OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS AND EMPLOYMENT STRATEGIES:  
A MULTI-METHOD STUDY OF TEACHER RECRUITMENT ISSUES IN 
AUSTRALIA

Wei Guo

Bachelor of Arts (Linguistics) (2003)  
Harbin University of Science and Technology (Harbin)  
Master of Arts (Linguistics) (2005)  
Changchun University of Science and Technology (Changchun)

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy

24 August 2009

Centre for Educational Research  
College of Arts,  
University of Western Sydney
Acknowledgements

In the three years of PhD study, I received advice, support, and assistance from many people. I must acknowledge my deepest thanks to my principal supervisor, Professor Michael Singh. To be a PhD student of Professor Michael Singh is a sweet pain. His unstinting devotion helped me to open windows, one-by-one, to answer my many questions about both my research and my life in Australia. My advanced academic English proficiency developed, through his patient and extensive written feedback; he also encouraged me to develop my bilingual competence through knowledge of advanced academic Chinese. He helped me achieve a qualitative leap in my research competence from what now feels like zero to a stage where I can now analyse evidence, relate it to theoretical concepts, and structure an extended argument informed by considered explanations. His positive feedback and inspiration helped me learn how to write research papers and to better understand how to represent my research in my writing. Chinese has a saying, ‘Ming shi chu gao tu’, which means ‘a great teacher produces a brilliant student’. Of course, this is just a saying. As a great teacher, Professor Michael Singh has been very successful in enlightening and mentoring me to broaden my research vision. But as a student, I am still trying to be ‘brilliant’ to match my ‘great teacher’. The best proof is half of my hair becoming grey, from being black just three years ago.

I also thank my two co-supervisors, Dr Carol Reid and Associate Professor Wayne Sawyer. They provided me their wide-ranging knowledge and wise advice for this thesis. I must acknowledge special thanks to Dr Carol Reid, who provided opportunities for me to be involved in the ARC research project she led. Being able to work on this nationally significant project as a research assistant greatly helped me to learn how to gather and interpret research evidence, to learn about team-based research, and to learn a little about research partnerships and competitive external grants. I also thank Professor Jock Collins, from the University of Technology, Sydney, for the chance to work for him as a research assistant, undertaking data entry and analysis. I also thank the Centre for Educational Research, University of Western Sydney for providing conference and seminar participation funds, office space and associated facilities.
I would also like to give my thanks and deepest love to my parents and wife; they always provided me with financial support, spiritual inspiration, and kindness—they did this unconditionally, no matter whether I was in good times or bad.

Thanks to the survey and interview participants, who provided solid and unreserved evidence for this thesis.

Finally, I would like to thank officers from the NSW DET and the NSW Teachers Federation for the kind support they provided.
Declaration

I declare that, except where due acknowledgement has been made, this research is my own work and has not been submitted in any form for another degree at any university or other institution of tertiary education. Information derived from the published or unpublished work of others has been acknowledged in the text and a list of references is given.

..................
Wei Guo
24 August 2009
# Table of Contents

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................... V
LIST OF FIGURES ........................................................................................................ VI
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ........................................................................................ VII
ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................... VIII
AUTHOR’S BIO-NOTE ............................................................................................... X
AUTHOR’S PUBLICATIONS ......................................................................................... XI

CHAPTER ONE: RECRUITING OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS:
FINDING GROUNDS FOR HOPE............................................................................... 1

1.0 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................. 1
1.1 RESEARCH PROBLEM .................................................................................... 2
1.2 BACKGROUND: OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH LITERATURE ....................... 3
1.3 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK ........................................................................... 6
1.4 RESEARCH METHOD ...................................................................................... 7
1.5 THESIS STATEMENT ...................................................................................... 10
1.6 THESIS STRUCTURE ...................................................................................... 10

CHAPTER TWO: TRANSNATIONAL LABOUR FLOWS, THE
AUSTRALIAN TEACHERS’ LABOUR MARKET AND RECRUITMENT OF
OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS: REVIEW OF THE RESEARCH
LITERATURE ................................................................................................................ 13

2.0 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................ 13
2.1 TRANSNATIONAL LABOUR FLOWS ............................................................. 14
2.2 THE TEACHER LABOUR MARKET IN AUSTRALIA ........................................ 20
  2.2.1 Teacher shortages ...................................................................................... 20
  2.2.2 Teacher recruitment and retention ............................................................ 24
  2.2.3 Victoria’s recruitment of teachers ............................................................. 30
2.3 RECRUITING OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS ..................................... 32
2.4 PROBLEMS EXPERIENCED BY OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS ....... 36
  2.4.1 Employment and qualification barriers for overseas trained teachers ....... 36
  2.4.2 Acceptance barriers for overseas trained teachers .................................. 40
  2.4.3 Language and other barriers for overseas trained teachers ...................... 44
2.5 CONCLUSION .................................................................................................. 46

CHAPTER THREE: FIELD, HABITUS, CAPITAL, AND CITIZENSHIP: A
CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR THEORISING OVERSEAS TRAINED
TEACHERS’ EXPERIENCES ..................................................................................... 50

3.0 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................. 50
3.1 FIELD—THE SPACE OF PRACTICE .............................................................. 52
3.2 HABITUS—THE LOGIC OF PRACTICE .......................................................... 58
3.3 CAPITAL—THE INSTRUMENTS OF PRACTICE ............................................ 62
  3.3.1 Cultural capital ......................................................................................... 64
  3.3.2 Social capital ............................................................................................ 71
  3.3.3 Symbolic capital—a recognised power .................................................... 75
3.4 CITIZENSHIP .................................................................................................. 78
List of Tables

Table 2.1: The ageing teaching population in Victoria (June 2001) ......................... 22
Table 5.1: Overseas trained teachers approval process and acceptable qualifications ................................................................. 150
Table 5.2: Reasons for immigration ........................................................................ 156
Table 6.1: Various barriers for the overseas trained teachers ................................. 198
Table 7.1: Minimum language requirements for OTTs from NESB countries ....... 208
Table 7.2: Milestones in NSW DET’s Pre-employment Programs for overseas trained teachers .......................................................................................................................... 217
Table 7.3: Comparison of the on the OTTP reports of 1996 and 1998 ................... 222
Table 7.4: Outcomes and achievements of the OTTP from 1996 to 1997/1998 ..... 224
Table 7.5: Personal suitability requirements in PeP ................................................. 232
Table 7.6: Evidence on PEAT .................................................................................. 243
Table 7.7: Issues and themes in interview evidence on support .............................. 246
Table 8.1: Support issues for the overseas trained teachers .................................. 276
Table 8.2: Issues and themes in interview evidence on self adjustment ............... 281
Table 9.1: Interactions between research questions, finding, themes and key concepts ............................................................................................................................. 295
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Components and relationships in the research design............................... 8
Figure 2.1: Key concepts concerning overseas trained teachers ............................... 47
Figure 3.1: Using two languages to multiply the meaning of key words in Bourdieu's work................................................................. 78
Figure 4.1: Chinese BBS discussion about quantitative and qualitative research methods................................................................. 90
Figure 5.1: Gender of survey participants................................................................. 130
Figure 5.2: Country of origin of the OTTs............................................................... 131
Figure 5.3: Age range of the OTTs................................................................ 131
Figure 5.4: Qualification of teaching areas .............................................................. 132
Figure 5.5: Curriculum of the OTTs in secondary areas.......................................... 133
Figure 5.6: Reasons for overseas trained teachers coming to Australia ......... 138
Figure 5.7: Period of arrival in Australia for OTTs ............................................. 147
Figure 5.8: Qualifications of the OTTs................................................................ 151
Figure 5.9: Years of teacher tertiary training of OTTs ........................................... 152
Figure 6.1: Difficulties faced by the OTTs .............................................................. 162
Figure 6.2: Strengths the OTTs bring into Australia ............................................ 172
Figure 6.3: Have the OTTs experienced unemployment in Australia .................. 177
Figure 6.4: When did OTTs first start teaching in Australia................................. 192
Figure 6.5: Place of first Australian teaching job .................................................. 192
Figure 6.6: Current teaching locations of OTTs ..................................................... 193
Figure 6.7: Employment status of OTTs............................................................... 193
Figure 6.8: OTTs’ self-evaluations of English skills............................................ 195
Figure 6.9: Discussion on Bourdieu's cultural reproduction theory and education system................................................................. 200
Figure 7.1: Useful features of the induction program............................................. 234
Figure 7.2: Bourdieu and his works................................................................. 245
Figure 8.1: Satisfaction rate for various forms of support for the OTTs .......... 252
Figure 8.2: How the OTTs solve the difficulties ............................................... 253
Figure 8.3: Who gives the most valuable support to OTTs? .............................. 275
Figure 8.4: Discussion of Bourdieu's concepts of forms of capital..................... 279
# List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ARC</td>
<td>Australian Research Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTRP</td>
<td>Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEEWR</td>
<td>Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIAC</td>
<td>Department of Immigration and Citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFL</td>
<td>English as a foreign language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELSA</td>
<td>English Language Skills Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENSOL</td>
<td>Employer Nomination Scheme Occupation List</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IELTS</td>
<td>International English Language Testing System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISLPR</td>
<td>International Second Language Proficiency Rating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOTE</td>
<td>Languages Other Than English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCEETYA</td>
<td>Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MODL</td>
<td>Migration Occupations in Demand List</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW DET</td>
<td>New South Wales Department of Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW DSE</td>
<td>New South Wales Department of School Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW TF</td>
<td>New South Wales Teachers Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOOSR</td>
<td>National Office of Overseas Skills Recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTT</td>
<td>Overseas Trained Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTTP</td>
<td>Overseas Trained Teacher Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACCS</td>
<td>Professional &amp; Colloquial Communication Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEAT</td>
<td>Professional English Assessment Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PeP</td>
<td>Pre-employment Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGCE</td>
<td>Postgraduate Certificate in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOL</td>
<td>Skilled Occupation List</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TESOL</td>
<td>Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

The research project reported in this thesis investigated the experiences of overseas trained teachers in metropolitan and non-metropolitan areas of New South Wales (Australia) in order to better understand their search for employment as teachers and the nature of the work of those employed as teachers. It is in this sense that this thesis explores issues troubling policy-makers in Australia regarding the attraction and retention of teachers.

This thesis began by reviewing current knowledge in the research literature about overseas trained teachers, as well as problems experienced by overseas trained teachers. The literature reviewed was not limited to Australia but also drew on research from other English speaking countries. In terms of theory, this research project used concepts from the work of Bourdieu (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) to argue and interpret the evidence. For instance, the participants in this study were interpreted as being ‘positioned’ as overseas trained teachers with ‘cultural capital’ and ‘habitus’ in the New South Wales (NSW) ‘education field’. These concepts helped afford a better understanding of the interactive relationships between overseas trained teachers—the practice subjects—and the specific education ‘field’: what kinds of ‘strategies’ were taken by both parties in the struggle for dominant ‘positions’ in the field? Sassen’s (1998, 2006) concepts of citizenship and digital network also helped to interpret the evidence of global labour mobility.

Both qualitative and quantitative research methods were adopted in this study, which included surveys, semi-structured interviews, and policy analysis. The surveys provided statistical data about the overseas trained teachers’ demographic features and details about their experiences overseas and in Australia. The interviewees were selected from those survey respondents who indicated their interest in providing more information through specific questions. Policy documents were also collected for policy analysis. The data collection and analysing processes were based on principles of validity and reliability to ensure rigorous outcomes.

Through analysing this evidence, this study found that family reasons and lifestyle change were two main incentives for the overseas trained teachers coming to NSW,
rather than professional development. However, due to the lack of a single national recruitment and registration system, the overseas trained teachers in this study who had already passed the nation’s skills recognition process, or who had registered as teachers in other States, had to re-register in NSW. This set up registration barriers. There were gaps between the needs of the overseas trained teachers and the State education authorities. Work locations, qualifications and work experience were the focus of additional barriers. The requirements emphasised local work experience, which marginalised the qualifications and knowledge of overseas trained teachers. The overseas trained teachers also experienced identity struggles, insofar as they were treated as both beginning teachers and experienced teachers. Importantly, this research found that collegial support networks were effective for helping newly arrived overseas trained teachers to adjust to the NSW education culture. With sufficient professional help, those overseas trained teachers with good English proficiency were able to adjust into this new work environment.

On the basis of these findings, this thesis argues that there are various barriers in the NSW public education system, restraining overseas trained teachers with considerable knowledge from getting involved in the system. And this leads to the loss of qualified overseas trained teachers who actually can bring benefits to the NSW education system. It is argued that failing to carry out efficient overseas trained teacher recruitment and employment strategies has a negative effect on this state’s ability to make transnational knowledge connections.
Author’s Bio-note

I was born in Changchun, a north eastern city of China which is famous for its automobile manufacturing—Volkswagen and Audi. Australians might know Changchun from the film *The Last Emperor*, as it was the home of the Japanese puppet emperor of Manchuria, Pu Yi.

In 2003, I entered Changchun University of Science and Technology to pursue a Masters degree. My major was English Language Linguistics. In the same year, I began my career as an English language teacher. Through my experience of serving as a full-time teacher, I learned how demanding the teaching profession is, and how much teaching can contribute to my own learning. These valuable experiences not only brought me an immense sense of success, through feeling the joy of teaching, but also intensified my interest in pursuing postgraduate studies. Working in a university as a lecturer for three years, I was eager to learn and to improve myself as a scientific educational researcher. Here I use the contentious term ‘scientific educational research’ to mean undertaking rigorous, evidence-driven, conceptually informed research; I use this term to distinguish it from the practice of just reviewing the research literature.

Through my research at the Centre for Educational Research at the University of Western Sydney from 2006, I hope to contribute to a better understanding of the problems inherent in overseas trained teachers’ experience of migration and seeking work in a new country. This research has been developed through a study of various literature, including that relating to overseas trained teachers and teacher shortages, research methods, and sociological theories of culture. Further, this research has benefited from extensive discussion with huge amount of written feedback, especially corrective feedback from my principal supervisor, Professor Michael Singh. I have found that investigating the social, educational and cultural issues facing overseas trained teachers from the Asia Pacific region is a very important research problem. This study has enabled me to explore the cultural, historical, and educational factors that influence the work/life trajectory of overseas trained teachers.
Author’s publications


CHAPTER ONE

RECRUITING OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS: FINDING GROUNDS FOR HOPE

Your mission is to find ground for hope—to find a way of life that will give our people hope. … People come to accept the status quo because they have lost faith in the possibility of anything better. They do not believe in what we stand for and we do not know what that is. What alternative can we offer and why would it be better? For what cause can we fight and demand the necessary sacrifices? We know what we are against, but what are we for? … You give us hope, but you never thought it part of your task to see whether that hope was justified (Lukes, 1996, pp. 21-22).

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Quality research is expected to provide credible evidence through rigorous ‘scientific exploration’, broadly understood. When relevant to education and to the issue of teacher supply, it can give education policy actors, including overseas trained teachers hope to address the problems of teacher supply, recruitment and induction, so as to make the current situation better. However, sometimes education participants choose to stay where they are rather than changing, as they are afraid of facing unpredictable outcomes. Policy actors can pretend not to see the truth because they recognise that they may be held accountable for change. Education policy actors may hope researchers will come up with answers that ‘sidestep’ awful truths and provide them with an ‘out’. One area that is least understood is that of transnational mobility. Education policy actors have yet to grasp the impact that this mobility is having on education systems. Thus the hope, in this instance, might be for researchers to clarify what this means and to contribute to transforming education systems.

This Chapter outlines the key elements in this thesis. First, it provides an explanation of the research problem, associated questions and a definition of key terms. This is followed by an account giving the background to the thesis in terms of an overview of the recent research literature on this research problem. The third and the fourth
sections provide explanations of the theoretical concepts and research methods used in this study, including the conceptual tools, data collection, analysis procedures, and research ethics. This Chapter concludes with a statement of the thesis and an overview of how it is developed through the ensuing chapters.

1.1 RESEARCH PROBLEM

For myself as a globally mobile knowledge worker, the problem and associated questions that form the focus of this thesis are deeply personal yet universally relevant. The global movement of knowledge workers raises important issues for nation states including the rights of these workers, the responsibilities of their employers and broad issues related to social inclusion. This section introduces the research problem, associated questions and definitions of key terms related to the global mobility of knowledge workers. This thesis reports the results of an investigation into the movement of teachers from all over the world into New South Wales (NSW, Australia) in order to better understand the experiences of overseas trained teachers (OTTs) working or seeking work in metropolitan, rural and regional areas. This thesis aims to address the following research questions:

1. What is the nature of the agents that might explain why and how OTTs come to Australia?
2. What are the key attributes of the field of current NSW Government strategies for employing OTTs?
3. What role does misrecognition play in the problems faced by multicultural Australia with regard to integrating OTTs into the NSW education system?
4. How are the OTTs who are working in NSW schools positioned, and what position do they take?
5. What are the dispositions of the OTTs who do not get employed as teachers in NSW?

Here, it is necessary to provide some preliminary definitions for key terms in these research questions. Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) concepts
of agent, field, strategies, misrecognition, position, system, and disposition are also enlarged upon in Chapter 3.

The concept of overseas trained teachers (OTTs) refers to those who have successfully completed a program of professional education as teachers in any country outside Australia and need certain approvals to teach in NSW. Under NSW regulations, these OTTs may be employed if they meet the requisite requirements at their initial assessment, or if not, after completing a retraining program in NSW. The retraining program may be a short course or a complete degree. However, in the literature, some of these OTTs are named as immigrant teachers (e.g. Cruickshank, 2004; Beynon, ILieva & Dichupa, 2004; Peeler & Jane, 2005; Walsh & Brigham, 2007). The concept of immigrant teacher is a broader term, referring to those who obtained their first teaching qualifications either in Australia, having previously migrated to Australia, or in an overseas country. Thus, ‘immigrant teachers’ includes immigrants who obtained their teaching qualifications in NSW. However, the NSW Department of Education and Training (NSW DET) uses ‘overseas trained teachers’, which is the term used in this thesis.

The methods used in this study include policy studies, surveys and in-depth interviews. The thesis uses this data set to explore the implications for policy-makers in Australia, of what this means for the attraction and retention of globally mobile teachers. The data is interpreted in terms of Bourdieu’s (1986, 1990, 1992) concepts of field, habitus and capital.

1.2 BACKGROUND: OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH LITERATURE

The purpose of this section is to locate the foregoing research problem in a brief overview of the recent research literature. It identifies what is known about the recruitment and employment of OTTs. This helps us to better understand the gaps, the blanks and blind spots in research-based knowledge about OTTs in multicultural Australia and internationally. Chapter 2 of this thesis provides a more elaborate review of research in these areas.
Globalisation has been accompanied by increasing transnational labour movements among developing and developed countries (Kapstein, 2000; Stilwell et al., 2004; Rizvi, 2005). Developed countries (such as Australia) tend to recruit skilled workers from developing countries (such as Fiji) to lower labour costs (Kapstein, 2000; Voigt-Graf, 2003; Morgan, Sives & Appleton, 2005). These skilled immigrants move from developing and developed nations to fill skilled jobs in a large range of industries and occupations, most often in Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries. The supply of skilled workers in developing countries is being weakened as a result—at least in some countries (Voigt-Graf, 2003; Stilwell, et al. 2004). However, on the other hand, the migrated skilled workers may also help to stimulate the economy in their original countries by remitting high valued foreign currency (Rizvi, 2005).

Collins, Reid and Guo (2008) report that OECD countries are facing labour shortages in education and health care industries. The labour shortage happens not only in remote and regional areas but also metropolitan cities of these countries. The tendency is for transnational labour flows to speed up movement of qualified teacher especially those from English speaking countries. The OECD countries such as the UK, United States of America and Canada are recruiting qualified teachers to solve labour shortage in teaching on the one hand, and to diversify their teaching workforce on the other hand (Hutchings, James, Maylor, Menter & Smart, 2006; Deters, 2006; Miller, Ochs & Mulvaney, 2008; Houten, 2009). Australian trained teachers are taken as highly qualified teachers by international recruitment agencies that drain labour from other countries (Reid, Collins & Singh, 2006).

In Australia’s domestic labour market for teachers, many researchers and organisations (MCEETYA, 2004; Hugo, 2005; Peeler & Jane, 2005; Harris & Jensz, 2006; Harris & Ferrell, 2007; Tytler, 2007; Sumasion, 2007; Singh, 2007; Zammit et al., 2007; Santoro, 2009; Miles, 2009) report that Australia is experiencing teacher shortage ranging from early childhood to tertiary education. The teacher shortage also exists in specific disciplines and localities, such as in science and mathematics and remote areas (Harris & Jensz, 2006; Harris & Ferell, 2007). The shortage of teachers may be due to aging of the teaching workforce such that a large number of teachers are expected to retire in the next ten to fifteen years (Peeler & Jane, 2005;
Miles et al., 2009). In addition, factors like relatively low salaries and poor job satisfaction make it difficult to recruit and retain qualified teachers in the profession, especially those in science subjects (Webster et al., 2005; Richardson & Watt, 2006). Given this teacher shortage, education authorities conduct various programs to recruit and retain teachers in the profession (Green, Randall and Francis, 2004; Victoria Department of Education and Training, 2004).

Given the current situation of the Australian teacher labour market, recruiting overseas trained teachers (OTTs) is not only a strategy for overcoming labour market shortages, but is also a measure that helps reflect features of Australian multicultural society (Reid et al., 2006; Hartsuyker, 2007; Han & Singh, 2007). Australia has a reputation for an unpolluted natural environment and an ethically diverse society, both of which are attractive for skilled immigrants, especially those from Asia Pacific regions (Reid et al., 2006). However, research (Cruickshank, 2004; Hartsuyker, 2007) has found that numbers of teachers with minority ethnic backgrounds working in Australian schools could not match the growing number of students from minority groups. Further, OTTs who migrate into Australia do not find it easy and comfortable to make the transition to being an Australian teacher (Cruickshank, 2004; Peeler and Jane, 2005; Kostogriz & Peeler, 2007).

The OTTs who were recruited by Australia and other OECD countries may face similar difficulties of getting employed. Lack of employment information, qualification recognition and acceptance for overseas employment records can lead to mandatory retraining programs. Language problems are but one of the major barriers that OTTs have to negotiate (Cruickshank, 2004; Beynon, Ilieva & Dichupa, 2004; Walsh & Brigham, 2007; Miller, 2008).

Reviewing these research literature helps to better understand the current situation of teacher movements from all over the world into NSW and what Australian education policies might be developed to attract and retain these transnational teachers. The local/global flow of people sponsored by governments is an increasing tendency throughout the Western world. How to attract and retain skilled professionals from around the world in order to ensure that teacher shortages do not happen in Australia is one of the issues that this research seeks to address. This study will also benefit the
OTTs who are facing difficulties or barriers in seeking teaching employment in Australia. This will be done through disseminating research results, so that increased attention will be brought to this situation as well as helping improve social and economic harmony for Australian society.

1.3 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

This section provides a brief account of the conceptual framework used in this study; Chapter 3 provides a more elaborate account of these conceptual tools. This thesis necessarily involves the review of research literature and the exploration of relevant conceptual tools—all of which helped inform the research method. A set of key concepts drawn upon in this thesis come from Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) theory of practice, in which the notions of ‘field’, ‘habitus’ and ‘capital’ are used to interpret OTTs’ practices in the Australian educational context. ‘Field’ is the space for practising; it answers the question of where the agents engage in their practices. ‘Field’ raises questions about the relationships which construct networks among different existing positions. Therefore, thinking with the concept of ‘field’ makes it possible to explore the experiences of OTTs from the perspective of relationships. For Bourdieu (1984, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993), in a highly divided society, the social world is constructed out of small relatively independent social worlds. The latter are objective spaces with independent logic and certainty which cannot be transformed into other, independent social worlds. Thus, certain rules in one field cannot be adopted in other fields. Bourdieu (1984, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993) emphasises conflict in social life, to the extent that the ‘field’ is a space of struggle between agents in various positions who use their capital and habitus as necessary in this contestation. There are several necessary connecting points for analysing the notion of ‘field’. First, the relative positions of the field. Second, the objective constructions among the positions that the agents take in the field. Third, the habitus of the agents. Lastly, there are external factors, like the economy, politics, and culture, which may not directly affect practices, but do so indirectly through specific agents in the field.
‘Habitus’, the logic of practice, answers the question of how agents practise. Bourdieu (1990, 1991, 1992, 2005) argues that habitus is an internalised form of consciousness acquired through the accumulation of long term experiences which then direct and share the activities of agents. Habitus generates spontaneously, posits itself in continuous changing situations and follows the logic of Bourdieu (1990, 1991, 1992, 2005). The activities generated from habitus cannot be deduced from certain regulations or forms but are embodied in practical life. Bourdieu (1990, 1991, 1992, 2005) regards habitus as a subjective adjustment to the object position which is formed in the social position in a field. It is an outcome of internalised externality and ‘structured structure’ or ‘structuring structure’.

In the process of struggle in a field, agents use ‘capital’ to refer to the tools of practice. This answers the question of what OTTs use to practise in the Australian education field. ‘Capital’ is not only used by the agents in struggle, but is also an object over which they engage in struggle. Agents may possess certain sanctified forms of capital when it is possessed exclusively. Bourdieu (1984, 1986, 1991, 1992, 1993) divides capital into four forms: economic capital, symbolic capital, cultural capital and social capital. This thesis uses the last three forms of capital in its analysis of the relationships between the OTTs and education authorities. The combined interpretation of ‘field’, ‘habitus’ and ‘capital’ enables this research to explain how and why OTTs with similar cultural capital and habitus practice in the Australian education field, and how OTTs develop social capital to enhance their professional development. Sassen (1998, 2006) has provided a valuable extension of our knowledge about citizenship, which is explored in terms of the employment status of OTTs in NSW. Her concept of ‘digital networks’ helps to interpret how the Internet, which crosses national boundaries, assists OTTs to communicate with their peers in their mother countries.

1.4 RESEARCH METHOD

Key aspects of the research methods provided in this overview relate to data collection, data analysis, and research ethics: Chapter 4 provides a detailed exploration and justification of the research methods used in this study. Having
refined the research problem and posed the research questions above, this section provides the rationale for the gathering of credible evidence and the analytical procedures necessary for making sound explanations. Figure 1.1 shows the research process that emerged over time through progressive refinement of the initial plan and which led to this thesis.

Figure 1.1
Components and relationships in the research design
Initially, the plan was to conduct surveys and focus groups in order to collect data. The focus group participants were to be selected from those who completed the surveys and expressed their interest in the issues under investigation, as well as a willingness to be involved in individual interviews. However, focus groups proved not to be the most appropriate research method, as it was difficult to obtain insightful responses from all the participants in limited time. Therefore, the focus group was replaced by semi-structured interviews with individuals. The semi-structured interviews were conducted either in person or via telephone. The interview participants were dispersed throughout New South Wales. It was very difficult to reach every interviewee to conduct face-to-face interviews; hence, telephone interviews were organised for some participants (see Appendix 6).

Data analysis for this thesis utilised computer software, including SPSS and NVivo. The former was used to provide a statistical analysis of the responses to paper and online surveys. NVivo was used to analyse the interview evidence. The results generated through these combined methods mean that both qualitative and quantitative evidence is presented in this thesis.

This study was undertaken as part of an Australian Research Council (ARC) Linkage Project (Reid, Collins and Singh, 2006-2009). For this reason, partner organisations, the NSW DET and the NSW Teachers Federation played important roles in facilitating the data collection for this research. An ARC Linkage Project reference group of the partner organisations in NSW met two times a year, for three hours each time. I participated in these meetings. My thesis has benefited from my membership of the project team and being able to access partner organisations’ databases and by their enabling me to contact the research participants to conduct surveys and semi-structured interviews. They also helped me in collecting relevant policies and associated documents and in finding other stakeholders to consult during my fieldwork.
1.5 THESIS STATEMENT

This thesis argues that overseas trained teachers migrating to Australia, with considerable knowledge to contribute, and a willingness to adjust to the Australian educational context are being constrained in their engagement in the NSW public education system by various barriers, including registration, professional and language issues. In other words, it is argued that the OTTs’ strategies to find employment involve struggles over their cultural capital, and this tends to have a negative effect on NSW’s ability to make transnational knowledge connections.

1.6 THESIS STRUCTURE

This thesis is developed according to the following structure. Chapter 2 provides an overview of the recent literature on transnational labour movement, the current situation of the teachers labour market in Australia, the recruitment of overseas trained teachers, and the problems experienced by OTTs.

Chapter 3 sets out the theoretical concepts which will be used in the evidentiary chapters to extend and deepen the understandings developed there.

Chapter 4 explains and justifies the research methods actually used in this research. There were departures from the initial research plan, since the research methods had to be adjusted to explore the research problem in response to practical issues of the data collection process. Computer software was used to assist in the data analysis, so as to better understand the connections between the research problem and the data presented in evidentiary chapters.

Chapter 5 presents an analysis of evidence relating to the incentives that attract OTTs to come to Australia. This Chapter also analyses evidence from the NSW teachers registration process, based on official Government documents and interview evidence.
Chapter 6 gives some indication of the registration, qualification recognition, employment and language ‘barriers’ that OTTs face in securing employment as teachers in NSW. This Chapter links to the question of what sorts of support provided to help OTTs to overcome these barriers (Chapter 8).

Chapter 7 presents an analysis of the Professional English Assessment Test (PEAT), which is conducted to examine the English proficiency of Non-English Speaking Background (NESB) OTTs. This analysis reveals the problems they experience with this Test and the possibilities and constraints on conducting this Test more productively and efficiently. This Chapter also analyses the Pre-employment Program (PeP) and its predecessor induction programs which were conducted by the NSW DET and its predecessor NSW Department of School Education (DSE) to help OTTs to prepare for employment in the NSW public education system. The Chapter presents a time series analysis of official documents of the PePs from the early 1990s to 2008, survey outcomes and interview evidence.

Chapter 8 analyses the forms of support that OTTs access through the NSW DET and its peer networks. It analyses interviews and survey responses, to establish what support the participants judge to be the relatively effective in meeting their needs for securing employment as teachers in NSW public schools, and what sorts of adjustments they make to try to fit into Australian educational culture.

Chapter 9 provides a summary of the thesis; the key findings with respect to the research questions; implications for policy adjustments to assist overseas trained teachers; a statement about the study’s limitations; recommendations for further research, and reflections about the research process. Providing more professional support and creating peer support networks may offer better possibilities for OTTs to overcome the barriers they face so as to meet the needs of Australian education for teachers.

Besides the traditional research strategies used to complete this thesis, the researcher, as a bilingual learner, also brings to this study an account of his experiential learning, documenting the place of my bilingual and digital capabilities in my research education. A specific contribution to this element of my research project is the
development of the concepts of ‘zigzag learning’ and ‘knowledge detours’ (Singh & Guo, 2008a) (see Chapter 9) to name the learning strategies that I made use of to extend my bilingual and digital capabilities. Following Sassen (2006), I found it necessary to embed these capabilities in my education research, because digital and non-digital research practices were integrated with each other, and with my growing bilingual competence. Hence, throughout the thesis there are demonstrations of how I used digital technologies, including online communication tools, online forums and blogs in multiple languages to advance my multi-competence in undertaking this research project. These ‘multiple competences’ (Cook, 1995) opened up possibilities for me to improve my understanding of the research, both in English and in Chinese. These research practices are documented as footnotes in the main body of the thesis, from Chapter 2 to Chapter 8. These provide the basis for my reflections in Chapter 9. The next Chapter provides an overview of literature concerned with the research questions identified in this Chapter.
CHAPTER TWO

TRANSNATIONAL LABOUR FLOWS, THE AUSTRALIAN TEACHERS’ LABOUR MARKET AND RECRUITMENT OF OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS: REVIEW OF THE RESEARCH LITERATURE

What I am trying to calculate is which types of immigrant, if any, contribute significantly to the welfare of all. It is all rather tricky. Nicholas heartily agreed. Yet the bluntness of her answer suggested that trickiness for Stella Yardstick meant the complexity of the calculations involved, not in any conflict of principles … the utilitarian language seems oddly deficient and certain words and concepts are simply unknown here. The limits of their language seem to be the limits of their world (Lukes, 1996, pp. 43-68).

2.0 INTRODUCTION

It is hard to say what types of overseas trained teachers (OTTs) are able to provide the most valuable contributions to Australian education. This is because OTTs encounter various difficulties when they try to merge into Australia’s educational culture and labour market. The language problem is just one of the difficulties that most OTTs are likely to come across. The language issue is important for OTTs because it is not only a basic skill for daily life but is closely related to their prospects for professional employment in Australian education. The language ‘deficit’ of OTTs can be pre-supposed to constrain them in various social and professional activities. Besides the language problem, there are also other hurdles that OTTs need to overcome. This Chapter explores these and related problems by reviewing the recent research literature, and in so doing further refines the current research problem.

This Chapter interrogates the research literature to explore the connections between OTTs’ recruitment and the situation of such teachers who work in Australia and other Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries. These connections are borne out in the context of transnational labour flows through which the global mobility of professional workers is increasing ‘brain circulation’. 
Through reviewing recent research literature, especially in the period 2004–2009, this Chapter explores the contributions, limitations and absences in previous studies to substantiate the focus of this thesis, and provides a stockpile of current knowledge for interpreting the research evidence. This Chapter is organised in four main sections. The first reviews the literature on transnational labour movements. The second section introduces the current situation of the Australian teacher labour market, addressing the issues of teacher shortages and skill shortages, as well as recruiting and retaining experienced teachers. The third section explores the issue of recruiting OTTs into multicultural Australia’s educational milieu. The literature on the difficulties and barriers that the OTTs experience in new education contexts is reviewed in the fourth section. The next section examines issues of transnational labour flows into Australia as well as similar flows into other countries around the world.

2.1 TRANSMATIONAL LABOUR FLOWS

The issue of transnational labour mobility is integral to the formation of the nation, a process in which mass schooling plays a key role. The scale, range and level of transnational mobility have differed markedly in different historical periods. In the past twenty years, the acceleration of contemporary globalisation has been evident in the transnational mobility of large numbers of workers (Sassen, 1998). The scale of transnational mobility has enlarged as ever more countries have been integrated and sought integration into these processes.

With respect to the debate over ‘brain drain’ and ‘brain gain’ in the context of the global labour movement, Morgan, Sives and Appleton (2005, p. 226) report that ‘175 million people are living in a country other than that where they are born. This accounts for 2.9% of the world’s population and shows an increase of 75 million

---

1 Transnational- 跨国 (hanzi)-kuaguo (pinyin)-multi-countries, or international or cross countries. There were some complexities involved in developing my bilingual proficiency, a capability I now require for the world’s multilingual knowledge economies. It can be seen that I dealt with new English words either by using pinyin (Romanised approximations for the spoken Mandarin language) and/or hanzi, with each Chinese character having its own distinct meaning. I gained important pedagogical insights from the process of back translation. It can be seen that in some instances there are parallel meanings, while in others the meaning proves elusive, if not obscure.
people from the figures reported for 1995’. Kapstein (2000) argues that the trade between developed countries (such as Australia) and developing countries (such as China) has already reduced the income of unskilled workers and even increased unemployment in the developed countries. Migrant labour can be classified into three types: those who are uneducated; those who have a basic education and those who are highly skilled. The developed countries share the globalised economy and technology with the developing countries, although the former may have many more highly educated workers than the latter. The developing countries may have the advantage of highly skilled workers but relatively cheap labour costs. This situation leads to international recruitment agencies recruiting low cost labour from the developing countries. Stilwell et al. (2004) argue that certain social and economic circumstances, such as, war, deprivation, and social unrest, influence the decisions of skilled workers, swaying them as to whether to migrate or not. Rizvi (2007) argues that ‘the drivers of cross-border flows are not only economic, however. They are also cultural and political’ (p. 302). When the supply is beyond the demand in the labour market, some countries will encourage skilled workers to migrate to other countries in order to release an employment burden—India and the Philippines for instance, do this (Stiwell et al., 2004).

Stilwell et al. (2004) also explain that ‘migration is influenced by social networks, which offer support to new migrants and, often, connections to employment’ (p. 597). The social networks are a tie that connect source countries and target countries. They also help target countries to recruit more skilled workers, and benefit the new migrants in having colleagues to help them get used to new social and cultural circumstances. Thus, the flow of migrant labour is an interactive process affected by the globalised labour market. It not only needs government policy and strategic interventions for recruiting skilled workers, but also requires government post-arrival migration resources for retaining and developing such workers (Stilwell et al., 2004).

Some countries only train low skilled workers in simple techniques which provide basic services for local communities, especially in rural areas. This strategy can provide adequate skilled workers for these clients, and because they only receive basic training they are not likely to migrate to wealthier countries, and thereby the country retains these low skilled workers (Stilwell et al., 2004). Even large
government investment in growing jobs, cannot solve the unemployment problem despite producing a national budget deficit. Stilwell et al. (2004, p. 597) find that ‘individuals are more likely to migrate when they are reasonably sure they will find suitable employment in a destination country’. As a result of these forces, economists have explored the flexibility of the labour market in different countries in terms of the demand for workers (Kepstein, 2000).

Rizvi (2005) contends that ‘brain drain’ is a double edged sword. On the one hand, the ‘brain drain’ not only harms the economy of the developing countries but also strongly affects their social and financial foundations. On the other hand, Rizvi (2005) indicates that this can be an opportunity for the developing countries to stimulate their economies by securing human capital at advanced levels. These stimulations depend on the use of advanced technologies and highly skilled management, as well as highly valued foreign currencies being brought back by ‘brain drain’ workers. Rizvi (2005) suggests that ‘brain drain’ should not be regulated, as global labour flows are part of the global labour market, although the developing countries might use various regulations to restrict highly skilled workers from migrating to developed countries. However, these regulations would not only aim to regulate the movements of highly skilled workers, but would also require adopting various beneficial policies to attract skilled workers back to their home countries.

Through analysing government policies, Morgan et al. (2005) find that skilled workers are far more in favour than unskilled workers in developed countries, while the latter are in surplus in developing countries. This leads to two problems for developing countries. First, the developing countries face the problem of losing their reserve of educated labour. Second, ‘there may be severe drain, where the country subsidises the education and training of skilled workers who, by subsequently migrating, may provide little in either subsequent services or taxes’ (Morgan et al., 2005, p. 228).

Voigt-Graf (2003) takes Fiji as a model to investigate the situation of the teacher labour movement and claims that transnational labour flows negatively influence labour markets in developing countries. Labour markets in small countries like Fiji,
with a limited supply of labour capital, are affected by emigration. Highly skilled workers contribute greatly to their country by way of their skills and experiences. However, Voigt-Graf (2003) finds that immigrant teachers take the greatest share of the migrant labour market from Fiji to Australia. This has led to a fall in education standards in Fiji, because of the loss of experienced teachers. Further, given the misdistribution of development between metropolitan and rural areas in Fiji, schools in rural areas now find it difficult to recruit and retain qualified teachers who are moving to the prosperous urban areas of Fiji.

Many developed countries recruit teachers from developing countries as a measure to address their own teacher shortages. The education system and teacher supply in developing countries are negatively affected as a consequence (Miller, Ochs & Mulvaney, 2008). In the UK, the numbers of OTTs have increased dramatically in the last decade, due to a large number of local teachers retiring.

Miller et al. (2008) in addressing issues of change, knowledge transfer, skills, degeneration, human rights, transformation, and development found that overseas trained teachers provide a beneficial supplementary labour force for the UK education system, but their migration negatively affects teaching quality in their source countries. This evidence was generated through a semi-structured questionnaire which was completed by 192 overseas trained teachers in the UK. Miller et al. (2008) confirm that the Commonwealth Teachers Recruitment Protocol (CTRP) carries critical functions for protecting the rights of overseas trained teachers coming to the UK and maintaining teaching quality for British students. These researchers suggest the following points as issues for future research: First, investigating the transnational teachers after they go back to their source countries; second, investigating those who transform themselves from teachers into other professions, so as to help plan future teacher recruitment; third, investigating possible frameworks that might provide for comparisons of overseas trained teachers and locally qualified teachers. The tension between teacher retention in source countries and the freedom of teachers to pursue better professional development abroad is a critical issue for education policy, nationally and internationally.
Miller et al. (2008) investigate the impacts of the CTRP on OTTs in the United Kingdom. The CTRP has been framed in the context of global teacher mobility in the Commonwealth countries. The CTRP aims ‘to balance the rights of teachers to migrate internationally, on a temporary and permanent basis, against the need to protect the integrity of national education systems and to prevent the exploitation of the scarce human resources of poor countries’ (Commonwealth Secretariat cited in Miller et al., 2008, p. 93). Problems with the CTRP include: it is not clear that the CTRP helps to solve the problem of teachers supply and demand in Commonwealth countries; teachers in Commonwealth countries do not know the functions of the CTRP; the source countries and receiving countries do not implement resources to negotiate with each others’ gains because the CTRP is not legally binding; and the source countries are negatively affected by the CTRP.

The research concerning the ‘brain circulation’ debate usually focuses on the negative dimensions, for example that developed countries are ‘sucking up’ skilled workers from developing countries (Morgan et al., 2005). For instance, only a few of the studies Morgan et al. (2005) review investigated the possibility of qualified teachers with work experience in developed countries eventually returning to their countries of origin and bringing back positive effects. However, Rizvi (2005) observes that a compromise position on transnational labour movement is emerging among developing countries and developed countries, where brain drain is seen as contributing to the former, no matter where they work. This is because world-wide networks remain strong. However, Rizvi (2005) claims that this has not been capitalised upon by policy makers.²

² Rizvi (2005) compares the situation of past and recent international education and points out that educational aid provided to students from developing countries had very positive effects in assisting national construction projects in developing countries after these students finished their studies and returned to their home country. ‘A good example of this approach was the Colombo Plan, which enabled students from poorer Commonwealth countries to study in countries which had more established systems of higher education, like Britain, Australia, and Canada’ (Rizvi, 2005, p. 178). However, this model was challenged by recent international education policies aimed at commercialising education in developed countries. More and more full fee paying students from developing countries enter universities in major English speaking countries. ‘In a relatively short period between 1998 and 2002, the number of international students enrolled in the OECD countries alone has increased from 1.32 million to 1.78 million’ (Rizvi, 2005, p. 178). China and India are the two biggest sources of international students. These figures are predicted to double in ten years. Business studies, information technology and communication, and systems engineering which are closely connected to the global fast growth economy, are popular subjects for those students from Southeast and East Asian countries. The most attractive factor for those students from developing countries is that they can immigrate to developed countries after receiving their degrees. Traditional
Under the effects of globalisation, Australia is also facing a ‘brain drain’ itself, even as its teaching workforce is becoming diversified by transnational flows of bilingual teachers. Other English speaking countries such as the UK and the United States have been recruiting highly qualified Australian teachers to solve their teacher shortages or skills mismatch. This situation is a possible drain on Australia’s teachers capital. Reid, Collins and Singh (2006) report that 25,578 Australian-born people left to live and work in overseas countries in 2002-2003. Their destinations were mainly New Zealand, the United Kingdom, the United States, Hong Kong or Singapore. Twenty five point four per cent of these people who leave Australia are professionals. Miller et al. (2008) report that there were 5,819 Australian teachers who went to the UK between July 2001 and July 2005. On the other hand, Reid et al. (2006) indicate that ‘Australia had a net gain of 1 per cent in relation to immigrant school teachers in the period 1996–2001’ (p. 3). Brain loss is not as serious for Australia as it is for other countries, such as Fiji. This shows Australia’s ability to succeed in the competitive international labour market and its ability to recruit enough OTTs to meet the demand for teachers in Australian schools.\footnote{According to the current Migration Occupations in Demand List (MODL) and the Skilled Occupation List (SOL), neither the Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations (DEEWR) nor DIAC is actively recruiting immigrant teachers for Australia. Immigrant teachers can only rely on the Employer Nomination Scheme Occupation List (ENSOL) and an ‘Education Visa’ to enter into Australia in the hope of being recruited by schools once here (Reid et al. 2006, p. 2).}

Given this circumstance, it is necessary to prepare OTTs from different ethnic minority communities to achieve in Australian schools.

The global labour movement will be frustrated, if not blocked, if universities in developed countries continue to recruit students from foreign countries but mismatch this with policies that do not retrain foreign labour for available jobs. For this reason, the global economy increasingly creates gaps between developing and developed countries (Rizvi, 2005). The question is whether the transnational labour flows lead to polarised wages, causing the labour market to be divided into two parts, ‘winners and losers’\footnote{‘Winners’ refer to workers who will benefit from globalisation and the ‘losers’, those who will be sacrificed in the global labour market.} (Kapstein, 2000). Income divergence may drive migrant skilled workers to come back to their mother countries to seek better opportunities. The negative receiving countries, like Canada and Australia, have realised that their advanced, internationalised education is a good vehicle for recruiting highly skilled workers via students from developing countries (Rizvi, 2005).
influences of global labour circulation are happening not only between developing countries and developed countries, but also between advanced countries and relatively less advanced countries (Rizvi, 2005).

Globalised labour mobility cannot be avoided. Stilwell et al. (2004) indicate that developed countries also face the problem of losing skilled workers. Both developing countries and developed countries have realised that blocking the ‘human capital’ flow is not a way to solve the problem of labour shortages. To do this may aggravate issues of demand and supply, and even produce new social problems. The compromise between rich countries and poor countries on labour mobility requires finding methods to retain skilled workers in developing countries. Morgan et al. (2005) find that the Commonwealth Agreements have a function in managing the international recruitment of health workers and teachers in Commonwealth countries. Stilwell et al. (2004) indicate that labour agreements make the target country pay more attention to providing assistance for training labour in the source countries.

2.2 THE TEACHER LABOUR MARKET IN AUSTRALIA

Webster, Wooden and Marks (2005) find that the Australian teaching labour market is not one dimensional but is made up of different components. This is because one category of teachers cannot be replaced by another with different qualifications or subject specialisations. Supply and demand for teachers in different labour segments are not necessarily connected with one another.

2.2.1 Teacher shortages

White and Smith (2005) investigate teacher supply and demand through analysing the OECD’s (2003) report on attracting, developing and retaining beginning teachers. Their research finds that there are significant differences among countries regarding supply and demand in the teaching workforce. Miller et al. (2008, p. 92) report that ‘between 25 and 40 per cent of teachers in industrialised countries are over fifty years old and will be retiring within the next ten years’. The Australian Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs (MCEETYA) (2004)
reported that ‘based on 2001 Census of Population and Housing data, an average of 3.6% of the teaching workforce will reach retirement age per year over the next ten years’ (p. 5). Given this figure, it is estimated that nearly 36% of Australian teachers would have reached retirement age by 2014. Miles et al. (2009, p. ii) report the age range of Australian teachers is such that ‘by 2009, about 86,000 teachers will be aged over 55, and another 48,000 teachers will reach this age between 2010 and 2014’. This gives rise to concerns about an impending teacher shortage, which could become a crisis (Peeler and Jane, 2005). This, of course, was before the globalisation of the American financial crisis devalued workers’ superannuation funds, which might delay some prospective retirees.

MCEETYA (2004) reports that the primary teacher labour market around Australia is generally adequate, although there are some difficulties in recruiting secondary teachers in specific geographic locations and certain subjects. These subjects include languages other than English (LOTE)—specifically Mandarin, Korean, Japanese and Indonesian—and special education in public and private schools. Teacher supply for the secondary sector as reported by MCEETYA (2004) is inadequate in rural/regional areas, and also in some metropolitan locations. The secondary sector has difficulties in recruiting teachers in mathematics, science and technology as well as LOTE. In some instances, the secondary teacher shortage is so severe it is difficult to even find qualified relief teachers to fill temporary vacancies. For NSW, the MCEETYA (2004) report showed that by 2003, NSW had a balance of demand and supply in the teaching workforce.

In Australia there is a teacher shortage in some specific places and disciplines and in terms of the ethnic diversity represented in this workforce (Peeler & Jane, 2005). Zammit et al. (2007) argue that in some jurisdictions in the USA, the unqualified teachers are used fill to the gaps in teacher shortages and that ‘this compromises quality teaching and affects students’ achievements’ (p. v). Santoro (2009) argues that there is pressure on Australia’s teacher education system to ‘prepare greater numbers of teachers in shorter periods, to streamline teaching degrees’ (p. 43). Table 2.1 indicates that with the ageing workforce an era of teacher shortages is gradually coming to Victoria (Australia), for example.
Table 2.1
The ageing teaching population in Victoria (June 2001)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher age</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Under 25</td>
<td>1,811</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-29</td>
<td>3,431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-34</td>
<td>2,984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>3,874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-44</td>
<td>7,314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-49</td>
<td>10,166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-54</td>
<td>7,756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-60</td>
<td>2,368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-64</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Australian Education Union, cited in Peeler and Jane (2005, p. 327)

Table 2.1 shows that nearly 52% of government school teachers in Victoria were expected to retire within by 2011. Given that this survey was conducted in 2001, this figure may increase or decrease, because we do not know the rate at which those aged 45-49 years will actually retire. However, the projected retirement rate sounded an alarm about teacher shortages, now even more uncertain due to the financial crisis, beginning in 2008.

Harris and Jensz (2006) report that the shortage of mathematics teachers in Australian schools is ‘seen as an emerging and growing concern, with many heads of mathematics predicting that the demand is set to increase in the next few years as large numbers of experienced staff retire’ (p.44). However, Harris and Jensz (2006) indicated that the teacher shortfall in mathematics was not due to a lack of applicants but a lack of qualified and experienced teachers. Australian schools have a tendency to ‘move their most experienced teachers to senior classes and fill “gaps” at junior school level with less qualified staff’ (p. 46).

Harris and Farrell (2007) indicated that Australian schools are facing shortage of qualified science teachers and this tendency will be continue or even worsen in the future. This science teacher shortage is due to difficulties of ‘recruiting and retaining science teachers, the number of “baby-boomer” teachers who are likely to retire in the near future, and the level of uncertainty among younger teachers and those in
early career stages’ (Harris & Farrell, p. 160). Tytler (2007) argues that the shortage of qualified science teachers will impact on the quality of science classroom practice, and hence the enjoyment and learning of science by students, and this in turn will lead to a drop in numbers taking up science, and going into science teaching (p. 7).

Singh (2007) argues that ‘the expectation is that improving support for beginning teacher education will reduce the attrition rate at a time of teacher shortages and skills mismatch’ (p. 345).

In addition, Sumsion (2007) reports that Australia is experiencing shortfall of early childhood teachers which can be attributed partly ‘to a range of societal and structural changes including the increased workforce participation of women, the steadily growing demand for long day care places, and rapid expansion of places in response to that demand’ (p. 312). Hugo’s (2005) case study of an Australian university explored the potential shortages in university academics over the next twenty years. ‘Age heaping’ (that is, the concentration in older age workers), and gender imbalance are the main factors which influence the structure of Australian university academic staff. Under the effects of transnational labour mobility, more academic staff are being recruited from developing countries to work in Australian universities, while local university graduates who move overseas are aggravating the shortages in university academic staff. This is likely to have implications for the supply of teacher educators and thus the preparation of teachers.

MCEETYA (2004, p. 6) predicts that the Australian teaching workforce may have ‘the potential for significant teacher shortages between now and 2014’. To relieve the situation will depend on the success of policies for recruiting new teachers and retaining current teachers. The MCEETYA (2004) indicates that there are large numbers of professionals holding teaching qualifications but not working in schools. Immigrant teachers who have registered with State education authorities are part of the potential teaching pool. Further, Cruickshank (2004) reports that there are many overseas trained immigrant teachers from English-speaking countries who are not
employed as teachers in Australian schools; many are regarded as having skills that are not connected with teaching here.

2.2.2 Teacher recruitment and retention

Education employers adopt various policies when they cannot recruit enough qualified teachers (Webster et al., 2005). These policies include restricting the number of school students who can study subjects in which there is a teacher shortage; reducing class hours for students; employing teachers who are not necessarily qualified to teach specific subjects, or enrolling more students in the classes of existing teachers (Webster et al., 2005). Although these strategies can relieve teacher shortages in the short term, the price is a decline in teaching quality and student learning outcomes. However, this data may not reflect the complexity of the situation. It relies on school principals reporting on whether they have difficulties recruiting sufficient teachers, irrespective of their qualifications.

Overseas research shows that more students prefer to study humanities and social science, rather than mathematics and science subjects (Webster et al., 2005). According to overseas research by Miller et al. (2008), the teacher shortage in the UK is connected to two factors: one is that many local teachers are attracted by professions other than teaching; and the other is the continuous shortage of teachers in specific subjects and geographical areas. Mathematics, science and modern languages are the subjects with severe teacher shortages in the UK. For example, at least 25% of mathematics teachers in England were trained in subjects other than mathematics (Miller et al, 2008). The lack of mathematics teachers may be related to the low college entry requirements and graduates being more likely to seek employment in the private education sector, which offers higher incomes in England (Miller et al, 2008). A similar situation exists in Australia (MCEETYA, 2004; Harris and Jensz, 2006).

Mayer (2006) argues that ‘teachers enter the teaching profession because they enjoy working with children and have a desire to teach’ (p. 63). Richardson and Watt (2006) find that incentives for students choosing the teaching profession included ‘perceived
teaching abilities, the intrinsic value of teaching, and the desire to make a social contribution, shape the future, and work with children/adolescents’ (p. 44). Webster et al. (2005) argue that the current labour market situation undermines the incentive that student-teachers and teachers have for continuing to work in this profession. Teaching children in schools is losing its attraction to graduates. Webster et al. (2005) suggest that higher salaries could be a useful way to attract teachers and student-teachers back to schools in the subjects currently experiencing shortages. However, the inflexibility of teachers’ salaries is a key reason for the constant shortages of qualified teachers in specific schools and subjects. Richardson and Watt (2006) argue that

unless teaching can be made an attractive career choice for new graduates as well as for those who switch to teaching after pursuing other careers, the shortage of suitably qualified and experienced teachers promises to worsen (p. 29).

Money plays a key role in people’s selection of the teaching profession as a career. Webster et al. (2005) report that teachers of science and mathematics with high academic performance are more likely to forego teaching as a career to enter other professions in which they can gain more income. Relatively low income also encourages qualified teachers to leave their positions. This is becoming an international issue. Webster et al. (2005, p. 92) report that ‘teachers with the highest test scores (SAT and National Teacher Exam) are most likely to leave’ this profession in the United States. Furthermore, secondary school teachers of physics and chemistry make an important contribution to school education but get low salaries. In the UK, Miller et al. (2008) find that only 30% of the survey participants regard the British salary package as an attractive factor and 63% of the Australian teachers considered the British salary package better than Australia’s. Regarding personal reasons for migration, Stilwell et al. (2004) find that financial motivations, such as wages and family wealth are important factors that lead skilled workers to migrate. The huge divergences in these factors between poor and rich countries encourage skilled workers to migrate to the latter.

That higher salaries and job satisfaction are incentives for recruiting and retaining teachers, has also been confirmed overseas in the context of transnational teacher
movement. Richardson, Kirchenheim and Richardson (2006) surveyed 196 international teachers from North America and the UK working in a Caribbean country. 60% of the participants were females and the average age ranged from 40–49. Richardson et al. (2006) argue that pay and self-satisfaction, as variables in the adjustment process, are highly related to matters of recruiting, motivating and retaining international teachers.

The results indicate that pay and job satisfaction are related to the personal adjustment of teachers in their international relocations to a small Caribbean country. These two incentives increase international teachers’ self-esteem, hence decrease the rate of return to mother countries. Richardson et al. (2006) consider that the more satisfaction that teachers have in aspects of their job and pay, the more successful they will be during the international relocation process. However, the results also show no significant evidence that self-esteem plays an important role in the actual adjustment process although it helps in dealing with stress in the international relocation of the teachers. Richardson et al. (2006) note limitations in the research due to the homogeneous features of the participants and the pre-set questions. Richardson et al. (2006) do suggest that future research could recruit participants from diverse educational and geographical backgrounds, and this might better reflect how their self-satisfaction influences their adjustment experiences in international relocation.

There are often non-monetary incentives that bring people into teaching. Richardson and Watt (2006) find that ‘teaching may afford different types of rewards that are not always inherent in other occupations’ (p. 51). Considerations about time with family, the passion to teach children, and the willingness to devote one’s life to serving others are reckoned as among the main incentives that encourage people to choose teaching as their profession (Webster et al., 2005). Besides these internal motivations there are also considerations that relate to the characteristics of the student body, over which administrators and policy makers claim to have little apparent control. The characteristics of schools, such as the students’ family backgrounds, ethnic attributes, academic potential, and school management are also important criteria which prospective teachers use to decide whether they want to join the profession.
(Webster et al., 2005). The recruitment and retention\(^5\) of teachers who are qualified
to work in specific subjects or demonstrate high performing capacities, requires
more research so as to help schools and governments in making policy.

Stilwell et al. (2004) argue that low job satisfaction affects the performance of
workers and also influences them to migrate. Indirect financial motivations such as,
opportunities for promotion, training or leadership, or the provision of housing and
transport can help to retain qualified skilled workers in developing countries,
although money is still the primary consideration in making the decision to migrate.

Morgan et al. (2005) also find that seeking better employment is the most important
incentive for highly skilled workers, including teachers, for migrating from
developing countries to developed countries. The reasons accounting for their
migration were explained in terms of ‘push-pull’ factors (Morgan et al., 2005). A
key concern with regard to skilled labour migration is that ‘the education sector [is]
exceptional in relation to issues of migration because of the nature of government
involvement in regulation and registration processes’ (Morgan et al., 2005, p. 226).
These problems raise issues about whether measures can be adopted to manage
labour movement between developed and developing countries, to prevent skilled
labour from being overdrawn from the latter.

Webster et al. (2005) find that Australian teachers are relatively satisfied with their
current working conditions. Teachers seem to be more satisfied than other employees
with their employment security, even though they are unhappy with the balance
between working and non-working hours. Richardson and Watt (2006) suggest that
Australian teacher recruitment may focus on

additional social utility values (opportunities to shape the future and
enhance social equity), as well as personal utility values (job security,
time for family, job transferability), intrinsic values and individuals’
perceptions regarding their teaching-related abilities, promises to yield
more effective results (p. 52).

\(^5\) Retention-保住 (han zi)-baozhu (pinyin)-keep and does not change.
However, Webster et al. (2005) point to the limitations of government policies for attracting and retaining teachers. These researchers suggest that it could be more efficient for government to recruit teachers in areas which are in short supply. However, it is difficult for policy makers to develop salary systems for teachers according to the different subjects, because they lack enough evidence to show the effects of overall teacher supply and shortages under various employment conditions.

The NSW Department of Education and Training (DET) has established several training programs to recruit more teachers, and the Accelerated Teacher Training Program (ATTP) is one of these (Green, Randall & Francis, 2004). It aims to recruit industrial professionals who have relevant qualifications to satisfy the demand for Technology and Applied Studies (TAS) teachers. The ATTP incorporates various initiatives, including distance education, problem-solving methodologies and site-based workplace learning opportunities.

According to the Department of Education and Training (DET) of Victoria (2004), it has been successful in recruiting enough teachers through online advertising. Victoria established its Institute of Teaching in 2002 in order to fill the vacancies caused by the funding reductions of the 1990s. General teacher supply and demand in government schools in Victoria was balanced in 2004. This tendency was predicted to remain so over the following five years. This means that Victoria did not expect to have an overall shortfall in teachers in 2009; by then, bushfires and drought were the main public policy concerns.

Evidence from Webster et al. (2005) suggest that the provision of flexible salaries to teachers who work in subjects in which there are labour shortages could be one way forward. Thus, it might be reasonable for science and mathematics teachers to get higher salaries than other teachers, in the light of the shortages in these areas. On the other hand, standardised salaries have been established to ensure income equality between teachers who are at the same level of experience and service. Teacher unions are of the view that all teachers should be paid at the same rate for the same work. This is despite shortages in different subjects. However, Webster et al. (2005) argue that teachers who work in different subjects should be paid differently because they have different knowledge and skills, and thus do different work:
The fact that different teachers cannot be substituted for one another, without loss of productivity, is objective evidence that they are not doing the [equal] work. The fact that some teaching segments are in greater relative demand (or shortage) is indicative that the work is not of … [equal] value (Webster et al., 2005, p. 95).

It is difficult to identify which groups of teachers are worthy of higher salaries, although some countries have tried to measure teachers’ achievement by testing students’ learning performances (Webster et al., 2005). This has proved perplexing, as it is affected by the different backgrounds of students and other factors that influence students’ performances, such as whether they purchase private tutoring. In the United States, it has been found that in response to test-driven performance-pay some teachers encourage students to perform poorly on purpose on the initial test, in order to achieve much better outcomes in the final tests (Webster et al., 2005). The tests are also sensitive to the inclusion or exclusion of high or low performing students in each test. Webster et al. (2005) claim that long-term structural difficulties in the Australian teacher labour market contribute to the continuing loss of qualified teachers in science and mathematics subjects as well as the loss of the best-educated from the teaching profession. Teaching is an investment of social and economic value. Parents and students are concerned about teacher quality, teaching methods and what they students gain from education and not about teachers’ income and esteem.

It is very hard to decide whether teachers with particular skills should be paid more, regardless of test results. Webster et al. (2005) argue that selectively increasing the pay of teachers who have specific skills in short supply might encourage more people to join the teaching profession in these areas of labour shortage, and also strengthen the quality of teaching and provide better learning services to children. There are still many issues for government to consider with respect to improving the pay and/or conditions of teachers to cope with teacher shortages: research-based knowledge might contribute to our understanding of them.

29
2.2.3 Victoria’s recruitment of teachers

The Victorian DET (2004) investigates better ways of dealing with recruiting and retaining highly qualified teachers. It has schemes for helping teachers improve their skills, and mentoring to help beginning teachers. One challenge in the teacher supply situation is that those over 45 increased from 30% in the mid-1990s to 54% in 2003. This situation was aggravated by the Victorian Kennett Government’s deliberate retrenchment of teachers in the 1990s. However, it would be wrong to say that the Victorian teacher labour market is now stable enough to lessen concerns about labour shortages.

The Victorian report (Victoria DET, 2004) suggests that there could be a shortfall of several hundred teachers in 2007, with an increasing demand for teachers thereafter. The government decided it would like to keep current experienced teachers, who are currently leaving schools, as well as recruiting teachers who are from other States or overseas, rather than increase funding to universities to educate more student-teachers. However, if the teacher shortage really is to be explored, then the pressure on teacher supply in some regional or rural areas and in specific subjects also needs to be treated as a serious issue. In mathematics, for example, the 50–54 age group has already increased from 10% in 1995 to 24% in 2002, which means that one quarter of mathematics teachers will retire within the next few years. The Victoria DET (2004) report also stresses that teacher supply in both primary and secondary schools are a contentious policy issue in Australia, as well as overseas. The Victorian DET (2004) seeks to solve the problem of the misdistribution of teacher supply in rural areas and in some particular subjects by certain initiatives:

1. increase the supply of teachers
2. encourage teachers to rural and outer metropolitan schools
3. improve workforce planning (Victoria DET, 2004, p. 5).

Such plans were expected to increase the Victorian DET’s opportunities to recruit teachers from Australia and overseas. Since it appeared unable to influence the Federal Howard government’s policy to increase university student-teacher places, the Victorian DET tried to encourage professionals from other fields to convert to teaching by studying for professional qualifications. University students who have
degrees which can fit into teaching in primary and secondary schools, are also targets for recruitment (Victoria DET, 2004). For those who are willing to be teachers and are familiar with schools, the Victorian DET provides many benefits, including paid education programmes and guaranteed ongoing employment if they can qualify for teaching positions. Meanwhile, the Victorian DET (2004) also welcomes those teachers who formerly left teaching years ago, back to the classroom by providing refresher training courses to help them to get back quickly into teaching.

It is more difficult for rural and regional schools to recruit qualified teachers than those located in metropolitan areas. The Victorian DET (2004) report recommends financial aid for those teachers who would like to work in designated schools in rural or regional areas after graduation. For many years, the primary and secondary schools in rural and regional areas have been avoided by new teachers because of these areas’ economic situation. The Victorian DET teacher recruitment strategy proposed to ease this situation. The Victorian DET (2004) reports that student-teachers would gain teaching experience in those schools while earning money and promotion. On the other hand, schools in rural and regional Victoria can now also recruit and retain ongoing full- or part-time employees to keep a balance in the teacher labour market.

Other strategies include Summer Schools and the online delivery of professional development, conducted through cooperation with the Victorian Institute of Teaching and universities in that State. These are aimed at enhancing the qualifications of teachers and making them qualified in specific subjects, such as mathematics, physical sciences, technology studies, information technology and special education. Both the Victorian Labour Government and its schools agree that improving existing teachers’ qualifications is as important as recruiting and retaining them. The government has already started to assess university pre-service teacher education courses to ensure a high level of teaching standards, in order to fulfil the needs of the government and its schools in Victoria.
2.3 RECRUITING OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

Australia is a developed nation of immigrants with multicultural communities; this is so, despite eleven years of Howard Government policies to the contrary. It is now attracting more and more, skilled migrant labour from Asian and Pacific Island countries such as India, China and Fiji. The reputation of most Australian people for tolerance of cultural and linguistic diversity and Australia’s relatively unpolluted natural environment are helpful in this regard.

Reid et al. (2006) report that Australia’s teacher recruitment strategy focuses on attracting, preparing and retaining teachers who reflect Australia’s multicultural character. Han and Singh (2007) indicate that Australia’s ‘need to attract and retain some thousands of teachers each year has led to the recruitment of teachers, and the retraining of other professionals from nations throughout Asia, Africa and the Pacific Islands’ (p. 293). Reflecting the international competition for teachers, Houten (2009) reports that the United States has signed agreements with several countries including France, Germany, Japan, China, Mexico and Italy for recruiting OTTs to fill gaps in the supply/availability of language teacher shortage. Hartsuyker (2007) indicates that Australia is not only experiencing a teacher shortage in some specific places and disciplines but also in terms of the ethnic diversity represented in its workforce. It is necessary for Australian education departments to recruit more teachers who can represent multicultural Australian society, including OTTs.

