Singing the Lord’s Song in a Strange Land:
Compositional Voice
Towards Expression of Christian Transcendence

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF CREATIVE ARTS

from the
UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN SYDNEY

by

Hilary Clare Maclean, B.Mus. (Hons), University of Sydney

SCHOOL OF COMMUNICATION ARTS

2009
Abstract

This thesis explores the musical expression of Christian transcendence in my folio of compositions. The “Lord’s song” of the thesis title is a reference to Psalm 137, in which the Psalmist, in exile in Babylon, asks “how shall we sing the Lord’s song in a strange land?” (King James). This question could be paraphrased, in terms of the thesis, as “how can the transcendent be expressed in the material form of music?”

The transcendent is primarily expressed in these compositions by static referential pitches which symbolise the immanence of the eternal within the temporal, and by the use of borrowed musical material that has associations of transcendence. The compositions are seen as places that contain the transcendent and in which the transcendent may be met, and these places are likened to a musical ‘nest’ in which my own and borrowed musical materials are woven together.

The compositional credo discusses ways that music refers to and contains the transcendent through the voices of the composer, other musics and the transcendent at work in the process of composition. The chapter on compositional voice and craft lays out the general principles of mosaic form and modal voice-leading that are at work in these pieces. Three chapters cover individual works in detail, showing how they express particular aspects of the transcendent drawn from their texts or titles.
Acknowledgement

I wish firstly to acknowledge and say thankyou for the many insights and generous support that I received from my supervisor, Dr. Bruce Crossman, in the initiation and development of this project. I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Diana Blom for her invaluable help and suggestions in the writing of the thesis.

I would like to express my gratitude to Philip Barnes and the St Louis Chamber Chorus for the position of composer-in-residence which has led to a fruitful collaboration, and to Dick and Marilyn Brickson and Sondra and Dorsey Ellis for commissioning *Psalm 137* and *Misera, Ancor do Loco*. I am also grateful to Paul Stanhope and the Sydney Chamber Choir for recording the *Osanna Mass* (in progress) and other works for release on CD.

I am indebted to Jon Garrett for typesetting three of the choral works and Steve Clark for giving much needed help and advice with formatting. I would also like to thank my mother Josepheen and Gillis Maclean for advice and encouragement, and Mary and Barry Carroll for their hospitality and a place to compose. Finally, I would like to thank my family for their support and good humour, and particularly my husband John Carroll for his inspiration and help in the process of research.
Statement of Authentication

The work presented in this thesis is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, original except as acknowledged in the text. I hereby declare that I have not submitted this material, either in full or in part, for a degree at this or any other institution.
# Contents

## Introduction

**Chapter One:** Compositional Voice Towards Expression of Christian Transcendence
- Thesis Structure ........................................... 2
- Thesis Perspective ........................................... 5

## Part One: Credo

**Chapter Two:** Compositional Credo ................................. 7
- Types of Transcendence ..................................... 7
- Music and the Transcendent ................................ 9
  - ‘Voice’ as Connection to the ‘Transcendent’ ............... 10
- Music as Place .................................................. 14
  - The ‘Between’ as Analogy for Music as Place ............ 15
  - The Tabernacle as Analogy for Music as Place ........... 16
- Pitch and Musical Space ..................................... 17
- Musical Symbolism in the Folio Works ....................... 19
  - Musical Metaphor and Remaining Notes ................... 19
  - Extra-musical Association ................................. 26
- Summary ......................................................... 33

## Part Two: Context

**Chapter Three:** Compositional Voice and Craft .................. 35
- Schenkerian Long Range Pitch Connections .................. 36
  - Pitch Summary Notation .................................... 40
- Remaining Notes .............................................. 40
- Voice Leading .................................................. 43
  - ‘Centonization’ as Arrangement of Musical Ideas ......... 48
- Form .............................................................. 51
  - Form and Unity ............................................... 60
- Summary ......................................................... 62

## Part Three: Analysis

**Chapter Four:** Transcendence in Secular and Sacred Choral Works .................................................. 65
- *Os Anthos Chortou* (As the Flower of the Grass) ............ 66
- Desire and Distance in *Fragment 31* ......................... 67
- *Misera Ancor do Loco* ....................................... 76
- Harmonic Form and Blurring the ‘Image’ .................... 86
Introduction
Chapter One

Compositional Voice Towards Expression of Christian Transcendence

And may the sweetness of the Master our God be upon us

and the work of our hands firmly found for us,

and the work of our hands firmly found!

(Psalm 30: 17, Alter 320)

My aim in writing music, in accord with the Psalmist’s perspective, is to make a connection to the transcendent. This thesis is an explanation of the ways in which my music, or the work of my ‘hands,’ expresses the transcendent, or to use the metaphor of the thesis title, how this material music sings “the Lord’s song.” The expression of the transcendent in my music entails two aspects: voice (line and identity) and nesting (eclectic and symbolic gathering of musical materials) which aim to point to and make a place for the transcendent Christian God.

Thesis Structure

The discussion of my musical expression of transcendence is structured in the thesis in three parts: Credo, Context and Analysis. These sections are based on a collection of musical principles: ‘remaining notes,’ free voice-leading, musical nesting or ‘centonization’ (the gathering and arranging of my own and borrowed material), harmonic stasis, modal colour and density, and sonic symbols. These principles are argued in relation to the Credo’s concepts of voice and nest in relation to the transcendent, with reference to musical analysis of the contextual and folio works.
In part one, the “Compositional Credo” (chapter two), I discuss the musical expression of transcendence as a guiding philosophy. I explain my view of the relationship between music and the transcendent, drawing on the work of Christian philosopher William Desmond and essayist George Steiner, and the ways in which my music expresses the transcendent. While identifying my view of the transcendent with the Christian God, I note that my observations on the relationship between music and the transcendent can be seen in the light of other views of the transcendent. I refer to Steiner’s claim that all music (and all art) is a wager on transcendence or on the existence of meaning beyond the material world, and I further speculate that the transcendent inhabits musical works through the enigmatic engagement of voices beyond the composer’s own in the process of writing. As well as the voices of the composer and the transcendent, there are other human voices which speak in the creation of musical works, through the influence and quotation of other music. I borrow the term ‘centonization’ (used originally to describe the making of plainchant melodies from pre-existing formulas) to refer to the way shared musical gestures and sometimes quotations are combined and recombined in the writing of music. The extensive weaving of borrowed melodies into my own music is seen as a reference to the transcendent in its allusion to time past, and so to what is beyond time. Lastly, I describe the ways my music symbolises the eternal transcendent through the use of static pitch threads made up of what I call ‘remaining notes,’ and creates a place to contain the transcendent by weaving these threads, together with my own and other melodies, making a musical ‘nest’ to contain the transcendent.

In part two, within “Compositional Voice and Craft” (chapter three), the technical context and conceptual details of my creative process are examined. The idea that significant or ‘remaining’ notes maintain relationships even when they are
not sounding is shown to have its basis in the theories of Heinrich Schenker, although
the harmonic structures of my music do not conform to his structural model, but are
closer to the less directed harmonic forms of Debussy. On a local level, my music has
shown an abiding influence of the modal polyphonic textures of Renaissance choral
music, while employing a freer voice-leading that has similarities to the music of
Machaut. The term ‘centonization’ is applied to the combining of borrowed melodies
and melodic fragments, and extended to the level of form, where mosaic structures of
my music are compared to similar structures in Messiaen, Stravinsky, plainchant and
blackbird song. These structures also have some relationship to mosaic forms in the
Gospel of Mark, Isaiah and the Song of Songs.

In part three, musical techniques and symbolisms of transcendence in the
compositional portfolio are analysed in a series of chapters, ranging from secular
choral and ‘hidden’ sacred instrumental works through to the sacred Mass.
“Transcendence in Secular and Sacred Choral Works” (chapter four) analyses four
unaccompanied choral pieces, and how they express themes in their texts of love,
desire, memory and distance, both on a human level and as they relate to the
transcendent. These works are Os Anthos Chortou (2004), Misera, Ancor do Loco
(2007), Vive in Deo (2007) and Psalm 137 (2009). Continuing with the less obvious
expression of the transcendent, “Expression of the Transcendent through Birds, Bells
and Octatonicism” (chapter five) examines the instrumental works in the folio—the
orchestral piece Panah (2007) and the trio Lai (2008). Both express the immanent
presence of the transcendent through harmonic stasis, derived from bell sounds in
Panah, bird song in Lai, and in both, an octatonicism influenced by Toru Takemitsu,
who also used octatonicism to express the eternal.
A more direct expression of the transcendent is discussed in “Osanna Mass: Using Musical Sources to Create Pictures of the Transcendent” (chapter six). The choral Mass Osanna (2005-8) is compared to an illuminated manuscript in the way it expresses the text of the Mass. Borrowed plainchant and Jewish liturgical melodies bring with them symbolic associations derived from their texts, and the Mass text is also illustrated by the use of modal colour and an overall tonal imagery of ‘darker’ and ‘lighter’ keys. The five movements are bound together by the use of common ‘remaining notes,’ again symbolic of the transcendent, and recurring musical ideas taken from the borrowed melodies.

**Thesis Perspective**

The thesis is written from the perspective of a “reflective practitioner”\(^1\). Drawing on the approaches of other composers, as well as the theories of Schenker and ideas from Desmond and Steiner, it explains my processes of composition from the inside, rather than presenting an objective or exhaustive analysis of my works. This explanation aims to support the thesis proposition that my compositional voice expresses aspects of Christian transcendence, and begins by outlining the philosophical basis of this voice in the “Compositional Credo.”

---

\(^1\) This term was coined by Donald Schön in his book on reflective practice (*The Reflective Practitioner*), and refers particularly to his concept of “reflect[ing] on action,” or thinking back on actions that have been performed (qtd in Blom, 112).
Part One:

Credo
Chapter Two

Compositional Credo

The purpose of the compositional credo is to explore the relationship of music and the transcendent from my philosophical and compositional point of view, and to thus explain the context in which the accompanying folio of works was written. I will begin by looking at definitions of the transcendent and situating myself within these, and will go on to examine some aspects of the relationship between music and the transcendent, drawing on the work of William Desmond and George Steiner. The discussion will cover three main areas: compositional voice as a vehicle for an exchange of human and divine voices; music as a place to contain and in which to connect with the transcendent; and symbolism of the transcendent in my music. In my compositional voice, the primary agents of musical symbolism are pitch devices, particularly the use of static referential pitches, and extra-musical associations through the use of borrowed musical material. The dialogue with past music, another exchange of voices, also implicates the eternal transcendent in that its allusion to time past and human finitude points to what is beyond both time and mortality.

Types of Transcendence

The word transcendence has several possible definitions. Hans Kung’s book on Mozart bears the title *Traces of Transcendence*, and transcendence here is used in what Kung calls its real sense of divine transcendence (p.30). Richard Toop, in his article “On Complexity” talks about the continual pursuit of transcendence in the history of Western art music (43)—in this context, the meaning of transcendence can
be understood as the surpassing of previous limitations of compositional and performance techniques.

The philosopher William Desmond has defined three types of transcendence. The first type, T1, is the transcendence of “beings as other,” as exterior to one’s self and not the product of one’s own thought. Their and our existence gives rise to the question, “why beings and not nothing?” and to the thought that there may be possibilities of transcendence beyond this first kind of transcendence (Desmond, Art 268). A second kind of transcendence, T2, is self-transcendence or transcendence within a human being, the surpassing of what the self has been into new territories of knowledge and capability, and this is the transcendence that Richard Toop was referring to. It is an interior rather than an exterior transcendence, and it opens up possibilities of growth, self-determination and creativity. Again, questions arise, about the possible extent and direction of this transcendence—is it an “over-reaching into emptiness,” or does human self-surpassing point to a transcendence beyond self and others, towards transcendence as Other? (268-9).

The nature of a third type of transcendence beyond T1 and T2 can be understood in several ways. It can be seen as an unknowable “beyond” to the material world, “the unnameable source of everything about which we cannot speak,” as in the negative theology of the theologian-philosopher John Caputo (Zimmerman 255). It can be seen as an immanent ground of being that, as a vital essence, transcends the phenomena of the material world which it imbues, but is not transcendent in the sense that it exists apart from materiality. There are diverse outworkings of this view, from Buddhism (Koozin, Toru 39-40 and Spiritual 186)\(^1\) to Heidegger, Derrida and

\(^1\) In Buddhism this view is not the product of reason as it is in Western philosophy. Suzuki writes that the phrase “One in All and All in One” expresses neither transcendentalism or immanence, and can not be grasped by the intellect but only by experience, by accepting “Reality as it is or in its suchness” (32, 35).
Deleuze (Millbank 227-28 and Shusterman 100-02). This third kind of transcendence can also be seen as the higher power of esoteric spiritualities such as Freemasonry, Theosophy and Gnosticism or, finally, as an Origin that is transcendent to the created world but not completely unknowable, as found in different forms in Judaism, Christianity and Islam. Desmond posits such a transcendence, calling it T3, as the “most ultimate possibilising source” of the other two types of transcendence. It is a transcendence that is not interior [T2] or exterior [T1] but superior, preceding and exceeding all that it makes possible (Desmond, Art 268). The definition of T3 that I adhere to is the last one listed here, applied to the Judeo-Christian God, but my discussion of the relationship between music and the third type of transcendence can often be read in the light of other of these definitions.

Music and the Transcendent

Music has had a long association with the transcendent; religion or communication with the supernatural is perhaps the only context for music which is universal (Mithen 13, 271). Augustine said that “Sound is the understanding of the heart,” because music can express what cannot be said of the “ineffable God” (qtd in Østrem 291). For Schopenhauer, music above all the arts expressed or objectified the Origin in its “logical silence;” it “lets us sing the will, or hear it” (Desmond, Art 144, 153). Bonhoeffer called culture penultimate (Zimmerman 301) and to Desmond also.

2 The philosophies of Heidegger, Derrida and Deleuze hinge on a dualism between an absolute “higher conditioning power” or vital essence (Being, différence and “a life,” or the plane of immanence, respectively) and a “lower conditioned reality” of particular phenomena (Millbank 227). Derrida’s differential relations between “things and elements” that have no presence or being outside of these relations take place within a whole that, like Hegel’s and Nietzsche’s wholes, is a milieu of relationships without transcendence (Shusterman 101-2). Shusterman argues that deconstructionist critiques of the aesthetic concept of organic unity are in fact founded on the idea of différence as part of an organic totality of interconnected elements (102 and 107).
music and the arts face beyond themselves, and are addressed by what exceeds them (Art 291). For the composers Olivier Messiaen, Sofia Gubaidulina and Toru Takemitsu, music is a means of making a connection with the transcendent. Through his music, Takemitsu aimed to bring the listener into contact with a transcendent spiritual presence (Koozin, "Spiritual-temporal" 185). Messiaen, whose music contemplated and worshipped God (Johnson 183) believed that, though God is not representable, he is perceivable, and that “music… should and …can bring its listeners into profound contact with the divine” (Pople 47). For Gubaidulina, her music is a vehicle for an exchange of the brokenness or “staccato” of life for an experience of the divine in which music, as a Eucharistic-like sacrament (Lukomsky 23), effects a reconnection or “re-ligare”\(^3\) to the transcendent (Beyer 43).

George Steiner, in his book Real Presences, speaks of an “otherness” residing in works of art, and wrote that “through music we are most immediately in the presence of the logically, of the verbally inexpressible but wholly palpable energy in being that communicates to our senses and to our reflection what little we can grasp of the naked wonder of life” (210). It does indeed seem natural that a wordless medium should be used to express what is beyond words\(^4\), but while music is not verbal in itself, it is intimately connected with voices or voicing.

‘Voice’ as Connection to the Transcendent

These statements about the connection of music and the transcendent reveal a kind of ‘commerce’ or exchange of voices, with art looking to the transcendent and the transcendent residing in art. The word ‘voice’ contains a constellation of ideas

---

\(^3\) *Ligare* in Latin means to fasten or bind fast, and is a root of the Italian word *legato* (‘bound’) and a possible root of the word ‘religion’ (“Religion”).

\(^4\) Mithen suggests that this is one reason for music’s long connection with religion (271-2).
that shed light on the relationship between music and the transcendent, and which centre around two senses of the word: that of line, and expression or intent.

There are lines on the surface of many styles of music, for example the ‘voices’ in tonal harmony and counterpoint, and there can be lines below the surface as well, making connections between notes which are not close together in time. This concept was developed by Heinrich Schenker from the idea of melodic diminutions that were used to ornament simpler melodic lines. Schenker went further and transferred the idea of ornamentation from the musical surface to an underlying level (Cook, “Schenker, Corelli” 158), uncovering simpler lines at work beneath the melodies and harmonies of tonal music that revealed longer range tonal direction and connections. In Haydn’s Divertimento in Bb, for example, the underlying melody makes an overall descent of a third, interrupted in the middle (see Example 2.1). It also shows that the Ds in the melody in bars one and six are connected by being the beginning of each descent.

Example 2.1 Haydn’s Divertimento in Bb (Chorale St Antoni) (Forte 133)

The fact that a line goes somewhere expresses intent, the second sense of ‘voice.’ What the intent is cannot and need not be definitively answered—as Nicholas Cook has remarked, hearing musical works as products of their creators need not tell us what their intent is or how to listen to them, thus implying that real
listening will be in “conformance with a theoretical construct” (Cook, “Playing God” 19). Whose intent we hear in music however, although also an enigmatic question, is one that has a direct bearing on music’s relationship to the transcendent. Most composers attest to the mysteriousness of inspiration and the part it plays in composition; Ross Edwards calls it “the mysterious process” (Westwood), and Jonathan Harvey presents the similar sentiments of a number of composers in the first chapter of his book, *Music and Inspiration*. The mystery of inspiration lies in the sense that either the source of musical ideas, or the process by which we receive them, is unknown. Today, both source and process are often located in the subconscious, but before Freud the subconscious was referred to as the soul or spirit (Harvey 4), and the source of inspiration the transcendent, whether divine, magical or daimonic (Steiner 211). The idea of inspiration coming from a higher agency has a long history, from the muses of Plato\(^5\) to the “dark origin” of Schopenhauer’s genius (Desmond, *Art* 142),\(^6\) and Harvey cites composers from Haydn to Stockhausen who testify to the experience of being ‘gifted’ in the process of their writing (153-54).

Schoenberg connected the subconscious and the transcendent when he said that thematic relationships could be “a subconsciously received gift from the Supreme Commander” (qtd. in Cook, “Playing God” 10). For Schoenberg, it was at least partly through the subconscious that the “demands of constructive lawfulness in music” were fulfilled (qtd. in Harvey 141), and musical laws do seem to have a voice in music beyond and through the voice of the composer. For Schenker the fundamental structure directing tonal music was an inherent musical law, which he went as far as

---

\(^5\) Good songs and poetry were only produced by those who were “inspired and possessed” by the “madness of the muses” (*Ion* 533 E-534 and *Phaedrus* 245A, qtd in Østrem 290).

\(^6\) Through the artistic genius (the “high priest of the ‘hidden god’ of art”) the dark origin of all things, or will, is able to be liberated from its insatiable striving and ultimate futility into a will-less “knowing.” Art similarly is said to release humans into the truth of the origin and at the same time to save them from it, in their experience of concrete aesthetic (as opposed to abstract conceptual) knowing (Desmond, *Art* 142, 133 and 148).
identifying with God, or the timeless world of ideas (Cook, “Playing God” 12 and “Schenker’s Theory” 62). Even if the principles of a particular style are seen as historically “contingent harmonic practices” (Hyer) rather than inherent, invariable laws, in the process of writing, choices are guided by a sense of the rightness and sometimes necessity of particular possibilities. Although, unlike Schenker, I do not identify (tonal) musical laws with the will of the Idea, which becomes objectified through the genius as a kind of sleepwalker (Cook, “Schenker’s Theory,” 74 and 65), I do see the principles at work in different styles as being discovered rather than created by composers. These principles are discovered through inheritance and experimentation, are worked with and transformed, and in this process there is again an exchange of voices, a dialogue between the composer and something beyond him or her. This is similar to the Jewish concept of halachah, in which the law as set down in the Torah is interpreted and lived out, literally ‘walked,’ and this is a dialogue with God (Trepp 10).

In music we use the term voice-leading to describe the purposeful movement of melodic lines, and I am suggesting that, in a broader sense, the voices that are leading are the conscious mind of the composer, the voice of inspiration (whether the subconscious mind or the transcendent through this) and the voice of musical laws or principles. Australian poet Les Murray talks of “two main modes of consciousness, one for waking life, one for dreaming,” and expresses the necessity of both in his poem, “The Dialectic of Dreams:”

---

7 Schenker saw the fundamental structure as a horizontalisation of the “chord of nature,” or the lower triadic notes of the harmonic series, and identified this naturklang with the Origin, the daemonic or dionysiac, the Idea and an immanent vital force or essence (Cook, “Schenker’s Theory” 69 and 67; Solie 154 and 155).

8 Webern wrote about the development of serial composition: “At that time we were not conscious of the law, but had been sensing it for a long time. One day Schönberg intuitively discovered the law that underlies twelve-note composition.” (Webern 51).
The daylight oil, the heavier grade of Reason, reverie’s clear water, that of the dreamworld ocean agitate us and are shaken, forming the emulsion without which we make nothing much. (Eskestad 64)

Steiner maintains that art has always affirmed the “presence of agencies beyond the governance or conceptual grasp of…craftsmen,” who struggle and collaborate with these others to produce works of art (211). Beyond Desmond’s ascription to art of the potential to “unclog” our porosity to the transcendent, by renewing our “astonishment and perplexity about the original and the ultimate” (Desmond, Art 291), Steiner makes the more radical assertion that a transcendent “otherness” resides in art itself, as an “irreducible autonomy of presence” (214), irreducible to capture or definition.

Music as Place

The thesis in Steiner’s book is that art is a “wager on transcendence” (214) and more specifically on transcendence as the source of meaning, and he makes this wager more specific by saying that a transcendent presence resides in the actual words, brush strokes and musical notes of art-works, as a residue of the original “fiat of creation” (215). This proposition confirms a sense I have that music makes a place for the transcendent: that music contains something of the transcendent, and makes a place where humans can make a connection with the transcendent. I will now look at the idea of music as place, and chapters three and five will explore some spatial attributes of musical places.
The ‘Between’ as Analogy for Music as Place

My view of musical works as places has been influenced by Desmond’s concept of the ‘place’ of being that he calls the “between,” and I will briefly describe this. The between is a place of relationship: to be something is to be in relation to something other (Desmond, Art 4). Relationships are played out in the between, a “milieu of immanent being which enables all things to be, in their rich singularities and complex intermediations” (Desmond, God 9). In this milieu there is a fluid crisscrossing of many voices (Art 43 and 36) in which individual identity is not dissolved into the “absolute heterogeneity” of a single immanent totality (Millbank 228). The word “between” suggests that this milieu is not the whole, that there is something beyond, and indeed the between is given to be (Millbank 232) rather than self-generating or merely existing. The concept derives from Plato’s metaxu, a state between the material and the transcendent, and draws on the double meaning of meta in metaxu (and metaphysical): “in the midst” and “beyond” (Art 42), as signifying that the Origin is both immanent in and transcendent to the between. It is possible to have a porosity to the transcendent “in the midst” of the immanent flux of the between, and Desmond identifies art, religion and philosophy as being activities which may—but do not always—help to “unclog” the porosity of being between the human and the divine (Kelly 31).

Because the between is other to the transcendent, but is a place in which the transcendent may be encountered, it is a helpful concept for understanding a musical work as an open (but not formless) milieu which is other to its creator and the ultimate Origin, and yet within which the marks and traces of both of these may be met. A

---

9 For Desmond the between is both a space or mediation between the One as Origin and the many (from Plato [God 55, Millbank 228]), and the milieu in which communication between the One and the many can take place.
piece of music as a medium between humans and human and divine—a between—shares many of the characteristics of the ontological between in which it interacts, and the characteristics which have most drawn my attention are medium as place/space, and the “intricate communication” between different voices in this space (Desmond, God 9).

**The Tabernacle as Analogy for Music as Place**

Lawrence Buell has defined place as “humanised space” (qtd. in Leer 16). A piece of music is a humanly made “place” which invites others to enter, and can be seen to make reference to, or even a point of contact with, something which transcends what we know.

The Bible talks about places which are made holy by the presence of God, and some of the biblical references to the presence of God in particular times and places provide fruitful metaphors for music as a meeting place between human and divine. When Jacob journeyed from his family in Genesis chapter twenty-eight and saw the ladder to heaven in a dream, he built a stone altar and called the place Bethel, or House of God. He said “this is the gate of Heaven,” which recalls Desmond’s “porosity to the transcendent.” After the Israelites’ exodus from Egypt, God gave Moses instructions to build a moveable house for his presence to dwell in, the tabernacle or “tent of meeting” (Exodus 25-31). One of the Hebrew words for tent, mishkan, is part of the word family that contains neighbour (shaken) and Sh’kinah, God’s immanent presence (Stern 683), relating the ideas of (dwelling) place, human relationships and a connection between human and divine.

There are interesting parallels between the account of creation in Genesis and the instructions for building the Tabernacle that make connections between divine and human creativity. Some of these parallels are listed in Josipovici (101-4) and
Middleton (84-8). There are seven days of creation and seven sets of instructions to Moses, with God resting on the seventh day of creation and giving Moses instructions for keeping the Sabbath in the seventh speech. The phrase *Ruach Elohim*, the Spirit of God, is used in both the creation account and the description of the building of the Tabernacle\(^{10}\), and it is suggested by Sarna that this phrase may express God’s immanence or symbolise his presence (qtd. in Middleton 86). In Exodus (31.3 and 35.1) Bezalel, the master craftsman, was filled with the *Ruach Elohim*, who gave him wisdom, understanding and knowledge to “devise artistic designs” (*English Standard Version*, Exodus 31:3-4)\(^{11}\), an idea parallel to Plato’s muses or the romantic genius, but with the difference that this craftsman was making a place for the transcendent rather than acting as a “midwife” for the objectification of an “immanent life force” (Solie 155). It was also by wisdom, understanding and knowledge that God created the world, according to Proverbs 3.19-20, so human artistic activity is in the image of God as creator (Middleton 87), though only an image. It is not creation *ex nihilo* but, in words derived from the making of the tabernacle in Exodus, “making, weaving, joining” (Josopovici 103). These words relate to my processes of combining my own and borrowed musical ideas, processes which I see as being enabled by and in some way in co-operation with the Holy Spirit.

**Pitch and Musical Space**

Of the musical parameters that contribute to a sense that a piece of music is a particular place, I have particularly been concerned with pitch, both as voice-leading—‘intent’—and as referential pitch. Where do the voices go—do they lead to a destination, near or far, do they explore a space without leading to a destination

---

\(^{10}\) The only other time it appears before this is in the story of Joseph, which makes its use in relation to creation and the tabernacle more significant (Middleton 86).

\(^{11}\) All biblical quotations are from the English Standard Version of the Bible, unless otherwise stated.

(‘round about’), do they remain stationary? Referential pitches act as pitch locations within musical space, and are established by prominence, recurrence or by serving as melodic or harmonic destinations. Even when not audible, referential pitches will often exert an influence over the musical activity around them. In Schenkerian analysis, this influence is called prolongation\(^\text{12}\); in other styles the expectation of the return of significant pitches can result in an implicit continuing presence or influence of these notes. For this reason, and because of the symbolic significance that I attach to them as a representation of the eternal transcendent, I have called referential pitches in my music ‘remaining notes,’ notes which are literally “continuing to be” (“Remain,” def. 2).

A summary of remaining notes in the choral work *Vive in Deo* can be seen in chapter three (Example 3.3, p.39). The remaining note threads, connected by dashed slurs, are B and D in bold noteheads, G in white noteheads, and a high F#, and most of these threads include movement to notes on neighbouring pitches. The solid slurs show pitch movement to neighbouring pitches or a short-term pitch destination. These remaining notes are significant because they are heard frequently (often as part of a recurring melodic motif), and in most cases because they are one of the notes in the tonic triad of a key operating at that moment, or in the piece as a whole. Other notes in the reduction have smaller noteheads, and are significant because of their relationship to the remaining notes and/or because they occur frequently in a local context.

---

\(^{12}\) In example 2.1, bar one, the melody’s D is prolonged to the movement of the underlying melody to C, and the tonic (Bb) harmony is prolonged to the movement to chord V. Both the D in the melody and the Bb harmony “remain in effect without being literally represented at every moment” (Forte 142).
Musical Symbolism in the Folio of Works

Remaining notes belong to the first of two main types of symbolism in my pieces: musical metaphor and extra-musical association. Musical metaphor includes musical devices such as remaining notes or modal colour, used to symbolise the transcendent or illustrate an idea expressed in the text the music is setting. Extra-musical association occurs mostly through the use of borrowed melodies, which have meanings in their texts or history that relate to the text or idea behind the piece in which they are used. These associations are usually either overt references to aspects of the transcendent or interpreted as such.

