, the city of Gold, the mythological place where all is pure, where the spiritual kingdom of God is still cherished. The second is St Rupert, the patron saint of Rupertsberg, a little-known figure apart from Hildegard’s own writings. Rupert, a blessed man, is described as an embodiment of peace, renouncing the worldly life to help others. Rupert is significant because the act of glorifying him also glorifies the woman’s community at Rupertsberg. As the work builds, the boundaries between the two images blur, Jerusalem and Rupert are mentioned together, and Rupert becomes a small part in the foundations of the physical and mystical Jerusalem.

O Jerusalem, city of gold, graced with royal purple, edifice of utmost bounty, your light is never darkened.

Your beauty shines in the dawn light and the sun's blaze.

In these, noble Rupert, you gleamed like a gem, so that you cannot be obscured by fools, just as the valley cannot hide the mountain.

Jerusalem, your windows
cum topazio et saphiro
specialter sunt decorate.

In quibus dum fulges, O Ruperte,
non potes abscondi tepidis moribus:
sic ut nec mons vallii,
coronatus rosis, liliis et purpura,
in vera ostensione.

O tener flos campi
et o dulcis viriditas pomi,
et o sarcina sine medulla,
que non flecit pectora in crimina!

O vas nobile,
quod non est pollutum,
nec devatorum
in saltatione antique spelunce,
et quod non est maceratum
in vulneribus antiqui perditoriis –

3 In te symphonizat spiritus sanctus,
quia angelicis choris associaris,
et quoniam in filio dei ornaris,
cum nullam maculam habes.

Quod vas decorum tu es, o Ruperte,
qui in puericia
et in adolescentia tua
ad deum anhelasti, in timore dei,
et in amplexione caritatis,
et in suavissimo odore bonorum operum!

4 O Ierusalem, fundamentum tuum
positum est cum torrentibus lapidibus
quod est cum publicanis et pecatoribus
qui perdite oves erant,
sed per filium dei invente
ad te cucurrerunt
et in te positi sunt.

Deinde muri tui
fulminant vivis lapidibus
qui per summum studium
bone voluntatis
quasi nubes in celo volaverunt.

5 Et ita turres tui, O Ierusalem
rutilant at candent per ruborem,
et per candorem sanctorum
are adorned wondrously
with topaz and sapphire.

As your brightness, Rupert, shines in them,
you cannot be obscured by the moribund,
just as the valley cannot hide the mountain,
crowned with roses, lilies and purple
in a true vision.

O tender flower of the field
and sweet green of the apple,
O fruit with no bitter core,
enticing no heart into crime!

O noble vessel,
that remains free from stain,
not consumed
in the dance in the ancient cave,
not destroyed
in the attacks of the ancient plunderer –

The Holy Spirit makes music in you,
for you belong to the chorus of angels,
and because you are made beautiful in the Son of God,
and have no blemish.

What a beautiful vessel you are, Rupert,
you who in your childhood
thirsted for God, in fear of God,
and in the embrace of love,
and in the softest perfume of holy works!

O Jerusalem, your foundations
are set with burning stones,
that is, with publicans and sinners
who were the lost sheep
but, found by the son of God,
rushed to you
and have found their place in you.

Thus your walls
flash with living stones
which, through the highest exercise
of good will,
soared like clouds in the heavens.

And your towers, O Jerusalem
shine red and white through the redness
and whiteness of the saints,
et per omnia ornata membra Dei, que tibi non desunt, o Ierusalem.

Unde vos, o ornate, et o coronati, qui habitatis in Ierusalem, et o tu, Ruperte, qui es socius eorum in hac habitacione, succurrite nobis famulantibus, et in exilio laborantibus.

So all you who, adorned and crowned, reside in Jerusalem, and you, Rupert, their friend in this habitation, come to the aid of us servants who labour in exile.