Recommendations to the Australian Government have been made from several investigations into this situation, the most recent being the Hartsuyker (2007) report, which indicates the importance of the Australian Government providing financial and policy support for research into recruiting student-teachers from non-English backgrounds, in order to gain more teachers with multicultural backgrounds. Hartsuyker (2007) recommends that:

1. the Australian Government establish a Teacher Education Diversity Fund of $20 million per annum for universities to access, possibly in partnership with other bodies, to develop and implement innovative programs in order to increase the number of applicants and entrants to teacher education from under-represented groups;
2. the granting of funding from the Teacher Education Diversity Fund for programs targeting disadvantaged groups be conditional on the use of diagnostic testing of students with a view to identifying their individual needs so that they can be provided with the support necessary to succeed; and
3. the Australian Government monitors closely the impact of the Teacher Education Diversity Fund on the enrolment of students from under-represented groups in teacher education across Australia (p. 51).

The May 2007 Federal Budget the Commonwealth Government was expected to support the recommended Teacher Education Diversity fund, which was to provide $20 million per year to help universities and their industry partners to recruit more applicants and enrolments from minority ethnic groups or to undertake research into these issues. The Government anticipates this research can inform the development of creative programs which will benefit the stakeholders. The participants for projects funded by the Teacher Education Diversity fund are expected to include students from non-majority ethnic groups. Research is needed to examine individuals in order to better understand what students want to learn, and what are the barriers which block their progress through teacher education into beginning teaching. Such research could find more effective and necessary support, to help students with non-English speaking backgrounds succeed as teachers. Hartsuyker (2007, p. 50) suggested several steps to improve the recruitment of OTTs including:

Enabling universities to do more to reach out into communities and down into schools, to attract and encourage more people from under-represented groups to apply for places in teacher education, and, if necessary, provide them additional support to enable them to succeed.

As the main bodies training OTTs, some universities are trying to adjust their recruitment policies to be closer to the minority ethnic communities and schools in their States. Stakeholders are trying to encourage more students from ethnic communities to enrol in teacher education courses. In the light of this situation, more OTTs need to be recruited for rural, regional and certain suburban areas, as well as into particular subjects. Cruickshank (2004) indicates that in Australia, although more and more minority-group students are enrolled in teacher education courses every year, this number is hardly catching up with the increase in local and international students who are from non-English speaking countries. The global
circulation of workers in general, and teachers in particular, now sees flows of more experienced teachers moving to Australia from around the world.

Hickling-Hudson (2005) argues that it is critical for Australian teachers to be concerned about the question of how different immigrant ethnic groups, as well Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders, along with Anglo-Australians, interact with each other. Hickling-Hudson (2005) further points out that teacher educator, most of whom are Anglo-Australians with notable exceptions, have responsibilities to help student-teachers understand that it is essential to keep prejudice and discrimination out of their classrooms. This might be done by investigating the basic principles of various community groups, so as to develop better pedagogies and curricula.

Hope-Rowe (2006) investigates how diversified cultural contexts affect final year student teachers in teacher education programmes in a regional Australian university. Through this case study, Hope-Rowe (2006) finds that racism was encountered by some final year student-teachers, although in a multicultural social context is well established in Australian society. As a university teacher who was born and worked in a white Anglo Australian dominated region for a long time, Hope-Rowe (2006) points out that Australia’s rural or regional universities may not have introduced multicultural education because of their homogenous Anglophone students and staff, or may have difficulty in doing so for this reason. Hope-Rowe (2006) considers that many teacher educators work in mono-cultural, white Australian institutions, but should construct understandings of Australian multiculturalism to develop positive attitudes among prospective teachers of the diverse students with whom they will work. Hope-Rowe (2006) argues that for teacher educators to prepare teaching courses for students about multiculturalism is a challenge, as they have never worked in such environments.

According to Reid et al. (2006), China and India are now the third and fourth largest source countries of Australian immigrants. Indian immigrants speak English well, tend to be better educated than Australian-born people (with 96% of Indian immigrants compared to 46% of locals having a university degree) and work in highly skilled occupations. This means Anglo-Australians have to adapt to this multicultural society to make sure they can work in its competitive, culturally diverse,
global labour market. Han and Singh (2007) argue that non-English speaking background student-teachers are competitive in the Australian multicultural education context because ‘they are bilingual they not only recognise the possibilities and challenges facing students who speak different languages, they can access multilingual knowledge networks to inform their teaching’ (p. 296).

Meanwhile, Cruickshank (2004) finds that ‘in NSW, the most populous state, 23.7% of students and only 13% of teachers are from ethic minority backgrounds’ (p. 126). This situation should make OTTs who have already finished their Bachelors or Masters degree in teaching and have several years teaching experience in their original countries, attractive recruits for the teaching force. However, OTTs are not given enough attention as potential recruits by governments and schools in Australia. Cruickshank (2004) points out that ‘only 7% of Australian teachers were born overseas and there were an estimated 14,500 overseas-trained teachers who were unable to get back into teaching according to the last available figures in 1991’ (p. 126). Hopefully, this situation has changed for the better in the past twenty years. There is still further room for employing overseas trained teachers to fill vacancies, given the teacher shortages. Cruickshank (2004) argues that it is important to attract overseas trained immigrant teachers into the Australian teaching profession. Moreover, figures from Hartsuyker (2007) seem to further reflect this situation:

From 2001 to 2004 approximately 2% of all students enrolled in initial teacher education courses were from non-English speaking backgrounds. This is lower than the proportion of all Australian tertiary students from non-English speaking backgrounds which, between 1998 and 2003, was 3-5%. In addition, students from non-English speaking backgrounds had slightly lower retention and success rates when compared to the entire initial teacher education cohort (Hartsuyker, 2007, p. 48).

Meanwhile, it is more difficult for ethnic minority students to find and keep jobs at schools than for local students who speak English as their mother language. English plays a role in keeping ethnic minority students away from studying to be, and working as, teachers. Even so, ‘some universities have reported an increase in the number of their teacher education students from non-English speaking backgrounds’ (Hartsuyker, 2007, p. 48). The tendency is for students who enrol in teacher education courses to be of non-English speaking background, reflecting Australia’s
more multicultural background. It is reasonable to argue that the more student-teachers who have multicultural backgrounds, the better this will reflect the current situation of Australian school students. There is still further room for employing multi-cultural background teachers to fill vacancies (Hatsuyker, 2007).

2.4 PROBLEMS EXPERIENCED BY OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

OTTs, however, meet various problems when they are working in Australian schools. These include the barrier of English language, racial discrimination and the devaluing of their overseas work experience—all of which undermine their confidence (Peeler & Jane, 2005). Walsh and Brigham (2007) indicate that immigrant teachers may face three main barriers in new education contexts: systemic, social and general. This section is structured around these three issues. ‘Systemic barriers’ refer to problems of OTTs not gaining enough information to have their overseas qualifications properly recognised, or needing to receive further education to gain local qualifications and experience. ‘Social barriers’ include various problems that happen either in schools or local communities. ‘General barriers’ refer to matters such as their previous overseas work experiences not being valued, as well as the questioning of their English language proficiency. Mullock (2006) claims that teachers’ professional development is not always influenced merely by knowledge accumulation in their teaching practice, but is also swayed by external social and institutional contexts.

2.4.1 Employment and qualification barriers for overseas trained teachers

In Australia, although more ethnic minority students enrol into teacher education courses every year, this number hardly matches the increase in local and international students who are from non-English-speaking countries (Cruickshank, 2004). Meanwhile, OTTs may face barriers when they try to obtain permanent work in Australia. They usually have no idea about where to start or (re-start) their profession. Federal and State Government agencies differ on teacher recruitment procedures. There are inconsistencies in review processes and support for the recruitment of
Likewise, Hutchings, James, Maylor, Menter and Smart (2006) report that supply OTTs in England are

generally from Commonwealth countries. Their teaching qualifications are not automatically recognised in this country, and thus they are considered to be unqualified teachers until such time as they go through an assessment for Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) in England and Wales (p. 4).

Cruickshank (2004) reports that a large number of immigrant teachers are not employed as teachers or in other highly skilled jobs in Australia. More than half of them are in part-time jobs or are unemployed. The majority of those who secure full-time jobs, work in unskilled or semi-skilled positions. Elsewhere, Deters (2006) reports that international educated teachers in Canada have an ‘especially high rate of unemployment and underemployment’ (p. 3). While arguing that the recruitment of OTTs was not being given enough attention by governments and schools in Australia, Cruickshank (2004) predicts that ‘with the growing teacher shortages in many countries, however, it is inevitable that greater efforts will be made to provide pathways for immigrant teachers back into the profession’ (p. 126). Deters (2006) argues that there are barriers for international educated teachers to enter Canadian education system which

is a classic mismatch: on the one hand, there is a need for greater diversity in the teaching force; and on the other hand, there is an abundance of immigrant teachers who are experienced and clearly have much to contribute to a diverse school system, but are unsuccessful in entering the profession (p. 3).

Cruickshank (2004) finds that most immigrant teachers hope to continue their teaching careers in Australia, although some may prefer to do work in fields unrelated to their previous profession. However, various barriers block the realisation of these hopes. Cruickshank (2004) claims immigrant teachers cannot obtain enough labour market information about recruitment programmes from Government or non-Government organisations. OTTs also experience disadvantages in terms of language, culture and limited knowledge of the Australian education system and its culture. Therefore, some OTTs have to give up trying to find the relevant programmes after they cannot find appropriate information. Under these
circumstances, multi-faceted approaches may be used to recruit and retain high quality OTTs. According to Cruickshank’s (2004) interview data, an efficient way for immigrant teachers to secure jobs is ‘word of mouth’ and ‘community contact’. In addition, advertising at community language schools, and targeting information programmes through community groups, are also be good recruitment strategies.

Richardson et al. (2006) explore the cross-cultural factors that contribute to problems and failure in the adjustment process, and which lead international teachers to terminate their contracts prematurely. Through reviewing previous research, Richardson et al. (2006, pp. 884-885) developed two models of adjustment among international workers who are currently working abroad: the ‘anticipatory adjustment’ and the ‘post-arrival adjustment’ strategies. The former refers to the information and expectations that the individuals acquire before moving to a new country. The success of their adjustment depends on the accuracy of the labour market information provided. The second model of adjustment relies on how the OTTs deal with the differences between confirmed and non-confirmed information after arriving in the foreign country.

Miller (2008) explores policies governing the recognition of qualifications and prior work experience of overseas trained teachers and argues that the non-recognition of these is a policy issue in the UK. Beynon, ILieva and Dichupa (2004) find that the dissatisfaction among immigrant teachers about this process is because their teaching, education and work backgrounds are not recognised by the Canadian education system, although they have been teachers in overseas countries for many years. Miller (2008) uses ‘relative deprivation theory’ to explain the dissatisfaction and unfairness experienced by OTTs when their qualifications and prior work experience are not adequately recognised. Miller (2008, p. 16) argues that increasingly, regulations have been enacted to restrict the rights and mobility of the OTTs. Inadequate professional support, the limitations of language and cultural adjustment tests, and concerns about qualification assessment, are used to position OTTs into categories of ‘legal’, ‘illegal’, ‘highly skilled’, ‘skilled’ and ‘unskilled’ immigrants.

---

6 Word of mouth-口头 (han zi)-koutou (pinyin)-in words or in speech
In this context, Miller (2008) argues that the knowledge which OTTs can potentially bring into host countries has not been adequately recognised, unlike the knowledge contribution factor used to determine migration in the 1960s in the UK. Miller (2008) points out that at least 30% of migrants are not recognised as qualified workers, although a higher proportion of them have degrees, relative to the UK-born population. However, skilled migrants have higher unemployment rates than the UK-born population. In the teacher labour market, Miller (2008) reports that a lower proportion of ethnic minority teachers enter the education system, no matter whether they are from overseas countries or are UK-born. OTTs in the UK, when their qualifications are not recognised as equivalent to British degrees, have to take part in additional undergraduate studies to meet qualification requirements. Some OTTs who have already gained teaching positions are ‘paid as an unqualified teacher and are ‘officially’ restricted from taking up certain positions in schools’ (Miller, 2008, p. 21). However, according to Hutchings et al. (2006), many schools in England would like to employ the OTTs as ‘they often have a positive attitude and good class control’ (p. 7).

Miller (2008) points out that the OTTs suffer from denigration of their qualifications and prior work experience. The roots of this problem still need to be identified, although the problem has been investigated by various researchers. Miller (2008) says that it is understandable for the state to set barriers on the recruitment of overseas trained teachers as it does for locals becoming teachers, by assessing their educational backgrounds and previous work experience. However, Miller et al. (2008) argue that information support has to be enhanced so that OTTs are aware of what rights and qualifications they could or should have. Canada is an immigrant country which recruits highly educated workers, including qualified teachers.

Recruited immigrant teachers who want to return to teaching after they migrate to Canada need to be re-credentialled by the British Columbia College of Teachers (BCCT) in order to achieve the requirements for recruitment (Beynon et al., 2004). The re-credentialling course is specifically prepared for immigrant teachers who need to retrain partly, or in all of their professional training. After immigrant teachers finish their studies with the BCCT, they can apply for work as teachers, along with local students who graduate from teacher colleges in British Columbia. Immigrant
teachers who successfully pass school interviews are registered on the Teacher on Call (TOC) list. Further, employment of immigrant teachers depends on the demand in different districts of British Columbia. Twenty eight (28) immigrant teachers who were from British Columbia were interviewed and completed questionnaires reporting on the effectiveness of the BCCT course.

Beynon et al. (2004) found that this teacher registration and employment process made applicants exhausted financially and emotionally, and decreased the attraction of Canada for immigrant teachers. Also, immigrant teachers considered that they were still treated as foreigners, due to taken-for-granted biases, despite the qualification recognition process. Beynon et al. (2004) suggest that the education authority consider funding the immigrant teachers training programme and pay for internships when students take the BCCT course. This would also help them gain enough experience to benefit their future employment.

2.4.2 Acceptance barriers for overseas trained teachers

Kostogriz and Peeler (2007) argue that OTTs have been marginalised in Australian education. The knowledge of the OTTs is ignored in monocultural workplaces and OTTs are pre-supposed to be able to teach only in some specific disciplines in Australia. Therefore, OTTs struggle with how to position themselves. Kostogriz and Peeler (2007) indicate that this identity struggle is not due to the OTTs’ qualifications but is connected to their ethnic, cultural and language backgrounds, leaving them being defined primarily as ‘others’. As Peeler and Jane (2005, p. 325) observe, the ‘pathway to teaching in Australian schools can lead to dilemmas for new teachers, whether they are beginning their careers or are immigrant teacher professionals recommencing their careers in a new educational context’. Peeler and Jane (2005) take immigrant teachers as experienced teachers entering into the Australian education system, which requires and expects them to have sufficient knowledge to be capable of teaching in Australian schools. However, for immigrant teachers new to the Australian education system

mere transfer of knowledge does not suffice and does not satisfy their professional perception of self. Teachers who are born and trained
overseas lack culturally specific educational knowledge. These shortfalls can initiate unforseen dilemmas for their professional development and shifts in their definition of self (Peeler & Jane, 2005, p. 325).

Peeler and Jane (2005) point to the disadvantages experienced by immigrant teachers as causing difficulties; neither they themselves nor their Australian school employers are satisfied. Experienced immigrant teachers thus fall in confusing positions, not knowing whether to re/define themselves as experienced teachers or as new teachers. This professional identity confusion interferes with the professional development of immigrant teachers in Australia as ‘their experiences are often limited to a short practicum and their understandings of everyday schooling practices may not be comprehensive’ (Santoro, 2007, p. 92).

Beynon et al. (2004) argue that immigrant teachers bring teaching experience and the potential for contributing to multi-cultural education, which are benefits to the teacher labour market. Immigrant teachers have the potential to improve local education, but their qualifications and work experiences are devalued. Based on interviews with immigrant teachers, Beynon et al. (2004) point out that ‘the negation of identity often did so at the cost of time and energy that could be more productively channelled’ (p. 442).

Walsh and Brigham (2007) conducted an arts-informed research project using interviews with eleven (n=11) female immigrant teachers from eight countries to investigate the complex of experiences this group of teachers faced when integrating into schools in Nova Scotia, a Province in Canada. The interviewees were from various disciplines, education systems and levels of schooling. Walsh and Brigham (2007) also explore the concept of identity to discuss the negotiation of the immigrant teachers’ identity changes during the processes of gaining appropriate qualifications to meet Canadian requirements for employment. Walsh and Brigham (2007) claim that the barriers these immigrant teachers face in Canada should be investigated further, especially with reference to the context of Canadian immigration policies, which aim to recruit highly skilled migrant workers to maintain its population and economic growth.
The arts-informed research process allowed the participants to create vivid pictures and models to reflect their stories and experiences (Walsh & Brigham, 2007). This method generated more consonances and insightful responses among the group. The participants felt that they were empowered to express their thoughts through art. Walsh and Brigham (2007) found that these immigrant females were more educated but less employed than their Canadian-born peers. The skills of these immigrant females were ignored when they could not find appropriate jobs to match their skills, and this contradicted the immigration policy of recruiting highly skilled workers. For Walsh and Brigham (2007), this raises concerns about the ‘Eurocentric nature of curricula/hidden curricula in Canadian schools’ (p. 21).

Cole and Stuart (2005) studied the work experiences of British Asian, black and overseas teachers teaching in South-east England. Their study investigated the endemic racism experienced by minority ethnic teachers who are from countries where the first language is not English or where there is a significant difference in educational background. Through twenty eight (28) case studies, Cole and Stuart (2005) found a high degree of general ignorance, racism and even xenophobia. They also used the interviews with those teachers that were undertaken by local councils in the same region to investigate this issue. There is evidence from Cole and Stuart (2005) showing that the ignorance, racism and stereotyped attitudes experienced by these minority ethnic teachers caused unfairness in this educational environment.

Miller (2008) combines the concepts of social identity and relative deprivation to explain the feelings of resentment, unfairness and degradation among overseas trained teachers. Miller (2008) argues that the concept of social identity:

acknowledge[s] the importance of conflicts of interest between groups in engendering prejudice and discrimination. … and only an integration of Social Identity Theory (SIT) with relative deprivation theory could provide a complete explanation for why professionally deprived and held back individuals would feel resentment towards the ‘system’ and its officials (p. 19).

Miller (2008) argues that the identities of a group and its members influence each other. Minority group members compare their treatment with majority group members. Group identity motivates members to form resistance when they are
experiencing unfair treatment. Miller (2008, p. 19) argues that ‘the stronger a person identifies with a minority group, the stronger his or her feelings of outrage will be at that group’s illegitimately low status and unfair treatment’. Miller (2008, p. 15) explains the concept of relative deprivation as involving ‘having a perception that an expectation has been dishonoured (the cognitive component) and possessing feelings of injustice, dissatisfaction and discontent at this dishonouring (affective component)’. OTTs come to the UK with high expectations. However, Miller (2008, p. 19) suggests that ‘group identification—in addition to the belief that an expectancy has been unjustly violated—influences the strength of the affective component of relative deprivation’ as a person’s group identity is formed into the person’s self identity.

The barriers that these minority ethnic teachers face include racism, leading them to drop out or fail at teaching. Sheets (2003) argues that US education authorities do not take enough responsibility to set up environments for training teachers for a multi-ethnic society. It is necessary for the government and researchers to design specific plans for developing teachers’ capabilities to adapt to diverse language and cultural education settings, taking them from beginning to experienced teachers. Also, Beynon et al. (2004) indicate that the level of the immigrant teachers’ salaries depend on their qualifications. However, immigrant teachers’ overseas work experiences and salaries are not taken as reference points in the Canadian education system.

Miller and Travers (2005) explored the impact of the work experiences, job satisfaction and the mental health of the ethnic minority teachers in the UK. Through two hundred and eight (208) questionnaires, which contained both open and closed questions, Miller and Travers (2005) found that the main sources of stress for minority ethnic teachers were their ranking, the educational culture of schools, their workloads, cultural differences, and other barriers. Miller and Travers’s (2005) results show that ethnic minority teachers had difficulty in identity recognition and professional promotion. Miller and Travers (2005) also indicate that minority ethnic teachers may experience discrimination and institutional racism. The job satisfaction of ethnic minority teachers is less than that of majority ethnic teachers, even when most showed a high level of self-esteem. Female minority ethnic teachers
experienced more health problems than their male colleagues, especially mental health issues. Yet the analysis by Miller and Travers (2005) reveals that the minority ethnic teacher who had other qualifications than the Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) may demonstrate better competence in dealing with mental stresses.

Miller and Travers (2005) reported that minority ethnic teachers sensed they were lacking recognition in and for their work. The minority ethnic teachers experienced mental stresses connected with their professional identities. The limitation of this research by Miller and Travers (2005) is that the samples were not large enough to provide ideas for solving the stresses of minority ethnic teachers. Another limitation of this study is that the reflection method lacked objective measures. Miller and Travers (2005) suggest that event-contingent diaries might be a better approach for study of the work experience of minority ethnic teachers in the UK.

Santoro (2007) explored the experiences of the ethnic minority teachers in Australian schools through qualitative methods. Using in-depth interviews, Santoro (2007) investigated how ethnic minority teachers used their cultural knowledge and experiences to develop deeper communication with other teachers and their students. Santoro (2007) argues that it is necessary to recognise the potential contributions that ethnic minority teachers might make in education, especially to the education of ethnic minority students. However, putting all the responsibility on the ethnic minority teachers for the ‘learning and well-being’ of ethnic minority students would restrain the formers’ professional development and limit the ‘White-Anglo’ teachers’ development of skills to work with the latter.

2.4.3 Language and other barriers for overseas trained teachers

Learning to speak, read, write and listen to English is more important than ever for workers keen to position themselves in the transnational labour market. For OTTs who come from NESB countries, listening to and speaking English are the two main weaknesses. Han and Singh (2007) indicate that NESB teachers:
lack confidence in their English and some of them have difficulties in using it. The demand for advanced English language proficiency in teaching is necessarily much higher than that required of many other jobs in the Australian workforce (p. 298).

Cruickshank, Newell and Cole (2003) found that with the increasing range of different language and cultural backgrounds of students in teacher education courses, it is important to set up specific English courses for them to take English as a second language to meet their language requirements. Cruickshank et al. (2003) point out that a practical model for English language support involves combining the learning strategies of content-based units, tutoring/mentoring programs and self-directed study. Beynon et al. (2004) indicate that English language competence, length and cost of retraining programmes, and expectation of poor chances for employment, make some immigrant teachers in Canada quit teaching. Some immigrant teachers consider that they can not compete with Canadian-born local teachers.

This employment situation for immigrant teachers raises questions about labour migration policies. The incoming immigrant teachers need to be appropriate recruits and also need education courses to familiarise them with the local education, language and culture and different teaching methods. However, training courses take time and put participants in a dilemma about deciding whether they can afford to take the course.

Cruickshank et al. (2003) researched programmes to improve NESB teachers’ English level, and which English language teaching methods are most suitable for NSEB teachers. By investigating with one hundred and ten (110) overseas trained student-teachers in Australia through focus groups and semi-structured interviews, Cruickshank et al. (2003) found that most of the students agreed that content-based courses were useful and relevant to their studies. However, the students make use of other supplementary strategies as well. It is very difficult to design language programmes that can satisfy all the demands of learning English. More flexible training courses had been carried out among those experimental student-teachers. According to the outcomes of modifications to these courses, Cruickshank et al. (2003) found that both teachers and students complimented a mentoring project which focused on solving students’ specific problems and improving their
confidence and communication skills in Australian classrooms. The effects of content-based courses were also positive for the students. This means that some NESB students may prefer to follow their traditional routines of study, which may concentrate on written textbooks and teachers’ guidance. This phenomenon reflects the students’ bias for choosing teacher-centred approaches rather than self-directed learning projects, which were not as successful as their designers had anticipated.

Sawir (2005) indicates that English teaching strategies in some countries tend to focus on grammar and reading skills, and not on putting English into practice in real conversational contexts. Sawir’s study is based on interviews with students from five Asian countries. Sawir (2005) suggests two possibilities for improving students’ English abilities. First, better communicative teaching and learning practices in the countries of origin should be carried out. Efforts to do this have not been satisfactory to date. Second, bridging courses in the countries of origin were considered helpful ways to reduce ‘study shock’ and ‘cultural shock’ for students arriving in Australia.

As noted above, OTTs may be treated as beginning teachers in some contexts. Flores (2006) used semi-structured interviews to investigate what happened to newly arrived teachers during the early years of their career. Flores (2006) found that changed contexts forced newly arrived teachers to give up their specific teaching philosophies. Flores (2006) claims that the reasons for anxious feelings by early teachers relate to how to keep a balance between solving practical teaching problems and their own self fulfillment in teaching. Flores (2006) found that workplace conditions and school cultures are closely connected to these teachers’ professional development.

2.5 CONCLUSION

To conclude, it is necessary to recall the aim of this Chapter: namely, to find the blank spots in the recent research literature through reviewing them. This Chapter has reviewed previous research questions, methodologies, outcomes and limitations. Figure 2.1 presents a map of the key concepts derived from the review of the literature in this Chapter. This Chapter first examined the current research knowledge about transnational labour movements; this concept helped the researcher
understand ‘brain circulation’ of the skilled immigrant workers in both developed and developing countries, and its irresistible trend, given contemporary globalisation.

Teachers, as skilled workers, are involved in ‘brain circulation’ in Australia and other Western countries. Therefore, the concept of transnational labour (teacher) movement provides an analytical tool for exploring the first research question of this thesis (see Chapter 1).

---

**Figure 2.1**

**Key concepts concerning overseas trained teachers**

This Chapter then reviewed research focusing on the concept of teacher labour markets, with specific reference to Australia. It indicates that Western countries such as Australia face a serious skills mismatch, if not a shortage of qualified teachers. This is expected to increase within the next few years. For this reason, it is an important concept to better understand strategies for recruiting new teachers, as well
as maintaining the current teacher labour force. Some incentives, like money, self-esteem and passion were identified by previous research into teacher retention. In addition, a Victorian DET (2004) report addressed the concept of teacher recruitment and retention from a government perspective. The shortage of teachers not only constrains the economic development of Australia, but also limits Australia’s capacity to realise the possibilities of a multicultural society.

The Chapter has also showed that despite more and more minority-group students being enrolled in teacher education courses every year in Australia, this number does not match the increase in local and international students of non-English speaking backgrounds. It raised the concept of overseas trained teacher (OTT) recruitment. On the one hand, recruiting OTTs fits the trend of teacher circulation in and out of Australia. On the other hand, it can also help fill in gaps either in the teacher labour force or in gradually multiculturalised Australian classes. This section helped me to better understand what Australian education authorities might do to attract and retain overseas trained teachers. The concepts of teacher labour market and OTT recruitment help to provide research-based knowledge relevant to the second and the third research questions (see Chapter 1).

The last section of this Chapter reviewed research into the problems experienced by overseas trained teachers, either in Australia or in other developed countries. This literature is connected to the fourth and the fifth research questions (see Chapter 1), providing evidence about whether the barriers OTTs face may push them to quit the teaching profession, causing an internal problem of ‘brain waste’. Cultural mixing around the world is an increasing tendency due to the local/global flows of people. How to attract and retain skilled professionals in order to ensure that teacher shortages do not happen in Australia, is an issue which the research reported in this thesis addresses.

Through reviewing the literature, the researcher found that employment strategies conducted by NSW education authorities for recruiting overseas trained teachers can be usefully situated in relation to related research. In terms of methodology, much of the literature reviewed, adopted a single research method, which involved either a survey, or policy studies, or semi-structured interviews, or case studies. This
encouraged me to conduct a multi-method study, including surveys, semi-structured interviews and documents to gain comprehensive evidence from both agents (that is, NSW education authorities and OTTs) about the Australian education field. It was also found that Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991) concepts of ‘field’, ‘habitus’ and ‘capital’ are not used in the literature reviewed in this Chapter. I decided that application of these concepts from Bourdieu (1992, 1993, 2005) would provide a novel opportunity to analyse the relationships between the agents (NSW education authorities and the OTTs) to better understand employment strategies taken by both parties. The next Chapter establishes the theoretical framework for this research, which uses Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991) concepts of ‘field’, ‘habitus’ and ‘capital’.
CHAPTER THREE

FIELD, HABITUS, CAPITAL, AND CITIZENSHIP: A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR THEORISING OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS’ EXPERIENCES

He taught them to unlearn some of the basic tenets of Nicholas’s beliefs: that partisanship should not predetermine analysis, that simple dichotomies should be viewed with caution, that there were different, nonconvergent ways of being reasonable, that the ideas of one’s bitterest enemies were worth taking seriously and that spending time interpreting world-transforming ideas was worthwhile (Lukes, 1996, p. 19).

3.0 INTRODUCTION

The results of this research will be partial if the researcher cannot avoid siding with, favouring, supporting or endorsing a particular presumption. However, the analysis of evidence coming out of this research does not have a predetermined or standard answer; rather, it is about better understanding the complexities involved. The point has been to analyse the evidence using the conceptual tools explored in this Chapter in order to identify the various dimensions of the research problem and the different perspectives on it. A further concern is how the researcher understands the connection between the problem and ways of analysing it. It has proved necessary to avoid analysing the problem using a dichotomous approach to research. The researcher has explored the evidence from a range of possible perspectives, even those which seem not so important, or even opposite to the research aims. This is because evidence or literature that was overlooked at the beginning of this research project proved important by the end of the research. The researcher did not simply try to avoid the difficulties he encountered as certain findings proved worthwhile for the research.

Given too the context of labour and knowledge flows mentioned in Chapter 2, this Chapter first identifies Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) concepts of ‘field’, ‘habitus’ and ‘capital’ as keys to exploring the evidentiary relationships between the Australian education field and the OTTs. To begin, I
provide a preliminary understanding of these concepts: field is the independent network and struggle space that forms in any society; habitus is the socialised dispositions acquired by a person; and capital is in differential forms of power. Bourdieu (1990) argues that these three concepts cannot be analysed separately, because habitus and capital are practised within the specific logic of a certain field. This Chapter explores the relationships among the concepts of ‘field’, ‘habitus’ and ‘capital’, in preparation for analysing how evidence of the OTTs’ capital and habitus affect their practice in the NSW education field. More specifically, these concepts help to interpret evidence relating to the research questions in terms of the problems OTTs face with regard to their qualifications and work experience, the recognition process, competitive language tests, and NSW public school teaching. These concepts also assist in better understanding how the OTTs themselves practice, struggle, and solve these problems through using their capital and habitus. Hence, this provides possible ideas for addressing policy concerns in the future.

The literature reviewed in Chapter 2 shows that the issues of Australian teacher shortages or skills mismatches and the difficulties that OTTs face, are important. This Chapter starts by introducing Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) concepts of field, habitus and capital, and associated concepts of misrecognition, agents, positions, dispositions, illusio, strategy, and system. These will be used in the data analysis (Chapters 5–8) to explore how OTTs use their habitus and capital in the NSW education field. Then it turns to concepts of citizenship and digital networks (Sassen, 1998, 2006) to answer how the OTTs, as agents, establish their social identities and networks to seeking work and knowledge in Australia.

Globalisation provides the background, opportunities and motives for the transnational labour flows, and these labour flows also enhance the tendency towards globalisation. The concepts of citizenship and modern digital networks (Sassen, 1998, 2006) are theorised, to explore their functions in labour and knowledge flows. These concepts help explore the question of what problems are faced by the OTTs in gaining permanent employment positions in NSW public schools, especially as this relates to their residential status in Australia. Consideration is also given to how digital networks—innovative boundary crossing tools—help OTTs cope with
teaching and adapting difficulties through communicating with their peers and colleagues in home countries.

### 3.1 FIELD—THE SPACE OF PRACTICE

The concept of field is an important notion in Bourdieu’s (1990) theory, being a basic analytical unit for his social research. It can be either thought of in terms of the magnetic field in physics or the high level of differentiation in modern society. ‘Field’ provides a conceptual tool for analysing relationships in a certain space riven with power and conflict. Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) define field as:

> a network, or configuration, of objective relations between positions. These positions are objectively defined, in their existence and in the determinations they impose upon their occupants, agents or institutions, by their present and potential situation in the structure of the distribution of species of power (or capital) whose possession commands access to the specific profits that are at stake in the field, as well as by their objective relation to other positions (domination, subordination, homology, etc.) (p. 97).

Swartz (1997, pp. 117-119) considers this concept as explaining ‘structured spaces that are organised around specific types of capital or combinations of capital based upon the relational mode of reasoning’. Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) consider that in highly differentiated modern societies, the social world is constructed by various relatively independent smaller social worlds. The logic and definiteness of these smaller social worlds cannot be readily transformed or adapted by other social worlds. Bourdieu (1993) further explains this notion:

> the field is neither a vague social background nor even a *milieu artistique* like a universe of personal relations. It is a veritable social universe where, in accordance with its particular laws, there accumulates a particular form of capital and where relations of force of a particular type are exerted. This universe is the place of entirely specific struggles, notably concerning the question of knowing who is part of the universe and who is not (pp. 163-164).

This means ‘each field has a different logic and taken-for-granted structure of necessity and relevance which is both the product and producer of the habitus which
is specific and appropriate to the field’ (Jenkins, 2002, p. 84). From this point, these ‘social worlds’ involve different ‘fields’ like the economic field, the political field, the art field or the academic field. Society, as an ultimate field, is composed of these independent but related ‘fields’. Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992, p. 100) explain that a field is not independent from the ‘social worlds’ but connected to other fields as ‘a space within which an effect of field is exercised, so that what happens to any object that traverses this space cannot be explained solely in terms of the intrinsic properties of the object in question’. Swartz (1997) provides four basic properties for defining a field:

1. fields are arenas of struggle for control over valued resources and legitimization for the right to monopolise the exercise of ‘symbolic violence’.
2. fields are structured spaces of dominant and subordinate positions based on types and amounts of capital.
3. fields impose on actors specific forms of struggle.
4. fields are structured to a significant extent by their own internal mechanisms of development and thus hold some degree of autonomy from the external environment (pp. 122-126).

The agents who take different positions in a field will adopt various methods of struggle to maintain or improve their positions. Various parts will compete to possess more capital in order to secure advantage in a certain field. Therefore, the struggle in a field is transformed into a struggle for capital. The relationships between the activities that are the focus of struggles are highly connected and affected by the social positions of the agents. Here, it is necessary to explain the term of ‘position’ in a field. Bourdieu (1993) argues that:

the cultural field is, furthermore, structured by the distribution of available positions (e.g. consecrated artist vs striving artist, novel vs poetry, art for art’s sake vs social art) and by the objective characteristics of the agents occupying them. The dynamic of the field is based on the struggles between these positions, a struggle often expressed in the conflict between the orthodoxy of established traditions and the heretical challenge of new modes of cultural practice, manifested as prises de position or position-takings (pp. 16-17).

With this interpretation, NSW education can be regarded as a field that composes and distributes various positions. In this sense, newly arrived OTTs, relative to the
NSW education authorities can be taken to be placed in positions affected by the latter’s position of dominance in the field. Bourdieu (1993) argues that ‘those in dominant positions operate essentially defensive strategies, designed to perpetuate the status quo by maintaining themselves and the principles on which their dominance is based’ (p. 83). Thus, it can be expected there are likely to be conflicts between the OTTs and the NSW education authorities, as the former struggle to be better positioned within the field.

Jenkins (2002, p. 85) interprets a ‘field of struggles in which agents’ strategies are concerned with the preservation or improvement of their positions with respect to the defining capital of the field’. Bourdieu (1991) argues that:

agents and groups of agents are thus defined by their relative positions in the field. Each of them is confined to a position or a precise class of neighbouring positions (i.e. to a given region of this field), and one cannot in fact occupy—even if one can do so in thought—two opposite regions of the field (p. 230).

The OTTs and the NSW education authorities, as agents, are defined by their differing positions within the NSW education field. They are restrained to their positions in the field, such that one cannot take up the opposing position of the other. In other words, ‘as a set of objective power relations imposed on all those who enter this field, relations which are not reducible to the intentions of individual agents or even to direct interactions between agents’ (Bourdieu, 1991, p. 230). Grenfell (2007) argues that ‘a key function of fields is the way they provide a source of socialisation for those who enter them’ (p. 56). Bourdieu (1984) explains two dimensions of the social space:

Social space, being structured in two dimensions … vertical movements, upwards or downwards, in the same vertical sector, that is, in the same field…transverse movements, from one field to another, may occur either horizontally or between different levels … Vertical movements, the most frequent ones, only require an increase in the volume of the type of capital already dominant in the asset structure … movement within a field… Transverse movements entail a shift into another field and the reconversion of one type of capital into another or of one sub-type … and therefore a transformation of asset structure which protects overall capital volume and maintains position in the vertical dimension (p. 131).
Bourdieu (1984) indicates that most movement through social space occurs as people make vertical movements through acquiring capital accumulation through each transformation. However, the social positions of the agents can only be presented by comparison with the power they hold; thus, the field exists as a relational network. Swartz (1997, p. 124) argues that ‘the struggle for position in fields opposes those who are able to exercise some degree of monopoly power over the definition and distribution of capital and others who attempt to usurp the advantages’. For this reason, a field is neither a fixed social structure nor a unitary social relationship. The ‘soul’ of a field is composed by comparative power differentials in practical social relationships and their statuses. Jenkins (2002, p. 120) argues that ‘each field is organised according to contrast of antagonistic principles of hierarchy: the social hierarchy of inherited economic capital and political power, versus the cultural hierarchy of symbolic capital’.

The metaphor of a game is often used to explain field in Bourdieu’s (1990) work. The similarity between a ‘game’ and a ‘field’ is based on ‘illusio’ benefits, which can be understood in terms of the rules of the game which both game players and field actors must obey before entering into the game or field:

As for awareness of the logic of the game as such, and of the illusio on which it is based, I had been inclined to think that it was excluded by membership of the field, which presupposes belief in everything which depends on the existence of the field (Bourdieu, 1990, p. 72).

Bourdieu (1993) argues the competition in the game is furious, as players believe in the game and they value the stakes which make it worthwhile playing. Similarly, the presupposed ‘illusio’ or benefits make the agents believe the values of the field. In other words, acquiring the benefits of the field is the reason the agents have for entering into a specific professional field. Grenfell (2007) argues that ‘the logic of practice of a field is partly internalised by individuals passing through it, and thus shapes their thoughts and actions in the field in order to profit from it’ (p. 56). For instance, in a religious field, the agents are pursuing religious beliefs. Similarly, in the labour migration field, immigrant workers are seeking better living conditions or professional development. Swartz (1997) indicates that the agents in a field must have appropriate or similar habitus to recognise and obey the rules of the field.
Newcomers have to pay for entry into the field ‘which involves recognition of the value of the game and the practical knowledge of how to play it (p. 126)’. However, those agents who misrecognise the power relations when they are accepting the rules do not receive rewards. Bourdieu (1991) argues that:

the circle of collective misrecognition, which is the basis of belief in the value of an ideological discourse, is established only when the structure of the field of production and circulation of this discourse is such that the negation it effects (by saying what it says only in a form which suggests that it is not saying it) is brought together with interpreters who are able, as it were, to misrecognise again the negated message (p. 153).

Reed-Danahay (2005) argues that misrecognition exists in the relations between dominant and dominated classes as ‘the culture considered “legitimate” is the culture of the dominant sector. This misrecognition contributes to the reproduction of the position of dominance of the dominant class’ (p. 47). Webb, Schirato and Danaher (2002, p. 24) explain that misrecognition is a ‘form of forgetting that agents are caught up in, and produced by’ the field and the agents in the dominant position within it. The social agents are linked via a form of ‘symbolic violence’7, with the weaker social identities being treated to fewer social resources and capital. However, misrecognition is such that ‘they do not perceive it that way, rather, their situation seems to them to be the natural order of things’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 25).

Swartz (1997) argues that misrecognition ‘denotes “denial” of the economic and political interests present in a set of practices’ (p. 43), such that some social identities in the weaker classes can only ever have few resources. More importantly, under the effects of ‘symbolic violence’, the subjects lose their aspirations to fight for equal rights, as they regard themselves as deserving fewer resources. Swartz (1997) contends that ‘an unintentional consequence of engaging in field competition is that agents, though they may contest the legitimacy of rewards given by fields, nonetheless reproduce the structure of fields’ (p. 126). Thus, there are outsiders who do not belong to a certain field and are excluded from equal power relations within it.

7 Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) argue that the ‘refusal to wield domination can be part of a strategy of condescension or a way of taking violence to a higher degree of denegation and dissimulation, a means of reinforcing the effect of misrecognition and thereby of symbolic violence’ (p. 145).
Bourdieu (1993) argues that the field has its own relative autonomy such that ‘the degree of autonomy of a specific realm of activity is defined by its ability to reject external determinants and obey only the specific logic of the field, governed by specific forms of symbolic capital’ (p. 15). A field may gradually gain its autonomy through struggles which aim to get rid of the control by external factors, like politics and economy. In this process, the logic of a field gradually becomes the logic that dominates all the agents and their practices within the field. The more autonomy a field has, the less it is influenced by external factors. However, this autonomy is relative within every field, because it is restrained by the meta-field, the field of power, which is defined as:

a field of forces defined by the structure of the existing balance of forces between forms of power, or between different species of capital. It is also simultaneously a field of struggle for power among the holders of different forms of power. It is a space of play and competition in which the social agent and institutions all possess the determinate quantity of specific capital (economic and cultural capital in particular) sufficient to occupy the dominant positions within their respective fields (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p.76).

For Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992), all fields are within networks of fields of power, coming from different positions. Fields mutually affect and influence each other; thus, the autonomy of fields can only be relative. Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) indicate that there are three ways to analyse a field:

1. To analyse the position of the ‘field’ vis-a-vis the field of power;
2. To map out the objective structure of relations between the positions occupied by agents who compete for the legitimate forms of specific authority of which the field is a site;
3. To analyse the habitus of agents; the systems of dispositions they have acquired by internalising a determinate type of social and economic condition (pp. 104-107).

The second and the third points of the above statement refer to analysis of the capital and habitus of the agents, which they use in their practices in a field. The next two sections will focus on introducing the concepts of habitus and capital, exploring their connections with field.
3.2 HABITUS—THE LOGIC OF PRACTICE

Strategies which can undermine, maintain, or turn a person away from the game are adopted by agents as they struggle for capital in different fields. This can be understood as habitus, which Bourdieu (1990) defines as:

A system of durable, transposable dispositions, structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures, that is, as principles which generate and organise practices and representations that can be objectively adapted to their outcomes without presupposing a conscious aiming at ends or an express mastery of the operations necessary in order to attain them (p. 53).

It answers the question of why social life has predictable, regular patterns for the actors in a given field. There are three related concepts—dispositions, strategy, and system—that need to be clarified so as to better understand the concept of habitus. The concept ‘dispositions’ is associated with

a certain social origin [which is] … specified by being enacted in structurally marked practices; and the same dispositions lead to opposite aesthetic or political positions, depending on the state of the field in relation to which they have to express themselves (Bourdieu, 1993, pp. 70-71).

Bourdieu (1991) argues that ‘dispositions are acquired through a gradual process of inculcation in which early childhood experiences are particularly important’ (p. 12). Therefore, teachers educated in overseas countries can be expected to have dispositions which are different from those trained in the NSW education field. These dispositions ‘generate practices, perceptions and attitudes which are “regular” without being consciously co-ordinated or governed by any “rule”’ (Bourdieu, 1991, p. 12).

In this sense, the dispositions of the OTTs have already been unconsciously developed through their education and teaching experience. The characters of the OTTs have already been formed through their lives overseas and are reflected by their habitus. Bourdieu (1993) argues that the relationship between positions and position-takings (internal and external positionings) is ‘mediated by the dispositions of the individual agents, their feel for the game. Agents’ strategies are a function of
the convergence of position and position-taking mediated by habitus’ (p. 17). Brubaker (2004) argues that the concept of disposition can be used to determine class condition as it ‘directly govern[s] conduct, and because classes are defined as individuals sharing the same dispositions as well as the same external conditions of existence’ (p. 47).

Bourdieu (2005) indicates that the concept ‘system’ refers to systematic habitus: ‘a determined person—or a group of persons occupying a similar or neighbouring position in social space that all the elements of his or her behaviour have something in common’ (p. 44). Given these three key concepts, habitus can be understood as what entitles agents to follow certain patterns of action, where external structures cannot restrain their actions by other mechanisms. Habitus should not be equated with habit. Habitus has the capacity:

for generating product—thoughts, perceptions, expressions and actions—whose limits are set by the historically and socially situated conditions of its production, the conditioned and conditional freedom it provides is as remote from creation of unpredictable novelty as it is from simple mechanical reproduction of the original conditioning (Bourdieu, 1990, p. 55).

That is to say that habitus is capable of producing limited thoughts, consciousness, presentations and behaviours which are restrained by historical and social conditions. Bourdieu (1990) considers that fields represent various social spaces, and they show the relationship among agents in different positions, which are determined by their capital and power. The agents embody the capital that functions to decide their position in a field. The habitus also influences the determinations of the positioning of the agents based on ‘the whole past of which it is the product’ (Bourdieu, 1990, p. 56). More specifically, according to Bourdieu (2005), habitus is ‘something non natural, a set of acquired characteristics which are the product of social conditions and which, for that reason, may be totally or partially common to people who have been the product of similar social conditions’ (p. 45). Swartz (1997) explains habitus as:

a set of deeply internalised master dispositions that generate action. They point toward a theory of action that is practical rather than discursive,
prereflective rather than conscious, embodied as well as cognitive, durable though adaptive, reproductive though generative and inventive, and the product of particular social conditions though transposable to others (p. 101).

Jenkins (2002, p. 80) argues that habitus is derived from people’s previous experiences and is ‘the product of the past practices of this generation and previous generations. History culminates in an ongoing and seamless series of moments, and is continuously carried forward in a process of production and reproduction in the practices of everyday life’. Webb et al. (2002) understand Bourdieu was seeking to find an identity for himself which could lie beyond the habitus of intellectuals because the ‘intellectual world’ is concerned too much with their habitus and cannot see the values needed to question itself. Thus, Bourdieu’s (1990) habitus can be understood as a:

form of agonistics, a struggle to overcome the academic habitus and what he calls the ‘scholarly disposition’. The scholarly disposition ‘invites’ and disposes the intellectual to ‘bracket off’ the world. The intellectual/scholarly world ‘insinuates itself’, along with its values and dispositions, into a practitioner’s ‘being’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 17).

The identity of a researcher involves a ‘scholarly disposition’, which attracts educational researchers to explore questions according to their spontaneous academic interests (Webb et al., 2002, p. 17). This means that these intellectuals are out of joint with the practicalities of social life. The result is that intellectuals misrecognise their identities, as they are holding speaking rights that define their social identities within an upper social class, above or beyond the socio-economic (Webb et al., 2002).

These intellectuals who have greater cultural capital but less social and economic capital are in a dilemma when it comes to deciding whether to subordinate their upper class identity or to maintain their cultural identity as distinct from other classes (Webb et al., 2002). Webb et al. (2002, p. 134) indicate that ‘it is from this position that scholarly fields form a particular representation of the world that take it as an object of knowledge, something that can be represented in its entirety’. This notion can be interpreted in the Australian education field to refer to the knowledge dominating Australian educational practice, which excludes other knowledge and ignores other epistemologies.
Bourdieu (1990) indicates that habitus is the basis of the tacit generation of strategies that enable agents to deal with various unpredictable or constantly changing situations in a field. This is because habitus:

structures new experiences in accordance with the structures produced by past experiences, which are modified by the new experiences within the limits defined by their power of selection, brings about a unique integration, dominated by the earliest experiences, of the experiences statistically common to members of the same class (p. 60).

The concept of strategy mentioned above, can be understood as ‘a specific orientation of practice. As a product of the habitus, strategy is not based on conscious calculation but rather results from unconscious dispositions towards practice’ (Bourdieu, 1993, p. 17). Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) indicate that the habitus will respond to demands of the field by acting in a constant way. While habitus is also creative and imaginary it is restrained by its structures, which are generated in social structures. Jenkins (2002) explains that the relationship between habitus and field is such that ‘the dispositions appropriate to one field are translated according to the logic of another field. This is how diverse social settings and practices exhibit a stylistic coherence or thematic unity’ (p. 78). Therefore, on the one hand, the field restrains and forms the habitus which the agents embody. On the other hand, the habitus helps to structure the field as a meaningful world which is filled with enticing benefits and values that are worth the agents investing in.

Jenkins (2002) calls this model a ‘reciprocal or dialectical’ relationship, in which ‘the objective conditions produce the habitus, the habitus is adjusted to objective conditions’ (p. 79). Bourdieu (1990) emphasises that behaviours which are generated from habitus cannot be deduced from fixed models. The habitus follows a logic of practice that assures its adjustment in various changing situations. However, the habitus ‘contains the solution to the paradoxes of objective meaning without subjective intention. It is the source of these strings of ‘moves’ which are objectively organised as strategies without being the product of a genuine strategic intention’ (Bourdieu, 1990, p. 62).
The relationships between NSW education authorities and OTTs can be conceptualised in terms of the relationship between field and habitus. The field structure ‘might be the hierarchy of methods within the educational discourse, the legitimate procedures and language used to represent them. Habitus would be present in participants, their present and past experience, and the schemes of thought’ (Grenfell, 1998, p. 84). The habitus is expected to accord with the demands of the field. Therefore, it might be expected that OTTs who conduct teaching methods according to their own habitus, without due regard to the regulation of the field will not have ‘a clear method, procedure, sequence, to solve the problem’ (Grenfell, 1998, p. 84).

The education authorities conduct qualification recognition procedures to ensure teachers meet the requisite habitus within the field. The qualifications and knowledge of some teachers may be devalued if they refuse to coordinate their habitus with the legitimate regulations of authorities. Given the relationships between field and habitus, it can be anticipated that the NSW education authorities and the OTTs are agents who practise in the Australian education field, each with their different habitus. And the dispositions of their habitus lead them to choose ‘forms of conduct that are most likely to succeed in light of their resources and past experience’ (Swartz, 1997, p. 106). Bourdieu (1990) argues that ‘agents shape their aspirations according to concrete indices of the accessible and the inaccessible, of what is and is not “for us”’ (p. 64). All the agents in the field, therefore, can be expected to follow their habitus to find the most efficient strategies in order to gain or maintain favourable positions. The next section introduces instruments—capital—which the agents utilise to practice in the field.

3.3 CAPITAL—THE INSTRUMENTS OF PRACTICE

Bourdieu (1993) indicates capital as an instrument of practice. This idea has its origins in Marx but has different connotations and denotations. Bourdieu (1986) defines ‘capital’ as:

accumulated labour which, when appropriated on a private basis by agents or groups of agents, enables them to appropriate social energy in
the form of reified or live labour. It is an inscribed in objective subjective structures, but it is also the principle underlying the immanent regularities of the social world (p. 241).

The roulette game can be taken as a metaphor to explain the concept of capital from another angle, as a universe with equal competition but without the guarantee of accumulation. What the agents gain in prior games might be lost in the next game, every moment is relatively independent from other moments, and any possibility can happen to any other agent (Bourdieu, 1986). Being different from a roulette game, the agents are competing with their capital ‘which, in its objectified or embodied forms, takes time to accumulate and which has a potential capacity to produce profits and to reproduce itself in identical or expanded form’ (Bourdieu, 1986, p. 214).

This capital can be taken as ‘power relations founded on quantitative differences in an amount of labour they embody’ (Swartz, 1997, p. 74). Jenkins (2002) uses ‘interests’ as a metaphor for capital, which is: ‘interests are cultural or historical constructions, they are the objects of struggle, and can only be determined by empirical investigations’ (p. 87). Grenfell and James (1998, p. 25) argue that capital is arbitrary in that ‘people do not know they have capital until they enter a field where it is valued. The capital has power through the recognised value field participants give it’. For Bourdieu (1991) capital is related to the concept of field, and ‘a field is always the site of struggle in which individuals seek to maintain or alter the distribution of the forms of capital specific to it’ (p. 14). As mentioned in Section 3.1, the field is a place for struggling dominant positions; hence, capital becomes the instrument for dominant and dominated agents to struggle over. In other words, winning dominant positions in a field is determined by the amount of capital that an agent or a group of agents have.

The concept of capital thus extends from economic capital to cultural, social and symbolic capital (Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992), which deepens the recognition of practice instruments from the economic field to symbolic and non-material fields. Different forms of capital may be converted into other forms of capital in a field.

---

8 Economic capital takes account of the ‘exchange of the relative value of tokens of different colours, the exchange rate between various species of capital through strategies aimed at describing the form of capital upon which the force of their opponents rests’ (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 99).
(Bourdieu, 1991). The following sections focus on exploring cultural capital, social capital, and symbolic capital.

### 3.3.1 Cultural capital

Bourdieu (1993) defines cultural capital as ‘a form of knowledge, an internalised code or a cognitive acquisition which equips the social agent with empathy towards, appreciation for or competence in deciphering cultural relations and cultural artefacts’ (p. 7). Bourdieu (1991, p. 14) indicates that ‘knowledge, skills and other cultural acquisitions, as exemplified by educational or technical qualifications’ should be considered as cultural capital. Grenfell (2007) defines cultural capital as that ‘which results from engagement in and with education and culture’ (p. 60). Lareau and Weininger (2004) argue that ‘competence with the English language is a form of cultural capital’ (p. 124). For Bourdieu (1986), cultural capital exists in three states. First, the:

- embodied state, in the form of long-lasting dispositions of the mind and body; the objectified state, in the form of cultural goods which are the trace or realisation of theories or critiques of these theories, problematics; and the institutionalised state, form of objectification which must be set apart because, as will be seen in the case of educational qualifications, it confers entirely original properties on the cultural capital which it is presumed to guarantee (p. 243).

The embodied state of cultural capital is presented as a stable internalised disposition which takes on a specific character and is important to the composition of habitus. Fluent utterances, elegant tastes and sophisticated upbringing embody a certain cultural capital in certain classes of actors. This cultural capital is acquired and influenced by what one constantly sees and hears. The transformation of this kind of capital is more difficult to be aware of than the economic transformation of capital. Embodied cultural capital has historical features, as this personal habitus is developed over time. It cannot be exchanged or purchased, as it is integrated into a person’s dispositions, which can be converted from economic capital (Bourdieu, 1986). Grenfell (2007, p. 60) indicates that ‘taste, expression, knowledge and culture—these can be expressed in such diverse practice as tone of voice, knowledge
and general physical demeanour’: these can be classified as embodied forms of cultural capital. The objectified state of cultural capital refers to material or objectified cultural properties, namely, cultural goods with materialised values which play the role of transformation through material agents. However, the values do not depend on themselves, but on the dominated capabilities of taste and consumption in cultural properties. Material objects like paintings, books, machines and musical instruments are classified as objectified forms of cultural capital (Grenfell, 2007). The institutionalised state of cultural capital refers to the qualifications which are recognised by various institutions. In its institutionalised state, cultural capital has specific autonomy as the social institutions are relatively independent (Bourdieu, 1986). Education institutions like universities and schools can be taken as institutionalised states of this form of cultural capital (Grenfell, 2007).

Webb et al. (2002) indicate that family income, residential place and religious beliefs are used to classify a person’s social identity. Thus, in terms of their cultural capital, OTTs can be taken as ‘intellectual workers and identified as part of the knowledge class’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 109) with cultural capital. Mapping relations among identity groups depends on the capital the groups possess. The capital can be formed in various ways, like economic or cultural relations, which have values that ‘can be traded or exchanged for desired outcomes’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 109). Teachers with university degrees, or degrees from universities in the right countries can be classified as having cultural capital to exchange in the education field:

Education is an important field because of its capacity to confer capital, particularly cultural capital, upon its participants. Indeed, education can be referred to as an academic market in terms of its distribution of such cultural capital. This capital can be measured in three forms: relating to individuals, to objects, and to institutions (Webb et al., 2002, p. 110).

Individuals with cultural capital formed by their higher education, express it in their behaviours, such as accent and knowledge. Webb et al. (2002) argue that knowledge can generate social inequity when its value as cultural capital is not conferred. It is much more likely to be gained through formal learning than through practising in real contexts. In this way, the cultural capital of knowledge ‘tends to favour those who occupy positions and dispositions that provide access to these socially
legitimated and valued ways of knowing, knowledge becomes a marker of distinction and social privilege’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 110). Grenfell and James (1998, p. 22) claim that ‘knowledge is capital because, as a symbolic product of social fields, it has consequences which are more than simply symbolic; it “buys” prestige, power and consequent economic positioning’. Webb et al. (2002) claim that knowledge is related to habitus in that:

1. knowledge is always constructed through the habitus, rather than being passively recorded.
2. we are disposed towards certain attitudes, values or ways of behaving because of the influence exerted by our cultural trajectories. These dispositions are transposable across fields.
3. the habitus is always constituted in moments of practice which are brought out when a set of dispositions meets a particular problem, choice or context.
4. habitus operates at a level that is at least partly unconscious (p. 38).

For Bourdieu’s (1986, 1990) concepts of capital and habitus, Webb et al. (2002) indicate that capital can be regarded as technology which can be transformed into various forms. There are two ways that the agents can acquire knowledge and negotiate it in various cultural fields and social contexts—‘the “practical sense” and a “reflexive relation” to cultural fields and one’s own practices within those fields’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 49). The former refers to competence in understanding and negotiating adeptly in different cultural fields. This knowledge makes the agents realise where they are standing and adopt strategies to deal with the current circumstances. In this process, agents have to choose ‘practices, genres or discourses [that] are appropriate in certain circumstances’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 50).

However, people’s habituated behaviours in their fields are regulated by certain other fields, therefore limiting their performances. Webb et al. (2002, p. 50) claim that a second way of negotiating with the current context is to exercise ‘a “reflexive” relation to our own practice’. This reflexive practice can be operated under three contexts:

first is our social and cultural origins and categories; the second is our positions in whatever field we are located and the third is what Bourdieu refers to as an ‘intellectual bias’, that is, a tendency for some agents to
‘abstract’ practices, and to see them as ideas to be contemplated, rather than problems to be solved (Webb et al., 2002, pp. 50-51).

The objects refer to the qualifications and skills that need to be developed with cultural capital. Libraries and universities are institutions which carry forms of cultural capital (Webb et al., 2002). For the OTTs to be successful in other fields, they require practical skills, even though they do not share the same values as Australian-trained teachers, which were gained through their formal Australian education. However, Webb et al. (2002) argue that where educational qualifications are emphasised in employment, ‘it is difficult to succeed in many fields without the cultural capital such qualifications provided. The cultural capital bound up in a degree or certificate is increasingly mandatory for entry into the field of employment’ (p. 111). Thus, evidence of teaching skills is unlikely to be enough for OTTs to gain employment positions in the Australian education field, because local teaching qualifications in this field are likely to be a determining factor. Bourdieu (1984) argues that the cultural capital that people have means not only that they can gain employment positions, but also means a certain kind of capital which cannot be taken by those without qualifications:

It is clear that what an academic qualification guarantees is much more than, and different from, the right to occupy a position and the capacity to perform the corresponding job … diploma is more like a patent of nobility than the title to property (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 142)

Being relatively more important, specific qualifications establish the values of the qualification holders as distinct from other qualification holders. People’s self-esteem can drive them to protect their identified values, but might fail ‘if there were not also some complicity from objective mechanism’ (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 142). A further concern for academic qualification holders on evaluating their cultural capital is:

the fluctuations of the market in academic qualifications, the sense of investment which enables one to get the best return on inherited cultural capital in the scholastic market or on scholastic capital in the labour market (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 142).
It is understood that the accumulation of educational capital can only be satisfied with investment from economic capital. In other words, acquiring educational qualifications involves transforming economic capital into educational capital. This involves a reconversion strategy (Bourdieu, 1984) ‘which is always available, of converting one type of capital into another, however, the exchange rates vary in accordance with the power relation between the holders of the different forms of capital’ (p. 125). Hence, education qualifications are a measure for effecting transfer between cultural capital investment and economic capital return:

misrecognition are in no way illusory, since they can orient real practices, especially the individual and collective strategies aimed at establishing or re-establishing the objective reality of the value of the qualification or position; and these strategies can make a real contribution toward actual revaluation (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 131).

Bourdieu (1984) argues that blindly pursuing qualifications to avoid their devaluation drives individuals to ignore the actual value that academic qualifications embody by virtue of their practical social use. A complicated context is formed by qualification holders who suppose they could be employed after investing economic capital to gain appropriate qualifications while on the other side, the employers focus on the real world value of the qualifications. This leads to competition among qualification holders and indirectly causes the devaluation of qualifications, due to limited employment opportunities.

Bourdieu (1984) claims this is ‘a structural de-skilling which aggravates the effects of the de-skilling strategies that firms have been using for a long time’ (p. 131). Thus, those qualifications with the least value in the labour market will fall into disuse, through their actual value being based on non-selection. The holders who refuse to accept payment at a lower or devalued rate for their qualifications will remain unemployed. Bourdieu (1984) argues that it is not precise to call the transformation of professionals ‘social mobility’: rather, it is a way to try to make their capital more reasonable:

The reconversion of capital held in one form to another, more accessible, more profitable or more legitimate form tend to induce a transformation of asset structure (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 131).
Therefore, Bourdieu (1984) considers that ‘movements in a social space’ or ‘reproduction of the social structure’ could be a more accurate way to discuss this phenomenon. This is because ‘agents can only maintain their position in the social structure by means of a shift into a new condition’ (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 131). Professional skilled workers pursue better distribution of their capital by rearranging their original assets. Bourdieu (1984) indicates that the process for converting economical capital into cultural capital allows workers to pursue qualifications which are assumed to guarantee appropriate employment:

In a period of ‘diploma inflation’ the disparity between the aspirations that the educational system produces and the opportunities it really offers is a structural reality which affects all the members of a school generation, expect it to give them what it gave others at a time when they themselves were still excluded from it. In an earlier period and for other classes, these aspirations were perfectly realistic, since they corresponded to objective probabilities (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 144).

Bourdieu (1984) argues that ‘diploma inflation’ is caused by mismatched visions about what the education system promises through qualifications and training, and the reality that society can only generate limited positions of paid work. The education authorities who already have taken working positions hope to implant in their students knowledge to secure jobs through appropriate qualifications. This did not happen in other classes and earlier periods, when working positions were thought to match the qualification holders. Bourdieu (1984) argues that this means ignoring:

schooling as a conservative force, by being relegated to second-class courses or eliminated. The collective disillusionment which results from the structural mismatch between aspirations and real probabilities, between the social identity the school system seems to promise, or the one it offers on a temporary basis, and the social identity that the labour market in fact offers is the source of the disaffection towards work, that refusal of social finitude, which generates all the refusals and negations of the adolescent counter-culture (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 144).

The threatening thoughts of ‘schooling as a liberating force’ advocate that all students share equal opportunities to receive an education matched with workplace needs. As conventional education institutions, schools (and universities) undertake responsibilities for training students to obtain qualifications to gain matched working positions in the real world. However, education is being moved from its traditional
function. The students’ imagined social identities are recognised through receiving education. However, the supposed social identities mismatch their real world counterparts, which are reflected by limited working places in the labour market. In other words, appropriate job positions cannot be satisfied with matched qualified workers. Uncertain or confused social identities of qualification holders produce unstable factors in society. During the process of forming vague social identities, the financial returns from work usually compensate some qualification holders’ uncomfortable attitudes for not being treated as skilled workers. They gradually give up their illusions of struggling for their proper social identities and acquiesce in their devalued social status. For those ‘victims of downclassing’ (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 144) or devalued qualification holders:

it finds expression in unusual forms of struggle, protest and escapism that the organizations traditionally involved in industrial or political struggle find hard to understand, because something more than working conditions is at stake. These young people, whose social identity and self-image have been undermined by a social system (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 144).

These people with higher qualifications or skills are forced to take low payments or low social status work, which they mistakenly assume to be caused by the school system rather than by the economic system. They have no choice to avoid doing skills-mismatched work other than to fight to maintain the value of their qualifications. They:

can find no other way of restoring their personal and social integrity than by a total refusal. It is as if they felt that what is at stake is no longer just personal failure, but rather the whole logic of the academic institution. The structural de-skilling engenders a sort of collective disillusionment is inclined to extend to all institutions the mixture of revolt and resentment it feels towards the educational system. This anti-institutional cast of mind (which draws strength from ideological and scientific critiques) points towards a denunciation of the tacit assumptions of the social order (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 144).

Bourdieu (1984) indicates that devalued qualification holders mistakenly attribute their professional failure to the education providers who teach that qualifications are essential for securing working positions. The school system is criticised for its influence on accreditation. Even worse, the spread of this mistrust against public
education may eventually harm society’s foundations. To a certain extent, ‘the reconversion of economic capital into educational capital is one of the strategies which enable the business bourgeoisie to maintain the position of some or all of its heirs’ (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 137). While not guaranteeing social profit, specific academic qualifications face devaluation if they are relatively easy, and require less intellectual investment. Any specific objective can possess cultural capital. In other words, academic qualifications which are recognised by the system make it possible for holders to compete with others. This is one reason for the devaluation of qualifications. In this context, those who do not have adequate social capital have to pin their hopes on acquiring more advanced qualifications for maintaining stable social and economical profits. The next section introduces the concept of social capital and explains how it functions in the competition for capital in a given field.

3.3.2 Social capital

Bourdieu (1986) defines social capital as

the aggregate of the actual or potential resources which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalised relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition—or in other words, to membership in a group—which provides each of its members with the backing of the collectivity-owned capital, a ‘credential which entitles them to credit, in the various senses of the word (p. 249).

Grenfell and James (1998) explain that ‘social capital’ is ‘an individual’s or individual group’s sphere of contacts’ (p. 21). Jenkins (2002) regards social capital as ‘various kinds of valued relations with significant others’ (p. 85). Bourdieu (1986) considers social capital as a shared resource of members of a specific group. It is acquired through the social networks or the relationships among the members. The group has clear boundaries, with obligations for exchange as well as mutual recognition. The group provides the collective shared capital to its members, who benefit from being credited as members of the network. Social capital depends on a person’s capacity to form social relationships and the quality and quantity of these relationships. Dovey (2005) indicates that social capital ‘is a resource which inheres in social relations or networks of family, friends, clubs, school, community and
society’ (p. 286). Social capital requires investment by agents in social relationships. By accessing social relationships, investors can use and borrow the resources of other members in the group. Bourdieu (1986) argues that those who possess social capital are the practical agents of their groups. The concept of social capital can be enhanced when used with other forms of capital in a specific field, including members’ qualifications. Social capital sees the group supporting its members with their collectively possessed capital.