Desmond writes that, to speak of what is beyond, and beyond our full comprehension or expression, we have to resort to mythic or artistic means (Art 39). At the same time, as Steiner maintains, it is the “impalpable and mythical … which are still the ontological guarantors of the arcs of metaphor”—in other words, artistic representations of the transcendent are not empty images, but point to the presence of, or re-present, the transcendent. Visual art, whether abstract or representational, and music, whether absolute or programmatic, refers to something, it is about something (Steiner 202). Beyond the natural and social realities that art embodies, Steiner argues, art refers to the transcendent: “there is poesis because there is [original] creation” (203).

Musical Metaphor and Remaining notes

Remaining notes in my music are a reference to the transcendent by being a symbolic representation of its presence. Desmond writes that Plato’s concept of

---

13 The word ‘refers,’ is based on the Greek word *pherein*, to carry or bear, as is the word metaphor, “a carrying across or between” (“Refer” and “Metaphor”). Meaning is borne by musical and verbal signs.
14 *Poesis* is the Greek word for composition or poetry, from *poein*, ‘to make or compose’ (“Poesy”).
mimesis requires both the absence of the original (in this case, the Original), because it is other to the image, and the presence of the original, its “being available for manifestation” (Art 32). The presence that the remaining notes symbolise, in their lack of movement, is the original “I Am” of the transcendent beyond time (Exodus 3.14). They symbolise the Origin of being, and to me are a reminder of what Desmond calls our *passio essendi*, the “suffering” of being, in the sense of the receiving of being, being given to be (God 24). This is a primal state of being which is “responsive to [the transcendent] prior to and exceeding the sway of determinate reasoning” (Art 78) which characterizes the *conatus essendi*. The *conatus essendi* is an “activist endeavour to be” (Art 10), which is manifest in human will and self transcendence (T2).

The unmoving nature of remaining notes not only represents abstract concepts of eternity and origin, but also represents attributes which relate to God’s immanent presence in the world. The way remaining notes are static and yet active in the music, as points of influence on the surrounding harmonic texture, is a reference to the transcendent as described in Paul’s depiction of Christ: “He is before all things, and in him all things hold together” (Col. 1.17). In the Bible this active constancy is given particular focus in the quality of loving kindness (Hebrew *chesed*), and is often paired with “truth” (*emet*) to give “unfailing love” (Harris 1: 307) as in the refrain of Psalm 136, “for his steadfast love endures forever.” It is this love that, as Dante said, “moves the sun and the other stars” (qtd. in McGrath 62). Desmond calls the “possibilising power” of the transcendent agapeic (Art 238)—there is a generating which is a generosity, out of a surplus of being (God 161-62) that “releases finitude

---

15 The word immanent means ‘to remain in’ (”Immanent”).
16 Although the Greek words for love are generally interchangeable, *agape* in the New Testament has been associated with God’s unconditional love since the nineteenth century (Keener 1236). The phrase “God is love” in 1 John 4.16 uses the word *agape*. 
into its own being for itself” (Art 8), a being which is “very good” (Gen. 1.31). Artistic creation is a picture of this origination (Art 291).

In this giving of being, the Origin is communicating beyond itself (Art 48) and so remaining notes, symbolising this Origin which holds all things together, are also about connection. In Jacob’s encounter with God in Genesis, referred to above, he named the place Bethel, or house of God. The second divine encounter after which he named a place was more intimate, where he wrestled with God\(^\text{17}\). This place he named Peniel, the face of God (Gen. 32.24-30), and this word is derived from panim, meaning ‘face’ or ‘presence’ (Young 770). Embodied in the Hebrew word is the premise that presence is not abstract, but has to do with relationship.

This idea of relationship is musically expressed through the role of remaining notes in making connections, both through the effecting of transitions between different modes or through the threading of static pitches as a binding agent through a piece—“joining and weaving” (Josipovici 103). In my choral work Vive in Deo, for example, the ‘remaining’ pitch B is prominent in the B major homophonic section ending at bar sixty-six, and continues in the tenor parts as a pivot note between this section and the following one in E mixolydian (see Example 2.2).

\(^{17}\) Jacob’s wrestling with the angel can also be seen as a metaphor for composition—“I will not let you go until you bless me” (Exodus 32.26). Jacob wrestled at night, and a large part of compositional ‘wrestling’ involves the subconscious mind.
In some music particularly, remaining notes seem to shine through the forward movement of musical time like stars through an “overcoat of night”\(^{18}\). The slow movement of Mozart’s piano sonata in D, K576 is an example of this. It is in A major, and the melody begins on C# an octave above middle C; this C# (occasionally transferred to other octaves) rings through the goal-directed musical discourse as the third of A major and fifth of F# minor (bar 17), both as part of the overall movement to resolution on A but also seemingly independent of it, like a bell representing eternity in the flux of temporal life. The C#’s in their changing contexts are shown in the score, marked by asterisks (see Example 2.3).

\(^{18}\) This is James K. Baxter’s phrase for the material world which hides the transcendent, in his poem *Song to the Father* (Baxter, *Labyrinth* 71).
Whether remaining notes are partially hidden in the musical flow or are clearly audible as a near constant presence (see the discussion of Hosokawa’s *Voyage I* in chapter five), as a likeness of the presence of God they are to me a reminder of the “steadfast love which endures forever” (Psalm 136). They are an aid to Desmond’s porosity to the transcendent, to a sense of the presence of the transcendent and a participation in my own *passio essendi*, or receiving being.

**Example 2.3** Mozart’s Piano Sonata K576 II, C# ‘Remaining Notes’ (*)

19 Remaining notes of the tonic triad, in music which uses functional harmony, have also been seen to represent the single point of view of a human subject, analogous to the position of the painter or viewer in perspectivist painting (Boykan 79). Schenker used both the human and divine subject as metaphor for the tonic triad and its unfolding (Fink 133 and Cook, “Playing God” 12). The metaphor of a single point of view reflects well the shift in human consciousness expressed by Descartes, but to me, the static existence of these remaining notes, behind harmonic and melodic movement, suggests still points of a more eternal magnitude than a single human consciousness. An element of transcendence in these remaining notes is indicated by their partial independence to the harmonic trajectory (tonic triad notes may be decorative in relation to the *ursatz*) and to each other (in Mozart’s slow movement, for example, the C# of the tonic A triad continues to ring through F# minor, while E does not).
Extra-Musical Association

The second main type of musical symbolism in my music is extra-musical association through the use of borrowed musical material. In this there is an “intricate communication” (Desmond, *God* 9) or exchange of voices that interacts with the human-divine exchange discussed earlier. There is a Jewish saying, “I and you and the third who is in our midst” (Richardson 42), and music is bound up with these relationships—as well as mediating between people and the transcendent, it mediates between people. Since Max Weber’s *The Rational and Social Foundations of Music* there has been a great deal of writing on the relationship of music to human subjectivity and social relations, which includes the interpretative tradition associated...
with Adorno and later writers such as Subotnik and McClary (Cook, *Music* 215). It now seems self-evident that music should in some way reflect the self and its historical-social milieu, and that these layers of significance greatly enrich music’s meaning, but, at the same time, musical meaning also transcends its embodiment of context. Charles Rosen has written:

> The effort of the ‘new musicologists’ to escape from the formalist view of music by what they call ‘contextualisation’—resituating the music in history in order to reconstruct the various musical and extra-musical meanings of which it was the bearer—can be vitiated at the outset by a failure to realise that throughout history music has resisted…such constraint. It is, in fact, a historical distortion to anchor music too firmly in history (Rosen, *Critical* 271).

In writing music, it is the exchange of voices that occurs across historical boundaries through the borrowing of musical material that I am interested in. This exchange does not only involve musical quotation, for all musical composition, or any artistic endeavour, is borrowing in one sense, which is why Steiner calls artistic creation a residue of the original “fiat of creation” (215). Voltaire wrote of intellectual ideas that “The instruction we find in books is like fire. We fetch it from our neighbour's, kindle it at home, communicate it to others, and it becomes the property of all” (qtd. in Edwards 392). This could equally apply to artistic ideas, as stated more succinctly by the abstract painter Darby Bannard: “to make, you need to take” (“Art Quotes”). I think of musical borrowing in this sense as being at the broad end of a continuum of borrowing, and specific musical quotation as being at the narrow end.

---

20 There are also difficulties in objectively explaining how music embodies self and society (or, for Adorno, socio-political truth, in the way that art can both reflect and critique society [Williams 39, 15]). Although, as Cook points out, interpretations are not arbitrary, being rooted in features of the music, neither are they definitive (*Music* 220). Musical meaning is “ambiguous, slippery….provisional” (Rosen, *Critical* 270).
Musical borrowing is a kind of ‘centonization,’ a continual recombining of ideas in new ways. Centonization is a term used to describe the process of creating plainchant melodies from pre-existent melodic formulae (Chew). It was coined by Ferretti who used the term ‘centonate’ to distinguish melodies created in this way from free-composed melodies (Chew). The Latin word cento means ‘patchwork’, and was used of late classical and early Christian literature to describe a poem made up of lines from different pre-existing sources (Treitler 199).

I have used the word ‘centonization’ to refer to processes in music where ideas are shared between different pieces, composers and epochs. This is a fairly wide-ranging concept, and I use the word in inverted commas to distinguish it from its use in relation to traditions of Christian chant. At its widest, ‘centonization’ refers to the unavoidable reoccurrence of certain intervallic combinations and gestural shapes within a particular musical language or style—they are in fact among the markers which identify languages and styles. An example of such an idea is the shape made up of scale degrees 1-5-6-5 found in tonal music and heard, for example, in Twinkle Twinkle Little Star and the chorale melody Wachet Auf, Ruft Uns die Stimme (see Example 2.4).

---

21 Treitler has observed that this term as applied to plainchant often assumes that chants were crafted from pre-existing formulae into organic melodic wholes (193) within the “unified body of work, of uniform origin” that is Gregorian chant (189). He has criticised these assumptions on the grounds that they derive from a late eighteenth century aesthetic regarding the importance of originality, individuality and unity of art works (187, 193), and because they do not account for the origins of the chants in an unwritten, oral tradition (196). Musical formulae are not taken “from here and there”, as are scriptural quotations in the texts of plainchants (this is Ferretti’s phrase, quoted in Treitler [199]), but have particular functions as part of melodic families—for example, as an opening formula—and it is this that explains the natural, unified effect of their combinations (197).
Example 2.4 ‘1-5-6-5,’ Twinkle Twinkle Little Star and Wachet Auf, Ruft Uns die Stimme (Riemenschneider 41)

I also see the idea of ‘centonization’ as applying to the narrower end of the borrowing continuum, to the more conscious use of musical quotation, as in the incorporation in Western art music of foreign material with its attached associations. The intent behind this type of borrowing is similar to that behind literary centos, in that new meanings are created through juxtaposition of diverse material (Treitler 199). This is a kind of troping, whether seen as an extension of the figure of speech, in which words are used in a way that changes their meaning (as in irony and metaphor)—a trope is literally a ‘turn’ of phrase (“Trope”)—or as analogous to medieval tropes of plainsong. In plainsong tropes the elements of embellishment, interpolation and commentary through imported material resonate with these elements in art music borrowing.

Much twentieth century musical ‘troping’ articulates a sense of loss of past music and musical certainties. Schnittke’s polystylistic, for example, expresses a “personal sense of rootlessness” (Dohnányi 4), which is beautifully expressed in the separateness between quotations from Bach keyboard music and his own polyphony in the fourth movement of his Concerto Grosso Number 3 (see Example 2.5).

22 Tropes in plainsong are the additions of melismas, the setting of texts to existing melismas, or new verses of text and music (Planchart).
Although my musical borrowing is also concerned with the irretrievability of time past, the exchange of voices is not oppositional, but rather weaves borrowed melodies and fragments into my own style, which is more loosely tonal than what it
imports. This kind of borrowing is closer in intent to that of Charles Ives, who borrowed music through a sense of connection to what he called its “substance” or values (Burkholder 311 and 422). He saw the “simple but acute” nature of traditional melodies of his culture as being able to express this substance with a “depth of feeling” that he carried over into his own music (424). In my music, like that of Ives, the texts or contexts of the musical sources support the texts of my pieces, or the associations implicit in their titles, as the sources themselves enrich the music. This is like a musical version of the way Saint Paul used the Hebrew Scriptures to support his arguments (Dunn 170), sometimes collecting them into a poetic cento (as, for example in Rom. 3.10-18). In the case of my Osanna Mass there is a sense of the music speaking alongside the musical source materials (Jewish and Christian liturgical melodies) and their associated texts—it is literally a paraphrase Mass. In the Osanna “Kyrie,” for example, the plainchant Kyrie of Kyriale IX is put in counterpoint to the Jewish melody Kol Nidrei (see Example 2.6). The new music and the old come out of a shared belief in the transcendent, a point of connection between different times and through discontinuities of culture. As well as making a musical dialogue with the past, the writing in the present is a participation in the ‘communion of saints’ or body of believers past and present, one voice in a “murmur of many voices”.

---

23 A paraphrase Mass uses a monophonic musical source, usually a chant, throughout all or a number of the voices. In Josquin’s Missa ‘Pange lingua’ and Missa ‘Ave maris stella’, the same chant is used in each movement (Burkholder). My Osanna Mass uses several monophonic sources, which are combined in different ways through different movements.

24 The sopranos and tenors sing different phrases from Kyrie IX and the alto sings two phrases from Kol Nidrei.

25 This phrase is taken from James K. Baxter’s poem, Song to the Lord God on Spring Morning (Baxter, Collected 591).
The use of melodies from the past, with or without religious connotations, is a reference to the transcendent—from the “I and you” we are brought back again to the “third who is in our midst” (Richardson 42). The gulf that separates different ages in time raises for me questions about our beginnings and our end. In regards to our end, Steiner refers to what is “grave and constant” in the “mystery of our condition” (224). “Grave and constant” is a phrase from Joyce’s Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man that refers to the issue of our mortality which lies beneath the changing details that make up human experience (Campbell 24). At the same time, music which has been written in the past and is still meaningful today, as well as melodic and rhythmic ideas which remain recognisable as they recur in music through changing conventions, point to a different kind of connectedness between people. The common gestures we use in the way we express ourselves directs me to questions of our origin, which are also questions of our value: not only does existence provoke wonder “that it is at all” (Desmond, Art 3), it gives rise to the question, “what is the good of it all?”

I see musical connections between past and present, like remaining notes, as symbolising the changeless transcendent in time holding all things together.

---

26 Desmond, Being and the Between, quoted in Colledge (2).
Summary

This chapter suggests that different voices speak (or sing) in a piece of music—the conscious and subconscious voices of the composer, the transcendent (through music’s re-presenting of it and through discovered musical principles) and voices from other music, whether through shared musical gestures or musical quotation. Together these voices create a place or ‘tabernacle’ which is a ‘tent of meeting’ between them, and in my music, to use another analogy, through compositional craft the different voices weave a musical nest.

The idea of a musical nest relates to the Hebrew word, *qanah*, meaning “to possess, acquire or set up” which can also have the connotation “to create” (Harris 803). The meanings of most Hebrew words derive from a metonymic chain of associations, beginning from the original pictographic meanings of the letters which make up the root of a word. According to Jeff Benner, (Benner) the pictograph for the letter *qof* (English ‘q’) represents the rising or setting sun, with the associated meaning of gathering: when the sun sets, light is gathered to the sun. The pictograph for *nun*, or ‘n,’ portrays a seed, resulting in a combined idea of gathering for seeds, as when a bird gathers material to build a nest for her eggs. One verb made out of the ‘qn’ root, *qanah*, has generalised this idea to ‘to acquire or possess’.

The etymology of the word *qanah* makes a good picture of my processes of composition, which I will discuss in the following chapter—gathering material to make a musical nest, some of which is borrowed, and binding this material together through the use of recurring significant pitches or remaining notes, symbolic of the transcendent. This “making, weaving, joining” creates a place or a “between” which is porous to what is beyond it, a place for the meeting of people and the transcendent.
Part Two:

Context
Chapter Three

Compositional Voice and Craft

The purpose of this chapter is to present characteristics of my compositional voice, focusing on the way different elements express or refer to the transcendent. In chapter two I suggested that a number of ‘voices’ are at work in the process of composition. The conscious and unconscious voices of the composer, the voices of musics that are drawn into what is being written through influence or borrowing, and the voice of the transcendent, operating enigmatically through or with the composer’s subconscious mind and the laws or principles felt to be at work in the material—all of these voices cohere in the expression of a particular voice for each composer.

My processes of composition are analogous to making a nest. They involve finding or gathering musical material through listening to music, borrowing music and by playing the piano, and weaving this material together. The etymology of the word ‘gather’ reveals something of the philosophy behind this process: it is related to the Old English words gaed, ‘fellowship,’ and god, ‘good,’ (“Gather”) which in this context have associations of the meeting of people and the transcendent, and of the ultimate value of these things, and of being itself. The gathered materials are put together—composed—as threads of different kinds, such as pitch threads, motivic threads and formal threads. I will discuss four aspects of these threads: the use of significant recurring pitches, or remaining notes; voice leading; the arrangement or ‘centonization’ of motives; and structures. As my concept of pitch threads has been influenced by Heinrich Schenker’s theories of long-range relationships between notes, I will begin by explaining this connection.
Schenkerian Long-Range Pitch Connections

The introduction to Schenker’s theories I experienced as a student made me aware of the possibility of pitch threads below the surface of the music—lines of connection between notes that are not adjacent in time. Schenker saw tonal music of the Baroque to Romantic periods as being reducible to a fundamental structure or ursatz, which will take one of three forms (see Example 3.1). In each pattern, the bass ‘linearizes’ the tonic triad through arpeggiation, moving from (the keys of) I to V and back again within a movement. The upper voice (urlinie) in these patterns also makes horizontal the tonic triad by filling in its intervals with passing notes (Cadwallader 118). Just as a melodic line can be seen to be an embellishment of a simpler contour and ultimately a line in a single direction (as shown in Example 2.1 in chapter 2), Schenker saw an entire piece as an embellishment or ‘composing out’ of the tonic triad as found in one of these three patterns.

Example 3.1 Forms of Schenker’s Fundamental Structure (Forte 133)

Although Schenker’s theories are not useful as an analytical tool for twentieth century music in their original form¹, some aspects are helpful for understanding

¹ Attempts have been made to do this, and Baker summarises some of these in his chapter “Schenkerian Analysis and Post-Tonal Music.” Joseph Salzer attempted to replace the key of the dominant with a broader range of possibilities under the title “contrapuntal-structural chord” but, outside the coherence of functional harmony, his and others’ attempts ultimately rely on more arbitrary analytical judgements (Baker 155-6).
styles that use pitch as a referential marker, such as my style and those of Takemitsu, Messiaen and Stravinsky. In analysing my own music I have adapted several of Schenker’s principles, influenced by Koozin’s analyses of Takemitsu’s solo piano music (“Octatonicism”). These are the principle of octave equivalency, whereby a note has the same significance or function in whatever octave it occurs; the assumption of a relationship between significant notes\(^2\), whether between notes of the same or adjacent pitch, which do not occur consecutively in time; and the existence of at least two hierarchical levels, which are the written surface of the music and a deeper level of longer-range connections.

Nicholas Cook has described Schenker’s conception of form as a “demonstration of organic coherence through directed motion” (A Guide 64). Organic coherence derives from the fact that directed motion is a single melodic and harmonic movement that unfolds the tonic triad, as expressed by the Ursatz. Tonal music outside of Schenker’s ideal Baroque to Brahms period is much less likely to consist of a single directed motion. Cook has observed that Debussy’s music, for example, generally has directed motion on a local level, and achieves coherence on a global level through long-range threads of connection between notes that are static, or between several notes which do not progress towards a destination. The background structure of Debussy’s prelude, Puck’s Dance, for example, can be seen as a melodic movement of a whole tone, F to Eb (65) (see Example 3.2). This movement occurs in both the melody and bass registers, as indicated in the upper system, and there is no harmonic movement supporting it. Cook suggests, however, that we do not experience the music as prolonging the note F or moving in a direction from F to Eb, but that these pitch threads act like a “washing line” that chords are pegged on to (66).

\(^2\) In Schenkerian theory, significant notes are defined in relation to the fundamental structure. For my purposes, notes gain significance through prominence and/or frequency of occurrence.
These threads, with their static intermittent presence, are more like ‘remaining note’ threads which alternate and at times co-exist. In this approach to tonality there is no longer a unified tonal motion over a whole work, and so coherence is achieved through stasis rather than movement. Coherence and directed motion have been separated, so that coherence is no longer organic in the Schenkerian sense, in which each part has its cause in the whole (a directed tonal motion) (Cook 64).

Example 3.2 Debussy, “Puck’s Dance” (Preludes Book I), Reduction (Cook, A Guide 65)

Debussy’s underlying structures as Cook has described them are similar to those of my music, even though the styles are different. In my music also there is a lack of a clear dominant to define a home key and provide a structural movement to the tonic over a whole piece. As a result, the underlying pitch structures do not conform to Schenker’s fundamental structures, or one basic template, but are generally a set of coexisting static threads. Movement between pitches is mostly on a local level, or between a static pitch and its neighbour. An example of this is shown in the pitch summary of Vive in Deo (Example 3.3) in which the static pitch threads
are notated as large black (B and D) or white (G) note-heads; the slur between bars twenty-seven and thirty-eight denotes a movement from B to F# within the soprano melody in those bars (see Example 3.4).

Example 3.3 Maclean, *Vive in Deo*, Pitch Summary

Example 3.4 *Vive in Deo* (bars 27-38), Soprano Ascent

In *Vive in Deo* and other of my pieces, coherence is achieved through stasis rather than movement, as it is in *Puck’s Dance*, and this unity is not organically derived from a single source. Instead, static underlying threads representing the eternal transcendent, along with polyphonic and motivic threads on the surface of the music, make up a musical ‘nest’ that is an open whole.
Pitch Summary Notation

The notation of the summary of *Vive in Deo* and other pieces in this thesis is an adaption of the graphic notation used in Schenkerian analysis, and is mainly confined to the use of different noteheads and slurs. Larger white or black noteheads indicate significant pitches that recur through a whole piece, with oval white noteheads denoting the tonic if there is one. Smaller diamond-shaped noteheads indicate notes that are significant as part of a repeated figure or local pitch movement (ascent, descent, arpeggiation or neighbouring note). Solid slurs generally outline local connections, within a phrase or section, such as showing local underlying pitch movement or identifying a motivic or repeated figure. Solid slurs connecting the same pitch indicate that that note has a constant or consistent presence over that time. Dotted slurs denote a longer-range connection between two notes of the same pitch, or a note and a neighbouring note. Remaining notes belonging to different octaves are sometimes connected by lines to a central beam\(^3\), and longer-range melodic movement is notated as a series of joined quavers\(^4\).

Remaining Notes

Schenker’s ideas of deeper connections between significant notes led me to become more aware of the continuing presence of significant fixed pitches in music of a number of styles of music, including my own. These are pitches that maintain an intermittent presence throughout a piece (but are not necessarily part of a Schenkerian basic structure) and in chapter two I named these notes ‘remaining notes.’ Remaining

\(^3\) See Example 4.5, “Pitch Summary, Os Anthos Chortou,” in chapter four.
\(^4\) See Example 4.43, “Summary of Psalm 137” in chapter four.
notes are likely in any music that uses modes, or in which pitch referentiality is important.

Remaining notes, as they occur in my music, are often members of the tonic triad, although the tonic may not have same unambiguous function that it has in functional harmony. In the summary of Vive in Deo (Example 3.3) the remaining notes are identified as G, B and D, and the key of G major begins and ends the work; however G is not established for very long before the piece moves to other keys, and only returns at the very end in a context that is tonally clouded by a soprano melody in B major. It is the continued presence of the remaining notes rather than a strong structural function of the tonic that holds the piece together.

The sources of remaining notes are local melodies or repeated figures. A remaining note functions as part of a local musical event as well as contributing to long-range connections, as significant notes do in Schenkerian analysis. In the soprano melody in Vive in Deo (Example 3.4), the B in bar twenty-seven begins a medium-range ascent, while at the same time continuing as a central note in that melody as part of the global B pitch-thread. A single musical event may also incorporate several remaining notes, as this melody reiterates both B and G.

Remaining notes can have a grounding effect, if they constitute the tonic of a piece or a passage, or otherwise form a floating thread. These effects, as part of the symbolism of remaining notes, reflect the transcendent as being the ground or origin of being which holds all things together beyond the ‘gravity’ of time and the material world. Eternity, as represented by remaining notes, can shine through time expressed as a goal-directed harmonic structure, as was the case in the Mozart slow movement (K576) discussed in chapter two. Alternatively, time can be heard within the context
of eternity, as in most of my music, where local goal direction occurs within the continuing presence of remaining notes.

The overt presence of remaining notes in harmonic stasis is one way composers express the transcendent in music. Arvo Pärt’s ‘tintinntabuli’ style consists of a reiteration of tonic triad notes within moving voices, which do not change key and often work through a set process. The constant presence of the tonic triad is seen as a manifestation of God (Hillier 87 and 92). Sofia Gubaidulina’s music is often based on a symbolic dramatic narrative that will play out in a harmonically static context. In her work *In Croce* for organ or bayan and cello, for example, an exchange between the ‘human’ cello struggling upwards and a ‘divine’ bayan reaching downwards is enacted for the first third of the piece in a tonal space marked out by notes of an A major triad. The music of Australian composer Ross Edwards has been influenced by repetitive (‘remaining’) sounds of the natural world, such as frogs and insects. In the works of his “Sacred style,” which he sees as “contemplation objects” (Stanhope 105), a number of motifs or “archetypes” are subtly varied and juxtaposed in different ways, and because motifs usually recur at the same pitch and in an unmetrical context (107) they sound suspended in an eternal stasis. In Toru Takemitsu’s octatonic works, central pitches provide subtle or overt threads through the tonally undirected surface figuration of the music. Timothy Koozin has shown this harmonic stasis to be both metaphor and vehicle for the “transcendent spiritual presence” of the eternal (“Spiritual-Temporal” 185). Each of these composers has a strong Christian or Zen Buddhist influenced sense of the transcendent.

---

5 A bayan is a Russian chromatic button accordion.
6 This term was first applied to Edwards’ work in 1985 by Corinne D’Aston (Stanhope 103).
7 For an explanation of this process in some of Takemitsu’s piano works, see Koozin, “Octatonicism.”
Voice Leading

My music is made up predominantly of melodic lines or threads, a way of thinking about music that was encouraged by my experiences of singing choral music. It was Renaissance choral music in particular that influenced me to write in modal polyphony, and I have broadened the voice leading principles I absorbed from this music in a way that looks further back to Machaut.

In Renaissance counterpoint, dissonance, as the non-triadic intervals of a second, fourth, seventh and tritone, occurred mainly as suspensions on strong beats and passing or neighbouring note figures on weak ones (Butterworth 3, 11 and 16). Dissonance had to be explainable and resolved by such procedures in order not to destabilise the essentially consonant harmonic world. If consonance in my music is also defined as triadic intervals, then like Renaissance counterpoint there are many of these. Dissonance however works in an expanded way, and although the ground of the harmonic world is often ultimately consonant, there is much of the time an equilibrium or interpenetration of consonance and dissonance.

Dissonance in Renaissance counterpoint (and in functional harmony) was partly a function of the regular alternation of strong and weak beats, through which dissonance and resolution were defined. The regular pulse provided a framework against which syncopation could stretch and contract the rhythm of individual lines, and syncopated dissonance intensified the movement of the counterpoint to its goal, as can be seen at the end of the *Christe* in the “Kyrie” of Josquin’s *Pange Lingua* Mass (see Example 3.5)

---

8 This experience was gained principally through singing in my father’s church choir at St Luke’s Anglican church in Oamaru, New Zealand, and in the Sydney Chamber Choir under Nicholas Routley.
Example 3.5 Josquin, Missa Pange Lingua, “Kyrie” (end of Christe)

My music, in contrast, is usually based on additive rhythms in which the pulses are grouped in twos and threes, and in which rhythmic elasticity derives mainly from the changing groupings rather than rhythmic counterpoint against a regular pulse. Each part will often have its own flow of two’s and three’s independent of other parts (see Example 3.6), so dissonance or resolution are not vertically unified, or therefore definable, in relation to a regular strong-weak pattern. In Renaissance choral music, parts are rhythmically independent over a shared metre, whereas in my music parts are rhythmically and metrically independent over a shared pulse, which can mean that individual parts are rhythmically simpler. This greater independence of parts means that dissonance arises through the coincidence of different lines as they follow their individual melodic trajectories, in a way that is similar to the other type of Renaissance dissonance, the false relation. In Byrd’s Lullaby (see Example 3.7) the clash of C natural against C# is similar in effect to the dissonance of Bb against B natural in the “Gloria” of my Osanna Mass (bars 40 and 43) (see Example 3.6).