6 Who Are These?
Hildegard von Bingen
Ordo Virtutum: Prologue. In D Aeolian mode
Rebecca Frith voice, Kim Cunio reed organ, Jamal Alrekabi kamanche, Paul Jarman tarragotto, Tunji Beier bells, cymbals

The opening section of the Ordo Virtutum, the Play of the Virtues, is explored in great detail in this project. On this second disc it is heard as a reading [6], as a vocal piece [7-8] and as an instrumental track [10], to show how many permutations are possible with this music. Here, two completely different voices enter the stage, the Patriarchs and Prophets, and the Virtues, who set up a great contest for the soul, and indeed the whole of humanity, that is at the core of this work. A simple four-note refrain punctuates the spoken word, and soars towards the heavens. Later we hear the same text in sung in the original Latin, but for now the immediacy of its meaning in English is striking. We are meant to be arrested, as we must be before a meeting with the devil, that comes later in this work. (The English text is printed next to the Latin in the next track.)

7-8 Patriarchs, Prophets and Virtues
Hildegard von Bingen
Ordo Virtutum: Prologue, R. fol. 478-481. In D mode
Heather Lee soprano, Cantillation chorus, Paul Jarman tarragotto, Kim Cunio harmonium, conductor

This major work, written in 1151, is one of the first musical dramatic works in Western history. The text has strong and emotional connotations throughout and the music is highly original, moving from the tonic to the fifth and up to the octave in most of the pieces. It was classed as an ordo (a rite) by Hildegard, which gives a clue to its performance. It is not meant to be understood in just an intellectual capacity; it is more an active ritual, where each performer and listener has the opportunity to relive the moral struggle to which Ordo Virtutum refers. The work strikingly refers to souls imprisoned in bodies, a highly developed cosmological understanding that is beyond a mere morality play.

Patriarchs and Prophets:
Qui sunt hi, qui ut nubes?

Who are these who come like the clouds?

Virtues:
O antiqui sancti, quid admiramini in nobis?
Verbum, Dei clarescit in forma hominis,

You, holy ones of old, why do you marvel at us? The word of God grows bright in the shape of man,
et ideo fulgemus cum illo, 
and thus we shine with him, 
edificantes membra sui pulcri corporis. 
building up the limbs of his beautiful body.

Patriarchs and Prophets:
Nos sumus radices 
We are the roots 
et vos rami, 
and you are the branches, 
fructus viventis oculi, 
the fruit of the living eye, 
et nos umbra in illo fuimus. 
and we were shadowed in him.

9 De Spiritu Sanctor
Hildegard von Bingen
Antiphon to the Holy Spirit. R. fol. 466. Sung in G Aeolian mode
Heather Lee soprano, Jamal Alrekabi kamanche, Kim Cunio reed organ, Tim Constable gongs

This antiphon shows Hildegard as a visionary composer. It is consistently high in the voice, and makes technical demands on the singer throughout the piece. Every main phrase starts with this leap of a fifth, followed by an ascending scale up to the octave. In this treatment the mysteries have been heightened by the use of musica ficta (feigned music), the use of an accidental note (outside the scale), to make the music more beautiful and to distance the piece from the intervals of ugliness, including the diminished fifth, the interval of the devil.

Spiritus sanctus vivificans vita, 
The Holy Spirit, life-giving life, 
movens omnia 
moving all things, 
et radix est in Omni creatura 
is the root of all creation, 
ac omnia de immunditiia abluit, 
washing away all impurities, 
tergens crimina. 
clearing all accusations 
ac ungit vulnera, 
and anointing wounds, 
et sic est fulgens ac laudabilis vita, 
and is thus shining and praiseworthy life, 
suscitans et resuscitans omnia. 
awakening and re-awakening all things.


10 Ordo Virtutum – Instrumental Prologue
Hildegard von Bingen
R. fol. 478-481. In D Aeolian mode
Kim Cunio reed organ, Llew Kiek gittern, Paul Jarman tarragotto, Tunji Beier frame drum

We return to the start of Ordo Virtutum for the last time. The free and languid sections of ‘Patriarchs, Prophets and Virtues’ have now been set to an additive rhythm that matches the neumatic phrase lengths with changeable time signatures. It is surprising how natural this music sounds in an instrumental context, and proves what a difference instrumentation and tempo make to the realisation process; as the sombreness of the original is now imbued with a transcendental quality.