The amount of social capital that a specific agent possesses is based on ‘the size of the network of connections he [sic] can effectively mobilise and on the volume of the capital (economic, cultural or symbolic) possessed in his own right by each of those to whom he is connected’ (Bourdieu, 1986, p. 249). This means that social capital enables the agents to produce benefits with their other forms of capital, although this social capital cannot be reduced to the economic and cultural capital possessed by individuals or connected agents.

Bourdieu (1984) explains why class members with the same qualifications have different employment situations and social status. The reproductive function that education contributes to involves unfairness, based on sacrificing some class members’ interests. Newcomers are unlikely to succeed in using their qualifications ‘because they do not originate from that class, lack the social capital to extract the full yield from their academic qualification’ (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 147). This means that class members with appropriate qualifications but lacking social capital cannot compete with those who have such networks. This deficit means class members are unable to demonstrate the capacities that match with their qualifications. In this context, the qualified members who possess the relevant social capital will take all the available working positions and simultaneously devalue the qualifications of those lacking social capital:

The strategies which one group may employ to try to escape downclassing and to return to their class trajectory, and those which another group employs to rebuild the interrupted path of a hoped-for trajectory, are now one of the most important factors in the transformation of social structures. The individual substitution strategies which enable the holders of a social capital of inherited ‘connections’ to make up for their lack of formal qualifications or to get the maximum
return from those they have, by moving into relatively unbureaucratised areas of social space are combined with collective strategies aimed at asserting the value of formal qualifications and obtaining the rewards they secured in an earlier state of the market (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 147).

The competition for employment between class members without social connections and those equipped with social capital can be fierce. On the one hand, the former struggle to apply different strategies to try to change this unfair situation where their qualifications are devalued. On the other hand, the latter try to guard their social privileges and profits, which they inherit from their social networks. The latter take advantage of their social networks to reproduce their social profits. In order to repair disadvantages due to the lack of higher qualifications, the latter try to transfer into occupations where their qualifications are recognised by members with whom they have social connections. Bourdieu (1984) indicates that some working positions which are helped by the privileged class may be offered to unqualified offspring in their social networks, to avoid their qualifications being devalued and to protect their privilege:

The strategies agents use to avoid the devaluation of their diplomas are grounded in the discrepancy between opportunities objectively available at any given moment and aspirations based on an earlier structure of objective opportunities. This discrepancy reflects a failure to achieve the individual or collective occupational trajectory which was inscribed as an objective potentiality in the former position and in the trajectory leading to it, ‘broken trajectory’… blighted hope or frustrated promise, has not given the means of pursuing the trajectory most likely for their class (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 131).

With the purpose of keeping the value of the qualifications that secure the privileges of class members, social capital is used to mitigate any potential incompatibility between their offspring’s likely working positions and the ones their privilege promises them. Gradually, the newly arrived qualification holders will realise that their previous work preferences have to be directed to other, lesser occupations, even though they were not planning to do so. The education system plays a critical role in this process of changing people’s aspirations, not providing information to lead the students to pursue the identical occupations to their parents. In this way, the holders of social capital with relatively low qualifications and those with weak social capital
but relatively high qualifications, push into new labour markets, which the privileged
take to be their own:

Agents who seek to avoid downclassing can either produce new
occupations more closely matching their pretensions or can refurbish the
occupations to which their qualifications do give access, redefining and
upgrading them in accordance with their pretensions … they bring
hitherto unknown aptitudes, dispositions and demands with them into
their relation with that job and demands with them into their relation with
that job, and this necessarily causes changes in the job itself (Bourdieu,
1984, p. 150).

In creating new jobs, specific qualifications have to be changed if they are not to be
devalued. Qualification specifications may be modified so the criteria are only
accessible to the privileged class members. They also serve to prevent outsiders with
equal qualifications entering the system. To some extent, this redefines job
classifications. Bourdieu (1986) argues that:

the existence of a network of connections is not a natural given, or even a
social given, constituted once and for all by an initial act of institution,
represented, in the case of the family group, by the genealogical
definition of kinship relations, which is the characteristic of a social
formation (p. 249).

Social capital is maintained more or less by a series of material and symbolic
exchanges. Therefore, the social-and-knowledge networks are ‘the products of
investment strategies, individual or collective, consciously or unconsciously aimed at
establishing or reproducing social relationships that are directly usable in the short or
long term’ (Bourdieu, 1986, p. 249). More specifically, the social relationships of a
neighbourhood, colleagues or schoolfellows are transformed into optional or
necessary relationships to maintain their long term existences. Social relationships
can also be transformed into obligatory relationships which are protected through
institutions. In the processes of exchange, this structure is reproduced endlessly
(Bourdieu, 1986).

Bourdieu (1986, p. 250) indicates ‘the reproduction of social capital presupposes an
unceasing effort of sociability, a continuous series of exchanges in which recognition
is endlessly affirmed and reaffirmed’. Time, energy and economic capital are
spent—or invested—by the agents in the process of maintaining or reproducing social capital. This explains why the accumulation of social capital increases with the size of other forms of capital. Bourdieu (1986) claims that the social capital accruing from a relationship is that much greater to the extent that the person who is the object of it is richly endowed with capital. … enable it to concentrate the totality of the social capital, which is the basis of the existence of the group (pp. 250-251).

Agents acquire benefits from their institutional membership which, as Bourdieu (1986) indicates, means that the establishment of some groups is to accumulate social capital by benefitting from this group’s social capital. This can be so even though the members do not intentionally pursue this capital concentration. Besides practising in a field with cultural and social capital, agents can also use symbolic capital to maintain their positions in the field.

3.3.3 Symbolic capital—a recognised power

Bourdieu (1993) defines the concept of symbolic capital as:

> economic or political capital that is disavowed, misrecognised and thereby recognised, hence legitimate, a ‘credit’ which, under certain conditions, and always in the long run, guarantees ‘economic’ profits (p. 75).

Bourdieu and Wacquant (1992) indicate that symbolic capital is ‘the form that one or another of these species takes when it is grasped through categories of perception that recognise its specific logic or, if you prefer misrecognise the arbitrariness of its possession and accumulation’ (p. 119). Thus, symbolic capital can be understood as accumulated prestige or honour, which is ‘founded on dialectic of knowledge and recognition’ (Bourdieu, 1993, p. 7). Dovey (2005) defines symbolic capital/power as ‘a form of honour which is largely subsumed under objectified cultural capital as a resource which accumulates in objects and individuals’ (p. 287). The symbolic capital in a certain field is such that it ‘only has value to the extent it is recognised as having value’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 61). The forms of capital in the field are not usable unless some groups of agents can know and recognise their value as capital. Therefore, the forms of capital in the field have to be recognised or legitimated to
‘secure the specific profits produced by the field’ (Bourdieu, 1993, p. 75). In this sense, all capital, no matter in what form it exists is symbolic ‘in that it accrues value in terms of power and “purchases” practice in a range of field contexts’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 221). Thus, holding symbolic capital means having recognised power to determine the legitimacy of the capital of other agents which is at stake within a field. Swartz (1997) argues that symbolic capital is ‘a form of power that is not perceived as power but as legitimate demands for recognition, deference, obedience, or the services of others’ (p. 43).

Therefore, it can be anticipated that the OTTs who enter the NSW education field are expected to bring cultural capital in the form of qualifications, languages, and work experience, and to accept the presupposed ‘illusio’ (Bourdieu, 1990) of the field. However, symbolic capital, as accumulated honour, is unlikely to be possessed by the OTTs. However, their cultural capital has to be recognised by the holder of the symbolic capital—in NSW, that is the state’s education authorities. Thus symbolic capital is a form of symbolic power.

Bourdieu (1991) argues that symbolic power is ‘invisible power which can be exercised only with the complicity of those who do not want to know that they are subject to it or even that they themselves exercise it’ (p. 164). Grenfell (2007) understands symbolic power as ‘the power to define what is and is not valued, and thus what may and may not exist. This legitimisation is a consecration, thus, a near “sacred” act’ (p. 146). Symbolic power incorporates some basic elements, including ‘issues of class domination, the problem of social order and constraint, representations of legitimacy, and the way that social functions are fulfilled while being misrecognised in power relations’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 102). Here, we recall one of the key features of the field, namely the struggle for capital (see Section 3.1). Combining the characteristics of symbolic capital/power and the field, the struggle for capital actually embodies efforts to gain symbolic capital/power by agents developing their habitus, dispositions, cultural capital, social capital, and economic capital. Bourdieu (1991) argues that symbolic power ‘can be exercised only if it is recognised, that is, misrecognised arbitrary’ (p. 170). In the NSW education field, it may be that symbolic power is practised on the basis of misrecognition by both the
OTTs and the education authorities. Even so, the agents who can successfully exercise symbolic power take dominant positions in the field.

Bourdieu (1993) argues that the process of regulating the rules in a field, for naming as if universally recognised, the values of the dominant agents, generates symbolic violence. Bourdieu (1993) defines this as the legitimacy by ‘misrecognising the underlying power relations which serve, in part, to guarantee the continued reproduction of the legitimacy of those who produce or defend the canon’ (p. 20). The dominant agents use their symbolic capital to impose legitimate rules on dominated agents in order to maintain their dominant position in the struggles in, for and over the field. Swartz (1997) argues that symbolic violence is ‘the capacity to impose the means for comprehending and adapting to the social world by representing economic and political power in disguised, taken-for-granted forms’ (p. 89). As symbolic capital has legitimating and accumulating features, it is not likely that dominated agents will overcome the dominant agents.

Thus, the symbolic violence produces a hierarchy of other forms of capital in the field. Grenfell (2007) argues that symbolic violence is ‘the judgement or verdict implicit in educational discourses, for the way it “positioned” individuals within a valued hierarchy of performance based only on a misrecognised form of cultural arbitrariness’ (p. 112). As a monopolised legitimate exercise of power (Bourdieu, 1993), the concept of symbolic violence will be used to theorise the NSW education field. The NSW education authorities can be understood as the dominant agents with the symbolic capital to regulate the legitimating rules governing registration, employment, and English language proficiency and to marginalise or recognise the knowledge (cultural capital) of the OTTs (dominated agents).

In this context, it can be presumed that it will be impossible for the OTTs (dominated agents) to compete with the dominant agents in the NSW education field. The knowledge, qualifications, and work experience, as the cultural capital of the OTTs, therefore, cannot be presumed to have automatic value in this education field.
So far, I have set out Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005)\(^9\) key concepts of field, habitus, and capital, and some subordinate concepts, such as, misrecognition, agents, strategy, system, *illusio*, position, disposition, cultural capital, social capital, and symbolic capital. The relationships among field, habitus, and capital, are such that the field provides a structured space for agents to struggle for dominant positions by using forms of capital. In this process, the habitus plays a role in guiding the practices of the agents. The possession of symbolic capital shapes, if it does not absolutely determine, the final positions of the agents in a field. Besides the concepts considered above, further related concepts of citizenship and digital networks are addressed in the following sections, to theorise other questions that OTTs face in the NSW education field.

### 3.4 CITIZENSHIP

The purpose of examining concepts relating to transnational labour movement in global/national contexts is because these are of relevance to the research questions

---

\(^9\) Figure 3.1 documents a process I found useful for recognising and learning new concepts, given that I am proficient in Mandarin but could not understand their English meanings. These concepts come from Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) work. By establishing what the concepts mean in Chinese using an English-Chinese dictionary, I could better understand most of these new English concepts. Generally, this process, which took advantage of my Chinese linguistic proficiency, helped me to solve the problem of establishing meanings for new English concepts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Pin Yin</th>
<th>Han zi</th>
<th>Meaning of the characters</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Habitus</td>
<td>Xi Xing</td>
<td>习性</td>
<td>Xi= habit/practice</td>
<td>Habit of someone’s nature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Xing = character/nature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disposition</td>
<td>Xing Qing</td>
<td>性情</td>
<td>Xing = character/nature</td>
<td>Nature quality of emotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qing = emotion/feeling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversion</td>
<td>Zhuan Bian</td>
<td>转变</td>
<td>Zhuan = move/shift</td>
<td>Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bian = change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inflation</td>
<td>Peng Zhang</td>
<td>膨胀</td>
<td>Peng = bloated</td>
<td>Bloated and expended</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Zhang = expended</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinction</td>
<td>Qu Fen</td>
<td>区分</td>
<td>Qu = distinguish</td>
<td>Distinguish and divide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fen = divide</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


Take the concept ‘habitus’ for example. In Chinese ‘xi’ means ‘habit or practice’ and ‘xing’ means ‘nature or character.’ This helps in understanding ‘xixing’ as meaning a habit formed according to someone’s nature; maybe not quite what Bourdieu (1984) means, but helpful for the time being. Likewise, the Chinese language has many synonyms that express the same meaning. For instance, ‘distinction’ (qufen) is a good example. The Chinese meaning of ‘distinction’ can be deduced by knowing that ‘qu’ (distinguish) and ‘fen’ (divide) share a similar meaning. In Mandarin they are put together in accordance with the standard formation of concepts for ease of pronunciation. ‘Conversion’ and ‘inflation’ are also similar kinds of concepts.
addressed in this thesis about overseas trained teachers. Globalisation brings along opportunities, being a driving force pulling and pushing transnational labour migration, strengthening the power of globalisation to restructure many aspects of nation-centred education, albeit perhaps less so than international testing. However, the intersection of the two does not mean they fall into a single coherent framework. Generally, studies of globalisation often take international labour migration as its consequence, while from a transnational perspective migrants are seen as actively participating in cross-nation activities and along the way, pushing globalisation forward (Sassen, 2006). In this sense, transnationalism is a process through which migrant labour attempts to establish an extended community, thereby tying two or more nations together. What this means for connecting intellectual projects across these nations is touched on in the analysis of the evidence. Often, globalisation is attached to global flows of commercial goods, capital, technology and information which are embedded in well-structured multi-national corporate culture.

Transnationalism draws attention to labour flows at both the upper and low ends of the skilled labour market. Regulated and restrained by the law, labour flows are also shaped by the social networks migrant workers set up for themselves.

Transnational migrants face problems, such as not sharing the same rights in their countries of residence until they receive citizenship. However, Sassen (1998) argues that the ‘immigrants in accumulating social and civil rights and even some political rights in countries of residence have diluted the meaning of citizenship as the specialness of the claims citizens can make on the state’ (p. 23). The issue of citizenship has not been fully considered in the research literature reviewed in Chapter 2. Sassen (2006) suggests that this is because:

Citizenship is an incompletely theorised contract between the state and its subjects. … This incompleteness makes it possible for a highly formalised institution to accommodate change—more precisely, to accommodate the possibility of responding to change without sacrificing its formal status. Incompleteness also brings to the fore the work of making, whether it is making in response to changed conditions, to subjectivities, or to new instrumentalities (p. 277).

With respect to global citizenship, Sassen (2006) argues that citizenship and the national state cannot be investigated separately, because they are formed by a precise
relationship. This relationship cannot be simplified as a context made by different societies or by activists. Slaughter and Hudson (2007) claim that citizenship has wider transnational dimensions due to ‘the acceleration of globalisation both in terms of the transnational cost of many political issues, and the faster and cheaper global communications that have made it easier to organise like-minded groups around the world’ (p. 8). Sassen (2006) suggests that researchers need to investigate the nature of rights and the subject formation of citizens, as it becomes a:

heuristic category through which to understand the question of rights and subject formation and to do so in ways that recover the conditionalities entitled in this territorial articulation and thereby the limits or vulnerabilities of this framing (p. 278).

Sassen (2006) defines citizenship in its narrowest meaning as:

the legal relationship between the individual and the polity. … Today citizenship and nationality both refer to the national state. … Both identify the legal status of an individual in terms of state membership. But citizenship is largely confined to the national dimension, while nationality refers to the international legal dimension in the context of an interstate system (p. 281).

Citizenship is located on overlapping points of nation state rights and obligations. A citizen is a member of a nation state, as defined by its political and legal context. A citizen has basic rights, entailed by specific national state obligations for accepting the restraints of the state. However, this notion of citizenship is challenged by the highly developed post-industrial achievement of nation states themselves. Under these circumstances, nationality plays a key role in the institution of citizenship. Sassen (2006) claims that nationality ‘makes some of these transformations legible. Historically, nationality is linked to the bond of allegiance of the individual to the sovereign’ (p. 282). She argues that this obligated connection between individual and state has not been challenged by human mobility so much as by the developing global economy. Continuing, innovative post-industrial developments are breaking the citizen/nation/state relationship into ever-changeable connections:

This is evident in how nationality was conceived and how it has evolved. … The importance of nationality in international law is a function of the central role of states in the international law machinery, a
decline in the importance of this role will affect the value of nationality’ (Sassen, 2006, pp. 282-283).

Further, Sassen (2006) points out that globalisation, through digitisation and a range of emergent political practices, is playing a dynamic role in changing the nation/state/citizenship relationship. The disorder created by globalisation forces is diversifying various institutions of the nation state, including citizenship. This changeability and diversity can be analysed by using two processes:

A redeployment of specific components of citizenship across a wide range of institutional locations and normative orders; and a detecting of sites where formal or experiential features of citizenship generate instability in the institution and hence the possibility of changes (Sassen, 2006, p. 279).

Two key issues need to be clarified in investigating the changing relationships between the nation state and citizenship. Sassen (2006) argues that the changing relationship between citizenship and nationality may sacrifice human rights, or could form innovative new constructions of them:

First foci for analysis are the changing relationships between citizenship and nationality, the increasingly formalised interaction between citizenship rights and human rights, the implications for formal citizenship of the privatising of executive power along with the erosion of citizens’ privacy rights, and the elaboration of a series of standards and entitlements for citizens engaged in novel types of formal cross-border arrangements (Sassen, 2006, p. 279).

Sassen (2006) points out ‘that the formal political apparatus can accommodate less and less of the political in today’s world’ (p. 280). Sassen (2006) defines citizenship as:

a collective oath made by the full citizenry to adhere to a charter that had been publicly read aloud to them. The charter was a kind of social contract, and … that it must have been one of the sources of the modern contract theory of government; accepting the urban charter was a commitment to a permanent relationship (Sassen, 2006, p. 64).

According to Sassen (2006) global cities, such as Sydney, are contributing to these changes by connecting relationships among participants who makes such cities part of their social or political lives. The citizens acquire their living necessities in the
nations; however, this does not mean that all the citizens share equal political and economic rights. A small group of political elites control the governance of nations:

There was an overall recognition of the legal equality of citizens, but the poor generally were not included in various processes and there were multiple specific inequalities among the included, such as those between master and apprentice (Sassen, 2006, p. 64).

Sassen (2006) argues that the dynamic networks of globalisation, especially the Internet, entail a new relationship between the nation state and citizenship, changing their connections in both material and virtual terms. Traditional relationships between formal and informal government functions and politics are being destabilised during this changing process. New types of political organisations, which are completely or partly beyond the governance of traditional national state mechanisms, are playing active roles in transforming the old political system into something new. Sassen (2006, p. 147) claims that ‘these trends signal not only a deterritorialising of citizenship practices and identities, as is usually argued, but also their partial denationalising’. Therefore, postnational citizenship cannot be interpreted in terms of the traditional political institutions which once regulated citizenship in specific nation states or territories. Globalisation as manifested in new technology networks is a key actor that directly or indirectly leads to these changes (Sassen, 2006). The next section introduces the concept of digital networks to address the changes in the modern technology era.

3.5 A DIGITAL PERSPECTIVE ON LABOUR NETWORKS

This section takes up Sassen’s (2006) concept of digital networks as a tool for rethinking the relations between labour and the state. Traditional international relations theory holds that national authority is where each nation state is totally independent and each state handles all matters by itself drawing on its inherent power (Sassen, 2006). With the rise of the Internet, international relationships have undergone a series of major changes: ‘the overall outcome might be described as a destabilising of older formal hierarchies of scale and an emergence of not fully formalised new ones’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 328). The principle of state authority has been losing ground in this field and has been devalued by this trend.
The Internet enhances the capabilities of human beings— as citizens and workers—to express their opinions and thoughts, increasing opportunities for democratic decisions. The Internet is a technology which has a degree of independence from state authority and may improve social democracy by influencing global economic markets and social organisations due to ‘Internet exchanges, national backbone networks, regional networks, and local networks’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 330). However, the ubiquity of the Internet does not guarantee that all workers can access it. This is because it is controlled by private profit-making organisations which deny non-financial members entry. Further, the Internet is closely regulated by state authorities, regardless of its apparently open characteristics. Thus, there are two issues concerning whether the Internet makes it possible for immigrant workers to gain the power to surpass that of traditional state authorities:

One general [sic] still rooted in the earlier emphasis on the Internet as a decentralised space where no authority structure can be instituted. The other is a rapidly growing technical literature, in good part stimulated by the growing importance of issues such as Internet addressing and surveillance, with the associated legal and political issues (Sassen, 2006, p. 330).

There are three factors affecting the management of the Internet, that mean its potential in terms of labour migration is restrained by the overriding authority of the state (Sassen, 2006). First, the hardware and software of the Internet are controlled by state authorities via regulations governing technical and operational standards. State-sponsored privatisation, which is integral to the Internet’s development, gives large operational powers to global private profit-making interests. However, the trend is towards management by big corporations, with many key features of these businesses being supervised by state authorities.

The second layer in relationship between state authority and the Internet is ‘the power of private corporate interests in shaping the activity space of the Internet’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 331). The Internet is becoming more and more protected from public access. For instance, some computer scientists are developing Internet tools for protecting intellectual property rights, guaranteed by state legislation. They build firewalls between the public and those authorised to access a given website. This
feature restrains the Internet from being a facility open to immigrant workers from all over the world.

The third layer is that state authority has a hand in regulating the Internet, researchers and user activities. For instance, website addresses and names are controlled and assigned by state authorities. Given these three trends in the Internet’s development, there is a ‘the necessity for fair governance if we are to ensure that public interest issues also shape Internet development’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 333). A central question, therefore, concerning the relationship between the Internet and state authority is what they mean for migrant labours. There are different opinions on these matters. Some believe that the:

Internet is an entity that can be subjected to a governance mechanism while for others there is no such entity but rather a decentralised network of networks that at best can lend itself to coordination of standards and rules (Sassen, 2006, p. 334).

On the one hand, it is thought that the Internet cannot be governed or controlled by any one nation, as it is a global entity. It operates as a multilateral mechanism. However, some of its functions are controlled by state authorities, such as establishing systems to strengthen the protection of intellectual property rights (Sassen, 2006). The Internet is thus a network for distributing the administrative powers of state authorities. The Internet has some potential to undermine traditional state authority due to its global characteristics. However, Sassen (2006) argues that its hardware and software requirements are regulated and standardised by state authorities. Even so, because the Internet operates in an invisible, default territory, state authorities face several significant problems. On the one hand, as local political entities, state authorities do not have the administrative power to govern the Internet as a global technology. On the other hand, the effects of the Internet’s global, boundaryless power mean that state authorities cannot give up their efforts to control it by generating local regulations and standards:

The Internet is only one portion of the vast new world of digital space, and much of the power to undermine or destabilise state authority attributed to the Internet comes from the existence of private dedicated digital networks, such as those used in wholesale global finance (Sassen, 2006, p. 335).
Global economics and finance have been highly developed since the 1980s. These now have the power to influence national economic policymaking: ‘Seen this way, digitisation emerges as a variable whose significance goes beyond its technical features’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 337). Many global financial and economic activities only happen in private Internet or intranet spaces, which external members cannot access. The global labour market does not necessarily operate according to these interests. Digitisation plays a crucial role in world-wide labour markets. In this sense, digitisation is a part of traditional labour market communications, in spite of having some international characteristics. While the global labour market is embedded in its traditional foundations, it now sways the direction of state policies:

The private digital space of global finance intersects in at least two specific and often contradictory ways which the world of state authority and law. One is through the introduction of new types of norms, reflective of the operational logic of the global capital market, into national state policy. The second one is through the partial embeddedness of even the most digitised financial markets in actual financial centres, which partly returns global finance to the world of national governments, though conditioned on denationalised policy components (Sassen, 2006, p. 338).

Global digitisation cannot completely transcend the power of the state. This is because it is both a component and an object of this technology, with responsibility for labour and other forms of regulation. The public-access Internet provides services that can connect prospective immigrant workers from different countries together, but cannot ‘bypass interstate politics’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 338). This is because migrant workers are in weak positions for acquiring adequate labour market information. The existence of the Internet makes it possible for workers worldwide to ‘become participants in electronic networks’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 338) which transcend traditional meanings of territories to take part in the global labour market. The networks form a circuit which is standing by various points from different countries around the world. These points are continuing to try to drive local employment issues into the ‘global scale where national/local laws almost cease to be operative’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 338) through the Internet. How we can define ‘territory’ in the context of global networks which are composed of various local issues is a question for further investigation (Sassen, 2006). There are ‘two types of
digital activism by place-centred activist groups focused on local issues that connect with other such groups around the world’ (Sassen, 2006, pp. 338-339) through this borderless digital implement. As nodes in these global networks, local cities play an important role as subjects to those local organisations. But it is not clear whether organisations in rural or regional areas are members in these networks. The cross-territory feature makes these local organisations not only dedicated to gathering global information for local use but also concerned with influencing political issues.

For the first type of digital activism, the global networks allow migrant workers to focus on selective local issues which are closely attached to people’s lives, compared with local or national governments, which just make decisions. This type aims to enhance its influence and political power for average workers through connecting various nodes around the world by global networks. The Internet can make:

... a politics of the local with a difference. … It also makes evident that the fact a network is global does not mean that it all has to happen at the global level; however, the network’s globality can function as a political support and resource for the localities that constitute that network (Sassen, 2006, p. 339).

Most of the work for the second type of digital-based politics is established and carried out on digital global networks and this will be possibly transferred to specific activities undertaken by worldwide-related organisations through the Internet.

Sassen (2006) argues that connected global cities are the roots for producing these micro-level activities, resulting in challenges to traditional authorities. It is not clear at the moment whether these challenges will undermine the traditional theory of nation state because ‘the unbundling of national states may well happen even when the individuals involved are not necessarily problematising the question of nationality or national identity’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 340). The interactions among global cities may provide further impetus to push forward the relative decline in the power of the nation state. Digital technology may reinforce these interactions by its worldwide borderless character, giving ‘activists the essential vehicle necessary for the outcome’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 340). However:
technology by itself could not have produced the outcome. The possibility for cities and global digital networks to emerge as nodes in these types of transboundary politics is the result of a complex mix of institutional development (Sassen, 2006, p. 340).

Both the global cities and digital networks are creating non-government factors acting against nation states. Locality is now coined through globalised labour mobility and bypasses the limitations of real space and time via the Internet space. Visible and invisible barriers to migrant labour may be broken by the Internet and make it a platform for global information communication and social interactions. A space that bypasses physical spaces, it is concerned with interactive influences between remote and adjacent spaces being formed by the Internet media:

Nonstate actors can gain visibility as individuals and as collectives, and come out of the invisibility of aggregate membership in a nation-state exclusively represented by the sovereign (Sassen, 2006, p. 340).

In this sense, the Internet disarticulates social localities from their physical space, thus becoming a global phenomenon.

### 3.6 CONCLUSION

Global teacher movement is a process that can be interpreted using various concepts, relating to the social context and the individual. This Chapter has explored a series of important concepts to establish the theoretical framework for this thesis. These include Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) concepts of ‘field’, ‘habitus’ and ‘capital’, Sassen’s (1998, 2006) theory of citizenship and digital networks. Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) concepts provide a means for interpreting how OTTs and the NSW education authorities, as agents, struggle for favourable positions in the NSW education field. The habitus—the logic of practice—can be expected to direct both parties to adjust their positions within the field. The relationship between habitus and field is interrelated through the configuration of capital possessed by the agents, both the OTTs and the NSW education authorities. We might anticipate that cultural capital is the most important capital carried by the OTTs, and that lacking social capital means the OTTs fail to gain social connections in the field. In addition, and perhaps more importantly,
symbolic capital, which is considered the most powerful capital, can be expected to be manifested to the NSW education authorities, which uses its power to determine the legitimacy of the cultural capital of the OTTs. In this process, it can be presumed that the evidence will show that the OTTs risk the problem that their cultural capital may not be recognised or legitimated in the NSW education field. The data analysis presented in this thesis will test Bourdieu’s (1984, 1986, 1990, 1991, 1992, 1993, 2005) concepts of field, habitus, and capital as analytical tools for interpreting connections of field, agents, and their reactions. The evidence focuses on questions about migration intentions, qualification recognitions, employment barriers and group professional development. Evidence of these is interpreted using these concepts. Sassen’s (1998, 2006) concept of citizenship enables a focus on how the legitimacy of recognised residential status affects the employment status of the overseas trained teachers, and how contemporary boundary-crossing assists OTTs’ recruitment.

This Chapter has provided an account of the theoretical tools to be used in the evidentiary chapters to answer the questions of why the OTTs want to migrate into Australia; what sorts of strategies they adopt to adapt to the NSW education field; what impedes them in the processes of qualification recognition and employment; how the language test and professional support programs affect them; and how they struggle to achieve their professional development in the NSW education field. The following Chapter explains how the researcher carried out this project through using various research methods to collect credible evidence and to achieve a rigorous analysis of it.
CHAPTER FOUR

EXPLORING MULTI-METHODS RESEARCH

[For research] to be reasonable was to solve problems. ... If a problem looked soluble, [the researcher] would quickly seize its essentials; if it did no, [the researcher] would avoid or ignore it. ... [The research also has] to live by principles, and by one principle in particular: that to use people was to misuse them, that no-one should be treated as a means to someone else’s end or to serve some larger social purpose (Luke, 1996, pp. 8-9).

4.0 INTRODUCTION

It is important for a researcher to choose a set of appropriate research principles when certain problems need to be explored. For the researcher, if research methods are suitable for the research, then the essentials of the problems will emerge quickly, so that the researcher can seize it easily. Or, it is necessary for the researcher to abandon inappropriate research methods rather than misusing them. The researcher also needs to obey certain rules to avoid misusing participants’ opinions when the research involves human beings. This is because no one needs to be sacrificed to serve certain research agendas or an investigation which might position them in the public at large.

The foregoing Chapters have posed the research questions, reviewed the literature in the field and established the theoretical framework. This Chapter goes on to describe and provide a rationale for the gathering of credible evidence and detail the analytical procedures necessary for making sound interpretations. Silverman (2006) argues that ‘the value of a research method should properly be gauged solely in relation to what you are trying to find out, we need now to sketch out the uses and abuses of both quantitative and qualitative methods’ (p. 36). Qualitative educational research is

---

10 Figure 4.1 gives an example of the questions I raised in one online sociology forum. The question was, ‘Can somebody provide me with definitions and specific examples of qualitative and quantitative methods?’ Three users answered this question. The first, #2, mentioned that qualitative methods mainly use words or documents to demonstrate research findings, while quantitative research methods use statistical data. As an example he said that a focus group belongs to qualitative methods, while conducting experiments involving pre- and post-tests, and control and treatment groups, belong to
labelled as an ‘unscientific’ approach, while other forms of scientific knowledge are generally regarded as the highest form of knowing. The most commonly heard criticisms are, first, that qualitative research is merely an assembly of anecdotes and personal impressions, strongly subject to researcher bias. Second, qualitative research lacks reproducibility, as the research outcomes tend to be based on personal reflections and there is no guarantee that different researchers will come to the same qualitative research. The second response (#3) was a citation for an article explaining key features of qualitative and quantitative methods. The third user (#4) gave more examples to explain the differences between these two research methods.

**Figure 4.1**

**Chinese BBS discussion about quantitative and qualitative research methods**

This BBS question and answer session proved helpful to me. The advantages for me of using the Chinese language BBS system to speak with research students in China included having a platform where all registered users could present their views or provide answers on given questions. This supplemented the peer-to-peer model associated with instant message tools. The BBS also helped me to test my knowledge through obtaining advice on readings about the research issues in which I was interested. The BBS also provided me with answers through users’ responses to other people’s questions, which in turn inspired my thinking about these questions.
conclusions. Finally, qualitative research is criticised for lacking generalisability, only generating a large amount of detailed information about a small number of settings (Silverman, 2006). Given these debates, this Chapter is structured in five sections that lead from the philosophical basis for qualitative educational research through formulation of research design, data collection and data analysis process, concluding with an account of research ethics as used in this study. This Chapter necessarily involves the identification of assumptions and the review of the relevant literature to help address some of the above criticisms. This research required the use of critical and logical thinking, along with a consideration of alternative explanations based on the primary evidence that was generated. The following section introduces the researcher’s philosophy for conducting this research.

4.1 RESEARCH PHILOSOPHY

For educational researchers, how to do credible, worthwhile research is always a question. In particular, it involves a struggle between philosophies concerning the merits of social constructivism and realism. This section explores these tensions in order to develop principles to guide the production of credible evidence for this research.

4.1.1 A rational view of educational research

Bricmont and Sokal (2005) criticise some educational researchers, especially those in cultural studies who abuse scientific concepts and arguments, of using

---

11 In 1996, the US cultural studies journal *Social Text* published a special issue entitled ‘science wars’ with the aim of counterattacking the book *Higher Superstition: The Academic Left and Its Quarrels with Science* (Gross & Levitt, 1994). The ‘science war’ that broke out and bound into public view was magnified by a periodic paper entitled ‘Transgressing the boundaries: Toward a transformative hermeneutics of quantum gravity’ written by a physicist Sokal (1996). It proved ironic that this paper was included in that special edition. In another paper, entitled ‘A Physical Experiment with Cultural Studies’, its author claimed that his ‘transgression’ in *Social Text* was totally nonsense. Sokal (1996) explained that the aim of his ‘prank’ was to test if cultural studies had rigorous standards for research. This affair triggered much heated debate, with the mass media exaggerating the war between the natural sciences and the humanities.
scientific ideas totally out of context, without giving the slightest empirical or conceptual justification—note that we are not against extrapolating concepts from one field to another, but only against extrapolations made without argument—or throwing around scientific jargon to their non-scientist readers without any regard for its relevance or even its meaning (p. 538).

Bricmont and Sokal (2005) suggest that it is satisfactory for educational researchers to use specific scientific terms in social research provided they give sufficient relevant grounds to enable their readers to understand these concepts. However, it is not appropriate to use such terms without reference to their original properties and meanings, especially if those meanings are to be used in a new context. The arbitrary use of such technical terms is criticised. If educational researchers want to use scientific words as metaphors, then they should know ‘the role of a metaphor is usually to clarify an unfamiliar concept by relating it to a more familiar one, not the reverse’ (Bricmont & Sokal, 2005, p. 538). Further, Bricmont and Sokal (2005) contend that it is not helpful to use scientific metaphors especially when readers do not have the specific knowledge of these:

we fail to see the advantage of invoking, even metaphorically, scientific concepts that one oneself understands only shakily when addressing a nonspecialist audience. Might the goal be to pass off as profound a rather banal philosophical or sociological observation, by dressing it up in fancy scientific jargon (Bricmont & Sokal, 2005, p. 538)?

In this sense, as an educational researcher I want to take care in using specialist concepts which may be difficult to understand for myself or my readers. The use of obscure concepts may make readers confused or even doubt the value of the research.

Second, Bricmont and Sokal (2005) criticise epistemic relativism, with its claim that modern natural sciences try to obtain knowledge through observations and descriptions rather than the continuous creation and development of practical experiences. Bricmont and Sokal's (2005) argument suggests that educational researchers can carry out research based on an explicit statement and justification of theory and evidence, and avoid, minimise and scrutinise subjective observations. Bricmont and Sokal (2005) recommend that researchers be modest about their
research claims. This means to practise forms of investigation and to test research concepts which are not bound to certain interest groups:

No one should ever feel obliged to follow the ‘national line’ of the place where he or she happens to have been born, and no one has the right to define such a ‘line’ for others (Bricmont and Sokal, 2005, p. 539).

The aim of Bricmont and Sokal’s (2005) argument is to call the attention of educational researchers to the need to guard against academic deception. The research reported here follows research practices based on empirical evidence, well-interpreted concepts and rational arguments to contribute to worthwhile deliberation in this field. Research filled only with fashionable words offers little to furthering such studies.

In discussing the relationship between science and rationality, Chomsky (2005) investigates the meaning of the term ‘rational inquiry’, which he says represents a mixture of ‘rationality’, ‘science’ and ‘logic’. It is very complicated to explain the rules and connections among these three terms as they apply in educational research, for several reasons. First, educational researchers need to be familiar with the ground rules governing the research outcomes and whether they follow from prior suppositions; what kind of role the facts play in educational research; or whether educational researchers simply put ideas together and call this an argument. Chomsky (2005) claims that research may be reliable without working in accordance with these ground rules. Educational researchers can comply with the meaning of rational inquiry by staying within the ground rules. In other words, researchers can seek a resolution that makes the facts consistent with the outcomes. Second, Chomsky (2005) indicates that the relationship between science and rationality is not always clearly understood because their properties sometimes stand in opposing positions. The way to solve this problem is to presuppose the legitimacy of rational inquiry. Chomsky (2005) assumes that the relationships between the properties of science and rationality offer a consistent position:

Science is tentative, exploratory, questioning, largely learned by doing. … it doesn’t matter what we cover, but what we discover, maybe something that will challenge prevailing beliefs if we are fortunate … students are expected to come up with new ideas, to question and often
undermine what they read and are taught, and to somehow pick up, by experience and cooperative inquiry, the trick (which no one begins to comprehend) of discerning important problems and possible solutions to them (p. 531).

It could be better to understand science as a kind of rational spirit, because its aim is to investigate the consequence of activities during the process of their continuing development. Rationality is based on excluding individuals’ personal interests to follow reasonable principles:

It is not that scientists are inherently more honest, open, or questioning. It is simply that nature and logic impose a harsh discipline. … in the sciences, your tales will be refuted and you will be left behind by students who want to understand something about the world, not satisfied to let such matters be ‘someone else’s concern (Chomsky, 2005, pp. 531-532).

The research reported here is embedded in an exploration of practical experiences, using rational inquiry to better understand the concepts used to interpret the evidence and not to construct findings according to personal preferences. Researchers are a particular group of trained people who try to investigate concepts by getting beyond surface appearances. Educational researchers who have a scientific spirit, try to separate the truth from the exterior situation. Chomsky (2005) claims that researchers take the responsibility for explaining, justifying and illustrating research questions by using concise concepts to make a better understanding of the issues being investigated. Besides these rational views for conducting educational research, following Sassen (2006) it can be argued that educational researchers should be aware that modern technologies play a significant role in educational research. The following sections discuss this philosophical perspective on the embeddedness of digital technology in educational research.

4.1.2 Embedding the digital in educational research

Educational researchers cannot ignore innovative digital technologies such as the Internet, as they are used as tools by human beings (Sassen, 2006). More than this, ‘we cannot simply infer the impact of these technologies—on state authority, on democratic participation, on global finance—[or on educational research]—by
considering their technical capabilities’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 341). It cannot be assumed that these technologies can easily be embedded in educational research or help develop research education because ‘the diversity of substantive rationalities organising different social domains’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 341). However, these digital tools are no longer used or developed separately from educational research. They are embedded in both technical and educational domains, being shaped by the latter. Digital technologies should be considered a part of educational research:

There is no pure digital economy and no completely virtual corporation or community. This means that power, contestation, inequality, and hierarchy inscribe electronic space and shape the criteria for what types of software get developed (Sassen, 2006, p. 341).

Digital technologies are part of educational life and affect educational research, mediating supervisor/student relations as well as relations with university research officials and transnational research communities. Educational researchers may benefit from considering the interrelationship between digital technology and its research context, that is, not to ‘disregard the specificity of these technical capabilities which enable the formation of whole new interactive domains’ (Saasen, 2006, p. 342). At least, this means documenting the integration of new digital technologies in the educational research process as part of a holistic view of the research process. For the purpose of this study, research into the functions of innovative digital technologies accompanied the investigation into the experiences of overseas trained teachers. However, there are two ways of researching this relationship:

First, a tendency to understand or conceptualise these technologies in terms of what they can do and assume that they will do; and second, a strong tendency to construct the relation of these technologies to the social world as one of applications and impacts (Sassen, 2006, p. 342).

Any polarisation of digitalisation and educational research is questionable. First, interpretations of the role of digital technologies in the research process are limited, when understood only in terms of their physical meanings. Such an interpretation ‘inevitably neutralises or renders invisible the material conditions and practices, place-boundedness, and thick social environments within and through which these
technologies operate’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 342). The second defect of dividing digital technologies from the educational research process is that it denies understanding of the specific historical and social spaces which are now necessary for educational research as much as the development of digital technologies. Following Sassen (2006), it is reasonable to argue that it is necessary to avoid these two defects in order to understand the connections between digital technologies and educational research. Simply dividing research into the digital and non-digital domains does not eliminate the difficulty of understanding these in purely technological terms. The boundaries between educational research and technology are now blurred.

A key step in examining the complicated relationship between the digital and non-digital conditions of educational research is to consider their shared characteristics. Here, educational researchers operating in transnational environments can expect to discover that they cannot ‘escape state authority nor will they necessarily ensure their democratic rights’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 343). Thus, in any state educational facilities such as universities, authorities control the applications of hardware and software that constitute the Internet. For universities, allocating numerical student email addresses is a result of Government Laws defining official communications. Digital technologies cannot rid themselves of such specific local characteristics even though they provide researchers access to global information.

The online BBS arguments (see figure 4.1 in Section 4.0) were presented by Chinese people, who could be seen as a partial focus group of different people expressing opinions freely on certain issues. The Internet is a relatively recent means of digital communication, but it has impacted on educational research, which has been affected by this new technology. There are three dimensions to the embeddedness of digital technologies in educational research:

The complex interactions between digital and nondigital domains; the destabilising of existing hierarchies of scale made possible by these technologies; and the mediating cultures that organise the relation between these technologies and users (Sassen, 2006, p. 343).

Interactive computer-based technology provides a key focus for sorting out the relationship between digital factors and non-digital elements. This reflects their
practical educational contexts, which can be compared with virtual and theoretical environments. Sassen’s (2006) argument is that digital technologies can only enhance or be partly modified by global capital mobilities but they cannot change the nature or stability of capital itself. The mobility and stability interact with each other, but they do not modify their counterpart’s basic natures. The Internet applications for collecting data partly compensated for the limitations of individual interviews, which assisted the researcher to understand the OTTs’ issues.

4.1.3 Digital/nondigital imbrication in educational research

In educational research, the digital and the nondigital need to be considered as overlapping entities:

The digital is embedded in the larger societal, cultural, subjunctive, economic, and imaginary structurations of lived experience and the systems within which we exist and operate. At the same time, through this embeddedness, the digital can act back on the social so that its specific capabilities can engender new concepts of the social and of the possible (Sassen, 2006, p. 344).

Sassen (2006) points out that it is necessary to take stabilities as well as mobilities; therefore investigating human mobility should also refer to human stability. In the past, both human mobility and stability were confined to relative certain trajectories and places. Sassen (2006) points out that boundary conditions are being reduced by digital technologies, into which intellectual capital flows much faster than ever before without location limitations. The existence of digital technologies reinforces this tendency and amplifies researchers’ capacities in ‘enabling the liquefying of what is not liquid, thereby producing or raising the mobility of what we have customarily thought of as not mobile or barely so’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 344). The research process does not only liquefy data into digitised formats but also enables data to acquire hypermobilised characteristics which enable ‘instantaneous circulation through digital networks with global span’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 344).

However, this hypermobility operates at a specific time and cannot change the character of the data. Sassen (2006) claims that ‘much of what is liquefied and circulation in digital networks and is marked by hypermobility is only one
Digital technologies are tools which strengthen and speed up the mobility and circulation of intellectual capital, while the basic nature of intellectual capital remains stable even though it ‘has been transformed by the fact that it is represented by highly liquid instruments that can circulate in global market. … It is a transformed entity’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 345).

Sassen (2006) argues that there is a dialectical relationship between the digital and nondigital and it is difficult to specify one from the other. Both have their own basic characteristics, which are parallel and independent, where one cannot be modified by the counterpart. They react on each other ‘but do not produce hybridity [as] each maintains its distinct irreducible character’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 345). The connection of the digital and non digital comes with the ‘destabilisation of older hierarchies of scale and often dramatic rescaling’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 345). There are at least two levels at which this happens. First, the traditional state-centred position is broken down by this function, like a seesaw; the more weight added on scales other than national authorities, the less that national scales remain. However, this does not mean ‘the old hierarchies disappear but that various practices and institutional arrangements produce a rescaling of at least some of the old hierarchies of scale’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 346). This new position entails factors that can challenge the former. Second, traditional understandings of international relations cannot readily explain these current rearrangements to state-centred knowledge production and its relation to novel non-state scales because:

models and theories remain focused on the logic of relations between states and the scale of the state at a time when we see a proliferation of non-state actors, cross border processes, and associated changes in the scope, exclusivity, and competence of state authority over its territory, many partly enabled by these new technologies (Sassen, 2006, p. 346).

A kind of new research territory is generated through the process of partly undermining traditional international Euro-American dominated relations and intellectual hierarchy. Sassen (2006) defines the ‘local’ as a ‘microenvironment’ positioned in changing global scales of knowledge production which entails the Internet, because ‘such a microenvironment is in many senses a localised entity, but
it is also part of global digital networks, which gives it immediate far-flung span’ (p. 346). The local and global relations of educational research can no longer ignore the connections between, and made possible by, digital and nondigital matters. For researchers, digitalisation is no longer limited to traditional boundaries and cannot be taken as a technical character of digitalisation itself. Globalisation via digitalisation enhances the integration of knowledge from around the world. Transnational researchers are playing roles as global nodes in gathering global intellectual resources and various research functions together. Sassen (2006, p. 347) claims that cross-border networks are emerging as ‘one of the key components in the architecture of “international relations”’.

There are two different opinions about the relationship between digital technologies and researchers. One is that there is a contradiction between digital technologies and researchers which is too strong to lead them to mediate with each other. Sassen (2006) argues that there are some ‘borderlands’ which provide evidence that digital technologies mediate what transnational researchers can do. Researchers do not simply read technical meanings, neglecting the truth that technologies are used by themselves under specified contexts:

use is constructed or constituted in terms of specific cultures and practices through and with which users articulate the experience and utility of electronic space. … This in-between zone that constructs the articulations of cyberspace and users (Sassen, 2006, p. 347).

The use of digital technologies is likely to be characterised by various ‘values, cultures, power systems, and institutional orders within which it is embedded’ (Sassen, 2006, p. 347). However, digital technologies are only part of the capabilities that transnational researchers use to construct dialectical relationships in knowledge production. Digital technologies and the researchers who use them, affect each other while they cannot completely modify their counterpart’s characteristics. Sassen (2006) claims that the articulations between digital technologies and individual researchers are dominated more by the advanced and sophisticated Western educational cultures, no matter what kinds of roles these articulations play. This sees more advanced educational cultures using the Internet, rather than simply operating
the Internet. The following section explains how this research project was designed, conducted and analysed according to the concepts mentioned in this section.

### 4.2 RESEARCH DESIGN

Research design is a fundamental requirement for any educational research, which is always complex and difficult to operationalise. Kumar (2005) defines ‘research design’ as ‘a procedural plan that is adopted by the researcher to answer questions validly, objectively, accurately, and economically’ (p. 84). Oppenheim (2001) defines a research design as ‘a basic plan or strategy of the research, and the logic behind it, which will make it possible and valid to draw more general conclusions from it’ (p. 6). If researchers want to make their research generalisable; to involve comparisons with other similar groups; to predict future tendencies; to produce relevant information for conclusions that are valid, they have the challenge of coming up with a research design that is appropriate, logical and makes sure their research moves in the correct direction (Oppenheim, 2001). Even a less ambitious project needs a clear and logical research design to help the investigation to succeed. Therefore, as a researcher, I had to ensure that my research design and method matched my research questions. However, as Morgan (1997) indicates, ‘planning is not something that is over and done by a given point, with a totally new set of concerns waiting to replace it’ (p. 45). I too have had to make on-going revisions to my research project as each step unfolded, so it could be integrated into a developing whole.

Silverman (2006) points out that choosing a quantitative or a qualitative research method depends on what the researcher is trying to find: that is, the research question. If the research question focuses on people’s life histories and/or everyday behaviour, as in this study, then qualitative methods are likely to be more suitable. However, ‘dependence on purely qualitative methods may neglect the social and cultural construction of the “variable” which quantitative research to correlate’ (Silverman, 2000, p. 5). This study also incorporates quantitative data.

A pervasive assumption underlying many criticisms is that quantitative and qualitative research approaches are necessarily and fundamentally different
This distinction, however, is more a matter of degree than of type. The problem of the relation of the instance of research to some presumed underlying ‘truth’ applies to the conduct of any form of educational research, irrespective of whether it is qualitative or quantitative. One of the greatest methodological fallacies of the last half century in educational research is the belief that science is a particular set of techniques rather than a state of mind, or attitude, and the organisational conditions which allow that attitude to be expressed (Silverman, 2006). Burns (2000) argues that it is possible to generate statistical representations with quantitative data which may or may not be fully justified, as they depend on the judgements and skills of the researchers, the research questions and the appropriateness of the answers. Of course, researchers have to be selective and there are always limitations to any study, as there is no way for educational researchers to capture the literal truth of events.

Research involves collecting particular sorts of evidence through the prism of particular methods, each of which has its strengths and weaknesses. For example, in a sample survey it is difficult for the researcher to ensure that the questions, categories, and language used in the questionnaire are shared uniformly by respondents, and also that the replies returned have the same meanings for all respondents. Similarly, research which relies exclusively on field observations by a single researcher is limited by definition, to the perceptions and cognitive processing of the researcher, and also by the possibility that the presence of the observer may, in some way that is hard to characterise, have influenced the behaviour and speech of what was witnessed (Silverman, 2006). Given these factors, it was decided to conduct this research by combining different research methods.

Oppenheim (2001) argues that ‘conceptualisation’ determines whether a research project is successful. ‘Conceptualisation’ refers to ‘an improved and more detailed statement of the study’s objective, preferably with theoretical underpinnings (pp. 8-9)’. In Chapter 3, the researcher has already identified the concepts that this research needed to help to frame the research design and which are used in the evidentiary chapter to give added meaning to these ideas. I have tried to follow this research process by moving from a general conceptual understanding to a more specific, grounded application of those concepts in the end.
As explained in Chapter 1, this research explores the experiences of OTTs in the NSW education context. The research problem involves exploring motives for their migration, registration and employment policy considerations, the barriers met by these OTTs and support for their professional development. Given this research focus, and concepts gleaned from the theoretical framework, the researcher decided a cross-sectional study would provide a suitable research design. This is because this design is best ‘suited to studies aimed at finding out the prevalence of a phenomenon, situation, problem, attitude or issue, by taking a cross-section of the population’ (Kumar, 2005, p. 93). According to this design, the researcher pursued the following sequence, beginning with the identification of the population, selecting samples, contacting the potential participants to find out the required evidence and then analysing that evidence. All of these procedures were conducted with reference to the research questions.

The most appropriate research methods were developed and refined during the research process in order to make the outcomes more reliable. Being a part of an Australian Research Council (ARC) Linkage Project (Reid, Collins & Singh, 2006-2009) allowed the researcher to gain a contact list of preliminary registered OTTs (N=1500) in NSW. Hence the hard copies of questionnaires were sent out to these potential respondents according to their mailing addresses. The project also was advertised in the NSW Teachers Federation’s newspaper to widen the number of potential respondents. Meanwhile, an online survey was also conducted to try to recruit more respondents.

The NSW Teachers Federation also provided the researcher with opportunities to take part in the beginning teachers’ workshops that were held in rural NSW, and which assisted the researcher to distribute surveys and to recruit interviewees. For instance, a connection to a school Principal was established during a beginning teachers’ workshop, which helped the researcher to organise a focus group in a

12 There are some concepts that could not be readily understood even when I found the literal Chinese meanings in a dictionary. Consider the term ‘focus group’, which refers to a particular method of data collection. Focus group-焦点团体 (han zi)-jiao dian tuan ti (pinyin)-Jiao= burned, Dian= point, Tuan= group, Ti= body-burn the group. Its Chinese translation is easily connected with a famous Chinese television program, ‘Topics in Focus’ which aims to report the truth. This literal Chinese
NSW public high school. The ARC Project also allowed the researcher to access official documents from the NSW Teachers Federation, which provided a large number of policy texts covering the period 1991 to 2008. This provided a solid foundation for policy analysis and informed the analysis of the interviews and questionnaires.

Kumar (2005) defines sampling as ‘the process of selecting a few (a sample) from a bigger group (the sampling population) to become the basis for estimating or predicting a fact, situation or outcome regarding the bigger group’ (p. 164). This research conducted semi-structured interviews with 19 OTTs. Most of these (n=16) were collected from the questionnaires (N=132) that were returned; they expressed their willingness to take part in face-to-face interviews. The rest of the interviewees (n=3) were recruited from the above-mentioned focus group. Initially, this research intended to use focus groups as the main research method to collect the data. Focus groups have the advantage of providing researchers with valuable data through exploratory or phenomenological approaches. The former approach is used to ‘collect descriptive information or pilot knowledge to explicate and better understand constructs and to generate hypotheses’ (Vaughn, Schumm & Sinagub 1996, p. 24). The aim of it is to explore the fields which researchers know little about before the

interpretation of ‘focus group’ did not make sense to me, a beginning researcher who was not familiar with this method. This created great mental pressure in my search for its hidden meaning. Reading a range of literature in both Chinese and English helped to develop my understanding of ‘focus groups.’ They are a special kind of open-ended interactive discussion among a group of people, which is recorded and analysed. In some circumstances, the literal translation of such keywords troubled me, undermined my self-confidence and left me without any idea of their meanings; my principal supervisor then helped me with these problems.

13 Krueger & Casey (2009) define focus group as ‘a carefully planned series of discussions designed to obtain perceptions on a defined area of interest in a permissive, nonthreatening environment’ (p. 2). There are many definitions of focus group from different points of views. Morgan (1996) claims that the definition of focus group has three essential components: ‘First, it clearly states that focus groups are a research method devoted to data collection. Second, it locates the interaction in a group discussion as the source of the data. Third, it acknowledges the researcher’s active role in creating the group discussion for data collection purposes (p. 130)’. The focus group is different from other grouped interview procedures although many forms of group interviews are self-claimed as it is (Vaughn et al., 1996; Morgan, 1998). Vaughn et al. (1996) points out that the difference between focus groups and other small-group interviews is that focus group interviews are better organized, more formal, and yield findings that result from analysis of the transcriptions from the interviews. A second distinction between focus groups and small groups is that small groups are often used for consensus building or problem solving. It is not an explicit goal in focus groups to reach a consensus… Focus groups are designed to obtain people’s opinions and not to determine the exact strength of their opinions (pp. 5-6). Morgan & Krueger (1998) also distinguishes focus groups from other interview methods by the following features: 1. do not involve research such support groups; 2. are not focused, because the moderator does not or cannot keep the group focused.
research. This method helps researchers gain knowledge and ideas which can be tested against other evidence of daily experience and research literature. Phenomenological focus groups are used to help researchers who already have an understanding of the research issues and are keen to explore more profound issues. Focus groups using the phenomenological approach seek to better comprehend the research issues, based on the common grounds of specific but divided groups. Morgan (1997) indicates that the focus group can give researchers access to more data from group discussions than is normally generated from interactions in the group.

However, focus groups have weaknesses. First, Morgan (1997) indicates that the moderator’s role of directing the focus group influences the group’s discussions. Morgan (1997) argues that researchers conducting focus groups must notice if ‘the influence of focus group moderators is unreasonably magnified, it is one of those perceptions that can be “real in its consequences”’ (p. 15). Second, group discussion seems to be a two edged sword: on the one hand, participants can inspire each other’s ideas, thus broadening the data source. However, Morgan (1997) points out: ‘some participants withhold things that they might say in private, and a tendency toward “polarisation”, in which some participants express more extreme views in a group than in private’ (p. 15).

There were disadvantages to using focus groups, which came to the surface in this research. In a focus group with seven (7) participants conducted in a NSW public school, the researcher noticed that there were only two (2) OTTs who liked to express their ideas in front of the other five (5) colleagues. They tended to express complaints more than to provide useful comments or reduced the opportunity for others to do so. Therefore, this focus group was not very successful, as the involvement of participants was too low, leaving the supposedly group discussion as more of an interview. The researcher then had to come back to the school to interview the teachers who did not get involved in the previous group discussion. This time, rich data was obtained. From this experience, the researcher realised that the functions of focus groups were not as strong as semi-structured interviews for data collection in this research. Therefore, the focus group technique was replaced by
individual interviews. The next section explains how the data was collected for this research.

4.3 DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS AND PROCEDURES

Kumar (2005) categorises types of data as primary data and secondary data. The former is collected from primary sources by using research methods of observation, interviews, questionnaires and document collection. The latter involves collecting secondary sources which have already been acquired by earlier research; this literature has been reviewed in Chapter 2. Kumar (2005) argues that neither the primary data nor secondary data can provide perfect information for researchers. A reliable data collection process ‘lies in researchers’ ability to take care of the factors that could affect the quality of the data’ (Kumar, 1996, pp. 104-105).

4.3.1 Data collection instruments

Kumar (2005) claims that researchers should be aware of the limitations of different research methods and that they should choose the most appropriate ones to achieve their research aims. The researcher considered OTTs as the population that this research would involve. OTTs have high education levels, maturity, relative high social status and diverse ethnic backgrounds. Given these complex features of the OTTs, the researcher considered that using a single research method might not collect the most appropriate data. Therefore, the researcher decided to collect primary data by using multiple methods including questionnaires, semi-structured interviews and documents. The questionnaires (see Appendix 1) provided a preliminary record of basic information about the OTTs, such as their educational qualifications, employment status and age. The semi-structured interviews (see Appendix 2) enabled those who would like to express further views about some specific questions, as well as their reflections and recommendations. The documents (see Appendix 9) provide solid official policies to help to analyse the evidence. The following sections discuss the procedures and principles for collecting data using questionnaires, interviews and documents.
4.3.1.1 Questionnaire

Kumar (2005) defines a questionnaire as a ‘written list of questions, the answers to which are recorded by respondents’ (p. 126). The participants read the questions either on hard copy or on the Internet and then write down the answers. The questionnaires can focus on either exploring general issues that do not need further statements, or questions that need to be further investigated in the interviews. Burns (2000) classifies the form of questionnaires as either descriptive or explanatory. The former type of questionnaire targets the ‘nature of existing conditions, or the attributes of a population’ while the latter seeks to ‘establish cause and effect relationships but without experimental manipulation’ (Burns, 2000, p. 566). The two forms of survey can exist in the same questionnaire. The survey questions should be clear, without ambiguous meanings, to make them easy to understand, so as to obtain valid and reliable data. Also, it is useful to design a questionnaire in an interactive form to give participants the feel of being asked the questions in a face-to-face style (Kumar, 2005). The advantage of a questionnaire is that it allows the participants to think carefully before answering a question, hence, to make better expression of their answers. A questionnaire has the following features:

1. It requires a sample of respondents to reply to a number of standard questions under comparable conditions.
2. It may be administered by an interviewer, by mailing the respondent a form for self completion, or by telephone.
3. The respondents represent a defined population. If less than 100% of the defined population is sampled then a sample survey has been conducted, a 100% survey is a census.
4. The results of the sample survey can be generalised to the defined population.
5. The use of standard questions enables comparisons of individuals to be made (Burns, 2000, p. 567).

In this research, the researcher used the questionnaire (see Appendix 1) which was designed by the ARC chief investigator. The questionnaire contained both descriptive and exploratory questions. The questionnaire was divided into four main parts. Most of the questions in the first part were designed as descriptive questions which aimed to understand the previous education and employment background of the OTTs. Migration motives were also addressed in this part, specifically as to understand what sort of advantage Australia had in recruiting the OTTs. The second

106
part of the questionnaire was designed to explore the registration processes and current employment status of the OTTs.

The third and most important part of the questionnaire asked the participants to answer a series of exploratory questions. These questions aimed to explore the OTTs' comments on their English competence, both in daily life and in teaching environments; the difficulties that the OTTs have faced in the NSW education context; and future professional development, as well as the professional support they have received. Most of the questions in this part furnished ‘positive’, ‘negative’ and ‘not specified’ blank lines, to assist the researcher to identify the key ideas easily. The researcher also left blank sections for the participants to explain in detail their responses to certain questions. The fourth section included questions about the participants' personal details. The gender, age, sex, original nationality, languages, visa type, family backgrounds and religions were requested in this section. At the end of the questionnaire, the survey participants who wished to take part in semi-structured interviews were asked to produce their contact details.

4.3.1.2 Semi-structured interviews

Interviews have been widely used in educational research (Kvale, 2007). Researchers use informal interviews as the tool to obtain information from the participants, or to obtain relevant background about human subjects for generating questionnaires or conducting experiments. Kumar (2005) defines the interview as ‘person-to-person interaction between two or more individuals with a specific purpose in mind’ (p. 123).

Kumar (2005) points out that interviews can be classified into unstructured interviews and structured interviews, according to the flexibility in the asking of questions. The former is also called an in-depth interview, in which the conversation happens spontaneously between the interviewer(s) and interviewees, while the latter is carried out to address pre-determined topics and questions in order to match the interview schedule. The interview strategy used for this study was the semi-structured interview schedule (see Appendix 2): it was ‘neither an open conversation nor a highly structured questionnaire which … includes an outline of topics to be
covered, with suggested questions’ (Kvale, 2007, pp. 11-57). Therefore, the term ‘interview’ as used in this thesis refers to the ‘semi-structured interview’.

Kvale (2007) states that such research interviewing is not a formulaic process that will guarantee replicable results among any group of researchers. The interview process can be regarded as a research process with a philosophical framework that resembles typical forms of scientific investigation. Interviews depend on the individual creativity of the researcher as much as on knowledge of the literature, procedures or criteria. Kvale (2007) argues that interviews can produce systematised knowledge; thus, the purpose of interview is to understand ‘themes of the lived daily world from the subjects’ own perspectives’ (Kvale, 2007, p. 10). Research interviews are sometimes called a dialogue, to refer to a conversation between egalitarian partners. A dialogue is a joint endeavour where both partners are searching for true understanding and knowledge. However, in a research interview there is usually one partner who is seeking to understand, and the other partner serves as a means to the interviewer’s search for knowledge. To term the interviews ‘dialogues’ is then a misnomer, as it gives an appearance of mutual interests in a conversation which takes place for the purposes of the one partner—the interviewer (Kvale, 2007).

Kvale (2007) argues that interviews for research or evaluation purposes differ in some important ways from other familiar kinds of interview or conversations. Unlike conversations in daily life, which usually include reciprocal exchanges, research interviews typically involve an interviewer, who is in charge of structuring and directing the questioning. Because a research interview promotes understanding and possible change, the emphasis is on producing intellectual understandings rather than on producing personal change. Kvale (2007) indicates that research interviews have advantages in research projects that are aimed at individual outcomes; exploring individual differences between participants’ experiences as well as documenting variations in a program’s implementation at different sites.

Interviewing is an essential tool in educational research. However, the intricate relationship between the ‘hows’ and the ‘whys’ of the interview process is not always easily understood. Kvale (2007) claims research interviews should be theoretically underpinned by theoretical or practical aspects. Key theoretical
concepts should guide the interview: for example, the interviewer needs to be concerned with ethics and validity. In this research, the researcher explored questions in the interviews such as the following:

1. The OTTs’ knowledge and perception of processes or arrangements for their movement and engagement in identifying the key people involved in this processes;
2. What are the problems, challenges, gains and losses the OTTs faced in their mobility?
3. What are their suggestions for the NSW education context to support OTTs to get used to Australia’s education culture?
4. According to the OTTs’ experiences, can they explain the reasons which cause some education strategies to work and others not to work? Can they suggest better ways to address the problem?
5. Can OTTs suggest some possible strategies, intervention programs and useful indicators for government?

4.3.1.3 Documentary sources

Documents were also a source of primary data and were ‘collected either by [the researcher] or by someone else for the specific purpose [the researcher] has in mind’ (Kumar, 2005, p. 141). The documentary sources of data included Government publications and records. Given the feature of this type of data has already been collected by someone else, the researcher extracted the information from documents that were supplied by the NSW DET and NSW Teachers Federation (see Appendix 9). The researcher also extracted documents from websites. The Government documents concerned the conduct of recruitment and development of the OTTs.

4.3.2 Data collection procedures

In this section, the researcher explains how the data were collected, using the procedures mentioned in the above section. The problems and limitations of each data collection instrument are considered, to better understand how the data collection procedures addressed the research problem.
4.3.2.1 Questionnaire collection procedures

Burns (2000) claims that survey research has the following features:

1. Planning involves the determination of what topic is to be investigated and what population is to be studied.
2. Sampling involves decision making about which people from the population of interest are to be included in the survey.
3. Construction of the data-gathering instrument involves writing the question and planning the format of the instrument to be used.
4. Carrying out the survey involves pre-testing the instrument to determine whether it will obtain the desired data, distributing questionnaires to them, and verifying the accuracy of the data gathered (p. 568).

For this qualitative research method, the research sample was decided in advance according to the aim of this research project (Vaughn et al., 1996). The research reported here was conducted accordingly. The researcher first set up the survey population as OTTs (see Chapter 1 for the definition). The researcher then used a range of descriptive and exploratory questions which were developed by the ARC chief investigator to explore key issues among the target group. These questions were discussed with the NSW DET and with Teachers Federation officers to make sure of their appropriateness. At the beginning, the questionnaires (see Appendix 1) were distributed to the OTTs through NSW education networks and meetings that the target population might attend. However, the various employment situations and scattered working places of the target population made it difficult to recruit a satisfactory number of participants. The research seemed to be stuck at this stage. Fortunately, being a part of an ARC project made data linkage possible. The chief data sources were collected from a contact list of OTTs (N=1500) who were preliminarily registered with the NSW DET. Hard copies of the questionnaires were then mailed out to the addresses on the contact list. The ARC project also established an online site to recruit participants to complete the surveys and get follow-up interviews.

Web-based qualitative research approaches enable researchers and research participants to get beyond the traditional face-to-face conduct of survey or mailing
methods for distributing questionnaires. All of this was made possible by digital technologies. The hypermobility of these digital functions benefit from their non-materialist characteristics. However, Sassen (2006) argues that we should not disregard that such technologies are always undertaken in various material environments. Thus, researchers also need non-material strategies for collecting questionnaires, to match the digital strategies of the non-material world:

much of what happens in electronic space is deeply inflected by the cultures, the material practices, and the imaginaries that take place outside electronic space. Much of what we think of when it comes to cyberspace would lack any meaning or referents if we were to exclude the world outside cyberspace (Sassen, 2006, p. 344).