'S' denotes a suspension and 'P' a passing note (the addition of '>' indicates that it is on the beat).
The false relation in Byrd’s *Lullaby* is a result of the necessity for the bass to sharpen the leading note (C#) below the tonic D, while the alto sings its phrase with C natural in imitation of the tenor. This false relation, like others before it, is a result of
the differing demands of *musica ficta* on individual voices (Routley 65). In the passage from the “Gloria” (see Example 3.6) the clashes are a result of polymodality as well as modal flexibility. The Bb in the soprano in bar forty-three is part of a melody in F major (the plainchant used in the “Sanctus” of the Mass), heard against the G mixolydian first tenor melody (the plainchant used in the “Gloria”). In bar forty the bass B natural from the G mixolydian plainchant sounds against an alto Bb. This Bb is part of the Jewish *Aleinu* melody in C major (Idelsohn 147) which has a Bb at this point, perhaps applying some *‘musica ficta’* to avoid an unresolved leading-note.

The dissonance in the “Gloria” passage is clearly freer than that of Renaissance counterpoint—dissonances are not prepared or resolved, but are thrown up in the mixture of individual melodies. Although the sound worlds are different, this approach to polyphony is similar to that of Machaut, whose dissonances produce a number of non-triadic sonorities as well as consecutive fifths and octaves (see Example 3.8).
In Machaut’s “Kyrie” and the Osanna “Gloria” passage, much of the dissonance does not propel the counterpoint forward but contributes to a variegated

---

10 Unprepared or unresolved dissonances are marked with an asterisk, and consecutive fifths or octaves are marked with parallel lines.
texture of harmonic colour, which ranges from open triads through softer dissonances of seconds and fourths to the occasional sharper collisions of minor seconds. In much of my polyphony almost any dissonance is possible, as is parallel motion (see the upper three parts in bar 44 of the “Gloria” excerpt [Example 3.6]), functioning as light and shade on a static or slowly changing background modal collection.

This movement of harmonic colour and the individual trajectories of the different voices are manifestations of ‘time,’ and they are held together by the ‘eternal’ presence of a tonic pitch and/or other remaining notes. In this there is some affinity with Renaissance choral music, in that there is no one unifying temporal harmonic movement as Schenker saw in classical music, but many smaller movements in and around a group of related modal areas. These areas may be unified by the recurrence of significant pitches in Renaissance choral music as well, as is particularly the case in Josquin’s Pange Lingua Mass. The movements of this Mass are based on variations of the plainchant hymn Pange Lingua in the Phrygian mode, so that through the changing modal areas there run threads of C and B, and E and F.\(^{11}\)

‘Centonization’ as Arrangement of Musical Ideas

The coincidences of melodic lines in changing metres are a result of the arrangement of different melodies and motivic fragments. In chapter two I suggested that there is a continuum between the ‘centonization’ of musical gestures shared between musical works and epochs, and the conscious borrowing of specific musical material. As well as referring to the importation of musical ideas, this extended use of

\(^{11}\) The different sections of the Mass movements cadence predominantly in E phrygian, but also include cadences in G major, C major and D dorian or aeolian; sections begin in these modal areas as well as in A aeolian.
the word ‘centonization’—as a term originally coined to refer to the practice of creating plainchant from existing formulae—can also refer to the process of arranging musical ideas in a particular piece. In the excerpt from the “Gloria” of the Osanna Mass (Example 3.6) a number of borrowed melodies have been put together. The soprano and alto lines are a substantial intact portion of their original melodies, while the tenors and basses sing different phrases from the “Gloria” plainchant, not in order and with some repetition. ‘Centonization’ here is vertical in the combination of the melodies, and horizontal in the rearrangement of the “Gloria” chant.

When the material being assembled includes fragmentary elements such as single phrases (as the basses and tenors sing in the “Gloria” excerpt) or motivic figures, the music comes to be treated as space as well as line. At times the spatial aspect can overtake the linear aspect, as happens in the “Credo” of the Mass at the words Et in Spiritum Sanctum (Example 3.9). In this passage there are no melodies, but instead fragments from the Credo plainchant and other borrowed melodies are distributed through the musical space.
The process of writing passages like this one is like the filling up of a visual space, and reminds me of a series of paintings by the Spanish artist Joan Miro known as *The Constellations*, as, for example, his “Ciphers and Constellations in Love with a Woman” (Figure 3.1). These paintings were suggested to Miro by “The night, music and the stars” as an escape from the situation in France and Spain in the early 1940’s, and they were also based on the forms suggested by reflections in water (Hammond 44). Miro said that “in them my main aim was to achieve a compositional balance,” a “full and complex equilibrium” of form and colour (qtd. in Hammond 42 and 44). These pictures are assemblages of subjects and visual motives, motives

---

12 Quoted in Dupin (243). Miro painted these pictures listening to Bach, Mozart and Beethoven (Hammond 44).
which are repeated and varied in each painting and which recur in many paintings. The motives in my music are not part of a “system” of signs (Raymond Queneau called them “Miroglyphics” and “Mihieroglyphics” [qtd in Dupin. 246]) but motives are repeated and varied within a single piece, and their simplicity means they have similarities with motives in other pieces.

**Figure 3.1** Miro, “Ciphers and Constellations in Love with a Woman,” Art Institute of Chicago.

---

**Form**

The practice of assembling different musical ideas also works on a formal level; the spatial distribution and repetition of material can easily lead to a spatialised, sectional form. There have been several influences on my music that each in their own way arrange cells or motives within phrases or blocks of music, and arrange phrases or blocks within a whole piece. Among these are the music of Stravinsky (in particular, his *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*), Messiaen (*Vingt Regards sur...*)
l'Enfant Jésus), plainchant and blackbird song, which I will compare to the form of my choral work, Vive in Deo.

Example 3.10 Messiaen, “Regard de l’Étoile”
In the second of Messiaen’s *Vingt Regards*, “Regard de l’Étoile,” there are three blocks of material whose internal elements interrelate (see Example 3.10 and
Table 3.1). The first and second blocks (A and B) both contain segments that are varied (B) or unvaried (A), and to some of these are added interpolations, labelled as roman numerals.

**Table 3.1 Messiaen, “Regard de l’Étoile,” Structure**

| A | B(a b a’ b’ c)\(^{13}\) C | A | B(i, b ii, a’i, b’ii, c ii’) C ii (x3) | A | C’ |

It is interesting that, perhaps through Messiaen’s study of bird songs, the series of independent phrases that comprise many of the *Vingt Regards* are similar to the structures in some bird songs. Blackbird\(^{14}\) song, for example, is made up of a number of phrases that follow one another in an open-ended sectional form (the song seems like one long ribbon that lasts for an entire season, and each performance is like a section of it). The songs that I listened to and recorded in our garden\(^{15}\), in the spring of 2007, consisted mainly of half a dozen or so phrases that recurred in clearly recognisable forms throughout the season and in the spring of 2008. Some of these phrases were prominent and appeared to act as refrains, such as the C and D phrases in the excerpt given (see Example 3.11). Phrases were either repeated more or less identically (though the chirpy suffix usually differed) or varied by addition, subtraction or the reworking of a basic idea, as is the case with phrase B. There are a number of small pitch cells that are shared by different phrases, such as B-D (phrases B and C) and D-A (phrase A and some of B), which is partly a result of the fact that many phrases are built around a major triad. This can mean that the difference

---

\(^{13}\) Segment ‘c’ begins by reversing the pitch elements of segment ‘a:’ ‘a’ begins A Ab – Bb G – A Ab, and ‘c’ begins Bb G – A Ab – Bb G.

\(^{14}\) This is the Eurasian blackbird (*Turdus Merula*) which has been introduced to Australia and is found in New South Wales, Victoria and South Australia ("Eurasian Blackbird").

\(^{15}\) My family and I live in Penrith, on the edge of Sydney, NSW.
between a variation and a distinct new phrase is not always clear, as appears in a comparison of phrase B with A or C, but both A and C did establish their separate identities by recurring in very similar forms over many different performances.

Example 3.11 Blackbird Phrases

This example is an excerpt from a longer song. The spaces between phrases are often about five to ten seconds long, and sometimes longer. The pitch of phrases could vary from an F# ‘tonic’ to A, although not usually by more than a tone at a time. The score represents my impressions of a recording of one blackbird song, and the high notes in particular are often guesswork. I notated each phrase in G to make the relationships between phrases clearer, and did not notate microtones or local variations in tempo.
The Gloria plainchant used in my *Osanna* Mass\(^\text{17}\) consists of five basic phrase types which are made up of opening (‘a’ to ‘e’) and closing (‘x’ and ‘y’) segments (see Example 3.12). Segments and phrases appear in different variations which, like blackbird song, involve the addition, omission or elaboration of material. The simple outline of the *Jesu Christe* phrase, for example (line 5), is elaborated in the phrase *Qui tollis peccata mundi* (line 6), minus the initial note C.

Example 3.12 Gloria Plainchant from Kyriale IX, Transcription. Liber Usualis (“Cum Jubilo: Gloria”)

\(^{17}\) This Gloria is from the set of Mass chants Kyriale IX in the *Liber Usualis*. 
The phrases and segments are assembled in a trajectory that rises overall, with the two higher phrases predominating in the second half of the chant. Through variation the identities of segments can blur from one into another, and are therefore interpretable in more than one way.

Stravinsky’s *Symphonies of Wind Instruments* of 1920 was a groundbreaking example of non-narrative sectional form, and has been regarded as a “paradigm of discontinuity” (Rehding 39). Rehding has noted that a principle of interpolation operates on a formal level, in the assembly of different sections, and within sections in the elaboration of melodies (46-7). The opening theme, for example, appears with several different arrangements of its two motivic segments or cells (see Example 3.13). In the third and longest appearance notes are added to the theme, merging the identities of the two cells, so that the theme can be read as in two ways. It is either: ‘a’ (as in the first appearance), ‘b’ fragment interpolation, ‘a’ (as in the second appearance at RN 9) or: the beginning of ‘a’ (as in the first appearance), ‘b’ interpolation, the rest of ‘a,’ and ‘b’ (Rehding 47).

**Example 3.13** Stravinsky, *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*, Opening Theme (Rehding 47)
In the *Symphonies*, as in the Gloria IX plainchant, the mixture of the sections evolves through the piece (see Table 3.2). The earlier part of the piece (rehearsal numbers 1 to 10) consists of the sections I have labelled A to G; the central part (rehearsal numbers 11 to 41) of sections A, D2, E1, F1, F2, G, and H, and the last part of sections B2, C1, C2, D2, E2 and I. The last part brings back, in extended form, sections from the first part that were not heard in the second part, but the form is not heard as tripartite because of the interlocking arrangement of the sections.

**Table 3.2** Stravinsky, *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*, Sectional Form

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RN:</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>B1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>C1</td>
<td>B1</td>
<td>D1</td>
<td>B1</td>
<td>E1</td>
<td>F1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fanfare chorale I</td>
<td>“wild dance”</td>
<td>little chorale</td>
<td>sigh</td>
<td>first curling melody</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2</td>
<td>+ H</td>
<td>D2+H</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>F2</td>
<td>F2+H</td>
<td>F2</td>
<td>F2</td>
<td>F2+H</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>brass</td>
<td>staccato</td>
<td>extended</td>
<td>second curling melody</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>// 42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>F2</td>
<td>F2+H</td>
<td>F2</td>
<td>E1</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>E1</td>
<td>F1+ I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>accordion</td>
<td>chorale II</td>
<td>(cf A)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>C1</td>
<td>C1</td>
<td>B2</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>C1</td>
<td>C2</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>B2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>octave</td>
<td>staccato bass</td>
<td>tutti</td>
<td>fuller</td>
<td>legato</td>
<td>chorale extended</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18 Kramer’s label (qtd. in Rehding 41).
My choral work, *Vive in Deo*, is made up of longer sections than the previous examples, with some exceptions in the *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*\(^\text{19}\), but employs a similar construction of a series of panels that contain interrelated internal materials (see Figure 3.1). These materials are modal melodies with prominent use of thirds, harmonic fragments from a Brahms Intermezzo, and pigeon calls (a fuller discussion of this piece follows in chapter four).

**Figure 3.1 Vive in Deo, Sectional Form**

A    pigeon calls + modal melodic counterpoint 1  
B    (bar 24) Brahms harmonic fragment 1  
C    (bar 27) modal melodic counterpoint 2 + pigeon calls + Brahms harmonic fragment 2  
D    (bar 38) duo  
E    (bar 59) chorale  
F    (bar 67) modal melody + pigeon calls + mourning dove call + pedal point  
B    (bar 86) Brahms harmonic fragment 1 extended  
E    (bar 92) chorale intensified  
G    (bar 103) Brahms harmonic fragment 2 extended + pigeon calls  
H    (bar 112) harmonic pedal point  
H+D    (bars 132-9) harmonic pedal point + soprano melody from duo.

*Vive in Deo*, “Regard de l’Étoile” and *Symphonies of Wind Instruments* differ from the plainchant and blackbird song by having harmonic and polyphonic textures. Because more than one idea can thus be heard at a time, their distribution or ‘centonization’ of motifs or segments is vertical as well as horizontal, and variation of material can be achieved by change of context as well as by elaboration. In these

---

\(^{19}\) The structure of my choral piece, *Psalm 137*, discussed in chapter four, is made up of shorter sections, and was directly influenced by *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*.  

three pieces, too, the blocks or phrases are more contrasting than in the two monodic examples. Apart from these differences, however, the examples all in their own way assemble a number of sections, and within these sections assemble a number of segments or motives which are interrelated and varied. In each example except for *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*, sections or segments usually recur at the same pitch, creating threads of remaining notes.

**Form and Unity**

The forms in these examples are spatial or ritualistic rather than being dramatic narratives. There is growth in each case except for the blackbird song—for example the extension or intensification of the chorales in *Symphonies of Wind Instruments* and *Vive in Deo*, the addition of interpolations in *Regard de l’Étoile* or the building tessitura in the Gloria IX chant—but this growth is more a result of the arrangement of tiles than a continuous or teleological dramatic argument.

In Stravinsky’s music, the discontinuities between static blocks, and his use of repetition and variation rather than thematic development, are of Russian origin and contrast with the German ideal of “organic unity achieved from within the material itself” (Taruskin, qtd. in Cross 9-10). Stravinsky’s *Symphonies of Wind Instruments* is not derived from one germinal cell (Rehding 61); neither are contrasting materials

---

20 Richard Taruskin has identified Stravinsky’s *Symphonies*, written in memory of Debussy, with the *panikhida* service, or Russian Orthodox office of the dead (Cross 19).

21 A musical idea that generates organic unity can be seen as structural, as with Schenker’s *Ursatz*, or motivic. Schenker initially identified motivic unity with resemblances and associations between different parts of a composition, but came to see it as deriving exclusively from the fundamental structure (Cohn 152-3). In Beethoven’s music, themes and whole movements were seen by his contemporaries as deriving from one motivic nucleus [Rosen, *Romantic* 171]). Schönberg continued this aspect of the Romantic tradition (Cross 10), and the thematic analyses of Rudolph Réti (17, 141) were concerned with tracing the underlying unity of a piece of music to a motivic seed. The musical set-theory of Allen Forte looks for a “primary nexus set,” or connected complex of two or three sets of unordered pitch-classes, as the basis for all pitch material in sections of atonal works (114). Not all complete atonal works can be reduced to a connected set complex, and Forte has described the second of Stravinsky’s *Four Studies for Orchestra* as having complex interrelations between sections that are not part of a “single interconnected system of relations” (139).
resolved, but are woven together into a “non-synthesising balance” (Cross 14) by threads of motif and pitch, which provide connections between ideas that are separated in time. This kind of unity, as in the other musical ‘assemblages’ discussed, seems to be primarily a unity of association between related ideas rather than derivation from a single idea, although that is not to say that a common motivic nucleus could not be found in any of these examples. The association between musical ideas in each case is expressed by repetition or variation in a partitioned structure, rather than through thematic development as part of a unified harmonic narrative, as in sonata form. Instead of being taken apart and transformed, musical ideas are more likely to be changed by their different contexts as they are combined and recombined.

An alternative formal model that has some similarities with my music and the examples I have discussed is the Bible. The principle of connecting themes through a mosaic structure operates through many individual books of the Bible and the Bible as a whole, with the difference that the Bible has a redemptive metanarrative running through the surface discontinuities. Joanna Dewey’s description of Mark’s Gospel as an “interwoven tapestry,” with interpolations, repetitions, echoes and forecasts (to assist the memory of the listeners)\(^2\), sounds remarkably like a description of Stravinsky’s *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*. There is narrative development and climax in Mark, but instead of a single linear outline a number of themes are developed (such as Christology and discipleship) which prompts Dewey to use the analogy of a fugue as well as a tapestry. (7).

In the Book of Isaiah the underlying narrative is less explicit, couched within a montage of different poems and prose passages that do not follow a chronological

---

\(^2\) One example occurs at the end of Mark chapter one, where Jesus could not enter into the towns and so withdraws to the lake of Galilee (Mark 3.7). Between these two events which are consecutive in time, there are five scenes of conflict (Dewey 2).
order (Motyer 31 and 51). On a macro- and often micro-level, these passages are generally made up of static structures such as chiasms (e.g. ABCBA) or parallel structures (ABCABC), and are themselves often collages of existing writings, reassembled to make a coherent whole (343). Messiaen’s *Vingt Regards* has some similarities with the structure of Isaiah in its static forms, retrograde rhythms, palindromes and recurring themes (Griffiths 123 and Bruhn 301). The biblical book that *Vingt Regards* perhaps most resembles however is the Song of Songs, not only for its associations with human and mystical love, but for its circulation of recurring refrains and snippets of narrative, in a static form in which desire dissolves the experience of time. I have also compared my own music to the Song of Songs (see chapter five) because in both, threads of connection unify a non-narrative series of events.

**Summary**

In my music smaller musical events, such as motives, melodies and formal sections, are arranged or ‘centonized’ within a whole piece. Vertically, melodies interact within a modal or poly-modal field, with textures and tonally loose voice-leading that have similarities to Renaissance choral music and Machaut. Horizontally, threads of connection are formed between similar events and significant pitches, in sectional structures that have elements in common with the music of Stravinsky, Messiaen, plainchant and blackbird song.

Although the concept of longer-range connections derives from Schenkerian theory, and my approach to form, like his, is part of a religious world view, there are different symbolisms attached to these approaches. For Schenker, the fundamental
structure of a classical work is identified with God (Cook, “Playing God” 12), and the
musical work represents the “interactional rapport” between God and creation (Schenker, qtd. in “Playing God”10). The work forms a self-contained universe in which each part is centrifugally generated and subsumed by a single idea, the ursatz. In contrast, my music takes a centripetal approach, aiming to achieve coherence by weaving different ideas together and bringing out connections between them.

I see my forms as being entities or ‘betweens’—‘intermezzi’—that are open to what is outside them: to the transcendent and other voices, through the unavoidable ‘centonization’ of shared musical ideas and gestures, and through the conscious borrowing of musical material. There is also an “interactional rapport” here, in the way melodic lines show intentionalities in which transcendent and human, conscious and subconscious impulses cannot be fully disentangled. This rapport is not one in which a generating idea controls the inevitable outworking of the only possible consummation of itself (Solie 151), but is one where the transcendent is symbolically a binding agent for a group of related ideas. This is achieved through the consistent implied presence of remaining notes, as Paul said of Christ: “he is before all things, and in him all things hold together” (Col 1.17).

---

23 Classical forms are less self-contained than Schenker maintained. Cohn has demonstrated that motivic relations create a source of unity independently of the ursatz, “interacting with the Ursatz hierarchy yet maintaining ultimate autonomy with respect to it” (Cohn 169), so that the explanation for all musical phenomena in a tonal work cannot be traced back to a single origin.

24 Reti, in his linear (as opposed to Schenker’s hierarchical) conception of the development of the generating (motivic) idea, also saw its outworking as inevitable (Solie 154 and 152).
Part Three:

Analysis
Chapter Four

Transcendence in Secular and Sacred Choral Works

The four independent choral works in the portfolio express intersections of the human and the divine in their texts and music. The texts of the four works deal with themes of love, memory and desire—erotic, familial and spiritual—and separation over distance. There are separations between those who love over distances of time and space, separations between the material and the transcendent, and between artistic expressions and the realities to which they refer. Through their human experiences and concerns, the texts, as I interpret them, point to the transcendent, the “third who is in our midst,” and to the possibility of meaning.

The musical settings of the texts express immediacies of human experience through modal colour and the use of borrowed material, in ritual-like, sectional forms that express varying degrees of emotional distance. Borrowed materials and threads of remaining notes both symbolise and embody memory, together making ‘memory nests.’ These musical nests, as memory itself, can function as intermediaries or metaxus between the human and the transcendent.
Os Anthos Chortou (As the Flower of the Grass)

The starting point for the musical ideas of my choral work *Os Anthos Chortou* was a knot of ideas relating to love and desire, connection and distance in Sappho’s poem, Fragment 31. In this fragment the poet describes herself as being “greener than grass,” or “paler than dry grass” (Mary Barnard’s translation [Sappho 42]), and the title is a phrase from 1 Peter 1.24\(^1\) that describes human glory as both beautiful and transient. The interrelation of these ideas in the poem directs musical mode, rhythm and form.

*Sappho Fragment 31*

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{fainetai moy kēnos isos theoysin} & \quad \text{He seems to me to be like the gods} \\
\text{emmen ōner, ottis enantios toy} & \quad \text{that man who sits opposite you and} \\
\text{isdanei kai plasion adu fōnei-} & \quad \text{hears you sweetly speaking} \\
\text{sas upakooei} & \quad \text{and pleasantly laughing, for me my}
\end{align*}
\]

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{kai gelaisas imeroën, to m’ēman} & \quad \text{and heart flutters in my breast} \\
\text{kardian en stēthesin eptoaien,} & \quad \text{when I see you suddenly and it is} \\
\text{os gar es s’idō brokhe, ós me fōnais'} & \quad \text{impossible for me to speak,} \\
\text{ood’en et eikei,} & \quad \text{but my tongue sticks and at}
\end{align*}
\]

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{alla kam men glōssa m’ēage, lepton} & \quad \text{once a thin fire runs beneath my} \\
\text{d’autika chrō pur upadedromēken} & \quad \text{skin and my eyes see nothing and} \\
\text{oppatessi d’ood’en orēmm’, epirrom-} & \quad \text{my ears roar,} \\
\text{beisi d’akooai,} & \\
\text{kad de m’idrōs kakkhe-etai tromos de} & \quad \text{and sweat pours down me and}
\end{align*}
\]

\(^1\)“All flesh is like grass and all its glory like the flower of the grass. The grass withers, and the flower falls, but the word of the Lord remains forever.” Peter is quoting Isaiah 40.6-8.
Paisan agrei, chlōrotepa de poyas—trembling seizes me totally and I
emmi, tethnakén d’oligō ‘pideuēs—am greener than grass and I
fainom’ em’ auta.—seem to myself little short of dead.
alla pan tolmton, epei kai penēta—
but all is bearable, since even a poor
man... (Springer)

Desire and Distance in Fragment 31

The setting and interpretation of this poem have been debated for several centuries. Lyn Wilson describes it as the account of “uncontrolled physical/emotional symptoms [which are] the ‘natural’ reaction of a woman maddened by jealousy by the sight of her beloved…with a man” (56). Roger Woodard defines it as a hymenaeus or wedding song, one of several by Sappho, and explains the feelings of the poet as a vicarious participation in the experience of the bride. The word nounphē means both bride and goddess, and according to Woodard, the bride is perceived as both of these at the moment of the wedding, and the groom as god—“He seems to me to be like the gods” (28). Phainetai means ‘he appears’ and ‘he is manifested in an epiphany,’ and a wedding is a moment where appearances become reality. In Sappho’s poetry it is often Aphrodite and Ares who are the appearing divinities (in fragment 111.5 the bridegroom is isos Areui, equal to Ares), and so the poet’s identification with the bride is also a “becoming one” with Aphrodite (28-30).

2 Strong syllables are marked in bold type. Pronunciation is as follows:
a as in father    ai as in aisle
é as in lake     au as in cow
e as in pet      ei as in eight
ó as in phone    eu - eoo
o as in pot      oi as in oil
u as in pool     ou as in spoon.

3 Translation and Greek transliteration by Avery Springer (Springer).
However the poem is interpreted, the theme of desire is central to Sappho’s poetry, and it is described here with particular intensity. This theme fuses the erotic and the spiritual in her writing, and this for me has some resonance with the biblical metaphors of God as lover of Israel, and the lived metaphor of the relationship between God and his people, individually and collectively, in the sacrament of marriage. It is desire that connects human and divine, and this is expressed by Saint John of the Cross, drawing on *The Song of Songs*, in terms that are very similar to those of Sappho:

Fired with love’s urgent longings…
I went out unseen…
To where He waited for me.
O night more lovely than the dawn!…
that has united The Lover and His beloved,
Transforming the beloved in her Lover…
He wounded my neck
With His gentle hand,
Suspending all my senses.
I abandoned and forgot myself,
Laying my face on my Beloved;
All things ceased. (St John of the Cross 68)\(^4\)

There are also issues of distance between the experience and its expression in Sappho’s fragment. The first of these is the language itself, which reveals its meanings through a mask that is at once rigid in its rhythms and fluid in its word order. In the Greek language of Sappho’s time, including her dialect of Lesbos, stressed syllables were twice the length of unstressed syllables, giving the language a predetermined rhythm (Georgiades 109). In Sappho’s Fragment 31, the words with

\(^4\) These lines are taken from *The Ascent of Mount Carmel*, a poem which St John of the Cross used as a basis for his reflections and teaching on spiritual union (St John of the Cross 68).
their individual stress patterns are combined to conform to a combination of poetic feet known as the “Sapphic stanza,” which scans thus:

/ uu / / uu / u / / (three times)

/ uu // (once).

The sentence structure is independent of both the lines and the verses, as can be seen from the translation above, and the meaning of the words is obscured by the word order, as a literal translation of the first stanza shows:

fainetai moy kēnos isos theoysin
he seems to me that [man] like the gods

emmen’ ōner ottis enantios toy
to be that man who opposite you

isdanei kai plasion adu fonei-sits and nearby sweetly speak-
sas upakooei
ing hears [you] … (Springer)

Another aspect of the idea of distance lies in the fact that, despite the intensely personal nature of many of Sappho’s poems, they were written for public performance, as part of a ritual to be sung and danced, most likely by a chorus of women with a leader (Woodard 28). The rigid nature of the rhythms, which masks the immediacy of the words, would have been both necessary for and underscored by the dance. This formality of construction and delivery reveals the artifice of the poem (and of any aesthetic creation); it is a cool-headed skill which can here so effectively express the loss of physical and mental faculties within such formal constraints. The artifice of aesthetic activity points to the distance between representation and reality, whether that reality is earthly or transcendent, but at the same time the masks of
words and music can also bring us into contact with reality, the “fire beneath the skin”.

The music of Os Anthos Chortou expresses the public formality and the intimacy of Fragment 31 by setting its text for both a ‘Greek chorus’ and a ‘solo’ singer, with each group singing the verses in turn (see Figure 4.1).

**Figure 4.1 Os Anthos Chortou, Structure**

chorus 5 (incomplete).

The more formal music of the chorus is directed by the structure and rhythm of the text, so that the musical phrases are the same as the lines of poetry, and the rhythms follow the two to one ratio of the strong and weak syllables (expressed as crotchets and quavers). The chorus sings mostly in C minor (see Example 4.1) with a brief excursion at bar fifty-two into a mode influenced by the ancient Greek chromatic genus (see Example 4.2).

---

5 Verse three of Fragment 31.
6 The chromatic genus was made up of tetrachords, conjunct or disjunct, consisting of intervals of approximately a minor third and two semitones (Christensen 185).
Example 4.1 Maclean, *Os Anthos Chortou*, First Chorus

Example 4.2 Maclean, *Os Anthos Chortou*, Third Chorus
The music of the poet or ‘solo’ singer is also sung by the choir but is differentiated from the chorus by phrasing and mode. It does not follow the structure of the poetry, which often goes against the sense of the words, but phrases with the words against the layout of the lines. The strong/weak pattern of the words is mostly adhered to, but more loosely as the piece progresses. While the chorus uses the more angular and relatively dispassionate sound of C minor (melodic ascending scale), the solo sections are set in the darker octatonic mode, also based initially on C (see Example 4.3). Exploiting the octatonic scale’s lack of a perfect fifth and high number of semitones, the melodies keep turning in on themselves as an expression of emotional intensity.