11 The Soul
Hildegard von Bingen
Vision 4: 103. In A Phrygian mode
Rebecca Frith voice, Kim Cunio reed organ, Jamal Alrekabi kamanche, Paul Jarman tarragotto, Tunji Beier bells, cymbals
The visions of Hildegard are startling for their clarity and lucidity, placing humanity firmly within the divine order, and offering great hope for the salvation of the individual, through their own divine spark. Some are very grounded relating to matters on the physical plane; this vision, however, connects humanity through the soul to the greatest of powers.

The soul surrounds the human body with flesh and blood to fulfil its function, just as the blowing of the wind ripens fruit on earth.

We recognise God through our fiery soul and our body functions through the sacred spirit. The soul is the lady of the house, God has formed the human body only that the soul may live in it. No-one can see the soul, as no-one can see God.

The soul creates the thoughts of God And places them into our heart.

The soul nourishes, regenerates… Though not of flesh and blood it serves them. The soul is from God, body and soul exist as a work of God everywhere, in every respect.

12 O viridissima virga
Hildegard von Bingen
Sequence for the Virgin, R. fol. 407. Sung in G mode
Heather Lee soprano, Bronwyn Kirkpatrick shakuhachi, Kim Cunio harmonium, Tunji Beier cymbals

In this piece Hildegard takes the image of the Virgin Mary, and makes it crucial to the renewal of all humanity. It is the fertility and radiating love of the Virgin that allow all of earth to function, and bring a divine link from God, through humanity to the animal and vegetable kingdoms. Mary is a great instrument of the divine, and Hildegard’s joyful belief in this shows in this soaring work. The end of the piece, starting with Deinde facta est, expresses incredible rapture, yet is written with great tenderness. A conception of great subtlety.

O viridissima virga ave, que in ventoso flabro sciscitationis sanctorum prodisti.

Cum venit tempus quod tu floruiest in ramis tuis; ave, ave fuit tibi, quia calor solis in te sudavit sicut odor balsami.

Nam in te floruit pulcher flos qui odorum dedit omnibus aromatibus que arida erant.

Hail, O greenest branch, born in the sweet airs of the saints’ prayers.

Now the time is come for your branches to blossom; hail, hail to you, because the heat of the sun sweated in you like a fragrance of balsam.

From you came a beautiful flower which gave perfume to all the herbs that were dry.
Et illa apparuerunt omnia
in viriditate plena.

And these all appeared
in their full greenness.

Unde celi dederunt rorem super gramen
et omnis terra leta facta est,
quoniam viscera ipsius
frumentum protulerunt,

Then the heavens sent down dew onto the grass
and all the earth was made joyful,
because its womb
brought forth grain,

and because the birds of heaven
built their nests in it.

Et quoniam volucres celi
nidos in ipsa habuerunt.

Thus food was made for man,
and great was the rejoicing of those who ate;
Hence, sweet Virgin,
in you no joy is ever lacking.

Deinde facta est esca hominibus,
et gaudium magnum epulantium;
unde, o suavis Virgo,
in te non deficit ullam gaudium.

Eve rejected all this.

Hec omnia Eva contempsit.

But now let us give praise to the Highest.

Nunc autem laus sit Altissimo.
NAMU AMIDA BUTSU
To the Buddha of Limitless Light

Kim Cunio

Shakuhachi

In meditation

Shak

p

Shak

mp

Shak

accel.

Shak

mf

Shak

Preparing for extraversion

Shak

mp

Shak

1st time mp 2nd time mf

Shak

Animato

Shak

Stringendo

Cresc.

Shak

1st time mp 2nd time mf

Tempo only approximate, insert gaps between phrases as needed. Fermata to equal at least 1 crotchet length.
The jailkeeper was ignorance. Clouded by endless waves of deluded thoughts, the mind had falsely divided reality into subject and object. Once the jailkeeper was gone, the jail would disappear and never be rebuilt again. Thich Nhat Hanh