The online surveys and the mailed out questionnaires greatly helped the researcher access survey data (N=132) for this research project.

4.3.2.2 Interview procedures

The interview participants were identified from the survey responses, which asked the potential participants whether they would be willing to take part in interviews, and if so to provide their contact details. This was a useful method for recruiting interviewees. The information collected via the surveys included details of their names, email addresses and telephone numbers. The researcher also asked for help from the NSW DET and the NSW Teachers Federation to provide opportunities to attend Beginning Teachers Workshops and the Pre-employment Program sessions conducted for OTTs. These activities were held in different places in rural and remote NSW, which increased the opportunities to connect with potential interview participants. The OTTs who agreed to be interviewed also helped the researcher to find more participants for interviews.

In the process of recruiting the interviewee participants, the researcher tried to contact the participants by email (see Appendix 6) to let them feel that their opinions were important and would make great contributions to this research. The researcher pointed out that the participants’ contributions would greatly benefit the project and that the interviews would be anonymous. This increased the chances that prospective participants would share their information with the researcher. The date and time of
the interview were very important factors in attracting potential participants to attend
the interviews. This also helped to establish a good interaction with the participants
(Vaughn et al., 1996). The researcher then contacted the participants to fix a suitable
time and venue for the interviews. In certain instances, the researcher travelled to the
interviewee’s preferred venue to conduct face-to-face interviews according to their
preferences of time and place. However, in some situations, it was impossible to
meet all the preferences of the interviewees, as they were located in remote places in
NSW. The researcher then decided to conduct telephone interviews with those who
could not be reached in person (see Appendix 5).

Vaughn et al. (1996) indicate that a neutral location and well-maintained equipment
should be considered as basic conditions for interviews. The researcher booked the
conference room at the University each time when a telephone interview was to be
conducted, to keep participants feeling comfortable when answering questions
without being annoyed by noises or other distracting factors. It was important for this
research that the interviews were conducted with various types of participants (see
Appendix 5). Kvale (2007) summarises three steps for collecting data through an
interview:

1. Thematising. Formulate the purpose of an investigation and
describe the concept of the topic to be investigated before the
interview starts.
2. Designing. Plan the design of the study, taking into consideration
before the interviewing starts.
3. Interviewing. Conduct the interviews based on an interview guide
and with a reflective approach to the knowledge sought and the
interpersonal relation of the interview situation (p. 35).

Therefore, selecting the appropriate interviewees who could help the researcher
gather the most accurate and useful data had a close connection with positive
interview outcomes. The researcher used the first face-to-face interview as a pilot in
order to improve the questions in the following interviews. Then, the researcher
conducted the rest interviews according to following steps to get satisfactory
responses from participants. Before the interview began, the researcher drew up an
interview schedule (see Appendix 2) to guide the key questions to be asked and to
make sure the interviews would not go off the track.
This schedule also helped the researcher to rehearse before the interviews. The researcher told the participants that their personal information would not be disclosed and that the aim of the research was to gain their observations in the light of the research topic. The researcher explained the research questions, avoiding too much detail, to avoid over-preparation by the participants to ensure realistic responses. Examples of the questions which would appear in the interview were given to the participants in order to help them become familiar with some basic issues that were to be explored. The researcher then set up the time and informed the interviewees that the interview would last approximately 45-60 minutes. The length of the interview was estimated from the pilot interview, to make sure that the rest of the interviewees finished the questions on time.

As the first step of the interview, a general statement (see Appendix 3) about the research was provided. This included research title and aims, which were presented to participants to make sure that all of them understood the research project and voluntarily agreed to take part in the research. The researcher then started to ask the prepared questions to the participants. The researcher at this stage worked to ensure good personal communication when discussing problems related to key questions, to try to get more interactive and detailed responses. The researcher considered the responses in his mind during this stage to clarify what was wanted and unwanted information.

This ensured the researcher gained the most useful information from the participants by using the target questions probe to ensure successful research outcomes coming from the desired information (Vaughn et al., 1996). The participants provided fruitful information when the researcher could find connections between their responses and the focus of the research. At the end of the interviews, the researcher showed politeness to the interviewees by expressing appreciation for their participation. The researcher also emailed the participants timely and proper feedback after the interviews, explaining how valuable their interviews were. Keeping good relationships between the researcher and participants helped develop further leads in the project.
4.3.2.3 Documentary collection procedures

Being a part of the ARC project, the researcher took part in several meetings organised by the ARC chief investigator, with the NSW DET and the NSW Teachers Federation. These meetings provided opportunities for the researcher to access documents from the NSW Teachers Federation (see Appendix 9). The researcher analysed these documents at the University and then returned them in person and on time. The following section introduces how the researcher conducted reliable and valid data analysis.

4.4 DATA ANALYSIS PRINCIPLES AND PROCEDURES

Vaughn (1996) indicates that researchers have to transcribe, organise and reduce a large quantity of data to translate into the convincing material needed to develop a reasoned argument. Yin (cited in Krueger & Casey, 2009, p. 125) argues that ‘data analysis consists of examining, categorising, tabulating, or otherwise recombining the evidence, to address the initial propositions of a study’. Both quantitative and qualitative methods of analysis were part of the process used in this study. This section explains and justifies steps in the data analysis principles and procedures used in this research.

4.4.1 Reliability of data analysis

The research reported here involved collecting the primary data by relatively unstructured means such as tape recordings and transcribing these conversations. Bell (2005) suggests that ‘whatever procedure for collecting data is selected, it should always be examined critically to assess to what extent it is likely to be reliable and valid’ (p. 117). The main way for the researcher to ensure the reliability of the evidence is to document the process of data collection in detail. It is possible to analyse data by classifying and categorising it but for much of this process to remain implicit. For this study, the interpretative procedures were decided before the analysis and refined during the process. Thus, for example, computer software such as NVivo and SPSS was used to facilitate the analysis of the content of interview transcripts and questionnaires. A coding frame was developed to characterise the
evidentiary sources (for example, in relation to the age, sex, and role of the speaker; the topic; and so on). Bell (2005) argues that ‘reliability is the extent to which a test or procedure gives similar results under constant conditions on all occasions’ (p. 117). The reliability of the analysis of the data presented in this thesis has been enhanced by organising an assessment of it by researchers involved in the ARC project.

4.4.2 Safeguarding Validity

In addition to the issue of reliability, the researcher gave attention to the validity of the findings. Bell (2005) points out that ‘validity is an altogether more complex concept. Usual definitions of validity are that it tells us whether an item or instrument measures or describes what it is supposed to measure or describe, but this is rather vague and leaves many questions unanswered’ (p. 117). According to Burns (2000), validation strategies used in research can involve feeding the findings back to the participants to see if they regard the findings as a reasonable account of their experiences. If this strategy is used in isolation, it mistakenly assumes that fidelity to the participants’ commonsense perceptions is the touchstone of validity. In this research, this approach to validation was set alongside other approaches to testing the plausibility of the research account provided in this thesis. Even so, different researchers and stakeholders are likely to have different perspectives on certain issues raised in the data analysis chapters.

Burns (2000) indicates that testing validity is important as ‘research literature contains many examples of tests/techniques being used without proper consideration of their validity for the user’s purpose’ (p. 351). The researcher has tried to give a fair account of these incidences and to explain why the data varies. In the same way, where the findings of this study diverge from the theoretical concepts, this meant revising the theory in order to increase its reliability and validity. It was also useful for the researcher to ask himself questions to make sure the analysis was valid. These questions ask how well does the analysis explain the evidence; why have the participants explained issues in the way they do; how comprehensible would this explanation be to a thoughtful participant in a different setting, say China; and how
well does the explanation cohere with what we already know from the research literature (Burns, 2000).

4.4.3 Preparing for data analysis

For many researchers, the toughest thing after data collection is to reduce the large amount of data they have generated and then to give an accurate, appropriate and reliable interpretation of it (Vaughn et al., 1996). Before this researcher started the data analysis, some techniques were used to help to systematically reduce the data set. These techniques included taking notes during interviews, transcribing interviews according to agreed procedures, and identifying key ideas from the interview immediately on its completion (Vaughn et al., 1996). The researcher kept track of the spoken or non-spoken language of participants to help in understanding transcripts when doing face-to-face interviews. Flip charts also helped the researcher to relate different ideas to different participants when exploring whether they support an issue or not. Since the interviews were conducted after collecting the questionnaires, the researcher checked the responses of the participants on a specific question to get an indication of their opinions relative to the interviews.

After conducting interviews, the researcher sent interview recordings to a professional for transcription immediately, so the data analysis could be carried out as soon as possible. The researcher then had to decide how much detail to include in the transcripts. It was noted that, ‘the easiest data analysis procedure occurs with the most accurate and complete transcript’ (Vaughn et al., 1996, p. 102). During this process, the researcher found that evidence from two interviews could not be used, due to technical problems with the recording. This is why the researcher interviewed 19 participants but only used 17 of them as evidence. This can be taken as a limitation in the data collection process.

The researcher thought long and hard about how to conduct the data analysis of the surveys, interviews and texts, how to connect outcomes from these different data sources and how to link them to the theoretical tools. This planning involved consideration of effective ways to save useful data as well as going through the
questionnaire, transcripts and texts to make certain that all the data was correctly recorded. For instance, the researcher considered whether to accept the interviewer’s conclusions when the participant’s opinions appear to offer different interpretations.

Vaughn et al. (1996) suggest summarising key ideas as another technique to be undertaken before data analysis. The researcher summarised key ideas immediately after the interviews to generate an initial understanding of the interviewees’ comments and likewise after reading each document. The researcher identified connections among participants’ comments by finding common points among them, in preference to counting the number of times the same terms occur. The commonly used words were identified to present the participants’ ideas on specific issues. The researcher judged which groups of words appropriately captured the participants’ ideas. Sometimes the participants changed their opinions during the interviews. Therefore, the researcher was careful about identifying consistencies or otherwise in the participants’ opinions, and asked why this occurred and what kinds of contexts drove the participants to change their ideas. Morgan (1997) suggests that researchers recognise that what participants do in the research process depends on the context and that what happens in any research project depends on those who participate in it.

4.4.4 Data analysis procedures

It is important to provide information about how and why the data were analysed in this research. Data analysis of the interviews and documents provided a means for generating significant evidentiary excerpts from transcripts, and texts. The analysis of the questionnaires involved providing statistics reporting both descriptive and exploratory responses. The analysis also required procedures for exploring patterns among these different sources of evidence. Useful data analysis methods included:

1. coding data into predetermined categories;
2. using the data as a basis for summary statements that capture the main ideas of the interviewer
3. using quotes from the participants to support the categories, main ideas, and summary statements (Vaughn et al., 1996, p. 104).

Below are seven steps which were used in this research for analysing the data.
4.4.4.1 Analysing the survey data

The researcher obtained 132 responses from the online survey website as well as 1,500 mail-out questionnaires until this thesis finished. The researcher used the computer software SPSS to process the survey data. It should be noticed here that the computer software (NVivo and SPSS) used in this research could not help to process the data automatically. To some extent, they played the role of sorting and organising the data which had already entered into the system, especially the NVivo application.

For the survey data, the researcher first entered all the returned questionnaire responses into SPSS, according to the questions for further processing. The descriptive questions were analysed by determining the frequencies for the variables in this research. The maximum and minimum outcomes of the descriptive questions were able to be identified at this stage. For the exploratory questions, the researcher first made summary tables in SPSS to explore possible answers. Then, the key ideas from each response were identified and categorised into several main themes. This resulted in establishing the frequency of the main themes. The outcomes of the descriptive and exploratory responses were combined to investigate interrelationships between them. The survey analysis provided statistical data that helped the researcher to test the outcomes from the interviews and the policy analysis.

The researcher found that there were unanswered questions in some questionnaires through data entry process. Most of these phenomenon existed in exploratory questions. Fink (2006) indicates that ‘respondents may not answer questions because they do not want to, they miss the questions, or they do not understand them’ (p.88). Thus, in order to improve validity of this research, the researcher decided to conduct survey data analysis according to valid survey responses.

4.4.4.2 Identifying key ideas from the interviews

Key ideas from the interviews helped establish significant findings for this research project. Morgan (1997) indicates that the researchers need to identify the data, from what the participants say, that is interesting and important. Vaughn et al. (1996)
point out that ‘the big ideas are ones that emerge after involvement, rereading, and careful consideration of data’ (p. 105). Identifying the important ideas is the starting point for further analysis. In this study, the researcher used the computer software NVivo to identify the key ideas from the transcripts and remove those unwanted elements. The key ideas generated at this stage are called ‘free nodes’ in the language of NVivo. This stage also allowed the researcher to understand the key nodes and to arrange them in a systematic order to identify those elements most likely to contribute to findings.

4.4.4.3 Dividing interview data into evidentiary units

After identifying the key ideas, Vaughn et al. (1996) argue that it is necessary to divide the data into evidentiary units by identifying categories. The researcher noticed that there were numerous points in the interviews that were interesting but not relevant to the research question. So the researcher eliminated information which was irrelevant to the research questions under investigation, no matter how interesting it was. The researcher then identified evidentiary units which were as small as possible but clearly related to the research questions. Thus, it was possible to make sure that the analysis focused on what it was intended to do. Direct quotations from the transcripts ensured the researcher had access to the first hand or primary evidence that was then available for analysis and interpretation. In order to classify the units of evidence, the researcher kept the research problems in mind as it was essential for data analysis. The researcher also kept a data log to record his reasons for classifying and labelling data sources by using the ‘memo’ function of NVivo.

4.4.4.4 Classification of units of analysis

The purpose of this step was to group the evidentiary units identified in Step 3 into relevant categories, which are called ‘tree nodes’ in NVivo. It involved classifying different key ideas (free nodes) into themes. Vaughn et al. (1996) state that:

categorising brings together those information units that are related to the same content. Categories are superordinate headings that provide an
organisational theme for the units of data. During this step, rules that describe category properties are defined to justify the inclusion of units that category and also to serve as a basis for later tests of intersorter reliability (p. 107).

The researcher carefully considered which evidentiary units were related to certain categories or tree nodes. Explanations of the principles that informed these decisions are provided in the evidentiary chapters, so as to clarify the differences between evidentiary units. The researcher also explains the labels given to each category. This gives the researcher interested in doing further investigations, a clear guide. Vaughn et al. (1996) find that it can be difficult if not tedious to sort evidentiary units into different categories but it is necessary. To do this the researcher established various electronic folders to store the evidentiary units. The researcher also checked and sorted the irrelevant categories again, after the first round of categorising to make sure there was no useful evidence left out. Here it has to be said, explaining the criteria for identifying categories was very important because all the evidence needed to be considered and reconsidered by testing its relevance to the research questions.

During the NVivo process, the criteria for generating the evidentiary units had to be revised and merged several times, when they tended to become homogeneous. The last stage in this step was to contemplate the evidentiary units in the various folders and sort them into their final categories. The researcher then set aside material which was irrelevant to the research questions, and did so with determination no matter how interesting the information was.

4.4.4.5 Checking themes

Vaughn et al. (1996) claim that the themes are at the core of the research from which key ideas and information are generated for interpretation. The aim of this step was to check whether the categories or the tree nodes generated in Step Three provided enough evidence to support the key ideas generated in the first step. For this reason, the researcher made certain that all the information and categories were in keeping with the scope of these themes by conducting a content analysis of the themes.
4.4.4.6 Content analysis of the interviews

The theoretical concepts played a key role in the data analysis generally, as well as guiding the direction of the research reported in this thesis. By means of content analysis the evidence and theory were engaged to inform and test each other. Ezzy (2002) indicates that:

Content analysis can be useful as a stage of data analysis as it allows the relevance of pre-existing theory to be tested, and it can be used as a way of assessing the applicability of a theory that emerges during thematic or content analysis (p. 85).

The researcher used the theoretical propositions established in Chapter 3 to identify a framework for the data analysis. Content analysis was used in this research to test the data which had already been categorised by means of the above steps. This process guided the researcher to interpret the evidentiary excerpts using the theoretical framework. Interpretation of the use of these theoretical concepts was used to test whether these concepts could explain the results. In this sense, the research findings reported were evidentiary integrations of theoretical concepts and empirical data.

4.4.4.7 Document analysis

Yanow (2000) points out that document analysis, including the analysis of government policies and reports, can address a range of issues. The analysis of such documents from various domains can be integrated into data collection using various research methods. Yanow (2000) considers the basic step of document analysis as specifying and defining the research problem under investigation in order to reduce and control the scope by information to be collected and analysed. Setting up research criteria to sort the documents into different categories helped the researcher understand how to compare different documents from different individuals and organisations. The stakeholders regulate the documents made available, which means they affected the factors by which certain materials were made available. Thus, document ‘analyses require another set of analytic tools, ones based on philosophical presuppositions that put human meaning and social realities at their heart’ (Yanow, 2000, p. 4). This analytic base for investigating documents helped
the researcher better understand issues about the context in which they were obtained. The conceptual framework established in Chapter 3 indicates that different cultural and social structures were likely to inform the generation of documents in different contexts.

The process of analysis could not avoid the personal interpretations of the researcher because ‘we live in a social world characterised by the possibilities of multiple interpretations although dispassionate, rigorous science is possible’ (Yanow, 2000, p. 5). Accordingly, this means that different document analysts might get different interpretations of these tests, and that is why excerpts from them have been presented.

The interpretive approach to document analysis is concerned with the content of the texts themselves, but also analyses them interactively in relation to other evidence:

The interpretive approach is less an argument (in the context of policy analysis, at least) contesting the nature of reality than one about the human possibilities of knowing the world around us and the character of that knowledge (Yanow, 2000, p. 7).

The first stage in the interpretive approach is that it provoked the document analyst to question the texts by connecting them to the other evidence and together to investigate true processes and their interactive effects. In this way, the document analyst helped to see behind a superficial reading of them. The second stage in this interpretive approach was to explore contradictions between the texts and other sources of evidence. The steps of interpretive documentary analysis included identifying:

---

14 Document analysis in this study was not restricted to the language or ideas as understood and intended by their authors. Others, whose understandings of the document are or will be central to its enactment are also of analytic concern. Interpretive document analysis explores the contrasts between meanings as intended—'authored texts'—and the possibly variant and even incommensurable meanings—'constructed' texts—made of them by other relevant groups. Much document analysis requires the establishment of intent as a benchmark against which to assess enactments or outcomes. This is the sense of the document as established by its creators—the authored text. But that interpretive analysis leads us to see is that it would be erroneous to assume that this is the only meaning appropriate to or relevant for assessment. As implementation problems are often created by different understandings of document language, it is as important for analysts to access these other interpretations (Yanow, 2000).
1. the artefacts (language, objects, acts) that are significant carriers of meaning for a given policy issue, as perceived by policy-relevant actors and interpretive communities.
2. communities of meaning/interpretation/speech/practice that are relevant to the policy issue under analysis.
3. the ‘discourses’: the specific meanings being communicated through specific artefacts and their entailments (in though, speech, and act).
4. the points of conflict and their conceptual sources (affective, cognitive, and/or moral) that reflect different interpretations by different communities.
5. implications of different meanings. Interpretations for policy formulation and/or action.
6. showing that differences reflect different ways of seeing.
7. some other form to bridge differences (e.g., suggest reformulation or reframing) (Yanow, 2000, p. 22).

In the process of document analysis, the researcher used the excerpts derived from the documents and websites acquired from the NSW DET and NSW Teachers Federation as primary evidence and listed them in Appendix 9 but not reference list. The first step was a two-way process whereby the researcher first identified concrete expressions of the abstract meanings. This was an interactive process that was carried out at the same time to establish meanings that influenced each other. The next step involved identifying the specific meanings (and their contexts) which were carried by various documents. Then, the researcher collected different and contradicting views from various texts, which led to distinctive concepts.

The researcher examined the documents to explore potentially conflicting meanings. Further text analysis demanded the researcher identify the positions among different texts for different concepts. The role of the researcher here was to better understand different opinions. The final step in the document analysis saw the researcher work to achieve a balance among various conceptual meanings from various data sources. This meant combining the analysis of surveys and interviews. The ethical issues addressed in this research are presented in the following section.

4.5 RESEARCH ETHICS

In spite of the advantages of the research methods involved in this thesis, the researcher was aware that the participants were human beings who might raise
ethical issues. Silverman (2006) indicates that there is no need to worry about ethical issues where ‘empirical research was based on documents and texts that were already in the public sphere’ (p. 316). This was the case in this study. Therefore, this section focuses on how to avoid the ethical issues that may occur in using questionnaires and interviews. This means the researcher was aware that any incorrect understanding and improper use of the evidence could trigger potential problems which could lead to the failure of the research project.

4.5.1 Ethical issues related to the participants

In the light of the importance of ethics in educational research, the researcher used ethical principles and procedures to collect and analyse data, including assessing potential risks. Kumar (2005) claims that the following ethical issues are related to research participants:

1. Collecting information
2. Seeking consent
3. Providing incentives
4. Seeking sensitive information
5. The possibility of causing harm to participants

The researcher investigated the questionnaire and interview questions very carefully and organised the questions to meet the specific requirements of the research. The opening and following questions were prepared prior to the interviews with such sufficiency as to justify the relevance of the research and to avoid misusing the interview and wasting the participants’ time. The researcher carefully considered ethical principles in designing this research project. According to the focus of this research, the research subjects thus were determined as overseas trained teachers and not Australian-trained teachers with migrant backgrounds, although the latter could also be called immigrant teachers. This principle helped the researcher to be clear about the population that this research should be focused on, so as to avoid the ethical issue of surveying or interviewing the incorrect population.
4.5.1.1 Informed consent

Kumar (2005) indicates that it is unethical to conduct research without the consent of the participants. The researcher considered that the survey used in this research would not involve an ethical issue in acquiring consent from the participants. This was because the potential participants had the right to decide whether they wanted to fill out the questionnaires. Therefore, the returned valid questionnaires were considered as the expression of consent by the participants for participating in this research. However, the conduct of the interviews needed consent from the potential participants. The last question in the surveys asked whether the survey participants would like to take part in an interview. The researcher then contacted those participants (see Appendix 6). In this way, either telephone interviews or face-to-face interviews were conducted with these participants. The researcher also made sure that all these participants knew that they did so voluntarily.

4.5.1.2 Anonymity and confidentiality

This research was conducted to keep the participants’ personal information from being disclosed to third parties. The questionnaire responses were entered and analysed by numbers according to the date of the receipt of the surveys. Before the interviews began, the researcher informed the participants that their personal information would be kept confidential, as the aim of the research was to gain their insights in the light of research questions. The researcher also asked the participants for their permission to record these conversations. All the interview participants signed the consent forms\(^ {15} \) (see Appendix 4) and all the interview participants agreed to be recorded. The names of the interviewees have been changed so participants’ anonymity will guarantee that their personal information will not be revealed. All the returned questionnaires and interview transcripts were safely locked in the researcher’s university office. The researcher also informed the interview participants that the research report would be sent to them once the researcher was permitted to publish the results.

\(^ {15} \) The telephone interview participants signed and sent the consent form with returned surveys.
4.5.2 Ethical issues related to the researcher

Kvale (2007) indicates that an interview is a moral enterprise: ‘The human interaction in the interview affects the interviewees and the knowledge produced by an interview inquiry affects understanding of the human condition’ (p. 23). The interview is a process which involves the interaction between interviewer and interviewees. Thus, the interview should follow ethical rules and principles. The interview should contain commitment ‘to increasing knowledge of human behaviour and of people’s understanding of themselves and others, and to utilising this knowledge for the promotion of human welfare’ (Kvale, 2007, p. 24). Good research without ethical problems aims to provide opportunities to better understand human behaviours, and this knowledge should help improve human welfare. Interview techniques are an essential tool in qualitative research, in which the researcher avoids asking participants overly sensitive questions. During the conduct of the interviews, the researcher kept careful watch for possible dangers or difficulties, as well as doing or saying what was appropriate to make the participants feel comfortable. The following are triggers that might cause inaccurate responses from participants:

1. the general environment of the interview is threatening
2. the questions are inappropriate or ambiguous, or
3. the moderator is inept in eliciting and encouraging responses or disrespectful of the integrity of responses (Vaughn et al., 1996, p. 152).

The interactions between participants and the researcher were carefully considered. First, some of the participants answered the questions openly, offering as much information as possible, while some of them chose to answer questions in a way to suit what they thought and expected. Second, bias might come from an over-bearing researcher; thus, conservative participants might seldom have a chance to express their opinions. The researcher tried to avoid this situation. Third, there was no need for participants to prepare for the questions prior to the interview, as the aim was to gain various opinions from different types of participants. It was better to let the participants form their points of views during the process of the interviews.
The aim of the interviews was to find out participants’ perceptions, experiences or conceptions in a way that would provide substantial evidence about the research problem. Therefore, the researcher has avoided generalising the results of this data too widely, as they are more likely to be relevant to specific interviewees. Instead, the research questions are connected to particular issues, including:

1. typical responses of a larger population,
2. typical responses of a particular subgroup, and
3. highly individual and idiosyncratic responses (Vaughn et al., 1996, p. 154).

While the researcher might have misinterpreted the meaning of interviews because his contact with the subjects is too close; this was not the case in this study. Otherwise this could have handicapped, blocked or otherwise kept the researcher from being neutral.

4.6 CONCLUSION

This Chapter has demonstrated how the researcher conducted the research project reported in this thesis by using various qualitative research techniques to address the research problem, and theoretical concepts. This Chapter addressed the practical problems that the researcher faced in attempting to conduct focus groups as a data collection technique and the decision to forgo this approach, and how to convert the data through rigorous analysis using step-by-step procedures. It would be wrong to think that the data generated by these procedures was easy to analyse and generate outcomes from, in accordance with what was anticipated. Rather, given the large amount of data generated, it took a considerable amount of time, energy and skill to analyse and interpret them. Likewise, it is difficult to claim that all the data was useful or that all the findings would be agreed upon by other researchers or ‘end users’. This research attempted to link the principles of qualitative research to the structures and conventions of practical settings where the evidence was collected. Evidentiary excerpts were generated through data analysis to explore various concepts which add depth and extend the researcher’s initial interpretations. This Chapter has demystified expectations for developing qualitative research while
explaining the basis for what to include in the evidentiary chapters. Chapters 5 to 8 present the analysis of the evidence according to both, undertaken in accordance with the principles and procedures addressed in this Chapter, while offering conceptual interaction and elaboration on the literature.
CHAPTER FIVE

THE IMMIGRATION AND REGISTRATION PROCESS FOR OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS: NSW EXPERIENCES AND PROCESSES

Communitarians were attached to the soil, cultivated their roots and felt in truly organic connection with one another … to rely on unspoken understandings, unexamined traditions and slowly evolving customs. Since then there had been great changes in Communitaria. Waves of immigration and modern communications had unsettled the old ways and created a more heterogeneous society (Lukes, 1996, p. 118).

5.0 INTRODUCTION

Australian society is constituted by various connections among its diverse peoples, and between them and the peoples of the world. The foundation of a stable society depends on whether its people have balanced possessions, rights, opportunities and well-being. This principle is hard to implement through regulations, although the state exerts subtle influence in other ways on the connections among its people and others; those recruited to be its teachers comprise one such group. State-sponsored labour migration happens, and creates the context where the drive for balance in these conditions may be interrupted or broken. Workers tend to migrate to other countries when the connections in their homeland change or their dreams seem unrealisable. The incentives for migration include bettering family life, career development, a change in lifestyle or the need to avoid an unstable society. The new immigrants interrupt the old communitarian principles of the society which has recruited them by making its social components multiple and different.

This Chapter focuses on the analysis of evidence about the immigration and registration experiences of the OTTs who participated in this study. The analysis of evidence presented here helps to explain why these OTTs chose to come to Australia to continue their careers. Australia is well known internationally for its versatile and vibrant lifestyles, secure social environment, and its high quality education system for children. These are among the reasons teachers who have gained overseas
teaching qualifications seek better professional opportunities and an improved standard of life in Australia. The survey evidence provided in this Chapter was drawn from the responses (N=132) received. The interview evidence comes from 17 participants who expressed interest in taking part in the interviews. The survey and interview evidence provide an opportunity to explore the major incentives OTTs have for coming to Australia. Where relevant this Chapter also provides analyses of policy texts to explore how the teacher registration process works for OTTs. As might be expected, the teacher registration process involves checking the academic qualifications and work experience of the OTTs to make sure that they can fulfil requirements for employment in NSW. All OTTs who want to be employed in NSW public schools have to go through this process.

5.1 PROFILES OF SURVEY PARTICIPANTS

To start this Chapter, it is necessary to provide a profile of the participants who completed the survey used in this study. Figure 5.1 indicates that most of the survey participants were female, some 78.79% (n=104) of the 132 survey respondents, against 21.21% (n=28) of the 132 survey participants, who were male.

In terms of the country of origin of the survey participants, Figure 5.2 shows that OTTs from the UK made up the largest category (32.58%, n=43) of the OTTs. The OTTs who came from the Asia Pacific regions (18.18%, n=24) made the second largest category of incoming teachers, with others coming from South Africa.
(15.15%, n=20) and New Zealand (12.12%, n=16). There were 9.09% (n=12) of the OTTs from the North America region. The following 12.88% (n=17) of the survey respondents came from European, African and Latin American countries. Given the above figures, OTTs from the UK, New Zealand and North America may be taken as native English speakers. Thus, at least 53.79% (n=71) of the OTTs should not have English proficiency problems in daily communication. And 86.36% (n=114) of the OTTs nominate English as the main speaking language at home (see Question 38, Appendix 1).

**Figure 5.2**  
Country of origin of the OTTs

Figure 5.3 shows the age ranges of the OTTs. There were 127 valid responses and more than half (58.27%, n=74) of respondents were aged from 21 to 40, which means they were of a good age for teaching in Australia. The average age of these 127 OTTs was 39.14. There were 13.39% (n=17) of OTTs aged from 51 to 70, which means this group of OTTs will either retire in the next ten years or have already retired. The age group of 41-50 took up 28.35% (n=36) of the OTTs.

**Figure 5.3**  
Age range of the OTTs
Figure 5.4 shows teaching areas of the OTTs (N=132). According to MCEETYA (2004), the teacher labour force in NSW primary schools is generally adequate. However, from Figure 5.4, there are still 59.09% (n=78) of the OTTs who could teach in primary areas, which may raise a concern of over supply of primary teachers in NSW. Also, 58.33% (n=77) of the OTTs can teach in secondary areas and 19.70% (n=26) of the 132 survey respondents can teach both in primary and secondary areas.

![Figure 5.4](image)

Figure 5.4
Qualification of teaching areas

MCEETYA (2004) also indicates that the NSW secondary teacher labour force is not adequate in specific localities and disciplines, such as Maths, Science, Technology and LOTE. Figure 5.5 shows the curriculums of OTTs who may qualify to teach in secondary areas. Thus, the following figures are generated based on 77 OTTs’ responses (see Figure 5.4). There were 25.97% (n=20) of OTTs who could teach Social Science subjects, followed by Science (20.78%, n=16), and English (19.48%, n=15). Besides Science subjects, which have relatively more OTT supply, the in-demand disciplines like Maths, LOTE and Technology are in relatively low OTT supply: 9.09% (n=7), 2.60% (n=2) and 3.90% (n=3) of the 77 OTTs. Some 9.09% (n=7) of the participants did not provide responses.
Most of the survey questions were generally well answered by the participants. However, some of the survey questions, such as Questions 28 and 29 (see Appendix 1) did not collect many valid responses, or responses like ‘N/A’, that could not provide substantive data for analysing. The researcher then decided not to focus on questions like these and instead put them as potential interview questions.

5.2 PROFILES OF THE INTERVIEW PARTICIPANTS

This section provides a brief biographical sketch of each of the seventeen (N=17) interviewees.

Alka, was from Fiji and came to Australia in 1997. She has a Bachelor of Education in Home Economics and had 17 years teaching experience in Fiji before migrating to Australia. She is a permanent teacher in a public school in Sydney.

Anita migrated from India. She has a Masters degree in Education specifically in Child Development which she gained in India. Anita taught in India for two years, working with primary school children. She spent two years with her husband in Italy before coming to Australia in 2000. She is currently a teacher’s assistant in a preschool.
Anna is from the UK and did a Bachelors degree with Honours in Zoology and then she studied for a Postgraduate Certificate in Education, which she did in primary school teaching. Then Anna worked in an infants school in the UK for three years. Anna migrated to Australia in 2007 with her husband, who was offered a job at a university in Sydney. Anna is now employed in a tertiary education institution.

Chinmayi migrated to Australia from Sri Lanka as a skilled migrant in 2000. She received her Bachelors degree in Arts and a Postgraduate Diploma in Education in Sri Lanka in 1980s. She was a TESOL teacher in an international school in Sri Lanka for many years. She is now working for a public education institution in Sydney.

Edward came from the United States of America. In 2006, he migrated to Australia to marry an Australian woman. Edward has a Bachelors degree in Science, which prepared him to teach science and Physical Education in the USA. He had two years part-time work experience in the USA. He is currently teaching in a remote school in NSW.

Judy was born and raised in Minneapolis (Minnesota) USA. She went to university there as well and has Bachelors degrees in education as well as theology. After graduating, she taught in Los Angles (California) for a year and North Chicago (Illinois) for three years. Because her husband-to-be is Australian, Judy moved to Australia in 2005. She used to work casually in a public school in Sydney but left there as she was desperate to find a permanent position. From then on, she has worked in private sector schools. She plans to go to Melbourne to gain further education.

Karen was born in England. She did her degree in a teacher’s training college in the UK. She used to be in a co-ordinator role in PE, English and literacy in a primary school before starting her Masters degree in Education in the UK. Karen then became Deputy Head of a junior school. After about twenty years teaching in the UK and Papua New Guinea, Karen came to Australia in 2001 to work for a junior school in Melbourne. She came to Sydney with her Australian husband in 2007. Karen is currently employed in a tertiary education institution.
Medlyn is from Ireland and studied there for four years for a Bachelors degree in languages. She gained a Postgraduate Certificate in Education in England after travel to Australia for a holiday. Medlyn had one year’s teaching experience in Ireland before she returned to Sydney in 2005. She was then offered a job at a private school in Sydney and worked there for two years. Medlyn then moved to Western Australia to be with her Australian partner.

Megan was from the UK and received a Diploma of Education and a Bachelor of Arts in the 1960s. After working in a primary school in England for more than 10 years and being promoted to Deputy Principal, Megan came to Australia in the early 1980s and worked in a school in Queensland. She is working part-time in a remote school in NSW after spending nearly 20 years in various education sectors throughout Queensland and NSW.

Paul came from the UK after studying for a Masters degree in Computer Science there. He came to Australia in 2002 after working as a teacher and a social worker for about 10 years in the UK. However, Paul failed the teacher registration process to become an ICT teacher in NSW, and then found a position in the training department in a large utility company.

Vanessa was originally from South Africa and gained a Bachelor of Education in the 1980s. She has been a teacher in many countries, including South Africa, Botswana and England. She did a Postgraduate Diploma in Specific Learning Difficulties when she was in England. She spent 10 years teaching literacy to dyslexic students. She came to Australia in 2006 for a family reunion with her two sisters. She is currently working in a tertiary education institution in Sydney.

Rebecca was from South Africa where she qualified as a teacher when she was 40. Rebecca came to Australia in 2006 for a family reunion with her sister. Rebecca is doing part-time teaching in a remote NSW school.

Rose is an UK-trained teacher; she had a four year Bachelor of Education with Honours in Home Economics. With 20 years teaching career in the UK, Rose’s career progressed from being a teacher, and then head teacher, to Deputy Headship.
of a school. She also gained a Masters in Business Administration in Education Management before coming to Australia in 2006. Rose is now living in Sydney and was unemployed at the time of the interview.

Sophie grew up in England and did a Bachelors degree in Music and Education, as well as a Postgraduate year of training to become a primary school teacher. She worked for three years in London. Sophie first migrated to Australia with her husband in 1988 after five years teaching in the UK and two years teaching in South Africa. She taught in the Australian Capital Territory (ACT) for two years after arriving there. Then, Sophie went to Zimbabwe and South Africa for twelve years because her husband was sent to work there. She is currently doing part-time teaching in a regional school in NSW.

Timothy was from the UK. He had a Bachelor of Education. He taught Science and PE. Timothy qualified in 1996 and taught in London for most of the next twelve years. He came to Australia in 2003 and at the time of the interview had worked in a private school in Sydney for about 6 months.

Vallika was from the southern part of India and trained completely in English. She obtained Bachelors and Masters degrees in Engineering in India. Vallika migrated to Australia in 1998 with her husband, who had been offered a job there. Vallika is a permanent teacher in a Sydney school.

Veronica was from Russia and came to Australia in the early 1990s as an international student. Her major was in Russian literature and language. She used to be a permanent teacher in a public school in Sydney, where she taught Russian, but quit that job to seek other opportunities. She now has a Masters degree in Education from a Queensland university. She is working as a part-time Russian teacher in a public school in Sydney.

Here, it is necessary to justify the interview evidence used in Chapters 5 to 8. In most interviews, the researcher gained evidence relating to the main research questions and the contributory questions in the interview schedule (see Appendix 2). However, certain themes such as language problems or the Professional English Assessment
Test (PEAT) could only be answered by the NESB OTTs who were interviewed. Further, some interviewees took a long time discussing questions that they were interested in, which meant they did not have enough time to discuss other interview questions or just gave short answers, such as ‘yes’ or ‘no’. The researcher did not press these interviewees further because they had been most generous with their time, and given more of it than I initially asked. The following are examples of responses which did not provide really useful evidence for analysis: ‘I do not know really’ (Timothy, 26 August, 2008) or ‘Yes’ (Veronika, 27 May 2008). With such statements, the interviewees presented their thoughts firmly but did not provide further explanation; the interview had already exceeded the allocated time so I did not press them further. Thus, the researcher decided not to use this kind of evidence, and to focus on more substantive evidence to interpret the themes. It is for these reasons that not all of the 17 interviews are analysed in every section in Chapters 5 to 8. However, all of the interview evidence was analysed by the researcher. The next section explores the incentives the OTTs have for migrating to Australia.

5.3 REASONS FOR COMING TO AUSTRALIA

There are multiple reasons for OTTs coming to Australia (see Figure 5.6). The three main reasons highlighted by the respondents were family and marriage, lifestyle change and career opportunities. From the 132 survey respondents from NSW, 84.85% (n=112) came to Australia for family and marriage reasons. The second incentive attracting OTTs to Australia was lifestyle change, which was reported by 24.24% (n=32) of the participants from NSW. Interestingly, only 9.09% (n=12) of the respondents said they came to Australia seeking jobs and better professional development.16

---

16 These figures contain imbricated responses.
It seems that OTTs were mainly attracted to NSW for family reasons, followed by considerations about Australia’s reputation for good living conditions, and then teachers’ career and career development. The following sections provide interview evidence to further illustrate different types of migration incentives.

5.3.1 Career opportunities

Alka, an Indian Fijian, gained a Bachelor of Education degree (four years) in Child Studies, Textiles and Food Technology. With seventeen (17) years of teaching experience, she decided to leave Fiji to avoid severe discrimination toward Indian Fijians and seek better career opportunities. Australia was her first choice:

I chose Australia because I still have my family in Fiji. So people used to go to Canada or America. Australia is not too far away from home, you can reach your family (Alka, 2 July 2008).

Compared with other English-speaking OECD countries, Australia is very popular for immigrants from the Asia Pacific region (Hugo, 2009). This is partly due to Australia’s geographical advantage. If distance is a key issue for some migrants then many OTTs from Asia-Pacific countries might be expected to come to Australia to achieve their dream of better job opportunities and improved education for their children, the next generation.
However, finding appropriate jobs for some OTTs from the Asia-Pacific region is not easy in Australia. Some of them decide to go back to their home countries. Anita’s family is an example. They spent two years in Italy before migrating to Australia:

Last of all, we will be able to actually settle here in a real sense, we got frustrated in 2001 and we went back [to India] after disposing of everything. But again because our visa was expiring we came back in 2003 after spending nearly 2 years in India (Anita, 10 August 2008).

The decision to settle in Australia can be changed after arrival. Anita was a primary school teacher in India and her husband had a senior lecturer’s position in an Indian university. Both of them were well educated, with Masters degrees gained in India. The couple had difficulties finding positions in their fields in Australia, and they decided to go back to India after spending an unsuccessful first year here as migrants. However, they came back to Australia again to maintain the validity of their visas as Australian permanent residents and to again seek work in their profession.

After spending many years teaching and doing administrative work in England, Karen considered travelling and a change of lifestyle in Papua New Guinea, where she met her Australian husband:

So I worked there [Papua New Guinea] for three years. That is where I met my husband who was from Australia. He was working with a company at the time. Then that finished in Papua New Guinea, we came back here to Melbourne. I got a job (Karen, 16 June 2008).

For some immigrants, coming to Australia to teach is almost accidental. But being offered a job when she was visiting a friend in Melbourne, Karen changed her mind and worked for three years in a school there. In this sense, Karen came to Australia because of a job opportunity, not particularly because of her Australian husband.

Magen spent many years in the teaching service in the UK before she came to Australia as a tourist and stayed by chance. She loved the country immediately on arriving in Australia. Magen tried to find employment as a teacher during her stay in Australia. Finally a school Principal offered her a teaching position:
Well I was very lucky because [the Principal] was so hard to live with, eight of his teachers left in one year. He was left high and dry. One of them went home on holidays, and did not say she was leaving, or ‘Sorry, I am not coming back’. So, he kept a job for me (Magen, 15 May 2008).

School in remote Australian communities suffer teacher shortages, which may be met by OTTs. Many teachers leave these schools each year. The Principal offered the job to Magen even though she had not applied for a visa to work in Australia. Receiving better career opportunities is a good reason for migrating into Australia; however, in this research, family reasons were cited in a large proportion of the surveys and interviews. The family reasons include family reunion, marriage, and coming with spouses’ jobs.

5.3.2 Family reunion

Australia is famous for its excellent natural environment. The relatively ample job opportunities make it attractive for people to live and work here (Khoo et al., 2007). OTTs from other English speaking countries are also attracted here by the opportunity for reunion with their families. According to the survey responses, 84.85% (n=112) of the NSW participants came to Australia for reasons of family or marriage. The following evidentiary extract shows that family reasons play an important role in recruiting OTTs:

The reason why we came to Inverell is because I have a sister who had already been here for 11 years now. She actually came originally to Australia because my brother-in-law is a GP. He came in on a work visa for rural doctors. Then when we applied, my age was a little bit against me at the time (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Family reunion is a key reason for migration to Australia. The reason for Rebecca going to a NSW rural region from South Africa was that her age could not help her gain enough points for urban migration. To migrate to Australia, Rebecca only had one option, namely to apply for a 139 visa to live in a designated rural area, based on family sponsorship. One of the conditions of this visa was that she could only work in the designated rural area (Birrell, Hawthorne & Richardson, 2006). Rebecca then explained her reasons for coming to Australia but not other English speaking countries:
I would not have liked to have gone to the States. I definitely did not want to teach in England. Based on the experiences that friends of mine have had, that have been over. The States are obviously very difficult to get into, so that was not an option. Where England was concerned a lot of friends that went there actually ended up leaving teaching. They absolutely hated the so-called English experience of teaching (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Rebecca’s migration preference helps to better understand Australia’s advantage in recruiting OTTs. Immigrants can consider other alternatives to Australia—the United States of America and the UK are two options. However, migrants’ preferred destinations are not always possible; some do not apply to the USA because it is very difficult to get a working visa. Friends’ experiences of working in the UK led a prospective migrant to forgo that option.

Vanessa also migrated from South Africa for family reasons:

I applied to come here because my two sisters had moved here in the meantime. I really came here to join family, no other particular reason. Obviously I came in on this points system, sort of sponsored family (Vanessa, 13 July 2008).

Australia’s need for skilled labour benefits from its family reunion provisions for immigrants. It took Vanessa three years to get a visa to migrate to Australia. Being similar to Rebecca’s visa, Vanessa now lives with her extended family in Australia. According to the survey data, 42.42% (n=56) of the 132 respondents did not come to Australia with the specific intention of teaching and 57.58% (n=76) came to Australia to do so (see Question 48 in Appendix 1). The next section introduces another type of family-based migration, the marriage of foreigners to Australians.

5.3.3 Marriage

Teachers may come to Australia for reasons of family reunion, while some come to this country because of their marriage to Australians. Edward was an American exchange student studying in an Australian university, where he met his Australian wife:
She had about a year left of school after I graduated, so we decided that I would come back to Australia after I graduated, so she could finish at school. I did a bit of casual work in the States. In the meantime I waited for all the legal documents and ‘what not’ to go through. This was a major pain in the butt. Then about three months after I graduated I landed in Sydney (Edward, 24 June 2008).

Immigrants come to Australia with a spouse visa (subclass 820/801), which belongs to the temporary visa category. Edward, a citizen of the USA was allowed to apply for a permanent resident visa after living for two years in Australia\(^\text{17}\). Edward did not expect that his visa would create barriers to his employment in Australia; but he was wrong (see Section 6.3 for details of why Edward was wrong).

A female American teacher, Judy, had a connection with Australia via her grandmother, who was an Australian and had married an American soldier during the Second World War. So Judy described her marriage to an Australian as a reproduction of her grandmother’s journey, ‘just from the other side of the world’. Compared with Edward, Judy did more research into the details of migrant visa types. She came to Australia independently of her husband on a skilled migrant visa (subclass 175)\(^\text{18}\), which allowed her to become an Australian permanent resident immediately after arriving in Australia:

If I applied for a spousal visa I would have to get married within X amount of months of coming to Australia. Then for the next two years they are able to look into our private lives to make sure that we are legitimately married. My husband and I decided that we did not want to do that. That is why I came as a skilled migrant rather than on a spousal visa (Judy, 17 August 2008).

A spousal visa (subclass 820/801) has two years waiting time before an applicant is able to apply for permanent residence, which includes being checked to ensure the

---

\(^{17}\) According to the Department of Immigration and Citizenship (2009), foreigners who are married to or have a de facto relationship with Australian citizens or permanent residents can apply for a temporary visa (subclass 820) and a permanent visa (subclass 801) by lodging one application. The temporary visa is valid until a decision is made on the permanent visa. If applicants are granted the temporary visa, they will be eligible for consideration of a permanent visa two years after lodging his/her application. The applicants must demonstrate their relationship is still genuine and ongoing.

\(^{18}\) According to Department of Immigration and Citizenship (2009), the 175 visa belongs to a permanent residence visa. This visa allows applicants to migrate to Australia if they have good English language skills and have skills and qualifications in an occupation in need in Australia.
legitimacy of the marriage. The skilled migrant visa, as a permanent residence visa, allowed Judy to apply for permanent work immediately after arriving in Australia, but Edward could not apply for permanent jobs until he gained his permanent residency visa in Australia (see Chapter 6).

Among the interviewees, there was a group of OTTs who came to Australia not to teach but to be with their spouses, who had moved here for work. With the global movement of labour, Australia not only gains the skilled workers it needs, but also their family members, who may also have skills in areas of demand, like teaching. The following group of excerpts shows evidence of this.

5.3.4 Coming with spouses’ jobs

Sophie was an immigrant who came to Australia with her husband and then found a teaching job. She did a Bachelors degree and a Post Graduate Certificate of Education (PGCE) in Music in England. She spent the first ten years of her teaching career in England and South Africa, until her husband was offered a job in Australia:

I applied to come to Australia. It was easy for him [her husband] because he had been born in New Zealand, but for me I had to apply to come in. I put in my application. (Sophie, 12 August 2008).

Australia privileges the citizens of some countries in its immigration policy; generally New Zealanders have automatic right of entry and employment. Sophie said that she had to apply for a work visa, like a 457 visa\(^\text{19}\), if she wanted to work in Australia, although she could go with her husband as a spousal applicant. After several months waiting, Sophie arrived in Australia at the end of 1988.

Rose was a successful teacher and had had a successful administration career in England. Her hard work won her a Deputy Headship in an English school until her husband was offered a job in Australia:

\(^{19}\) According to the Department of Immigration and Citizenship (2009), the 457 visa is the most commonly used program by employers to sponsor overseas workers to work in Australia on a temporary basis.
We have got friends out here, and decided for the first time in 20 years of teaching to take two years off. I took some time off and quite frankly did not intend to go back into teaching. I needed some time out to recover, and then decided towards the latter of the last year (Rose, 19 August 2008).

Working holidays and friends in Australian can spark the desire to migrate here. Rose said that working in the education system in England as a Head was so exhausting. So she decided to move to Australia immediately when her husband was offered a job in Australia. She needed a period of time to recover after the 20 years of hard work, so teaching in Australia was not in her plans at first.

Compared with these two OTTs from the UK, Anna was in the early stages of her teaching career:

We came to Australia because my husband got a job here, basically, lecturing at a university. So, off we came. The life of an academic, you have to go where the work is (Anna, 19 August 2008).

The recruitment of skilled migrants leads to spouses also obtaining employment after settling in Australia. Anna was an infant school teacher in England with an Honours Bachelors degree and a PGCE. She came to Australia because her husband obtained a position in an Australian university.

As the only OTT not from an English speaking country in this Section (5.3.4), Vallika who was from India, came to Australia as her husband wanted to gain international work experience: ‘I would say that I was not the prime applicant. My husband was the prime applicant, but I had the points to work here’ (Vallika, 12 March 2008). She said that she contributed points for being qualified to work in Australia as the secondary applicant in her family’s skills migration.

The next section explores another incentive for attracting OTTs, which is the opportunity for a lifestyle change, where 24.24% (n=32) of the 132 survey responses chose lifestyle change as the explanation for coming to Australia.
5.3.5 Lifestyle change

Many participants had been to Australia as tourists or temporary workers and fell in love with this country and its lifestyle. They decided to come back to Australia to seek a lifestyle change.

Paul, who had been a Computer Science teacher and social worker in the UK, reckoned that it was the desire for a lifestyle change that brought him to Australia:

[Coming to Australia] really is a lifestyle change. Most of that is sort of personal really in terms of just started having a family. We did come here and do the backpackers thing a few years prior to this. ... Decided we would like to come back here perhaps for a chapter in life, so we did that. We thought well, you know, let us go back to Sydney and try life out there for a while. We have our young family, so that is what brought us here, mainly personal reasons (Paul, 6 June 2008).

Tourism can provide prospective immigrants the opportunity to access their life options. After being backpackers to Australia with his wife, Paul decided to open a ‘new chapter’ in the family’s life, albeit recognising his responsibility as the ‘breadwinner’ for a family with a newborn baby. Paul frankly said that one of the reasons for him coming to Australia was a lifestyle change. He also considered that teaching in Australia would give him a more competitive salary than in the UK. In this regard, Australia may be competitive for recruiting OTTs, if it matches the OTTs’ expectations in terms of incomes. However, Paul failed to pass the teacher registration system in NSW, contrary to his expectation (see Section 6.1 for details of why Paul ‘failed’ and what he did).

The love of travel and people can inspire migration. Medlyn was from Ireland and obtained a Bachelor Degree in Arts, majoring in German and Italian. The Australian surfing lifestyle brought her to Australia for the first time in 2001:

I knew that I would come back [to Australia] one day. I just did not know that I was going to meet an Aussie in the meantime. It was always my intention to come back here but I did not always have a specific area that I could have got a job in. I was more a backpacker doing bar work and café work. I thought I want to come back with a proper career, so I went back to university. That is what happened (Medlyn, 18 August 2008).
Medlyn finally applied for a de facto visa (subclass 820/801) before coming back to Australia in 2005. She emphasised that her Australian boyfriend was not the main reason for coming to Australia but the lifestyle.

Like Paul and Medlyn, Timothy had also been to Australia prior to deciding to migrate here. Timothy was trained as a teacher of Biology and Physical Education in England. He worked as a teacher in London for nearly 12 years:

I came to Australia five years ago with my wife’s company, they brought her out here. I worked in a private school in Bondi for about six months which was my sort of first [Australian teaching] experience in 2003. So then, we went back to England and really wished we were back in Australia. So we applied for residency through teaching. I got my permanent residency and brought my wife and baby of three months at the time over to Australia (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

A ‘try-before-you-settle’ strategy is possible for prospective immigrants from some countries. Being attracted by the Australian lifestyle, Timothy and his wife decided to migrate to Australia permanently. Timothy then applied for a skilled migrant visa (subclass 175) using his teaching qualifications and then brought his family to Australia. The incentive for migrating to Australia was, as Timothy said:

Probably children. When we looked at the lifestyle that was available over here in Australia and having children over here. Having an outdoor lifestyle and all of that was definitely something that was a contributing factor (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

Creating opportunities for one’s children is a key driver for some migrants. Timothy said that the Australian lifestyle and environment for raising the children were the key points that inspired him to come to Australia.

Veronika was from Russia and came to Australia as an overseas student. She became an Australian permanent resident after finishing university studies. She said that it was the Australian climate that attracted her to stay, ‘I love it [Australia]. I am enjoying it because I love the warm climate. I do not like the cold climate’ (Veronika, 27 May 2008).
Besides seeking lifestyle change and good climate, the stable social environment is also a point of attraction for OTTs. Chinmayi was a TESOL teacher in a private school in Sri Lanka. She migrated to Australia in 2000 using her teaching skills as capital. She was about 50 years old at that time. When asked why she chose to migrate to a new country that she did not know and at a relatively older age, she said, ‘Because of the problem there in our country in Sri Lanka. We had a problem that we were living in the Northern part of the country’ (Chinmayi, 25 June 2008). Chinmayi is a Tamil, and the fighting between the Government army and Tamil forces forced her to leave to find a country with a stable society. Australia was her first choice.

Given the above-mentioned reasons for migrating to Australia, the following figures from the survey responses help us to better understand the OTTs’ labour movement into Australia and the types of visas the OTTs hold for entering this country. From Figure 5.7, it can be seen that the numbers of OTTs arriving in Australia have gradually increased from the 1980s. There are 125 valid responses in Figure 5.7. Two point four per cent (2.4%, n=3) arrived in Australia in the 1980s and 10.4% (n=13) of the respondents arrived in the 1990s. The number of OTTs who arrived in Australia dramatically increased after 2000, with 87.2% (n=109) of the respondents migrating to Australia between 2000 and 2008. Of course, it is necessary to allow for the effects of self-selection among those completing the survey. From Figure 5.7, 48% (n=60) of teacher respondents migrated to this country in the last three years. Regarding the Figure 5.7, it has been produced from available data, but as a histogram has a limitation due to not being equal ranges for the years of represented.
Of the OTTs (N=120) who completed survey Question 44 (see Appendix 1), 85.83% (n=103) of them migrated to Australia with permanent residency and only 14.17% (n=17) came with temporary visas. The 457 visa and spouse visa (subclass 820/801) were the most two common temporary visas that the OTTs held on entry into Australia as temporary residents, which meant constraints on their right to work (see Chapter 6), whereas 70.59% (n=12) of the 17 temporary visa holders belong to the 457 visa and spouse visa type (see Question 45 in Appendix 1).

The OTTs come to Australia with various expectations for a new beginning, either for their families or careers. However, they all have to pass the teacher registration system, which is designed to check their eligibility for teaching in NSW. The next section provides an analysis of official documents concerning the recruitment of the OTTs and how they become eligible to teach in NSW.

5.4 THE REGISTRATION PROCESS FOR OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

In early 1990s, the then NSW Department of School Education [DSE] (now the Department of Education and Training) expressed the intention to recruit OTTs to meet the increasingly multicultural NSW schooling:

in the context of the multicultural nature of the population of New South Wales and its schools, the Department is conscious of the contribution to education which can be made by teachers with qualifications from overseas countries. These teachers can bring additional perspectives to teaching in primary and secondary schools. While themselves appreciating the need to adapt to the Australian culture and to the particular needs of various groups of students (NSW DSE, 1991, p. 1).

With NSW’s multicultural population increasing, the NSW DSE (1991) realised that OTTs could be a useful supplement to the NSW education system. The NSW DSE (1991) also claimed that it was necessary to train newly recruited OTTs to be familiar with Australia’s educational culture and students’ needs. Meanwhile, the NSW DSE (1991) set preconditions to assess the eligibility of teachers with overseas qualifications who intended to teach in NSW. It was decided that the OTTs seeking employment in NSW public schools must:
1. be competent in the use of the English language before they can teach in New South Wales.
2. be recognised as qualified primary or secondary teachers in their country of training, and must have obtained their academic and/or teaching qualifications at tertiary level.
3. have their personal suitability, attitudes and ideas on teaching assessed at interview by a delegated officer of the Department of School Education
4. satisfactorily complete a Department Bridging Course, including a two-week supervised practicum
5. satisfactorily serve an initial probationary period of at least one year from date of appointment (if seeking full-time employment) (NSW DSE, 1991, p. 2).

In order to teach in Australia, an English speaking country, it is necessary for OTTs to be proficient in English so they can be capable of daily teaching. The NSW DSE (1991) required OTTs to have primary or secondary teaching qualifications, which should be gained from recognised tertiary education institutions. This meant that the teachers should hold at least undergraduate degrees. The OTTs were also required to be interviewed by a NSW DSE official, with the aim of evaluating whether their personal capacities were suitable for teaching in NSW public schools. NSW DSE (1991) also designed an induction program for re-training the OTTs by introducing them to the NSW public school system. Then those teachers seeking permanent employment in NSW undertake at least one year of provisional service. The OTTs who satisfied these five conditions would be given preliminary approval to teach in the NSW public school system.

Compared with the registration policies for OTTs in 1991, after 18 years development, the NSW DET (2009b) now has more specific requirements governing the registration process. Table 5.1 indicates that the OTTs have to fulfil some requirements on their education qualifications in order to gain teaching positions in NSW in 2009. Typically, these are the same as for local teachers. The NSW DET (2009b) indicates that the academic qualifications, criminal records and previous employment records of the OTTs have been checked by the NSW Institute of Teachers, since 1 October 2004.
Table 5.1
Overseas trained teachers approval process and acceptable qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overseas trained teachers approval process</th>
<th>Acceptable teacher qualifications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• a formal assessment of academic qualifications;</td>
<td>1. Primary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• probity checks including national criminal records checks and employment checks;</td>
<td>• an appropriate four-year undergraduate degree which includes an end-on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• if necessary, an assessment of your English language skills;</td>
<td>or integrated teacher education course;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Participation in the Pre-employment Program for Overseas Trained Teachers;</td>
<td>• an appropriate four or five year double degree program including a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Attend a personal suitability interview (NSW DET, 2009b).</td>
<td>primary teacher education qualification;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• an appropriate three-year undergraduate degree and a one-year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>primary teacher education award;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• a three-year primary teacher education qualification.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Secondary education</td>
<td>2. Secondary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• an appropriate four-year undergraduate degree which includes an end-on or integrated teacher education</td>
<td>• an appropriate four-year undergraduate degree which includes an</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>course; or</td>
<td>or integrated teacher education course;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• an appropriate four or five year double degree program including a secondary teacher education</td>
<td>• an appropriate four or five year double degree program including a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qualification; or</td>
<td>secondary teacher education qualification;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• an appropriate three-year undergraduate degree and a one-year secondary teacher education award;</td>
<td>• an appropriate three-year undergraduate degree and a one-year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>or</td>
<td>secondary teacher education qualification;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• a three-year secondary teacher education qualification.</td>
<td>3. Early childhood education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• To be eligible to be a teacher of Kindergarten to Year 2 in a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>primary school with a qualification in Early Childhood education, it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>is necessary to have a degree in which units of study include</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>discipline knowledge, pedagogy and professional experience related to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>teaching 5–8 year olds (NSW Institute of Teachers, n.d.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


To fulfil academic requirements, the NSW Institute of Teachers (n.d.) indicates that the OTTs who intend to gain teaching employment positions in NSW public primary or secondary schools must have at least a three year teaching qualification in primary or secondary education. The OTTs must have qualifications in either early childhood, primary or secondary teaching. All potential applicants should also have good records in school practicum in their university studies. Applicants must provide documents that can verify their work experience as teachers and their academic records.
The NSW DET (2009b) also requires OTTs from non-English speaking countries to prove their English proficiency is of a high enough standard to teach in NSW, by taking an English proficiency test and gaining a satisfactorily high score (see Chapter 7). For OTTs in NSW, it is mandatory to take part in the Pre-employment Program and a personal suitability interview (see Chapter 7).

Figure 5.8 indicates the structure of education qualifications of the 132 survey participants in NSW. There were 96 OTTs (72.73%) who held Bachelors degree(s); 34 OTTs (25.76%) held Masters degree(s). 32.58% (n=43) held Teaching diploma(s) and 31.82% (n=42) held Teaching certificates. 8.33% (n=11) held Bachelors degree(s) and Teaching Diploma(s). 14.39% (n=19) held Bachelors degree(s) and Teaching certificate(s). From Figure 5.8, it can be seen that the educational qualifications of these OTTs means they are qualified to teach in NSW public schools. However, the proportion with Masters degree(s) is low.

Figure 5.8
Qualifications of the OTTs

Figure 5.9 shows that 42.42% (n=56) of the 132 respondents have three to four years of teacher training. Over a half of the participants (57.58%, n=76) have four years or longer of tertiary teacher training. Given the evidence in Figures 5.8 and 5.9 and the NSW DET (2009b) OTT registration process, these respondents should all be eligible to register as teachers with the NSW DET; at least on this criterion.
Regarding the interview evidence, the interview participants indicated that the long wait time for registering with NSW DET drove them to try other occupations while waiting for the assessment results. Many of them found appropriate jobs during this period and did not go back to teaching, as the jobs could provide them with what they expected for living. In other words, the length of the registration process keeps some of the OTTs out of the NSW teaching profession. The teacher registration process varies, according to the time of the OTTs’ arrival in Australia. Take Alka for example, who came to Australia in 1998, and commented of the registration process:

It’s changed now. At that time, I had [to submit the application] so after about 5-6 weeks they contacted me for an interview. If you passed the interview you make an appointment to do your PEAT [Professional English Assessment Test]. If you do the test and if you get all A’s, you get your [approval number]. I got my number and I started [as a casual at] schools around Liverpool area, a week like that. But then I got the last term I got 5 days a week at [the] school and from there I came here (Alka, 2 July 2008).

For OTTs from non-English speaking countries, there are a number of tests to pass on the road to a teaching job. Before 2000, it only took a few weeks for recognition of OTTs’ qualifications. The successful OTTs would be contacted to take part in an interview to see whether they had sufficient English language proficiency to manage classes in NSW schools. PEAT has started to be conducted to test the English proficiency of those teachers who come from non-English speaking countries (see Chapter 7). The teachers who gain four ‘A’s in this test may be ‘approved to teach’ in NSW public schools. Teachers with ‘teaching approval numbers’ were assigned to
different schools for 10 days teaching practicum. The teachers who completed the above processes would be qualified to apply for formal teaching positions in the NSW public schools. This meant they could now search for a job; it did not mean they were given a job.

Veronika, who came to Australia from Russia in early 1990s recalled her experiences of the qualification recognition process:

Number 1 you had to translate all of my qualifications and then I have to have them acknowledged as an equivalent to Australian education. I’m not really sure; I think that’s NOOSR [National Office of Overseas Skills Recognition]. They send you back this acknowledgment to say what the equivalent of your education is in Australian educational system. Then I had to participate in the professional English test for teachers, at the New South Wales Institute of Languages. Prior to that, in order to make my life easy and in order to pass that test easier, the recommendation was I attend a teacher preparation course in that respect for teachers, which I did. It really helped. Then I had to pass the test. Then I pretty much had orientation program (Veronika, 27 May 2008).

For OTTs getting a teaching position can be quite a testing time. After being recognised as a skilled worker, that is as a teacher, in Australia by the National Office of Overseas Skills Recognition (NOOSR), Veronika passed the PEAT, which certified her English proficiency. The pre-test training course helped her to pass this test but this support for OTTs was cancelled several years later (see Chapter 7).

Compared with Alka and Veronika’s qualification registration experiences, more recent arrivals have found it more difficult to be registered as teachers in NSW. Vanessa, who came from South Africa in the middle of 2000, found many difficulties in her registration process after a long time waiting for her immigration visa. She said that the registration process was more suited to beginning teachers and not to experienced OTTs:

I was finding it quite hard to marry together all the accreditation process. I’m all for giving teachers this. I can see why it needs to be done, so that wasn’t a problem. But the process itself wasn’t really geared for someone like me in the role I was in. The process is really geared for assuming that people are straight out of university, in a classroom role, you know you are of their career (Vanessa, 13 July 2008).
Some OTTs thought they were being given the wrong tests. Vanessa mentioned that she could not understand why the NSW Institute of Teachers had to recognise her qualifications again after she obtained the immigration visa. She thought that this meant she could apply to work as a teacher in Australia. She considered this double qualification check as unnecessary and time wasting for both applicants and NSW Institute of Teachers:

To this day I don’t know why the NSW Institute of Teachers were so slow in processing the application. It just seemed a straight ‘open and shut case’. You know there you are, you’ve gone through all of this before. It should’ve been a matter of a turn around within a couple of weeks, a month maximum. What were they actually doing? I’m sure they weren’t doing anything with them. I’m sure it just sat on someone’s desk for three months. The other irritating thing was I couldn’t actually get any sense from them. I couldn’t just phone them up and say, ‘Where it is, what’s a time frame?’ There was no time frame so that meant planning was extremely difficult. I couldn’t plan. If they said I’ll get it by May I might’ve said well I’ll take something temporary or I’ll see how I go. By then I had opportunities coming up which were too good to miss and I don’t regret it at all. It just seems that the whole State education doesn’t seem as enticing. I probably would’ve just done it because it was a job, unless I got in at a certain level (Vanessa, 13 July 2008)

OTTs want to get a job as soon as possible after arriving in Australia; they need to consider financial issues. Vanessa’s registration process took three months for the application to be processed by the accreditation institute. Compared with Alka, who waited for a few weeks for the qualification recognition process in the 1990s, it was common for OTTs to wait for a few months to pass the first step to be registered with NSW DET. Chinmayi’s experience was similar:

I applied for employment with the Education Department. I sent all my certificates for recognition. Then it took a long time for them to look through my certificates. Then I got a letter asking me to do the PEAT exam (Chinmayi, 25 June 2008).