Example 4.3 Melodic Minor and Octatonic Scales on C

The distinctions between chorus and ‘solo’ are not rigidly maintained, as can be seen by the impurities in the harmonic fields of the different sections in the pitch summary (Example 4.5). In addition to this, throughout Os Anthos Chortou several pitch threads maintain a more or less consistent presence, being heard as significant notes in the material of both chorus and solo sections; they are C, F, F# and B, all part of the C octatonic scale. One example of shared significant pitches is the interval C-F that features prominently in the opening melody, which recurs a number of times (see Example 4.1). It also occurs in a ‘heartbeat’ figure in several sections, both chorus and solo, in reference to the line kardian en stēthesin eptoaisen (“my heart flutters in

7 The octatonic mode is made up of alternating semitones and tones (or vice versa). The octatonic scale used in Os Anthos Chortou is, according to Pieter Van den Toorn’s classification, the second of the three possible transpositions of Model B of the octatonic scale, which begins tone-semitone (51).
my breast”) where it first occurs (see Example 4.4). The overlapping of material between chorus and solo points to an interlinking of intellect and emotion, and the real and represented worlds.

Example 4.4 Maclean, *Os Anthos Chortou*, ‘Heartbeat’ Figure
At the second setting of verse three (bar 59) (see Example 4.5) there is a more extended octatonic passage centered on B, where the subjective octatonic experience takes over from the more objective diatonic formality. The poet’s willing surrender to this experience leaves her “little short of dead,” and this is expressed by a dissolving of the octatonic mode into the key of A minor (bar 78) (see Example 4.6). The progression at this point has a false relation at the point of death (the syllable ‘teth’ of *tethnaken*, ‘to have died’), and is taken from a student assignment I wrote in the style of Dowland, a rather obscure conceit used here because the classical Greek use of dying as a sexual metaphor was a precursor of the same practice in Elizabethan
poetry. The piece ends inconclusively on Sappho’s last unfinished phrase, back in the public sphere of C minor, since “all is bearable,” even ‘death.’

Example 4.6 Maclean, Os Anthos Chortou, Dowlandesque Fragment
**Misera, Ancor do Loco**

The text of *Misera, Ancor do Loco* also deals with issues of desire and distance, this time in a context of betrayal and abandonment in the myth of Ariadne. *Misera* is a setting of the fifth part of Monteverdi’s monody, the *Lamento d’Arianna*, originally written as part of his opera *Arianna* in 1608 for the wedding festivities of Prince Gonzago of Mantua. The only part of the opera to survive is Ariadne’s lament, a monody in eight sections setting Arianna’s words from scene vi.

The libretto by Ottavio Rinuccini is based on the myth of Ariadne and Theseus, and the whole opera takes place on a rocky island in the Mediterranean Sea. Ariadne and Theseus stop there on their way back to Theseus’ home (Athens) from Crete, where Theseus had slain the Minotaur in the labyrinth, finding his way out with the help of Ariadne’s thread. Theseus, on the advice of his councillor, abandons Ariadne and sets sail for Athens while she sleeps. The next morning Ariadne discovers what has happened and sings her lament, during which new ships approach the shore. She leaves, and Thyris informs the audience of the arrival of Bacchus and of his wooing of Ariadne, who returns to the stage with Bacchus and Cupid. Their love is celebrated in a choral finale, in which Jove invites Ariadne and Bacchus to live as gods above the stars (Whenham).

---

*Misera, Ancor do Loco*[^8]

*Misera, ancor do loco*  
Wretched, I still harbour my betrayed hope, and

*alla tradita speme, e non si spegne*  
the flames of hope are still not quenched by this

*fra tanto schern ancor d’Amor il foco.*  
disdain.

[^8]: The words in bold type are taken from the chorus of fishermen in scene vi of the libretto.
Spegni tu morte omai le fiamme indegne.  Come, Death, and quench these unworthy flames!

In van lingua mortale  Where sorrow is infinite
In van porge conforto  The comfort of human tongue
Dove infinito e il male.  Is in vain.
O madre O padre,  O mother, O father,
O de l’antico Regno superbi alberghi,  O lofty palaces of the ancient kingdom,
ov’ebbi d’or la cuna.  where my cradle was of gold!
O servi O fidi amici (ahi fata indegno)  O servants, O faithful friends (oh wretched destiny!)

Ahi, che’l cor mi spezza  Oh, how my heart breaks
Mirate ove m’ha scort’empia fortuna.  Look where cruel fate has brought me.
Mirate di che duol m’ha fatto herede,  Look at the pain to which my love, my trust and
l’amor mia, la mia fede, e l’altrui in ganno.  the treachery of others has made me heir.
Così va chi tropp’ama e troppo crede.  So it is with one who loves too much and believes too much.

Verace amor, degno chi’l mondo ammiri,  Truthful love, worthy of universal admiration,
Ne le miserie estreme  Even in times of extreme misery
Non sai chieder vendetta, e non t’adiri.  You know not how to cry vengeance, nor fly into a rage.
Così va chi tropp’ama e troppo crede.  So it is with one who loves too much and believes too much. (Routley, Arianna 38-9)

In 1614 Monteverdi made the first four parts of the monody into madrigals for five voices, as part of his sixth book of madrigals. Misera, Ancor do Loco is a reworking of the fifth part of Monteverdi’s monody into a five part ‘madrigal,’ modelled on Monteverdi’s reworkings of parts one to four (the music for part V of the monody can be found in Appendix one). It is not an attempt to complete Monteverdi’s work, but is written in dialogue with his monody and madrigals, using
them to inform my own language. I have followed Monteverdi’s madrigal settings by keeping the monody’s melody and harmony throughout, and by extending the monody through the repetition of phrases by imitation, and the repetition of sections in different keys (see Table 4.1).

Table 4.1 Harmonic Summary of Monteverdi’s Monody, Part V, and Maclean’s *Misera Ancor do Loco*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar:</th>
<th>Monody:</th>
<th>Misera:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>A min through G min to D maj;</td>
<td>A min through G min to D maj; D maj (chorus); G min to G maj overlapped by D min to G maj</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95</td>
<td>D min to G maj</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Monody: D maj;</td>
<td>Misera: D maj; D maj; I-V in D min, E min; I-V in G min, A min; A min-maj; Amin; D maj; D min(maj)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>1-V in G min, A min; A min-maj;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>D min(maj)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At the same time I have expanded on Monteverdi’s approach in a number of ways, for example by retaining his harmony, but enriching it with the addition of notes not in keeping with his style. The opening of *Misera* illustrates this, in its addition of a fourth in the A minor chord in bar three, and of a fourth, second and sixth in the C major chord at bar eight (see Examples 4.7 and 4.8).
Example 4.7 Monteverdi, *Lamento d’Arianna*, Part V, Opening

Example 4.8 Maclean, *Misera, Ancor do Loco*, Opening
I have also extended two of Monteverdi’s ways of producing dissonance. The first is dissonance by displacement, in which a note is delayed or anticipated, sounding against the harmony. A well known example of this is the bass line of the opening of the first madrigal, *Lasciatemi morire* (see Example 4.9). In the second type of dissonance, upper parts sing a passing or neighbouring chord over a bass which does not change. An example occurs in the third madrigal, *Dove, dov’è la fede*, (bars 10-11) where the upper four parts sing a passing chord D over a G bass (Example 4.10), sounding two harmonies together.

**Example 4.9** Monteverdi, *Il Lamento d’Arianna*, “Lasciatemi Morire,” Dissonance by Displacement

**Example 4.10** Monteverdi, *Il Lamento d’Arianna*, “Dove, Dov’è la Fede” (bars 8-11), Dissonant Passing Chord
In *Misera*, there are also momentary dissonances by displacement or overlap, as for example in bar twelve, where the altos, tenor one and basses prolong the G minor chord as the other parts move to D major (chord V). In this case the prolonged G minor does not resolve onto D but stops sounding, making room for the D to emerge (see Example 4.11).

**Example 4.11** Maclean, *Misera*, Overlapping I to V Cadence, bars 12-13

More extended examples of harmonic overlap occur between bars forty-seven and sixty-three, including some repeated superimpositions of two chords that are consecutive in the monody. This culminates at bar sixty-one, where Arianna contrasts her trust with Teseo’s (Theseus’) treachery; the monody begins this phrase with chords IV6-V (bar 103) (Example 4.12) and *Misera* pits these two chords against each other simultaneously (Example 4.13).
Example 4.12 Monteverdi, *Lamento d’Arianna*, Part V, at *la mia fede*

Example 4.13 Maclean, *Misera*, at *la mia fede*

Another instance of harmonic overlap in *Misera* derives from Monteverdi’s practice of pre-empting passages in the madrigals, by interpolating a version that is transposed, usually by a fourth or a fifth, before the passage itself in the original key.
of the monody. At bar twenty-six of *Misera*, there begins a progression that moves from G minor to C major, ending in bar thirty-four. The same progression, now from D minor to G major (as it occurs in the monody from bar 95) (see Example 4.14) begins in bar twenty-nine in the bass and bar thirty-one in the tenors, causing a polyphonic overlap of five bars (see Example 4.15).

Example 4.14 Monteverdi, *Lamento d’Arianna*, Part V, at *O Madre*
Example 4.15 Maclean, Misera, at O Madre
Lastly, *Miserà* introduces three ‘chorus’ sections into the setting of the monody. In the original libretto for scene vi (the scene of Arianna’s lament) there is a chorus of fishermen who comment sympathetically on Arianna’s plight, and three of their statements make up the three chorus sections\(^\text{10}\). The interpolation of the choruses expands on Monteverdi’s practice of interpolating phrases in different keys. The music for the chorus sections, however, is not based on the monody, but is new harmony in which the chords are made up of two triads, a fourth or fifth apart (see Example 4.16). This is also an extension of Monteverdi’s passing or neighbouring chord dissonances (see Example 4.10, page 80), and makes an aural connection to the passage at bar twenty-nine, where two harmonic progressions of a fifth apart overlap (see Example 4.15).

---

\(^{10}\) In the libretto these statements occur between different parts of the monody, not within part v.
Harmonic Form and “Blurring the Image”

In Monteverdi’s monody the harmony generally moves around rather than through the tonal space of each section; key areas are usually defined by their dominant, but the tonal space itself is not defined by the key of the dominant as a counter-pole to the tonic. According to Eric Chafe, harmonic progression in the monody is informed by tonal imagery that expresses Arianna’s anger and Teseo’s cruelty in sharper tonal centres, and Arianna’s remorse and resignation in flatter tonal centres. These keys centre around the recurring key of D minor, representing her love for Teseo (166-7). Chafe has noted that the reworkings of the monody in Monteverdi’s madrigals (II, III and IV) clarify the tonal space by setting the last subsection twice, first by transposing
it up a fifth (the key of the dominant) before restating it at the original tonic pitch (182).

The tonality of part five of Monteverdi’s monody is not clarified in my reworking. A major, the key of V, is not established as a tonal centre, and the interpolations of the chorus in D major increase the recurrence of D as a tonal centre, as can be seen in a comparison between the two harmonic schemes (see Table 4.1, page 78). The sense of changing harmonic movement and colour around a static centre that is found in the monody has parallels in my own style, and I accentuated this sense rather than clarifying the tonal structure as Monteverdi did in his madrigal settings.

Eric Chafe remarks on how Monteverdi’s settings of the monody transform it from a naturalistic, spontaneous and rhythmically fluid expression of emotion to a more formal reflection on the text, with more tonal definition and demarcated with blocks of repetition and a regular metre (172, 176 and 184), albeit one that is still very immediate in its use of dissonance. Misera formalises part five of the monody in similar ways, further breaking up the flow with the three choruses. The distance from the monody is also increased by the use at times of a thicker texture of more than five parts, and an obscuring of the clarity of the original triadic harmony by the use of added notes and harmonic overlap. The way the harmonic ‘paint’ runs blurs the image of the original monody, and serves as a metaphor for how the boundaries of style and authorship have been blurred in this modelling of Monteverdi’s monody and madrigals.
Vive in Deo

The text of Vive in Deo, like that of Misera, Ancor do Loco, is about love and the memory of love, and abandonment through death rather than betrayal; the memories are of love not entirely lost. The text is my arrangement of a collection of inscriptions from the Roman catacombs, taken from Spencer’s book of 1877, A Visit to the Roman Catacombs (119-120). Spencer dates these inscriptions from the St Calixtus catacombs from the first three centuries C.E.11

Vive in Deo

Mnēskēsthe, mnēsthēs
Anatolius filio benemerenti fecit
qui vixitannis septem,
mensis septem, diebus viginti.
issespiritus tuus bene requiescat in Deo;
petas pro sorore tua.

Philoumenē, en eirēnē sou to pneuma.

Mnēskēsthe
Dionysius, nēpios akakos,
entha de keite meta tôn hagiōn,
mmēskēsthe de kai hēmōn
en tais hagiāis hymōn preuchais,

Cyriaco caro, filio dulcissimo:

Remember, may you remember
Anatolius made this for his well deserving son
who lived seven years,
seven months, ten days.
may your spirit rest well in God;
pray for your sister.
Beloved, may your spirit be in peace.

Dionysius, innocent child,
lies here with the saints,
and remember us too
in your holy prayers,
both me who engraved and me who wrote this.
Cyriaco, dear one, sweet child:

11 Vive in Deo was commissioned by the St. Louis Chamber Chorus for a concert to be held in the chapel of the Sisters of St Joseph of Carondelet in St. Louis MO, where the complete bones of seven martyrs originally from the Roman catacombs are housed. The history of these relics is given in an article in the St Louis Post-Dispatch by Joan Little (May 10, 1998).
vivas in Spiritu Sancto. may you live in the Holy spirit.

Semper in Deo vivas; May you always live in God;
Agape, vivas in aeternum; Agape, may you live in eternity;
zēkaien Kyriō; live in the Lord;
En eirēnē sou to pneuma; may your spirit be in peace;
Spes, pax; peace to you, Spes (hope);
dulcis anima. sweet soul.

Mnēsthēs, Iesous ho Kyrios, Lord Jesus, may you remember
Teknon hēmōn. our child.
Castorino,coniugi bono et dulcissimo, Castorino, good and sweet husband,
qui vixit annos sexaginta unus, who lived sixty one years,
menses quinque, dies decem; five months and ten days;
benemerenti. well deserving.
Uxor eius hoc fecit. Your wife made this.
Vive in Deo. Live in God.
Mnēakesthe Remember
Philoumenē beloved
Mnēsthēs, Iesous ho Kyrios, Lord Jesus, may you remember
Teknon hēmōn. our child.
Vive Live
caro dear one
Mnēsthēs. may you remember.
Semper in Deo vivas, dulcis anima12. Sweet soul, may you always live in God. (Barnes)

---

12 The Greek text is in italics, with accented syllables in bold type. Greek pronunciation is as follows:

a as in father   ai as in aisle   th as in thin
ē as in lake    ei as in eight   ch - k
e as in pet     eu – eoo        ph as in phone
ō as in phone   oi as in oil    g as in gate
o as in pot     ou as in spoon. pn as in pneumatic
y as in keep
The music of Vive in Deo incorporates music from two sources that have personal symbolic associations with the idea of memory. The first source is Brahms’ Intermezzo in E minor, op.119 (see Example 4.17), which is one of many pieces that I remember my father playing when I was a child. Vive in Deo was written two years after his death, and these references to the Intermezzo are my own musical inscription to his memory.

Example 4.17 Brahms, Intermezzo op. 119, Beginning

Brahms himself made many allusions to other music in his works. In an example directly connected to the idea of remembering, Paul Berry has investigated the relationship between a piano piece he wrote for Clara Schumann, later revised and entitled Capriccio, and a song he wrote for her called Alte Liebe (Old Love). He used material from the piano piece in the lied and, although it was set to a nostalgic text about lost love, this musical remembrance is interpreted by Berry as a personal gesture affirming their long-standing friendship (Berry 110).
Several fragments were taken from the intermezzo and used motivically through *Vive*, starting with the opening two chords (upbeat and downbeat), which appear as a repeated figure at bars twenty-four and eighty-five in *Vive* (see Example 4.18).

**Example 4.18** Maclean, *Vive in Deo*, First Brahms Fragment

![Example 4.18 Maclean, Vive in Deo, First Brahms Fragment](image)

The two chords which follow (E minor and A minor, with appogiaturas) are woven into the texture of the passage beginning at bar twenty-seven (Soprano 2 and Alto) (see Example 4.19). The A minor chord with appoggiatura, comprising the second beat of Brahms’ first bar, emerges more clearly in the passage beginning at bar 102 as a repeated figure (see Example 4.20, starting at bar 105).
Example 4.19 Maclean, Vive, Second Brahms Fragment

Example 4.20 Vive, Third Brahms Fragment
The first eight bars of the Brahms melody are taken up by the first Sopranos in the chordal passage at bar ninety-two; at bar ninety-six this passage culminates in a cadence also taken from the Intermezzo, which in that piece returns the music to the opening theme (see Example 4.21).

Example 4.21 Maclean, Vive, Brahms Melody and Cadence

The second source of musical material in Vive are pigeon calls, a reference to the dove which has divine connections for most religions of the Middle East, and a complex of symbolisms in the Judeo-Christian traditions. Through its part in the story of Noah (Genesis 8) the dove is associated with hope; it is also a symbol of the love of
God for his people, perhaps because of the faithfulness of the mating pair, and white doves were used as sacrificial offerings for purification in the temple, thereby symbolising purity—compare Jesus’ admonition to be as “innocent as doves” (Matt 10.16). In the New Testament the Holy Spirit appeared at Jesus’ baptism in the form of a dove (Matt 3.16) (Rubin). The dove was a common symbol above catacomb inscriptions (see Figure 4.2), and a connection can be made with the idea of memory through the association of doves with faithful love, and perhaps also by the repetitious nature of their cooing.

**Figure 4.2** Catacomb Inscription with Dove, Chapel of the Sisters of St Joseph of Carondelet, St. Louis MO.

The pigeon calls in *Vive* are those of the spotted turtledove, an Asian species introduced to Sydney, the appropriately named North American mourning dove, and the rock pigeon which is found in most parts of the world. The piece opens with repeated figures setting the word ‘remember,’ transcribed from turtledove calls in our
back garden (see Example 4.22) and these figures appear intermittently throughout the work.

Example 4.22 Maclean, Vive, Turtledove Calls

A pair of North American mourning doves calls, along with turtledoves, in the passage beginning at bar sixty-seven. I imitated their practice of one bird calling on one note (Alto, bar 73) and the other responding a tone higher (Soprano 2, bar 76) (see Example 4.23).

Example 4.23: Vive, North American Mourning Dove calls
The rock pigeon’s call has a more complex articulation which obscures the pitch; I approximated two different calls which are both heard in the opening passage (setting *in bono* and *Agape vivas*) (see Example 4.24), and the first of these is heard once more towards the end of the piece (see Example 4.20, Alto 2, bar 109).

**Example 4.24** Maclean, *Vive*, Rock Pigeons

The music into which the borrowed materials are woven is made up of melodies which are often plainsong-like—they are a memory of plainsong, which itself is a memory and development of the Greek, Roman and Jewish musics from which it arose, and with some of which the writers of the inscriptions would have been familiar. The homophonic passages in *Vive* are also a kind of remembering of the harmony in Brahms’ Intermezzo, in the way that the sharpness supplied by the non-harmonic notes, particularly in the opening of the Intermezzo, is extended in the
clashing notes of the *Vive* harmonies (see Example 4.21). This sharpness is, perhaps in both pieces, an expression of the emotional dissonance caused by the experience of loss.

**Memory, Time and Eternity**

There is a palpable sense of loss in the text of *Vive*, a sense of the distance between the past of the deceased and the present of the inscription, which is now to us also past. But the text also interweaves time and eternity, for the passing of time that causes death will, in terms of Christian eschatology, also bring history and Christ’s redemption to fulfillment, something the early Christians saw as imminent. Those honoured in the inscriptions had been released into a ‘now’ that was ‘not yet’ for those remembering them.

Does the fulfillment of history mean the end of time? Is eternity timeless? The classical idea of eternity was *nunc stans*—“the standing now” (Desmond, *God* 294). T.S. Eliot and Messiaen saw eternity as a still point\(^\text{14}\) and unmoving (Koozin, “Spiritual” 194) in contrast to Karl Barth’s vision of uninterrupted duration, unfragmented by forgetting, death or destruction (Richardson 139). Whatever the case, there is in Christianity an intermediation between time and eternity, an “equipoise of immanence and transcendence” (Desmond, *God* 296) through eternity’s continual bringing to be of immanent reality (294 and 296), and through God’s participation in this reality and its time in the incarnation of Jesus. Eliot’s still point is present in time, as suggested by Morris Weitz, as the *telos* or goal of history, which is Christ:

\(^{14}\) *Burnt Norton II* (Eliot 15).
Time past and time future
What might have been and what has been
Point to one end, which is always present. (Burnt Norton I [Eliot 14])

Memory, though arising out of time, points beyond it by telescoping and rearranging the past, connecting things that are temporally distant, and making present things or people that are absent, though, as with mimesis, this presence is not a full presence. Musical borrowing is a form of memory, and the cutting and pasting of borrowed material into new contexts is an illustration of what memory does to time. For borrowing, too, there is a connection and separation in relation to the original, a presence and an absence. As the sidestepping of time that memory (and musical memory) performs is an intimation of eternity, so memory’s threads of connection, if they begin in love, can also point to the origin of love, the “one end, which is always present.” Inscriptions in the catacombs betray great tenderness in their brevity—some lives are remembered to the day.

Psalm 137

Psalm 137, like the texts of Misera, Ancor do Loco and Vive in Deo, deals with separation, in this case exile from a geographical and spiritual home. Psalm 137 sets the first eight verses of the psalm in the original Hebrew, which is given here with a translation that makes reference to the one in The Book of Psalms by Robert Alter (Alter 473). Hebrew and English words are aligned as much as possible.

---

15 Weitz is referred to in Fiddes (136).
Psalm 137

Al naharot Bavel, sham yashavnu gam bachinu, b’zochrenu et Tzion.

By the rivers of Babylon, there we sat and wept when we remembered Zion.

Al aravim b’tocha, talinu kinoroteynu.

On the poplars there we hung up our harps.

Ki sham shelunu shoveynu, divrey shir,

For there asked our captors words of song,

V’tolaleynu simcha, shiru lanu mishir Tzion.

And our plunderers, (rejoicing or) ‘rejoice! Sing for us from the songs of Zion’

Eych nashir et shir Adonai, al admat nechar?

How can we sing a song of the Lord on foreign soil? (soil foreign)

Im escachech Yerushalayim, tishcach yemini.

If I forget you, Jerusalem, I will forget my right (hand). (may my right hand wither)

Tidbaq l’shoni l’chiki, im lo ezc’rechi,

My tongue will cleave to my palate, if I don’t remember (you),

(Will cleave my tongue to my palate)

Im lo a’aleh et Yerushalayim, al rosh simchati16. (The Book of Psalms 384)

If I don’t elevate Jerusalem above my highest joy. (The Holy Bible 626 and Alter 473)

Psalm 137 is an account of the experience of the Judeans in exile in Babylon in 586 BCE (Alter 473), after Jerusalem was sacked and its survivors taken as prisoners. The author speaks of the distance between the exiles and God’s dwelling place in Jerusalem, and in writing the piece I expanded this idea metaphorically to refer to the distances between past and present, and the dead and the living, as well as the distance between the material world and the transcendent: “And these are but the

---

16 Pronunciation is as follows:
a as in father    ai is ‘a’ plus ‘i’
u as in pool      ey and eh as in Latin pleni
e as in pet       ch as in Scottish loch
i as in feet      r is like a soft ‘d’.
O as in German tod
outer fringe of his works; how faint the whisper we hear of him!” (Today’s New International Version, Job 26.14). These ideas are expressed through the use of borrowed material which has associations with the themes of distance, and through musical devices which displace the flow of musical time, influenced by Stravinsky’s The Soldier’s Tale and Symphonies of Wind Instruments.

I have used fragments of three works from the past in this piece. Two are works by Bach that use the melody An Wasserflüssen Babylon, which sets a paraphrase of this Psalm: his chorale harmonisation and chorale prelude (see Examples 4.31 and 4.25). The other is Schumann’s Von Fremden Ländern und Menschen (Of Foreign Lands and People), the first piece in his Kinderscenen, which I remember my father playing in my childhood (Example 4.26).

Example 4.25 Bach, Chorale Prelude on An Wasserflüssen Babylon (bars 1-17)
From the Schumann I took the falling fourth, G F# E D, from bars one and two (a recurring motif through both this piece and Psalm 137), as well as the chords at the beginning of bars two and three, which appear in bar forty-two (see Example 4.27). I also put the harmony of Schumann’s opening eight bars in canon with itself (bar 74), changing the sequence of some of the chords (see Example 4.28).
Example 4.27 Maclean, *Psalm 137*, Schumann Chords 1
From the Bach chorale prelude (see Example 4.25) I used part of the first two phrases of the chorale melody (in the tenor clef) at bar fifty of Psalm 137 (see Example 4.29), and the first two phrases of the opening ritornello melody at bar eighty-four of Psalm 137. The two melodies are the same except for the cadences of their second phrases. The first phrase of Bach’s chorale melody appears at the opening (soprano, bar 7) and closing of Psalm 137 (see Example 4.30) and in the first ‘chorale’ at bar 64, in the bass and then the alto.
Example 4.29 Maclean, *Psalm 137*, Bach Chorale Melody (Soprano)
From the Bach harmonization of the chorale melody (Example 4.31) I took some of the chords that are ‘between the cracks’—the chords between pure triads, in which harmonic notes have been displaced by passing notes and suspensions (such as the chords on the second quaver of bar 1 and the seventh quaver of bar 11). These chords were rearranged and used to make the chordal motives first appearing at bars sixteen (see Example 4.32) and thirty (see Example 4.33).
Example 4.31 Bach’s Harmonisation of *An Wasserflüssen Babylon* (Riemenschneider 2)

Example 4.32 Maclean, *Psalm 137*, First Harmonic Motif
Example 4.33 Maclean, *Psalm 137*, Second Harmonic Motif (bar 30)

The melodic writing and musical structure of *Psalm 137* were influenced by traditional music of Babylonian Jews and two works by Stravinsky. I drew on two Babylonian melodies, a liturgical setting of Lamentations (Example 4.34) and a folk melody (Example 4.35), both taken from Idelsohn’s book, *Jewish Music*, and their influence can be seen in the opening of the piece in the alto (bar 4) and bass (bar 6) (see Example 4.30, page 105).

Example 4.34 Lamentations 1.1 (Idelsohn 54)
Example 4.35 Hammaydil Ben Kodesh (Idelsohn 373)

The influence of Russian folk melody on Stravinsky’s music has also produced repetitive ‘curling’ melodies in a limited range, as for example at rehearsal number six of his Symphonies of Wind Instruments (see Example 4.36), and the influence of this kind of melody, particularly with the prominence of the interval of a fourth, can be seen in Psalm 137 and indirectly in many pieces I have written. The chorale-like phrase in Symphonies which first appears two bars before rehearsal number two (Example 4.37) is also in retrospect very similar to the first chordal motif in Psalm 137 (Example 4.32), made up of Bach chorale chords.
From *The Sold Ier's Tale (Histoire du Soldat)* *Psalm 137* takes the idea of ostinatos which come and go. The E minor repeated figure at bars 17 and 102 of *Psalm 137* (see Example 4.38) is similar to Stravinsky’ ostinatos in that it has two notes (see Example 4.39) and runs in quavers (see Example 4.40). Unlike these
ostinatos, with their residue of tonic-dominant oom-pah which, like its melodies, are “related to clichés common to European Art Music” (Mellers, qtd. in Van den Toorn 185), the single chord E minor ostinato evokes water (the streams of Babylon) rather than walking. An ostinato-like line in the tenor at bar forty-nine (Example 4.29, p.104) also derives from Stravinsky’s ostinato in scene one, in its diatonic interval leaps and static, non-functional harmonic sonorities.

Example 4.38 Maclean, Psalm 137, E Minor Ostinato

Example 4.39 Stravinsky, The Soldier’s Tale, Introduction, Ostinato (Van den Toorn 184)
Example 4.40 Stravinsky, *The Soldier’s Tale*, Scene 1, Ostinato (Boykan 159)

The arpeggiated figure that first appears in the introduction of *The Soldier’s Tale* (Example 4.39) finds an echo in the alto’s arpeggio which sets the word *kinoroteynu* or ‘our harps,’ first occurring at bar twenty-three (see Example 4.41).