The time frame for the qualification recognition process was not the only trigger giving rise to complaints from the OTTs. Lack of information transparency for the applicants was another deficit in the process that was complained about by the applicants. Vanessa mentioned that the accreditation institute did not share information with her about the process of her application and she obtained no
responses to her inquiries. Under these circumstances, the OTTs did not know when their application would be finalised.

This led to the problem that the OTTs were stuck with the registration process for a long time and could not find other, temporary work to support their families. They might lose better job opportunities during this period as they waited in the hope that their applications might be passed some day soon. The NSW DET would lose OTTs during the period as people doubted the chances of success of their applications and were pressed to generate income. Vanessa is an example of an OTT who left teaching during this period.

5.5 DISCUSSION

From the 1990s, Australia’s immigration pattern has changed, as more immigrants have come from Asia:

whereas previously Europe had been the main source of newcomers. Six categories in the top ten are now from Asian countries, with the UK and New Zealand still at the top of the list. They, and South Africa, are the only English-speaking countries in the list (Leeman & Reid, 2006, p. 60).

Thus, not surprisingly, in this research the majority of the interviewees came from the UK, South Africa, and the Asia Pacific region. Further, Paldam (2007) finds that:

if immigrants have high labour market value, they may want to go to countries where they know the language and can find a job quickly. If immigrants have low labour market value, they may prefer countries where social support is high (p. 449).

Table 5.2 shows the reasons the OTTs in this research had for migrating to Australia. The main migration incentives are listed as themes. This provides some insight into why OTTs from English speaking countries chose to migrate to Australia. The advantage of being native language speakers from similar education systems gave them a competitive advantage in the labour market, especially given the complexities of the ‘teacher shortage’ issue in Australia.
### Table 5.2
#### Reasons for immigration to Australia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewees</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alka</td>
<td>Fijian Indian, coming to Australia for better career development.</td>
<td>Seeking career development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anita</td>
<td>From India, coming to Australia for better employment opportunities.</td>
<td>Seeking career development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magen</td>
<td>From the UK, coming to Australia for better employment opportunities.</td>
<td>Seeking career development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen</td>
<td>From the UK, coming to Australia incidentally.</td>
<td>Seeking career development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca</td>
<td>From South Africa, coming to Australia for family reunion.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanessa</td>
<td>From South Africa, coming to Australia for family reunion.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edward</td>
<td>From the USA, coming to Australia because of marrying an Australian woman, holding spouse visa.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judy</td>
<td>From the USA, coming to Australia because of marrying an Australian man, holding skilled migrant visa.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>From the UK, coming to Australia with spouse’s job.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose</td>
<td>From the UK, coming to Australia with spouse’s job.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna</td>
<td>From the UK, coming to Australia with spouse’s job.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vallika</td>
<td>From India, coming to Australia with spouse’s job.</td>
<td>Family reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>From the UK, coming to Australia for lifestyle change.</td>
<td>Lifestyle change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medlyn</td>
<td>From Ireland, coming to Australia for lifestyle change.</td>
<td>Lifestyle change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timothy</td>
<td>From the UK, coming to Australia for lifestyle change.</td>
<td>Lifestyle change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veronika</td>
<td>From Russia, coming to Australia for lifestyle change.</td>
<td>Lifestyle change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinmayi</td>
<td>From Sri Lanka, coming to Australia for its stable social environment.</td>
<td>Lifestyle change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Skilled migrant workers originating from newly industrialised countries like China and India come to the recipient countries ‘mainly for children’s education, lifestyle and potential security’ (Chiang & Hsu, 2006, p. 6). Skilled immigrants are selected to fulfill the qualifications and labour needs of Australia (Paldam, 2007). OTTs are highly skilled workers who are recruited by the Australian Immigration Department. The survey and interview evidence shows that family betterment and lifestyle changes are the two main reasons the OTTs give for migrating to Australia. Most of the OTTs claiming their motives for migration belong to these two categories were
from developed English speaking countries. Marriage, family reunion, and coming to a job obtained by their spouses, were main factors that contributed to their migrating to Australia. In addition, Friedmann (2005) argues that family reunion in a migration country creates affinity environments which:

represent a voluntary clustering of migrants in certain districts that, by virtue of migrants’ proximity to each other, offer material strains of surviving in a city where none of the familiar cultural cues are present (p. 325).

Family reunion migration may provide a possible approach for recruiting qualified OTTs, by offering a way of connecting their families already in Australia, and ensuring a support network. Teachers living with their families at the beginning stage of migration have an important support network. Their preliminary job hunting is focused around their families’ locations. This brings OTTs to certain rural or regional areas in NSW where their families are located.

Families can support the in-coming relative OTTs, helping them to become familiar with the local community. Khoo et al. (2007) point out that Australia is attracting more skilled workers by using permanent or temporary working visas, which also means that ‘spouses and dependent children can come to Australia with the skilled employee, spouses have full work rights, and there is no restriction on [temporary] visa holders applying for permanent residence’ (p. 484). The Australian skilled worker recruitment policy brings not only qualified workers to this country but also their spouses, who might hold teaching qualifications. While the portion migrating for this reason may be small, they do present another source of teacher recruits, one that might be valuable in fragile financial circumstances.

This may offer policy makers another channel for recruiting overseas trained teachers. Those OTTs who came to Australia to further their careers were from the middle class in their source countries, especially for those from Asia-Pacific regions. This reminds us of Sassen’s (1998) argument that poverty cannot be taken as a reliable variable for explaining migration as ‘not all the countries with severe poverty experience extensive emigration, and not all migrant-sending countries are poor’ (p.
Hodkinson (1998) finds that career development involves a series of ‘turning points’, such that:

at a turning point a person goes through a significant transformation of identity. Career development can be seen as an uneven pattern of routine experience interspersed with such turning points. Career decisions are pragmatically rational and embedded in the complex struggles and negotiations of the relevant field (Hodkinson, 1998, p. 101).

These turning points in a person’s career follow three typical routines: confirmatory routines, contradictory routines and socialised routines (Hodkinson, 1998). The first one can be understood as the spontaneous actions a subject makes, due to his/her habitus, which Bourdieu (1990) indicates as a set of durable dispositions in social practices. Contradictory routines refer to the subjects being disappointed and regretful about their original decision to change their career trajectory. Some migrant workers experience indecision about settlement due to labour market challenges. The socialised routines ‘confirm an identity that was not originally desired’ (Hodkinson, 1998, p. 102). According to Bourdieu’s (1986, 1990, 1992) concepts of field, habitus and capital, the career development of OTTs is located in a socialised network or field which connects with other agents’ acts and positions. Therefore, the career development of the OTTs can usefully be understood as combining the context of field, habitus and capital. For OTTs in a certain field, developing their teaching career in Australia is also related to the amount of cultural capital they possess and how their habitus helps them to make the decision to migrate and pursue professional development in Australia.

After migration, the OTTs have to be registered and approved to teach in NSW public schools. Their qualifications have to be checked to make sure that they can satisfy local employment requirements. This fits Bourdieu and Wacquant’s (1992) theory of field, which is a place of struggle where people aim to obtain capital, power and legitimation. The NSW education authorities take a dominant position in the field by controlling the right of legitimation to be a teacher in NSW. The OTTs, as the dominated agents, have to accept the rules of the field, which are taken as pre-conditions for them to enter the field. Therefore, the registration process embodies symbolic power:
In the forms of symbolic capital is perceived not as power, but as a source of legitimate demands on the services of others, whether material, such as help at harvest time, or symbolic, such as the expression of deference; and it is precisely this perception or misrecognition that makes it effective as a form of power (Brubaker, 2004, p. 40).

The symbolic capital involved in regulating OTTs, such as the registration process, is carried out by the state’s authoritative power, which is entitled by legitimated rules to position them as dominant agents in this field. The actions involved in respecting and acting on the rules by the OTTs enhance the symbolic capital of this authoritative power. Couldry (2004) indicates that:

the symbolic power legitimates key categories with both cognitive and social force. This power, although it is relevant to the way certain types of capital are constituted as symbolic capital in the context of particular fields, is relevant also to the wider field of power, and indeed, to social space, as a whole (p. 176).

This symbolic power and the legitimation involved are relatively invisible. It is constituted through other symbolic capital to take absolute dominance of the migrant workers’ positioning in society. Even though the OTTs hardly see it, they accept it voluntarily.

5.6 CONCLUSION

The foregoing analysis of the evidence presented in this Chapter shows that more than half of the OTT interviewees were from English speaking countries, accounting for 70.59% of those 17 interviewed. All of the OTT interviewees were familiar with the policies governing migration to Australia. Nearly half of the interviewees came to Australia for family reasons, including family reunion, marriage to an Australian, or coming with their spouses who had obtained a job here. Interestingly, in the family reasons category, both teachers from South Africa came to Australia initially without the specific intention to teach but to be with their families. Both of the American teachers came to this country by marrying Australians. The employment status of the South African and US American teachers was based on the types of visa they applied for before coming to Australia. In order to follow with their spouses’ international
labour movement, a group of women sacrificed their own teaching careers in their homeland.

The visa types had very close connections to these teachers’ subsequent employment in NSW schools. The interview evidence indicates that teachers with a family sponsored visa can only work in the designated location of the sponsored family member. The teachers with a spouse visa can only work in temporary positions until their Australian permanent residence is approved, which takes more than two years. Only an independent skilled migrant visa entitles OTTs to apply for permanent employment. Then they faced with the teacher registration process, which includes checks of their academic qualifications, previous employment records, English language proficiency for those from NESB countries, and taking part in the Pre-employment Program. These are among the key pre-conditions for being a teacher in the NSW public school system. Given the above points, the conditions of visa types, qualifications, previous work experiences, and English language may lead to registration, employment, qualification and/or language barriers for those OTTs who want to work in Australia. Chapter 6 provides a detailed analysis of evidence relating to these barriers.
CHAPTER SIX

BARRIERS FOR OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

A state in which those best able to calculate what will bring about the best consequences for the general welfare are left alone to do so. A state in which in every sphere of life experts make the significant choices. … A state in which we trust bodies of qualified experts to determine who will be born, how they will be educated, who will receive medical treatment and whose lives will have to be brought to a conclusion (Luke, 1996, p. 78).

6.0 INTRODUCTION

For migrants, the living and working conditions in the target country are taken as one of the more important considerations when they are looking to migrate. Migrants are always worried about whether they are qualified to get employment; whether their families will be able to get a better education, medical and living conditions; whether the new country will be good for their future career development; and even whether their rights and safety can be secured in a strange country. It is natural for human beings to pursue better lives. However, it is never easy for new migrants to settle in a strange country. Various regulations, conditions and restrictions will confront the migrants before they can obtain employment, citizenship, Permanent Residency and citizenship. The government authorities have the responsibility of trying to eliminate those barriers facing migrants which are unproductive to enabling them to settle more smoothly.

Overseas trained teachers face difficulties, if not barriers blocking their registration for employment as teachers, in job hunting and teaching work. These barriers impact on their confidence and self-determination. Most of the interviewees who participated in this study talked extensively and sensitively about their concerns. It is important to recognise that the voluntary self-selection process may have led these interviewees to focus on certain concerns rather than on other issues. Even so, their accounts help us to better understand how such OTTs think about how they are positioned in the Australian education context, and how they might position themselves. Most of the interviewees were well trained and experienced, but some
could not find proper teaching positions, nor could they quit teaching as a career. The question is how can OTTs gain qualifications and work experience to meet local Australian employment requirements so they can meet expectations about maintaining or improving Australian teaching quality? This assumes that the experiences and qualifications of the OTTs are acceptable and valuable under Australian guidelines. This Chapter focuses on the problems and difficulties these OTTs face under the current NSW employment process and teacher registration. It analyses official documents, survey and interview data to see what kinds of barriers impede OTTs in developing their teaching careers in NSW.

Figure 6.1, drawn from 111 valid survey respondents, indicates the difficulties that OTTs have faced in NSW. The key difficulties focus on the acceptance of their qualifications and previous employment records (36.94%, n=41), the registration process (32.43%, n=36) and the NSW school system (15.32%, n=17). A variety of responses such as ‘difficulties in entering the system’, ‘unemployment’, ‘qualifications are not recognised or valued’ can often be found in one returned questionnaire. Only 6.31% (n=7) of the 111 valid survey respondents claimed that they never faced any difficulties in the NSW education system. However, the survey respondents reported that problems to do with discrimination, the English language proficiency test and lack of support did not often affect them.
coding of the data revealed these to be the main barriers confronted by the interviewees. The barriers may happen before, during or after the employment and registration process, PEAT (see Chapter 7), or the Pre-employment Program (see Chapter 7). The researcher put them together here to explore the theme of ‘barriers’. The first section analyses the registration barriers the OTTs faced at the beginning of the process.

6.1 REGISTRATION BARRIERS

Walsh and Brigham (2007, p. 2) found that ‘systemic barriers include difficulty in gaining accurate information about having credentials assessed (and the cost of doing so), having to return to school for additional education, and also the necessity of somehow gaining “[local] experience” in the school system’.

Anna was a teacher from the UK who came to Australia with her husband. She was very keen to continue her teaching career in Australia as she came from a family of teachers. However, she found that the registration issues did not happen in the way she had expected. Anna thought that a teacher from the UK would not meet much trouble in becoming a teacher in Australia as these two countries share much related curricula and comparable teaching methods.

I thought I will just do some temporary or administration work or anything that came along just to get some money in the meantime. It took them a very long time. This was not only due to them. It was partly due to the people back in the UK being very slow in giving me proof of where I had taught. It was an absolute nightmare trying to prove that I had done any supply work so I just gave up trying to prove that. I did not even put that in the list because I could not get proof from all the different schools for different days because they do not have such a long record back in the UK (Anna, 19 August 2008).

To get a casual job teaching while waiting for registration can take a long time, because of the need for verifiable evidence. Anna said it might partly be due to not all of her previous working places being able to provide evidence to show her previous work experience. Anna questioned the registration process, which seemed so obscure because she could not find the right person to answer her questions. She
was frustrated when the accreditation authority did not allow her to provide original transcripts of her qualifications and verifications of the previous working experience but demanded certified copies:

They would not allow originals. I had never had a proper transcript. So I asked for 3 copies knowing that they would want one and that I should have a couple around. But they did not want an original so I had to copy it and get it sent anyway. I think they have little rules that they are quite funny with. They do not use common sense with a few of these things. They may not do that anymore. They did not want the real thing (Anna, 19 August 2008).

Certification of evidence can prove to be a challenge, not the least because candidates are trying to second-guess the reasoning behind employers’ requirements and may misconstrue the registration process. The request for photocopies of the qualifications was not the last thing that Anna had experienced. The official processing of her case then asked for the signature of a Justice of Peace on her copied documents. She could understand that the documents had to be verified by some authorised person but, according to Anna’s experience, the officials who signed her documents were not particularly qualified to sign them. ‘So why did it have to be a Justice of the Peace’? After waiting for a long time to pass the assessment stage, Anna received a letter from NSW DET asking her to attend the Pre-employment Program for two weeks. In the meantime Anna had already found a good job that could provide her with a good living:

I had a job which was giving me stability and definite income. I got the letter [for attending the PeP], I’d have to take 2 weeks annual leave to do the course, and then after that I could only get casual work. I was not sure whether I was willing to give up a full-time position where I get holidays and a definite income and all these other things, to work casually (Anna, 19 August 2008).

One’s motivation for becoming a teacher in Australia can be testing. Should an immigrant worker give up a good income in a stable job for an uncertain chance of getting back into teaching? From the perspective of financial motivation, most of the OTTs wanted to start work as soon as possible after arriving in Australia to support themselves, even though they had the passion to continue teaching. The many registration hurdles involved in examining the qualifications and the work
experience of OTTs became barriers. These functioned negatively to slow down recruiting the OTTs to fill the gaps in teacher shortages. Paul also suffered a long time waiting for the assessment of his qualifications:

When I got here I was surprised. I was surprised and disappointed at the bureaucracy involved in actually trying even to get my qualifications assessed by New South Wales Teach [NSW Institution of Teachers] or whatever they call themselves. It was simply it was taking too long so I had to get something to get a roof over our heads (Paul, 6 June 2008).

The registration process can feel very ‘bureaucratic’ and lead to ‘surprise and disappointment’ at the time consuming assessment process. This made Paul find other jobs to support the family. The accreditation authority asked Vanessa to prepare the documents with a Justice of the Peace’s verification, which she felt hard to find:

I was speaking to them [case processing officials] and telling them all the things they could get and things that they should not bother with and where to find this and that. I cannot remember anything specific other than saying, managing to find Justices of the Peace for them, because they did not like my things when they were verified by somebody in an official position (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).

The matters led Vanessa to comment that ‘NSW has a reputation for being fussy and doubts the authenticity of overseas qualifications’. Rose, another OTT from the UK, said:

I’m not an unintelligent person. I came out here without any transcripts for my degrees because that was sort of on the last page in the tiny blurb after you’ve done everything else. So, there I was with all of the forms submitted to join the program here and the most crucial piece of evidence that I needed was not with me. Therefore, I had to get that from overseas which was a pain. I had not found the overall process of becoming a teacher here particularly easy to follow. From there on in, I had no idea how recruitment operated until I started to look at applying for jobs. Now, I can honestly say that I can see I’ve gone in cycles. For the first six months that I was in Australia I was not able to teach because I still had to go through that whole Pre-employment Program (Rose, 19 August 2008).

OTTs are likely to have valuable experience, for instance as head teacher and/or a senior administrative officer. Rose had worked in several schools in the UK in such
positions. She had remarkable work experience and qualifications. Her opinions on the NSW OTT registration system represented the views of many OTTs, who had already passed the skills recognition system of the Department of Immigration and Citizenship (DIAC). She, like other interviewees had assumed that this proved that they were qualified to teach without further examination of their qualifications:

It seems fairly extraordinary but the National Office of Overseas Skills Recognition (NOOSR) don’t seem to have any communication with New South Wales Teaching. It’s like they are some kind of god. So even though my qualifications were assessed as good to go by [NOOSR] there was this additional level of having to reply and go through the rigmarole of the whole thing again. As I say when you arrive here, you have to get a job you know. You cannot spend time with somebody else assessing your qualifications (Paul, 6 June 2008).

The mismatch between the NOOSR skills recognition policy and the NSW OTTs registration policies misled the OTTs. Based on the NOOSR report Paul thought that he could apply for a teaching job directly after migrating to Australia. He was not aware that he had to pass another State-level registration process; that this would take a long time and that this was required so as to get approval to teach in NSW. Of course, it is the responsibility of the OTTs to check teacher recruitment information themselves. However, there appears to be no single website which provides all the information to let OTTs know the whole of the teacher registration process, which means more than passing the Federal skills recognition requirements. Perhaps no one really knows.

Another kind of registration barrier for OTTs concerned those who registered as teachers in Australian States other than NSW, but could not get that registration recognised in NSW. Magen registered with Queensland Teachers College and obtained a job with the Queensland Education Department. She also worked as a teacher in Victoria without any trouble. She was recognised in both jurisdictions as being qualified as both a secondary and primary teacher. However, she faced registration barriers in NSW so that she could only teach in NSW, which meant public primary schools:

The NSW DET said no. First of all, you are only trained for primary so you can only teach primary. You can do casual in secondary and primary
teaching but you can only teach full-time in primary. So there is a disparity between now, which is very annoying, between the States (Magen, 15 May 2008).

Getting approval to teach in NSW secondary schools in remote rural communities, which are desperate for secondary teachers, is a challenge. After two years waiting, Magen still had not heard from the accreditation authority about her application. During this period, the high school that Megan wanted to work for was suffering severe teacher shortages. The Principal of the high school had to teach some classes and other teachers had to do double classes due to the lack of secondary teachers. Not surprisingly, Magen lost her interest in being a secondary teacher but obtained employment in the Catholic education system. She could not see any sign that her application would be approved in the near future:

I applied 2 years ago. I did not hear from them. Now you will not believe this and this is where I am really getting a little bit cross, but I am beginning to leave it, to say forget it, let them get on with it, because they did not answer and deal with my application, there is no record of them having done any work with me so I said to the deputy head, you do it, you get me through, you put up with it, I cannot (Magen, 15 May 2008).

The NSW OTT registration process may not recognise teachers registered as a secondary teacher in England and in other States in Australia. Magen is a very experienced OTT. For this reason she argued that teachers’ work experience should be considered as a measure of their teaching capabilities, and not just their qualifications:

In teaching, if I may say so from the little bit of experience I have had, primary training, and especially the way it was done in England, is beneficial. I have taught actually children from 5 to 24. I can tell you the hardest thing to do is your infants, your 5 and 6 year olds, they’re the hardest, and the next hardest is your primary, in your actual method. Secondary, you are up to specialist subjects; it’s almost a free-for-all there, within the confines of the syllabus (Magen, 15 May 2008).

Qualification recognition is a first measure to see whether OTTs are qualified to teach in NSW DET schools. However, for an OTT who had gained recognition in different Australian education systems, this does not mean that recognition matches NSW requirements. To the NSW DET, teaching competence and experience are
important. Classifying experienced teachers into categories according to the field in which they gained their initial qualification is open to question.

In NSW, the OTT registration process is quite stringent. For example, Sophie was from the UK, and a registered teacher with the ACT education authorities. She lives in a town which is only ten (10) kilometres away from NSW. She thought that there might be more opportunities for work in NSW than in the ACT as it was closing down many schools. However, when she asked to register with NSW DET, the answer was, ‘No. Even though you have worked in the ACT for two years, your qualifications are from overseas’ (Sophie, 12 August 2008). Depending on the initial field of study in which a teacher was trained, this is used to decide whether and where they will be appointed. There is no sense in which career change and professional learning are recognised. Most OTTs have to go through the whole registration procedure again, no matter whether they have worked in other States in Australia. The next section analyses barriers associated with accepting the qualifications and previous work experience of the OTTs.

6.2 BARRIERS OF QUALIFICATIONS AND PREVIOUS WORK EXPERIENCE

Canadian researchers Walsh and Brigham (2007, p. 2) found that ‘general barriers include the sense that previous teaching experiences are not valued, as well as difficulties with language and accent, in terms of both personal concerns about proficiency and discrimination on the basis of accent regardless of proficiency’. Miller (2008, p. 21) argues that ‘non-recognition of overseas qualifications and prior work experience can be attributed to a “deficit model” of difference’.

During the interviews, the OTTs quickly responded to questions about their qualifications and experiences, indicating that these were not readily accepted by NSW DET. There was a shared sense that teacher recruitment and employment policies were not accepting of the OTTs experiential knowledge gained through learning. This was as true of teachers from English speaking countries as others. Myles, Cheng and Wang (2006, p. 233) report that ‘although foreign-trained teachers bring invaluable expertise and experience to their new country, it has been virtually
impossible for them to work in the [new country] because their foreign credentials do not meet the requirements for [local teaching qualifications].

Vanessa started with the stories of two of her colleagues; they were Australian-trained teachers who had a few years teaching experience in Australia and had worked overseas for several years. However, she reported that they found they could not find appropriate jobs which matched their qualifications and experiences after going back to Australia. This was because their overseas teaching experiences were not accepted by the NSW DET. Vanessa said: ‘Just imagine what it is like for people not from here trying to negotiate it. I think there is something very badly organised and designed’ (13 August 2008). She continued with the claim that the NSW DET does not have:

a fast track or a different track or a let us negotiate track, it’s … you know I’m all for raising standards and everything else and I think if this all works in this country and people are true to those guidelines and those accreditations you will find that the dead wood will retire. Hopefully you will get that fresh staff (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).

Familiarity with the details of the NSW OTT recruitment policies is a key requirement. Vanessa held the view, also shared by other OTTs, that the accreditation process should give recognition to teachers’ experiences and qualifications:

The intentions of [qualification recognition] are good but perhaps things have not really caught up with each other. This is a real difficulty for the image of the profession and for people coming in. I have no quarrels with the intentions, not at all (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).

OTTs seek employment in the private or Catholic sector because they could not work out how the NSW DET system worked. Vanessa also said they did so because of the inflexibility in treating the OTTs, their qualifications and experiences. These comments made it appear that there are no incentive mechanisms to inspire and attract the OTTs, only barriers. Vanessa said one of her friends faced the problem of relating her previous working experience and the NSW requirements:
She was a social worker, but she had not got the qualification. She understood her situation but even so, she had a lot of skills, she had done a lot of special education that I had done. But she was from a different background. There was absolutely no flexibility for her to do anything even as a teacher’s aide. She looked around, and the only thing she could find when she got here was working in a very exploitative situation in a tutoring college. She could see the only way she was going to get ahead or get a job was to go back to University full-time and do the ‘whole Australian thing’ (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).

If this is true, the current system might be losing potential teachers due to a lack of acceptance of the overseas experiences and qualifications of OTTs. Even Australian-trained teachers who had overseas work experiences were also not given recognition for this. Sophie worked with ACT Education Department for two years for teaching music. She left Australia to work in Africa as an OTT due her husband’s job commitment. Sophie was surprised when she found that she could not find a job in the ACT after spending twelve years teaching in Africa:

I was away for 12 years and when I came back to the ACT. They said, ‘Oh, no. We do not take any references for people who have come from overseas. We will not accept any references older than three years.’ So I had to start again as though I was a beginner in the whole process, to get my qualifications all done (Sophie, 12 August 2008).

Internationally experienced Australian teachers may not get jobs in public schools. First, Sophie’s overseas teaching experience was not recognised by the ACT Education Department. Second, the ACT Education Department does not accept references older than three years. Ironically, this meant Sophie’s previous Australian work experience was not counted, as she had left Australia over twelve years previously. Due to the above two factors, Sophie had to start over from the beginning, gaining the qualifications and recognition as a new incoming OTT.

Another interviewee, Paul came from the UK, and holds a Bachelors degree in Computing Science and a Post Graduate Certificate in Education (PGCE). He said he could not register as an Information Communication Technology (ICT) teacher with NSW DET because his ICT teaching qualification was not recognised. Paul worked as a social worker and IT teacher in a British school for many years and came to Australia for a change of lifestyle. As the breadwinner of the family, Paul had
extensive experience in social work and networking IT systems and was eager to continue his teaching career in NSW. However, he failed the qualification recognition assessment as an ICT teacher, even through it was listed on the Internet as a field of teacher shortage. He tried to negotiate with the NSW DET officials, arguing that his previous work experience qualified him to work in NSW public schools as an ICT teacher. The response was that he could only be registered as a Computing Science teacher due to an absence in his ICT teaching qualifications:

They didn’t really explain it. The short answer was it that it [networking] does not appear on your qualifications, as a subject you have studied. Therefore, DET’s assumption is that I was not qualified to teach ICT, but was qualified to teach computer studies. They were essentially assessing my qualifications rather than assessing what I’ve gained in experience and competency through being in the job (Paul, 6 June 2008).

Paul admitted that he did not hold the required qualifications in ICT networking and that he could not provide the evidence as demanded. However, he maintained the view that both his qualifications and his prior experience of teaching ICT in the UK should be considered during the qualification assessment process. Miller (2008, p. 17) points out that ‘several migrants, however, among them OTTs, have been polarised in terms of their qualification levels’. This suggests the need to weigh job applicants’ practical work competences and their qualifications:

It just seems so ludicrous because if only they’d sort of spoken with me during an interview, interviewed me and assessed me on my knowledge of networking, then they would have seen. I tried to prove myself… (Paul, 6 June 2008).

Prior teaching experience overseas poses challenges for respect and valuing. The difficulties in doing this led to previous work experience in this field being rejected. Judging OTTs only by the ‘paper work’ does not help to pick out those experienced OTTs who might bring valuable knowledge and skills to Australia’s education system, although they might not have Australian qualifications. According to the 132 survey responses (Figure 6.2), 83.33% (n=110) of the OTTs considered that teaching experience and expertise were the most valuable strengths they brought to Australia. Besides teaching strengths, multi-language competence (5.30%, n=7) and diverse cultural knowledge (10.61%, n=14) were also reckoned as OTTs’ strengths. 16.67%
(n=22) of the OTTs mentioned management skills as their strengths, which meant they had experience in senior positions of leadership in schools that might also benefit the NSW education system, and 15.91% (n=21) of 132 survey respondents mentioned more than one aspect of their strengths.

Figure 6.2
Strengths the OTTs bring to Australia

Unfortunately for Paul, the current NSW qualification assessment system did not give him the chance to prove his competence in ICT teaching. This might be due to the inflexibility of the system, with the power of teacher recruitment for NSW public schools being in the hands of a central Government agency. Such registration and employment requirements ‘have led migrants and their supporters to criticise those responsible for failing to move beyond tolerance and accept differences as valid and valuable expressions of the human experience’ (Miller, 2008, p. 16).

Qualification recognition problems can occur during the assessment process. Rebecca was a South African teacher who taught students from Years 4 to 9 and another two subjects for Year 12, and had South African teaching qualifications. She was called a ‘middle school teacher’ in South Africa. However, there was no connection between Australian and South African teaching qualifications because officially there is no ‘middle school’ sector in Australia. As a consequence, Rebecca’s ‘middle school’ qualifications were only recognised for infant and
primary teaching in Australia, even though she had no work experience or studies as an infant teacher:

When I queried it they said to me obviously the original assessment was actually done at a Federal level … that is the way they do it. They actually have either primary or secondary, there is no in-between (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Having migrated to Australia as a secondary teacher it is possible for OTTs not to pass qualification assessments. Rebecca’s skills recognition was initially completed at the Federal level yet did not meet the State level assessment requirements. This means that passing the skills recognition at the Federal level does not guarantee OTTs passing the State qualification assessment, and vice versa at the State level does not match with skills at the Federal level. Miller (2008) points out that:

the claimed neutral assessment and measurement usually disguises itself under the cloak of ‘professional standard’, ‘quality’ or ‘excellence’ without questioning whose standard is put into place and whose interests it represents. Although migrants are allowed into the country, professional standards deny them access to proper employment in their professions (p. 23).

Living in a rural area where there is no ‘middle school’ sector but where they experience teacher shortage, eventually helped Rebecca get permission to work as a casual teacher in a high school. But by then, Rebecca was enjoying teaching in an infant and primary school, although she had no previous experience working with infants.

Anita has a Bachelors Degree in Education and a Masters degree in Child Development, with many years work experience in pre-primary and primary schools in India. During the registration process, the NSW DET misrecognised her qualifications, and designated her as a secondary teacher. This has meant she cannot get a job in primary schools with her Indian qualifications and experiences, which is what she wants:

Because I am a graduate and post-graduate, I was told that is why I am qualified as a high school teacher not as a primary school teacher. I argued a couple of times but they are so stubborn. They didn’t listen anything.
They said, ‘No, you are approved under our guidelines’. I am approved only for being a high school teacher. I have to teach only in a high school (Anita, 27 June 2008).

Being trained as an early childhood teacher in India, Anita felt that she was not fit to teach in an Australian high school. She started looking for early childhood and primary teaching jobs but was not successful because she did not have Australian qualifications. This was despite her having considerable relevant work experience. Then she met another challenge:

When I went for interviews for childcare, they told me that they do not recognise this assessment because you should have assessment from DoCS [Department of Community Services]. So, I went to the Department of Community Services. They said, ‘OK, you have no primary teaching. You have to do an early childhood qualification from here. You may get some exemptions’ (Anita, 27 June 2008).

After being declined by many employers and after a bewildering assessment of her teaching qualifications, Anita had to seek local qualifications in order to work as an early childhood teacher’s aide:

Everywhere I am going they want to see the local qualification, the local Certificate III, have you done Certificate III, have you done the Diploma. So basically it’s a rejection of my overseas qualifications. They are not accepting these qualifications. Whatever else they are saying, that I can use outside this country; that’s not true. I have actually faced it; they are not accepting my overseas qualifications or overseas experience. Basically, it is discrimination (Anita, 27 June 2008).

Anita paid $1,600 Australian dollars to gain the Certificate III as a ‘knocking brick’ to apply for jobs. The Certificate III is a much lower level qualification compared to her Masters degree in Child Development. Even though she now holds the Certificate III, she is still not recognised as a qualified early childhood teacher, and so is paid at a lower level because she does not hold an Australian bachelors degree in Early Childhood Education. Miller (2008, p. 18) argues that ‘overseas qualifications and work experience are consistently undervalued, the result of which is wage gaps for overseas trained workers, particularly those of colour’.
Disappointment and depression come with the devaluing of OTTs qualifications and experiences in the Australian education context. Anita came to Australia with her husband, who was a lecturer at a University in India. Prior coming to Australia, they had worked in Italy for two years. They came to Australia because it is an English speaking country with a pleasant natural and social environment. But the rejection of her qualifications and experience gave Anita a very bad experience, ‘I do not have local experience, local qualifications’ (Anita, 27 June 2008).

The devaluation of overseas qualifications devalues their intellectual capital: ‘Minority Ethnic individuals, especially from the Indian sub-continent, with high educational and occupational qualifications experienced downward professional mobility after arriving in the United Kingdom’ (Miller, 2008, p. 20). It is also difficult for Australian school officials to accept the different educational philosophies brought to this country by the OTTs Australia claims to need.

Magen had experience working as a head teacher in literacy, and in Deputy Headship in a British school. However, she faced strong resistance when she offered her teaching ideas about literacy. She claimed that she had ideas to help students to learn more words in a short time but she met resistance from the school Principal, denying her the chance to bring her literacy expertise to Australia. She felt that as a foreigner, the education officials were saying, ‘do not come in here and tell us what to do’ (Magen, 15 May 2008). This raises the question of how to treat difference. Miller (2008) argues that:

“though minor differences may be gently affirmed in depoliticised and decontextualised forms such as food, dance and festivities, substantive differences that challenge hegemony and resist co-option are usually perceived as deficit, deviant, pathological, or otherwise divisive (p. 22).”

The misrecognition of the qualifications and work experiences of OTTs is a complicated issue in the Australian educational context. The evidence in this section was mostly from unemployed OTTs who were unsuccessful in gaining entry to the system. However, the evidence might be different if it came from those OTTs who were successfully employed in the system. The evidence might also be different if it came from the NSW education authorities, given the difficult circumstances they
face. Given the evidence that Department of Immigration and Citizenship (DIAC) is the agent responsible for initially recognising the skills of OTTs at Federal level, the barriers of accepting overseas qualifications and experience might create a set of expectations that could not be met by NSW DET. On the other hand, there is a Chinese proverb, ‘Hua wu chang hao, yue wu chang yuan’, which means ‘flowers cannot always be beautiful and the moon cannot always be perfectly round’. The OTTs also have to consider the problems that may occur and be prepared to face these before coming to Australia. However, as another Chinese proverb states ‘Jie ling hai xu xi ling ren’ which means ‘those who tie the bell can untie it.’ In other words, the education and immigration agents have to take responsibility to ‘untie the bell’ which they have assembled to attract skilled migrant labour. Besides barriers in the registration process and the acceptance of overseas qualifications and experience, the OTTs also faced barriers to employment in their job hunting process. The next section focuses on employment barriers for the OTTs.

### 6.3 EMPLOYMENT BARRIERS

This section discusses barriers that OTTs face before, or in the employment process, after gaining approval to teach. According to the survey and interview evidence mentioned in the above sections, the participants expressed their strong desire to find employment positions in NSW public schools. However, Figure 6.3 shows that 44.70% (n=59) of the 132 survey participants experienced unemployment in Australia. The duration of unemployment lasted from one month up to two years. However, 40.15% (n=53) of the OTTs had just recently arrived and were unable to answer this question. Further, 15.15% (n=20) of the OTTs have never experienced unemployment in Australia. The OTTs also have ‘concerns about whether they will be able to secure employment commensurate with their education and experience even after they have met the requirements for teaching qualification’ (Walsh & Brigham, 2007, p. 2).
A NSW DET (2003) report shows that once the OTTs are approved to teach in NSW public schools, they are qualified to apply for casual or temporary teaching positions in NSW public schools when there are vacancies. However, OTTs:

with approval for permanent full-time and permanent part time employment may elect to teach on a casual or temporary basis only or on a casual or temporary basis until such time as a permanent position becomes available (NSW DET, 2003, p. 12).

This policy seeks to explain that interim employment opportunities, like casual or temporary positions, are the ones that OTTs can most often expect to apply for at the beginning of their career in NSW. This is not unlike the situation for local teachers. All OTTs, as well as unemployed local teachers are placed on a ‘waiting list’, from which are allocated vacant teaching positions. Karen explained the ‘waiting list’ thus:

The gentleman [a NSW DET official] told us that in primary education they have quite a lot of teachers. They actually have a ‘waiting list’. … What happens is when a permanent position comes up you are allocated that position according to when you actually came onto the waiting list (Karen, 16 June, 2008).

This situation is far away from what the OTTs imagined the situation of ‘teacher shortage’ meant, before they moved to Australia. From advertisements and recruitment agencies in their homeland they understood that Australia is facing

Figure 6.3

Have the OTTs experienced unemployment in Australia?

![Bar chart showing experienced unemployment, not experienced unemployment, and not applicable as just arrived in Australia.](image)
teacher shortage and OTTs could expect to get permanent positions immediately after migrating into Australia. However, in Australia they learn that:

demand for teachers exists in the secondary areas of mathematics, science (particularly physics), technology (particularly food technology with hospitality), and English (especially with drama), and also in the specialist areas of school counselling and special education. Employment prospects for teachers trained in these subjects are very good, especially if you choose to work in western and south western Sydney and in non-coastal, rural NSW. Teachers of all secondary subjects and primary teachers can find work as casual and temporary teachers throughout the State (NSW DET, 2009a, para. 18).

NSW DET (2009a) indicates that qualified and experienced OTTs have a chance to compete for jobs in some specific subjects, and in certain non-metropolitan areas. OTTs trained and willing to work in these particular subjects/sites may have increased opportunities to be employed permanently by the NSW public schools, but there are no guarantees. The NSW public schools have temporary and casual positions to employ primary and secondary OTTs once they have the requisite teaching approval. After getting teaching approval, the OTTs register their information and preferences online, including their qualifications, expected working places, preferred hours to work and employment status. The system will assign available positions according to the teachers’ preferences, depending on availability, due to competition from other teachers. The NSW Teachers Federation (2007a) encourages OTTs to contact School Principals regarding employment possibilities in the area where they would like to teach part-time or casually. The NSW Teachers Federation (2007a) also suggests OTTs consider offers of work in NSW regional or rural areas so as to increase their chances of being employed permanently. For OTTs who want to gain permanent employment they have to wait until a position is available:

Permanent employment as a teacher is offered only to Australian citizens or permanent residents of Australia. Factors which influence a teacher’s permanent employment prospects include the geographic locations in which the teacher is prepared to work and their teaching area. For example, secondary mathematics teachers are in demand. Teachers who have permanent approval to teach are eligible to apply for advertised permanent classroom teacher positions. These positions are advertised on the Department’s Jobs@DET website (NSW DET, 2009c, para. 22-24).
The NSW DET (2009c) further indicates that the condition for being employed in permanent positions is that only Australian citizens and permanent residents are eligible for these jobs. The teachers who are in demand in specific subjects, or who are willing to work in particular locations are more competitive in gaining permanent employment. Teachers with permanent teaching approval are eligible to apply for the permanent jobs when they are advertised. However, there is a lack of clarity as to whether OTTs will be employed on ‘a casual or temporary basis only or on a casual or temporary basis until such time as a permanent position becomes available’, or can apply for permanent positions immediately after having NSW DET teaching approval. OTTs can apply for permanent positions by competing for positions advertised on the website. NSW DET also provides another option for securing permanent employment, based on the availability of jobs in certain, mostly undesirable locations:

Under our new staffing procedures, you may be notified by us about other vacant permanent positions in geographic locations that you have indicated on your list of preferences. For these positions, you will have the opportunity to submit a short resume and may subsequently be invited to an interview (NSW DET, 2009c, para. 25).

The OTTs are asked to register online and to indicate their preferred work locations. The NSW DET will inform them when permanent positions are available, according to teachers’ preferences. The OTTs then may apply for these permanent jobs and compete for them through interviews. The NSW DET conducts the same employment procedures for Australian-trained teachers and OTTs, after the latter gain NSW teaching approval. Therefore, the following explanations and suggestions regarding the employment procedures recommended by the NSW Teachers Federation may also apply to the OTTs.

Application online is the first step in obtaining a teaching position. … You will be asked to complete a ‘Nomination of Schools Form’. This indicates the schools or school Districts in which you are prepared to teach. The Federation’s advice is: - Tick the boxes for ‘permanent’, ‘temporary’ and ‘casual’ employment. This will maximise your employment chances. If you tick only the ‘Casual’ box, you will not be considered for a permanent position. You will not be considered for either a graduate recruitment program position, nor be given a priority date for future permanent appointment. You will also be ineligible to
apply for any PeP [Pre-employment Program] positions (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007a, para. 1-3).

The NSW Teachers Federation (2007a) explains the NSW DET’s teachers’ employment procedures in detail. The provision of applications online for teaching positions is the first step after registering with NSW DET. The teachers are asked to fill out an online form to indicate their preferences for the kind of employment they would like. The three options are permanent, temporary, and casual. The NSW Teachers Federation (2007a) suggests that teachers choose all three options to maximise their employment opportunities. This means if a teacher only chooses a ‘permanent position’, s/he will not be given any casual or temporary jobs; s/he will have to wait until a permanent position is available.

This is not practical, because neither online DET permanent position advertisements nor permanent positions by geographical locations are likely to be given to newly registered teachers without any local practical teaching experience. Thus, all teachers (including OTTs) who are newly registered with DET have to nominate all three categories and be prepared to start as casual or temporary teachers. Therefore, OTTs, even those with a considerable amount of teaching experience, have to start their teaching careers again in Australia as they are under the same employment procedures as the new Australian education graduates who also just register with DET. This suggests that their overseas teaching experiences are not being valued, but trigger employment barriers whereby more experienced OTTs cannot gain better employment positions:

DO NOT put down any school or area (School Education Area) you are NOT prepared to accept. If you are offered a school that you can’t accept, your application will be relegated to a later priority date. Your nomination list is not a ‘priority order’ list (first choice, second choice etc.) but ALL the areas in which you are prepared to accept an appointment. The list can be as small or as large as you wish to make it. You may list Districts (School Education Areas, schools, or a combination of both (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007a, para. 4).

The NSW Teachers Federation (2007a) explains the meaning of the permanent preferences areas on the ‘nomination list’, because teachers may misunderstand it as a ‘priority list’. The teachers can write down several schools or areas where they are
willing to work, on their preference list. Some teachers may put down areas that they
do no intend to work in, but that are likely to provide a quicker track to permanent
employment, like rural or regional areas. However, they might change their minds
when they are offered work in a school in these areas. Under this circumstance, the
teacher will be reassigned to the bottom of the waiting list, and this in turn will
dramatically influence their future applications for employment. Therefore, the
choices on the ‘nomination list’ are most important to a teacher’s employment.

when your name comes up apparently you’ve got 2 days to say yes or no.
If you say no, you go back to the bottom of the waiting list. Some people
have been on this list for a couple of years (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

Teachers generally indicate a willingness to teach in metropolitan areas. Not many
make schools in rural or regional areas a priority employment choice, unless they
really want to work in those areas. The NSW Teachers Federation (2007a) suggests
that teachers think twice before making this decision, because choosing only a few
cherished locations will limit their employment prospects.

Timothy’s understanding of the ‘waiting list’ saw it as an employment barrier for
both teachers and schools. For him, the system did not seem to be based on finding
the most appropriate teachers for the children, but depended on one’s position on the
‘waiting list’. This might be harmful for maintaining teacher quality:

my school or the school closest to where I live for my son could be good
now, but if those teachers decide to get a transfer next week or year,
random teachers could be employed because they would be at the top of
the list, not because they are the best teachers for the school. Therefore
my view is, the children are not getting the best service. They are getting
worse things in my view. This is a strange way of running a system of
education (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

The ‘waiting list’ encourages casual or temporary teachers to leave the profession if
they can find relatively stable positions in other fields. Timothy doubts if children
receive quality education under these circumstances, as the teachers appointed to
succeed those leaving schools might not be the most suitable but are merely the next
on the ‘waiting list’. Timothy doubted the argument that, ‘No one would go to
schools in rural areas if they were allowed to choose their jobs freely’. He argued

181
that, as in England, ‘Principals are entitled to more power in employment’ (Timothy, 26 August 2008). Timothy thought that people were trying to protect their own jobs and using rural communities as an excuse, rather than addressing their needs. For him the ‘real’ purpose of this system was to set up barriers ‘to restrict competition and to sustain the interests of the dominant groups’ (Krahn cited in Miller, 2008, p. 23). Timothy said he did not understand the system:

I really do not understand it. No one has given me a really good reason as to why it works like this. People just defend it and defend it. ... I tend to find, a lot of your old school teachers, who were in England in the 80s they had a job for life. Nobody could take that job from them. Once things changed the quality of teaching went up (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

Timothy considered that the current employment barriers are a key issue influencing the quality of teaching in Australia. In particular, the practice of teachers keeping their jobs for their whole life was questioned. Under these circumstances, teaching has been considered as a life long career, to do forever, without changes. Timothy took England’s experiences as a contrary example:

I do not know the quality of the teaching here. The people who tend to defend the status quo the most tend to be old school. The ones who think well if we change this, ‘he does not just hire but he also fires’ he might just get rid of me. That is my understanding of it (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

Teachers who have been in teaching service for a long time fear changes that might mean they could lose their jobs if the employment process were changed. The principals would have more powers to select the most appropriate job applicants. They would also lay off staff due to the limited number of positions. Whether the refusal to change employment practices is one of the reasons causing the long ‘waiting list’ is open to question. For those teachers who are employed, they struggle to maintain their labour rights and benefits by striking. The new incoming OTTs are asking for positions which they were led to believe were available. Timothy mentioned that some teachers have asked him to join the striking teachers, ‘I get people telling me we are striking for this and we are doing that. I am of the view of I just want to get a job’ (Timothy, 26 August 2008).
A key concern for OTTs is to find appropriate teaching positions that can match their skills and experiences; or otherwise to find another job. For OTTs, lacking Australian qualifications and local experience, this places them at a disadvantage. However, their overseas work experience and the specific skills they have are supposedly in demand in Australia, but are not acknowledged and recognised when seeking jobs in Australia. In particular, the data indicates that most of those interviewed faced employment barriers when they were trying to enter the NSW schooling system. Concerns about their overseas qualifications and teaching competence had not stopped their immigration, but once in Australia it affected their prospects for employment. It is understandable that most of the OTTs expected to start work as soon as possible after arrival. Stable work and better workplaces in Australia were what they thought immigration would provide. However, as Miller (2008, p. 15) points out, ‘these expectations are dashed, if their qualifications and work experience, gained in their home countries, are not recognised as legitimate by potential employers and accreditation bodies’. The current complex employment process for teachers severely influences their post-arrival settlement, keeping at least some OTTs out of the NSW public school system. The employment barriers mean schools lose opportunities to employ the OTTs which Australia’s multicultural education system should have.

The experiences of Vanessa and her sister provide a good means to compare the employment process of an Australian-trained teacher and an OTT. Vanessa arrived in Australia at the same time as her sister just finished a teaching degree from an Australian university, and prepared for life as an Australian-trained beginning teacher. Vanessa had several years teaching experience in Special Education in South Africa and the UK; her sister was a beginning teacher with three years of teacher education. The outcomes were not as Vanessa had expected. She thought that her sister would find a job easier than her:

I was prepared to go anywhere. I was not thinking I must get a job within five kms of where I live. I was very open, but I then put my papers into the Department of Education. They wanted all my qualifications (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).
OTTs who do not have a strong preference regarding their future work location when applying to migrate into Australia increase their employment prospects. Vanessa took her qualifications and other documents to the Catholic school system, where she completed all the required assessments, including interviews. Within two weeks she was given a permanent job offer from a Catholic school. Her sister was still waiting for an initial response from the NSW DET. After getting another job offer, Vanessa left the Catholic school. The two jobs indicated that Vanessa’s qualifications and previous work experience were highly valued in Australia, at least in the Catholic sector. The time for the DET assessment ground on and it lost another potential qualified employee. As a newly graduated, Australian-trained teacher, Vanessa’s sister secured a Catholic school job offer a week before classes started. There was little time for her sister and the school to get to know each other; it was just like a blind date. Vanessa said,

She just took herself off to the school, had a wander around for a couple of days before school started. She turned up on the first day, ‘Hello I am here. Hello everybody’ … She could have said no, but by the sounds of it, you never say no to those because they are like hen’s teeth and you have to take them. … Now she feels well stuck in a sense. Once you get a permanent job you do not feel you can change into any other. You cannot go out of the Catholic sector into the DET sector (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).

It is very hard for teachers to forgo a permanent position in one sector and move to another. Vanessa’s sister is now ‘stuck’ in a sector she did not want to work in. Both OTTs and Australian-trained teachers face employment barriers, including not having many chances to transfer across different schooling sectors. Therefore, the employment barriers among the different schooling sectors influence teacher circulation:

Now, she [her sister] was fully into the Department, you know targeted graduates. Now she feels she cannot move anywhere because if she moves she will lose her permanent job. You cannot go back to it, you know. Everyone just feels they’re stuck. I think they are. They just hold on because they are too scared if they go anywhere else they will never get back to where they were in terms of security (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).
Being ‘stuck’ in a job one does not like focuses attention on this particular employment-inhibiting movement across different education sectors. Apparently, it is difficult for teachers to transfer among Australia’s different educational sectors. Perhaps this is because the education system does not have many opportunities for more appropriate employment. Vanessa concluded that this indicated a ‘lack of competition’, favouring ‘traditional protected employment’. She also said, ‘Australia has got a reputation which is, if it is not Australian then it is regarded with deep suspicion’ (Vanessa, 13 August 2008). Timothy explained:

I think the [qualification] accreditation is good because you make sure you are getting people who can do the job correctly. Any amount of paper work that I’ve sent in for the last 18 months can say what it needs to say. So accreditation proves it. But once you have actually got it, to get a job I find that really frustrating and this is where the problem lies (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

The qualification recognition provides the evidence that helps employers select the right person for a teaching position. However, after spending eighteen months trying to get his NSW DET teaching approval, Timothy had become disappointed with the process. It was really hard for him to find a position, even a casual one:

To get my NSW accreditation you have to do two weeks [PeP] to prove that you are a teacher. This is so, even though you have gone through an 18 month application process to show every single CV, every single written reference. You have backed it up with evidence upon evidence. When you get here, they still will not let you teach. You then have to go again… I said to them, ‘I have already given you this.’ They say, ‘No, this is a separate process, you can now get accredited’ (Timothy, 26 August 2008).

Getting accredited only means the OTTs are qualified and approved to seek a teaching position in NSW public schools. It does not mean they are assigned automatically to a teaching position:

Their way of getting permanent staff is very off-putting. I can see it will take a while. You can see why people that have gone through the old system want it to stay that way because if they have been waiting 6 years to get this position they have been promised at the end of doing whatever after 6 years. You can see why they do not want it to be stopped. I suppose there has to be a line somewhere. It’s like anything where you
want change doesn’t there? Speaking to Australian teachers, some of them who have been out for 5 years or whatever are very annoyed at the thought that jobs can then come down to interview. Other people think it should be very transparent. All jobs should be available to everybody. You should be just interviewed to get a position. I never in my wildest dreams thought that it would be anything different than that anywhere else. It was quite a surprise that they do it with this ‘waiting list’ method in NSW (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).

In NSW, permanent positions are not advertised to attract the most experienced and qualified teachers but are allocated according to the length of service and the ‘waiting list’. Some teachers, especially those who were in the teaching service for a few years but without permanent positions, could not move to available job vacancies easily because they were on the permanent job waiting list. They were afraid of losing their place on the ‘waiting list’ and losing the chance for a permanent position if they left for other jobs, like overseas vacancies. Such overseas work experience might not be counted after they returned to Australia. Therefore, some Australian-trained teachers with overseas work experience might have to start over again at the bottom of the waiting list.

The ‘waiting list’ seems to favour those casual or temporary teachers who work hard and are loyal to their schools. But it might be unfair to those highly experienced teachers, qualified university graduates and newly arrived OTTs. The competition for teaching positions does not seem to be built on competence but on one’s position on a waiting list. This means, there are few chances for OTTs to show their specific teaching skills to get permanent positions directly. They are largely judged by their documents, the PeP Practicum and their willingness to persist with the ‘waiting list’. This represents a type of ‘protected employment’. A dilemma in this situation is that schools lack the administrative power to advertise job vacancies to recruit the most appropriate teachers.

Those with the symbolic capital, the established group, hold on to it by producing barriers to prevent latecomers from entering the system. The ‘waiting list’ method may have negative effects by pushing the teachers who cannot afford to wait out of the profession. This might be contributing to Australia’s teacher shortage. The teachers on the ‘waiting list’ do not want to teach in rural or regional areas, but are
waiting for metropolitan positions. Apparently, the teachers who would like to teach in rural areas do not see the chance to apply for these jobs as they see themselves at a lower position on the ‘waiting list’:

It is unfair for the school to only be able to offer one job every however many years to somebody on a permanent position. It’s just very strange. A lot of teachers put up with being temporary jobs and not knowing what to do. Not being able to secure a full-time job, they do a lot of casual work. They just do it because that is the way it is. I came from a place where that is not the way it is. I find it quite hard to accept that it’s so different here (Vanessa, 13 August 2008).

It can be difficult to understand the NSW school employment system. The OTTs interviewed in this study could only get temporary or casual jobs, waiting many years for a permanent position. The ‘wait time’ for a permanent position leads some OTTs to either choose to do temporary jobs for an uncertain period in the hope of securing permanent employment, or they get a job in another sector, or they leave the profession altogether.

Edward is from the United States of America. He studied in an Australian university as an exchange student. He has a Bachelors degree in Science Teaching, which was designed for students to teach Science and Physical Education in US schools. He came to Australia to marry an Australian woman. After completing the NSW DET OTTs registration process, he thought that he would find a casual job around the area where he lives. However,

I went around to all the schools in Wollongong. They all turned me away saying, that their casual lists were full. That I had to try at the beginning of the year and then they would let me in. (Edward, 24 June 2008).

According to the NSW DET teacher employment system, Edward, an OTT, can apply for temporary or casual teaching positions in NSW. He wanted to apply for teaching positions near his home so he could live with his wife, who was doing a teacher education course in Wollongong. However, there were no casual teaching jobs available in the Wollongong district in the year he gained the NSW DET teaching approval. Then he had to wait until the following year to see if there were any available positions, if he wanted to teach in that area.
To support the family, Edward finally chose to work as a salesman in an electric goods store. The limited casual or temporary employment positions might be another employment barrier for qualified OTTs to hurdle if they wanted to enter the NSW public school system. Some of those OTTs who did well in their PeP practicum (see Chapter 7) could not get casual positions, as these were not always available in local schools:

Trying to get your foot in the door here is almost impossible. I got the job by word of mouth. The reason I got the job was because I had done my placement at a local school. I got on really well. I thoroughly enjoyed it. They wanted to have me this year, but did not have a post to fill (Rose, 19 August 2008).

Finding a job in the Sydney metropolitan area can be a challenge. Rose emphasised that her previous overseas work experience had brought her respect from employers. She did well in the PeP practicum (see Chapter 7) and the school wanted her to join them. However, she had to wait because the casual list was full that year.

Edward and his wife finally received two teaching positions in a remote area school. His wife was given a permanent position because she is an Australian citizen. However, Edward could only get a casual job because (see Section 5.3.3), as he explained:

It [marrying an Australian] gives me employment rights but not with the government. I can only work casually with the Department. I do not think I cannot take any government position that is as far as I understand it (Edward, 24 June 2008).

Edward understands the NSW DET only employs Australian citizens and permanent residents in permanent positions, even though he was prepared to teach science in a remote Indigenous community. Marrying an Australian did not give Edward citizenship or permanent residence rights. The immigration laws are such that:

The spouse visa allows you to enter or remain in Australia on the basis of your married or de-facto relationship with your partner:

1. on a temporary visa (usually for a waiting period of approximately two (2) years from the date you applied for the visa)
2. on a permanent visa if, after the waiting period (if applicable), your partner relationship still exists and you are still eligible for this visa (Department of Immigration and Citizenship, 2009).

Edward did not know whether he would have to leave the remote area school, given the year it would take to get Permanent Residence. On the one hand, his wife would lose her permanent employment if she left with him. On the other hand, Edward could not gain a permanent position before becoming an Australian Permanent Resident:

The Principal [of the remote school] knows everybody. This guy has been around teaching forever. He is ancient. He knows everybody. He has gotten on to politicians. You name it he has contacted them to try and get me into this permanent job. The Department keeps saying no, because I am not a Permanent Resident. So they cannot employ me permanently. So what he is doing now is to try and get Immigration to speed up my Residential status (Edward, 24 June 2008).

The School Principal tried to raise Edward’s salary to a similar level as that of a permanent teacher, to try to keep him in this remote Indigenous school. The School Principal was also keen to get Edward a permanent position in order to try to keep this couple in this remote school that suffers greatly from teacher shortages. However, the NSW DET continued to decline the Principal’s application because of Edward’s temporary residency visa. Therefore, the Principal asked DIAC to speed up Edward’s process for obtaining Permanent Residence. From Edward’s experiences, we can see that OTTs’ residence classification becomes another employment barrier for gaining a permanent position, even in a remote school where there is a teacher shortage. When asked, ‘given the teacher shortage in remote Australia, do you think it could be much harder for you to get a job in this country’, Edward answered:

How much harder, I honestly do not know. It was such a pain in the arse for me to get the certificate that says that I can teach in public schools. That was probably a 3 month process. You could not make it much more difficult (Edward, 24 June 2008).

The teacher employment system in NSW can be a cause for disappointment for some OTTs. As a science teacher, Edward can only get short term casual teaching in a remote Indigenous community. Permanent positions are so hard to get because of his
temporary residency, despite having an Australian wife. He expressed his intention to move to other areas for teaching, although his wife’s permanent position would be sacrificed. A similar experience also happened to Veronika, from Russia. She tried to find a permanent position teaching Russian.

It took me quite a while to get my permanent residency. It was not a straightforward procedure. Getting permanent or casual approval employment all depends whether you are an Australia permanent [resident] or not. Therefore, for some time I could not get into that field (Veronika, 27 May 2008).

It is not possible to be employed as a permanent teacher if one’s visa classification is not that of Australian Permanent Resident. Veronika was told that teachers of Russian were in demand, but only one school in Sydney provided the course at that time. Veronika finally gained a permanent position after completing the Permanent Residence process, which takes several years.

Medlyn was a primary teacher in Ireland who majored in languages. She came here with her Australian fiancé. Medlyn did not try to find work through the public school system but with the Catholic and private sectors. She applied for a job advertised in newspapers. A private school provided her a chance for an interview:

   I did not get anything from the State, I was told there was a thirteen year ‘waiting list’ for a job. The Catholic people said, ‘Oh, besides the fact that you have taught already we still want you to pass a 2-3 week free teaching’. I did a couple of weeks with them. I thought this is going to be difficult to get a job. Luckily I got into the private sector. I did not have to deal with any of the red tape (Medlyn, 18 August 2008).

Among the reasons Medlyn did not try to find a job with the NSW DET was that she did not receive any employment information from the Department and was told that it would take a long time to wait for a job. Medlyn’s comments reflect the worries and anxieties among OTTs about their employment futures. After a series of job interviews, Medlyn succeeded in getting a teaching position in a private school in Sydney. She felt relieved that she did not have to deal with the amount of documents to prove her teaching competence, although the private school income would be less than the government schools.
Sophie lives on the border of NSW and ACT. She registered with both the ACT and NSW Education Departments but could only find casual positions on either side of the border. She does relief teaching in the ACT and crosses the State border to do casual teaching in NSW. She found that:

it was awkward because you would be offered this work for 1 day here [in ACT], and then you would be offered work from another school [in NSW]. They would say we want you all week. I would say, ‘Well I have committed to doing a day for this other school. It was very difficult to get regular work (Sophie, 12 August 2008).

The unstable job commitments in both ACT and NSW made Sophie feel tired as she commuted from one State to the other during the week. She felt it was very hard to find a fixed teaching position with regular income in either State to support her family. Finally, after struggling to find secure employment, Sophie quit her teaching career, after finding full-time work as a teaching assistant.

Given the evidence analysed in this section, it is clear that these OTTs have faced employment barriers hindering them in getting a job. However, it should also be noted that some of these employment barriers, such as the ‘waiting list’ system and the online teaching preference registration system, are not directed against OTTs in particular but apply also to Australian-trained teachers. The following Figures 6.4-6.7 may help us to better understand the employment status of the OTTs.

Figure 6.4 indicates that there 41.67% (n=55) of the 132 survey respondents started teaching in Australia between 2005 and 2008 and 5.30% (n=7) started teaching before 2000. 12.88% (n=17) started teaching between 2000 and 2004. Due to the survey, there was a large number of OTTs who had just arrived; 40.15% (n=53) of these 132 survey respondents had not started teaching yet.
Figure 6.4

When did the OTTs first start teaching in Australia?

There are 79 (59.85%) of 132 survey respondents had taught in NSW until 2008, if we calculate the figures in Figure 6.4. Figure 6.5 shows localities of the first teaching job of these OTTs. There were 64 valid responses within these 79 OTTs who had taught in NSW; 70.31% (n=45) of them started teaching in NSW metropolitan areas, and 29.69% (n=19) had their first Australian teaching job in NSW rural or regional areas.

Figure 6.5

Place of first Australian teaching job

Figure 6.6 shows the current teaching places of 62 valid survey responses. Due to similar numbers of valid responses in Figure 6.5 and Figure 6.6, the researcher considers there is comparability between these two Figures. Fifty nine point sixty eight (59.68%, n=37) of the OTTs are teaching in metropolitan areas; this has decreased in comparison with 70.31% (n=45) in Figure 6.5. The number of OTTs who are teaching in rural and regional areas increased from 29.69% (n=19) to
40.32% (n=25) in Figure 6.6. This might be a positive signal that strategies for attracting OTTs to teacher shortage areas are working. There are 67.11% (n=51) of OTTs teaching in government schools and 32.89% (n=25) of the OTTs are working in the non-government sector, within the 76 valid responses (see Question 14, Appendix 1).

![Figure 6.6](image)

**Figure 6.6**

Current teaching locations of OTTs

Figure 6.7 shows the general employment status of these OTTs. There were 101 valid responses for this question; 70.30% (n=71) of the survey respondents were employed or would be employed as temporary or casual teachers, while only 29.70% (n=30) of the OTTs had permanent teaching positions.

![Figure 6.7](image)

**Figure 6.7**

Employment status of OTTs

If we compare figures in Figures 6.6 and 6.7, it is not difficult to find that 30 OTTs with permanent teaching positions represent 48.39% of the 62 OTTs who are
working in NSW schools. This figure may help to understand teacher employment strategies conducted by the NSW DET (2009a), where OTTs may start from temporary or casual positions in their first years, like the 41.67% (n=55) of the 132 OTTs (see Figure 6.4) who started teaching in Australia after 2005; many of them might have not been yet promoted to permanent positions.

It is not difficult to understand that most OTTs might expect to be employed immediately after arriving in Australia, as they have to support their families and many are aware of Australia’s skills shortage. The registration and employment barriers may keep some of them out of teaching, and lead some to transfer to other professions or occupations to ensure they have stable incomes. However, we may also see that the OTTs, as new incoming teachers, have disadvantages, associated with the lack of local teaching experience and not being familiar with the system, although they may have many years teaching experience overseas. It may be difficult for the education authorities to believe that OTTs are capable of taking permanent teaching roles in just a short time. Thus, OTTs typically start as temporary or casual teachers, like many university teacher education graduates. Among the employment barriers, it is the temporary visa that is the barrier that goes against only the OTTs, and this is a ‘problem’ and this may be caused by the DIAC. In addition to the registration barriers, barriers to acceptance of their qualifications and work experience, and employment barriers, the OTTs also face language barriers in the Australian education context. The language barriers exist not only for NESB OTTs but also for native English speaking OTTs.

6.4 LANGUAGE BARRIERS

The survey participants were asked to indicate what they considered their English competence to be, in terms of their general English language capability, knowledge of students’ informal language, and their knowledge of subject-specific language. Figure 6.8 indicates the confidence of OTTs’ in their English language abilities. The survey responses (N=132) indicated that 94.70% (n=125) of the OTTs were confident with their English proficiency. They claimed to be able to communicate in English without any problem. The survey respondents were less confident with their
ability to understand and use the informal Australian English of their students. 64.39% (n=85) of the NSW 132 survey respondents were confident with Australian students informal language. 90.91% (n=120) of the 132 survey respondents indicated that they were fairly confident with their abilities in subject specific language. There were no noticeable differences between the presumed language proficiency of survey respondents who had experienced unemployment, compared to those who had not rated themselves highly across all three areas of English.

![Figure 6.8](image)

**Figure 6.8**

OTTs’ self-evaluations of English skills

Grenfell (1998) indicates that ‘language arises out of interactions with language and between people, which are constructing and constructed according to intent, the limits of context, and degrees of shared meaning’ (p. 74). The interview evidence shows that some of the OTTs still had some problems which made it difficult for them to fit into the Australian education system. However, most of them considered their English competence was good enough to teach in Australian schools. Interestingly, language barriers exist not only for teachers from non-English speaking countries, but also for native English speaking OTTs. A teacher from India felt she was made fun of; her accent was seen as a source of amusement by students and her colleagues, although she was a hard working teacher:

> It is not our fault that our accent is not like you. English was our second language in our home country. They do not think that we are clever as them because we know so many languages. They know only English. We know Italian, we know Punjabi, we know Hindi, we know Urdu, and we know English. Five languages, [but] they don’t think like that (Anita, 27 June 2008).
OTTs from India know that their English accent is different from Australian English. Anita she had no problem communicating with the locals. But this difference seemed to be a barrier in her job hunting and teaching. However, she considered that people should focus on her multilingual competence and skills in managing these languages, instead of just looking at her accent as a deficiency. Veronika, who was from Russia said:

So I, being honest, I was not very comfortable. That is why I decided not to go ahead in that direction. I always felt conscious. I always felt that my accent was seen as interfering with my knowledge. So yeah, I was not comfortable. That is why I am dealing with primary, with little kids, because I would not, no I would not want to go into anything with the High School (Veronika, 27 May 2008).

OTTs may lose their self-confidence due to their ‘foreign’ English accent. This impeded Veronika’s career development, although her accent was hardly different from local Australians. Veronika felt herself to be inferior due to her accent. She could not fully contribute her knowledge to the Australian education system. She did not even want to try to teach high school students, as she was afraid that her accent might be ridiculed by them. The language barrier affects not only NESB OTTs. Native English speaking teachers face challenges: Australian educational jargon often confused Magen.

Educational jargon was the thing that got me a little bit. You know I found that confusing and disconcerting. But I had more to think about than what words to be using. You know, I wanted to get on with the job (Magen, 15 May 2008).

Magen experienced trouble with Australian education jargon. She could not be understood by students, although she came from England. It was not a matter of Magen speaking standardised English. It has to do with the problem of OTTs having to fit into the Australian education system by learning its specific language. Magen said that she would get used to this as it was necessary for keeping the job.
6.5 DISCUSSION

The global circulation of workers in general, as well as of teachers in particular, exists for several reasons. However, for newly arrived immigrants, Australia is a society in which there is:

An ambivalent coexistence of outward-looking multiculturalism and Anglophile xenophobia [that] leads some to regard Australia as having a successful multicultural society in which over 100 diverse ethnic/linguistic groups live democratically together, and others to criticise it for its hostile treatment of some ethnic minority groups (Hickling-Hudson, 2005, p.341).

For Australian education, OTTs are a beneficial supplement for schools, especially in some specific subjects. Hartsuyker (2007) indicates that OTTs and teachers from non-English speaking backgrounds bring ‘a range of experience, cultural perspectives and languages to … schools, and are important in a multicultural school context’ (p. 48). This situation would seem to offer opportunities for OTTs who have relevant Bachelors or Masters degrees and several years of teaching experience in their countries of origin. It might even suggest they could become one of the key sources of labour for the Australian teaching force. Hickling-Hudson (2005) argues that ‘individuals have not a single, fixed “essence”, but that they construct multiple identities in a process of refining and reworking values, beliefs and ways of seeing the world’ (p. 343). OTTs have to draw on this when confronting barriers to making a teaching career in Australia.

Table 6.1 shows that most of the issues raised by the interviewees focus on the complicated and lengthy registration process; their overseas teaching experiences not being accepted and valued, and issues concerning their employment status. Miller (2008, pp. 16-17) indicates that ‘in deciding who are most desirable for “admission”, the state sets the parameters for the social, cultural and symbolic boundaries of the nation as manifested in the “race nature” of immigration policies. And the non-recognition of qualifications and experiences acts as a barriers to integration’.
Table 6.1
Various barriers for overseas trained teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewees</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anna</td>
<td>Registration process is so complicated and lengthy</td>
<td>Registration barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>1. Registration process is so complicated and lengthy</td>
<td>Registration barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Skills not recognised</td>
<td>Acceptance barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Overseas working experiences were not accepted</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanessa</td>
<td>1. Registration process is so complicated and lengthy</td>
<td>Registration barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Overseas working experiences were not accepted</td>
<td>Acceptance barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose</td>
<td>1. Registration process is so complicated and lengthy</td>
<td>Registration barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Overseas working experiences were not accepted</td>
<td>Acceptance barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magen</td>
<td>1. Registration process is so complicated and lengthy</td>
<td>Registration barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Overseas working experiences were not accepted</td>
<td>Acceptance barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Language issues</td>
<td>Language barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>1. Overseas working experiences were not accepted</td>
<td>Acceptance barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anita</td>
<td>1. Overseas working experiences were not accepted</td>
<td>Acceptance barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Language issues</td>
<td>Language barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca</td>
<td>Overseas working experiences were not accepted</td>
<td>Acceptance barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timothy</td>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veronika</td>
<td>1. Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Language issues</td>
<td>Language barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edward</td>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen</td>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medlyn</td>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employment barriers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, the OTTs interviewed for this study report confront a range of barriers. Acquiring Permanent Residency status is essential for applying for permanent teaching positions in NSW; this is a first barrier. OTTs with temporary visas (e.g. Spouse visa, see Section 5.3.3) cannot be employed in permanent teaching positions.
even in specific instances of severe teacher shortage, for instance, for a Science
teacher in a remote Indigenous community. This can be understood in terms of
citizenship being ‘a legal status based on rights, in the whole, compatible with the
conservative ideology of the duties and responsibilities of citizens and is a strongly
state-centred conception of political community’ (Delanty, 2007, p. 15). It is not
difficult to understand that citizenship is a special kind of membership that entitles
the members to rights but also to obligations, such as contributing to forming the
nation’s citizens through education (Slaughter & Hudson, 2007). Delanty (2007)
argues that in the context of contemporary globalisation:

migrant groups have become more and more a part of the mainstream
population and cannot be so easily contained by multicultural policies
and, on the other side, the ‘native’ population itself has become more and
more culturally plural due to the general pluralisation brought about by
post-industrial and post-modern culture (p. 18).

However, the restrictions of residential status on positions of permanent or full-time
employment ‘excludes a large number of undocumented workers [or temporary
workers which] will contribute to the formation of an immigrant underclass that is
legally as well as economically disadvantaged’ (Sassen, 1998, p. 49). Hence,
restraining the potential contributions of temporary OTTs, either in educational or
economic terms, has the potential for negative outcomes. Hickling-Hudson (2005)
argues that:

discourses of who are the real and less real Australians reflect and are
constitutive of power relations dominated by British-derived cultural
hegemony, still entrenched despite the growing diversity of the
population, the increasing support for various levels of multiculturalism,
and the articulation of multicultural aims by governments (p. 341).

Australia is an immigrant country. However, it is very much like Miller’s (2008, p.
16) characterisation of England, namely that ‘the openness and tolerance has been
increasingly threatened by a series of government initiatives targeted at restricting
the privileges and freedom of migrants’. 
The Australian education context is promoted as a field in which OTTs are recruited to practise (Hartsuyker, 2007). This ‘field’ (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992) is a network where the relations between Australian education authorities and the OTTs have been configured in certain positions. The structure of this field depends on the amount of capital and power their counterparts possess or lack. Grenfell (2007) argues that ‘entry into the field depends on accepting, at least implicitly subscribing to the pre-existent forms of the field’ (p. 55). The OTTs have to accept the Australian education and employment rules that are the field in which they operate, although ‘acceptance and the logic of practice implied by it, is therefore a kind of “self-

---

Discussion on Bourdieu’s (1991) cultural reproduction theory and education system

This article triggered in me a better understanding of the meaning of ‘education’. The article points out that from this theoretical perspective, ‘education’ refers to reproducing the social structure of social classes through converting students to society’s desired patterns and shapes. Here then, education is responsible, in part at least, for the reproduction of the social and economic system. In other words, over the long term, education necessarily makes for cultural reproduction by enabling the culture of the dominant class to become the culture of the whole social structure, or at least to govern it. From continuous bilingual reading and understanding, I have learnt about many theoretical concepts with which I was not familiar before starting my PhD studies. I can now understand the English language literature that explains these theories and I can connect them with my research, especially the analytical interpretation of evidence. However, I still find it difficult to write my understandings in English. It seems there is a curtain in front of me. My writing is sometimes blocked by obscure concepts whose meaning in English I do not completely understand. Being assisted with Chinese articles, I can write in English based on my Chinese understandings.

---

Figure 6.9

Discussion on Bourdieu’s (1991) cultural reproduction theory and education system
“deception” but one which might still bring its rewards’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 55). With regard to cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1986), such as the education qualifications and work experience of the OTTs, these ‘have value to the extent to which what passes as having legitimate value is known and recognised’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 61). Despite the OTTs having such cultural capital, ‘the capital accrued from educational institutions only has value in fields that recognise and share this value’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 111). Thus, within this specific field of Australian education and employment, the capital that a certain group has but other groups do not have, creates a basis for distinctions among different social groups, and creates divisions between upper, middle and lower social groups (Grenfell, 2007). Therefore, this mechanism ‘occurs in a “misrecognised” form; part of its power is that it is “occluded”, or at least not open to conscious control or acknowledgment’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 61).

The OTTs then are classified as non-Australian teachers who have deficits in their qualifications and a lack of local work experience, despite an immigration process that leads them to assume otherwise. Therefore, different terms and regulations are generated, ‘to differentiate between Australians considered “real” and “non-real”’ (Tsolidis cited in Hickling-Hudson, 2005, p.341). This leads to a misrecognition of the qualifications and work experiences of the OTTs at various points, some of which become barriers to their careers as teachers. The cultural capital that the dominant agents— NSW education authorities—possess, becomes ‘associated with “highbrow” aesthetic culture and analytically and casually distinguished from technical forms of knowledge or competence’ (Swartz & Zolberg, 2004 p. 7).

According to Bourdieu (1986), language can be taken as a form of cultural capital. Thus, besides the registration and acceptance barriers, for OTTs from non-English speaking countries, language becomes evidence of another capital they are lacking, namely being native English speakers. Webb et al. (2002) indicate that language is one form of cultural capital that with others, ‘shape, determine and help reproduce social relations, and the different power relations that pertain in our culture have no necessary basis’ (p. 117). What does this mean for OTTs from NESB countries? Grenfell (1998, p. 73) indicates that ‘words are never just words; language is never just a vehicle to express ideas. Rather it comes as the product and process of social activity which is differentiating and differentiated’. Thus, there is no doubt that
overseas trained teachers should have sufficient English competence to support their teaching in Australia.

However, Brubaker (2004) finds that the examiners of people’s English language proficiency are not, and cannot be neutral with respect to the test-takers’ social origins, and may over-emphasise certain aspects of language and style ‘which more than any other aspects of educational performance, are heavily dependent on cultural capital’ (p. 42). Grenfell (1998, p. 73) argues that ‘language should be examined in terms of the relationships from which it is generated’. The field of Australian education is multivalent; thus, ‘forms of thought are developed not simply in terms of the content of knowledge but through a whole relationship to language, which itself was acquired ipso facto in the process of gaining linguistic mastery’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 105). OTTs with language problems may enhance their language competence in the process of exercising knowledge, but they probably need to do this before migrating to Australia.

6.6 CONCLUSION

This Chapter has analysed evidence of the barriers when OTTs try to integrate into the NSW public education system. The barriers which were explored relate to registration, employment and language. The key problems the interviewees raised focus on the lengthy registration process for recognising OTTs’ qualifications; the requirement to have local Australian work experience and Permanent Residency status as essentials to gain permanent positions in the NSW public schools. There were also issues with language difficulties for some OTTs. The language difficulties affected communication with students, parents and teachers, with the issue of accents being a key concern. However, teachers from English speaking countries also faced language problems, especially in the use of different educational terminology. This Chapter raised a question which is explored in Chapter 8, namely, whether OTTs who have had long teaching experience overseas should be judged as beginning teachers in Australia? They aspire to reclaim their previous level of status in accordance with their work experience and teaching competence. This partly requires local qualifications and teaching experience. Additional professional and personal
support could lead to some changes so that OTTs can continue their career in Australia. Before evidence of this concern is analysed in Chapter 8, it is necessary to analyse evidence relating to the Professional English Assessment Test (PEAT) and the Pre-employment Program (PeP). This is done in Chapter 7.
CHAPTER SEVEN

PREPARATION OF OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS—PEAT AND PRE-EMPLOYMENT PROGRAMS

‘I can see you are a utopian. You think that one can call up an ideal in one’s imagination and then go and find or create a reality to match it. We know otherwise. We have attained the world you seek through the inexorable process of world-historical development and through the revolutionary struggle of the Proletariat. In short, the Workers of the World united as we told them to, and we now live in the New World made possible by their successful struggle’ (Lukes, 1996, p. 182).

7.0 INTRODUCTION

There are no ideal training programs and tests that completely meet the needs of both education authorities and OTTs. Both employers and workers will always struggle for testing regimes and training programs which are of benefit to themselves. Before migrating to Australia, the OTTs had little knowledge about the language test and training programs they would have to undertake to get employment as teachers. Of course, Australian education stakeholders, employers, principals, students and their parents have questions about whether these OTTs can fit into the Australian education field and match the varying expectations. The language proficiency test and the retraining program are required of the OTTs, to ascertain which ones meet these requirements. There are conflicts and struggles between the OTTs and the education stakeholders as each pursue their advantage within this field. Research may offer insights into possible solutions that meet the interests of both parties, but it is no road to utopia.

This Chapter first analyses the policies for conducting the English language proficiency test for OTTs from non-English speaking backgrounds. Then it analyses the history of selected policy and programs for the retraining of overseas trained teachers developed in New South Wales between 1991 and 2008. The purpose of this document analysis is to identify what might be learnt from exploring the progress
that was made in addressing problems of teacher recruitment through the development and reworking of the English language proficiency test and Pre-employment Program provided for teacher induction and orientation. The primary evidence for this Chapter is drawn from the analysis of relevant policy and program documents produced by the NSW DET (and its predecessor the Department of School Education) and the NSW Teachers Federation. Data analysis procedures include event listing; the tabulation of categories; the presentation of interview excerpts based on key themes and patterns, the analysis of survey evidence and the generation of key concepts. The first section provides evidence about the conduct of the Professional English Assessment Test (PEAT) for Non-English Speaking Background (NESB) OTTs.

### 7.1 CONDUCTING PEAT FOR NESB OTTS

The policy of the NSW DET is that OTTs who want to register in NSW and who speak languages other than English as their first language are asked to take an examination that tests their English language skills. The Professional English Assessment for Teachers (PEAT) test is designed and conducted by the Institute of Languages, University of New South Wales on behalf of NSW DET:

> All NESB teachers seeking employment with the NSW Department of Education and Training (DET) are required to have their qualifications assessed by the School Staffing and to pass the Professional English Assessment for Teachers (PEAT) (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007b, p. 1).

PEAT is mandatory for OTTs from non-English speaking countries to qualify for the possibility of seeking employment in NSW public schools. There are some points relating to PEAT which do not fully satisfy the requirements or expectations of the NSW Teachers Federation. In particular, the Federation is of the view:

> that trainee teachers were not always aware of particular requirements for teaching in NSW public schools. Whether this was the responsibility of the DET or the relevant university has been a moot point for some time. It would be a pity if the same situation developed in relation to the Institute’s requirements (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007c, p. 1).
The issue of employers’ responsibilities for retraining non-English speaking OTTs to ensure that they are familiar with teaching requirements for working in Australian public schools is a challenge. The course of study for the PEAT covers many of these issues. However, the course only focuses on the knowledge that is required for passing the test. It is important for OTTs to acquire knowledge of the teaching requirements in NSW public schools, as they are from different education systems. The schooling model with which they are familiar is unlikely to apply in Australia. The interviews with OTTs, reported in this Chapter, also show that one of the problems that they face is the lack of a vehicle for gaining familiarity with the NSW education system. They report that they did not get enough such information.

There is also an issue about who has to take the PEAT. The NSW Teachers Federation (2007b) points out that it seems unfair to judge English proficiency by the PEAT for non-English speaking background overseas student teachers who have received all the teacher education in Australian universities: ‘The English language requirements for entry into an undergraduate university program are lower than those proposed in this draft’ (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007c, p. 1). The counter-argument is that it is important for the PEAT provider to ensure: ‘everybody enrolled in a teacher education course is aware of the requirements; the [NSW] Institute [of teachers] provide[s] a leaflet on the English language requirements for the universities to hand out to their students’ (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007c, p. 1). In this sense, it may be worthwhile paying attention to the relationships between the PEAT provider and university educators so as to develop teacher education courses to meet requirements for being a teacher in NSW public schools. It might be appropriate for student teachers and/or OTTs who retrain, because those who are from non-English speaking backgrounds in Australian teacher education programs are not required to take a further test to prove their English proficiency.

7.1.1 Description of the bands in the PEAT test

There are six bands for each of reading, listening, writing and speaking in the PEAT test ranging from Band A+ to Band D (A+, A, B+, B, C, and D). The five requirements of the Bands are briefly explained here, while Band A is discussed
further below. Band A+ requires examinees to master English to a standard
equivalent to that of a native English speaker, as used in daily or professional life
(NSW Teachers Federation, 2007b). Band B+ indicates that the examinees are able
to use English appropriately in teaching but might have slight difficulties which
influence understanding and communication. Band B shows that the examinees can
use English freely in daily communication and in basic professional discussions but
with some inaccuracies. The examinees may also have problems in all four sections
due to limited vocabulary. Examinees with a Band C rating can only deal with basic
daily communications, and cannot satisfy the speed of demands in teaching.
Inaccuracies strongly influence English language understanding. Band D means the
examinees are not qualified at all (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007b).

Let us now turn to Band A of the PEAT test (NSW Teacher Federation, 2007b). This
is the minimum requirement for non-English speaking OTTs to gain a teaching
position in NSW public schools. Band A in the PEAT test demands examinees show
a mastery of English equivalent to that of native speakers in listening, writing,
reading and speaking. Accuracy and fluency in different contexts are both
emphasised, specifically in relevant education contexts. The PEAT test is quite
helpful in assessing the English language qualifications of overseas trained non-
English speaking teachers. It specifies the minimum English language requirements
for overseas trained teachers who are from non-English speaking countries (see
Table 7.1).

There are general and specific English language requirements of Band A, which are
considered the appropriate English language skills that non-English speaking OTTs
are expected to have (NSW Teacher Federation, 2007b). For the reading section, it
requires that PEAT test-takers should be capable of reading various styles of English
texts, and that their reading speed should be equivalent to or approximately that of,
educated native English speakers. Comprehension of some difficult styles of English
language texts is also part of the criteria in the reading section. For the listening
section, the PEAT requires the examinees to successfully understand all forms of
speech in contexts relevant to their professional work as teachers. This includes
understanding Australian accents, words and sayings.
Table 7.1
Minimum language requirements for OTTs from NESB countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Band</th>
<th>General requirements</th>
<th>Specific requirements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reading (Band A)</td>
<td>Read all styles and forms of the language pertinent to your professional needs.</td>
<td>Can read difficult prose readily and all material relevant to your teaching subject including all professional documents. Reading speed will approximate that of a comparably educated native speaker. Understanding cursive writing poses no greater difficulty for you than for a native speaker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening (Band A)</td>
<td>Being able to comprehend easily and accurately all personal and professional contexts relevant to your experience</td>
<td>Readily understand all educated speech in any context relevant to your professional life. Rarely troubled by speech in other contexts, comprehend the generally recognised varieties of Australian English and other similar varieties only occasionally baffled by colloquialisms, comprehend fast rates of utterance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing (Band A)</td>
<td>Being able to write fluently and accurately on all levels normally pertinent to your personal or professional needs.</td>
<td>Rarely make errors in grammar or vocabulary. Able to consider and select from amongst a wide choice of vocabulary and structures to make your meaning clear. Considerable sensitivity to the level of language required in any context and modifies language appropriately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking (Band A)</td>
<td>Being able to use the language fluently and accurately on all levels normally pertinent to your personal, social, academic or professional needs.</td>
<td>Participate within range of experience with a high degree of fluency and precision of vocabulary. Mastered commonly occurring colloquial and idiomatic forms. Can respond appropriately even in unfamiliar situations. Pronunciation does not impede comprehension by a native speaker. Considerable sensitivity to the level of language required in any context and can modify language appropriately.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: NSW Teachers Federation, 2007b).

The listening section of PEAT requires the participants to demonstrate that they have little trouble in comprehending speech quickly; including speech mixed with
colloquial words. The emphasis is on accuracy in understanding such speech. For the writing section, the PEAT examinees are required to show their capability for writing fluently and accurately. Versatile writing skills; appropriate word usage; being able to use different writing structures to suit different purposes and rarely making grammatical errors, are essential for success in this test. The speaking section tests the examinees’ English capabilities for talking and responding to others.

The test participants are required to use a wide range of vocabulary, including Australian colloquial words, to speak freely and accurately in all kinds of situations (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007b). This section tests the capacity for non-English speaking OTTs to speak in ways that are as little different from well-educated native speakers as possible. If the participants have one or other World English accent and this does not affect mutual communication and comprehension, then they may pass. When Chinmayi was asked about her experience with PEAT, she said:

in reading comprehension, what I did, I am slow, you have to increase your speed, it was ok. But the questions are based on the school system, so I have to read about the school policy for the PEAT. Even the questions they ask are for speaking and how you are reading with the school system. To know the school system here, I learned, I went to a course, I followed a course, but I did ok. I could have done better. I did not study (Chinmayi, 25 June 2008).

Not passing PEAT the first time is a cause for disappointment. PEAT is designed to require OTTs to be familiar with the NSW school system and to understand how it works, as well as to test English language proficiency. It is essential to include questions based on the NSW educational context. In other words, the PEAT is not simply an investigation of the English competence of the OTTs but also requires that the NESB teachers demonstrate that they can manage the English required for the specific education environment in which they want to and need to work. Of course, not all OTTs agree with these purposes:

Part of the problem with the PEAT test is of course, it tests, not just English but English in relation to working in NSW schools, so the content is about do you understand the language, the vocabulary, of working in NSW schools (Anita, 10 August 2008).
NESB OTTs may fail the test for the first time under this circumstance, even though the NSW DET provides specific courses for OTTs to help them prepare for it. Veronika completed the PEAT after two attempts, passing three components the first time and passing the writing component the second time. As the holder of a Masters degree in Education, Veronika was very confident with her English proficiency. One can only sense a slight difference in her spoken English from a native English speaker during the interview. She said,

I believe my writing is also very good but at that time I did not know anything about the Australian educational system. They were asking about writing reports or notes for excursions, so you need to use specific language in that respect. I had no clue (Veronika, 27 May 2008).

The NESB OTTs are expected to be aware that sufficient English communication competence may not guarantee them passing PEAT. They are also required to have a sound understanding and detailed knowledge of the NSW education system. These requirements are built into what is expected to pass the test, as they are necessary to work in NSW public schools. Not all the NESB interviewees passed PEAT the first time they took it. However, Alka, a teacher from Fiji, was very proud of passing the test at her first attempt:

I know friends who were able to pass at first attempt. I did. It could be my exposure. I was not just a classroom teacher. I was involved in other [educational work], like marking of exams and in setting up for exams for senior level (Alka, 2 July, 2008).

Alka received bilingual (English and Hindu) education from primary school. She considered the reason for her passing the test easily to be related to her previous work experience. She was not only involved in classroom teaching, but also took charge of some school administrative work. These experiences gave her a strong background in school English writing and understanding school reports and procedures. Doing work other than that of a classroom teacher also helped. Alka’s story helps us to understand that NESB OTTs’ success in the PEAT is connected to their proficiency in English skills, and may derive from having a variety of school experiences. This could have implications for recruitment.
7.1.2 Possibilities for conducting other forms of English proficiency test

How to test the English language proficiency of non-English speaking OTTs is an important issue. The NSW Teachers Federation (2007c) argues that it is difficult to find a way out of this dilemma to satisfy both the needs of the students and the requirements of OTTs for working in Australian teaching contexts:

There is a balance that needs to be reached between the rights of otherwise qualified teachers to obtain employment in their chosen profession and the rights of the students they teach. The Federation recognises that it is not always easy to strike that balance appropriately. … The English language skills required to teach in NSW schools are, by the very nature of the Profession, higher than those required, for example, to complete a course of study in an Australian university. At the same time it is important not to set the bar too high, thus excluding some who have the potential to become excellent teachers (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007c, p. 1).

In the real teaching environments of NSW public schools, the requirements of minimal English language proficiency for OTTs are not enough to meet the demands of daily teaching. However, OTTs may learn more if given professional development to improve their English proficiency, thus, minimising the loss of potentially successful teachers at a time of teacher shortages. With respect to the issue of rights, students have the right to OTTs whose English language proficiency is equivalent to that of native speakers. Should qualified OTTs be entitled to the right to work as a teacher regardless of their English capabilities? Here, there is a need to consider the impact of such rights on both students and OTTs. What more could be done to develop a set of criteria for selecting appropriately qualified OTTs that avoids negative impacts? The NSW Teachers Federation (2007c) argues that PEAT should not be the only measure for assessing OTTs’ English proficiency, due to its cost and the central metropolitan location:

For reasons of both cost and the location of the testing centres, the Federation is pleased to note that there is more than one acceptable test available. The Federation has always been concerned that the only location where prospective teachers in public schools can sit the PEAT test required by the DET is in Sydney. Travel and accommodation costs, on top of the not insignificant fee for completing PEAT, have proven to be a considerable barrier for some teachers (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007c, p. 2).
In the current situation, the part-time preparation courses and workshops, as well as the PEAT, are only held in central Sydney. This makes it difficult for teachers who live in regional or remote areas of NSW to be involved. The high costs involved in taking the test, plus the uncertainty of test outcomes lead some OTTs to avoid it. This means that NSW public schools are, potentially, losing highly experienced teachers. There is the possibility of adopting various English language proficiency tests. The NSW Teachers Federation has endorsed two alternatives to PEAT, one being the International English Language Testing System (IELTS):

The Federation notes that the level of proficiency required on this test is higher than that required for entry to the majority of universities in Australia. The Federation also notes the requirements to be registered, accredited as a teacher in Victoria, South Australia and Queensland include a minimum score of 7 in all four areas of IELTS, while the requirement in Western Australia is a minimum score of 8 in each area. ... It does not seem unreasonable for the NSW Institute to require a ‘minimum overall score of 7.5 including a minimum result of 8.0 in both the speaking and listening modules and 7.0 in reading and writing’ (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007c, p. 2).

Given the IELTS scores for English language requirements in other Australian States for OTTs, the NSW Teachers Federation agreed with the policy of the NSW Institute of Teachers on the requisite IELTS scores. This puts much more attention on speaking and writing skills. A second alternative test is the International Second Language Proficiency Rating (ISLPR):

This test appears to be appropriate, particularly as it has been developed, in consultation with the Queensland College of Teachers, in a form specifically applicable to the teaching profession. ... Requirement for teaching in Queensland is a score of 4 for Speaking, Listening and Reading and 3+ for Writing and in South Australia, Western Australia and Victoria a minimum score of 4 in each area. ... The NSW Institute of Teachers has not explained why it might require a higher score of 4+ in all four areas. The Federation questions whether this requirement is unnecessarily high (NSW Teachers Federation, 2007c, p. 2).

Along with these optional language tests, the NSW Teachers Federation doubted why the NSW Institute of Teachers requires higher scores when compared with four other Australian States. It is possible that this may hinder qualified OTTs from entering the NSW system of school education. The concern about taking results from
other forms of English proficiency test sounds reasonable. However, teaching in NSW public schools for NESB OTTs does not only involve being highly proficient in English, but also having the language for dealing with various teaching circumstances. These skills include management of specific NSW education terms and familiarity of NSW education system. In this sense, other English tests cannot replace PEAT, which is specifically designed to examine the English proficiency of the NESB OTTs in the NSW school context.

7.1.3 Cost and location of the PEAT

Given the cost to participants of undertaking PEAT, the NSW Teachers Federation (2007c) suggested that the providers consider conducting the test in regional NSW. This was seen as a possible way of reducing participants’ expenses, including the cost of travel and accommodation, and of providing a means of attracting more qualified OTTs. Regional, inland Australia has a teacher shortage so this could be a useful initiative.

Chinmayi had migrated from Sri Lanka, where she had started learning in English from primary school, and continued to do so to tertiary education. She received a Bachelors degree in the middle of the 1980s, when the Sri Lanka education system followed the British system, and all her college texts and library books were written in English. She used to work as a TESOL teacher in a private school in Sri Lanka and communicated with her students in English, although she spoke Tamil at home. Therefore, Chinmayi was confident of her English competence and presumed that she would pass PEAT. However, on her first try in 2000, she only obtained a B for all sections, and did not achieve the four ‘A’s required to pass the test. After the first failure Chinmayi did not retry the PEAT test until 2004, for financial reasons:

The problem is that for the exam you have to pay a lot of money. At that time, when we migrated, we migrated under skilled migration, my skill. So after 2 years we were not given any social benefits so we had to find some jobs. So my husband did some factory jobs. We did not have much money at that time (Chinmayi, 25 June 2008).
NESB OTTs who meet the precondition of passing PEAT move on to the next step in the registration process with NSW DET (2009b). However, the cost of the test and the preparatory course give many NESB OTTs ‘cold feet’. They understand the importance of passing the language test to continue their teaching career in Australia, but as newly arrived immigrants, the first thing they have to do is to find work to support their families:

I thought it was a waste of time and money [to take the PEAT test], so that’s why I did the exam again in early 2004, and got an A in reading only. So I had to do it again, so I did in 2004. I got an A for writing in April 2004. So I had passed 2 components. Then the other 2, I completed in 2004. I completed all the components in 2004 (Chinmayi, 25 June 2008).

Chinmayi finally met all the requirements for PEAT after taking the test four times in four years. It might be said that Chinmayi was not good enough to pass the test the first or second time, and so should avoid further examination fees. As an OTT from a developing country, financial reasons played a role in keeping Chinmayi away from both the test and the preparation course. However, PEAT is conducted in such a way as not to financially penalise OTTs who fail part of it. They do not have to redo the whole test, only those parts they fail, so they do not have to pay the full administration fee. With the cancellation of the English training courses (see Section 7.2.2), the improvement of English proficiency appeared more difficult for some NESB OTTs, because this reinforced their relative disadvantages in the labour market. The PEAT provider argued that it was not practical to conduct the test in regional areas, for the following reasons:

1. The Professional English Assessment Test (PEAT) is administered by the Institute of Languages at the University of New South Wales and takes a full day to complete.
2. To properly conduct PEAT requires a specialised venue which must have desks and chairs separated by specific and reasonable distances and be equipped with a high quality sound system to ensure even delivery to all its parts so that no candidate is disadvantaged by poor coverage while they are undertaking the listening component.
3. Also the venues must have additional rooms or offices each with audio recording facilities, a table, two chairs and a whiteboard to enable individual candidates to complete the Speaking component.
4. For each sitting of the PEAT a range of specialised staff is required. These include invigilators to ensure the security of the conduct of the
The PEAT provider gives three reasons that negated the possibility of regional provision: the length of the test, the facilities needed for the test, and the security required for the test. While inner Sydney is not one of the places where there is a shortage of teachers, this is where the tests are conducted. The test provider considered the feasibility of conducting the test in regional locations but anticipated that it would not be possible to be fully operational in such settings. Issues concerning the likely number of participants and the costs in sending the examiners to such places, mean that the test provider is unlikely to conduct PEAT in regional areas. In addition:

The PEAT is conducted on a user pays basis and if it were conducted outside of the premises within UNSW, expenses in addition to venue hire would include payment of staff and staff accommodation, travel and sustenance, making participation in the assessment more expensive (NSW DET, 2007, p. 1).

Given these difficulties there may be other ways forward. For instance, the PEAT provider might be able to conduct more tests periodically, to offer more times for the examinees. More specifically, PEAT could be promoted, if not conducted in university courses or programs to allow OTTs to become more familiar with the test and figure out appropriate times to take the test. The following section introduces the mandatory training program that all OTTs have to complete before they get teaching approval in NSW (2009b). For those OTTs who pass PEAT it is the next step in getting ‘approval to teach’ in NSW public schools.

7.2 PRE-EMPLOYMENT PROGRAMS

This section presents a time-series analysis of the Pre-employment Program (PeP) and its predecessor—overseas trained teachers program (OTTP) for OTTs that was made possible by using texts supplied by the NSW Teachers Federation and NSW DET. Accordingly, the ability to trace the events and agencies involved over the period 1991 to 2008 could be done in reasonable detail and with precision. This is a major advantage in using these records. The logic driving this time-series analysis is:
the match between a trend of data points compared with (a) a theoretically significant trend specified before the onset of the investigation, versus (b) some rival trend, also specified earlier, versus (c) any trend based on some artefact or threat to internal validity (Yin, 1994, p. 114).

The time-series analysis presented in Table 7.2 provides a basis for exploring the sources of innovation in the PePs. Following Yin (1994), three opposing explanations are considered the drivers for these changes. First, it is possible that the key agency responsible for driving the changing events during the course of these nearly 20 years was the central authorities within the Education Department. Contrary to this position, the evidence suggests that changes in the PePs for OTTs were driven by a multiplicity of agencies at different levels. The changes in the program were affected by factors beyond the control of any one agency. An examination of the actual data points in Table 7.2 concerning the changes that occurred between 1991 and 2008 provides a basis for the development of propositions that best match the empirical evidence. Table 7.2 indicates that a range of agencies were involved in making changes to the PePs for OTTs. These include the NSW Department of Education and Training and its predecessor—the NSW Department of School Education, the NSW State Government, a university, the Secondary Principals Council, and the Primary Principal’s Association. This evidence supports the proposition that multiple agencies played a significant role in driving quality improvements to the PePs for OTTs during the period 1991-2008. Interestingly, the evidence in the event list in Table 7.2 does not indicate any external factors as having a bearing on the Program’s changes. This raises the question as to whether there were any other agencies, internal or external to the public education system that had a bearing on these changes to the Program.

Another question arises, about what evidence there is to indicate whether these changes proved successful for the stakeholders, including the schools and the OTT themselves. Here it needs to be noted that OTTs who were recruited at different times have had different rules applied to them under different versions of the PeP. As the Program has been improved or otherwise changed, then it might be expected that schools and the most recent recruits should have benefited considerably from these
changes. However, any concerns arising from the earlier period of overseas teacher recruitment may continue to affect schools, because those teachers may still be employed.

Table 7.2
Milestones in NSW DET’s Pre-employment Programs for overseas trained teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Agency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>The ‘Policy on the Employment of Teachers with Overseas Qualifications’ is released</td>
<td>Premier of NSW Mr Nick Greiner and Education Minister Ms Virginia Chadwick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>OTT from non-English speakers background required to complete the English Language Skills Assessment to demonstrate that have language facility commensurate with ‘full professional proficient’ in English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>The Professional English Assessment for Teachers (PEAT) introduced to assess the English capabilities of OTTs from countries where English is not the main language</td>
<td>Developed and conducted by The Institute of Languages, University of New South Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>The PEAT examination was revised to be more representative of the work of (NSW) teachers</td>
<td>Suggestions for revisions made by the Secondary Principals Council and the Primary Principal’s Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-2003</td>
<td>OTT who have successfully completed ‘optional’ Orientation course have their ‘Priority date’ for employment accelerated (enhanced) by 6 months</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>The delivery of the Orientation program for OTTs becomes problematic</td>
<td>Schools no longer support the program by accepting OTTS into their school for the ‘professional experience’ component</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Completing an Orientation program for OTT becomes mandatory in December</td>
<td>NSW Government Commitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>The 17 day Pre-employment Program (PeP) for OTTs becomes mandatory; only those who successfully complete the Program are granted ‘approval to teach’</td>
<td>Conducted by NSW Department of Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>An external evaluation of the PeP recommends significant changes, including reducing its length to 12 days</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>The revised PeP is conducted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Singh & Guo, 2008b, p.17)
The NSW DSE (1991) considered that a successful OTT should be able to adjust to NSW community and school cultures as well as to their students’ needs. The induction program is a necessary and good opportunity for OTTs to understand NSW public schools and practise their teaching skills prior to employment:

To facilitate the adjustment process, the Department’s Career Development and Induction Unit (CDIU) has upgraded and extended the 5 phase Induction Course previously offered to overseas-qualified teachers of Non-English Speaking Backgrounds already employed in the service (NSW DSE, 1991, p. 16).

This induction program was designed for the OTTs who had already been employed by NSW public schools. It differed from previous programs:

The new Program will be conducted in a pre-service mode, will include a supervised practicum of two weeks (during which participants’ communicative skills in the classroom will be assessed), and must be successfully completed before approval for employment can be given (NSW DSE, 1991, p. 16).

The new Program lasted for two weeks and was conducted under the supervision of mentors. The OTTs’ English communication competence and flexibilities for dealing with various class incidents were evaluated through their practicum. The induction program was taken as a pre-condition for gaining ‘approval to teach’ in NSW public schools. The program included the development of their skills and understanding in the areas of:

1. teaching strategies
2. classroom management and organisation
3. cultural understandings
4. interpersonal communication skills (NSW, DSE, 1991, p. 16).

The Program focused on re-training and developing the newly arrived OTTs’ competence in carrying out efficient teaching strategies to manage students and curriculum activities. The Program also helped enhance the OTTs’ understandings of Australian culture as well as daily communication skills.
7.2.1 Overseas Trained Teacher Program (OTTP) (1994–1995)

In 1994 and 1995, the NSW DET (1994) continued conducting the Overseas Trained Teacher Program (OTTP) for NESB OTTs who have passed the English proficiency test and for native English speaking OTTs. The OTTP was conducted in full-time and part-time modes, which lasted five (5) days in the face-to-face course and thirty (30) hours over four (4) weeks for those attending on a part-time basis. The NSW DET (1994) indicated that more than half of the program participants were not willing to accept casual or part-time employment in NSW public schools. The NSW DET (1994) reported that about 25% of the NESB OTTs passed the English Language Skills Assessment (ELSA) test in 1994. The NSW DET (1994) also created sessions for OTTs and NSW education officials to share information concerning the following issues:

1. The application for employment
2. The ‘Personal Suitability’ interview
3. The English Language Skills Assessment (ELSA), utilising the exemplar and PEAT
4. Successful teaching strategies
5. Classroom Management (NSW DET, 1994, p. 4)

The NSW DET (1994) also provided professional counselling support at pre-set venues and suitable times for those OTTs who had questions about the ELSA (and later PEAT), job opportunities in the labour market, the qualification recognition process or preparation for the ‘Personal Suitability’ interviews. For OTTs whose English needed to be improved, the NSW DET also assisted the English training institutes and arranged school placement for the teachers to practise. The NSW DET (1994) reported that OTTP was successful in helping the OTTs to become familiar with the NSW schooling policies, systems, students and educational culture, as well as with teaching strategies they might adopt in practical teaching. The activities of the Program included:

1. Information Evenings focusing on pathways to employment.
2. Professional support for twenty week English for Teachers courses, offered by the University of NSW, Institute of Languages and the Adult Migrant English Service.
3. Five (one week) Orientation courses for all successful graduates of the ELSA and other teachers from English speaking backgrounds,
with an approval to teach, to promote successful entrée into casual and full-time teaching positions. Sixty three teachers took part in these courses during 1994 (NSW DET, 1994, P. 1)

The induction course was conducted for teachers who had already passed the English proficiency test and gained ‘approval to teach’ in NSW public schools. The NSW DET (1994) also provided professional support to OTTs by conducting information workshops and English skills training courses. With regard to the achievements of the OTTP, NSW DET (1994) decided to conduct the 1995 OTTP with the following sessions:

1. Eight (full-time and part-time) Orientation Courses;
2. The development and trialling of one day courses for teachers applying for employment to prepare them for the Personal Suitability interview;
3. Continued involvement in English language courses offered by tertiary and other providers, particularly in the area of classroom communication and the provision of appropriate school experience placements;
4. Continued provision of counselling services to all those overseas trained teachers seeking advice in relation to any aspects of the employment process, including advice concerning the English Language Skills Assessment (ELSA);
5. Information Evenings will be conducted in all metropolitan regions during the first and second semesters of 1995;
6. All previous participants of Induction and Orientation courses will be surveyed as to their current and on-going professional development needs—following which, a full day course based on the areas of interest indicated will be provided (NSW DET, 1994, p. 4).

There were several changes in the OTTP for 1995. The induction program saw eight courses, up from five courses in the previous year and the NSW DET organised a one day course to assist the OTTs to prepare and rehearse their ‘Personal Suitability’ interviews. The English proficiency training, counselling services and information evenings provided the OTTs with valuable professional support. In 1995, the NSW DET would also provide a day course to support the teachers to deal with common difficulties in their professional development. This course was based on information gained from surveys of participants in the induction program, along with school reports about their practical teaching.
7.2.2 Overseas Trained Teacher Program (OTTP) (1996-1998)

The NSW DET (1996) indicated that the OTTP provided overviews of the development of the labour market situation, policy directions, employment issues, assessment outcomes, services and future options. Summaries and recommendations were included in the annual report for OTTP. Providing labour market information to OTTs helped them find the most suitable and realistic employment pathway. The OTTs could gain employment support from various sources, including in the OTTP, in brochures and in information sharing networks:

There are 500 teachers who gained approval in the period of 1991-1992, prior to the introduction of English language proficiency requirements. It is anticipated that many will be offered permanent employment in 1997, and that they and their schools will need ongoing professional support (NSW DET, 1996, p. 10).

In 1996 approximately 500 OTTs from non-English speaking countries gained ‘approval to teach’ in the NSW public schools without taking an English proficiency test. After 5 to 6 years casual work, many of them were expected to qualify to gain permanent positions in schools. Therefore, it was necessary to provide further professional support to help these teachers develop their teaching and language skills so as to fully qualify for permanent positions. Table 7.3 provides a comparison of the 1996 and 1998 annual reports on the OTTP.

Table 7.3 shows that there were few modifications relating to the recruitment of OTTs from 1996 to 1998. In the teacher labour market, there were 18,000 teachers eligible to apply for permanent positions in NSW public schools in 1996; this figure decreased to 11,000 in 1998. The career pathway for OTTs who started as casual teachers seemed reasonable, due to the demand for these positions. The disciplines which had teacher shortages were Technological and Applied Studies and some specific Asian languages. Teacher shortages in these subjects did not change from 1996 to 1998. The teacher registration rate changed in 1996 and 1998, which suggests that the teachers had broadened their views to seek employment across the State. In 1996, the recognition of OTTs’ qualifications and teacher recruitment was centralised, to ensure the OTT employment process was consistent.
### Table 7.3
Comparison of the OTTP reports of 1996 and 1998

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overview points</th>
<th>1996 Annual report</th>
<th>1998 Annual report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Labour market situation</td>
<td>Long waiting list (18,000)</td>
<td>Long waiting list (11,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour shortages</td>
<td>Technological and applied studies (Industrial Arts and Computer Studies), languages Other than English (LOTE)-Vietnamese, Korean and Japanese.</td>
<td>Technological and applied studies (Industrial Arts and Computer Studies), languages Other than English (LOTE)-Vietnamese, Korean and Japanese.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registration rate</td>
<td>1% teacher mobility and broadened teachers registration locations</td>
<td>1% teacher mobility and broadened teachers registration locations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy directions</td>
<td>Restructuring to centralise processing qualification recognition and recruitment</td>
<td>Policy consistency from 1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour market information</td>
<td>Providing information support to broaden the OTTs’ employment options</td>
<td>Providing information support to broaden the OTTs’ employment options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English proficiency training and test</td>
<td>1. Due to the Federal funding cuts, the English proficiency training courses were no longer to continue after the end of 1996. 2. The English proficiency test-ELSA would not be continued after March, 1996. 3. 57.6% of the participants passed ELSA test</td>
<td>1. No English proficiency training courses 2. PEAT replaced ELSA 3. Asking teachers who got approvals prior to 1992 to redo English proficiency test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment outcomes</td>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: NSW DET, 1996, 1998)

Due to the belated introduction of the English proficiency test, many of the teachers approved for employment in the early 1990s did not have to demonstrate their English competence. Therefore, the NSW DET (1996) considered that it was necessary to provide additional on-going professional support to those teachers who gained approval to teach prior to 1992. One method was to require this group of teachers to take part in the newly introduced English proficiency test, the PEAT, from 1997 onwards. The original English proficiency test, the ELSA was replaced by PEAT in March, 1996. In comparison with ELSA:
the PEAT offers several advantages to most OTTs. If a candidate achieves one, two or three ‘A’s in the first attempt, then only the sections not passed need to be attempted again at a cost of $50 for each part. An information booklet and exemplar of the PEAT is available from the Institute of Languages for eligible teachers. When teachers receive their results, feedback is provided to help teachers better understand their performance (NSW DET, 1996, p. 4).

The newly adopted PEAT offered OTTs a financial advantage, insofar as those who failed did not have to redo the test by paying the full administration fee. Those who passed were closer to getting ‘approval to teach’. Further, the previous ELSA results were treated as valid and equal to PEAT scores for the ensuing two years. However, the pass rate for ELSA in 1996 was 57.6%, indicating that over 40% of the NESB OTTs had to improve their English proficiency. With the cancellation of the English training courses, the improvement in their English proficiency was made more difficult for NESB OTTs, workers who were already relatively disadvantaged in the labour market. In addition, the NSW DET required OTTs who had gained their teaching approval prior to August 1992, to take part in the PEAT test to demonstrate their English proficiency. The reports (NSW DET, 1996, 1998) showed that the OTTP was conducted using appropriate methods and played an important role in the OTTs’ employment. However, the reports (NSW DET, 1996, 1998) also indicated that OTTs should consider broadening their efforts to seek employment in different education disciplines where there was demand.

The NSW DET also organised two English training courses annually from 1997 onwards, to improve the communication and speaking skills of these teachers. The English proficiency training course and test changed from 1996 to 1998. The main modification in these years was that due to Federal funding cuts, the NSW DET could no longer provide the English for Specific Purposes course to OTTs, from the end of 1996. Other professional and language support programs which had been conducted previously were merged into other training courses.

From Table 7.4 it can be seen that NSW DET (1998) made two changes in relation to the OTTP compared to 1996, one concerning information and the second relating to employment support. In 1997/1998, the NSW DET decided to conduct additional
information sharing sessions around Sydney suburbs to help those teachers who were not able to attend the evening information sessions.

Table 7.4
Outcomes and achievements of the OTTP from 1996 to 1997/1998

|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Information           | 1.1 Information evening programs overseas trained teachers seeking employment with the NSW Department of School Education (DSE)  
|                          | 1.2 Information sessions for the participants in ESP-Teachers courses                                  | Information sessions were provided to various groups of OTTs throughout the Sydney metropolitan and regional locations who found difficulty in attending Evening sessions. |
|                          | 1.3 Information given to all the candidates of the PEAT assessment regarding counselling and employment enquiries (See following points in the column on the right) | 1.4 Distributed information to all NSW providers of service to NESB migrants on available courses and services  
|                          |                                                                                                      | 1.5 Distributing brochures of Working Options for overseas trained teachers and overseas trained teachers Programs  
|                          |                                                                                                      | 1.6 Provided on-going support and resources to the Queensland Department of Education who are beginning to develop an orientation and support program for their OTTs. |
| 2. Counselling           | Personal/phone counselling services for OTTs on employment procedures, interpretation of ELSA results, (See following points in the column on the right). | No changes                                                                                              |
|                          |                                                                                                      | English for Specific Purpose (ESP) courses, and qualifications assessment where appropriate. |
| 3. Bridging programs     | 3.1 Initial co-ordination of school observation visits for participants (See following points in the column on the right). | No changes                                                                                              |
|                          |                                                                                                      | 3.2 Information to OTTs on the availability of tertiary courses to upgrade existing teaching qualifications.  
|                          |                                                                                                      | 3.3 Monitored availability and suitability of English language classes available to overseas trained teachers. |
| 4. Employment Assistance | 4.1 Orientation courses for all approved OTTs  
|                          | 4.2 School visit program for two day observation visits.                                                | Two Professional & Colloquial Communication Skills (PACCS) courses, both part and full-time, were provided for OTTs currently employed and who had been identified as requiring additional assistance with language skills development. The courses were conducted by Macquarie University. |
| 5. Database              | 5.1 Finalised the existing ELSA database (See following points in the column on the right)            | No changes                                                                                              |
|                          |                                                                                                      | 5.2 Updated database of participants in OTT programs since January 1994  
|                          |                                                                                                      | 5.3 Updated the database of all relevant NSW service providers for NESB migrants |
| 6. Policy and Procedure  | 6.1 A revised English language assessment (PEAT) has been developed by the University of NSW, Institute of Languages. The first administration was June 18, 1996  
|                          | 6.2 Equity issues                                                                                     | No changes                                                                                              |

(Source: NSW DET, 1996, pp. 6-8, 1998, pp. 6-8)
The NSW DET (1996, 1998) also organised two language training programs to be conducted by Macquarie University to improve employed teachers’ English communication and specific language skills for teaching. This evidence indicates that the NSW DET tried to enhance OTTs’ competence by providing information and professional development to enable those already employed to improve their capabilities for working in the NSW school system and to be more competitive in the labour market.

7.2.3 The Overseas Trained Teacher Program (OTTP) (2000-2003)

Between 2000 and 2003, the contents and requirements of the OTTP did not have significant modifications but mainly followed the previous training routines. Therefore, the researcher only takes OTTP documents from 2000 for analysis. In order to provide better pre-employment support for the OTTs and to help them get used to the new teaching environment, an induction program was provided to OTTs who had already been approved to take teaching positions in NSW public schools. The five day induction program covered the following aspects in the NSW schooling system.

1. Classroom Management
2. Child Protection
3. Teaching Strategies
4. Lesson preparation and presentation
5. Syllabus issues
6. Adjusting to the culture of NSW schools and their students
7. Employment issues such as casual teaching and salary conditions
   (NSW DET, 2000, p. 1)

With regard to teaching skills, the program familiarised the OTTs with teaching strategies and the curriculum used in NSW schools. The program assisted the OTTs to prepare to work in NSW by inducting them into its educational culture and employment conditions:

A course of one day’s duration, preparing applicants for ‘Personal Suitability’ interviews will be offered each month to Overseas Trained Teachers to acquaint them with the DET and professional matters related to their role as teachers in a new and possibly different system and culture
   (NSW DET, 2000, p. 1)
In order to help the OTTs to pass the ‘Personal Suitability’ interview, a course was organised and routinely conducted one day a month, to assist them to become familiar with the professional difficulties they might face in their teaching.

The induction program was conducted following one of two models. One model involved a five day full-time training course, which allowed the OTTs to have a single day school visit to gain an impression of how NSW schools work. The teachers who could not make these full-time courses were provided with an eighteen hour part-time course which was conducted in the evenings over two weeks. The PEAT for the non-English speaking OTTs was conducted seven times in 2000; the tests were not conducted unless there were 50 participants. Successful participants in PEAT were admitted into the orientation course with other English speaking applicants. During the induction programs and English training process, several sessions were organised for sharing useful information between NSW DET officials and the OTTs. The topics covered:

1. The application for employment process
2. The ‘Personal Suitability’ interview
3. The Professional English Assessment for Teachers (PEAT).
4. Successful teaching strategies and
5. Classroom Management
6. The culture of our students and schools (NSW DET, 2000, p. 2)

These information sessions served as a support network where the OTTs could share their experiences with each other. Besides the information sharing session, professional counselling support was provided to the OTTs at regular periods. This professional advice included:

1. the application for employment process,
2. qualifications assessment
3. preparation for the personal suitability interview
4. accessing appropriate English language courses (NSW DET, 2000, p. 2).

As newcomers, the OTTs were eager to know and understand the qualification recognition process and employment related information. At the time it was also seen as very necessary for the NSW DET to provide professional counselling
support to the teachers in order to assist them with adjusting into the new system as soon as possible. The OTTs were invited to experience a school day in NSW as a volunteer, in order to enhance their knowledge of the NSW schooling system. However, this support was discontinued, as from 1998 onwards there were few schools willing to provide this support.

In order to help the OTTs to pass the ‘Personal Suitability’ interview comfortably, a day course was offered which introduced NSW school system structures and the school environment. The OTTs were given an understanding of issues like the NSW curriculum and employers’ expectations. As OTTs are required to manage colloquial communication skills in their interviews, this was another item in their course. It is very important for OTTs to have adequate English communication skills in their daily teaching with students and in working with their colleagues. Accordingly, the Professional and Colloquial Communication Skills (PACCS) course was designed to train the OTTs in this regard:

PACCS courses are designed to promote and develop spoken and written communication skills for the classroom, the staffroom and a range of school-based activities (NSW DET, 2000, p. 3).

Macquarie University took charge of this training. The program aimed to train the OTTs in the following aspects of English speaking and writing:

1. classroom management
2. professional issues such as curriculum development and lesson planning
3. interaction with students, parents, and colleagues
4. professional reading, writing, and discussion
5. career development (NSW DET, 2000, p. 3).

Some of the OTTs from non-English speaking countries or education systems which were different to Australia found difficulties getting used to Australia’s particular education system and to Australian English. This could cause difficulties when communicating with students, parents and colleagues. Besides, improved English communication and report writing skills would benefit the OTTs as they adjusted to the NSW education system. Those teachers who developed their communication
skills through practical training and successful participants were awarded a certificate to indicate their level of proficiency.

7.2.4 Pre-employment Program (PeP) (2004-2008)

After 12 years (1991-2003) of development, the OTTP faced major modifications in order to respond to expectations about the development of OTT training and employment situations, as well as government cost-cutting. Therefore, a new training program—the Pre-employment Program (PeP)—was developed at the end of 2003 to replace the OTTP. The PeP was designed on the basis of the OTTP and was first conducted in 2004. From 128 valid survey responses in this study (see Question 11 in Appendix 1), 75.78% (n=97) of the OTTs had undertaken an induction program and 24.22% (n=31) had not. The reason for some OTTs not undertaking an induction program was that the OTTP was optional for OTTs before 2004. The OTTs were encouraged to do the program but this was not mandatory. However, from 2004, OTTs who intended to seek employment in NSW public schools have been required to demonstrate ‘their capability to meet the educational needs of students in NSW government schools’ (NSW DET, 2005, p. 3). It is now mandatory that incoming OTTs take part in the PeP organised by the NSW DET. Therefore, commitment to completing the PeP has become a pre-condition for the OTT to gain teaching approval in NSW public schools. The PeP was designed at the end of 2003 to introduce OTTs to NSW educational culture and the requirements for teaching school students. Some OTTs did not have to take part in the program for the following reasons. Namely, they:

1. have completed a teacher training qualification (e.g. Diploma of Education) in NSW; or
2. have participated in a program that has enabled them to teach on exchange in a NSW government school for one year within the previous five years; or
3. are in Australia on a short term visa which allows them to undertake paid employment in Australia (typically these people are on a 90 day visa and only work casually in schools); or
4. are applying for re-employment after successful permanent teaching in NSW government schools including the award of a Teaching Certificate (NSW DET, 2003, p. 4).
NSW teaching qualifications and previous local teaching experience are critical to OTTs being exempted from the PeP. Holders of NSW teaching qualifications and teachers working in exchange programs can be regarded as typical examples of exemptions. The PeP is designed in two phases: the orientation phase and the assessment phase, which take twelve (12) and five (5) consecutive days respectively (NSW DET, 2003). This potentially excludes qualified casual teachers who are currently involved in other professions but might be willing to move back to the school environment. The PeP is delivered through a combination of:

1. workshops (orientation course and bridging course components)
2. on-line support materials (bridging course)
3. in-school experience (orientation course, assessment, bridging course) (NSW DET, 2003, p. 4).

There are three kinds of assisted programs provided to the OTTs. Interactive programs, like workshops and orientation courses, help the OTTs familiarise themselves with the NSW schooling system. The bridging courses are optional and aim to provide professional support to those OTTs who have temporary difficulties meeting the requirements for working in NSW public schools. An in-school experience provides them the opportunity to:

1. experience the context of the workplace and the day to day work of teaching
2. access practitioner support and advice
3. apply learning and demonstrate proficiency in the workplace (NSW DET, 2003, p. 5).

During this in-school experience, the OTTs learn about NSW public schools and teaching, as well as experiencing daily work procedures and routines. An assessment is conducted by the school, to report on whether the OTTs fully satisfy the work demands. These three strategies join with each other to provide evidence of those OTTs whose performance is satisfactory in their new work environment. The orientation course, which takes 12 days, focuses on two aspects: workshops and in-school practices:

The orientation course of the *Pre-employment Program for Overseas Trained Teachers* is designed to assist Overseas Trained Teachers to
understand the nature of NSW schools and the responsibilities of teachers in our schools. The orientation course occurs over 12 consecutive days and includes workshops and in-school experience (NSW DET, 2003, p. 6).

The orientation course helps OTTs to gain a general impression of NSW public schools as well as insights into how qualified teachers work in these schools. The workshops provide OTTs an understanding of education in NSW government schools with respect to the following issues:

1. curriculum in NSW
2. student behaviour
3. cultural awareness
4. child protection
5. employment opportunities (NSW DET, 2003, p. 6).

The workshops focus on discussing issues specific to NSW public schools that are of immediate relevance to OTTs’ future teaching. The issues covered included syllabus, classroom control, multicultural classes and possible work choices. An in-school placement provides the OTTs opportunities to:

1. observe effective teaching practice
2. participate in professional discussions with other teachers
3. participate in team teaching
4. undertake some independent teaching
5. participate in the range of activities that occur in schools
6. undertake activities planned in collaboration with the coordinating teacher (NSW DET, 2003, p. 6).

The OTTs then undertake in-school practice, which aims to identify their professional capabilities for working in NSW public schools. The nine day practicum is the most important part of the orientation program. The in-school practice gradually develops from class observation to teaching. There are also some group discussions during the process, to ascertain whether the OTTs are able to adapt to team work.

Following the orientation course, the participants’ professional capabilities are evaluated to see whether the OTTs are capable of teaching in NSW public schools:
The in-school assessment offers Overseas Trained Teachers the opportunity to demonstrate their capability to meet the educational needs of students and to be assessed for approval to teach in NSW government schools (NSW DET, 2003, p. 7).

The school practicum allows the OTTs to teach in a real class, where they demonstrate their teaching skills and are assessed to see whether they could be approved to teach in NSW public schools. This concept is similar to initiatives in North America where ‘teacher educators have framed their programs on non-transmission based conceptions of knowledge and teaching with an emphasis on learning by doing within a context’ (Myles, Cheng & Wang, 2006, 234). An interview is conducted after the school practicum to investigate the OTTs’ suitability to adjust to NSW public schools. The ‘Personal Suitability interview’ assesses their attitudes and ideas about teaching. This face-to-face interview lasts between 30 to 40 minutes and is conducted by the Teacher Recruitment Unit. The ‘Personal Suitability’ interview addresses issues relating to the following areas:

1. teaching and learning
2. communication skills
3. student management
4. professional attributes (NSW DET, 2003, p. 8).

The ‘Personal Suitability’ interview examines various issues, ranging from specific teaching and communication skills to student behaviour management. The teachers need to demonstrate excellent competence in their teaching and the English competence to communicate well with students, colleagues and parents.

Table 7.5 shows specific details of the requirements of the ‘Personal Suitability interview’. It focuses on whether the OTTs are able to understand the NSW curriculum, intensively and extensively, as well as to flexibly adjust their teaching approaches based on the curriculum and students’ needs. The OTTs must show their capabilities to deal with different classroom issues using effective communication skills. It is necessary for OTTs to demonstrate their abilities to work comfortably with colleagues in the NSW public schools; to indicate that they can pursue their self-development to be successful teachers by initiating their own professional learning. The ‘Personal Suitability’ interview reflects the NSW DET’s willingness to
recruit qualified OTTs who have excellent prior teaching experience and, in addition, the capability to adjust their skills to meet the needs of Australian students and the NSW curriculum.

Table 7.5
Personal suitability requirements in the PeP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching and learning</th>
<th>Communication</th>
<th>Student management</th>
<th>Professional attributes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• plans learning sequences which reflect the relevant syllabus content and meet students’ interests and needs</td>
<td>• speaks clearly in a suitable tone, using appropriate vocabulary</td>
<td>• establishes and maintains students’ interest and engagement in learning</td>
<td>• demonstrates a willingness to accept feedback and a capacity to implement advice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• uses a variety of appropriate teaching styles and sets learning tasks appropriate to the students’ interests and needs</td>
<td>• demonstrates appropriate non-verbal behaviours</td>
<td>• uses effective classroom management techniques including effective questioning skills</td>
<td>• demonstrates positive and appropriate interactions with teaching staff and others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• demonstrates an understanding of appropriate learning outcomes and assessment tools appropriate to the lesson sequences</td>
<td>• exhibits rapport, empathy and respect in interactions with students.</td>
<td>• anticipates potential classroom management issues and adjusts teaching strategies accordingly.</td>
<td>• demonstrates initiative, resourcefulness and self-reliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• caters for students’ individual differences.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• demonstrates creative and flexible approaches to teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• is aware of student welfare and child protection issues.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: NSW DET, 2003, p. 8)

The newly designed PeP was welcomed by employers, who regarded the Program as a good approach to providing them with well-prepared and qualified OTTs who understood the NSW education system. Reflections from the PeP participants about the Program were also explicit in this regard, according to a report from the NSW DET (2005):
1. Overseas trained teacher employment applicants indicated that in general, the orientation program:
   a. had made a considerable to a very high contribution to their preparation for the assessment components of the program (57% survey responses).
   b. was either a ‘waste of time’ or ‘too long’ (30% of survey responses).
2. The orientation program had contributed to specific areas of capability that were demonstrated during the assessment phase of their initial qualifications.
3. Overseas trained teacher employment applicants overwhelmingly acknowledged the value of the opportunities it provided for professional learning through first-hand interaction with enthusiastic and expert colleagues in a school setting (99% of survey responses).
4. Overseas trained teacher employment applicants said that they knew what was expected of them during the in-school assessment phase (93.5% of survey respondents). The majority of these respondents also indicated that they felt well prepared for the assessment (pp. 4-5).

It is a significant achievement that most of the participants who took part in the PeP were subsequently ‘approved to teach’ in NSW public schools. OTT training programs—PeP, and its predecessor the OTTP—have been conducted for nearly 20 years (1991-2008). These Programs have been successful in helping OTTs to become familiar with the NSW education system. And yet, according to the NSW DET (2008), the length of PeP had to be reduced to 12 days, including a 2 days Orientation Workshop and 10 days In-school Placement and Assessment. This change reflects the effects of cost-cutting on reducing the length of the Program, but also shows the continuing commitment that the NSW DET has made. However, the content of the PeP has not changed significantly, as is evident from the following issues it addressed in 2008:

1. The organisation and functioning of NSW government schools
2. The NSW curriculum
3. Using NSW syllabuses
4. Sources of teaching and learning resources to support the NSW curriculum
5. Child protection
6. NSW Institute of Teachers Professional Teaching Standards
7. The Department’s expectations of its teachers
8. Practicalities of the In-school Placement and Assessment
9. An orientation to the schools and teaching practice
10. Assessment of teaching practice (NSW DET, 2008, p. 3)
Some of the issues in the 2008 PeP were not necessarily extensively developed, but they covered similar features when compared with 1994. The contents of the PeP, which aims to provide specific support to the OTTs, still focuses on a general introduction to the NSW education system. In this study, 87.63% (n=85) of 97 OTTs who took part in the induction programs indicated that the program was useful (see Question 12 in Appendix 1).

![Figure 7.1](image)

**Figure 7.1**

**Useful features of the induction programs**

The OTTs’ (N=85) answers regarding useful points about the induction programs (see Figure 7.1) focused on valuing the programs for the understandings it provided about the NSW education system (56.47%, n=48); student behaviour management and protection (25.88%, n=22); and the NSW education curriculum (22.35%, n=19). However, the length of the PePs was too long, which was criticised by the survey respondents as a not useful point. The following interview analyses evidence about what the OTTs expected from the PeP.

### 7.3 INTERVIEW EVIDENCE ON THE PRE-EMPLOYMENT PROGRAMS

Given the orienting functions of the PePs for the OTTs, it is worth considering some of the potential problems that it brings to OTTs. The evidence from six interviewees will be discussed in this section, namely that of Rose, Anna, Judy, Rebecca, Sophie and Karen. As mentioned above, the induction program was optional for the OTTs before 2004, when the PeP was introduced, which means that the OTTs in this
research who migrated in Australia before 2004 might not have experienced this induction program. Also, not all the OTTs interviewed who have undertaken the PeP made comments on this issue, due to their preoccupation with discussing other issues. These are the key reasons for focusing on these interviews in this section.

Rose confirmed that the PeP was very helpful to new OTTs to figure out what the NSW education system looks like and how it works. This provided a useful starting point:

I found it useful. He [the NSW DET official] is very engaging, I found that pretty useful. There were some things, it is a shame it could not be longer in some respects. There was a lot shuffled into 2 or 3 days. There almost needs to be this. I may well have missed some of these things because as I said the access to the website to let you know what you need to do is not particularly clear (Rose, 19 August 2008).

Rose also considered that the orientation in the PeP was too short for OTTs to know every aspect of the NSW education system in only 2 days. Rose said that she could access the information from the NSW DET website, but the information was not very clear for newly arrived OTTs to understand:

You really are left on your own. Until that point in time where you have to do the 2 days with the DET and then obviously straight in at the deep end to 2 weeks in school. You do not get a chance to do any observations really of schools. You really are sinking or swimming which luckily for me was good. I am not so sure it is good for a lot of people (Rose, 19 August 2008).

Rose questioned whether the PeP could provide enough orientation information and professional assistance for all the OTTs. She was confident with her competence that she could understand the procedures in a short time, as she was a teacher who had worked in a similar education system for 20 years. However, Rose doubted that other OTTs, who were not at her level of experience, were given enough time to better understand the new system. She described the teachers at this stage as being left to 'sink or swim' by themselves.

Anna, another teacher from the UK, also held a similar opinion about the usefulness of the PeP:
The 2 week course with the workshops and being in schools is a good idea. Get an idea of how the schools are different, how the curriculum is different. I am not sure that for a country they are going to say, ‘Yes this is equivalent’. I am not sure that they need to go through quite the rigmarole that they go through at the moment to get there (Anna, 19 August 2008).

Anna considered that the PeP was useful for OTTs from completely different education systems, to help them to better understand the Australian education system. However, she doubted whether it was necessary for teachers from similar education systems to take part in the program, given the knowledge they already had.

Judy is a teacher from the USA; she came to Australia on an independent skilled migrant visa, although her husband is an Australian. This visa type entitled her to apply for permanent positions in NSW public schools. After arriving in Australia she worked in a private American school in Sydney until it closed down. She then wanted to get a job in the NSW public education system but was advised to go through the accreditation process, including the PeP, in order to get ‘approval to teach’:

I had to go through the Teacher Initiation Program [PeP], which is pretty much you go for an in-service. They teach you how to be Aussie for a day. They tell you how to talk like an Aussie, how to relate to people as an Australian. Then you have to teach in the government schools for free for about 2 ½ weeks before they will approve you to teach in NSW. This is degrading at the best of times (Judy, 17 August 2008).

Judy was concerned that the PeP lost its key feature, which was to help OTTs to understand the NSW education system. She considered that the program only focused on how to turn the teachers from other education systems and cultures into Australian teachers:

I was sitting in a room with professionals from all over the world who had Masters’ and Doctorates. They were sitting in a program for a day telling us how to be Australian. It was very degrading (Judy, 17 August 2008).
Judy argued that it was ‘degrading’ for those OTTs who had excellent education and work experience to be converted into Australian teachers through the PeP. The degrees of the OTTs were ignored in the program. Besides the qualifications and experiences of the OTTs not being valued in the PeP, Judy expressed other views on way OTTs are treated:

I did not see it [PeP] as necessary in order to teach. The mentality is trying to make people that come here ‘more Australian’. Instead [they should be] looking at the fact that they are from different countries and that is an attribute, they can bring things to the culture here that someone born and raised here would not be able to do. I do not think NSW sees foreign teachers as an attribute. They only see them as a detriment (Judy, 17 August 2008).