Example 4.41 Maclean, Psalm 137, *Kinoroteynu*

The structure of *Psalm 137* interpolates repetitions of verses into the original poem (see Figure 4.3) so that textual ideas and musical ideas return through the piece, though not always in the same combination.
Figure 4.3 Maclean, *Psalm 137* Text, Structure

Verse 1) By the waters, there we wept  
2) On the willows  
3) For there our captors  
4) How can we sing?  
5) If I forget you  
6) Let my tongue stick  
1) There we wept  
2) On the willows  
5) If I forget you  
6) If I do not elevate Jerusalem

The musical structure of *Psalm 137*, following the *Symphonies of Wind Instruments*, is a rondo-like form in which ideas recur in different combinations and in episodes of varying lengths. In *Symphonies* there are two threads, octatonic and diatonic (Rehding 53), which are juxtaposed throughout the work and synthesised together in the final chorale section (62), whereas in *Psalm 137* most material is diatonic. In both works individual melodies are usually modal but their combinations are often ambiguous, most consistently in the Stravinsky. *Symphonies* culminates in an extended chorale with interpolations of previous material, while in *Psalm 137* there is an extended passage of two chorales two-thirds of the way through the work. Finally, in both pieces, there are predominant pitches or remaining notes within sections and on a macro-level. In *Symphonies*, ideas often return on different pitches, but according to Alexander Rehding’s analysis (61) there are overall significant pitches which “reveal continuities between non-adjacent moments” (65), notably a ‘remaining’ note D in the upper voice of the graph, and two descents to C in the bass. These are more audible in the extended chorale from rehearsal number 42 onward (see Example 4.42). In *Psalm 137* ideas recur mostly on the same pitch, and so are a
source of remaining notes—the most consistently recurring pitches are A and D, which belong to a number of motives (see Example 4.43).

**Example 4.42** “Associative Graph” of Stravinsky’s *Symphonies of Wind Instruments* (Rehding 61)

**Example 4.43** Maclean, *Psalm 137*, Summary

* Bach chorale melody
The distance of exile referred to in Psalm 137 and the metaphorical distances between material and transcendent, past and present are expressed musically through displacement in a number of ways. The act of borrowing music is in itself a displacement—the borrowed material is “in exile” in a foreign musical place. Structurally in Psalm 137, drawing from Symphonies of Wind Instruments, a sense of continuity of ideas is sometimes interrupted by abrupt changes of material, and by the fragmentary nature and open-endedness of some sections. There is also displacement in the construction of harmony in Psalm 137; on a local level, almost every chord is derived from the Bach or Schumann sources and, in the case of the Bach chords, used mostly in orders that have no reference to their original harmonic function or context. The individual Bach chords are themselves also displaced, being the ones from the chorale that are in transition between stable triads. On a structural level, the piece spends most of its time “in exile” from its key of G major, the key of each of the three sources. The only passage in G, the extended chorale section (bar 64), is roughly two-thirds of the way through, and it is followed by a passage on an A pedal, and a recapitulation of three keys in succession, ending on an ambiguous cadence. Of the last five chords, the first two are Schumann’s first two chords (incomplete), and the last three chords are part of Bach’s final cadence (the ii 6/5-ii), without the resolution of V-I (see Examples 4.44 and 4.45).

**Example 4.44 Bach Chorale, Final Cadence**
Example 4.45 Maclean, *Psalm 137*, Final Cadence

Each of the musical sources for *Psalm 137* have their own connections to ideas relating to “distance” and the past. *Symphonies of Wind Instruments* was composed in memory of Debussy, and its continual traces or memories of tonality were written by a man who would foreground the relationships of music with its past more than perhaps any other twentieth century composer. Memory and loss form a thread through much of Schumann’s music, and most of his Lieder are about absence and regret, often expressed by the dislocation of harmony and melody, and open endings (Rosen, *The Romantic* 217-18). In *Von Fremden Ländern und Menschen*, the only time the melody rests on the tonic is in the middle of the piece at the end of the cycle of fifths, and then only briefly.

The sense of distance in Bach’s chorale prelude comes from its “elusive” quality, in its sarabande rhythm without upbeat and the unusual, ostinato-like returns of the soprano ritornello theme (Williams 348). This elusiveness extends to the harmony which, because of the nature of the melody (written in 1525), moves around rather than through its musical space; the key of the dominant does not define the
tonal space as a counter-pole to the tonic, but is only one of several keys in transit and does not play a role in returning the music to its home key\textsuperscript{17}.

The harmonic and motivic recurrences in Bach’s chorale prelude are like water lapping—the waters of Babylon. Water in its continuous movement can be seen here as time, time which exiles us from the past and from a direct experience of the eternal. The “rivers of Babylon” are likely to refer to the network of canals that connected the Tigris and Euphrates (Alter 473), two of the four rivers named in the garden of Eden (Gen 2.10-14), and so the Judeans mourning the loss of Jerusalem, God’s dwelling place, sit and weep beside the original waters of paradise and the unbridgeable gulf of time past. But the Psalm goes on to say, “Should I forget you, Jerusalem, may my right hand wither…if I do not set Jerusalem above my chief joy” (Alter 474-5). Desmond has said that time, “as given to be, points immanently to its other… What possibilises time is not itself time … Thus we find arising for us the thought of eternity” (\textit{God} 293). If time points to eternity, we do not “forget Jerusalem.” Just as Psalm 137, and the \textit{Symphonies of Wind Instruments} which influenced it, express distance through discontinuities, there are also “continuities between non-adjacent moments” (Rehding 65). These continuities are found in the notes and gestures which remain in the music through presence and absence, and so point to eternity.

\textbf{Summary}

As stated at the outset, the texts of these four works are about love, memory and desire, and separation or distance between those who love. Connection and

\textsuperscript{17} The final G major slips in from A minor, and is only then confirmed by a modulation to a cadence in D.
distance are expressed through the use of borrowed melodies and harmonies, which retain some of the poignancy of their original contexts and are often symbolic of connection and distance in my own life. Distance is also expressed through the formality of panel structures—the solo-chorus form of Os Anthos Chortou, the sections and interpolations of Misera, Ancor do Loco, the panels of Vive in Deo (discussed in chapter three) and the Stravinsky influenced segments of Psalm 137.

The human separations and the poetic and musical artifice used to express them point to other distances and connections: in Os Anthos Chortou between words and music and the realities they express; in Misera, Ancor do Loco between musical image and original; in Vive in Deo between the past and the present, and Psalm 137 adds to this the distance and connections between the material and the transcendent. These distances and connections take place within the different mediums or metaxus of text and music which are part of the fabric of the larger “between”—Desmond’s milieu of immanent being in which human experience is played out (God 9). A metaxu, as Simone Weil saw it\(^\text{18}\), is something which both separates and connects, as, for example, the physical world is both a barrier from and a way through to God (Weil 145), and above all Christ is “the metaxu of humanity and God” (Nevin 457). The concept of metaxu can be applied to several observations which arose in the discussions of the four choral works, as in the description of time as both hiding eternity and pointing to it as its possibilising Other, in the reflections on the text of Psalm 137. In regard to Os Anthos Chortou it was suggested that the artifice or mask of words and music in artistic works both distances us from and connects us to the material and transcendent realities to which they refer.

\(^{18}\) “Metaxu” is a concept Weil adapted from Plato. Desmond defines Plato’s metaxu as the “middle space between the One and the Many” (God 55).
George Steiner writes of this dual relationship between expression and meaning that, although meaning is not something that can be completely grasped, there is “in the art-act and its reception,…in the experience of meaningful form, a presumption of presence” (214). This presumption of presence is a “wager on meaning” (215), and Steiner asks whether “the encounter with meaning in the verbal sign, in the painting, in the musical composition…can be made intelligible…if they do not imply, if they do not contain, a postulate of transcendence” (134). Without such a postulate of a transcendent source of meaning, meaning is the moving trace of an absent source. “Where there is no ‘face of God’ for the semantic marker to turn to, there can be no transcendent or decidable intelligibility” (132).

In the discussion of Vive in Deo, memory was seen as both connection to and distance from the one remembered, and as a metaxu to the transcendent also, in its intimation of eternity and the source of love. Memory plays an important role in the musical interpretation of the texts, as in these pieces musical artifice builds a ‘memory nest’ using material borrowed from historical sources. These nests are held together in part through the weaving of remaining notes, which themselves are a symbol and embodiment of memory in their recurrence. As I have already identified remaining notes as an expression of the eternal transcendent, this symbolism adds the dimension of memory to the transcendent: “Can a woman forget her nursing child, that she should have no compassion on the son of her womb? Even these may forget, yet I will not forget you” (Isa. 49.14-15). Without memory there is no meaning, whether it is our own clumsy and approximate memory, or the memory of the transcendent.

---

19 Memory involves images, and thus as a kind of mimesis, is a metaxu between oneself and the original person or event, which is other to the memory but made manifest by it (from Plato’s concept of mimesis [Desmond, *Art* 32]).

20 God also asked Israel to remember him (Deut 8.18), and in the Eucharist, which Jesus asked that we “do this in remembrance” of him (from Luke 22.19), there is a clear coming together of memory, presence and meaning.
who, “the same yesterday, today and forever” (Heb 13.8) underwrites the possibility of identity and significance within the flux of language and experience.
Chapter Five

Expression of the Transcendent through Birds, Bells and Octatonicism

The two instrumental works in the folio, the piano trio *Lai* and the orchestral *Panah*, are both concerned with the expression, through a textless musical medium, of the immanent presence of the eternal transcendent in time and the material world. The eternal is evoked through the use of octatonic harmonic stasis, influenced in this by Takemitsu and Hosokawa, and the use of bird song and bell sounds which are also harmonically static\(^1\) and bring with them symbolic associations of the transcendent. The musical spaces created by these two pieces are compared to those of works by Takemitsu, who spoke of his music as a Japanese garden, representative of eternity as an immanent ground of being. *Lai* and *Panah* are likened to the garden of the “Song of Songs,” whose ground of being, represented as the male lover\(^2\), is transcendent and yet appears: “I sought him, but found him not” (3.1) and yet “Behold, you are beautiful” (1.16).

*Lai*

*Lai* is a ‘chorale prelude’ written for clarinet, cello and piano, based on the Lutheran chorale melody *An Wasserflüssen Babylon* (By the Rivers of Babylon). The text of this melody is a paraphrase of Psalm 137 (see chapter four) which for the

---

\(^1\) The bird songs I used had refrains which recurred on the same, or nearly the same, pitch, and in the case of the blackbird, most phrases also had a common tonic, within a margin of a tone.

\(^2\) In Judaism and Christianity there are traditions of interpretation of the “Song of Songs” in which spiritual allegory of various forms co-exist with (and sometimes suppress) literal readings (Hess 22-3). This interpretation of these two phrases is my own, for the purposes of the analogy of music as a garden which contains the transcendent.
purposes of this piece is seen as a metaphor for both a distance or ‘exile’ between the material world and its transcendent creator, and a connection between them. *Lai* uses a combination of the octatonic mode and birdsong to express an interweaving of transcendent and material realities.

The structure of *Lai* is loosely modelled on Bach’s chorale prelude for organ on *An Wasserflüssen Babylon* (BVW 653), which has an introduction and interludes separating statements of the melody’s phrases (see Table 5.1). Bach’s prelude is in a ritornello form with the opening material, derived from the first two phrases of the chorale, returning several times in varied forms. The opening of *Lai* is also derived from the beginning of the chorale melody, but only the first two notes D and E. Most of the musical ideas which recur are not directly connected to the chorale melody as they are in the Bach prelude.

### Table 5.1 Maclean, *Lai*, Structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>31</th>
<th>37</th>
<th>47</th>
<th>62</th>
<th>81</th>
<th>93</th>
<th>111</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intro</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B/A</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Coda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>^^^^</td>
<td>^</td>
<td></td>
<td>^</td>
<td>^</td>
<td>^^^^^</td>
<td>^^</td>
<td>^</td>
<td>^</td>
<td>^</td>
<td>^</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A: chorale phrase  B: interlude

___ chorale  ^^^^ birds  ----- octatonic I  ...... Octatonic III

Two transpositions of the octatonic mode provide the harmonic structure of *Lai*; each octatonic collection makes up a harmonic field, and the music moves...
between collections I and III\(^3\) (see Example 5.1). Octatonic collection I is associated with the chorale melody and birdsong references, and contains a G major triad, the tonic triad of the chorale, although G does not act as a tonic in the octatonic collection (these sections are marked as A in Table 5.1). Collection III is used for the interludes between the melodic phrases (marked as B), most of which contain more sustained passages of material derived from birdsong. Collection III contains an A major triad, which again is not a tonic, and A major is the key of the blackbird’s song (this is the actual pitch of the blackbird’s song, which was pitched between A and G every time I heard it). There are no pure statements of an octatonic collection except in the piano interlude (transposition III), because the chorale and bird song provide foreign notes, and the prevailing collection at any time includes some reference to the other collection.

**Example 5.1 Octatonic Collections I and III**

![Octatonic Collections I and III](image.png)

**Birdsong symbolism and notation**

*Lai* incorporates the song of several birds local to Sydney, presented as transcription or freely paraphrased—the magpie, currawong, pied butcher bird, bell bird and blackbird. ‘Lai’, an English or old French name for ‘song’, and the name of

---

\(^3\) These collections are labelled according to Van den Toorn’s categorization, and are “Model A” collections, starting semitone-tone (50).
an extended song form from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, quite possibly
derives from the Irish loïd or laïd meaning blackbird’s song (Fallows)\(^4\).

In writing \textit{Lai}, I was influenced by Messiaen’s extensive use of bird song, and
share some of his views on the meaning of bird song and its symbolism in music.
Messiaen used bird song in his music in two ways, one “exact” and the other
“probable,” the latter treating the bird call as \textit{music concrète} or sound material to be
manipulated (Samuel 95). In either case it was important for Messiaen to transcribe
birdsong accurately, and he was proud of the exactitude of his transcriptions (Samuel
94), which are two-thirds accurate, according to Robert Fallon’s analyses (116)\(^5\).
Even exact use of bird song usually needed some interpretation, all the same, such as
making the songs slower and lower, and augmenting all the intervals by the same ratio
so that micro-tones could be heard as semitones (Samuel 95). The result would also
often be a composite, idealised version drawn from many performances of a song
(Fallon 134).

Exactitude was important for Messiaen because he believed the accurate
representation of sensible reality would more effectively awaken a sense of spiritual
reality, an “aesthetic of realism” he shared with Salvador Dali and Catholic
philosopher Maritain (Fallon 116 and 124). From the thirteenth century theologian
Saint Bonaventure, whom he quotes in his \textit{Traité de rythme, de couleur et
d’ornithologie}, Messiaen saw nature as coming from and leading to God, and thus
that natural things are signs of God, which manifest an aspect of his divinity (Fallon
116 and 131-2). This is a sacramental view of the world which believes that beyond
the ritual sacraments instituted by Christ, the world itself is a sacrament, an “an

\(^4\) The blackbird’s music is also an extended song form, and although it does not have verses, it does
have a number of phrases that return as refrains.

\(^5\) Given that some ‘inaccuracies’ are a result of artistic decisions (Fallon 123), this is an almost super-
human result, as attested by the expert on the Australian Albert’s Lyrebird, Syd Curtis, who observed
Messiaen transcribing a lyrebird in a rainforest near Brisbane (Rothenburg 198).
outward and visible sign of an inward and spiritual grace” (*The Book of Common Prayer* 198).

Even though I do not subscribe to an aesthetic of realism, I also tried to notate the songs as faithfully as I could, because the more accurate I could make them, the more I could learn from these songs, and the more choices I had in using them as “exact” or “probable” musical sources. In using bird phrases “exactly,” like Messiaen I often made the bird songs lower, and slowed them down a little. I dealt with microtones by ‘quantising’ them to the tempered scale rather than expanding all intervals to accommodate them, because I wanted to approximate the actual melody with its sense of tonality. Some rhythmic quantising was also necessary when the rhythms were too subtle to notate clearly. I notated some multiphonics as two notes in *Lai* (see Example 5.2; the lower notes were creative guesswork), but did not use most of the blackbird’s percussive chirpy noises. Finally, again like Messiaen, I rearranged the sequence of bird song phrases to suit the music at hand.

**Example 5.2** Maclean, *Lai*, ‘Magpie’
When using bird song as a “probable” musical source, I paraphrased the original phrases by altering rhythms, adding harmony (see Example 5.3) and by making up notes that approximated the contour of a flourish that was too quick to notate (see Example 5.4).

Example 5.3 Maclean, Lai, Paraphrase of Pied Butcher Bird

![Example 5.3 score image]

Example 5.4 Lai, Paraphrase of Magpie

![Example 5.4 score image]

I share Messiaen’s view that birdsong, with all of nature, reveals something of God. In much bird song there is for me a sense of the presence of the transcendent, perhaps because the fragmentary and tonally undirected nature of their song gives it a sense of timelessness, and of the “just is”-ness of the world, relating to Desmond’s
astonishment “that it is at all” (Art 3). This seems to be corroborated by the fact that, beyond the functional aspects of bird song to do with mating, defending territory and the like, there is no known explanation for some birdsong, as in the case of the blackbird who sings most musically after the mating period has finished (Rothenberg 74). Part of bird song appears to be birds just singing—they sing, like us, because they must (Rothenberg 128), which is perhaps why to Messiaen they symbolised freedom and joy (Fallon 130-1). John Carroll’s poem about birds at Lake Menindee in Western New South Wales (“An equivalence”) expresses this perhaps unwitting relationship to the transcendent.

An equivalence
Between song and flight
Can be drawn

Each
Faces the sky. (Carroll)

The poem also implies a connection between the song of birds and of humans, as human song, as argued by Desmond and Steiner, also “faces the sky” (see chapter two). Messiaen believed in more than a similarity between human and avian music, saying that birds, the “greatest musicians on our planet” (Samuel 85), represent the “true, lost face of music”; that bird song, expressing the elements of music, is the source of all earthly music while being an expression of heavenly music (Fallon 130). Although I do not see bird song as the origin of all human music, it would be inconceivable for human beings not to be musically influenced by birds. To illustrate this I have taken the liberty of extending one of the blackbird phrases I transcribed into a little Scottish song (see Example 5.5). I see this influence as an inter-species

---

*Quoted by Johnson from an article in *Le Guide du Concert* (3 April 1959) (117).*
expansion of the idea of ‘centonization’ or shared musical ideas (discussed in chapter two), and of course as some birds, like humans, are inveterate borrowers, there is ‘centonization’ within bird song itself.

Example 5.5 Blackbird Phrase and ‘Scottish’ song

In *Lai*, bird song has clear associations with the transcendent (with the blackbird in the ‘higher’ key of A major), and the chorale melody, through its text, has an association with humanity (in the ‘lower’ key of G major). The interplay between these two musical sources can be seen to represent the interweaving of transcendent and material realities. On the other hand, the chorale melody is the element that, like the transcendent in the world, in a hidden way binds the work together. Although it is the only tonally goal-directed material in the piece, it seems timeless because, with its slow speed, its tonal logic is hidden beneath the busier, domestic activity of the birds, as material, earthly creatures. These double layers of symbolism also point to the mysterious interpenetration of the material and the transcendent, and of time and eternity.
**Harmonic Stasis**

The description “fragmentary and tonally undirected” that I applied to bird song is one that could equally be applied to the music of Takemitsu, and *Lai* is influenced by both of these musics. The undirected nature of Takemitsu’s music is in large part due to the use of symmetrical modes of limited transposition, particularly the octatonic mode. Although he was greatly influenced by Messiaen’s use of these modes, Takemitsu had started exploring the octatonic mode before his introduction to Messiaen’s music (Koozin, *Toru* 41), probably for the same reason, as both composers found the mode to be an effective expression of the eternal. Because of the symmetry and therefore lack of hierarchy among its notes, the mode has no tonal centre to aim for, and without a purposeful movement towards a tonal destination there is less likely to be a sense of moving forward in time.

Takemitsu often uses one octatonic collection as a harmonic ground in his pieces, on which other octatonic collections and notes foreign to the primary collection are superimposed, and this play of clarity and obscurity of the predominant collection provides the harmonic structure of many of his works. This process is illustrated in regard to his *For Away* and *Waterways* later in this chapter. *Lai* does not have a primary collection, although octatonic I begins and ends the piece, but instead the music moves from one to the other in a series of static harmonic panels (see Table 5.1, page 121).

Bird song also contributes to the sense of harmonic stasis, providing most of the motives which reappear at the same pitch through the piece. These include the A# F# of the magpie (Example 5.4, page 125, at bar 59 in the piano), the pairs of high Ds or Es of the bell bird, which echo the upper two notes of the chorale melody, and the
many variants of the A major triad with added sixth of the blackbird (see Example 5.6).

**Example 5.6 Lai, Blackbird and Bell Bird**

These recurring notes are ‘remaining’ notes in this piece, as they are in bird song the world over—a universal sign of the transcendent according to the symbolism I attach to remaining notes. Griffiths suggests that Messiaen was attracted by what bird songs contain of the eternal, by the fact that in many respects they are the same today as they were thousands and indeed millions of years ago. They are therefore an image of the changelessness that had always been central to his musical and religious thinking. (Griffiths 188)

This is a view of the eternal that Messiaen and Takemitsu shared in their different spiritual traditions.

**Panah**

*Panah*\(^7\) is an orchestral work which explores the sound of bells as an expression of mindfulness of the presence of God. The title is a Hebrew word meaning ‘to appear,’ ‘to turn’ or ‘to show one’s face’ (Harris 2: 727 and Young 45)

\(^7\) Pronounced Panah.
and is a reference to the sense of the numinous that bell sounds can create, a sense of an appearing of divine glory which is hidden in the world. This appearing is expressed musically through a static harmonic ‘emergence’ influenced by the music of Takemitsu and Hosokawa, and through an exploration of the inside of bell sounds.

**Signs of Transcendence and the Symbolism of Bells**

Bells “speak to the glory of God,” a glory which manifests itself in different ways in the world. William Desmond identifies four “hyperboles of being” which are signs of the transcendent in the immanent “between” of human life and the world in which it is lived (*God* 4). These signs are “overdetermined,” or beyond complete definition or comprehension. The first of the four hyperboles is the fact of being or “the sheer ‘that it is’ of given finite being,” and the second is “the incarnate glory of aesthetic happening,” of the natural world. The third hyperbole is the “self-surpassing” of human beings in their aspirations and achievements (Desmond’s second type of transcendence) which points to a deeper transcendence as origin of this. The fourth hyperbole is found in human relationships, which in their giving and receiving, or porosity to others, point to a deeper generosity of being in which we “are given to be before we can give ourselves to be” (*God* 11-12). The appearing denoted by the word *Panah* could refer to any one of these hyperboles of being, to any moment in which a person senses something beyond their own finitude or that of the world.

Bells, with their mysterious sonic presence, can arouse a sense of the transcendent, and with their consequent religious associations are a source of musical

---

8 Richard Chartres, Anglican Bishop of London (“Solemn Consecration”).
9 Hyperbole means exaggeration, but Desmond here is playing on the meaning of the Greek *huperbole*, meaning ‘excess.’ The transcendent exceeds, reaches beyond, immanent reality (“hyperbole”).
10 Hauerwas writes that the darkness of God is excess light. He quotes Denys Turner, saying that it is not that “God is too indeterminate to be known; God is unknowable because too comprehensively determinate, too *actual*” (Hauerwas 20).
material that both evokes and symbolises the transcendent. Bells have an association with mindfulness of the transcendent in Western and Eastern traditions. Bells are a symbol of eternity in Buddhism (Suzuki 251), and in the Shakuhachi Honkyoku tradition the bell of its founder, Fuke, has come to symbolise enlightenment (Lee 1). Thomas Merton, a Trappist monk, wrote that

Bells are meant to remind us that God alone is good, that we belong to Him, that we are not living for this world. They break in upon our cares in order to remind us that all things pass away and that our preoccupations are not important. They speak to us of our freedom, which responsibilities and transient cares make us forget. They are the voice of alliance with the God of heaven. They tell us that we are His true temple. They call us to peace with Him within ourselves...The bells say...“Christ is risen!...our song is perfect as the Father in heaven is perfect and we pour our charity out upon all.” (Merton, Thoughts 56)

It is partly the complexity and obscurity of bell sounds that gives rise to their association with the ‘overdetermined’ or mysterious transcendent. The ‘community of sounds’ that exists in a bell tone can be seen as symbolic of the three-in-one of the Christian trinity, or of one sense of the meaning of the Hebrew word echad used in the phrase “the Lord is one” (Deut 6.4), that of plurality in unity (Harris1: 30). They are also a particularly clear example of the Eastern idea of a sound as a complex entity. Takemitsu said that “A single sound is extremely complex in that it condenses the infinite range of noise that it arises from” (De Ferranti 207), ‘noise’ being the “stream of sounds” in the world, which are given meaning by composition (Ohtake 7, 20). A single sound contains the infinite, as an entire piece can be contained in a gesture (Ohtake 67). The bloom and decay of a bell sound is a picture of the infinite in the finite, as the eternal can only be expressed in the temporal.
Texture and Harmony from the Inside of Bell Sounds

The ‘plurality’ of bell sounds influenced the use of orchestral timbres as well as motivic and harmonic material in *Panah*. I translated my impressions of several Russian bell sounds into musical form, as a kind of exteriorization of the inner reality of the sounds\(^\text{11}\), without trying to create a realistic depiction of their tone. The composite timbres of the orchestra are well suited to expand on the complex timbres of bells, which change as they decay. The strike note gives a sharp edge to the beginning of the sound\(^\text{12}\), after which the higher partials fade out first and the hum last. The woodwind act mostly as higher partials, with glockenspiel and crotales giving a sense of the sharpness of the initial strike tone. The strings usually function as a hum tone, while the brass fulfill both these roles, depending on their tessitura (see Example 5.7). The hum tones of large bells can be very powerful, like a roaring wind when the bells are repeatedly struck, and the low brass and timpani timbres at letter H (bar 71) are a reference to this kind of sound\(^\text{13}\).

\(^{11}\) This is a phrase used by Moscovich to describe French Spectral music (Moscovich 27), although *Panah* is not a spectral work in this sense. While *Panah* derives the Pskovo-Pechersky chord from electronic spectrum analysis, it does not use this as a basis for harmonic fields, or complex processes for their gradual transformation.

\(^{12}\) At the strike note, the impact of the clapper creates a temporary distortion resulting in a wide spectrum of frequencies before the regular vibrational patterns are established. This is what gives a bell sound its initial intensity and brilliance (“The Acoustics of Bells”).

\(^{13}\) An example of this is the sound of the “Salvator” bell of the Salzburg Cathedral (“Salzburg [A]”).
The complexity of bell sounds is due partly to the different strengths and delay times of partials, which creates an interior liveliness in each sound (“The Ancient
Art”). Pitch percepts (perceivable partials) vary in their pitch weight (loudness) over time (see Figure 5.2). Drawing from this feature, the texture in *Panah* is largely made up of a coexistence of different oscillating lines.

Figure 5.1 Analysis of a European Minor Third Bell ("The Ancient Art")

Calculated pitch percepts for the spectrum shown below. The strong fundamental percept at 349 Hz diminishes after 1.5 seconds and is overtaken by the minor third percept at 822 Hz. The 690 Hz partial only dissociates from the 349 Hz fundamental after 1.5 seconds which probably contributes to the rapid decrease in the 349 Hz pitch weight. The 137 Hz percept is the common subharmonic of both the 2nd and 3rd (minor 3rd) partials. It only appears at maxima of the minor third.

---

14 Weight: pitch weight or prominence. Frequency: s—spectral percept; v—virtual percept or subharmonic (a harmonic that has a pitch lower than the fundamental). Numbers at the top right of the example indicate pitch frequency in Hertz.

15 In a minor third bell there is a clear partial a minor third above the fundamental.
European minor third bell spectrum

All motivic material in *Panah* can be directly or indirectly traced back to the sounds of several Russian bells from three sources. For all bells apart from one\(^{16}\), I notated the partials I could hear by ear, adjusting them to tempered tuning—a very subjective process because of the ambiguity of the sounds. The first source is the Pskovo-Pechersky monastery near the Estonian border, one of whose bells has been analysed by Aldoshina and Nicanarov, and I used the bell harmonics in their analysis to make up the chord that occurs at bars thirty-four and forty-two. I transposed the bell a ninth lower to A, the central referential pitch of *Panah*, and adjusted the pitches to standard tuning, applying some artistic license in the process (see Example 5.8). The lowest two notes do not sound in the orchestral chord.