Judy considered that it was not necessary for the OTTs to take part in the PeP as they were qualified enough to teach in the NSW public schools. She thought the cultures and the positive points that the OTTs bring to Australia were marginalised and disregarded in the PeP. The PeP was paying more attention on how to make the OTTs more Australianised rather than exploring what they could bring to local Australian students. Judy felt that the OTTs were regarded as ‘detriments’ that had to be retrained to achieve Australian standards but not beneficial to the multicultural education agenda which the NSW DET claimed for itself.

Rebecca was from South Africa and came to Australia to be reunited with her family. However, her visa type determined that she could only work in a designated rural area where her family lived. She did not know about the process for registering with the NSW DET before coming to Australia:

I had to do the Pre-employment Program, I was stuck here [in Australia], not able to work, no money. Then I discovered that I had to do an 11 hour train trip to get to Sydney in order to do the course. Now that is not OK when you are that far away. You know to actually get down to Sydney. You do not always have access. The schools are also a little bit resentful of actually having to go through that process. But yes, it was good once it was done (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Rebecca’s experiences reflect that of other interviewees—who had just arrived in this new country and did not have any clues about how to find a job. Rebecca found
that she still had to complete the induction program after her qualifications were recognised. She confirmed that the PeP was useful for her to learn about the education system. However, it was difficult and uncomfortable for her to travel from rural NSW to Sydney for the PeP without any financial aid. Like PeP in 2003, a nine day practicum in schools was used to ascertain whether these OTTs could provide high quality, professional teaching to students. However,

employment applicants do not receive financial support from the Department of Education and Training during the mandatory 17-day program, they are required to meet living and travel costs associated with their participation in the program. Where recommended, employment applicants may accept a place on a Bridging Course. The Bridging course is provided on the basis of cost recovery and will involve the employment applicant in a minimum financial commitment of $525 with the maximum being $1075 (NSW DET, 2005, p. 3).

This cost may be considered a financial burden on OTTs, because they have to have some form of income to support themselves while waiting to be assigned an employment position in schools. This is a potential trigger to hinder the recruitment of more OTTs to fill teaching vacancies in some areas. This raises the question about the possibility of conducting the PeP in rural areas where there are teacher shortages. It is a financial burden on the OTTs who live in rural areas to travel to Sydney for the PeP. The OTTs have to spend at least $1,500 dollars, including travel and accommodation costs to participate in the program. For newly arrived immigrant families, this is not a small amount of money to invest when there is no guarantee of a job. Besides, Rebecca felt she was treated unfairly during the practicum in school.

Sophie had worked in a NSW public school about 20 years ago as an OTT from the UK. She then went to Africa with her husband’s job. However, she found that she could not register with the NSW DET for even a relief teaching position when she came back from Africa. She had to go through the recognition process again, which included taking part in the PeP:

The PeP was useful. It was nice to meet the other people who were sort of in the same situation. If I had been living in Sydney it would have been more useful to me because my area is a very small town. There are not a lot of schools (Sophie, 12 August 2008).
Sophie also lives in a NSW remote area. Compared with Rebecca’s comments on the PeP, Sophie emphasised its value in enabling her to connect with other teachers who shared a similar situation. Sophie mentioned that she could gain employment information through communicating with other teachers and DET officials. But she felt it a pity that she lived in a NSW rural area, where there were not many employment options for her to choose. Once again Sophie’s comments raise the question of whether the PeP could be conducted in NSW rural areas where there are teacher shortages.

Karen is an OTT from the UK. She came to Australia after approximately 20 years of teaching in the UK and Papua New Guinea. She taught for three years in Victoria after arriving in Australia. Her comments on the PeP were:

I did not learn anything new [in the PeP]. You might say well, that is to do with you. However, I come from that perspective of when you are sent on these things you should always try and find something to learn. You have as much of a responsibility as the person [the DET officer] who’s actually presenting. What I learnt most was from the people who were actually there on the course. So it was actually being with that group of teachers to me that was the most rewarding part of the experience (Karen, 16 June 2008).

Karen’s expectations of learning something new in the PeP were not fulfilled. She considered OTTs should take part of the responsibilities to manage their professional learning themselves, in addition to that of the PeP trainer. From Karen’s viewpoint, the PeP was a course designed to help OTTs to share knowledge which they had already managed to gain. Karen said that it was not the program but other participants who helped her to access new knowledge and information:

Maybe that is not so true. The guy [the DET officer] who was presenting on the NSW curriculum, he did go into detail, the differences in terminology and that kind of thing. But if you cannot work it out should you be doing the job? You have got to be able to have that level of being able to find things out and look at curriculum documents. There is not going to be somebody telling you about it all the time (Karen, 16 June 2008).

Karen claimed that the PeP was useful in providing information that OTTs should know about the NSW education system. She also argued that OTTs should have
independent learning competences to be able to access the knowledge which they needed to be able to teach in NSW public schools. Karen believed that the PeP ‘should be devolved and localised because then you are more able to respond to the needs of the students, the teachers, the parents and the community’ (Karen, 16 June 2008). Karen’s previous teaching experience in Victoria told her that there were no major differences between that State and the NSW curriculum and students’ assessment processes:

I think it [the PeP] has been a retrograde step because what it has done is in a sense codified the knowledge base for teaching rather than opening it out. Making it more enquiry based in my career. It is those enquiry skills that have been an important ability to find things out, find out about assessment, find out about this child (Karen, 16 June 2008).

Karen considered that the PeP was not really helpful, as it focused on pre-digested knowledge as a way of inducting them into the system. She would rather learn by developing teachers’ enquiry skills to solve specific problems. Competence in learning through inquiry should be able to direct the teachers, rather than codified documents which had been designed to tell teachers what they need to learn. Karen said that the PeP was a ‘retrograde step’ for professional learning.

The above two sections have analysed evidence of what happened over two decades with regard to the PePs for OTTs in NSW. The evidence shows that the NSW educational community has been working on various policies and measures to improve the retraining programs for OTTs. There is no doubt that these programs are useful for OTTs who prepare to enter the NSW education system, through providing information about the NSW education system and curriculum. These greatly help the new incoming OTTs to familiarise themselves with a new education context. However, there are still some questions of concern to education authorities, teachers’ organisations, and individual teachers. These questions include whether induction programs could provide opportunities to connect the knowledge and skills of OTTs from other cultures, to the NSW education context. This is because OTTs, as skilled immigrants, have teaching skills and knowledge which could, potentially help to reform the education community in NSW.
7.4 DISCUSSION

Given the data summarised in Chapter 6 (see Section 6.4), most (94.70%, n=125) of the 132 survey participants were quite confident with their English proficiency. However, Cruickshank et al. (2003) found that many immigrant student teachers:

particularly those of Arabic speaking backgrounds, overestimated their initial competence in academic English. This may have been because their existing competence in English had been sufficient for the demands of study, work and living in their country of origin and in Australia (p. 245).

The main reason some NESB OTTs did not pass the test the first time is that PEAT requires not only that the participants have proficient English communication skills but also that they have competence in managing the English specific to the Australian education context. Bradley et al. (2008, p. 103) argue for ‘a greater focus on English language proficiency that goes beyond the language competence required for the course and adequately prepares students for the working environment’. English training programs should be designed to make sure skilled workers and students are ready and prepared for working in Australia.

As discussed in Chapter 6, language is taken as a form of cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1986). Language is the basis of all teacher presentations and discussions. However, language is meaningless symbols if it is cut off from practical social and cultural lives. Therefore, language is not merely an accumulation of rigorous symbols but a logical discourse that carries functions in furthering social relations:

Those who are surprised by the paradoxes that ordinary logic and language engender when they apply their divisions to continuous magnitudes forget the paradoxes inherent in treating language as a purely logical instrument and also forget the social situation in which such a relationship to language is possible (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 476).

With logical discourses, various social and cultural regulations and institutions are established and structured to maintain human society and its particular mechanisms of reproduction, such as education. Language functions in real life educational discourse when teachers make presentations in practical operations (Bourdieu, 1984).
Jenkins (2002) argues that ‘language is an intrinsic element of the competitive struggles over the use of culture and of the processes of cultural reproduction which make such an important contribution to the social reproduction of the established order’ (p. 157). The struggle for legitimacy of language use exists in each education field, such that the English proficiency tests conducted on NESB OTTs are part of this competition for employment, as much as a struggle over English. Webb et al. (2002) claim that every discipline has its own type of language and requires the use of various discourses. Therefore, Australian educational English rejects the OTTs’ use of terms from other fields, from other Englishes. However, it is important to:

understand language not as a mirror reflecting a pre-given reality, but as a practice that ‘makes the world’, or at least determines how we understand it. … what things are valued, what questions can be asked, and what ideas can be thought (Webb et al., 2002, p. 13).

The nature of the English language that different ethnic groups are entitled to use in Australia plays a role in making sense of the OTTs’ registration of a place in the teaching profession. In Australian educational discourse, English is ‘made to mean’ (Webb et al., p. 13) Australian educational English. The people with power in this field try to ‘compete with one another in order to impose their meaning on language’ (Webb et al., p. 13). Therefore, Australian educational English is marked with power and influence on the OTTs’ perceptions about its implications for their work/life. This power conceals itself in the form of the PEAT test conducted to assess OTTs linguistic and cultural capital. Bourdieu (1991) argues that ‘the more formal the linguistic market is, the more practically congruent with the norms of the legitimate language, the more it is dominated by the dominant’ (p. 69). In the Australian education field, migrant workers compete with each other by establishing discourses of Australian educational English which are favourable to their benefit, in order to win employment as teachers. Just like a soccer game, Australian educational English plays the role of player and the referee. That is because ‘language is not powerful in and of itself, but it becomes powerful when it is used in particular ways, or by particular groups and institutions’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 95).

Table 7.6 indicates that three of the four interviewees who took the PEAT did so several times before they passed.
### Table 7.6
Evidence on PEAT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data sources</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Institute of Language, UNSW</td>
<td>Ask for qualified teachers to take part in the PEAT. PEAT preparation courses and workshops. Descriptions of the bands of PEAT. Treatment for Academic misconduct and cheating.</td>
<td>Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW DET</td>
<td>Cost of the PEAT. Advice to NSW Teachers Federation for venues for the PEAT.</td>
<td>Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW Teachers Federation</td>
<td>Questions for the PEAT passing scores. Questions for adopting other English language tests.</td>
<td>Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinmayi</td>
<td>Took the test four times and passed</td>
<td>The cost of the test is high. Australian-specific education terms and contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anita</td>
<td>Took the test two times and passed</td>
<td>Australian-specific education terms and contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alka</td>
<td>Passed the test first time</td>
<td>Wide range of working experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veronika</td>
<td>Passed the test two times</td>
<td>Australian-specific education terms.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language can also be used to create a distance between teachers and students. Grenfell (1998, p. 79) claims that ‘pedagogic language can be seen in these terms; as the product of a particular field context. As such, it will be governed by what is valued in that field, what is legitimate, what is excluded’. Therefore, language may be divided into legitimate and illegitimate forms in order to distinguish those who ‘gain control over another to maintain core principles of their own habitus’ (Grenfell, 1998, p. 81). Under these circumstances, some OTTs are unable to be what they might want to be and what the employing authorities want them to be. The knowledge and language of some teachers may be marginalised in this process. The linguistic habitus of these teachers is denied; it is rendered as illegitimate by ruling
interests. This can be interpreted as the ‘unorthodox ways of thinking and acting actually operate as if they were legitimate for one group whilst being in opposition to other groups’ (Grenfell, 1998, p. 82).

The English language functions in structuring OTT practice, and ‘provides the means for understanding the world and later is the medium by which these understandings are communicated’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 95). The winning part is always the government that controls its citizens by making the ‘legitimate language’, which is ‘symbolic power’ that ‘bring things into being by naming them, and by making people see and believe a particular vision of the world’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 95). However, this symbolic power need not be accepted by people, either consciously or unconsciously:

We comply with the dominant vision of the world not because we necessarily agree with it, or because it is in our interests, but because there does not seem to be any alternative. People—those from dominated groups, women—often just accept that the way things are the way things should be, or have always been (Webb et al., 2002, p. 96).

To a certain extent, the state’s symbolic power can be transformed into a symbolic violence that could ‘dispose people to make a connection between the divisions that apply in the animal ‘kingdom’, and the social divisions that apply in their own culture’ (Webb et al., 2002, p. 117). This symbolic violence enables the dominant classes to maintain privileged positions by making social divisions necessary and vital (Bourdieu, 1991). Take the school system as an example: in order to maintain its privileged status in a society, the dominating class adopt various methods to impede the less powerful classes’ access to social or educational resources. Webb et al. (2002, p. 113) claim that the ‘role of schools is to make students believe that the existing social relations are just and natural and in their interests’. The argument is that teachers from the dominating class act in ways favourable to students from similar social and family backgrounds. Their English language functions to reproduce the habitus of the dominating class(es) (Bourdieu, 1991)\textsuperscript{21}. Webb et al.

\textsuperscript{21}Figure 7.2 is a Chinese academic’s blog which introduces Bourdieu and his works.
(2002, p. 116) indicate that ‘language operates as a system of relations that helps reproduce these dominant and dominated positions and distinctions’. In order to manage academic disciplines, teachers have to master specific languages to deal with daily routines and operations in various contexts, like communicating to students and parents.

From the summary of the evidence presented in Table 7.7 it can be seen that the key issue of concern is the effectiveness of the PeP, particularly in how it supports OTTs. This issue reflects developments in NSW DET policy over nearly 20 years with regard to training OTTs to fulfil the requirements of the Australian education context.

This concern about support suggests that NSW DET might provide training programs that target the OTTs’ needs, as well as follow-up professional development. The NSW DET is the key agent for exercising this power through its administrative authority. More specifically, the qualification recognition process, the PEAT test and the PeP are forms of this power.

Figure 7.2
Bourdieu and his works

In this article, the writer explains who Bourdieu is and what his most important works are. The second sentence provided me with explanations of Bourdieu’s (1991) concepts of social networks and social capital. The author explains Bourdieu’s (1991) concepts of ‘habitus’ by using easy to read Chinese. This extended my understanding of ‘habitus’. This helped me to explore the deeper meaning of this concept, which I wanted to use in this specific scholarly context. Initially, I could not understand the connections between people’s ‘habitus’ and their social locations. This Chinese blog article explains that ‘habitus’ is a concept to explain people’s natural behaviours and the way of lives, but also continuously strengthens people’s social connections within ever-changing boundaries. Thus, ‘habitus’ plays a role in structuring and restructing people and their social boundaries.
Table 7.7
Issues and themes in interview evidence on support

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data sources</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rose</td>
<td>The PeP is helpful, but length is short, which is possibly not enough for relatively inexperienced OTTs</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna</td>
<td>The PeP is helpful, but seems not necessary for OTTs from a similar system.</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judy</td>
<td>The PeP is ‘degrading’ the OTTs by only focusing on training the OTTs to be Australian teachers.</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca</td>
<td>From NSW regional area, the PeP is helpful but information sharing with other participants is more important; high cost of taking the program</td>
<td>Professional and network support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>From NSW regional area, the PeP is helpful but information sharing with other participants are more important; high cost of taking the program</td>
<td>Professional and network support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen</td>
<td>The OTTs are responsible for managing the skills the PeP provided; the PeP is ‘retrograding’ the experienced OTTs.</td>
<td>Professional and network support</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overseas trained teachers who are not satisfied with the local education context tend to be considered as having deficits, such that ‘knowledge has become materialised on the basis of ethnic and national origins (Miller, 2008, p.23)’. Myles et al. (2006, p. 234) claim that ‘the skills that [overseas trained] candidates learn on the practicum are strongly influenced by what they bring to the experience, such as their assumptions, conceptions, beliefs, dispositions and capabilities’. With regard to the evidence from policy documents and interviews, it can be seen that the NSW PeP is designed to convert the OTTs who carry overseas teaching methodologies into the Australian education field. This process can be theorised as a legitimation struggle (Bourdieu, 1993) over educational knowledge between the policy makers and the OTTs in the Australian education field.

The OTTs’ education capital is modified as they receive legitimated knowledge from the policy makers, a modification which is ‘driven by policy reformers who take for granted the notions of evolution and progress, thus adopting a non-reflective stance on the historical contingency of change and resulting in an instrumental and
utilitarian view of education knowledge’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 220). Therefore, the mandatory PeP for OTTs sits in a dilemma between delivering information about the NSW education system and engaging in professional practice. Under this situation, Grenfell (2007) finds that ‘teachers are often caught in a space where “who” they are and “what” they are obliged to do in terms of the dominant discourse sometimes clashes’ (p. 235).

By means of different and sometimes contested reconversion strategies (Bourdieu, 1984) conducted by the PeP, OTTs consciously or unconsciously seek to protect or enhance their intellectual capital by positioning themselves within the structures and traditions associated with being ‘Australian teachers.’ Their original knowledge and economic capital are reconverted into new educational capital by means of taking part in the PeP to gain ‘approval to teach’ in NSW public schools. The success of these reconversion strategies depends on the changes the OTTs make to their sense of being ‘Australian teachers,’ and less so on any changes in the other direction. The volume and composition of their intellectual capital, as well as the role of different agencies, are key instruments for their production as ‘Australian teachers’. Through various and changing reconversion strategies, education authorities armed with the necessary power, privilege and framework use pre-employment policies and programs to identify which OTTs are worth being regarded as ‘Australian teachers’, and determining how ‘Australian teachers’ are viewed. Without the pre-employment policies and programs as ‘reconversion strategies’ for producing the distinguishing identity of ‘Australians teachers,’ there could not be a vision for forming ‘Australian teachers’. The OTTs’ employment strategies add new forms of social, multicultural, and economic capital to make a local advantage of current developments associated with the shortage or mismatch in skills in the teaching profession.

The analysis of evidence presented in this Chapter raises a number of concerns. For instance, education authorities conduct training that focuses on securing their interests in the legitimization struggles (Bourdieu, 1993) in the education field. However, in the process the OTTs’ knowledge, based on their prior experience, appears to be ignored, if not degraded. Just as Bourdieu (1984) argues, the market value of academic qualification will be devalued if consideration is not given to their cultural or social capital. In this sense, the experiences and qualifications of the
OTTs are only assessed by the ties with employment mechanisms. Therefore, qualifications can turn into various proofs but do not necessarily correspond exactly to their real value in the labour market. A challenge is to locate a balance in delivering NSW official education pedagogies and curriculums on the one hand, and paying attention to the needs and practical knowledge of the overseas trained teachers, on the other. Myles et al. (2006, p. 244) argue that a teacher preparation course ‘should not only take into account the writing of lesson plans, the development of instructional materials and the awareness of the use of language in the classroom, but it should also address the unique needs of these foreign-trained individuals’.

**7.5 CONCLUSION**

This Chapter first analysed evidence of the NSW educational authority’s commitment to recruiting quality teachers. This saw the introduction of the Professional English Assessment for Teachers (PEAT) to evaluate the English language proficiency of overseas trained teachers from countries where English is not the main language. The cost of the test and the preparation course is a reason why some NESB OTTs forgo the test. Teachers who have a wide range of educational knowledge and a variety of experiences working in schools beyond the classroom pass the test relatively easily. This suggests that the PEAT test is closely related to Australian teachers’ routine work. The historical texts from the NSW DET and its predecessor—NSW DSE relating to the PeP and its predecessor—OTTP for OTTs from 1991 to 2008, were analysed. Through analysing these documents in chronological order, three issues about key educational agencies and what responsibilities they undertake in both designing and conducting the PeP have been made evident. First, the PeP takes a major responsibility for a wide range of activities, and evaluations of its achievements indicate that positive changes have been made to the Program. Second, attempts to make constructive changes to the Program involve educational agencies and external organisations. Third, in relation to creating a quality PeP for OTTs, educational agencies cannot ignore the efforts that external agencies have been struggling with, but which are beyond the control of the PeP.
Chapter 8 provides an analysis of the sorts of support the OTTs use to help their professional development in the NSW education context.
CHAPTER EIGHT

FORMS OF SUPPORT FOR OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

I am glad to say that the very word ‘social’ has been expunged from our vocabulary. … No more social justice or social welfare or social policy or social problems or social services or social safety nets! No more social class! No more social engineering! As I have often said, there is no such thing as society. Only individual persona exist, and their freedom grows daily (Lukes, 1996, p. 213).

8.0 INTRODUCTION

There are many benefits that a society can provide to its citizens, such as justice, welfare, service and safety. Government policies can be regulated to ensure all these rights for citizens and also to solve social problems where they exist. For OTTs who are not citizens but permanent residents, they can obtain forms of government support, especially where it is related to their professional learning, which can help them easily integrate into the local education community. The OTTs’ self-confidence, competence and capacity to adapt can be considered part of this process. The most valuable thing that the education community can bring to these OTTs is not only welfare or justice, but also the professional support needed to help them find their way into the Australian teaching profession.

This Chapter analyses evidence of OTTs’ needs and the forms of support they receive from various channels. It has two aims. First, to better understand what OTTs need in order to progress or to renew their teaching careers in the Australian education system. Second, to investigate what are the sources of support the OTTs can access to meet their needs. The analysis of evidence reveals that the forms of support occur along four main lines. The first is authoritative information to navigate their way through the processes of immigration, registration and employment. The second focuses on professional support that OTTs can access from the NSW DET, schools and colleagues, to help them learn about the new education system and its culture. This includes considerations of mentoring policies and the professional development of OTTs. Third, there are the support networks that the OTTs access via
their peers, especially those in and from the homeland. These support networks provide access to the accumulated knowledge and intellectual resources inside and outside of Australia which bring benefits to Australian education. The fourth provides evidence of the self-adjustments the OTTs make to help themselves adjust to teaching methods and qualifications in the Australian education context. In relation to Chapters 6 and 7, which dealt with barriers, English proficiency testing and the pre-employment training programs, this Chapter analyses evidence of the adequacy of forms of support that help the OTTs to progress through various barriers and help convert themselves to meet the needs of Australian education. This Chapter starts by providing an analysis of the evidence of the overseas trained teachers’ needs, according to a NSW Teachers Federation (2003) report.

8.1 OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS’ NEEDS

There are problems in providing appropriate support for overseas trained teachers. The NSW Teachers Federation (2003b) argues that there are four issues which have to be addressed to assist OTTs in adjusting to the NSW public school system, and which require more attention from the NSW DET:

1. the need to support schools which are currently struggling to provide appropriate support for some overseas trained teachers who are currently working in our schools;
2. the need for a serious and systemic strategy to support teacher induction generally;
3. the need for there to be support for the school and the teachers involved in the suitability assessment program; and
4. the need for any such proposal to be accessible to all applicants who seek it and therefore remain fee free (p. 2).

Here the NSW Teachers Federation identifies its worries about OTTs as well as NSW public schools. The lack of appropriate professional support designed to improve teacher capabilities posed challenges for both, leading the:

Federation [to] lobby to ensure that teachers recruited from overseas have appropriate qualifications and an adequate induction program that includes an internship. This will prevent negative impacts on students, staff and the person appointed (NSW Teachers Federation, 2003a, p. 1).
Schools are aware of the importance of employing OTTs, but OTTs had difficulties in fitting into their new work environment. As the authority with the responsibility for public schools and OTTs, the NSW DET designs and conducts programs for both OTTs and the schools in which they are to work. In terms of gaining general support, 78.79% (n=104) of 132 OTTs surveyed in this research indicated that this support was adequate (see Figure 8.1).

In terms of induction programs, 53.79% (n=71) of the 132 NSW survey participants said that the assistance was adequate. The survey data also indicated that professional assistance for OTTs with placements was adequate (41.67%, n=55) and 79.55% (n=105) said that they receive adequate support for their professional learning. Moreover, support via an information service was also seen as adequate (77.27%, n=102) by 132 OTTs surveyed in NSW. From Figure 8.1, it can be seen that the survey respondents were generally satisfied with support for their professional learning, with information as well as general matters. However, the survey respondents were not very satisfied with the support connected to employment and the PeP.

Given difficulties that the particular OTTs in this study faced in the NSW education system (see Chapter 6), another survey question (see Question 20 in Appendix 1) helps us to better understand how the OTTs solved these difficulties. There were 107 OTTs out of 132 surveyees who provided their responses to this question (see Figure 8.2).
Figure 8.2 shows that when facing difficulties, 14.02% (n=15) did not have ideas on how to solve the problems. 20.56% (n=22) would seek support from others, including colleagues, families and friends. Combining the other three approaches, namely ‘continuing to work hard’, ‘keep going and trying’ and ‘seeking alternative teaching methods’, we find that more than half of the OTTs (65.42%, n=70 out of 107 survey respondents) sought solutions to their difficulties by themselves. For newly arrived OTTs, solving difficulties by themselves might not be a wise choice, as they might be stuck on some problems for a long time. This raises concerns about discussing what sorts of support may help the OTTs deal more efficiently with the difficulties. The next four sections analyse information support, professional support, peer support networks and self-adjustment of the OTTs using interview evidence.

8.2 INFORMATION SUPPORT FOR OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

Labour market and related information is very important for a worker who is a stranger in a new place. Tourists learn about attractions and glean directions about how to reach them, through brochures. Online tourist information and forums provide suggestions and recommendations to enable tourists to find the most appropriate and efficient route to explore scenic views. For immigrant workers with sufficient information, they too can easily accommodate themselves in a new country.
with few troubles. However, lack of specific, detailed labour market information will lead to wasting time on useless matters. In this section, some of the interviewees expressed their difficulties in understanding labour market information relating to immigration, teacher registration and employment policies in NSW.

Before migrating to Australia, Anna collected information about living and working in Australia. She realised that she had to register as an OTT with the NSW DET and that an approval number was needed before she could begin looking for a teaching position. Therefore, she prepared her certificates of teaching and degrees, ready to prove that she was a qualified and experienced OTT who could be registered to teach in NSW:

> Well when I got here I was just on the Internet a lot. I thought right, I’m going to find out. So I did everything via the Internet. I found out you have to order this pack. They send you this pack with information and you do part of it online and part of it by sending things off. All sorts of different bibs and bobs. Most of it I found out from online. So theoretically I should have done that and waited for the pack to be sent over to me. Now I am thinking about it, I really should have done that. But I did not realise that it would have taken quite as long as it did. So anyone that I speak to now that is thinking of coming over, I tell them all to do it first (Anna, 19 August 2008).

The Internet is important for OTTs to check registration policies before and after arriving in Australia. Anna learned from the Internet that the NSW DET would provide an information pack to guide OTTs through the registration process. The information pack indicated that OTTs who wanted to teach in NSW had to register online while also sending off, via the post, the paper work required for recognition of qualifications. Anna waited for the information pack at home so as to avoid unnecessary detours in the registration process. However, she suggested that OTTs preparing to come to Australia should complete the registration process before leaving their homeland, to avoid unexpected trouble and time delays.

Anna felt helpless when she was asked to register online about her preferred work locations, employment status and time. As an OTT, she was in a new, strange country and unsure about many of these matters. There was not enough information
to help her know what kinds of districts, schools and work options might suit her needs:

Most of the information I got from speaking to people about why they would need all of that rather than getting it from the website. I’m sure if you mine your way through all the different pages carefully then it would’ve been in some small print somewhere. But I didn’t come across it (Anna, 19 August 2008).

Interpretation of information is necessary to understanding it. Anna asked other OTTs or Australian friends for explanations. The information on the NSW DET website required more knowledge and interpretive skills than Anna had, to fully understand.

Paul came to Australia with a skilled worker’s visa that meant his qualification had been assessed and passed by the National Office of Overseas Skills Recognition (NOOSR) (see Chapter 6):

They assessed both my teaching qualification and my IT qualification. They wrote back and said my qualifications are applicable in Australia, I am good to teach. However, what I did not realise at the time was that there was an additional layer of State assessment. You may have heard this before (Paul, 6 June 2008).

Passing the national skills assessment does not mean an OTT is qualified to teach at the State level. The double layers of government and the lack of specific explanations about the different registration and employment processes at the Federal Department of Immigration and Citizenship and the NSW DET can be a shock. This jeopardised Paul’s employment as a teacher in Australia.

Anita did not successfully pass the NSW qualification recognition process to become a primary teacher, even though she had two Masters degrees in primary education. In order to work as a teacher in an early childhood centre school, Anita took part in a teaching course and gained a certificate. However, Anita still had difficulties in finding proper teaching jobs. Anita considered that there was not enough authoritative employment information to support and answer her needs:
I am in a black hole basically. I have tried a few places but I cannot get [a position]. That is why the reason I survive from this one [current work]. I make that a chance to speak with someone so that I can get introduction with someone in the child development department or somewhere. Basically what I want now is to enrol in a university for childcare (Anita, 10 August 2008).

Anita’s Australian childcare certificate did not let her get a relatively stable teaching position but only a job as a childcare assistant. She described her employment-seeking process as a ‘black hole’. Anita has spent much money doing various training programs to gain a childcare certificate but this did not help her much in securing employment as a teacher. She had to collect information from various channels, but no one could provide her an authoritative answer until she learnt from the childcare department that a university teaching degree in early childhood might help her to become a childcare teacher. To help Anita find an appropriate university that could provide an early childhood education degree and thus a path to better employment, I sent her relevant information.

Some OTTs find difficulty in obtaining adequate information with regard to their registration and employment. Therefore, it seems desirable for NSW education authorities to advertise their information, policies and regulations through various channels that the OTTs can access. The Internet is an efficient channel as information can be quickly updated and provide timely access. The researcher has observed that since 2006 the NSW DET website, as the most authoritative source of information about that education system, has improved the information it provides compared to when this research started. The next section discusses potential professional support for the OTTs.

8.3 PROFESSIONAL SUPPORT FOR OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

The PEAT preparation course and the Pre-employment Program can be taken as forms of professional support that the NSW DET provides to OTTs (see Chapter 7). However, some of the OTTs found that because they were treated as experienced teachers in schools, they could not gain enough professional support for their adjustment to local schools.
Vanessa has a sister who is an Australian-trained education graduate. She believes that there are no significant differences between the treatment of Australian-trained teachers and OTTs with respect to the NSW teachers’ registration and employment process. Vanessa ascertained this after comparing her story with her sister’s. However, she found one very important difference. The professional support the Australian-trained teachers receive seems to be greater:

When I looked at all of the [education systems] whether you are in the Catholic system or the public system, I just found that I did not get any mentoring or any kind of input from the Catholics for doing it. My sister was doing it with the DET at the same time. Being a ‘targeted graduate’ she was given a lot of formal time to get on with it. She was sent on various things to do it. Other first year teachers in my school were given all those opportunities but they didn’t see. Because I was also part-time they didn’t include me in that whole process. So, at the end of the year I was no further in doing it because no one had helped. I just didn’t have the mentoring (Vanessa, 13 July 2008).

Given the uncertainty and debates surrounding key concepts, Peeler and Jane (2005, p. 326) define mentorship as ‘the “ongoing supportive relationship” that may develop in both informal and formal arrangements’. Different education systems provide different forms of professional support for OTTs working in casual positions. Vanessa had not received any kind of mentorship to help her solve problems and difficulties. However, on the other hand, her Australian-trained sister, who was a ‘beginning teacher’ (Singh, 2007) had access to various professional services to help her deal with a range of problems in her teaching. Vanessa’s part-time employment status worked against her getting the same support as her sister. She felt disappointed because no one was helping her:

So it assumes you have come into teaching to be a classroom teacher at the very beginning rather than assuming that you might come in from overseas or interstate and have 20 years experience teaching, when you are actually going into a non-classroom role, but still playing a role as a teacher, as an educator (Vanessa, 13 July 2008).

One reason some OTTs may not receive professional support is that it is assumed they have enough classroom teaching experience, and so they are not able to access the mentoring provided to beginning teachers. However, Vanessa was classified as a new teacher because she came from overseas. Moreover, she knew very little about
the NSW teaching environment, even though she did the PeP and had many years of overseas teaching experience. On the one hand, NSW DET asks for OTTs to start over in Australia to gain local teaching experience, and on the other hand, it is supposed that OTTs can deal with teaching problems by themselves using their previous overseas work experience without any formal mentoring. How OTTs can take advantage of their teaching experience while also being supported as teachers needing to adjust to the local teaching context, is a challenge. Vanessa was very satisfied with her current school as it was: ‘very good at seeing me as an expert in my field, acknowledging me and my experience, giving me freedom’ (Vanessa, 13 July 2008). Investigating and knowing the advantages OTTs bring is very important for both local schools and the overseas teachers themselves.

A different kind of response to professional support was provided by Alka, who was from Fiji and had received an English language education from primary school. She was employed in various teaching and administrative positions in Fiji, passed PEAT in one attempt, and gained a permanent teaching position in a short time. Alka is an OTT with enough competence to deal with the difficulties in her teaching and daily life. Alka was satisfied with the support she received from her principal and colleagues, and was confident in dealing with various difficulties. She commented positively on her professional support:

The support that I have been given at the school here, the school as a whole, and the principal, you would not believe it since 2001. If my own children are sick, when they can they let me go home early. I have got that kind of support, from my first one year. All these things, they mean so much to me. They know you do not have any family here. My head teacher, always made me feel like I am good, like I can do it. Now there are days where students in her class are causing trouble, she sends them to me. When I am free, if I can I keep them (Alka, 2 July 2008).

Professional support from the school builds a teacher’s contentment. For Alka it was more than she had expected; so much of it was unexpected. The Principal and her colleagues were so supportive when Alka was a newly arrived OTT in the school. This support meant she could take care of her family and work through the challenges of the early migrant settlement stage. The professional support provided her with Australian teaching skills, but more importantly, encouraged her to feel that
she can do things equally as well as Australian-trained teachers. This professional support was necessary, and it greatly inspired Alka to be confident, and enhanced her professional learning, and became a form of mutual support among her colleagues and herself. Alka expressed the view that:

They [overseas trained teachers] are the people who complain that we need support. I will get support when I need support. Because you are [teachers], it is your responsibility as a teacher. You should be able to do what your responsibility calls for (Alka, 2 July 2008).

OTTs do not just wait for professional support but work to improve their own teaching competences and to get used to the new education system and community. The professional support of an outside assistant tool cannot resolve all the difficulties, especially if teachers refuse to develop themselves inside. Alka considered it was unfair to other teachers if OTTs claimed that they should have easier classes to teach in the first two years of teaching in Australia:

Because all the teachers do get difficulties. That frustration that I go through with some students, the other teachers in my faculty they have their frustrations, not just us. So they deal with the same issues. So it is unfair to say you get easier classes. Like it is the same as you go working in somewhere and you just want the light duty. Some people who are good masters, very well educated but they are not for in this system. They work in a factory (Alka, 2 July 2008).

Many of the difficulties facing OTTs and Australian-trained teachers are similar. Both have different difficulties in some areas, but some difficulties are less for the local teachers. Therefore OTTs, as teachers first, have to deal with these problems to show that they are capable to teach in Australia. The lack of local teaching experience could not be an excuse to claim an easier job. OTTs have to earn respect through hard work and teaching competence. Alka considered that it was not practical for OTTs to expect employers to accommodate them. On the contrary, OTTs should take the initiative to get used to the environment where they are now working. Professional support should be established on the basis of what the OTTs need, not what they want.
Medlyn had never worked in the NSW public school system. She had a different view on professional support:

Support is a big one from [OTTs’ perspective]. I do not know where you get the support from but just to know that there is support, that there will be, you know. You are not going to have parents or students who are giving you a headache. Besides the work load that you have during the day. So I think that is a big one. I do not know how else to attract people (Medlyn, 18 August 2008).

Professional support is very important for OTTs, and needs to be provided in various forms. It might involve mentors, where teachers sit together at a certain time to discuss matters of concern. It could take the form of incoming OTTs having backup, a person ready to help when they are facing difficulties. With regard to the amount of professional support, Medlyn said:

It just depends on the school you are at. The first school that I went to, they knew I was a new teacher and there was a lot of help offered. I had a really good co-ordinator so I felt that if there was any help I needed it was there for me in NSW. I think now that I have been teaching for a couple of years I do not kind of think the same support is necessary. I guess if I wanted it I would ask for it (Medlyn, 18 August 2008).

It might be assumed that schools the OTTs work in provide the requisite professional support. Medlyn’s first school provided enough support to help her get used to its educational environment. The mentors took her as a new teacher and offered much help in order to meet her teaching needs. This support assisted Medlyn to become a successful teacher with the confidence to deal with various difficulties after she moved to Western Australia. Thus, this professional support not only met this OTTs’ initial needs but also benefited her teaching career. The needs of OTTs were raised by various interviewees. For instance, Anita gave up during the school practicum because her supervisor did not take responsibility for helping her prepare the lessons, made her feel uncomfortable and was discouraging:

she was supposed to help me in making the [lessons], because I did not know the system here, like how do we teach, how do we make the things and so. But she said it is not the right kind of job for me, she said I cannot teach high school students she was very rude to me, so I gave up (Anita, 10 August 2008).
The supervisor of OTTs’ school practicums are supposed to help them learn about the NSW schooling system and teaching strategies through real teaching practices, and to see whether they could adjust to their new teaching environment. Both the OTTs and the supervisors know that the former have much to learn about this new education system. Therefore, supportive supervisors can help OTTs to become familiar with the system, and also enhance their confidence in engaging the system.

Chinmayi failed her school practicum as she was unable to control the students, although her supervisor agreed that she had knowledge that could contribute to NSW school students. Chinmayi did not know what to do to manage the students’ behaviours. Her experience in Sri Lanka was that students would sit quietly and listen to teachers carefully in classes. She was not aware that student behaviour management would take such a large proportion of time in Australian classes:

They [the school and the Principal] did not give me a chance. When they say, if you are not successful at your school practical assessment, they say they are [not going to employ me]. There is another bridging course, but I did not refer to that (Chinmayi, 25 June 2008).

The school and its Principal did not give Chinmayi a second chance to do the practicum after she failed the first time. Therefore, Chinmayi could not register with the NSW DET, as she had not completed the PeP. Sophie used to work with NSW DET and the ACT Education Department. She understood the importance of professional support for OTTs:

I had a helpful person within NSW who invited me along to the professional development that was going on for learner assistance teachers. That was useful because that brought me up to speed with things like how they do assessment here and that type of thing. This was very useful (Sophie, 12 August 2008).

Good professional assistance is a great help for OTTs, enabling them to get used to the work environment in a short time. Sophie learnt how to assess Australian students from a professional mentor in her school. Compared with Anita and Chinmayi’s unsuccessful and depressing experiences, Rebecca’s story shows the bright side of professional support. Of course, as an OTT, her path was not smooth, but it shows how an OTT can survive in the Australian education context with
appropriate and adequate professional support. The PeP course helped Rebecca after first finishing the registration process.

Once I got down there [Blacktown] and actually did the courses there. It was very good. I actually told him [a DET officer] that it gave me an overview of what the curriculum was about. It then gave me an idea of what Australian teaching would be about. It pointed me in the right direction. … Then, of course, I had to do the 2 weeks in a school. That was my first real introduction with working with Australian children. Then obviously once I was approved to start teaching, I had my first casual day (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

The induction program was very helpful for giving OTTs a preliminary sense of what Australian school education and curriculum are like. The school practicum provided Rebecca with a chance to meet and work with Australian school children as well as learning school routines. Rebecca then gained a teaching position in a school after getting her official ‘teaching approval’. However, the shock of awful student behaviour almost sent her home:

I had one of them at a high school, where my first experience was actually with a class. I had never experienced that in my life before. That was the class that walked out on me. Then I went off to another school. I had another day, which was also with a child that literally crawled up the walls. They were supposed to have withdrawn that child from the class because they do not normally expose that child to the casual teacher. I actually got home and I said to my husband, ‘That’s it! I am not staying in Australia. I am going home. Put me on the plane right now or you are divorced’. I went home (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

OTTs can be expected to have difficulties in dealing with inappropriate student behaviours, due to inexperience in having to deal with this in their prior teaching. There is professional support, and there are strategies to assist them to get used to the realities of the Australian teaching environment. Rebecca then compared differences in the professional support she received from her current school with that of her previous school, where she worked as a casual teacher:

I was with a very good teacher. He was [one of the] Assistant Principals. Obviously when you are co-teaching with someone who is a very good practitioner, you pick up different sorts of odds and ends. I did. It went exceptionally well. I had no problem with that at all. I have felt very comfortable at my school. They have been very supportive. The staffs
here are wonderful. My casual days were in schools where I actually knew nobody (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

A cooperative and mutually supportive teaching environment is of benefit to OTTs. Rebecca’s overseas teaching experiences were valued by her colleagues. Her mentor was willing to help her solve different problems in the school. This collegial support inspired Rebecca to be confident in her teaching in Australia and helped her to better understand the nature and value of the professional support that OTTs can depend on, and the support they can provide each other:

there are other teachers at the school but you know something it actually gets to a point as well, they also have their own problems. They also have a lot that they have got on their plate. They actually do not have the time to sit around and support people (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Rebecca expected DET to provide professional support to help the OTTs get used to the NSW schooling system. However, she also recognised that the local Australian teachers have their own problems and so cannot help all the time. The pressures of work are such that ‘to keep pace leaves little time for longer serving staff to inform newcomers of educational histories and the continuing trajectories of change’ (Peeler & Jane, 2005, p. 329). Therefore, support for OTTs helping each other to find solutions to their problems might be useful, along with the professional support of mentors.

How much professional support would be adequate to help the OTTs to get used to the NSW education system? Rose, a former senior teacher and school administrator said:

I am not saying it had to take 6 months or even a year, you know. It just needed to be a bit more interaction over a period of time. Instead of all I got was that 3 days, then into school, back for my interview and then I was done. I left. There’s no follow up. No, ‘How are you getting on?’ No real interest in terms of getting you employed and so on so forth (Rose, 19 August 2008).

The PeP did not provide enough time for the OTTs to learn about the NSW education system. The school practicum lasted only for two weeks. Follow-up
professional support could be an efficient way of focusing on the workplace needs of OTTs. Karen held a similar view to Rose on the value of the professional support:

The whole system is very good. I have to show initiative myself. I have to decide what it is that. If I need help I go and look for it and find it. That's an important skill about being a teacher as well, not just relying on other people to do it for you (Karen, 16 June 2008).

The mentorship system is very useful. However, it is also important for OTTs to find answers for themselves. One of the basic skills of a teacher is to have the independence and competence to solve the difficulties of teaching. The initial professional support of the PeP was not designed to address their every need. Further, professional support was needed then in areas where the OTTs most needed it. Karen described the professional support as being like helping with ‘children in your class that are having difficulty’ (Karen, 16 June 2008). The teachers point out the right directions for the children to find the answers, but do not work out the problems for the children:

So the schools where I have worked, they have had very good systems in place in terms of inductions, mentors and approaches to professional learning. These allowed the school to respond to the needs of the school as a whole as well as the needs of individuals (Karen, 16 June 2008).

School may provide point-to-point support which meets OTTs’ needs. The PeP was helpful in letting OTTs know about general school discipline and regulations, but follow-up professional support may also be necessary to match individual OTTs’ needs. Besides information support and on-going support for the OTTs, another form of support for OTTs—peer support networks—which are discussed in the next section may raise attention for the stakeholders.

8.4 OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS’ PEER SUPPORT NETWORKS

For some OTTs, coming from different cultural and educational contexts, their needs for information and professional support cannot be fully met by NSW DET officials. Some of the OTTs find other sources of support to help them get used to the system. These are support networks made up of OTTs. Some of the OTTs find it difficult to
communicate with their Australian colleagues, as their issues and concerns are not the same. The OTTs always have to explain something about their former educational activities, while trying to learn more about Australia’s educational culture. Communicating with Australian colleagues can lead to blank moments. Given this situation, some OTTs mentioned that their friends’ advice in their home countries is particularly useful, as they do not have to spend as much time explaining things that can be taken for granted. This makes the conversation more understandable and easier. Anna, who benefited from her colleague’s support in this way, said:

One of the main people I speak to on these issues is one of my old teaching friends who is the ICT co-ordinator at the school I used to work at in the UK. We used to do a lot with all the new ICT. We had the interactive white boards for a couple of years before I came out here. She was very good at getting into all the new things. Because I was the youngest member of staff there, I would be very keen to try everything out with her. So it is another one of those things we are trying out really, just not in the same work setting I suppose (Anna, 19 August 2008).

The OTTs’ support network can be composed either of their friends or colleagues in Australia or it can draw on colleagues in their home countries. Anna developed her ICT teaching skills here in Australia through communicating with one of her colleagues in the UK by phone or other ICT tools. She discussed advanced ICT skills with her colleague and brought these skills to her Australian work environment. Anna found it tough to communicate with her Australian colleagues concerning certain cultural and educational issues. Rebecca was very lucky to have a sister in Australia who could help her better understand Australian education, curriculum and materials:

She has been a great help in terms of policy documents, pointing me in the right direction of reading whatever had to be done. From a government point of view, the first thing that obviously happened was we had that overseas trained teacher’s course that I had to do prior to actually going (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Rebecca’s sister helped her to fill in the gap between what she understood about the registration and employment policies of OTTs and Australian interpretations of these policies. OTTs are likely to misunderstand the contextually grounded meanings of
such policies, as they are not familiar with the Australian educational culture. It was necessary for someone to explain the policies in terms of local experiences and interpretations. With her family support network, Rebecca was well advised on how to navigate and thus avoid unnecessary detours in the labour registration process.

Besides getting support from friends in their home countries and family members in Australia, OTTs who did not have such sources of support, organised cooperative networks among OTTs to assist each through their difficulties. The interview evidence shows that several OTTs from different backgrounds had such networks, which played an important role in providing support, information and a safe environment for sharing their experiences of teaching in Australian. Alka said that some Fijian teachers, who came to Australia seven years before her and who had permanent teaching positions, helped her to understand what it means to be a teacher in Australia:

> You cannot practise what you practise in your country. You would not see it, because students do not want to be… they try your authority in a friendly manner. I am in control. You need to do the [right things]. It just does not come like that. It comes with experience (Alka, 2 July 2008).

The adequacy of overseas teaching experience gives some OTTs an advantage. However, thinking that one’s overseas teaching experience is all that is needed to teach in Australia is wrong, and leads to inefficiency. In Fiji, teachers may not be worried about classroom control, as the teachers there have full authority. Initially Alka tried to adopt her Fijian practices in an Australian class, but these failed. She quickly learnt how to use different but other effective ways to deal with misbehaving Australian students from her Fijian teacher support network. She pointed out that the classroom control methods they taught her were not related to their Fijian experiences but to their Australian teaching experiences.

Alka’s colleagues also provided her with suggestions about student behaviour management, but it came from their Australian experiences, while also knowing what it is like in an overseas country. The evidence shows that the OTTs need such collegial circles or networks to provide professional support from experienced migrant teachers from similar educational cultures. Judy developed a teacher network
when she was a teacher in an American school in Sydney. She kept the network of teachers even after the school closed. She described her group as a support network where the teachers could share their positive or negative experiences of Australian education:

Our group has currently expanded from an American group to just a migrant group. We’ve got people from the UK, from Ireland. We have got some people that are currently moved here from Bangladesh. We get together. It is like a migrant group trying to support each other in the midst of a culture that is not very welcoming to migrants (Judy, 17 August 2008).

Judy proudly said that her network was not a group which was only composed of teachers from the United States but included other OTTs from all over the world. She implied that Australia’s education culture did not favour migrants, an issue discussed with her group members. Judy’s support circle provides an opportunity for OTTs to share their Australian experiences. It shows the OTTs’ cooperative spirit in a situation where there is a shortage of labour market information and professional support. While different from the NSW DET’s OTT support procedures, their multi-ethnic support group is vibrant and helpful for the OTTs. Peeler and Jane (2005, p. 327) indicate that the ‘mentoring process is enhanced by informal rather than formal mentoring arrangements’.

The above three sections have discussed forms of support that might be provided to help OTTs to engage the NSW education system more comfortably. These forms of support range from providing exact registration and employment information to the OTTs through various channels, to providing on-going professional support to establish peer support networks. It is hard to decide which forms of support would be the most appropriate and efficient for OTTs. Further, it would be arbitrary to say which form of support is inefficient, due to the different contexts where the OTTs live and work. The contexts may cause individualised responses from the interviewees. When facing problems, the OTTs can either choose to seek help from people around them or solve the problems by themselves. The next section will discuss how the OTTs adjust their teaching methods and qualifications to fit into the NSW education system.
8.5 MAKING SELF-ADJUSTMENTS TO TEACHING METHODS AND QUALIFICATIONS

There are gaps between the OTTs’ expectations and the practical situations in which they find themselves. Either the OTTs choose to remain what they are or take the initiative to negotiate their way into the current environment. This section focuses on analysing evidence of the differences between the OTTs’ experiences within and outside of Australia, and how they deal with the Australian students by adjusting to Australian teaching methods. This raises the question of whether multicultural education means that OTTs stick to their original teaching methods in order to show their individual colour on a mosaic wall. Alternatively, do the OTTs from various countries better serve the system by drawing on their overseas experiences, which most Australian teachers do not have. This part is linked to Chapter 6, because not only does it show the difficulties that the OTTs face, but also how they adjust to overcome the gaps.

8.5.1 Adjusting teaching methods

This section discusses OTTs’ capabilities for critical self-reflection as a professional support mechanism to get involved in the Australian education system. Vallika, an Indian teacher who came to Australia more than ten years ago, successfully gained a permanent teaching position. She claimed that OTTs need to be aware that they are now in a multicultural education context. The OTTs have to make some adjustments to get used to the local education culture in order to be more acceptable to Australian students:

You feel the different culture, and adjust to the different culture. I’ve seen someone in this school here from a migrant background take a class and the tone that the person spoke: “get into 2 lines. You go and sit here”. You know a softer tone was needed. The students who will not cope [with the tougher tone]. They [the students] lost respect [for the teacher] as soon as they think you can’t deal with it (Vallika, 12 March 2008).

Vallika said that OTTs had to realise they were in a different education culture with different educational values. It was hard for OTTs to be accepted by students and their colleagues if they refused to change to fit into the Australian social and
educational context. Alka thought her background made her difficulties of transition easier in a multicultural family in Fiji; she explained:

I may have a student who is good and then misbehaves in one lesson. Why? What is that? So I try and find out their background because it helps you to understand more. If you teach, you do take on responsibilities. When my head teacher was not here from end 2003 and whole of 2004 I was the head teacher. So it’s all that exposure too, it gives you more confidence (Alka, 2 July 2008).

Alka’s family is not a traditional immigrant family. Her mother is a Hindu while her father was a Christian. So Alka had experience of both these cultures, and she could understand the conflict between both, and also their positive elements. She and other family members shared similar feelings:

In Fiji, you have a classroom control. The work is there, whatever you prepare. Of course you will have 100% of students listening to you. You don’t have to worry about the students do whatever you want to do … they are seated and pay attention (Alka, 2 July 2008).

Alka use to teach in circumstances where she could fully control her class. She built her authority as a teacher in the classroom and this made her more confident as a teacher. But here in Australia, she found that she had less control in the classroom. She had ability in and experience of controlling a class, and did so with ease. But the different teaching environment in Australia made it hard for her to apply this experiential knowledge in this new education environment. Another teacher, from India, Anita, felt the same as Alka and had similar Australian classroom experiences in Australian classrooms:

Of course they were big because it was Year 10. They were big. They were not good. I did not have experience with these types of children. In India the children are not of this kind. They listen to the teacher. They respect the teacher very much. They [Australian students] were throwing papers, chairs here and there. It was so rude. I did not like it (Anita, 10 August 2008).

Anita failed at the school practicum stage in her teaching assessment as she could not get used to the Australian students’ behaviours, which were totally different from those of students in India. Anita found that Australian students were not likely to
follow the teachers’ instructions and showed less respect than Indian students. Anita was disappointed with the rude behaviour of Australian students and found no solution to deal with these difficulties. Comparing Australian and other education contexts, Veronika, who was trained in both Russia and Australia and taught in Australia for many years said:

For the last 16 years, Russia has had some changes so I do not know anything about Russian educational system right now. But prior to that, it was slight difference in terms of discipline. There were lots of expectations from the students. The role of the teacher was just an idol, compared to Australia. The relationship between student and teacher is more like a partnership and friendship (Veronika, 27 May 2008).

Veronika is not up to date with the current Russian educational context as she left that country sixteen years ago. However, from her previous experience, she said Russian education paid more attention to discipline. The teachers were a model in various aspects to their students, which meant they had absolute authority over their students. However, she found the relationship between teachers and students in Australia to be more like friends who played in the same pool. The Russian teachers had authority in terms of both discipline and knowledge, and they could use discipline to control their students’ behaviour in the classroom, and to make sure the classroom rules and the teacher were respected. When asked whether she had changed herself to suit the Australian education context, Veronika said:

My subject is not common in Australia, so what I’m going to do? Even if I would like to do teaching, I have to readjust somehow. So, either I’m undertaking additional course and upgrade my knowledge or either I’m slowly moving out of teaching (Veronika, 27 May 2008).

Being trained in a completely different education context and a rarity among language teachers in Australia, Veronika fully understood the importance of developing herself to get used to the new teaching environment. Her unique language skills would not guarantee life long teaching employment if she did not continuously develop her knowledge and teaching capabilities. Sometimes the educational and social circumstances would enhance a teacher’s enthusiasm. For some teachers, if the students cooperated with them, they could enjoy their teaching even in complicated situations. Rebecca indicated this:
I taught in two different types of areas in South Africa. The first one that I taught in was in a very multicultural school in Johannesburg. It was totally mixed in terms of everything, from race groups right through to different religious groups. I had classes of about 42-45 children and the discipline in the school was wonderful. The kids I was teaching could not speak a word of English. They would do their spelling. They would try hard. There was this whole ethos of really wanting to improve themselves (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Rebecca said that she could deal with the complicated multicultural education situation when she was teaching in South Africa. She enjoyed the teaching there because the students would willingly cooperate with her. The students had a strong eagerness to learn and knew why they were learning. Their families were fully supportive of the teachers. Given the high unemployment rate in South Africa, the children there really knew that if they did not study and work hard at school they were not going to get anywhere in their life. Rebecca indicated that the hard work and spirit of the students in South Africa actually encouraged her to try to help them even more. Compared with her experiences in South Africa, Rebecca experienced a cultural shock when she came to Australia, where teaching/classroom experience was not as good as she expected:

What I found was such a culture shock in coming to Australia, is that the kids over here, you do obviously have some children that have good parental support at home but to be honest with you, a lot of the parents actually do not give a damn, not in the area where we are. When I got here and started teaching properly I almost wore myself to the bone trying to really push children. I had a very high level of expectation in terms of the work that I expected them to achieve. In the end I actually realised that I was running into a brick wall, to the extent that I was going to drive myself out of teaching if it carried on like that any longer (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

Rebecca indicated that some of the parents in this rural Australian town did not take the responsibility to encourage the students to study. At the beginning of teaching in Australia, Rebecca tried to use the teaching strategies which she used in South Africa to inspire her students to learn. She held to a relatively high standard of achievement, which she expected from her Australian students. However, before long, she found the situation was not as she had expected. In Rebecca’s view, the goals she set for the Australian students are not too high. She felt deeply frustrated
about the situation and confused as to why the students in a school with much better teaching resources and financial support, had much lower ambitions to develop themselves. Rebecca even considered quitting teaching if this situation could not be improved.

I said to myself I have to put myself first and must concentrate on those kids that actually want to achieve. In that class I can honestly tell you that there were 5 children that really want to learn in a class of about 33 children. It is not a priority for them to be there. I always said I would never let myself fall into the trap of just saying, ‘oh, well, just get on with it’. But I’m finding I’m having to in order to actually get through the day (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).

As an ambitious teacher who wanted to put all her students on the right track, Rebecca felt miserable that no more than one sixth of the students in her class really wanted to learn. Rebecca also felt exhausted from spending a long time to organise the order of her classes everyday. She thought the Australian students had good educational resources, but most did not value the chance to get a decent education. The main difficulty for Rebecca’s Australian teaching career was that it was hard to find students who really wanted to learn. It was hard for Rebecca to understand why she had to pay much more attention to organising and managing her Australian students than to teaching them. In her view, this was a waste of her teaching time; students should perform well in the classroom. It seems that Australian students in this rural town need their teachers to prompt them to follow their teachers’ instructions. The confusion this brought made Rebecca review her approaches to teaching. She adjusted her teaching expectations to the Australian teaching situation and the needs of her Australian students in this rural town:

I always try to do the best that I possibly can but I’ve found that I’ve had to lower some of my standards. First of all, I am teaching Stage 3 with some of my classes. I’m teaching a whole Stage below the so-called accepted government curriculum level because that’s actually what they’re achieving; I’m finding that the level in comparison to South Africa is actually much lower. I mean the school really does try. It’s been a big adjustment from a teaching point of view, I haven’t really changed too much of my actual teaching strategies or my philosophies as such. In South Africa I was one of the first teachers that was fully education trained and a lot of what I was taught to do. I apply very much the quality teaching framework across all of my teaching. (Rebecca, 11 August 2008).
Rebecca found her teaching approaches sometimes were not suited to Australian students. She also learnt from her Australian teaching experiences and tried to adjust to suit the Australian education context. Her reflections about her teaching were important to finding out what the Australian students in remote areas actually need in the process of their learning, ‘I work the kids and they sometimes almost hate me for it, but I’m actually starting to get results out of the children I am teaching’ (Rebecca, 11 August 2008). She tried to keep those practices and ideas which she found advantageous and change those which were not suitable for Australian students. Rather than being too authoritarian she used other forms of teaching, to which the Australian students responded well. With renewed effort, she found the joy of teaching as her students began to accept her teaching approaches and progressively improved.

8.5.2 Adjusting qualifications

Faced with barriers to the acceptance of their overseas qualifications and previous employment records (see Section 6.2), some OTTs choose to gain local qualifications in order to gain employment as teachers. This strategy could play an effective function in helping OTTs obtain local experience and positions of employment.

Vanessa did not feel that the NSW DET treated the newly arrived OTTs in the same way as local beginning teachers and in particular, in not providing appropriate professional support. However, she did not bother with this issue, as she gained a local teaching qualification to enter teaching more smoothly:

I started my Masters at the same time. I just thought I cannot cope with everything and doing that as well. So that put me off when I had to weigh up whether to stay in the school system or go into the private sector. That was one of the factors I considered, which might be short sighted because ultimately I might well want to go back into the school sector (Vanessa, 13 July 2008).

The employment barriers made Vanessa chose to do a Masters degree at an Australian university. She saw that her sister, who was trained in Australia, gained
more advantages in professional support and employment than she did as an OTT. She expressed her willingness to continue in the teaching profession in Australia, after gaining a local teaching degree. After being rejected by many early childhood schools for having mismatched qualifications, Anita decided to enrol in either a diploma course or a university degree to gain a local teaching qualification.

Because that head teacher told us that there is no harm in enrolling now if you get a place in the university. Because of what happened, basically we are wasting time, so if we have to spend some time in getting a local qualification we will do it (Anita, 10 August 2008).

Anita felt that she had wasted much time in finding a proper teaching position in NSW, due to a lack of information. The Certificate IV she completed could only qualify her to work as a teacher’s assistant in an early childhood centre. With the expectation of being a teacher in primary or early childhood school, Anita considered that a local university degree might make sure that she was qualified to find a long term teaching position.

In the above sections, the researcher has discussed forms of support provided to OTTs. They are information support, professional support, OTTs’ peer support networks and OTTs’ self adjustment in qualifications and teaching methods. The following Figure 8.3 may help to better explain which parties provide the most valuable support to OTTs. Within 78 valid responses, 39.74% (n=31) of survey respondents considered fellow teachers including school Principals, Head Teachers and mentors, to provide the most valuable support to them, while 32.05% (n=25) considered they were getting the most valuable support from family members and friends’ networks. It can be seen that educational authorities, such as NSW DET, did not win too many votes for providing valuable support to OTTs (12.82%, n=10): 15.38% (n=12) of 78 valid responses expressed thoughts that no one provided valuable support for them and they had to do this on their own.
Figure 8.3
Who gives the most valuable support to OTTs?

Figure 8.3 provides insights that effective professional support from peer teachers or teacher networks as a kind of mentorship might be the most important approach for supporting OTTs. It reflects that simply providing training programs to OTTs will not necessarily mean that they can develop themselves in practical school teaching in Australia. Thus, it is important to establish a comprehensive ongoing teachers’ support network, whether it is made of Australian peer colleagues or teachers from the homeland. In addition, Santoro (2007) argues that:

it is vital that school communities are genuinely committed to supporting them [OTTs] and understand it as the responsibility of the entire school community and not only the concerns of a few individuals and the teachers themselves (p. 92).

The professional development of OTTs may depend not on one single party, but on cooperation from multiple parties.

8.6 DISCUSSION

OTTs migrate to Australia as skilled workers with expectations of job opportunities. Confronting barriers to do with registration, employment, language, professional retraining and the lack of professional support is a challenge. These barriers are part of the portrait of the experiences of the OTTs who participated in this study. Table 8.1 provides a summary of evidence relating to various support issues for OTTs. This does not happen only in Australia, but also in other countries which are recruiting
OTTs. In similar research conducted among OTTs in the UK, Miller et al. (2008) report that, before going to the UK, the participating OTTs lacked knowledge of ‘qualified teachers’ status (QTS), which is a British qualification recognition system for the OTTs. Given that OTTs have many years of overseas teaching experience but are new to the Australian education field, it is difficult for them to re-locate their professional identities. Hence, it is hard to decide which forms of support might be delivered to them. Peeler and Jane (2005) argue that a ‘lack of guidance causes newcomers to suffer a sense of hopelessness and non-acceptance, and their attitude becomes one of “Why bother”’ (p. 329).

Table 8.1
Support issues for OTTs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewees</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW Teachers Federation</td>
<td>Overseas trained teachers’ needs</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna</td>
<td>Problems in understanding policies.</td>
<td>Lacking information support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>Problems in understanding policies.</td>
<td>Lacking information support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anita</td>
<td>Problems in understanding policies. The mentor did not help in the practicum</td>
<td>Lacking information support and professional support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinmayi</td>
<td>The mentor did not help in the practicum</td>
<td>Lacking professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca</td>
<td>Good experiences of professional support. Casual position will be causing difficulties to OTTs</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose</td>
<td>Professional support might depend on individual teacher’s capability.</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>Good experiences of professional support</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen</td>
<td>Professional support might depend on individual teacher’s capability.</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medlyn</td>
<td>Importance of professional support. The amount of professional support might depend on schools</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanessa</td>
<td>Lacking mentorship. Assuming the OTTs have enough experiences to deal with local classes</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alka</td>
<td>Colleagues are helpful in many issues Knowledge and understanding of support available Fijian teachers support network</td>
<td>Professional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judy</td>
<td>Establishing global OTTs support network</td>
<td>Support network</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some OTTs in this study chose to quit the teaching profession in helpless desperation, due to a lack of on-going support. However, according to the interview evidence, providing a series of on-going professional supports is desirable and seems feasible. For instance, mentorship offers ‘a means of bridging the gap between the newcomers’ former ways of knowing and current practice, thereby mobilising their capacity to operate effectively as a teacher in their new contexts and develop a positive professional identity’ (Peeler & Jane, 2005, p. 325).

Santoro (2007, p. 92) argues that ‘effective professional development and mentoring programs for teachers of difference may support their retention in Australian schools’. It is important that the OTTs ‘receive ongoing school support, effective and sensitive professional development and are able to establish and participate in teacher networks in order to bridge some of the cultural differences they encounter’ (Santoro, 2007, p. 92).

However, Hartsuyker (2007), Chair of the Howard Federal Government’s committee of inquiry into teacher education, reported that the committee was unable ‘to undertake an assessment of the extent to which the various stakeholders have developed and implemented effective strategies in response to these challenges and opportunities [on OTTs professional development]’ (p. 36). It seems that it is very difficult to get appropriate research-based knowledge about such a complex problem. Teacher professional development, including the provision of mentorship to new teachers, deserves more attention in Australia. Without such government attention, Australia is ‘unlikely to keep the finest teachers in the profession without more commitment to programs of reskilling and professional development’ (Kalantzis and Harvey cited in Martinez, 2004, p. 101).

One of the reasons for the inadequate professional support is that the Federal Government cut the funding for language and information support in the mid 1990s (see Chapter 7). These funding cuts affected not only the professional support for OTTs, who are regarded in part as beginning teachers, but also Australia-trained beginning teachers. Martinez (2004) points out that under devolution of funding to schools for professional learning, support for beginning teachers is not a priority, ‘as
the novices (who are at the bottom of the school power hierarchy) are unlikely to be represented on those allocation committees’ (p. 103).

In this context, where professional support for Australia-trained beginning teachers cannot be guaranteed, support for OTTs assumes an even more challenging status. Another complication is that the OTTs are treated as experienced teachers, and not given access to similar teacher development programs as beginning teachers. This is a contradiction. Martinez (2004, p. 103) argues that ‘support of newly appointed teachers and preparation and reward of mentors’ is a system-wide challenge. Likewise, Santoro (2007, p. 92) argues that it is vital that school communities support ethnic minority teachers and ‘understand [they have] the responsibility of the entire school community and not only the concern of a few individuals and the teachers themselves’.

With regard to the lack of formal professional support from education authorities, some OTTs organised their own informal peer support networks to help each other to deal with professional issues. Using online communication tools is one of the good ways to seek professional support from peers. Martinez (2004) indicates that Internet communication via email and chat boards:

> can offer new teachers intra- and interschool networking support to counteract the isolation that many new teachers experience. These facilities may be of special value for teachers who enter their career in rural and remote communities (pp. 101-102).

These online support networks can cross the traditional nation state border and decentralise the governance mechanism (Sassen, 2006). The OTTs can seek professional support freely with their foreign friends or colleagues by using Internet communication tools. Further, Peeler and Jane (2005) indicate that:

> Contact with others in the profession can help them [OTTs] orient themselves to the theoretical and practical concepts of teaching and inform them of specific contextual orientations. Effective transitions form part of an evolutionary process that connects newcomers to the profession and helps them acquire the necessary skills and knowledge (p. 325).
The function of peer support networks has emerged as important in this study. Such networks seem to assist the newly arrived OTTs in realising the importance of adjustment, providing them with ideas about how to achieve it more efficiently. These peer support networks can be theorised using Bourdieu’s (1986) concept of social capital, which provides members in a group with collective-owned capital. Therefore, a support network composed of successful, experienced OTTs from similar ethnic backgrounds seems to provide useful and practical intellectual capital for in-coming teachers. These peer support networks comprise social capital.

Grenfell (2007, p.145) claims that people with similar social and cultural capital ‘have an interest in supporting each other’ via social networks and the ‘nature of social solidarity itself is therefore transformed in the new order—as social capital’. In this sense, the OTTs connect their cultural capital—as teachers—into a peer

---

**Figure 8.4**

Discussion on Bourdieu’s (1986) concepts of forms of capital

The author explains three types of capital and explains that a doctoral degree is a form of cultural capital which can be traded for economic capital, especially a good job. For some accessing this cultural capital is an unconscious process of intergenerational transmission. I was hoping that I could understand Bourdieu (1986)’s theories in English, but I was awe-struck when faced with the immense body of literature on Bourdieu available in English. To find out what I really needed to know from this massive body of English language literature drove me to pursue numerous research angles but I could not find a way of meeting my needs. This Chinese blog contained many articles on Bourdieu which provided me with insights into his concepts. I established my preliminary understanding of Bourdieu’s (1986) concepts based on these articles. This article inspired me to think more about education theories from a Chinese perspective. From this perspective, I may say that the online articles written in my mother’s language successfully assisted me to better understanding of difficult concepts that I could not gain through the mass of literature in English.
support network—social capital. This enables them to rework their accumulated foreign cultural capital (as teachers) via social capital to observe what they are lacking in local cultural capital. Being different from cultural capital, social capital (Bourdieu, 1986) reflects a collective feature of their immigrant status, so that ‘if you leave the group you lose the capital’ (Dovey, 2005, p. 286). Hillier and Rooksby (2005) argue that a group of migrants with similar migration backgrounds are likely to help each other to deal with problems in their new lives in a new country; these ‘social capital networks are vital to coping with the several shocks of a new environment’ (p. 31). Further, Hillier and Rooksby (2005) argue that these social capital networks are closely related to the cultural capital people possess, such that the more education the group members have, the more opportunities there are for sharing understandings of the new system.

The peer support network of the OTTs in the Australian education field can be understood ‘in terms of the configuration of their capital’ (Grenfell, 2007, p. 60). Since the cultural and social capital that OTTs carry or access on arrival is not valued in the Australian education field, they have to struggle to rework their foreign cultural capital by gaining access to other forms of capital in the field. Following Grenfell (2007), it is possible to argue that no matter what forms of capital OTTs gain in this process, ‘it has value to the extent that it supplies “social energy”, which can be used to “buy” and make further investments in the field, thus working to establish preferential positions within it’ (p. 60). Peer support networks are useful for the OTTs to gain social and cultural capital which might better be valued as part of their professional learning, especially in a context where they lack authoritative professional support. This social capital can be further invested in, to help them gain more relatively-advantaged positions in the field.

Facing barriers to their professional support and qualifications recognition, some of the OTTs in this study chose to renew their teaching strategies and qualifications to fit the NSW education requirements. This too can be understood as a strategy of self support. Table 8.2 illustrates this situation. Hillier and Rooksby (2005) indicate that:

actors’ behaviour will be related to their position in the field. Their behaviours will also be related to the resources available to them, and to
their view of the field, including their ideological viewpoint and their perception of which issues are worth fighting for, this last being constructed from their position in the field (p. 23).

Some OTTs are situated at a relatively low position in the NSW education field, due to their shortfalls in fulfilling all the requirements of local teaching qualifications, and enculturation through work experience.

Table 8.2
Issues and themes in interview evidence on self adjustment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data sources</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vallika</td>
<td>OTTs should take the initiative to adjust themselves to suit the Australian context</td>
<td>Cultural adjustment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alka</td>
<td>Multicultural family background helped to deal with the Australian students.</td>
<td>Cultural adjustment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Anita        | 1. Different students behaviours between Indian and Australian students.  
2. Qualification adjustment | Cultural and qualification adjustment |
| Rebecca      | 1. Differences between Australian and South African students.  
2. Try to adjust teaching methods to change | Cultural adjustment              |
| Veronika     | 1. Different student-teacher relationship between Russia and Australia.  
2. The OTTs have to develop themselves to suit for the changes | Cultural adjustment              |
| Vanessa      | Qualification adjustment to gain professional support               | Qualification adjustment         |

The support resources that they can access are limited, as they are classified as experienced teachers. Some of them gave up the teaching profession when faced with these problems. However, for those who chose to stay in teaching they were able to secure support for adjusting themselves to meet the qualification and work experience requirements. This means there was hope in their minds, as they considered it worthwhile to struggle to gain a position in the field on their own. Bourdieu (2005) indicates that the struggles in a certain field are such that:

"every agent acts according to his position (that is, according to the capital he or she possesses) and his habitus, related to his personal history. His
actions, words, feelings, deeds, works, and so on, stem from the confrontation between dispositions and positions, which are more often than not mutually adjusted, but may be at odds, discrepant, divergent, even in some sense contradictory (p. 47).

Here habitus (Bourdieu, 2005) is taken as a social action developed through the agents’ previous knowledge and experiences. The struggle to adjust the habitus of OTTs reflects ‘a set of meaning that individuals attach to themselves by themselves and for themselves with a view towards the presentation of self towards others, must also be seen as a practical practice that flows from a habitus ensconced in a field’ (Widick, 2004, p. 200). The self-support and adjustment of OTTs to their cultural capital comes under the influence of their habitus, which mediates their engagements with the NSW education field, resulting in ‘actual dialectic exchange between subjective (habitus) and objective (field) into a psycho-social conflict of self-overcoming’ (Widick, 2004, p. 224). Those OTTs who positively transform their identities adapt to the new field; for some this is a challenge, a few withdraw from the field.

8.7 CONCLUSION

This Chapter analysed evidence of the OTTs’ sources of support with respect to their employment as Australian teachers. It also analysed evidence of how the OTTs practice in a situation where they lack authoritative standing in the NSW education field. The documents from the NSW Teachers Federation show that the OTTs secure their professional learning through induction and other forms of support. Inevitably, there are concerns about whether the induction program can provide adequate support for OTTs to get used to the NSW education system. There are concerns about whether the current professional support helps OTTs to re-establish their careers in Australia. Some OTTs do not gain enough information and explanations from official documents; this leads them to waste time and money. The survey data shows that more than half of the respondents are satisfied with the PeP but also, a portion of them are not satisfied with the professional assistance they receive. The interview evidence tends to support the survey data in that 5 of the 13 interviewees mentioned the lack of professional assistance in the school practicum or follow-up support while teaching. This raises another concern about self-support for adjustment,
and if education employers can provide more on-going professional support. In this way, the experiences and diversified educational cultures of OTTs could deliver what the government wants. The next Chapter provides findings, implications, recommendations, and reflections arising from this study.
CHAPTER NINE

ESTABLISHING EFFECTIVE RECRUITMENT, EMPLOYMENT AND SUPPORT STRATEGIES FOR OVERSEAS TRAINED TEACHERS

Utilitarians believe that every question has a correct answer that can in principle be calculated. For communitarians every question-and-answer comes with a point of view, and no point of view can be judged superior to any other, since there is no further point of view from which this can be done (though, oddly, they seem to have a point of view from which this, in turn, can be known to be true) (Lukes, 1996, p. 180).

9.0 INTRODUCTION

For an early career researcher, one begins with an expectation that there will be an answer for one’s research question no matter what the research problem is. These answers the beginning researcher expects to obtain through his/her research, and expects they will be of benefit, at least to a certain degree. In the effort to achieve these research outcomes, one learns much about the kind of research that is valued. One is that there is no ultimate answer for the research questions, but plenty of questions for further research studies. Every effort that a researcher makes is based on the previous hard work of other researchers, the community of researchers one aspires to join. At the same time, his/her research may provoke the further development of knowledge for researchers who follow. Most of the time, there is not a big step forward in knowledge that one researcher can achieve, but he/she can guide the work of researchers who follow.

This Chapter is the final Chapter of this thesis. This thesis has progressed from reviewing the previous literature, establishing a theoretical framework, designing the principles and procedures for the research investigation, and analysing the evidence that was collected or otherwise generated. This Chapter concludes this thesis by explicitly addressing the research questions raised in Chapter 1. To do so, this Chapter is divided into five sections. The first section provides a summary of the previous eight Chapters, to briefly review what has been achieved through the
research process. The second section details the main findings that this research has achieved. The third section presents implications arising from this study, to address policy concerns relating to recruiting, retraining and supporting OTTs. The forth section concerns the limitations of this research and provides suggestions for possible directions for further research. The last section provides reflections on how I as a researcher used my bi-lingual and technological competence throughout this research project.

9.1 SUMMARY OF THIS THESIS

Chapter 1 outlined the research problem addressed in this study. The research aimed to explore why OTTs come to Australia, the Government policies for recruiting and employing OTTs, and the experiences and strategies of the OTTs who try to fit into the NSW education system.

Chapter 2 provided a review of the recent research literature to establish the current knowledge of transnational labour flows, the Australian teacher labour market, concerns about recruiting OTTs and the barriers faced by OTTs. This Chapter situated the study of OTTs in the context of research knowledge about global labour movements to establish the connections between employers’ recruitment and employment strategies, and the problems in applying these strategies. Both overseas and Australian research literature were reviewed in this Chapter.

Chapter 3 explored the theoretical framework used in this study. It provided a range of concepts to guide the data collection and analysis processes. These key concepts were selected to explore the relationship between the evidence and the theories, with the latter being used to interpret the former so as to address the research questions.

Chapter 4 presented the research philosophy informing the conduct of the research reported in this thesis, explained how the research was designed and how the evidence was collected and analysed. Of course, the research design and process were themselves revised during the course of this study. Explanations as to why these changes were made in the flexible research design were provided.
Chapters 5 to Chapter 8 represented the evidentiary chapters. These Chapters are where the primary evidence is analysed. Chapter 5 analysed evidence of the main reasons for OTTs coming to Australia. This Chapter also analysed documents on the registration system of OTTs.

Various barriers in registration, acceptance of overseas qualifications and previous employment records as well as language, were identified in Chapter 6. These blocked some OTTs from getting employed into the NSW education system. This Chapter presented evidence for discussing forms of support that might be provided to help the OTTs overcome these barriers.

Chapter 7 analysed documents about the conduct of PEAT with OTTs from non-English speaking countries and how the English proficiency test affects the teachers. This Chapter also analysed documents from 1991–2008 relating to the conduct of induction programs for OTTs.

Chapter 8 analysed evidence of various support mechanisms that OTTs access through the NSW education system. Both the absence and presence of different forms of support were analysed. The strategies taken by the OTTs to adjust themselves to NSW schools were also explored in this Chapter. The following sections of Chapter 9 present the findings, implications, recommendations and the researcher’s reflections.

9.2 FINDINGS

This study explored a series of research questions about the employment and recruitment of OTTs and the strategies to enable them to adjust to the NSW education system. The findings relating to these questions are highlighted in this section.

The reasons OTTs claim to have for migrating to Australia tend to be reasons of family reunion and/or change of lifestyle reasons, rather than professional development.
Australia has many advantages for recruiting OTTs. This study found that family reasons and lifestyle changes were major incentives for attracting the OTTs. Further, global labour movement in fields other than teaching has the potential to bring to Australia people who are qualified OTTs, who subsequently seek employment here.

With Australia’s close connections to other English speaking countries, skilled teachers from the UK were one of the major contributors to Australia’s international labour force. With the largest population in Australia, NSW has the advantage of attracting many international institutions and entrepreneurs to run branch offices in this State. This situation continuously brings many international skilled workers with their spouses, and they often provide a source of qualified teachers. Another two major key reasons for OTTs migrating to Australia are family reunion and marriage with Australians. These groups of OTTs considered finding teaching positions where they could register for employment as teachers in NSW. Some teaching family members made this decision before moving to Australia with their partners. Most of them were women.

This research found that family members in teaching might not always realise the complexities of teacher registration and employment in NSW. Once here, they were led to seek teaching positions in NSW, but mistakenly assumed it would be without serious challenges. Australia is widely known for its beautiful and clear natural environment and peaceful social conditions. These tend to be part of the OTTs’ preliminary expectations that lead them to move abroad. Some of them chose to migrate in the expectation of a different lifestyle, especially the excellent outdoor environment, which is seen as good for raising children. Nearly all the interviewees from this group were from English speaking countries which had similar education cultures to that of Australia.

The absence of a single national approach to teacher registration and employment may be a block for OTTs gaining employment as teachers in NSW.

This study found that overseas teacher labour flows were blocked by Australia’s complicated teacher registration and employment system.
The OTTs, as skilled workers, who want to migrate and gain permanent employment positions in NSW first have to hold a valid Permanent Residency (PR) visa obtained through the Commonwealth’s Department of Immigration and Citizenship. Obtaining qualification recognition begins with the National Office of Overseas Skills Recognition (NOOSR), and is an important step in the process for gaining a PR visa. Passing this qualification assessment means OTTs are technically qualified to teach in Australia as skilled workers. However, ‘qualified to teach’ does not mean that OTTs can find teaching jobs equal to their positions in the home countries. Those OTTs whose qualifications were checked by NOOSR prior to coming to Australia as skilled workers, then found that their qualifications had to be double checked by the NSW Department of Education and Training (DET). Also, those OTTs with teaching qualifications officially recognised in other States, who transferred to the NSW public education system had to have these reassessed.

The OTTs’ registration process in NSW is stated in official documents and regulations. However, acting on these documents becomes complicated due to the absence of a uniform qualification recognition system among Australia’s different education, employment, and migration agencies, all of which are involved in labour recruitment. Some OTTs experienced a long ‘wait time’ for decisions from each different agency; and some were asked to provide supplementary documents to support their applications. The length of time for documents to be checked could take from several months to two years. This situation dramatically increased the ‘wait time’ to register with the NSW DET for employment. Due to the need to find paid work, some OTTs could not continue their teaching careers, and secured other work to support their families.

This study found that OTTs in NSW might start with work in temporary teaching positions which were open to those given approval to seek teaching positions. Not surprisingly, OTTs who can teach specific subjects, or in localities where there are teacher shortages, have a better chance of being employed. OTTs with approval to seek teaching positions could register online to indicate their preferred work locations while waiting for employment. However, the permanent positions which OTTs expected to obtain due to the reported teacher shortages in Australia took longer to obtain, because they needed to obtain Permanent Residency and have
proved their teaching capability. Therefore, the residential status of the OTTs can become an employment barrier for some OTTs. In addition, given the registration and employment barriers mentioned above, it is difficult for some OTTs to find permanent positions within several years of arriving in NSW. Given these barriers, this may lend credence to Miller’s (2008) claim that migrants are restricted by the system of Government regulations, which limits their employment prospects.

This study found that the complicated OTT registration and employment system can push some OTTs into other jobs or employment in non-State schools. Therefore, the NSW DET may confront a similar problem of ‘brain drain’, as happens between developing and developed countries (Kapstein, 2000). NSW does not have sufficient teachers in some specific subjects and geographical locations (MCEETYA, 2004), and the drain of some OTTs into other professions or sectors might be redressed through changes in registration and employment requirements in NSW.

There are gaps between the expectations of some OTTs for employment and the NSW education authority’s needs for skilled teachers in certain disciplines and in selected locations.

The gaps in expectation between some OTTs and NSW employing authorities lead to problems in skills mismatch for OTTs seeking employment in NSW schools.

Through data analysis, this study identified four key concerns that reflect the mismatch in expectations between NSW education authorities and some OTTs. First, what do most OTTs expect?—it is permanent positions and better living and working conditions. Second, what does the NSW DET ask for those OTTs seeking permanent positions?—it is tightly designated qualifications and sufficient local teaching experience. Third, where are the permanent positions?—they are only in subjects in demand and in specific geographical locations. Fourth, what do some OTTs have to offer?—considerable overseas work experience.

From these issues, it can be seen that the permanent positions that some OTTs expect are determined by their having appropriate qualifications in disciplines in demand and/or a willingness to work in specific localities, and sufficient local teaching
experience. For the OTTs who have just arrived in Australia, many do not qualify in terms of these requirements. Given the NSW teacher labour market situation, it is acknowledged that NSW has teacher shortages in some specific disciplines and geographical locations (MCEETYA, 2004). However, the OTTs recruited by Australia are seeking family reunions and lifestyle changes, which means they prefer either to stay with their families or in comfortable places that are easy to live in. The places that these OTTs choose to live are unlikely to be rural areas of NSW unless their families are located there. In other words, with regard to international labour recruitment, rural NSW is not made the focus for recruiting OTTs to fill the gaps in areas of teacher shortages. Therefore, overseas teaching experiences are all that some OTTs have to compete for permanent teaching positions against Australian-trained teachers. They do not meet the well-known employment requirements that the NSW education system has for permanent positions.

Under these circumstances, the demands that NSW makes of teachers cannot be met until OTTs are selected to meet the requirements for permanent positions. The employment barriers will continue while OTTs are recruited who do not satisfy the employers’ requirements. In other words, to solve this problem of mismatched qualifications, OTTs have to be recruited to work in the areas of demand identified by the NSW DET, and then it might modify its support for OTTs.

The OTTs’ overseas work experience and the knowledge they have gained there tend to be marginalised in NSW schools, effecting a different kind of skills mismatch.

This study found that OTTs were considered to have deficits in their overseas qualifications and experiences which could not be readily redressed by the NSW education employers. Even those whose qualifications were recognised could not find teaching positions because of the mismatch with their skills. Therefore, some OTTs’ work experience and knowledge were of limited value.

This study found that most of the interviewees had more than three years of teaching experience in overseas countries. Some of them had senior academic or administrative roles. They had expected that their multi-competence gained overseas
would be valued in Australia’s multicultural education environment. However, some of these highly experienced teachers faced the situation where their previous overseas work experiences were not accepted or otherwise recognised in the Australian education context. This happened not only to OTTs from the Asia-Pacific region, but also to teachers from English speaking countries, who assumed that they shared a ‘similar’ education system with Australia. This lack of recognition of OTTs’ previous experiences and knowledge created a hurdle for them to become employed in the NSW schooling system. The evidence pointed to a contradiction, with skilled workers being recruited from overseas, while the local labour market did not need these particular workers (Walsh & Brigham, 2007). This suggests a possible problem with the recruitment of OTTs in the first instance. Due to different education systems, it was difficult to match some OTTs’ qualifications with those required in Australia. This led to the problem that some OTTs were classified into school sectors that did not suit their previous work experience. The knowledge, experiences, and qualifications that some OTTs brought to Australia were rejected, thus rejecting their skills and experiences.

The OTTs struggle with being positioned as both beginning teachers who have to be re-educated into the Australian education culture, while also being expected to draw on their considerable teaching experiences from overseas.

This study found that some OTTs who were employed, struggled with being treated as beginning teachers needing to be re-trained to fulfil Australian education standards. However, they were also regarded as experienced teachers in the schools where they worked, where professional support was not always present.

The evidence in this study showed that regarding those OTTs who came from countries that used teaching strategies and evaluation systems different from Australia’s; it was essential for them to learn Australian ways to meet parents’ and students’ expectations. The Pre-employment Programs were introduced in response to these related concerns. However, the evidence indicated different opinions about the PePs. In terms of the effectiveness of the PePs, it was helpful in assisting OTTs to learn about NSW schooling principles. However, the PeP might not be necessary for those OTTs from similar education systems; they were offended, as it seemed to
treat them as beginning teachers. Some of the interviewees considered parts of the program unnecessary, as they were well trained and qualified teachers with many years of work experience.

They felt the PePs sought to train OTTs to be ‘Australian teachers’ but did not recognise them as teachers who could bring positive assets into Australia’s multicultural education system. Through analysing the policy, survey, and interview evidence, the NSW OTT recruitment policy tended to take OTTs as inexperienced teachers, and provided the PeP to initiate their retraining into becoming ‘Australian teachers’. The policy analysis found that the free workshops and support courses that existed before 1998 have since been transformed into fee-paying bridging courses which did not attract OTTs to enrol. However, some of the OTTs who were employed felt that they were not provided appropriate ongoing professional support once employed, they were expected to be experienced teachers. This contradictory aspect of their recruitment and employment made it difficult for some OTTs. Some felt ‘degraded’, and a few found the PeP took a ‘retrograde’ form of professional learning. Some of the interviewees mentioned that they did not learn from the PeP itself but from other participants; presumably this is one of the PeP’s intended benefits.

**Newly arrived OTTs benefit from forming collegial networks among teachers from their homelands—something which could be acknowledged in the official mentoring system.**

*This study found that where there was a lack of professional support, the support networks which were organised spontaneously by some OTTs provided peer discussion groups which complemented fee paying bridging courses and official mentoring systems.*

The interview evidence showed that some OTTs did enjoy teaching in Australia, especially where they had sufficient follow-up mentorship. This was reinforced by the survey responses; from 90 valid survey responses, 72.22% (n=65) considered working in Australia favourably compared with their experiences in other countries (see Question 30 in Appendix 1). Further, 67.62% (n=71) of the 105 valid responses
would recommend other OTTs to teach in Australia (see Question 31 in Appendix 1). In addition, 74.07% (n=80) of 108 valid responses expressed their intentions to continue to work in Australia in the next five (5) years time (see Question 32 in Appendix 1). However, these positive responses seemed to depend on the schools where the teachers worked.

The evidence showed that some OTTs developed into proficient ‘Australian teachers’ with strong teaching skills, especially when adequate professional support was provided. Besides the support from Government bodies, there were OTTs who sought support and gained it through their own social networks. For some, this support came from their previous colleagues or relatives from their homelands. Peeler and Jane (2005) claim that establishing personal support to meet OTTs’ needs generates positive outcomes for their professional transition. The evidence indicated that those OTTs who gained information, teaching skills, and insight into teaching experience through conversations conducted in their mother language or among familiar peers, made a successful transition.

This form of mentorship provided professional support that helped these OTTs become familiar with the Australian education context. The problems of learning to use specific teaching methods and Australian students’ behaviour management were addressed through this mentorship process. However, this mentorship might not contribute much help when the OTTs face the problem of knowing how to embed their previous teaching experience into the Australian education context. This was because the local Australian teachers had little knowledge of the overseas teaching strategies. In this context, the contribution of the OTTs’ own support networks also provided tactics, strategies, experience, and suggestions. Successful former OTTs with similar education, culture and working backgrounds proved helpful in this regard.

**Some OTTs are able to make the necessary and spontaneous adjustments to fit into the Australian educational culture.**

*This study found that some OTTs could adopt strategies to adjust themselves, either in teaching methods or qualifications, to adapt to the Australian education system.*
addition, the adjustment could be smoother and faster if these OTTs were provided with sufficient professional support.

The evidence showed that some OTTs faced difficulties in dealing with the Australian education context. In part, this was due to differences in cultural and educational backgrounds. This group of OTTs encountered many difficulties, in particular a ‘dark’ period at the beginning of their efforts to establish a teaching career in Australia. During the teaching process, the cultural shock of students’ misbehaviour was mentioned often in the interviews. These teachers were not prepared to teach Australian students who were not like the students in their home countries. However, those OTTs who did adjust their teaching methods to the learning needs of Australian students were successful in gaining respect from their students and colleagues. This depended on their having proficient English language skills and multi-competence as teachers. The evidence showed that those OTTs who themselves were good at negotiating current situations and who also had professional support could achieve a teaching career in Australia. These successful OTTs were aware that they themselves needed to engage in continuous self-development to make the adjustments needed to deal with this new education system. There were also some OTTs keen to gain local teaching qualifications to overcome the barriers to their employment.

Up till now I have identified the key findings of this research in terms of the individual research questions. Now, it is important to revisit these to explore any potential intersections or relations between and across the research questions and the key findings reported above (Table 9.1). By mapping these against the key themes and key concepts, it is possible to better understand the logic of OTT recruitment through the experiences of key stakeholders.

The argument of this research, which I recall here, is that there are struggles over OTTs’ cultural capital in NSW DET employment strategies; this tends to have negative effects, for some but not all OTTs, in securing employment let alone making transnational knowledge connections. The themes in Table 9.1 identify what the OTTs (agents) in this study have gone through in the NSW education field. This is a time-sensitive account that moves from the OTTs’ immigration stories,
registration process and employment strategies to the support strategies of the NSW DET and those initiated by the OTTs themselves. The recurring pattern in the theoretical concepts used to interpret these findings is explained below.

Table 9.1
Interactions between research questions, findings, themes and key concepts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research problem</th>
<th>Findings</th>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Key concepts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the nature of the agents that might explain why and how OTTs come to Australia?</td>
<td>Family reasons, lifestyle change, and professional development</td>
<td>Immigration</td>
<td>Citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the key attributes of the field of current NSW Government strategies for employing OTTs?</td>
<td>Absence of national teacher registration and employment system</td>
<td>Teacher registration</td>
<td>Field, strategy, cultural capital, symbolic capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lengthy teacher registration process</td>
<td>Teacher registration</td>
<td>Field, strategy, cultural capital, symbolic capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Language test and Pre-employment Program</td>
<td>Employment strategies</td>
<td>Field, strategy, cultural capital, symbolic capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘Waiting list’ system</td>
<td>Employment strategies</td>
<td>Field, strategy, cultural capital, symbolic capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residential status</td>
<td>Employment strategies</td>
<td>Citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employment gaps between the OTTs and NSW education authorities.</td>
<td>Employment strategies</td>
<td>Field, habitus, symbolic capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What role does misrecognition play in the problems faced by multicultural Australia with regard to integrating OTTs into the NSW education system?</td>
<td>Marginalising OTTs’ knowledge and work experience.</td>
<td>Employment strategies</td>
<td>Field, misrecognition, cultural capital, symbolic capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How are the OTTs working in NSW schools positioned and what position do they take?</td>
<td>The OTTs are positioned both as beginning teachers and experienced teachers. They are taking dominated positions.</td>
<td>Employment and support strategies</td>
<td>Field, misrecognition, cultural capital, symbolic capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the dispositions of OTTs who do not get employed as teachers in NSW?</td>
<td>Collegial support network and self adjustment</td>
<td>Support strategies</td>
<td>Field, dispositions, habitus, cultural capital, social capital, symbolic capital, digital network</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the context of transnational labour movements, the OTTs, as skilled workers, migrate to Australia for various reasons. Family and lifestyle changes were among key incentives these OTTs in this research gave for their migration to Australia. The
recruitment of OTTs is undertaken for two reasons. One is the very real possibility that the Australian teacher labour force could face shortages or skills mismatch in specific disciplines and localities. The other reason is that the OTTs may provide beneficial supplements for increasing the Australian multicultural presence in school classes. Thus, the recruitment of OTTs has the potential to be mutually beneficial, or in the Chinese expression: ‘one arrow, two hawks’\textsuperscript{23}. However, OTT registration and employment strategies entail a series of struggles over cultural capital between the NSW education authorities and the OTTs. Both parties are agents in the Australian education field, although they occupy differential positions of power. The former take the dominant position while the latter can only occupy a dominated position in this field. The NSW education authorities hold the symbolic capital, which entitles them to the power to legitimate the cultural capital embodied in or concerned with the OTTs.

Thus, the registration and employment of OTTs is not successful until they gain legitimacy from the NSW education authorities. OTTs have to accept this result if they decide to enter into this field, which means accepting the rules of the field almost unconditionally. Given their inexperience in this field, some are given to a misrecognition of the rules. As a result of this misrecognition process, the knowledge of the OTTs, their cultural capital, is marginalised as it does not belong to the dominant agents. The registration and employment strategies are designed and conducted to make the OTTs favoured agents within the dominant position. Habitus plays a role in directing the practices of both agents in the field. Besides the practices set for the NSW education field, the OTTs also need appropriate residence visas to gain permanent employment positions. Australia entitles people with citizenship to live and work freely but denies this to others, for whom it is illegal to take certain employment positions.

Some OTTs who successfully gain employment in NSW public schools may also suffer from being misrecognised as both beginning teachers and experienced teachers. The misrecognition of their identities as teachers means that these OTTs may not share or access support strategies which are designed for teachers who fit the

\textsuperscript{23} Yi jian shuang diao (pin yin)—一箭双雕(han zi)
dominant frame of reference. The cultural capital of this group of OTTs is unlikely to be discovered and developed. Thus, the OTTs, no matter whether employed or unemployed, will try to convert their cultural capital into forms of social capital, such as peer support networks, to avoid devaluation of their cultural capital. In this process, digital networks take on an innovative function in enabling OTTs to establish support networks within and across countries. Other OTTs may consider gaining qualifications from the dominant agents, as this can favour them in gaining employment. Here, it should be noticed that these identity conversions and self-adjustments are all guided by the OTTs’ habitus, which is the embodied sense of being a teacher, drawn from their previous overseas experiences.

Thus, I have explained relations between the research problems and the findings in terms of the themes and key concepts that cut across the research questions. The research in this thesis makes it possible for the researcher to consider implications for policies that may help OTTs such as those in this study, to become involved in the NSW education system more smoothly.

9.3 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

Given the above findings of this thesis, there are education policy responses that might help such OTTs to conquer their difficulties. Further consideration of the value of the knowledge and experiences of OTTs and efforts to strengthen their professional support might be addressed. Of course, there is the prior issue of why Australia immigration authorities recruit migrant labour in areas where shortages do not exist.

9.3.1 Focusing on the contributions of OTTs

Overseas trained teachers may bring positive attributes into Australia although they are also considered as having a lack with respect to local teaching experience, and a lack of qualifications as well as limited English competence. Given Australia’s multicultural education context, it is desirable to recruit qualified and competent OTTs specifically to fill the gaps in areas of known teacher shortages and to provide
an ethnically diverse education workforce. However, the current policies for recruiting and employing OTTs focus on checking qualifications, language competence and local teaching experience against the specific employment requirements. OTTs need to be recruited for, and prepared to meet Australia’s employment needs. OTTs need to be prepared to become more Australianised through qualification and training processes. However, the potential contributions that OTTs can bring into Australia should not be neglected. There must be some knowledge that Australian students do not know that OTTs can help them learn about different intellectual cultures. While these OTTs are stressed in the Australian education context, their multiple teaching competence and potential contributions do not appear to be engaged here. OTTs face the dilemma of either speaking or acting like Anglo-Australian teachers or of being marginalised in the Australian education system. It is necessary to review and re-examine the intellectual contributions that OTTs can make to their Australian students and peers.

9.3.2 Introducing more efficient OTT training programs

Regarding the question of what kind of training program is required for OTTs, the expectations of the OTTs in this study for ongoing mentorship could help solve some of their problems, on the basis of individual needs. There are three questions that can be raised here:

1. What do the OTTs need by way of support?
2. What kinds of support can the NSW education community provide?
3. How can these two issues be addressed under current circumstances?

It is perhaps not surprising that OTTs might be confused on starting work in Australian schools. This is especially so when they are positioned as both beginning classroom teachers and as teachers with satisfactory work experience. The absence of professional support assumes that OTTs are good enough to work independently, based on their previous classroom experiences. Some OTTs might be able to adjust their teaching approaches to Australian classes by themselves. However, not all the OTTs can find solutions to the challenges they face in their class through
independent adjustment. Thus, as newcomers to the Australian education system, OTTs do need professional assistance in coming to know the NSW schooling system.

The different teaching methods used in various countries are being imported into Australia via these teachers, ostensibly for the benefit of the NSW education community. These expected benefits accrue not only to the OTTs but also to the entire school community. Peeler and Jane (2005) suggest that:

> the providers of teacher education courses should examine whether they satisfactorily deliver suitable knowledge of teaching and practice that enables newcomers to perform their teaching duties. Teachers born overseas face particular difficulties, hence there is a need to bridge the gap in cultural understanding of different education systems (p. 334).

A bridging system might be developed to satisfy the OTTs’ need to become familiar with the NSW public education system. The current Pre-employment Program helps OTTs become familiar with basic NSW school rules, but they also need ongoing professional assistance to help deal with questions that arise in their teaching. Mentoring programs can help the newcomers to cope with the stresses and tensions that emerge in the Australian education context (Peeler & Jane, 2005). However, traditional mentoring programs alone are unlikely to provide all the help the OTTs need. It is difficult for mentors to provide substantive support to the new OTTs while themselves having heavy teaching responsibilities. It is necessary to deliver an efficient training and professional support system through the cooperative participation of multiple parties. This could include the use of information communication technology to allow OTTs to discuss Australian teaching issues online with colleagues in their homeland or other teachers from there now working in Australia.

### 9.3.3 Conducting PeP and PEAT in areas of teacher demand

The OTTs from other parts of NSW have to travel to Sydney for taking part in the PeP or PEAT. The travel and accommodation costs for these newly arrived OTTs who are located in NSW rural or regional areas entail a heavy financial burden. This raises the concern that the PEAT and PeP might be periodically conducted in those
areas in which there are supposed to be teacher shortages. Alternatively, these OTTs could be compensated for the costs incurred, including any loss of pay.

9.4 RECOMMENDATIONS

This study has explored the experiences of OTTs in different areas of NSW, the reasons for their migration, and the barriers they faced in the registration and employment processes. There were gaps between the requirements of the NSW employment system and the OTTs’ needs. The participants in this study, for instance, focused their disciplines on subjects and teaching areas which were not currently in short supply in NSW. The reason for this might be due to a limitation of this study, namely that the OTTs qualified in disciplines in demand have been employed and so had no incentive to participate in this research project. Therefore, future research might focus on how to engage these OTTs and explore how they successful in getting into the NSW education system. This might help to address another research issue, namely a comparison between successful and unsuccessful OTTs.

Despite intentions otherwise, the data collected for this study largely came from English speaking OTTs. OTTs from the Asia-Pacific region have already become the second largest group of OTTs. There is need for future research among OTTs from countries where English is not the first language, especially those who have successfully engaged in the Australian education context. How these OTTs apply their knowledge and multiple competences to survive in the Australian education context is important. This is especially so if English language proficiency is considered as a potential deficit.

This research explored the employment status of OTTs, with half of the OTTs were currently employed as permanent teachers (n=62). However, this research did not investigate differences across the education sectors in which these OTTs gained permanent employment. Future research might focus specifically on differences and similarities across education sectors. The OTTs working in different sectors would help further to explore the effects of NSW DET employment strategies.
Due to the relatively large number of OTTs who having recently arrived in Australia and not having started work, there is a need to track their experiences in further research, to better understand how NSW teacher employment strategies affect them.

9.5 REFLECTIONS

Doing this research was a painful and happy process. The ‘pain’ felt like a rooster being forced to lay eggs and the ‘happiness’ was constantly felt in digging up so many unknown things through continuous explorations. Before drawing this thesis to a close, I want to reflect on what I have learnt, not only from the research itself, but also from the various connected dimensions. I gradually realised that a person is not an individual living on an isolated island, but is positioned in a constantly developing setting. The continuous thinking, analysing and reflecting have led me to investigate issues hidden in the data. For me, my research writing stimulated my thinking and reflecting, and this generated unanticipated insight. In this section, I discuss my reflections on my doctoral studies by reviewing my learning strategies.

9.5.1 Zigzag learning practices

The concept ‘zigzag learning’ (Singh & Guo, 2008a) recognises that bilingual research students have at least two funds of knowledge to draw upon, or to shuttle between, in their studies. I benefit from being literate in two languages, by being able to see the object of my studies from differing perspectives. It also means that my learning has occurred in my two languages, thereby enhancing the substance and quality of what I have come to know. Thus, zigzag learning is integral to enhancing my bilingual proficiency as a transnational knowledge worker.

For me zigzag learning is a process that can be likened to climbing a mountain, insofar as it acknowledges that going straight up may not be the fastest or most efficient way of scaling it. At one level, zigzag learning provided me with a survival mechanism, enabling me, a research student from China, to carry on my studies in a predominantly English-only academic environment. This learning strategy engaged my Chinese and English linguistic repertoire in enhancing my research capabilities. I
translated words from English into Chinese, then translated them back, and then followed this with a discussion of what had been understood, with peers and my principal supervisor. This is because there was a need to judge whether the initial translation was correct. ‘Back translation’ provided an important basis for me to judge whether the whole process had led me to the correct words (lexicon), the correct part of speech (grammar), and the enhancement of my knowledge.

9.5.1.1 Learning to read twice

How were my bilingual capabilities employed in reading scholarly articles written in English? Basically, this involved my selectively annotating each page as it was read, with words written in han zì (Chinese characters). In China, as a teacher I suggested that for students to study English well, that when they meet new words they should first guess their meanings according to their context. If the students can find explanations for the meaning of words from their context, then they do not have to search for the meanings or pronunciations of the words in their English-Chinese dictionaries. However, if the students still cannot understand the meanings of the words, they are then encouraged to find the meanings in their English-Chinese dictionaries. I too did this.

9.5.1.2 Multiplying synonyms

Inevitably, every research student meets some new words that they do not recognise when reading the advanced English and advanced Mandarin (Han Zì) to be found in the academic literature. How to understand these new words and then transfer them into writing can present a major issue. One strategy I used, was to learn synonyms for these words in both English and Mandarin. To achieve a satisfactory solution, this process involved four stages, which have a zigzag pattern. For me, English grammar is a problem, but I also struggled to write in English using the variety of words needed to avoid monotonous repetition. Using the advantages my bilingual proficiency provides, I used Mandarin (Han Zì) as a beneficial supplement to advance my knowledge of English and, most importantly, to progress my doctoral studies.
My strategy of zigzag learning began with me identifying a Chinese synonym for a particular English word. Then I identified a Chinese synonym for the initial Chinese word that I had found. The third stage was to find an English definition for that Chinese synonym. By working through this zigzag process I have been able to better understand the meaning of the English concept as well as its Chinese synonyms. The important last step in this strategy of moving back and forth between the two languages was to test if the English definition appears similar in meaning to the original English word. I did so by discussing what I had written with my principal supervisor.

9.5.2 Knowledge detours using ICTs

What are ‘knowledge detours’ (Singh & Guo, 2008a)? A detour is created when there is a blockage, usually in a roadway. People have to take an alternative path around the obstruction in order to reach their goal. In this instance, the idea of a knowledge detour refers to the way in which I, as a bilingual research student, was able to recognise an impediment to my learning and research, such as the challenges posed by advanced academic English, and to draw upon my first language in order to negotiate my way around the obstacle. A knowledge detour, therefore, represents my attempts as a bilingual research student, to use my layers of knowledge to mediate or otherwise mitigate problems I faced in doing research and becoming a researcher. Such detours led me to places where I wanted to be, even though I sometimes encountered further problems while taking the detour. For instance, the difficulties of learning advanced academic English created a feeling of diffidence in me, even as I tried to avoid the blockages confronting me. Without appropriate recognition and acknowledgement by my principal supervisor, this knowledge detour itself would have caused me to lose face, to lose my self-confidence, decrease my enthusiasm for learning and even increase linguistic inaccuracies.
9.5.2.1 Bulletin Board System

One way I used knowledge detours to improve my learning was via online academic studies using the Bulletin Board System (BBS). BBS is an online forum or information exchange service. It provides public electronic whiteboards where every registered user can write questions, answers, opinions or views about issues raised by other users. A BBS is mostly administered by education centres, research institutions or business organisations. It is the academic and research features of BBS that made them attractive for me, providing me with a means of interacting with research students in China. BBS offered me possibilities for exploring different themes and sub-themes across several bulletin boards. As a BBS user I read other students’ or scholars’ views on a topic within a few seconds of my raising an issue. Alternatively, they posted their own ideas on a notice board, and I learnt from these.

The BBS supplemented the university’s face-to-face research training workshops, and better still, users could express their opinions freely without being afraid of being laughed at because of their ‘silly’ questions or answers. These were real concerns for me in face-to-face discussions. The users in BBS discussions do not know each other’s true identity. In this virtual scholarly community, I could participate in the discussions from a position of equality. Furthermore, users provide succinct summaries of their responses helped by the use of plain Chinese rather than academic Chinese; I found the former easier to understand. These benefits could not be achieved by me from online forums conducted in English, because so many colloquial or informal words are used. For me, colloquial English is very difficult to understand. Much of my time was wasted looking for the meaning of these vernacular words in various types of English/Chinese dictionaries. Weblogs and podcasts provided another important means of assistance in my research studies.

9.5.2.2 Blogs

Blogs provided me with another vehicle for making knowledge detours. These innovative digital technologies have functions similar to the BBS, but provide readers or (bloggers) with diary-style accounts of issues. For instance, I used ‘Google blog search’ to find articles in Chinese concerned with ‘how to prepare a PhD thesis’
or ‘how to write a literature review’. These blogs provided me with access to research students studying in China and elsewhere. By explaining my research and the processes involved, I was inspired by others to follow their successful methods for undertaking doctoral studies. Likewise, I found that there was much to be learnt from some Chinese academics’ blogs, where they shared their research responses and understandings.

9.5.3 Reflections on zigzag learning and knowledge detours using ICTs

Let us look back to these two types of learning practices I adopted in my research studies; learning strategies from other cultures that seem to be marginalised in Anglo-phone academic environments. The central question we might now ask is how does a Chinese research student and others who share similar attributes, acquire knowledge through using their mother’s language and their technological competence?

My learning practices in Chinese involved using translation skills and ICT tools. I have always asked myself whether to ‘think it in Chinese’ is really an obstacle for gaining knowledge in English. In China, nearly all the English learners as well as English teachers, consider that ‘thinking in English’ is the ultimate competence that a learner of English as a foreign language (EFL) should have. I pushed this as the first priority in English teaching. As an English teacher, I always said to my Chinese students to stop thinking in Chinese, and to use English when practising English. The authors of English language text-books always explain English without any use of Chinese, as they aim to have students practise thinking in English.

The native speaking teachers of English even set up their classrooms without any Chinese words, which seems to make Chinese an enemy in the process of learning English. As a teacher I struggled to try to erase the effects of ‘Chinese’ in all my students’ learning activities. These were all carried out in English to ensure students practised ‘thinking in English’. All of this leaves students puzzled with the English explanations and the associated English pictures. This idea has become a ‘body guard’ which makes it seem reasonable for me as a Chinese research student
studying overseas to want to gain all my knowledge by English-only means. From what I have learnt of Australian universities from colleagues, this often seems to be the normal taken-for-granted agreement negotiated by Chinese research students and their Anglo-phone educators.

However, as a Chinese student I found out that ‘thinking in English’ is only a dream. It is so unrealistic, and it caught me out when entering an English speaking environment. Take myself, a research student who practised his competence in English through learning advanced research. The more I wanted to think in English, the less I could write or learn in this particular English speaking environment. I was misled and trapped by the difficulties of trying to learn in English only. The bilingual learning practices mentioned above show that I have realised the complexities of language issues in research-based learning. However, even in Australia, where English is required for my PhD thesis, and this is something I really wanted to greatly improve, I have been encouraged by my principal supervisor to develop my bilingual and ICT competences to deal with this ‘problem’. As a newcomer to an Australian university, my knowledge of research developed through three stages, by using my combined bilingual and ICT competences.

During the first stage, I tried to understand the English language literature by using Chinese translations, without thinking that I was in Australia and needed to think only in English. I took my Chinese language as an advantage. I found it helpful to understand and memorise English by actually thinking in Chinese. However, I also wanted to think in English, but at this early stage in my learning there were no English thoughts that I could bring to bear to improve my understanding. Therefore, Chinese translations were an efficient way of assisting me to learn. I translated unknown English concepts into Chinese by looking for them in an electronic English-Chinese dictionary. Writing the Chinese translations helped me to understand the concepts’ meaning, and also assisted me to remember them.

During the middle stage, I tried to use bilingual translation to help practise my English thinking. With the accumulation of new words through reading, listening and writing, I felt that I could gradually rid myself of any assistance needed from the English-Chinese dictionary. I was using English more freely, even though I still had
many language problems which my Principal supervisor helped overcome with corrective feedback. At the time I took comfort in knowing that George W. Bush, who was then President of the USA, is popularly known for his struggles with the English language. I deliberately began to train myself in the English way of thinking by practising English-Chinese and Chinese-English translations. This learning process we called ‘learning zigzag’ (Singh & Guo, 2008a). I think that abandoning the Chinese way of thinking to learn English was not as effective as, or faster than, this practice of ‘zigzag learning’. However, the former strategy had been built up over more than thirty years of English language education in China, so the thought, ‘stop thinking in Chinese’ was often spoken by myself. Therefore, I considered that a proper way of accessing knowledge in English in Australia during this middle stage was not to exclude my mother’s language but to rely on the Chinese way of thinking to help me learn the English way of thinking. The best way I found to do this was to practise my bilingual translation competence. I am familiar with conversion rules for the two languages regarding their common and different points. The English way of thinking developed gradually during this process. The faster that I practised this bilingual translation process, the quicker I formed the English way of thinking. Both the ‘zigzag learning’ process and the ICT resources I used, assisted in shortening the Chinese-English transmission process, and so helped me enter the third stage more quickly.

The third stage was an advanced and enjoyable stage of learning, as it gave me a way of thinking in English independent of Chinese. I now consider that the most important and difficult stage for me was not the third step but the second. The relationship between the Chinese and English ways of thinking is like an adult teaching a child to walk. Taking Chinese as the adult and the English as the beginning walker, the more walking the child does, the faster the child learns to walk, so eventually he/she can even run independently. However, the advanced stage of the English way of thinking cannot be reached except through the long intermediate stage. Further, there were no dynamic turning points to indicate when I entered the third stage; it was only achieved through continuous effort during the middle stage.

Looking back at the development I have achieved in the English way of thinking, this has given me an answer to the question posed at the beginning of this section. I am
now of the view that the use of my mother’s language and the Chinese way of thinking did no harm to my learning of advanced academic English in Australia. Instead, it paved a way for me to learn English more efficiently.

I also found another interesting issue during my bilingual language practices in my learning to be a researcher in Australia. That is, the more I accessed English, the more respect I gained for my mother’s language. It is interesting that I generated this thought during my focus on second language learning. I did not know how great the Chinese language was until my English competence achieved a relatively advanced level. I began to think through the relationship between the two languages during my learning of knowledge about research. The more I learn English, the more I love to re-read Chinese literature; something which I had neglected for some time. Now I find Chinese a source of respect and pride. English has proven to be a foil to deepen my love of Chinese.

In turn, I also understand the greatness, exactness and succinctness of English, as expressed in western education research. Take an English concept like ‘substance’ for example, which is simple and clear to understand. In Chinese, ‘substance’ can be translated as ‘wuzhi’. This is a combination of two characters, ‘wu’ and ‘zhi’, which mean respectively ‘material’ and ‘quality’. This combination forms a two-syllable concept that is easy to pronounce and has an aesthetically pleasing sound. However, when pronounced for its rhythm this sacrifices the accuracy of the concept, and people may be confused as to whether to understand it as ‘material’ or ‘quality’. This brings uncertainty to communication. It increases or allows for biases in both understanding and expression, and so increases difficulties in education research. Such words appear to be used for logical thinking and computing symbols in research.

I found using my ICT bilingual competences to access knowledge in a Western research environment to be a quite enjoyable process. This was especially so when my Chinese language worked like a mirror, enabling me to see the sincerity of English. My English language is a mirror that enables me to see the profundity of Chinese. I am very glad to have been involved in these research activities in Australia. By using my multi-competences I am finally having some fun accessing
the important knowledge available in these two languages. Are there conflicts involved in accessing knowledge in both my mother’s language and English? I found that it was not contradictory but that each fitted together in harmony. My bilingual learning competence is like having two legs: one moves to make the other move further.

My three years of doctoral studies have come to an end with the completion of this thesis. These reasons for me undertaking this study are still awake in my heart. I have tried my best to devote all my effort to this research. I finally understand how doing research or questioning a truth also constructs the knowledgeable researcher. Looking at my table and floor with messy papers, diagrams and evidence, I remember the depressed feelings I had about my initial confusion over research questions, methods, theories, and the complications of analysing evidence. But, now, the direction for doing this research has never been so clear, it all appears so coherently in front of my eyes. I have gradually grown up. The road of research has taken me through doing this doctoral study with considerable help from my principal supervisor. I am on the way to choosing the possibility of researching more questions.
REFERENCES


APPENDIX 1: Survey questionnaire for OTTs

IMMIGRANT TEACHERS IN AUSTRALIA SURVEY
INSTRUCTIONS: Please tick boxes or fill in answers where appropriate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEACHER HISTORY</th>
<th>Response/Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Please list your Teaching Qualifications (including date and education institution and country)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Qualification/exam – Institution – Year - Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>How many years of tertiary teacher training have you had?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Please list countries where you have taught and the years in each country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>In what areas did you have teaching qualifications prior to coming to Australia? [Please tick boxes]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ early childhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ primary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ tertiary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>In what areas of the curriculum do you teach (primary or secondary)? If secondary, what key learning areas?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4.______________________________________________</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

24 This is the survey that was developed and used as part of the ARC Global Teachers Project by chief investigators Dr Carol Reid, Professor Jock Collins and Professor Michael Singh. Survey data for immigrant teachers from NSW was selected for use in this thesis.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Why did you decide to come to Australia to teach?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Are you a member of a trade union?</td>
<td>☐ Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>☐ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>When did you first start teaching in Australia?</td>
<td>☐ Year______</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>☐ Not started teaching yet (Go to Q. 10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Where was your first Australian teaching job?</td>
<td>State:___________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Territory:_______________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>City:___________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Suburb:_______________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Town:___________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Please briefly outline the steps you undertook/are undertaking to</td>
<td>1._________________________________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>achieve recognition as a teacher in Australia?</td>
<td>2._________________________________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3._________________________________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4._________________________________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5._________________________________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Did you undertake a <em>teacher induction program</em>?</td>
<td>☐ Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>☐ Part of the program?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>☐ No (Go to Q.13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>What features of the induction programs have you found useful/not</td>
<td>Useful ____________________________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>useful? Please explain.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Not useful ____________________________________________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Response</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Where are you currently teaching? State:___________________________</td>
<td>Territory:________________________ City:_______________________________</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburb:________________________ Town:____________________________</td>
<td>☐ Not teaching yet (Go to Q. 15)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Is the school where you now teach in the government or non-government sector? [tick boxes]</td>
<td>☐ government ☐ non- government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Is/will your employment be permanent, temporary, or casual? [tick answer]</td>
<td>☐ Permanent ☐ Temporary ☐ Casual Other?__________________________</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Did you experience unemployment in Australia? [please tick]</td>
<td>☐ Not applicable as just arrived ☐ Yes ☐ No For how long?________Years_________Months</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 What strengths do you bring with you as a teacher in Australia?</td>
<td>[comment]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Have these strengths benefited the school community as a teacher in Australia?</td>
<td>☐ Yes, especially ______________________________________________________</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ No, because of ______________________________________________________</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

321
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>What difficulties, if any, have you faced as an immigrant teacher in Australia?</td>
<td>[comment]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>How did you resolve these difficulties?</td>
<td>[comment]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 21| Please indicate by circling your degree of confidence with language:     | English language 1 2 3 4 5  
Student informal language (slang) 1 2 3 4 5  
Subject specific language 1 2 3 4 5 |
|   | 1-no confidence….5 high confidence?                                      | 1. Strongly disagree  
2. Disagree  
3. Neither agree nor disagree  
4. Agree  
5. Strongly agree |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 23 Do you intend to seek opportunities for professional advancement as a teacher while in Australia? [please tick] | □ Yes  
□ No  
[please explain] |
| 24 Have your expectations of being a teacher in Australia been met? [please tick] | □ Yes  
□ Partly  
□ No  
[please explain] |
| 25 Did you experience a difference between your values and the local community? [please tick] | □ Yes, especially ____________________________________________________  
____________________________________________________________________  
____________________________________________________________________  
□ No, because _________________________________________________________  
____________________________________________________________________  
____________________________________________________________________  
[please explain] |
| 26 From whom did you get your most valuable support as an immigrant teacher? |                                                                 |
| 27 From your professional experience as an immigrant teacher in Australia please indicate your ratings of the adequacy of professional assistance 1. Not adequate…5. Highly adequate. [circle] | General Support 1 2 3 4 5  
Induction 1 2 3 4 5  
Placement 1 2 3 4 5  
Professional Development 1 2 3 4 5  
Information 1 2 3 4 5 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Please comment on your satisfaction as a teacher in Australia from a professional perspective?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Please comment on your satisfaction as a teacher in Australia from a personal perspective?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>In general, how does teachers’ work in Australia compare with that in other countries? (follow up with focus groups)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ very favourably</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ favourably</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ not very favourably</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ very unfavourably</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Explain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Have you or would you recommend to other immigrant teachers that they teach in Australia?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[please explain]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>In five (5) years time do you see yourself teaching in Australia? [please tick]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[please explain]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Do you intend to teach in another country in the near future? [please tick]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[please explain]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>If you were able to make one major change to education policies or procedures, what would that change be?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Are there any other matters relevant to your experience as an immigrant teacher in Australia that you would like to mention?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BACKGROUND</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>What is your country of birth?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>What are the countries of birth of your parents? Mother:_________________________ Father:_________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>What is/are the main languages spoken at home?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>What is your gender? [please tick] □ Male □ Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>What is your age? ________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>What is your religion?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IMMIGRATION HISTORY</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>What countries did you live in prior to coming to Australia? List in chronological order. • Most recent 1 • Next most recent 2 1. _____________________________ 2. _____________________________ 3. _____________________________ 4. _____________________________ 5. _____________________________ 6. _____________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>What year did you arrive in Australia as an immigrant teacher? Year ________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Are you a temporary or permanent  Temporary YES/NO [if yes, go to Q44] Permanent YES/NO [if yes, go to Q45]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 If Temporary, What is your Visa category</td>
<td>[go to Q46]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 If Permanent, what was your immigration category of entry?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47 Do you intend to apply for Australian citizenship sometime in the future?</td>
<td>□ Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other __________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 Did you come to Australia with the specific intention to teach?</td>
<td>□ Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other, explain __________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49 Why did you want to teach in Australia?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 Since coming to Australia have you regularly attended any of the following activities?</td>
<td>□ religious activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ activities arranged by local school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ activities organized by people from your home country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ activities arranged by the local community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ activities involving sports or hobbies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ other, specify _____________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ none of these</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51 If you have children, do they attend a government or non-government school? (or will attend if just arrived)</td>
<td>□ Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ Non-government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>If non-government what is the religious denomination?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ I have no children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>□ My children have finished school</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Would you like to discuss your experiences further in a short focus group session (60mins)?
If yes, please fill in contact details below.
THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR TAKING TIME TO COMPLETE THIS SURVEY
APPENDIX 2: Interview schedule for OTT interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicative questions for interviews with immigrant teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. How and why did you come to be a teacher in Australia? (Probe: Do you feel as though you are as fully involved Australian schools and society as much as you would like? Why or why not?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How have Federal and/or State Government policies made possible, or caused challenges for you becoming a teacher in Australia? (Probe: Which factors do you think are the most important to your future career and personal development as an immigrant teacher?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. What do you see as some of the defining incidents in your experiences of being a teacher in Australia? (Probe: What is the most difficult problem you have faced in Australian schools?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What do you think of being a teacher in Australia? (Probe: How does it compare with being a teacher in your former homeland? How have/will you survive your beginning years of teaching in Australia? Do you feel that you belong to Australian schools and Australian society? Why or why not?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. What are some of the important things you have learnt overseas about teaching? (Probes, e.g. with respect to teacher/student relationships? Use of curriculum resources? Lesson preparation? Assessment? Teaching strategies?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. What networks in Australia or from overseas have you drawn upon into helping you to do your teaching here in Australia? (Probe: Who or what is the most helpful to your work and study in Australia or from overseas?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. How have you used your knowledge of a second language in your teaching in Australia? (Probe: How do you deal with language, cultural and/or behavioral problems?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. How have you used knowledge you acquired overseas in your teaching in Australia? (Probe: In what areas have you found it necessary to improve your teaching here in Australia? Why?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. What is your assessment of the prospects for migrant teachers from working in Australian schools? (Probe: Will you stay in teaching even if Australian schools can not guarantee your permanent position? Do you want to take teaching as your lifetime career? Where would you really prefer to be teaching and why?)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 3: Information statement

Project title: Policy considerations regarding immigrant teachers working in Australian schools

You are invited to participate in this research project which is being conducted for my PhD candidature. This research project will investigate the experiences of immigrant teachers working schools in New South Wales (NSW, Australia) in order to better understand the support such teachers require to work in metropolitan, rural and regional areas in multicultural Australia. It will compare the experiences of immigrant teachers with respect to their experiences of and/or desires for mobility. The data set to be generated for this study includes policy texts, questionnaires, focus groups and in-depth interviews. During the course of focus groups with teachers participants will be asked to take part in semi-structured interviews to gain more detailed insights into these issues. This data set will be analysed to explore the implications for policy-makers in Australia regarding the attraction and retention of globally-mobile immigrant teachers.

The outcome of the work will be a thesis and publications in academic and professional journals. Access to this material will be made available to participants on request ([w.guo@uws.edu.au](mailto:w.guo@uws.edu.au)).

The parts of the research involve:

- complete a survey and if interested agree to:
- attending a 1 hour focus group;
- attending a 45-60 minutes semi-structure interview;
- consent to be audio taped
- share your knowledge, skills and experience.

All data collected for this study will be confidential. Neither the names of individuals or organisations will be identified in publications arising from this study. Volunteers who agree to participate in this study are completely free to withdraw at any time.
they wish, and to do so without any need for explanation. If a participant wishes to withdraw, then any information that has been collected from or about that person will be destroyed if the person so requests.

I am conducting this PhD research project through the Centre for Educational Research, School of Education, University of Western Sydney. My Principal Supervisor is Professor Michael Singh, and his contact number is 4736 0186. This study forms part of a larger ARC Linkage project led by Dr Carol Reid; more information about this project is available on request.

Yours sincerely,

Mr. Wei Guo
PhD Candidate, Centre for Educational Research, University of Western Sydney, Locked Bag 1797, Penrith DC N.S.W. 1797, Australia, Telephone: (02) 4736 0459, Fax: (02) 4736 0499, w.guo@uws.edu.au

NOTE: This study has been approved by the University of Western Sydney Human Research Ethics Committee. The approval number is 07/163. If you have any complaints or reservations about the ethical conduct of this research, you may contact the Ethics Committee through the Research Ethics Officers (tel: 02 4736 0883 or 4736 0884). Any issues you raise will be treated in confidence and investigated fully, and you will be informed of the outcome.
APPENDIX 4: Consent form

UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN SYDNEY
HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE
Consent Form For Persons Participating In Research Projects Involving Interviews, Questionnaires or Disclosure of Personal Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL</th>
<th>School of Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research Centre</td>
<td>Centre for Educational Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Title:</td>
<td>Policy considerations regarding immigrant teachers working in Australian schools</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Name(s) of investigators: (1) Wei Guo

Phone: 02-47360459

Name of participant:

1. I have received a statement explaining the interviews involved in this project.

2. I consent to participate in the above project, the particulars of which - including details of the interviews - have been explained to me.

3. I consent to be involved in:
   (a) Focus groups
   (b) Semi-structured interviews

4. I authorise the investigator or his or her assistant to interview me or administer a questionnaire.

5. I acknowledge that:
   (a) Having read the Plain Language Statement, I agree to the general purpose, methods and demands of the study.
   (b) I have been informed that I am free to withdraw from the project at any time and to withdraw any unprocessed data previously supplied.
   (c) The project is for the purpose of research and/or teaching. It may not be of direct benefit to me.
   (d) The privacy of the information I provide will be safeguarded. However should information of a private nature need to be disclosed for moral, clinical or legal reasons, I will be given an opportunity to negotiate the terms of this disclosure.
   (e) The security of the research data is assured during and after completion of the study. The data collected during the study may be published, and a report of the project outcomes will be provided to University of Western Sydney, and the Federal Department of Education, Science and Training.
   (f) Any information which will identify me will not be used.

Participant’s Consent

Name: ___________________________ Date: ___________________________

(Participant)

Name: ___________________________ Date: ___________________________

(Witness to signature)

Participants will be given a photocopy of this consent form after it has been signed.

NOTE: This study has been approved by the University of Western Sydney Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any complaints or reservations about the ethical conduct of this research, you may contact the Ethics Committee through the Research Ethics Officers (tel: 02 4570 1136). Any issues you raise will be treated in confidence and investigated fully, and you will be informed of the outcome.
## APPENDIX 5: Profile of interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Country of origin</th>
<th>Current jobs</th>
<th>Date of interview</th>
<th>Interview venue</th>
<th>Mode of interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alka</td>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td>Permanent teacher</td>
<td>2 July 08</td>
<td>school</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanessa</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>University staff</td>
<td>13 July 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>University staff</td>
<td>19 August 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anita</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Teacher assistant</td>
<td>10 August 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinmayi</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Institution staff</td>
<td>25 June 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edward</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Teacher in a remote school</td>
<td>24 June 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judy</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Permanent teacher</td>
<td>17 August 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magen</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Teacher in a remote school</td>
<td>15 May 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veronika</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>Primary teacher</td>
<td>27 May 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Company staff</td>
<td>6 June 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>19 August 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>11 August 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timothy</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>26 August 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sujit</td>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td>Permanent teacher</td>
<td>4 June 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medlyn</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>18 August 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>12 August 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>16 June 08</td>
<td>UWS</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vallika</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Permanent teacher</td>
<td>12 March 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jihad</td>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>Permanent teacher</td>
<td>4 June 08</td>
<td>Participant’s place</td>
<td>Face to face (F)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

25 Interviews with Sujit and Jihad are not used in this thesis study due to technical problems.
APPENDIX 6: An email of invitation to potential interview participants

Dear ____________,

You have received this email as you consented to take part in interviews or focus groups for overseas trained teachers.

As a part of the ARC project “Global Teacher Movements” organised by UWS, UTS, NSW DET and the NSW Teachers Federation, we are conducting focus groups and interviews to understand more about your experiences so that we can suggest ways to improve policies and procedures as well as provide recommendations for appropriate professional development.

We would like to record the interview or focus group in which you participate.

There are four places around Sydney that you might choose to take part in either a focus group or interview. They are:

1. University of Western Sydney, Penrith Campus
2. University of Western Sydney, Parramatta Campus;
3. University of Western Sydney, Bankstown Campus;
4. University of Technology, Sydney, City Campus

Could you please advise us a range of times that are convenient for you for participating in an interview or focus group within the next four weeks? Could you also advise as to which of the above venues best suits you for participating in either of these activities?

If this does not prove convenient, we would be interested in conducting a telephone interview with you. Or we can travel to your indicated venues. Could you please advise of your interest in doing this and suitable times.

Your participation in this project will be greatly appreciated. It will give the NSW DET and the NSW Teachers Federation a depth of knowledge and understanding needed to inform policy and program developments necessary to meeting the needs of overseas trained teachers.

Thanks and kind regards

Wei Guo

Research Assistant and PhD Candidate
ARC Global teacher Movements Project
Centre for Educational Research
University of Western Sydney
Kingswood Campus
Room K2.29
Phone 02 47360459
Email: w.guo@uws.edu.au
APPENDIX 7: Ethics approval letter from University of Western Sydney

28 August 2007

Wei Guo
49 Second Avenue
Kingswood NSW 2747

Dear Wei,

HREC Number 07/163 Policy considerations regarding beginning teachers working in Australian schools: The local/global mobility of knowledge workers from the Asia-Pacific region

The Committee has agreed to fully approve the project noted above. Please note that you will be required to seek approval from the NSW Department of Education via their SERAP process before conducting this research.

You are advised that the Committee should be notified of any further changes to the research methodology should there be any in the future. You will be required to provide a report on the ethical aspects of your project at the completion of this project. The report form is located on the Research Services Ethics Web Page and is a mandatory requirement of this approval.

The Protocol Number HREC 07/163 should be quoted in all future correspondence about this project. Your approval will expire 31 December 2009. Please contact the Human Ethics Officer, Kay Buckley on tel: 02 47 360 883 if you require any further information.

The Committee wishes you well with your research.

Yours sincerely,

[Signature]

Associate Professor Christine Halse
Chairperson
UWS Human Research Ethics Committee
APPENDIX 8: Ethics approval letter from NSW Department of Education and Training

PLANNING AND INNOVATION

Dr Carol Reid  
School of Education  
Bankstown Campus  
University of Western Sydney  
Locked Bag 1797 Penrith South DC  
BANKSTOWN NSW 1797  
AUSTRALIA

Dear Dr Reid  
SERAP Number 2007007

I refer to your application to conduct a research project in NSW government schools entitled "Globalisation and teacher movements into and out of multicultural Australia." I am pleased to inform you that your application has been approved. You may now contact the Principals of the nominated schools to seek their participation.

This approval will remain valid until 12 November 2008.

The following researchers or research assistants have fulfilled the Working with Children screening requirements to interact with or observe children for the purposes of this research for the period indicated:

Name: Wei Guo  
Approval expires: 10/05/2008

You should include a copy of this letter with the documents you send to schools.

I draw your attention to the following requirements for all researchers in NSW government schools:

- School Principals have the right to withdraw the school from the study at any time. The approval of the Principal for the specific method of gathering information for the school must also be sought.
- The privacy of the school and the students is to be protected.
- The participation of teachers and students must be voluntary and must be at the school’s convenience.
- Any proposal to publish the outcomes of the study should be discussed with the Research Approvals Officer before publication proceeds.

When your study is completed please forward your report marked to General Manager, Planning and Innovation, Department of Education and Training, GPO Box 33, Sydney, NSW 2001.

Yours sincerely

Andrew Rolfe  
A/General Manager, Planning and Innovation  
13 November 07

* Level 6, 35 Bridge Street  * GPO Box 33  * Sydney NSW 2001 Australia  *
* telephone 02 61 3 9561 8746  * facsimile 02 61 2 9561 8911  * www.det.nsw.edu.au  *

335
APPENDIX 9: List of documents from NSW Department of Education and Training and NSW Teachers Federation


NSW DET. (2007). DET/TF Management Committee Item no. 27/07 – Response to Request to have PEAT tests conducted in Regional Centres. (2 page letter from Industrial Relations Directorate, NSW DET, 8 August 2007, available from NSW Teachers Federation, 23-33 Mary Street, Surry Hills, Sydney, 2010).