---

\(^{16}\) The frequencies of the Pskovo-Pechersky bell were analysed by the Fast Fourier Transform method (Aldoshina 3); see Example 5.10.
Example 5.8 *Panah* chord (bar 34) and Pskovo-Pechersky Bell Spectrum (Aldoshina 3)

All the notes in this bell sound, except for B and F, belong to the octatonic collection III, beginning on A (see Example 5.9). This inharmonic pitch profile is very different to the profiles of English bells, which aim to approximate the harmonic spectrum of the “chord of nature” (“Sound of Bells”).

Example 5.9 Octatonic Collection III

The second source of bell sounds is a group of sound samples of bells from the church of St Nicholas in San Anselmo, California, made in the Russian Pyatkov foundry (“Pyatkov”). I notated different pitches I heard within these bell sounds, and took note of the effects of oscillating intervals produced as partials came in and out of audibility. These intervals were freely adapted to produce repeated oscillating figures, mostly belonging to octatonic III (see Example 5.10), and these figures were distributed through the musical space in a process of ‘centonization.’ I also noted commonly recurring combinations of partials within bell sounds, and used these as a basis of three harmonic motives (see Example 5.11). These chords are not octatonic and contain all four notes missing from the scale.
Example 5.10 Repeated Oscillating Figures in *Panah*\(^{17}\)

Bar numbers indicate first occurrence of motif

\* indicates that the first note is an initial upbeat only

Example 5.11 Harmonic Motives and the Pyatkov Bells From Which They Derive

The third source of bell sounds is the Ouspenie Cathedral in Great Rostov, Belarus, which houses the Sisoy bell (“Rostov-Sisoy”), a deep bell with obscure harmonics. I took three of the harmonics that I thought I heard, transposed them so that they were based on the note A (see Example 5.12), and changed the regular pulsing of the bell partials to a more vigorous rhythm (see Example 5.7, page 133, at letter H). This rhythm is influenced by the kinds of irregular patterns that result from the ringing of sets of European church bells.

Example 5.12 Sisoy bell, Possible Partials

---

\(^{17}\) These figures are shown with the rhythm and instrumentation in which they first appear.
Texture and Harmonic Emergence

The texture of *Panah* is made up of motives emulating the undulation of bell partials, and over these, chordal motives come and go—there are no melodies. This is a departure from other pieces I have written, particularly choral works, but my interest in counterpoint is still evident in the layers of static lines and fragments which interrelate freely, just as in bells the different partials sing independently.

The macro-harmonic structure which underpins this activity is a slow-moving series of harmonic fields with an overall center of the note A (see Figure 5.2). The piece begins with this note predominating on page one, expanding to the notes of the A major/minor triad on page two, and through the addition of neighbouring notes, builds to a full octatonic complement on page three, obscuring the A triad. The octatonic collection is then itself obscured by the use of notes foreign to it, and by page seven the harmonic field is modally undefined. An A harmonic series chord emerges from this like a shaft of light, before merging back into an A octatonic harmonic field made ambiguous by numerous foreign notes. On page eleven there is the brief swell of an A sixth chord (or F# minor seventh) in the overall octatonic sonority, which on page twelve opens out into A minor pentatonic. A recapitulation of the opening (from pp. 3-4) at page fifteen brings a return of A octatonic, and this remains until the end.
Like the sound of a bell, the overall harmonic structure is not teleological. There is no harmonic pole in opposition to the A centre and no sense of harmonic propulsion, but there is a sense of flow, or ebb and flow, from the use of notes and motifs in common between harmonic areas, and through intensification of pitch and textural densities. Notes added to harmonic fields intensify the colour of these fields, as when the full octatonic complement gradually builds up from the opening to letter A (see Example 5.13). New notes also transform one field into a new one, as when a predominantly octatonic field gives way to a predominantly pentatonic one at bar seventy-one (see Example 5.7, page 133).
Example 5.13 *Panah*, Intensifying Harmonic Field, from Part to Full Octatonic

The example shows a musical score with various instruments and notations, indicating the progression from part to full octatonic scale. The notation includes ledger lines and musical symbols to represent the harmonic field development. The text at the bottom of the page reads: "partial octatonic (A major/minor triad plus D#) full A octatonic."
Although new harmonic areas or large chords are not goals that are progressed to, they are prepared in the passages preceding them by the pre-figuring of some of their notes, and sometimes by the gradual or sudden reduction of texture. The Pskovo-Pechersky chord at bar thirty-four appears out of the trumpet’s B and G notes, which it contains (see Example 5.14), and the same chord (with an added low C#) similarly emerges at bar forty-two, out of a context which includes many of its notes (see Example 5.15). The recapitulation (bar 86) is prepared for by the notes C and A, which are central to the A major/minor based octatonic field to follow (see Example 5.16).
Example 5.14 *Panah*, Pskovo-Pechersky Chord I (letter C)
Example 5.15 Panah, Pskovo-Pechersky Chord II (letter D, strings)
Example 5.16 Panah, Recapitulation (letter J)
In the previous three examples the texture reduces in the bar or bars preceding the new material to make a space or clearing from which the new can emerge. In the case of the two A harmonic series chords, the preceding material stops suddenly, revealing the new chord (see Examples 5.17 and 5.18; the two chords are marked with an asterisk).

Finally, the high point of the piece, in which the brass and timpani ring in A pentatonic like a set of bells, is again prepared by common notes C and A. This time, however, the texture does not reduce to make way for the new but builds up, as though the new material is rising beneath it, surfacing at bar seventy-one. After hearing Panah performed, I have changed the dynamic hairpins to articulate a more consistent build to bar seventy-one. Panah was performed by the New Zealand Symphony orchestra, conducted by Scott Parkman, at the SOUNZ-NZSO Orchestral Readings in September, 2008.
Example 5.17 *Panah*, Emergence of A Harmonic Series Chord (strings, bar 47)
Example 5.18 *Panah*, Emergence of A Harmonic Series Chord (strings, bar 97)
Harmonic Emergence from a Symbolic Ground

In Panah, the sense of emergence of new harmonic events is a result of the fact that the new material is prepared by—already hidden in—the passage before it. This idea of emergence is influenced by Takemitsu’s use of octatonic collections, where one collection forms the harmonic background of the piece, and is obscured by or emerges from other collections. Timothy Koozin has analysed this practice in several of Takemitsu’s piano pieces, and has described the movement between collections in For Away (1973) on a local and global level (see Example 5.19 and Figure 5.3). “Throughout the piece, octatonic III periodically re-emerges at the musical surface, clarifying ambiguities of pitch grouping which arise in more densely chromatic passages” (“Octatonicism” 128).
Example 5.19 Takemitsu, *For Away* bars 1-7: Octatonic Collections (Koozin, “Octatonicism” 129)
There is a very clear example of harmonic emergence in Takemitsu’s piece, Waterways\textsuperscript{19}. The central pitch collection of this piece is octatonic II, and there is an ebb and flow of modal density as octatonic II is added to by foreign notes or the other two collections (see Figure 5.4). At page twelve the modal density reduces sharply and then gradually, until only three notes are sounding: C, Ab and Eb, belonging to octatonic II. At the beginning of this passage the triad is an indistinguishable part of the harmonic field, but as the number of notes gradually reduces, the triad becomes imperceptibly more ‘visible,’ like an image coming into focus—as one becomes aware of this, one realises that it has been there all along.

\textbf{Figure 5.4} Takemitsu, Waterways, Modal Density Profile

---

\textsuperscript{19}Written in 1977 for clarinet, violin, cello, two harps and two vibraphones.
The texture of *Panah* was influenced by another Japanese composer, Toshio Hosokawa, who was himself influenced by Takemitsu. Notes in Hosokawa’s orchestral writing are often long streams of sound which subtly transform in pitch and timbre, and their combination in shifting clouds influenced my translation of bell partials into an orchestral texture.

In the music of both Takemitsu and Hosokawa, events emerge from a background that is always there, explicitly or implicitly. For Takemitsu, this is the central octatonic collection of the piece, and in much of Hosokawa’s orchestral music, the background is both modal and textural, with the slow moving streams of sound articulating a more unambiguous and static octatonic collection. Superimposed on these grounds are mainly melodic gestures, which Takemitsu described as objects in a musical garden (Burt 168) and Hosokawa as brushwork on the surface of primed paper, as in East-Asian landscape painting (Hosokawa 8).

From Takemitsu, *Panah* takes the use of a single octatonic collection as a background for other events, and further bases the background on a triad or even a single note (*Waterways*, Ab and *Panah*, A). Following Hosokawa’s example, aspects of the background in *Panah* are more audibly on the surface in the slow sustained textures and clear, almost continuous, presence of significant pitches (remaining notes). Hosokawa’s *Voyage 1* slowly traverses the notes of an F# diminished chord, in a way that is reminiscent of the slow canti firmi of Gagaku music, and the note F# remains with the listener after the music has ended. Hosokawa likened his music to the slow breathing of Zen meditation (Hosokawa 9), and in both a sense of slowness and stillness make eternity less hidden in time.

For Hosokawa (8) the textural ‘canvas,’ and for Takemitsu the octatonic collection, find their source in the deeper ground of infinite silence, which is an
“active presence” in the music (Koozin, *Spiritual* 189). This is the “natural ontological ground of being” (Merton, *Zen* 45) or the “underlying, ‘undifferentiated’ sacred unity that empowers and is a ground for everything”\(^{20}\). For Takemitsu and Hosokawa this ground is something that invites mindfulness—a paying of attention that does not seek explanation (Merton, *Zen* 38) to that which is beyond determination. This is an idea which has some resonance with the Biblical phrases, “The Eternal God is your dwelling place, and underneath are the everlasting arms” (Deut. 33.27), and “In him we live and move and have our being” (Acts 17.28)\(^{21}\). In *Panah*, the emergence of harmonic or melodic events from a supporting ground is a musical expression of the idea of the glory of God ‘turning its face’ or appearing in the world. In expressing a mindfulness of this presence, *Panah*, like the works that influence it, is a wordless ‘Sanctus.’

**Musical Space as a Garden**

The music of Takemitsu and Hosokawa, and the musical source materials for *Panah* and *Lai* of birds and bells, seem to express time as being suspended rather than forward moving. Koozin states that Takemitsu provokes “an awareness of eternal time” by using the octatonic mode as a way of spatialising time (Koozin, *Traversing* 18). As mentioned earlier, in the octatonic mode there is no tonal centre to aim for, and so music that is predominantly octatonic tends to explore its own space rather than pursue a destination. Takemitsu’s music moves around a space often created by a primary octatonic ground, a space he referred to as a Japanese garden: “Sometimes my music follows the design of a particular existing garden. At times it may follow the design of an imaginary garden I have sketched. Time in my music may be said to


\(^{21}\) Saint Paul was probably quoting Epimenides of Crete (*The Holy Bible*, 1116).
be the duration of my walk through these gardens” (Takemitsu 119). Each piece is a particular garden, and the objects in the garden are musical gestures, timbres and notes, or other octatonic collections foreign to the primary collection of the work. The colours of these variations of mode and timbre are also the changing light and shade which play on the objects in the garden. These objects exist in harmony because the garden, like the mode which forms it, has no inherent hierarchy to create opposition between different elements, and no need of a narrative to resolve this opposition.

One source of this sideways (as opposed to forward) harmonic movement is from developments in Romantic harmony, mediated by Debussy. In *The Romantic Generation*, Charles Rosen describes how Romantic composers dissolved the opposition between tonic and dominant, using modulation to mediants as chromatic colouration of the tonic, rather than as a harmonic counter-pole to it (249). “My music is composed as if fragments were thrown together unstructured, as in dreams.” You go to a far place and suddenly find yourself back home without noticing the return” (Takemitsu 106). “Dream,” to Takemitsu, is an eternal moment (Ohtake 36); the time of dreams is not linear. By taking on the indeterminate quality of dreams, music becomes more effectively an expression of the infinite. Takemitsu referred to his hope, as a composer, of being “one of these gardeners cultivating infinite time” (Takemitsu 143).

In *Panah* and *Lai* the ‘centonization’ of musical ideas means this material also fills a space rather than travelling to a destination through time. Musical composition is like the visual composition of figures in a picture, getting the proportions, spaces and (timbral and harmonic) colours right, in a way that is to me reminiscent of Miro’s

---

22 Takemitsu’s music is very carefully and delicately “thrown together;” in a kind of ‘centonization’ of motives and changing versions of arabesque-like gestures.
*Constellations* series (see chapter three). The lack of sustained narrative means that the macrostructures of Takemitsu’s music and of *Lai and Panah* are more an issue of shape than trajectory. In *Waterways*, there are significant events near golden section points. At three and a half minutes, close to the division of the piece by the golden ratio into a small and a large section (as though, for example, thirteen were divided into five and eight) there is a long descending piano chord sequence that ushers in a new obscuring of the octatonic mode after a moment of clarity—the beginning of the second wave of octatonic activity (see Figure 5.4, page 150). More significantly, close to the large/small division (just after six minutes) is the point at which the Ab triadic motif gradually begins to emerge out of the texture, marked initially by repeated high B minor chords on the piano. Rather than being climactic moments with dramatic preparation, these divisions are both noticeable points in the series of larger arcs which make up the work. The main point of arrival (the unison Ab triad) is close to the end, and it is an arrival by emergence, not by narrative.

There are golden section events in *Lai*, for similar reasons. The one with the most significance is the large/small division at a point of intensity at bar ninety-three (RN 7), when the full ensemble returns with the chorale melody and birds together after a hiatus of blackbird song (see Example 5.20 and Table 5.1, page 121). This again is not a prepared destination, but a point of change in the texture, marking a division of musical space in a way analogous to the marking of visual space in a painting.
Example 5.20 Maclean, Lai, Golden Section

The spaces of Lai and Panah are metaphorically closer to the garden of the Song of Songs in the Old Testament than a Japanese garden. The garden is not itself the eternal; the infinite ground is beyond it. The garden is a place—a ‘between’—of both longing and intimacy, in which eternity is both transcendent and immanent, where a connection to the transcendent origin is possible. Birds and bells, as we have seen, are symbolic of this intersection of the earthly and divine. Lai and Panah share with the Song of Songs a form that is not a narrative, but a mosaic of places or scenes that are drawn together by recurring ideas, phrases or images.

Koozin writes that Takemitsu’s music aims to bring the listener into contact with a transcendent spiritual presence ("Spiritual-temporal" 185). For both myself and Takemitsu there is a distance between the listener and the transcendent that the music seeks to bridge, and in Waterways and For Away, and Lai and Panah this distance is conceived differently. For Takemitsu, the distance between time and eternity is like the distance between the background and foreground in his music. Details emerge from the undifferentiated ground (whether the octatonic mode or
silence itself) and return to it in an ultimate unity; it is a distance within a totality\(^{23}\).

This distance has something to do with the concept of *ma*, of what is between. In Takemitsu’s music, boundaries between gestures are elusive and his forms are fluid, and in these transitions eternity resides. This distance is the “border between dream and reality,” (Knussen 2) both elusive shadow and infinite ground, and it is a constant presence in Takemitsu’s music as the often imperceptible transition between sound and silence.

In *Lai* and *Panah* the distance is conceived as being between the music and a ground that is outside it. The text of the chorale melody in *Lai* can be interpreted as referring to this, and, as are Bach’s chorale preludes, the piece is a meditation on the text. Psalm 137 asks “How shall we sing the Lord’s song in a strange land?” (*King James*). Metaphorically, how can music contain an infinity which transcends it? The Psalm continues, “Should I forget you, Jerusalem, may my right hand wither. May my tongue cleave to my palate if I do not recall you” (Alter 474)—it is by playing and singing, by music that Jerusalem (in this metaphor the transcendent) is remembered. Music and the arts “face the sky,” and are addressed by what exceeds them (Desmond, *Art* 291).

\(^{23}\) The title of one of Takemitsu’s piano pieces, *Les Yeux Clos*, refers to a lithograph by Odilon Redon in which a man’s face as a “floating image only partially emerges from an undifferentiated background” of black, white and grey (Koozin, “Spiritual-temporal” 190). The foreground and background together share a surface which is ambiguously both flat and three-dimensional.
Chapter Six

*Osanna* Mass: Using Musical Sources to Create Pictures of the Transcendent.

![Figure 6.1 Title Page of the Penitential Psalms with King David, French Book of Hours, 1460 (“Book of Hours”)](image)

The choral setting of the liturgy of the *Osanna* Mass is in some ways like a medieval illuminated manuscript: it expresses the text with pictures, decorations and colour, through associations attached to borrowed religious melodies, and illustrative representations of the transcendent. The Mass draws on Judaic and Christian musical
sources and my remaining note ideas to express the transcendent, here specifically the God of the text of the Mass, and his intersection with humanity. Two themes arising out of this are bound together in the title of the Mass, Osanna. The word osanna, found in the text of the Sanctus, comes from the Hebrew word Hoshiana, which literally means “Save us now!” but has also taken on the connotation of praise (as it has in the Sanctus) and these two meanings run through both the text and the music of the Mass.

The purpose of this chapter is to explain the two approaches used to ‘illuminate’ these themes in the text of the Mass. The first approach is of musical association through the use of plainchant, Jewish melodies, church bells and birdsong. The second is the approach of illustration, through my use of remaining notes (some of which have symbolic significance) and features of mode, rhythm and texture. An examination of particular outworkings of these approaches in each individual movement will follow in the second half of the chapter.

Music-Association: Musical Sources and Their Incorporation in Osanna

The musical sources used in the Osanna Mass are melodies of Gregorian chant and Jewish religious song, and patterns of church bells, ordered and aleatoric. There are also a few phrases of birdsong, music which, from a Christian perspective, is of celestial rather than human origin. The two groups of liturgical sources are a reflection of the Christian history of the Mass, and of the Judaic origin of many of the ideas and actual material of the text of the Mass, and of its central subject, Jesus¹.

¹The Jewish melodies post-date Jesus and the origins of the Mass by several hundred years, but their textual associations are strengthened by the fact that they are well known and still in use today.
The primary element of musical association in the *Osanna* Mass is the use of plainchant that sets the text of the Mass, and thereby symbolically takes on the text’s reference to the transcendent. The text is the Ordinary of the Mass liturgy, the parts of the Mass that do not change from week to week. The Ordinary comprises the Kyrie, Gloria, Credo, Sanctus and Agnus Dei, a collection of texts of biblical derivation or written by different authors from the time of the early church to the seventh century (Crocker and Hiley, “Gloria” and “Agnus Dei”). The Mass portrays God as the transcendent creator of the world, the “Heavenly King” (Gloria) and beyond time, “before all ages (or worlds)” (Credo), and also as immanent in creation, in the Sanctus’ “Heaven and earth are full of thy glory”. The text of the Mass also encapsulates God’s involvement with humanity in time through its central theme, the Atonement, the connection of human and divine, and it is in this theme that the prayer and the praise of the word *Osanna* meet. The texts for each movement are included in the individual discussions below.

The Mass is based on the set of Gregorian chants for the Mass Ordinary called *Missa cum jubilo*, which is number nine of the eighteen sets of Ordinary chants in the *Liber Usualis*. These sets of chants, the kyriale, do not contain Credos, as the Credo became established in the liturgy later than the other movements (Crocker and Hiley, “Credo”); out of the six independent Credos in the *Liber Usualis*, I chose number one. Each movement in the *Osanna* Mass is based on its corresponding plainchant, which comes and goes throughout the movement, most consistently in the “Credo” and “Agnus Dei.”

The two main Jewish melodies used through the Mass are *Kol Nidrei* and *Aleinu* (see Example 6.1 and Example 6.2), both set to texts from the Jewish

---

2 The *Liber Usualis* is a book of Gregorian chants from the Solesmes Abbey, first issued in 1896 (“Liber”).
prayerbook, the *Siddur*. The text of the *Kol Nidrei* is an annulment of vows made in the past year that remain unfulfilled or broken\(^3\), and is performed at the beginning of *Yom Kippur*, the Day of Atonement. It seemed fitting to include this request for mercy for human transgression and fallibility in the Kyrie’s prayer for mercy, amongst other movements. The text for the *Aleinu* is part of the *Shacharis* or morning prayers, and is an affirmation of God’s pre-eminent glory and transcendence, the “King who reigns over kings” (*The Complete Artscroll* 159). This melody was sung by Jews burnt at the stake in Blois in 1171 (Idelsohn 157) and, according to Eric Werner (43), was later incorporated into the melodies of the Sanctus and Agnus Dei of Kyriale IX, which I use in my Mass. The history of this melody highlights the complex relationship between Christians and Jews through the ages, in which the ethnicity and suffering the Jews shared with Jesus contrasted with the oft-times role of Christians as “those who crucified” (Kinzer 230).

Both *Kol Nidrei* and *Aleinu* are Missinai\(^4\) melodies, and many of the motifs shared by this group of melodies have associations with particular sections of the Jewish liturgy. Their recurrence in different contexts therefore has “hermeneutic significance” (Werner 29), and a similar principle operates in the *Osanna* Mass on a much smaller scale, whereby the texts associated with borrowed materials interpret or ‘illuminate’ the text of the Mass.

---

\(^3\) The renunciation originally applied to vows of the past year, and Sephardic Jews continue this tradition, while Ashkenazic Jews apply it to the year to come (Butterfass).

\(^4\) Missinai means ‘from Mount Sinai’, and is a name which reflects the veneration in which they are held rather than their origin, which was Europe in the time of the Crusades. (Werner 27).
Example 6.1 *Kol Nidrei*, Reconstruction by Werner (36)

---

Werner’s motifs are marked as ‘a’ to ‘d.’ Werner remarks that the form of the melody, as reconstructed by him from a number of variants, is very close to the medieval *Lais* (37). This reconstruction is hypothetical and does not represent any actual version (Seroussi).
Example 6.2 *Aleinu* (Idelsohn 148)

This version of *Aleinu* is by A. Beer (c.1765). Barlines indicate melodic formulas, and the spelling reflects Ashkenazic pronunciation of Hebrew.

Another source of musical material for the *Osanna* Mass are bells, as melodies or counterpoint produced by bell ringing, and the harmonics of a single bell. Like bird song, bells are used in the Mass both for their interesting melodies and spiritual associations. Bells have a symbolic role regarding the transcendent in many religious traditions, including the two drawn from in the Mass. In the instructions to Moses in Exodus 28: 31-35, gold bells were to be sewn on the hem of the robe of Aaron the High Priest, and their sound ensured Aaron’s protection when he entered the Holy Place and Most Holy Place in the Tabernacle, the awe-ful point of meeting between immanent and transcendent realities. In the Christian tradition, bells have been also been associated with the presence of God. The ‘Sanctus bell’ is rung three times in the Roman Catholic Mass to announce the presence of Christ in the bread and wine, and in monastic orders bells function as a call to prayer, or mindfulness of God’s presence in that moment. The sound of large church bells, most often used to mark

---

6 Gold is a biblical symbol of purity and faith (Malachi 3:3).
significant times in people’s lives such as marriage and death, can also make us aware of something beyond everyday life – “the very air seems deified”\(^7\)—and it is collections of these bells, European and English, which provided the inspiration for material in the “Gloria,” “Sanctus” and “Benedictus.”

Bird song plays a relatively small part in the Mass, and is mainly used in the “Benedictus.” Bird song has a natural association with transcendence, being music not written by human beings, and for Messiaen it was the voice of nature and so, by implication, of God (Griffiths 174). I follow his example of incorporating bird song into the human song of composition, and in this case its inclusion in the “Benedictus” relates to the account in Luke 19 which is the source of the text. When the crowd proclaim “Blessed is the King who comes in the name of the Lord!” Jesus was asked to rebuke his disciples, but he replied, “I tell you, if these were silent, the very stones would cry out” (Luke 19:38-40, ESV). For me, therefore, if inanimate stones would announce the presence of the kingdom of God, how much more “our little servants of immaterial joy” (Messiaen 34).

All of these source materials, as well as providing symbolic associations through their texts or contexts, provide symbolic pitches as remaining notes to illustrate the themes of prayer and praise. The structures of the plainchant melodies also provide models for the tonal stasis used as a musical illustration of the eternal.

**Influences of Kyriale IX Plainchant on the Osanna Mass**

The recurring use of segments or motives in plainchant and Jewish melodies has encouraged and expanded an existing tendency in my music of ‘centonization,’ or drawing together different musical ideas and assembling them through the music. In addition to the use of source melodies as a basis for counterpoint in the *Osanna* Mass,

\(^7\) This is a line from John Clare’s poem, “Sabbath Bells” (Robinson 181).
different motives of these melodies have become a part of the fabric of the musical texture, being distributed among different voices and through different movements to connect them as parts of a unified whole. The use of chant material through the Mass in both of these ways is reminiscent of choral Masses of the Renaissance, in particular the paraphrase mass which uses a plainchant or melody in some or all voices (Burkholder), though the Osanna Mass draws on more source materials than was usual for that period.

In the chants I chose for the Mass there are three levels of musical idea: segment, phrase and section. These levels can be seen in the Kyrie chant (see Example 6.3) which shows how segments and phrases are combined in different ways, in this case in an accumulation of ideas through the three sections. Each level can vary in size between the chants, and this kind of construction results in a variety of formal structures. They range from the clearly audible sectional structure of the Kyrie and Agnus Dei chants, to the fluid form without divisions, but shaped by an overall rising tessitura, in the Gloria chant (see Example 6.10, page 176). In the Osanna Mass also, sections are sometimes distinct and sometimes run together. In the polyphonic texture of the Mass, there is a similar principle at work of interconnection between different levels, with motives and phrases recurring in different sections.

---

8 The chants of Kyriale IX are not themselves connected in this way, apart from the Sanctus and Agnus Dei, which both may draw on the Aleinu. The chants are independent pieces with their own distinctive motives, connected only by the looser kind of ‘centonization’ of belonging to a common language.
In the plainchants of Kyriale IX, rhythmic flow is also a result of combination and recombination: rhythmic groups (phrases and segments of phrases) consist of varying arrangements of two or three note cells (see Example 6.4). The size of these

---

9 This analysis is based on the assumption that most notes in a chant are of roughly equal length, except the ends of some segments and at cadences, as in the “equalist” approach of the monks of Solesmes, although it is not known how plainchant was performed—see the discussion in “Performing Practice: Medieval Monophony” (Hiley).
cells is determined primarily by the neumes which set the syllables in the texts. In the Osanna Mass, this kind of additive rhythm predominates through the use of plainchant and my own material is influenced by it. Rhythmic variety occurs on the smallest level of varying cell lengths, and on the formal level of contrast between the textures of different sections, while there is less variety of note lengths and rhythmic gesture from phrase to phrase. This consistent and elastic rhythmic flow is a way of expressing a sense of stillness or timelessness behind ongoing changes of melody and harmony.

Example 6.4 Opening of Gloria IX Plainchant (“Cum Jubilo: Gloria”), and the First Phrase Transcribed (groupings marked with slurs)

A final correlation between the plainchants and the Osanna Mass (and in my music generally) is the recurrence of musical ideas at the same pitch. This often means, in both musics, that there is goal directed melodic movement within a phrase or a section—suggesting the temporal—but not over a whole piece, which gives rise

---

10 Neumes are signs which set a single syllable of text. Most neumes consist of up to three notes, and combinations of neumes can form groups of six notes or more (Bent).
to an underlying stasis, suggesting the eternal. In the plainchants of Kyriale IX the phrases follow a melodic journey to a destination, usually to the final or fifth of the mode, placing importance on notes of the triad of the final as they go, and so establishing these notes as a constant implied presence which produces a tonal stasis. This journey is perhaps like that of a ribbon unfurling in the (tonal) air, rather than a journey to another place. In the Kyrie IX chant, for example, a framework of D, F and A (indicated by the larger noteheads) underpins the melodic contour and forms remaining note threads (see Example 6.5).

**Example 6.5 Kyrie IX Plainchant, Pitch Framework**

In the *Osanna* Mass, too, there is melodic and sometimes harmonic trajectory within phrases but not over the course of a whole work, and this is also often due to the return at pitch of previous ideas. Returning pitches, or remaining notes, are not confined to one mode because each Mass movement is in more than one key. A reduction of the choral “Kyrie” (see Example 6.7) shows that its significant pitches are derived from those of the Kyrie chant (see Example 6.5) and the *Kol Nidrei* melody (see Example 6.6).
Example 6.6 *Kol Nidrei*, Pitch Framework

Example 6.7 Choral “Kyrie,” Pitch Framework

"Kyrie" Remaining Notes Summary
The overall harmonic scheme of the Mass derives from the modes of the chant movements, which are Dorian, Mixolydian, Dorian, Lydian and Lydian (all Dorian and Lydian movements use Bbs to avoid outlining tritones, so they are effectively in D natural minor and F major respectively). The plainchant modes are incorporated into an extended modal language, in which a number of modes exist side by side or simultaneously; the mode of each chant becomes either the central mode or tonic of its corresponding Mass movement, or a significant element in its modal mixture.

It can be seen, then, that the influence of the plainchants of Kyriale IX extends beyond the provision of melodies heard on the surface of the Mass, and that their characteristics also permeate its musical language.

**Illustration through Symbolic use of Pitch**

In both the chants and Mass movements, significant recurring notes, or remaining notes, are an outcome of the melodies and motives at play on the surface of the music, and the tonal frameworks from which they are drawn. The repetition of segments or motives, most often at the same pitch, is a major reason for the consistent pitch threads through these pieces. In the Mass, motives and the remaining notes associated with them are mostly derived from source melodies, which means they sometimes have a symbolic as well as a musical function. The connection between the texts of the Kyrie and *Kol Nidrei*, for example, has already been noted, and this associative symbolism merges with the musical symbolism in which the remaining notes represent the transcendent. Some remaining notes recur through the Mass and act as a unifying force through the whole work (see Example 6.8).
Throughout the Osanna Mass, there is a fairly consistent tonal imagery in which the number of sharps or flats in a key makes reference to “lighter” or “darker” ideas in the text. This may well be an influence from Josquin and Monteverdi, although it was not initially a conscious one in my writing of the Mass. The motet *Absalom Fili Mi*\(^{11}\) expresses the words “Let me not live longer, but descend into hell, weeping” with a descending cycle of fifths, starting in Bb and progressing as far as Gb, associating the descent into hell with the descending contour and flatter keys.

Monteverdi, according to Eric Chafe, in the earlier part of his career used modes with a major third to express emotions like anger and bitterness (reflecting the meaning of the Latin *durus*, ‘hard’) \(^{12}\), and movement to hexachords with more sharps intensified this expression\(^{12}\). Minor or ‘soft’ modes (moll), intensified by movement to flatter hexachords, were used to express emotions such as suffering or resignation (176-7 and 180-1). Major modes could also express lighter emotions such as joy, as in parts of *Orfeo* \(^{13}\) and came increasingly to acquire more positive associations for Monteverdi (Chafe 55).

\(^{11}\) *Absalom Fili Mi* may be by Pierre de la Rue (Meconi).
\(^{12}\) For examples from Monteverdi’s *Lamento d’Arianna*, see Chafe (170 and 183).
\(^{13}\) Compare also the use of major modes in the setting of Psalms of praise in Monteverdi’s *Vespro della Beata Vergine*. 
The Osanna Mass generally follows a ‘light’ and ‘dark’ parallel with major and minor modes, in relation to lighter and darker themes in the text, and sometimes intensifies this imagery with the use of sharper or flatter keys. F major has an association with God’s love through being the mode for the Agnus Dei chant, while the keys which form the contexts for the F# pitch thread (B minor, Eb minor and F# major) accompany textual references to the Lamb of God (see Example 6.8). An example of how the imagery of a key area can be heightened by the addition of other key areas is the representation of heaven in the “Credo.” The opening key centre is Bb major, to which the D minor of the plainchant melody adds a raised fourth (E), while its prominent fifth (A) gives a strong role to this note as the raised seventh of Bb, giving the key less gravity and more light (see Example 6.21, page 189). At the words et resurrexit at bar fifty, the key area, again Bb major, is made brighter by the addition of the Aleinu melody in F and the ‘glinting’ of the B natural in the C major bell figure (see Example 6.25, page 193). This use of modal colour is similar in effect to the use of gold and bright colours in illuminated manuscripts.

**Individual Movements: Sources and Devices Interpreting the Texts**

Just as there are broad principles of tonal organisation and text illustration underlying the Osanna Mass, on a microcosmic level the themes of transcendence and human-divine interaction are expressed through particular musical sources and harmonic-melodic devices.

---

14 The F# originates from the references to the Kol Nidrei melody in G minor in the “Kyrie” (bar 13) which gave rise to the F# in the A octatonic mode (first appearing in bar 12) and later in the B minor Christe section (beginning at bar 23).
“Kyrie”: Distance and Connection

\[ \textit{Kyrie eleison} \quad \text{Lord have mercy} \]
\[ \textit{Christe eleison} \quad \text{Christ have mercy} \]
\[ \textit{Kyrie eleison} \quad \text{Lord have mercy. (Sydney Chamber Choir)} \]

The simple text of the Kyrie makes a profound ontological statement about humanity and the transcendent\(^{15}\). The speaker prays to something other than themselves, which transcends them, but is, at the same time, their origin. The prayer for mercy is a recognition of a distance between the speaker and the transcendent, and a plea for connection with the divine. This connection was renewed each year at the Day of Atonement, according to Judaic tradition (Leviticus 16:30), and in the Christian tradition this is seen as being fulfilled in the crucifixion and resurrection of Christ. The Jewish source melody, \textit{Kol Nidrei}—“All Vows” in Aramaic (Seroussi)—sets a text of renunciation of vows to be said at the beginning of the Day of Atonement. The atonement, literally ‘at-one-ment’, is necessary because God’s holiness transcends human sinfulness, but the meaning of the Kyrie text is deeper than this. It implies that our ontological status is one of need or incompleteness, preceding the fact of sin, because we are ‘other’ to the origin and cannot sustain ourselves. This is not something that needs redemption, for “poverty is the door to freedom” (Merton \textit{Thoughts} 46) and is a source of our porosity to the transcendent of which Desmond speaks.

The source melodies for this movement are the plainchant Kyrie and the \textit{Kol Nidrei} (see Example 6.3 and Example 6.1). The \textit{Kol Nidrei} probably dates from

---

\(^{15}\) The expression \textit{Kyrie eleison} was already used in pagan civic and religious ceremony before the time of Christ (Crocker), and was a form of address given to one’s superior, like ‘lord’ or ‘sir’. \textit{Kyrie} referred to masters of slaves, civic leaders and deities, including the Jewish God for Hellenistic Jews, and differed in connotation to the word \textit{despotēs} by suggesting legitimate rather than arbitrary authority (Green 485).
sixteenth century, and is found in many versions with varying degrees of elaboration. The version I use is a theoretical, unelaborated core melody proposed by Werner (36). Its own influences are a mixture of Ashkenazy liturgical and German minnesinger traditions (Idelsohn p.157) and it has a measured rhythm and a clear harmonic minor tonality\textsuperscript{16}, so the use of whole phrases in a context not disguised by polymodality gives a Baroque feeling to some of the harmony. This is something I would normally avoid, but the pathos inherent in the melody, “regarded as a musical symbol of Jewish suffering and hope for redemption” (Seroussi), is a sincere expression of the convictions behind \textit{Kyrie eleison} or its Hebrew translation, \textit{Hoshiana}, “Lord, save us”\textsuperscript{17}, and I chose not to disguise it.

The form of the choral “Kyrie” follows the text in having three sections, each with subdivisions, although both levels are longer than they are in the Kyrie chant, and do not follow the chant’s three groups of three (see Example 6.7). The transition between one key and the next is made by the use of notes common to both, and at bar forty-one this takes the form of a polymodal overlap between the two keys, in which the sopranos sing the plainchant melody in D minor over B harmonic minor harmony. The distance between keys is an illustration of the distance between the material and the transcendent, and the human and the divine.

There is a sense of weight associated with the text that is already well expressed by the D natural minor of the plainchant, with its Bb pressing down onto the fifth of the scale, and the lowered seventh rising with ‘effort’ to the upper D. The octatonic mode, derived from the \textit{Kol Nidrei} melody in G minor (see Example 6.9) intensifies this effect with its (in this context) prison-like structure of endlessly

\textsuperscript{16} \textit{Kol Nidrei} and \textit{Aleinu}, being \textit{Missinai} melodies (see footnote 3), do not fall into the Jewish liturgical modes because of their German influences (Idelsohn 147). For this reason I label their modes according to conventional major/minor terminology.

\textsuperscript{17} This word appears at bar 32, a brief pre-echo of the \textit{Hoshiana} to come in the \textit{Sanctus}. 
repeating minor thirds. The low tessitura is an indication that it is “from the depths I called you, Lord” (Psalm 130:1, Alter 455).

Example 6.9 G harmonic Minor and Derived Octatonic Scale

A sense of weight is also expressed by descending pitch in a number of ways. There is an overall contour of a rising in the first Kyrie section, a falling in the Christe, and a falling again in the second Kyrie, which relates to the overall rise and then fall of the Kyrie chant. The descent in the Christe at bar thirty-three is achieved by using the falling sequence at the phrase labelled ‘b2’ in the Kol Nidrei (Example 6.1), presented in B minor heterophony and counterpoint, along with other phrases from the melody. The falling idea is taken further at the second Kyrie section (at bars 45 and 54), where the contour of the plainchant melody is broken up between the parts note by note rather than phrase by phrase. This means that all voices sing one melody, in a kind of melodic reduction or telescoping: notes begin before previous notes have ended, and some repeated pitches are omitted. The result is an effect like tears, which symbolises both the sense of loss expressed in the text, and, as a ‘bleeding’ melody, Jesus’ emptying of himself in his death on the cross.

18 The phrases are taken from two versions of the melody, the Werner archetype and the Lewandowski version of 1871, found in Idelsohn 155.
19 Bar 45 uses the three Christe phrases of the chant, and bar 54 the Kyrie from the third section of the chant, without the third rise to the high D.
“Gloria”: Pealing and Tolling

Gloria in excelsis deo, Glory to God in the highest.
et in terra pax hominibus bonae voluntatis And on earth peace to men of good will.
Laudamus te. We praise Thee.
Benedicimus te. We bless Thee.
Adoramus te. We adore Thee.
Glorificamus te. We glorify Thee.
Gratias agimus tibi propter magnam gloriam tuam. We give thanks to Thee for Thy great Glory.
Domine Deus, Rex caelestis, Deus Pater omnipotens. Lord God, heavenly King, God the
Father almighty.
Domine fili unigenite, Jesu Christe. O Lord the only-begotten Son, Jesus Christ.
Domine Deus, Agnus Dei, Filius patris. O Lord God, Lamb of God, Son of the
Father.
Qui tollis peccata mundi, miserere nobis. Thou who takest away the sins of the world, have mercy on us.
Qui tollis peccata mundi suscipe deprecationem nostram. Thou who takest away the sins of the world, receive our prayer.
Qui sedes ad dexteram patris miserere nobis. Thou who sittest at the right hand of the
Father, have mercy on us.
Quoniam tu solus sanctus. For Thou only art Holy.
Tu solus Dominus. Thou only art the Lord.
Tu solus Altissimus, Jesu Christe. Thou only, O Jesus Christ, art Most High,
Cum Sancto Spiritu in gloria Dei Patris. Amen. With the Holy Ghost, in the glory of God the
Father. Amen. (St Andrew Daily Missal)

The text of the Gloria is an exuberant hymn of praise, and its opening quotation from the angelic hymn in Luke 2:14, announcing the birth of the Messiah, suggests a mingling of earthly and heavenly praises. The text praises the Father,
prays to the Son, and praises the trinity in a concluding doxology, and the form of the “Gloria” reflects this tripartite division (see Example 6.15). The melodic sources I use to express these ideas are the plainchant (Gloria IX, Example 6.10), the Jewish melody Aleinu (Example 6.2), the Sanctus IX chant (Example 6.30), and church bell patterns.

Example 6.10 Gloria IX, Transcribed (“Cum Jubilo: Gloria”)
The text of the *Aleinu* overlaps that of the Gloria in its praise of the King and Holy One, and is also a statement of monotheism: “He is our God and there is none other” (*The Complete Artscroll* 159). The text was written in Babylonia in the third century C.E. (Idelsohn 147), and the singing of the text became customary in the late eleventh century at the time of the first crusades, when Jews were forced to convert to Christianity or burn at the stake (Idelsohn 157). Both the Gloria plainchant and *Aleinu* are ‘glorious’ melodies which freely use motivic segments in wide melodic arcs, and in the first and last parts of the choral “Gloria” are used to express praise.

Throughout the “Gloria,” patterns derived from bells form a consistent thread, and are a prominent symbol of God’s glory. Bell patterns in the first and third sections of the piece are derived from English and European bell peals, and the central section is inspired by the harmonics of a large European bell, probably the appropriately named *Salvator* (Saviour) bell from Salzburg cathedral. These harmonics are first heard in bar sixty-eight (see Example 6.11), with the fundamental, Eb, unheard below them. As mentioned in chapter four, in the discussion of *Panah*, most bell harmonics produce dissonant chords such as this one, and the partials move in and out of prominence. The dissonance of bell tones is also portrayed through polytonality (bars 24 to 32 and bar 47) (see Example 6.12). I see this “living tone” as a symbol of the inner life of the trinity, and the dissonance as an expression of God’s inscrutability and the mysteriousness of existence.

---

20 In 2005 I notated my impressions of this bell from a sound sample which is no longer available (*The Bells of Christmas*). I found another recording of the bell in which the fundamental (Eb) is more audible, and in which the harmonic of the fourth (Ab) is louder than the major third (Salzburg [A]).

21 “Living tone” is a term used by Crossman (152), and refers to eastern ideas of a sound as a complex musical entity in itself.
Example 6.11 Bell Chord

Example 6.12 Polytonal Bell Figure

The bells in the first section of the “Gloria” are like fragments of the patterns produced in English change ringing, and relate to melodic material in the Gloria chant and the Aleinu melody (see Example 6.13).

Example 6.13 Phrases from Choral “Gloria” Bells, Gloria Chant and Aleinu.

The bells in the transition to the middle section (bar 47) are influenced by the sound of European church bells, which often do not have a fixed rhythm or order, but sound in irregular and constantly changing permutations. I listened particularly to the bells of the Taizé community when writing these patterns (“MP3 and Podcasts”).
In the last section (bar 107), a complete circuit of the simplest of the English bell peals, the “Plain Hunt” (Wilson), is worked through. The Plain Hunt usually consists of between four and eight bells, for example, numbers 1234567 and 8. In the second line the first two swap so that the second bell sounds first, and the other three pairs will do the same: 21436587. In the third line the swap is moved along one:

Line 1: 12345678       Line 2: 21436587       Line 3: 24163857

and so on, until the first line is reached again. These changes can include a “covering” bell which stays the same for each change. I took the usual limit of eight bells up to 9, with eight changing bells and a ninth low tonic G covering bell. These ‘bells’ sound out a mixolydian scale, and the pattern begins thus (with numbers translated into scale degrees on the right):

| 123456789 | 987654321 |
| 214365879 | 896745231 |
| 241638579 | 869472531 |
| 426183759 | 684927351 |
| 462817359 | 648293751 |

and so on. This pattern breaks up the words it sets, as though God’s glory spills out of words which cannot contain it (see Example 6.14)²².

---

²² The numbers in this example indicate the order of the notes as they occur, rather than the numbers attached to particular pitches in the previous discussion.
Example 6.14 “Plain Hunt,” “Gloria” bar 107

Underpinning the melodic material in the “Gloria” is the macro-harmony, which continues the scheme of tonal imagery begun in the “Kyrie” (see Example 6.15). The G mixolydian at the beginning and end expresses praise and the Kingship of God, and has an openness and lightness from its major third, intensified at times through the use of bell figures in E mixolydian, a sharper key. The middle section traverses around the flatter keys of Eb minor and G harmonic minor, with the low Gb
of Eb minor continuing the thread of the low F#’s in the “Kyrie,” and their associations with Christ as the Lamb of God. In the “Gloria,” Eb minor begins at the words Domine Deus, Agnus Dei (Lord God, Lamb of God), tolling for the one who “takest the sins of the world”. The text of the Gloria is not a narrative, but deals with contrasting ideas that could be categorised as ‘light’ (glory) and ‘dark’ (“hear our prayer”). Following the structure of the text, the musical progression of three sections from (tonally) light to dark and back to light has the feeling of a narrative, which could be seen as the progression of Christ from heaven to earth and back to heaven.

Example 6.15 “Gloria,” Key Areas and Pitch Threads

![Example 6.15 “Gloria,” Key Areas and Pitch Threads](image)
The two harmonic transitions, into and out of the flatter key areas, express the text at these points: the implied descent of Christ as Lamb of God (bars 47 to 58), and the looking up to God in “receive our prayer” (bars 85 to 94). The first transitional passage (bar 47), leading to *Domine Deus, Agnus Dei*, is a twelve bar shift from G mixolydian to Eb minor (see Example 6.16). The change of key is achieved firstly by superimposing an E major figure in the bass onto the existing G mixolydian tonality, which emerges as an E mixolydian tonality in bar 49. The addition of G again at bar 53 brings an ambiguity that is strengthened and darkened by the addition of Bb, which over bars 56 to 58 changes the meaning of the Bass F# to Gb of the following Eb minor—the heavenly descending to the earthly and to human need by an exchange of keys from ‘light’ to ‘dark.’

**Example 6.16** “Gloria,” Harmonic Transition (from bar 49)\(^23\)

Later, at the words *suscipe deprecationem nostrum* (receive our prayer) the transition back out of Eb minor takes place in a similar way: the soprano Bb rises to B natural (bar 85), changing Eb minor to B major, and paving the way for the B to become the third of G major by bar ninety (Example 6.17). The harmonic movements between these fairly distant keys at these points in the text symbolise a relational

\(^{23}\) Each slurred group of notes continues to sound as others are added, up to bar fifty-six.
movement between human and divine—one reaching out to another through an exchange of notes\textsuperscript{24}.

\textbf{Example 6.17} “Gloria,” Harmonic Transition (bar 84)

\begin{center}
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example6.17.png}
\end{center}

Soon after the return to the tonic G major at bar ninety-four (G is associated from the beginning with God’s glory) the harmony moves to the key of VII through two descending fifths. At bar ninety-seven (Example 6.18) the GEC of the \textit{Aleinu} melody in the alto turns the previous G major bars into a dominant, and the CAF of the bass \textit{Sanctus} melody (bar 99) makes the previous two C major bars into a dominant. This move to the flatter F major affirms the return to the tonic G, in a way that is analogous to Mozart’s and Beethoven’s use of the subdominant to relax long-range harmonic tension in the recapitulation of sonata form (Rosen, \textit{The Classical Style} 79 and \textit{The Romantic Generation} 244). The F major passage merges back into G mixolydian (bar 106) through the earlier method of an exchange of notes.

\textsuperscript{24} A similar idea can be found in Gubaidulina’s \textit{In Croce}, mentioned in chapter three. In \textit{In Croce}, the exchange between human and divine involves an exchange of registers and an exchange of diatonicism and chromaticism.
The “Gloria” is a narrative of key areas (and their associated melodic materials) but it is not a pitch narrative in the sense of a Schenkerian fundamental linear descent. Instead, pitch threads on G, B and D continue through each change of key area, moving to neighbouring notes and back again (see Example 6.15). On a local level, melodies have their own pitch trajectory, but individual lines in a passage will often operate without co-ordinated movement to a harmonic goal, with the result that there are less restrictions on vertical possibilities. I am interested in the coincidences that happen when different melodies—particularly from other sources—are put together, and in letting surprising things happen if they seem right. The remaining notes and the surface coincidences together refer to the glory of God holding all things together, expressed in the idiosyncrasies of nature and in the things that are not explained.
“Credo”: Stillness in Movement

*Credo in unum Deum,*
I believe in one God,

*Patrem omnipotentem,*
The Father Almighty,

*factorem caeli et terrae,*
maker of heaven and earth,

*visibilium omnium et invisibilium.*
of all that is, visible and invisible,

*Et in unum Dominum Iesum Christum,*
and in one Lord Jesus Christ,

*Filium Dei unigenitum,*
the only begotten Son of God,

*et ex Patre natum*
born of the Father

*ante omnia saecula.*
before all worlds.

*Deum de Deo, Lumen de Lumine,*
God from God, Light from Light,

*Deum verum de Deo vero,*
True God from True God,

*genitum non factum,*
begotten not made,

*consubstantialem Patri:*
of one being with the Father:

*per quem omnia facta sunt.*
through him all things were made.

*Qui propter nos homines*
For us people

*et propter nostram salutem*
and for our salvation

*descendit de caelis.*
He came down from heaven

*Et incarnatus est*
and was incarnate

*de Spiritu Sancto*
by the Holy Spirit

*ex Maria Virgine,*
of the Virgin Mary,

*et homo factus est.*
and was made man.

*Crucifixus etiam pro nobis*
He was crucified for us

*sub Pontio Pilato,*
under Pontius Pilate,

*passus et sepultus est,*
died and was buried.

*et resurrexit tertia die,*
On the third day he rose again,

*secundam Scripturas,*
in accordance with the Scriptures,

*et ascendit in caelum,*
and ascended into heaven,

*sedet ad dexteram Patris.*
And is seated at the right hand of the Father.

*Et iterum venturus est cum gloria,*
He will come again in glory
iudicare vivos et mortuos, to judge the living and the dead,
cuius regni non erit finis. And his kingdom will have no end.

Et in Spiritum Sanctum, And in the Holy Spirit,
Dominum et vivificantem, the Lord, the giver of life,
qui ex Patre Filioque procedit. who proceeds from the Father and the Son,
Qui cum Patre et Filio simul adoratur who with the Father and the Son is worshipped
et conglorificatur: and glorified,
qui locutus est per prophetas. who has spoken by the prophets.

Et unam, sanctam, catholicam And in one holy catholic
et apostolicam Ecclesiam. and apostolic church.

Confiteor unum baptisma I acknowledge one baptism
in remissionem peccatorum. For the forgiveness of sins.

Et expecto resurrectionem mortuorum, And I await the resurrection of the dead
et vitam venturi saeculi. Amen. and the life of the world to come. Amen. (Sydney
Chamber Choir)

In the third movement of the Mass the musical form is again based on the text, this time not as a broadly tripartite structure but as a series of musical pictures. The Credo text follows a similar order to that of the Gloria (Father, Son, Holy Spirit, and in the Credo, the body of believers) but contains a more detailed account of each rather than expressions of adoration. The text of the Credo is a summary of Christian belief\textsuperscript{25}, which I have approached as a devotional text like the rest of the Mass, and so have used the same kinds of expressive devices as in the other movements. The harmonic structure of the sectional pictures is a recurring selection of four main tonics (Bb, C, A and F) which gives an overall harmonic stasis to the movement, and this and other features of stasis are derived from qualities inherent in the plainchant.

\textsuperscript{25} It was originally formulated at the council of Nicea in 325 to refute the teaching of Arius that Christ is not fully God (McManners 144).
The Credo chant used in the Osanna Mass is the oldest known Credo chant (number one in the Liber Usualis), possibly dating from the end of the eight century (Crocker, “Credo”), and is much more recitational in character than the chants from Kyriale IX (see Example 6.20). It consists of four recurring, motivically inter-related phrases which reflect the phrase structure of the text: two opening phrases cadencing on A and D for phrases ending with a comma, and two closing phrases cadencing on G for those with colons or full stops (see Example 6.19).

Example 6.19 Credo I Chant Phrases, Transcription (“Cum Jubilo: Credo”)

The phrases generally form open-closed pairs, but there are several of groups of three containing two closed cadences. In addition, the inter-relationships between phrases, and their adaptations to different lines of text, sometimes blur the distinctions between them. This mixture of repetition and variety, along with the simplicity of the melodic contours and small pitch range, has a “lapping” effect, like the continually changing play of ripples in water. The repetition and continual returning to A and G gives a stillness beneath the melodic movement which seemed a good picture of the presence of the Holy Spirit within the flux of the material world—it is like an extended form of the “inner life” of a bell sound. I have aimed to translate this effect into the choral “Credo” in several ways, outlined under “Illustration of the text through lapping,” below.
Example 6.20 Credo I, Transcription ("Cum Jubilo: Credo")

A number of other source melodies are also woven through the “Credo,” each one with associations that relate to the text. The first is a melody commonly used for the Jewish ‘credo’, *Sh’mah Yisrael* (tenor, bar 4): “Hear O Israel, the Lord our God, the
Lord is One” (Deuteronomy 6:4) (see Example 6.21). Following this, at bar eleven, the first section of the Agnus Dei chant is heard in its entirety in the tenor part, linking the Agnus Dei “Lamb of God” with the words “and in one Lord, Jesus Christ” in the credo text. The sopranos’ falling fourth bell motif from the “Gloria” also gives a cross-reference to the idea of glory at this point (first sopranos from bar 12) as the music opens out from Bb major into the sharper key of C major at these words (see Example 6.22). In both examples the plainchant is sung by the altos.

Example 6.21 “Credo,” Opening
Example 6.22 “Credo,” *Et in Unum Dominum Iesum Christum*

At bar thirty-six the descent of Christ from heaven is effected harmonically by two drops of a fifth, from the previous section ending on F (bar 36) to Bb (bar 40) which is V of Eb in bar forty-two (see Example 6.23).
At Crucifixus etiam pro nobis (bar 48), the first phrase of the Easter chorale melody *O Haupt voll Blut und Wunden* (Riemenschneider 17) is heard in the altos, while the first tenors sing the first half phrase of a gospel song, *Near the Cross*\(^{26}\). The lower voices ‘toll’ an Eb minor chord as a funereal bell, the same chord which in the “Gloria” middle section set the words *qui tollis peccata mundi*, “who takes away the sins of the world” (see Example 6.24).

\(^{26}\) The text is by Fanny J. Crosby and the melody dates from 1867 (DeMent).
The following passage, *Et resurrexit*, (bar 52) brings back the *Aleinu* melody heard in the “Gloria,” primarily because of the bright sound and rising contour of the melody, but also as a reference to the divinity of Christ from a Christian interpretation of this text about the “Master of All” (*The Complete Artscroll* 159). The Basses sing the *Sh’ma Yisrael* melody, which has similar textual associations to the *Aleinu*, and the “Gloria” bell figure returns in the altos, again for its associations with glory (see Example 6.25).
Example 6.25 “Credo,” *Et Resurrexit*

At *et iterum venturus est cum gloria* (and he will come again with glory; bars 61 to 92) previous source melodies appear in fragmented form, with the addition of *Kol Nidrei* at *judicare vivos et mortuos* (he will judge the living and the dead) (see Example 6.26). The credo text here is juxtaposed with the *Kol Nidrei*, which is sung on the eve of the Day of Atonement, linking God’s judgement with his mercy.

Example 6.26 “Credo,” *Et Iterum Venturus Est*
This combination of fragments becomes faster, denser and more irregular from bar seventy-five, at the words *et in Spiritum Sanctum*, as an expression of the Holy Spirit as the “giver of life” (*vivificantem*) (see Example 6.27). Several fragments from these two passages return later in the recapitulation of the opening material (bar 112).

**Example 6.27** “Credo,” Melodic Fragments (bars 72 to 92)

Finally, in the passage beginning at bar ninety-two, *qui ex patre filioque procedit* (who proceeds from the Father and the Son), there are two quotations from the plainchants associated with Christ: the Kyrie (tenors from bar 94) and the Agnus Dei (soprano 2, from bar 95) along with my countermelody to this chant from the “Agnus Dei,” in the first sopranos at bar ninety-nine (see Example 6.28).
Example 6.28 “Credo,” Qui ex Patre

Illustration of the Credo Text through ‘Lapping’

In addition to the interpretation of the text through the use of borrowed material, the overall theme of transcendence in the text of the Credo is expressed by musical stasis in a number of different ways. The stasis behind the recurring phrases of the Credo chant is reflected in the “Credo” on local and structural levels as an expression of the presence of the eternal in the temporal, although it is hidden beneath a series of different musical events. On a local level, the plainchant is present more consistently through this movement than it is in any of the others, except for the “Agnus Dei,” and its presence on the surface of the music provides an alternating A-G thread through its open and closed cadences (although they are not necessarily heard
as cadences in their contexts). Other note pairs within the phrases undulate more subtly, through the phrases’ repetition—A/Bb, E/F and D/E. In addition to this, the recurring motives discussed above join the chant phrases to achieve a lapping affect through their use in successive thematic and harmonic contexts, and the idea of alternation is expressed more directly by a number of oscillating figures (see Example 6.29).

Example 6.29 “Credo,” Pitches of Oscillating Figures

On a local level, too, there is stillness behind movement in the way that most sections are harmonically static, with repeated fragments or goal-directed melodic movements within them. A short example of the latter can be found at bar fifty-two (Example 6.25). The Bb/F pedal in the tenor provides a static ground for the soprano melody in F, with its goal of high F (bar 57)\(^{27}\), and the bass melody which descends from D to Bb.

On a deeper level, there is an irregular alternation in the flow of the sections’ tonal centres and textural types, a larger-scale “lapping”. Sections are defined by texture and pitch material, in the form of motives, themes and modal areas. In terms of themes, defined here as prominent, intact melodies, there is not enough repetition to provide a sense of alternation. As far as texture and key area go, however, each have a small number of possibilities that keep returning in varied forms, much like the four phrase types of the Credo chant (see Table 6.1).

\(^{27}\) The soprano melody travels to the final F’s by outlining the F major arpeggio.
Table 6.1 “Credo,” Keys and Textures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>25</th>
<th>31</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>46</th>
<th>54</th>
<th>58</th>
<th>61</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bb maj</td>
<td>F maj Cmaj</td>
<td>A nat min</td>
<td>A nat min/F*</td>
<td>Eb maj</td>
<td>Gb maj Eb min</td>
<td>Bb maj A mixo</td>
<td>C maj A min</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PP</td>
<td>PP, FR</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>PP</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>PP, FR</td>
<td>PP</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>FR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>124</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G min C maj</td>
<td>G maj C maj/mixo *</td>
<td>F maj</td>
<td>A mixo</td>
<td>Bb maj</td>
<td>F maj Cmaj</td>
<td>G maj</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FR</td>
<td>FR</td>
<td>PP, P</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>PP</td>
<td>PP, FR</td>
<td>H</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Texture:

PP: polyphony and pedal       P: polyphony       H: homophony       FR: repeated fragments

Bold type for texture initials indicates harmonic motion within that section.

* indicates a descent of a fifth into the following section.

This circulating effect of recurring key areas is accentuated by the ambiguity in the tonality of the “Credo” movement. C is the predominant tonal centre, but there is no clear tonic for the piece. There is twice a temporary sense of resolution to a tonal resting place through descending fifths movement (marked with an asterisk in Table 6.1), but these places turn out to be part of the overall ebb and flow of key areas.

Stasis behind movement in the “Credo,” then, can be seen on two levels, within sections and within the piece as a whole. Firstly, there is either directed melodic movement or the ‘lapping’ of repeated fragments within static sections. The stasis, and so the symbolism of the eternal in the temporal, is perceptible here. On the second level, that of the whole piece, the element of stasis is less obvious. What is

---

28 The modality of the chant is also ambiguous – it appears to be D natural minor, but D is the goal of an open cadence which occurs only three times, while the closed cadences rest on G.
most audible is the changing character of the sections, with their textural, harmonic and thematic contrasts. At the same time, however, changes of texture and modal centre come and go in an irregular alternation or ‘lapping,’ without a pre-eminent point of arrival or modal centre, which is an element of stasis beneath the changing surface of the music. Through all of these the plainchant melody forms an alternating (static) thread, along with other more intermittent threads of melodic fragments. These threads are usually unvarying in pitch, and so provide most of the remaining notes which act as a binding force through the series of diverse sections. In their obscurity, the long range ‘lapping’ of harmony and texture, together with motivic and pitch threads, symbolise an eternal which is more hidden in the flux of time.

“Sanctus”: Darkness and Brightness

*Kadosh, kadosh, kadosh, Adonai tzeva’ot,* Holy, holy, holy is the Lord God of Hosts.

*Kol m’lo ha’aretz k’vodo.* Heaven and earth are full of thy glory.

*Osanna in excelsis.* Hosanna in the highest.

*Benedictus qui venit in nomine Domini.* Blessed is he who comes in the name of the Lord.

*Osanna in excelsis.* Hosanna in the highest. (Sydney Chamber Choir)

The main idea that I have drawn from the text of the Sanctus is the expression of God’s glory as incomprehensible, or ‘dark,’ and as filling the earth with ‘brightness’. The text consists of two biblical quotations, from Isaiah 6.3 and Luke 19.38-40, and the *Osanna* “Sanctus” is in two parts which can also be sung as independent pieces, “Sanctus” and “Benedictus.” In the liturgy of the Mass, the Sanctus as a whole is sung just before the prayers which prepare for the taking of the bread and the wine. There are a number of interlinking associations between the two
texts and their context at this point in the liturgy, and these, alongside my personal impressions, have guided the ways in which I have expressed the texts. These ways centre around the idea of harmonic colour, which makes an overall progression from dark to light.

In the Sanctus, I see the expressions of glory in the Gloria and Credo as being transformed from an outward, bright exuberance to a more inward experience of awe, reflected in the experience of Isaiah before God in heaven, in the passage from which this text was taken. I have aimed to convey a sense of awe through a musical expression of darkness, by making the Sanctus chant (see Example 6.30) into a canon at the minor second. In the Bible, darkness signifies separation or hiddenness: between humans and knowledge of how to live righteously (wisdom), between humans and knowledge of God, and between humans and God himself. In Psalm eighteen it says of wisdom that “it is you who light my lamp, the Lord my God lightens my darkness” (vs. 28), and verse eleven says of God that he “made darkness his covering, his canopy about him.” Job, at the point of abandonment from God, spoke of making his “bed in darkness” (Job 17:13). All three connotations relate to the text of the Sanctus. Firstly, “holy” means righteous or pure (Harris 787), secondly, God is beyond our comprehension, and thirdly, holy means transcendent—without God’s reaching out to humankind (“he who comes”) he cannot be found.

---

29 The meaning of kadosh is ‘set apart’ (Harris 788).
Example 6.30 Sanctus IX, Transcription (“Cum Jubilo: Sanctus”)

It is the unknownness and unreachability of God that is represented by the darkness of the opening canons. For this reason the words from Isaiah are in the original Hebrew, which is symbolically closer to the heart of who God is than Latin, and also more opaque in being less known in the context of Western art music. There are two canons separated by a single gesture at bar sixteen, and these three statements correspond to the three “holy”s. The chant phrases are sung in F and F#, whose notes together make up nearly the whole chromatic spectrum (see Example 6.31).

Example 6.31 “Sanctus,” Notes of the Two Canons

As in my orchestral piece, *Panah* (chapter four), pitch density here is musical weight, representing the Hebrew word for glory, *kvod*, whose root means ‘weight’
(Harris 426). The distance between the two keys is also symbolic of our distance from the transcendent and from the comprehension of God, for they have only two notes in common, the most distant possible relation. Other points of dissonant polymodality in the Mass have related symbolisms\textsuperscript{30}, but this is the most dissonant example because the notes here are all in dense proximity. In the first canon, the first phrase of the chant (in F and F#) is hidden in the texture, being broken up amongst the different voices, as is the chant at the end of the “Kyrie,” except that here the texture is more sustained (see Example 6.32).

\textbf{Example 6.32} “Sanctus,” First Canon in F and F#

\textsuperscript{30} The polymodalities in question are: Kyrie: Bminor and Dminor, Gloria Eb minor/major, Agnus Fmajor and F# major. By association with these passages’ symbolism of the Lamb of God, the F# major at this point also implies the presence of the Lamb of God at the heart of the Godhead.
An octatonic breath-like gesture follows, in which the eight notes of that scale on A (also a combination of F and F# majors) fill in the space one by one. The sopranos sing A and G in reference to the second phrase of the plainchant. The third phrase of the chant is then sung intact in the second canon, by each of four parts (in F, F#, F, and F#). In both canons, the lengths of each note vary independently between the parts to give a sense of ebb and flow in the cloud-like texture—a “cloud of unknowing”\textsuperscript{31}—a texture which was influenced by Hosokawa’s use of shifting blends of sustained notes\textsuperscript{32}.

Out of this ‘womb’ of sound emerge tendrils of melody into the (F major) light of the material world, which begin setting the words Adonai Tzeva’ot, “Lord of Hosts.” The “hosts” are fragments of the Sanctus chant in different keys, with some inverted; not a warlike army in this representation but an expression of another sense of tsava (host), that of service (see Example 6.33).

\textsuperscript{31} This is the title of an anonymous work on contemplative prayer from the fourteenth century.

\textsuperscript{32} I refer to three ‘sound-mass’ pieces: Voyage I, Konzert für saxophone und Orchester and Ferne-Landschaft II.
The hosts of heaven, whether angelic beings or forces of nature (Psalm 33.6), serve their creator: “the whole earth is full of his glory.” At this phrase the setting recalls the ‘glory’ of the “Gloria,” with bells ringing in the European style of rhythmic abandon. In this case the effect is achieved by giving each part a repeating ‘bell’ of a different length to the other parts (see Example 6.34).
Example 6.34 “Sanctus,” Kol M’lo Ha’aretz K’vodo

The “Benedictus” is centred throughout on F major, and the text is primarily interpreted through the associations attached to the source materials. The quotation from Luke which provides this second half of the Sanctus text is itself a quotation from Psalm 118 (verses 25-26) by the crowd on the first Palm Sunday. It is part of the Hallel, the Psalms of praise (Psalms 113 to 118) which are sung at the major Jewish festivals (France 780). At the last supper, in which Jesus and his disciples celebrated the Passover meal, the hymn they sang in Matthew 6.30 was most likely the Hallel (France 996), sung before Jesus himself became the Passover or Paschal lamb at the crucifixion.\(^33\) This passage is now sung in the liturgy as an introduction to

\(^33\) Matthew makes clear his interpretation of Psalm 118 as prophetic of Jesus’ death by quoting it three times from Jesus’ entry into Jerusalem, at Matthew 21:9, 21:42 and 23:39.
the preparation of the Eucharist, which parallels the Passover service in its celebration of salvation by substitutary sacrifice. The Hebrew word *Hoshiana*, from which the Latin *Osanna* comes, has the same meaning as the Greek *Kyrie eleison*, with a sense of urgency: “save us now!” The music at the beginning of the “Benedictus” returns to the low counterpoint of bar nine of the “Kyrie” to reflect this meaning of *Hoshiana*.

The word *Hoshiana* developed connotations of praise, much like *Hallelujah*, (France 780), hence “Hosanna in the highest!” at Matthew 21.9. From bar twelve, *Hoshiana* becomes *Osanna in excelsis*, the exclamation of praise of the Sanctus text. Both senses of the word, of supplication and praise, are appropriate at the Eucharist, where human need meets divine provision. “He who comes” also has particular significance in the Eucharist which, as well as being a ritual remembrance of Jesus’ atonement, is also a sign and potentially an experience of his presence now (and in the Roman Catholic tradition this presence is literal in the bread and wine).

The words, “Hosanna in excelsis. Blessed is he who comes in the name of the Lord” (bar 12) are carried by the Sanctus plainchant, joined by the *Aleinu* melody in the bass (bar 19) and accompanied by a number of fragmentary melodies derived from bird calls and blackbird song local to the Penrith (NSW) area where I live (see Example 6.35)\(^\text{34}\). These avian, rather than angelic, “hosts of heaven” are proclaiming as well as embodying the filling of the earth with the glory of God (from the Sanctus), and welcoming the one who comes in the name of the Lord.

---

\(^{34}\) Two notes together are a suggestion of multiphonics in some of the calls.
Example 6.35 “Benedictus,” Bird Call Phrases (bars 14-22 and 30-33)
For the final Osanna in excelsis (bar 28) the Sanctus chant is not completed, but opens out into a return of the bells from the end of the “Sanctus,” with their associations of glory (see Example 6.36), while the birds continue. In bar thirty-seven the texture opens out again to a brief reprise of the final bell peal of the “Gloria,” this time in the key of F major.

**Example 6.36 Bell Notes of “Sanctus” and “Benedictus”**

One of the primary means of text illustration in the *Sanctus* is the use of symbolic pitches and the colour of associated modal areas (see Table 6.2).
Table 6.2 “Sanctus,” Macro-Harmony and Source Materials

“Sanctus”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>54</th>
<th>65</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F and F# maj Plainchant canon 1</td>
<td>Octatonic on A</td>
<td>F and F# maj Plainchant canon 2</td>
<td>Polytonal F centre Plainchant fragments</td>
<td>F and Bb maj Bell figure</td>
<td>Ab maj Bell figure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Benedictus”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>27</th>
<th>37</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Octatonic on A</td>
<td>D aeol over A</td>
<td>F maj Chant Aleinu Birds</td>
<td>F mixo Birds Bell figure</td>
<td>F maj Birds Bell figure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After the F/F# major setting of “Holy, Holy, Holy” at the beginning of the Sanctus, the F major remains for “the Lord of Hosts,” emerging out of the mixture and establishing itself amidst inflections of fragments in G and Bb majors (bars 39 to 53). The darkness of the opening has given way to the lighter key, made brighter by the piquancy of dissonant fragments, expressing the glory of God now revealed in the natural world. At “the whole earth is full of his glory,” the brightness is intensifed by the clash between F and Bb major ‘bells’ (bar 56, see Example 6.37), and this becomes brighter again with the addition of Ab (bar 65), or perhaps darker. The addition of Db shortly after and the loss of the top A confirm that the chromatic spectrum is moving back in the direction of the original darkness of F# (Gb), although the original combination of F and F# is only hinted at in the last two bars (see Example 6.37).
Example 6.37 “Sanctus” Bells, Harmonic Progression (from bar 56)

The F major which emerged and was obscured in the “Sanctus” is established again in the “Benedictus” (bar 14) and continues until the end of the movement, now as the glory of God revealed in Christ (“blessed is he”). It is punctuated with the Eb of the currawong call (see Example 6.35), and has a more extended Eb colouring in the F mixolydian bell passage (bars 28 to 37).

The harmonic structure of the “Sanctus” is a series of areas of harmonic colour which are static within themselves, but which move overall from darkness to brightness. The movement within each area is also a result of changing colours or light and shade, firstly from the subtle differences in the combinations of dissonances in the two canons, and later in the modal inflections in the collages of fragments based on F major. In the “Benedictus,” I aimed to evoke the unordered effect of different species of birds singing together, the way it apparently ‘just happens,’ as the “glory of God expressed in the idiosyncracies of nature” referred to in the discussion of the “Gloria.” The process of writing these passages was like the filling up of a visual space, like the floral decorations around the borders of illuminated manuscripts,

35 The pied Currawong is “perhaps the most conspicuous native bird” in urban south-eastern Australia, and it is found right up the east coast of the continent (Lindsey 32).

36 The directional contours of the chant phrases are obscured by the canonic procedures; instead the gradual entry and exit of the different voices increases and decreases the density of the texture, and gives a sense of breathing in and out for each of the canons.
or the figuration in Miro’s *Constellation* paintings as discussed in chapter three. By becoming space, the music suggests the suspension of time.

“*Agnus Dei*: Simplicity and Intimacy

*Agnus Dei*  
Lamb of God

*qui tollis peccata mundi:* who takest away the sins of the world:

*miserere nobis.* have mercy on us.

*Agnus Dei*  
Lamb of God

*qui tollis peccata mundi:* who takest away the sins of the world:

*miserere nobis.* have mercy on us.

*Agnus Dei*  
Lamb of God

*qui tollis peccata mundi:* who takest away the sins of the world:

*dona nobis pacem.* grant us peace. (Sydney Chamber Choir)

The “*Agnus Dei*” makes a contemplative and devotional end to the *Osanna* Mass, through its straightforward presentation of the Agnus Dei plainchant phrases in a series of harmonic settings. The plainchant’s economy of means, with its repetition of simple melodic shapes, is translated in the “Agnus” into textural, rhythmic and often harmonic simplicity.

The structure of the Agnus Dei chant is similar to that of the Kyrie, with three sections using repeated material (see Example 6.38 and compare to Example 6.3, the Kyrie chant). In the Agnus chant, the sections form a symmetrical ABA, rather than a build up of motifs over a rising tessitura, as in the Kyrie. There seems to be a
particular interpretation of the text in this simple scheme, with the meditative stasis of
the repeated arch shapes of the melody, and (my subjective impression of) the warmth
of the F major mode. There is a hint of the pathos implicit in the text in the pressure
of the top F’s to the semi-tone E’s below them, but the focus is not on the agony of
the cross—qui tollis peccata mundi—but on the peace of the last line of the text. The
prevailing sense is one of simplicity, expressing reverence and intimacy, qualities I
aimed to reflect in the choral “Agnus.” This is appropriate for the place of the Agnus
Dei in the liturgy, just before the taking of the bread and wine, when Christ is most
immediately present.

Example 6.38 Agnus Dei IX, Transcription (“Cum Jubilo: Agnus Dei”)

The form of the plainchant is carried over into the choral “Agnus,” set within
an opening and a closing section (see Table 6.3).
Table 6.3 “Agnus Dei,” Structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>29</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>50</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opening</td>
<td>G mixolydian over F major (melody over cantus firmus)</td>
<td>1st section of plainchant</td>
<td>2nd section of plainchant</td>
<td>3rd section of plainchant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G maj/mixo (polyphony)</td>
<td>F maj over F# maj (homophony)</td>
<td>G mixo over G and F maj (G centre) (canonic)</td>
<td>G mixo over F maj (melody over cluster texture)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In each section the chant melody is set in a different harmonic context and, as in the “Gloria” these contexts move from lighter keys to darker and back to lighter. In the opening, the first chant phrase in F is a slow cantus firmus, supporting a melody in G mixolydian (with one F#) which gives a brightness to the F major.

In the setting of the first section of the plainchant at bar 15, the alto carries this melody in counterpoint to the soprano’s Sanctus plainchant, a counterpoint closer to heterophony because of the similarity of the two melodies (as both are possibly derived from the Aleinu melody). The harmony in this section leaned towards the style of Josquin, who is a master of expressing tenderness through harmony. The two lower parts guide the F major into slightly ‘deeper waters’ with the introduction of Bb and Eb harmonies, in preparation for the polymodal setting of the second section of the chant (bar 29). This passage places the F major chant above F# major harmony, and is the final part of the F#/Gb thread that has run through the whole Mass, carrying with it the same associations of separation and the Lamb of God, but with a more intimate and tender quality than before (see Example 6.39). The F major of the chant remains sounding when the F# major cluster has died away in bar thirty-eight, clearing a space for the return of F major in canon with G major (see Example 6.40).
Example 6.39 “Agnus Dei” (end of the first section of plainchant and beginning of the second)
In section three the chant is in the tenor part, still in F, and the altos sing it in canon, in G. The two soprano parts sing the opening melody, also in canon, and still in the brighter key of G which in this passage eclipses F as a tonal centre. The plainchant ends in bar forty-nine, and the opening melody continues in the closing passage, over an echo of the ‘bleeding melody’ texture of the “Kyrie.” This is comprised of the third section of the plainchant, unravelled into threads of individual notes which coalesce back onto the tonal centre of F (see Example 6.41).
Example 6.41 “Agnus Dei,” Closing Section

Summary

In the Osanna Mass, the themes of Divine transcendence, immanence and intersection with humanity in the Mass text are ‘illuminated,’ or interpreted pictorially and symbolically, through two primary means. The first is the use of musical sources which symbolise aspects of these themes by association: the Mass plainchant (Kyriale IX) and Jewish melodies through their texts, and church bells and birdsong through existing spiritual associations. As in paraphrase Masses of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, phrases and fragments from these melodies have been gathered and woven into the fabric of the Mass in a process of ‘centonization.’ Borrowed phrases and
fragments make up a significant amount of the material of the Mass and are a source of significant pitches, some of which have taken on symbolic value. The plainchants in particular have musical features that are found in, or have informed, my musical language, such as the use of remaining notes, harmonic stasis, and the rhythmic flow of uneven groupings of pulses.

The second means of expressing the themes in the Mass is illustration, and for this I have used elements of my musical language to create aural symbols or ‘pictures’ of concepts in the text. These elements centre around the use of remaining note threads, and ways of using harmony, for example through modal colour, polymodality and pitch density.

The musical sources and remaining note threads, both with their attached symbolisms of the transcendent, are woven into a musical ‘nest’ which I see as containing the transcendent. This nest is not centred around one tonality, since the movements are based on the modes of their respective chants, which have tonal centres of D, G, D, F and F. In the absence of a unified key scheme, it is motivic and pitch connections which hold the whole Mass together in an open-ended unity.

The image of a nest suggests a dwelling place and a place of intimacy—a place in which the transcendent can be present, and in which human beings can experience a connection to it. As God dwells in the “praises of Israel” (Psalm 22.3), and is enthroned in the texts of the Mass, the musical nest also dwells in the presence of God for, “sing[ing] for joy to the living God,” like the birds which made nests in the crevices of the Hebrew temple stones,

Even the sparrow finds a home,
and the swallow a nest for herself,
that puts its fledglings by your altars,
Lord of Hosts, my King and my God. (Ps 84.2-3, The Holy Bible and Alter 298)
Conclusion
Chapter Seven
Voiced and Nested Transcendence

My portfolio of compositions, discussed in this thesis, in different ways expresses aspects of the transcendent. In writing music, and experiencing any art, I am seeking a sense of meaning beyond what words can articulate. In aiming to “sing the Lord’s song” in the “strange land” of the material world and the material of music, I am looking for a sense of connection to a reality that is more intense than that which is experienced in ordinary life, and that opens up a “porosity to the transcendent” that remains after the event. In some experiences of this porosity we “are awakened beyond ourselves, as if released into a kind of praying” (Desmond, Art 289). I see this sense of connection as having something to do with the “sweetness” that the psalmist asks “the master our God [to] be upon us” as mentioned in the introduction (Psalm 90.17, Alter 320). “Art can be a carrier of transcendence” (Art 290), and art can be or make a place in which the transcendent can be met, which I have likened to the biblical tabernacle or ‘tent of meeting.’ For me, as for the makers of the tabernacle, it is the Holy Spirit who is the enabler to “devise artistic designs” (Exodus 31.3-4), and in my music the designs take the form of a mosaic or ‘centonization’ of musical ideas that have been collected and woven into a musical ‘nest.’ On a local level it is modal melodic material, my own and borrowed, that is threaded together with voice-leading influenced by Josquin and Machaut. On a formal level the mosaic is most often a series of interrelated panels of varying lengths. Threads of static pitches of continuing significance, or ‘remaining’ notes, bind the nest together.

In writing the secular and sacred choral works of the portfolio and reflecting on their texts, I have found that my understanding of human reality and the
transcendent has deepened, and my musical language has been renewed. New musical ideas from both secular sources (such as the use of the additive rhythms of Sappho’s poetry) and sacred sonic symbols (such as the use of musical material that is borrowed because of perceived sacred associations) have facilitated this renewal. In addition, the use of borrowed tonal material as a starting point for writing has suggested new ways of writing tonally, and contributed to the particular identity of each piece.

Ideas relating to the transcendent direct the music even when writing instrumental music, through associations that come with the title and/or borrowing. Both Lai and Panah borrow music that is not written by humans—bird song and the partly uncontrolled timbre of bell sounds—to express the transcendent dwelling in the world, and take from Takemitsu the use of the octatonic mode and the sense of eternity that he associated with it.

Transcendence and the glorious immanence of the Judeo-Christian God are central to the text of the Osanna Mass and my musical illustration or ‘illumination’ of the text. The diverse textures and harmonies that express the details of the text are unified by longer-range threads of harmonic lightness and darkness, recurring melodic ideas and remaining notes that maintain a consistent symbolic presence through the five movements. The plainchant and Jewish melodies alongside which the Mass speaks—paraphrases—enrich the meanings of the text, and imbue my own compositional voice with a “murmur of many voices.” Together these voices address and make a clearing for the transcendent.

Through writing this thesis I have come to see that not only have individual pieces been made as nests for the transcendent, but that this concept applies to all the pieces together. As individual works are open-ended wholes or ‘betweens,’ made up
of collections of musical ideas and borrowings, these works together make up a collective sound world or nest that is an identifiable ‘place,’ porous to the transcendent and to other people\(^1\).

The writer of Psalm 90 asks that “the work of our hands [be] firmly found.” The verb “firmly found” occurs here in a context of comparison between human ephemerality and a God who is “from forever to forever” (vs. 2, Alter 317). In the transitory, time-based art of music, the invisible is ultimately firmer than the visible or audible. It is the transcendent referred to and residing in art, as Origin and end, the “third who is in our midst,” that makes it firmly found.

\(^1\) This porosity is symbolised for me by the tabernacles made for the Jewish festival Sukkot which, according to the Mishnah, should have small gaps between the branches of the roof through which one can see the stars (Trepp 124).
Works Cited


<http://quote.robertgenn.com/auth_search.php?name=bannard>


<http://romaaeternRomaAeterna.jp/>.


<http://romaaeternRomaAeterna.jp/>.


Fallon, Robert. “The Record of Realism in Messiaen’s Bird Style.” Olivier
Messiaen: Music Art and Literature. Ed. Christopher Dingle and Nigel


Fiddes, Paul S. The Promised End: Eschatology in Theology and Literature.


Forte, Allen and Steven E. Gilbert. Introduction to Schenkerian Analysis. New

France, R.T. The Gospel of Matthew. The New International Commentary on the


—. “Traversing Distances: Pitch Organisation, Gesture and Imagery in the Late


Lukomsky, Vera and Sofia Gubaidulina. “My Desire is Always to Rebel, to Swim Against the Stream!” *Perspectives of New Music* 36 (1998): 5-41.


Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos, 2005.


(Claudio_Monteverdi)>


Riemenschneider, Albert. *371 Harmonised Chorales and 69 Chorale Melodies*


Stanhope, Paul. “Into that Mysterious World: Notions of Ritual in Kumari by


Glossary of Musical Terms

Between A term used by philosopher William Desmond to refer to the ontological “milieu of being” (God 9) of the material world and human experience and relationships. The between is not self-contained but has a transcendent origin with which it interacts. It is used analogously of my pieces to refer to the nature of their forms as interrelationships of independent ideas within an open-ended whole.

‘Centonization’ An adaption of the word used to describe the creation of plainchant from pre-existing melodic formulas. In a broad sense it refers to musical material and gestures shared by different pieces, composers and epochs. In a narrower sense, in regards to my music, it refers to the finding of musical ideas—some borrowed—and their horizontal and vertical arrangement within a piece of music.

Harmonic emergence The ‘appearing’ of new harmony from previous harmony, gradually or suddenly, by the addition of new pitch material to elements already present, rather than the following of a tonally directed harmonic progression.

Lapping A recurrence of pitches, motives or modal areas to give an effect analogous to water lapping rather than flowing in a direction.

Modal density The number of notes of a mode, and/or the number of modes, sounding simultaneously.

Musical nest A metaphor for my works which refers to the gathering of musical materials and their weaving into a musical place to contain the transcendent.

Organic Unity A concept of the unity of an artwork from the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, derived from a model of biological organisms (Solie 147-8). Heinrich Schenker wrote that “wholeness stems from a central generative force to
which everything else is subordinate” (qtd. in Solie 151), and for Schenker this force was the “chord of nature” or major triad, horizontalised in the ursatz or fundamental structure.

**Remaining notes** Significant pitches which maintain a consistent or intermittent presence throughout a section or work. The name reflects their symbolic association with the eternal transcendent.

**Tonal imagery** The use of the aural imagery of major and minor modes, and/or the symbolic imagery of sharper and flatter keys, to express concepts of light and darkness.
Appendix 1

Monteverdi’s *Lamento d’Arianna*, Monody Part V (Ed. Nicholas Routley)
...rate ove mi ha scorto mia fortuna mirate di che

duol m'han fatto e ro de l'amor mia la mia fe de e l'altrui ganno Così va

chi troppo ma così troppo cre de.
Appendix 2

CD Track Listing

Secular and Sacred Choral Works

1) ὁσ anthes chortou
   St Louis Chamber Chorus, directed by Philip Barnes
   November 14, 2004, Third Baptist Church, St Louis MO . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 3’22”

2) Misera, Ancor do Loco
   St Louis Chamber Chorus, directed by Philip Barnes
   April 16, 2007, St Louis MO . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 5’10”

3) Vive in Deo
   St Louis Chamber Chorus, directed by Philip Barnes
   November 11, 2007, Holy Family Chapel, Sisters of St Joseph Mother House, St Louis MO . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 7’20”

4) Psalm 137
   St Louis Chamber Chorus, directed by Philip Barnes
   May 31, 2009, Christ the King Catholic Church, St Louis, MO . . . . . . . . . . . . 7’03”

Instrumental Works

5) Lai
   Charisma (David Miller, Ros Dunlop and Julia Ryder)
   April 18, 2008, Joan Sutherland Centre, Penrith, NSW . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 7’03”

6) Panah
   New Zealand Symphony Orchestra, conducted by Scott Parkman
   September 2, 2008, Michael Fowler Centre, Wellington, NZ . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 7’43”

Choral Mass, Osanna

7) Kyrie
   Sydney Chamber Choir, directed by Paul Stanhope
   September 6, 2008, Great Hall, University of Sydney, NSW . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 4’29”

8) Agnus Dei
   Sydney Chamber Choir, directed by Paul Stanhope
   September 6, 2008, Great Hall, University of Sydney, NSW . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 4’15”

Total 43’45”